

10

STANDING COMMITTEE ON  
DEFENCE  
(2010-2011)

FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA

MINISTRY OF DEFENCE

*[Action Taken by the Government on the Recommendations contained in the Thirty-Fourth Report of the Committee (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on "Human Resource Planning, Shortage of Manpower, Infusion of Hi-Tech Training and Infrastructure for the Armed Forces"]*

TENTH REPORT



सत्यमेव जयते

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI

*March, 2011/Phalguna, 1932 (Saka)*

TENTH REPORT  
STANDING COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE  
(2010-2011)

(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)

MINISTRY OF DEFENCE

*[Action Taken by the Government on the Recommendations contained in the  
Thirty-Fourth Report of the Committee (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on  
“Human Resource Planning, Shortage of Manpower, Infusion  
of Hi-Tech Training and Infrastructure for  
the Armed Forces”]*

*Presented to Lok Sabha on .....*

*Laid in Rajya Sabha on .....*



LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI

*March, 2011/Phalgun, 1932 (Saka)*

**C.O.D. No. 120**

*Price : Rs. 77.00*

© 2011 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

Published under Rule 382 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha (Fourteenth Edition) and printed by National Printers, New Delhi-110 028.

## CONTENTS

	PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE (2010-2011) .....	(iii)
INTRODUCTION .....	(v)
CHAPTER I Report .....	1
CHAPTER II Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government .....	20
CHAPTER III Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's replies .....	47
CHAPTER IV Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee .....	51
CHAPTER V Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of Government are still awaited .....	64

### APPENDIX

Minutes of the Fifth Sitting of the Standing Committee on Defence (2010-11) held on 17 January 2011 .....	68
Analysis of Action Taken by the Government on the Recommendations contained in the 34th Report of the Standing Committee on Defence (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) .....	70

COMPOSITION OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE  
(2010-2011)

Shri Satpal Maharaj — *Chairman*

MEMBERS

*Lok Sabha*

2. Shri Harish Choudhary
3. Shri Kamal Kishor 'Commando'
4. Shri H.D. Devegowda
5. Shri Varun Gandhi
6. Dr. Sucharu Ranjan Haldar
7. Shri Kapil Muni Karwariya
8. Shri Bhaskar Rao Patil Khatgaonkar
9. Shri Asaduddin Owaisi
10. Prof. Prasanna Kumar Patasani
11. Shri A.T. Nana Patil
12. Shri C.R. Patil
13. Shri Amarnath Pradhan
14. Shri C. Rajendran
15. Shri J. Ramesh
16. Shri M. Rajamohan Reddy
17. Shri Bajju Ban Riyan
18. Shri Kalyan Singh
19. Shri Mahabali Singh
20. Rajkumari Ratna Singh

*Rajya Sabha*

21. Shri Munquad Ali
22. Shri Avinash Rai Khanna
23. Prof. P.J. Kurien
24. Shri Mukut Mithi
25. Shri Mukhtar Abbas Naqvi
26. Shri T.K. Rangarajan
27. Shri Birender Singh
28. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav
29. Shri M.V. Mysura Reddy
30. Shri Naresh Gujral

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri T.K. Mukherjee — *Joint Secretary*
2. Smt. Sudesh Luthra — *Director*
3. Smt. Jyochnamayi Sinha — *Deputy Secretary*

## INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman of the Standing Committee on Defence (2010-2011), having been authorised by the Committee to submit the report on their behalf, present this Tenth Report on 'Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations/observations' contained in the Thirty Fourth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on Human Resource Planning, Shortage of Manpower, Infusion of Hi-Tech Training and Infrastructure for the Armed Forces.

2. The Thirty Fourth Report was presented to the Lok Sabha on 24 February, 2009 and laid on the Table of Rajya Sabha on the same day. The Ministry furnished their Action Taken Notes on all the Recommendations/Observations contained in the Thirty Fourth Report on 17 February, 2010.

3. The Report was considered and adopted by the Committee at their sitting held on 17 January, 2011.

4. For facility of reference and convenience, Recommendations/Observations of the Committee have been printed in bold letters in the Report.

5. An analysis of Action Taken by Government on the Recommendations/Observations contained in the Tenth Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee is given at Annexure-II.

NEW DELHI;  
17 January, 2011  
27 Pausa, 1932 (Saka)

SATPAL MAHARAJ,  
Chairman,  
Standing Committee on Defence.

## CHAPTER I

### REPORT

This Report of the Standing Committee on Defence deals with action taken by the Government on the recommendations/observations contained in the Thirty-fourth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on 'Human Resource Planning, Shortage of Manpower, Infusion of Hi-Tech Training and Infrastructure for the Armed Forces', which was presented to Lok Sabha and laid in Rajya Sabha on 24 February, 2009.

2. The Committee's Thirty-fourth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) contained thirty-eight observations/recommendations on the following aspects:—

Para No.	Subject
(1)	(2)
1.	Human Resource Planning in the Armed Forces
2.	Assessment of Manpower
3.	Persisting Shortage of Officers
4. to 7.	Encouragement and Motivation
8. and 9.	Recruitment Procedures
10.	Pre-Induction Training
11.	Pre-Induction Training Infrastructure
12.	Reckoning of Training Period
13.	Stipend during Pre-Induction Training
14. to 16.	Management of Career
17. to 22.	Working Conditions
23. and 24.	Welfare Measures
25. and 26.	Exit Policy
27.	Welfare of the Ex-Servicemen
28.	Induction of Ex-Servicemen
29. and 30.	Civilian Manpower and Infrastructural Support



(1)	(2)
31. and 32.	Defence Research and Development Organization(DRDO)
33.	Inadequate Training Infrastructure
34.	Need to expedite e-learning
35.	Delegation of power to service headquarters
36.	Depleting strength of Field Firing Ranges
37.	Training abroad
38.	Long Term Training Plan

3. Action Taken Replies have been received from the Government in respect of all the recommendations/observations contained in the Report. These replies have been examined and the same have been categorized as follows:—

- (i) Recommendations/observations, which have been accepted by the Government (Please *see* Chapter II):—

Para Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 7, 9, 11, 12, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35 and 38.

(23 Recommendations)

- (ii) Recommendations/observations, which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government (Please *see* Chapter III):—

Para Nos. 10, 16 and 37.

(03 Recommendations)

- (iii) Recommendations/observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration (Please *see* Chapter IV):—

Para Nos. 5, 8, 13, 15, 17, 27, 28, 29 and 36.

(09 Recommendations)

- (iv) Recommendations/observations in respect of which final replies of the Government are still awaited (Please *see* Chapter V):—

Para Nos. 14, 24 and 30.

(03 Recommendations)

**4. The Committee desire the Ministry's response to their comments made in Chapter-I and final replies to the recommendations made in Chapter-V of this Report be furnished to them at the earliest and in any case not later than six months of the presentation of this Report.**

5. The Committee will now deal with the action taken by the Government on some of their recommendations in the succeeding paragraphs.

**A. Imparting pre-selection Services Selection Board (SSB) Oriented Training**

**Recommendation (Paragraph No. 5)**

6. The Committee had recommended as under:—

“The Committee also feel that it is equally important to simultaneously initiate concrete steps for the larger involvement of the three services for imparting pre-selection Services Selection Board (SSB) oriented training in all schools and educational institutions including technical education institutions by utilizing the services of professionally qualified defence personnel so as to supplement the governmental efforts in disseminating the defence related information specially in those areas where such infrastructure is weak, inadequate or non-existent.”

7. The Ministry in their action taken reply has stated as under:—

“Sainik Schools, spread across the country and NCC units operating in Schools/Colleges across the country are engaged in imbuing Military oriented training, physical fitness etc. among the students. The training imparted by these organisations contributes in spreading career awareness of students about the Armed Forces and motivates them to take up Armed Forces as a career. These schools are excellent feeder organisations for the defence forces.

Further, Rashtriya Military Schools are premier training establishments of the defence services engaged in the pursuit of imparting quality education and also preparing the students for a career in the Armed Forces. The five Rashtriya Military Schools located at Chail, Ajmer, Belgaum, Bangalore and Dholpur besides providing State of the art educational facilities to the cadets are also grooming them as future potential officers of the defence services. To achieve this aim, the cadets are put through various outdoor activities as well as SSB training capsules. Pre-SSB training

is a regular feature in Rashtriya Military Schools. The services of both serving and retired Group Task Officers (GTOs) and Psychologists are taken to develop the personality of the cadets, inspire them by widening their knowledge base and equip them adequately to face the Service Selection Board.”

**8. To further supplement the Government’s efforts in disseminating the defence related information where there is inadequate infrastructure, the Committee had desired to impart pre-selection service selection board oriented training in all schools and educational institutions including technical education institutions. The Committee are perturbed to note the cryptic reply that the needful is being done through Sainik schools, NCC and Rashtriya Military Schools. The Committee find that the aforesaid initiatives are inadequate. There is an urgent need for military training in all schools and educational institutions including technical intuitions. The recommendation of the Committee when implemented would be having broader and wider implications as it would create awareness and prepare the talented youth to join armed forces. The Committee would therefore like to reiterate their earlier recommendation to further extend training in all schools, colleges and technical educational institutions.**

## **B. Recruitment Procedures**

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 8)**

9. The Committee had recommended as under:—

“The Committee find that a number of procedures for recruitment of permanent Commissioned and short service commissioned officers through UPSC and Non-UPSC mode have been put in place for entry in the combatant and other specialized and allied wings of the three services in the armed forces. However, all the candidates aspiring to become officers have to invariably under-go Service Selection Board (SSB) tests having same format both the combat and technical services. The Committee’s examination has brought out that the format of SSB tests has not undergone any major changes in the last three decades except that the process now involves two stages in which the candidates are first screened on the basis of psychological test and only those who qualify these tests are assessed in the second stage. Although this system is stated to be scientific enough to determine the suitability of a candidate for the armed forces, the Committee have been informed during the evidence that the present system of selection procedure has been examined by a Committee appointed by the Chiefs of Staff and its report has

*inter alia* highlighted that the “procedures for selection are extremely rigorous”. The Committee’s interaction with an ex-serviceman having expertise in this field has also brought out that the selection process in the SSB tests is negative in approach and the whole exercise is directed towards finding enough reasons to reject a candidate rather than carrying out an appraisal of his good traits for selection. It has also been pointed out that the most of the assessors hesitate to give clear-cut assessments and keep most of the candidates as border liners implying thereby that the whole selection process is unable to determine suitability of such candidates. Even the Defence Secretary admitted during evidence that some of these tests are rigorous and impracticable and require a “fresh look”. These facts lend credence to the Committee’s view that the SSB tests for selection of officers in the armed forces continue to be based on antiquated practices and no serious attempt has been made to adopt and implement the modern techniques of selection. While emphasizing that there should not be any compromise with the quality and traits required for serving the Armed Forces, the Committee recommends that an exhaustive review of the selection process through SSB tests should be undertaken at the earliest and latest techniques available for selection of candidates in an objective manner should be put in place to inspire confidence among the candidates volunteering for a career in the Armed Forces. Since a good number of youth coming from rural background face considerable difficulties in communicating in particular language, steps should also be taken to ensure that such candidates are not subjected to language barriers while assessing their suitability for the Armed Forces. Needless to say that language and communication abilities of such selected candidate can be improved to the desired level while imparting pre-induction training to them.”

10. The Ministry in their action taken reply has stated as under:—

“The selection procedure adopted by the Service Selection Boards is scientific and is aimed at assessing the officer like qualities of an individual. The ability of an individual to withstand physical and mental stress is assessed to determine his/her suitability for an Armed Force.

The selection process is designed to select a prospective candidate to meet the service requirements. The procedure is centrally standardized by Defence Institute for Physiological Research (DIPR), New Delhi for all three services. The process has delivered results and has stood the test of time.

The emphasis during the testing of verbal abilities is on communication skills and not on a language in particular and as long as a candidate is able to comprehend the instruction given to him and act accordingly it is considered good enough. Fluency in spoken English or knowledge of English is not a limiting factor for a candidate during testing.

Keeping with the modern techniques of selection, which have evolved, the changes in the socio-economic background and the envisaged changes in the service requirement a project on 'Comprehensive Selection System in Armed Forces' has been taken up by DIPR for evolving a new selection system based on cognitive abilities."

**11. The Committee find that on the one hand a project on comprehensive selection system in armed forces has been taken up by DIPR for evolving a new selection system based on cognitive abilities on the other hand the selection procedure adopted by the Service Selection Boards is considered to be scientific and satisfactory. The Committee are unable to comprehend the stand of the Ministry on the issues raised in the recommendation. The Committee, therefore, while reiterating their earlier recommendation, once again wish to emphasize that the study by DIPR should be completed at the earliest and the new selection system based on modern techniques of selection is put in place.**

### **C. Stipend during Pre-Induction Training**

#### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 13)**

12. The Committee had recommended as under:—

The Committee note that the cadets undergoing training before induction as officers are not being paid any stipend except in the case of graduate cadets who are reported to be paid a monthly stipend of ₹ 8,000/- during training. The Committee understand that all the cadets taking pre-induction training for joining the armed forces in the officers' cadre do not necessarily come from affluent background and they strongly feel that there is an imperative need to extend appropriate financial support on the basis of their educational qualifications so as to enable them to meet out their pocket expenses as well as the expectations of their family members. They, therefore, strongly recommended that all the cadets undergoing pre-induction training at NDA or similar institutions must be paid ₹ 10,000/- and the graduate entrants ₹ 15,000/- as monthly stipend during the entire period of training before being commissioned

in the armed forces. The Committee also desire that the MoD should take up this matter expeditiously with the Ministry of Finance at the highest level and impress upon them the need for extending such a benefit.

13. The Ministry in their action taken reply has stated as under:—

“Post VI Central Pay Commission (VI CPC), the fixed stipend to cadets at IMA, OTA and Cadet Training Wings at CME, MCEME and MCTE has been increased to ₹ 21,000/- per month. However, the Commission did not recommend grant of a stipend in NDA and similar training academies in view of the fact that no payment is required to be made by Cadets to such training academies and the training results in award of a degree and subsequent employment in the Defence Forces.”

**14. In order to extend appropriate financial support and motivate the cadets, the Committee had recommended that all the cadets undergoing pre-induction training at NDA or similar institutions should be paid monthly stipend during the entire period of training before being commissioned in the armed forces. The Ministry instead of taking concrete measures in this regard has rejected the recommendation of the Committee outrightly. The Ministry find that no payment is required to be made to the cadets during the training period. The Committee feel that extending appropriate financial support during the training would be a small measure which would help the cadets in meeting their daily expenses. Not only that the said initiative would also boost the morale of the cadets. Therefore, the Committee wish to emphasize to reconsider the issue.**

#### **D. Time Scale Promotion**

##### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 15)**

15. The Committee had recommended as under:—

“The Committee note that the substantive promotion upto the rank of Lt. Colonel or equivalent in the three services is made by time-scale on completion of the stipulated period of 13 years of reckonable commissioned service. However, promotion of the officers to the rank of substantive Colonel not promoted by selection is made subject to their being fit, only after completion of 26 years of reckonable commissioned service. The Committee’s examination has brought out the rank structure in armed forces being of steep

pyramidal shape has little scope for the officers to climb up the hierarchical ladder. The opportunities for their promotion are further restricted because of limited availability of training facilities for Higher Command Course. Needless to say that the officers not selected for promotion or for Higher Command Course feel demotivated which ultimately results in adverse effect on the overall efficiency of the armed forces. The Committee, therefore, desire that in order to achieve the functional efficiency; combat effectiveness; and to keep down the age profile of the brigade commanders or equivalent in the three Services of armed forces, the MoD should take appropriate measures to introduce a system whereby the strength of permanent commissioned officers *vis-à-vis* SSC Officers is gradually brought to level of 30 per cent of the authorised strength in each of the three Services and the time scale promotions upto the rank of Brigadier and equivalent in all the Services are made by bringing in appropriate reduction in the length of reckonable commissioned service so as to fulfil the individual career aspirations as well as to keep the morale of officers high. The Committee need hardly point out that such a measure would have negligible financial implications consequent upon implementation of new pay-bands in the armed forces besides going a long way in keeping the rate of attrition at lower levels."

16. The Ministry in their action taken reply has stated as under:—

"The A.V. Singh Committee had recommended that the ratio of Permanent Commissioned officers to Short Service Commissioned officers should be brought down. The Cabinet has already granted its approval 'in principle', to the reduction in the Permanent Commissioned officers cadre and corresponding increase in the support cadre (including Short Service Commission Officers). Specific proposals in this regard, keeping in view the specific requirements of the three Services, are being examined by the Ministry."

**17. With regard to the recommendation of the Committee to introduce the system of time scale promotions upto the rank of Brigadier and equivalent in all the Services by bringing in appropriate reduction in the length of reckonable commissioned service, the Ministry has chosen not to respond to the issue. The Committee again emphasize that the said initiative would certainly increase the functional efficiency and keep the morale of the officer high. The Committee, therefore, urge the Ministry to take expeditious action on the recommendation of the Committee.**

## **E. Working Conditions**

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 17)**

18. The Committee had recommended as under:—

“The Committee note that limited opportunities exist for promotion of the officers in the armed forces due to steep rank structure. This fact necessitates that fair and transparent systems are put in place for allaying the fears in the minds of officers serving armed forces. Although the constitution of Selection Boards for promotion is stated to be fixed, the Committee understand that there is no fixed time schedule for holding the meetings of such Boards in different services. Undoubtedly, any delay in holding the meetings of such boards may sometimes result in denial of promotion to the officers otherwise eligible. During evidence, the Defence Secretary informed the Committee that he would not like to hazard a guess on the allegations made by those who are not promoted that the dates were played with to rule them out and made a promise that he would certainly look into this aspect. The Committee trust that the Ministry would not only pay serious attention towards streamlining the procedures in this regard but also ensure that the meetings of all selection boards for promotions in different wings of the three services are held at a regular interval of six months every year to make selection for the posts anticipated in ensuing six months so that not even a single deserving officer is deprived of his legitimate right. Any deviation from the stipulated time schedule in holding meetings of the selection boards for promotion should be viewed seriously and appropriate action taken against those found responsible.”

19. The Ministry in their action taken reply has stated as under:—

#### **ARMY**

“Selection Boards (SBs) for consideration of officers for promotion to the select ranks are to be held once a year to make selection for vacancies accruing in the ensuing ‘one’ calendar year. Presently, two SBs are being held in a calendar year.

#### **AIR FORCE**

A streamlined procedure exists for conduct of Promotion Boards. The Board is conducted between February to March every year.



## NAVY

The Navy conducts Promotion Boards on a yearly basis are based on the anticipated vacancies of the entire year.”

**20. The Committee are constrained to note that the Ministry instead of taking expeditious action on their recommendation to hold meetings of all Selection Boards for promotion in different wings of the three services at a regular interval of six months every year, has just reproduced the existing practice. As per the practice, in Air Force and Navy, the Promotion Boards are conducted on a yearly basis. In case of Army, Selection Board for promotion to the select ranks are held once a year. The Committee would like to emphasize that holding the meetings of Selection Boards regularly at the interval of six months would ensure timely promotion to officers which would boost their morale. The Committee while reiterating their recommendation would like the Ministry to take expeditious action in this regard.**

### F. Exit Policy

#### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 25)**

21. The Committee had recommended as under:—

“The Committee note that certain criteria have been laid down in the three services for considering the request for pre-mature retirement or resignation from the Services. The Committee’s examination of the subject matter has revealed that such requests from officers are considered on merit of the case and requirements of the service. Undoubtedly, discretionary powers in such matters result in discontentment among officers in a number of cases. The Committee, therefore, stress that the Ministry of Defence should lay down clear-cut, objective and well-defined policy guidelines in this regard leaving no scope for arbitrary decisions. It should also be ensured that cases of similar nature are treated in an equitable manner.”

22. The Ministry in their action taken reply has stated as under:—

“Guidelines and mechanisms for considering requests for premature retirement are already laid down for the three services. These are applied uniformly and in an equitable manner.”

23. The Committee note that the guidelines and mechanisms for considering requests for premature retirement are already laid down for the three services. The Committee wish to stress that these guidelines

should be strictly adhered to without application of any discretion in order to avoid discontentment among officers.

**G. Welfare of the Ex-servicemen**

**Recommendation (Paragraph No. 27)**

24. The Committee had recommended as under:—

“The Committee note that the Department of Ex-servicemen Welfare has been created in 2004 under the Ministry of Defence to formulate various policies and programmes for the welfare and resettlement of ex-servicemen (ESM) in the country. According to the information available with the Committee, this Department is assisted by Kendriya Sainik Board (KSB) and Directorate General of Resettlement (DGR). While the KSB lays down general policies for the welfare of ESM and their dependants and also administers welfare funds, the office of the DGR has been entrusted with the responsibility of implementing schemes and programmes of the Government for ESM which includes pre and post-retirement training, re-employment, self-employment, etc. The Committee are however, surprised to find that despite existence of such an elaborate mechanism, there are a number of areas which require focussed attention for dignified resettlement and rehabilitation of ESM. Undoubtedly, there is an urgent and imperative necessity to address the legitimate needs of ESM and the Committee strongly recommend the following measures:—

- (i) In order to enable ESM to derive their due benefits from the welfare schemes formulated for them by the Government, the Ministry of Defence should urgently devise a foolproof mechanism for compulsory registration of all ESM with the relevant Zila Sainik Boards which in turn should forward such data to Rajya Sainik Boards and DGR for being maintained at State and National levels. Needless to say that complete and precise data on the number of ESM in the various States and the country as a whole would be immense use to the various agencies involved in formulating and implementing policies and programmes being contemplated for the welfare of ESM.
- (ii) Based on the accurate data on ESM so available with DGR, the Ministry should ensure adequate allocation of funds to DGR for efficacious implementation of various schemes being launched for welfare of ESM in the country.

- (iii) In their 4th Report (14th Lok Sabha), the Committee had reiterated their earlier recommendation for setting up of 'National Commission on Ex-servicemen'. The Committee have now been informed during oral deposition that the proposal for establishing such a Commission has since been cleared by the Raksha Mantri. The Committee trust that the 'National Commission on Ex-servicemen' with statutory powers will be established soon so as to ensure accountability of existing structure put in place for implementation of various welfare schemes for ESM.
- (iv) The Committee understand that the revised pension policy being implemented as a sequel to the recommendations of the Sixth Central Pay Commission continues to remain a contentious issue between the Government and the ESM. The Committee desire that appropriate and expeditious action should be taken to resolve this issue in accordance with the general principles of equity.

25. The Ministry in their action taken reply has stated as under:—

- “(i) Process of computerisation has been started at Rajya Sainik Board/State Hqrs. and Zila Sainik Boards/District Hqrs. level. Funds for the same have also been released to all the State Governments. Completion of computerisation is likely to take time. Once the system is in place, computerised data at State and District level would be available and the authorities may be in a position to ensure compulsory registration.
- (ii) Adequate funds are being provided to the Directorate General (Resettlement) under the head 'Training' and the same are being utilized for training of Officers as well as PBOR. The welfare schemes for Ex-servicemen are being handled by Kendriya Sainik Board, the funds for which are being provided out of the Armed Forces Flag Day Fund (AFFDF). In addition, various State Governments have their own schemes for benefit of the Ex-Servicemen residing in the States.
- (iii) The recommendation for setting up of 'National Commission on Ex-servicemen' has been considered but has not been found feasible as a number of bodies such as Directorate General (Resettlement), Kendriya Sainik Board at the Centre and Rajya Sainik Boards at the State level already exist to undertake welfare schemes for Ex-servicemen and their families.

- (iv) A Committee was set up under the Chairmanship of Cabinet Secretary on the direction of PM to look into the issue of One Rank and One Pension (OROP) and other related issues. The following recommendations have been made to substantially improve the pension of Personnel Below Officer Ranks (PBOR) and Commissioned Officers:—

#### **Personnel Below Officer Ranks**

- I. The proposal of Ministry of Defence to bring pre 10.10.1997 PBOR pensioners at par with post 10.10.1997 PBOR pensioners may be agreed to.
- II. The proposal of the Ministry of Defence to reckon the enhanced rate of classification allowance *w.e.f.* 1.1.2006 on notional basis for the purpose of calculation of pension (as in the case of reckoning MSP for determination of pension) may be agreed to.
- III. In order to reduce the gap between pre and post 1.1.2006 PBOR pensioners, it is proposed to follow the principle of the Award of Group of Ministers (GoM) of 2006 in the following manner:—
  - (a) To reckon the pension of all pre 1.1.2006 PBOR pensioners with reference to a notional maximum in the post 1.1.2006 revised pay structure corresponding to the maximum of pre-Sixth Pay Commission pay scales as per fitment table of each rank.
  - (b) Also to continue with the enhanced weightages awarded by the GoM.

#### **Commissioned Officers**

- IV. The proposal to remove the linkage of full pension with 33 years of qualifying service *w.e.f.* 1.1.2006 instead of 1.9.2008 in the case of Commissioned Officers may be agreed to. A similar dispensation will have to be extended to civilians who have retired between 1.1.2006 and 31.8.2008.
- V. In order to address the issue of disparity in the pension of pre and post 1.1.2006 pensioners at the level of Lt. General/equivalent/Additional Secretary and equivalent civilian categories, a separate pay scale starting at

₹ 67,000 and going up to ₹ 79,000 may be created and all officers of the level of Lt. General/equivalent/ Additional Secretaries may be fixed in this scale. As a result of this, the pension of pre 1.1.2006 Lt. Generals will get fixed at ₹ 36,500 and those of Additional Secretary at ₹ 33,500.

#### **All Defence Pensioners**

VI. It is proposed to agree to broad banding of percentage of disability/war injury pension for pre 1.1.1996 disability/war injury pensioners.

VII. It is proposed to remove the cap on war injury element of pension in the case of disabled pensioners belonging to Category E.

2. Government letter has already been issued on 30.10.2008 implementing the Committee's recommendation Nos. (II) and (IV)."

**26. The Committee are distressed to note that even after getting clearance from Raksha Mantri for setting up of National Commission for Ex-servicemen, the Ministry has declined to set up the Commission on the plea that number of bodies are existing to undertake Welfare Schemes for Ex-Servicemen and their families. As there is apparent dissatisfaction among the Ex-servicemen, the Committee are of the strong view that there is an urgent need for setting up of a commission at the National Level. While reiterating their earlier recommendation the Committee would like the Ministry to reconsider the recommendation and set up the commission expeditiously.**

The Committee have constantly been recommending in their reports to consider the demands of Ex-servicemen for 'One Rank One Pension' in a holistic manner. The Ministry in the action taken note has again stated about the benefits extended to Ex-servicemen by implementing the seven recommendations of the Committee set up under the Chairmanship of Cabinet Secretary. The Committee again emphasize that in spite of the benefits extended by implementing the seven recommendations, the demand of 'One Rank One Pension' still persists. As such the Committee would like to reiterate their recommendation made in earlier Report to reconsider the issue of One Rank One Pension, so that the demand of Ex-servicemen is met which would boost the morale of the defence personnel.

## H. Induction of Ex-servicemen

### Recommendations (Paragraph No. 28)

27. The Committee had recommended as under:—

“The Committee understand that besides their primary responsibility of protecting the territorial integrity, the services of the armed forces personnel are often requisitioned to assist the civil authorities during internal security problems and rescue/relief operations during natural calamities. Considering the fact that a large number of defence services personnel retiring at a comparatively younger age well trained and experienced enough to handle problems of internal security and natural calamities, the Committee are of the view that it would be in the national interest that the Government devised an appropriate scheme for inducting retiring armed forces personnel as a distinct force on the lines of Central Paramilitary Forces personnel (CPMF). The Committee are in no doubt that such a scheme would not only address the problems being experienced in lateral induction of Ex-servicemen in CPMF but also result in substantial financial savings to the Government on recruiting procedures, training and pension payments. It would also minimize instances of frequent deployment of the armed forces for secondary duties as the services of the distinct force having professional experience would always be available to assist the civil Authorities.”

28. The Ministry in their action taken reply has stated as under:—

“The issue of lateral transfer of army personnel into Central Paramilitary Forces (CPMFs) has been under dialogue with Ministry of Home Affairs. The issue is yet to be resolved. The VI Central Pay Commission, in their report, have also recommended a scheme of lateral transfer of defence personnel to Central Police Organisations/Defence civilian organizations after rendering 7-17 years service in the defence, with a view to, *inter-alia*, provide lifetime employment to defence personnel. However, as per decision of the Government on the recommendations of the VI CPC as contained in the Ministry of Finance Resolution dated No. 1/1/2008-IC dated 29th August, 2008, the recommendation related to lateral shift of Defence Personnel to Central Para Military Forces will be examined separately. The recommendation for inducting retiring armed forces personnel as a distinct force for civil duties on the lines of CPMFs.”

29. The Committee in their earlier reports have been recommending for lateral induction of Armed Forces Personnel into Paramilitary Forces. However, as the matter is still under consideration at various Ministerial level and it is time consuming, the Committee had desired for evolving a scheme for inducting retiring Armed Forces Personnel as a distinct force on the lines of Central Paramilitary Forces. The Committee are distressed to note that instead of addressing the matter the Ministry, has simply stated that there is no proposal for inducting retiring armed forces personnel as a distinct force for civil duties. In view of immense benefits by creating a distinct force, the Committee desire the Ministry to re-consider the issue.

## **I. Civilian Manpower and Infrastructural Support**

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 29)**

30. The Committee had recommended as under:—

“The Committee note that civilian manpower and infrastructural support to the services Headquarter office of inter-services organizations under the Ministry of Defence are provided by the office of the Chief Administrative Officer (CAO). While the office of CAO is responsible for providing administrative cover to the civilian personnel so employed including various categories of Armed Forces Headquarter (AFHQ) civilian cadres, the Committee are surprised to find that the proposals regarding cadre restructuring etc., of AFHQ civil services require consultation with the Department of Personnel and Training (DoPT) which is reported to be playing no role in career management of AFHQ civil cadres. While the Group of Ministers in paragraph 6.76 of its Report on ‘Reforming the National Security System’ had recommended in 2001 that ‘a Committee may be set up to look into the issue of better utilization of AFHQ civil service officers within the Ministry of Defence’ the Committee’s examination of the subject-matter has, however, revealed that nothing substantial has been done in this regard and participation of this service within the Ministry remains inadequate. The oral deposition and the written submission made before the Committee also highlighted that despite recruitment to various groups of AFHQ civilian cadres through common examination, their service conditions continue to be at variance with similarly placed services under the Government. Undoubtedly, the bleak career prospects and absence of any lateral movements in the Ministry of Defence have an adverse impact on the functioning of these cadres where a number of cases relating to service matters are reported to have been under protracted litigation. In the light of

the fact that cadre were introduced with the specific aim of providing specialized infrastructural support to the three service Headquarters and inter-service organizations, the Committee desire that appropriate steps should be taken to strengthen the AFHQ civilian cadres by restructuring their service conditions with a view to bringing in parity with similarly placed services in the Government."

31. The Ministry in their action taken reply has stated as under:—

"The issue for utilisation of Armed Forces Headquarters (AFHQ) Civil Service Officer in MoD Secretariat in pursuance of the GoM's recommendations contained in para 6.76 of its Report on 'Reforming the National Security System' has been examined twice in consultation with the Department of Personnel and Training (DoP&T). On both occasions, the DoP&T have not agreed to the proposal for utilising the AFHQ CS in MoD (Sectt.). A Cadre Restructuring of Armed Forces Headquarters Civil Service (AFHQ CS) has been done in 2008 with the approval of Ministry of Finance."

**32. The Committee are concerned to note that even when the Group of Ministers (GoMs) in its report had recommended to set up a Committee to look into the issue of better utilization of AFHQ Civil Services office within the Ministry of Defence and the Committee in the recommendation have emphasized to implement the recommendation of GoMs, the Ministry has tried to sidetrack the recommendations of the Committee by stating that DoPT has not agreed to the proposal and has reiterated its stand of not reviewing the position in the light of DoPT's advise. The Committee again emphasized that the AFHQs Civil Service Officers was introduced with the specific aim of providing specialized infrastructural support to the three service Headquarters and inter-service organizations. As such the concern of the Committee should be brought in the knowledge of DoPT and immediate action should be taken in the light of the recommendation of GoMs.**

#### **J. Depleting strength of Field Firing Ranges**

##### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 36)**

33. The Committee had recommended as under:—

"The Committee are concerned to note that the number of Field Firing Ranges (FFRs) is gradually decreasing over a period of time. Although the army had a total of 104 FFRs at one point of time, the number of such Ranges is expected to come down to mere



seven by the year 2014. One of the important reasons attributable to the depleting number of these Ranges is reported to be the clearances required to be obtained by the State Governments from the Ministry of Environment and Forests to permit use of forest land for non-forest activities in accordance with the Forest Conservation Act, 1980 and Supreme Court judgment delivered in 2002. While the MoD is stated to have initiated a process of consultation with all stakeholders in order to find a mutually acceptable solution to the problem, the Committee feel that it is high time that the Ministry imitated expeditious and concrete steps to resolve this issue in the national interest in a time bound manner.”

34. The Ministry in their action taken reply has stated as under:—

“ARMY

There are 92 notified Field Firing Ranges (FFRs) in the inventory, of which notification of 57 ranges has expired. Cases of 04 ranges are under active consideration by State Governments for re-notification.

#### **Actions Taken**

- (i) Favourable judgment of Hon’ble Supreme Court with respect to NPV.
- (ii) Advance sensitization of environment prior to expiry of notification for taking timely actions to renotify ranges.
- (iii) Interaction by HQ Commands with respective State Governments.

AIR FORCE

The Air Force has seven air-to-ground ranges, located in Gujarat, Rajasthan, Punjab, West Bengal, Uttar Pradesh, Madhya Pradesh and Assam-Meghalaya border. However, operations of following ranges are severely constrained due to the restrictions imposed by civil air traffic as well as proliferation of habitation/industries in the vicinity:—

- (i) Dollang Mukh Range (Assam)
- (ii) Singpur Range (Gujarat)
- (iii) Sarmat Range (MP)
- (iv) Tilpat Range (UP)

Despite the above limitations, IAF continues to use these ranges for its air-to-ground firing practices within the laid down safety parameters.”

35. Keeping in view the depleting strength of Field Firing Ranges, the Committee had desired to resolve all the issues in consultation with all stake holders. The Committee are perturbed to note that despite the action taken by the Armed Forces, out of 92 notified Field Firing Ranges with army notification with regard to 57 ranges has expired Cases. Only 4 ranges are under active consideration by State Government for re-notification. All the 7 air-to-ground ranges, with Air Force are severely constrained due to restrictions imposed by civil air traffic as well as proliferation of habitation/industries in the vicinity. Keeping in view the changing security scenario and the strategic importance of Field Firing Ranges the Committee wish to reiterate their earlier recommendation to take concrete steps to acquire the same.

## CHAPTER II

### RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

#### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 1)**

The Committee's analysis of the statistical information relating to the preceding fifty years as furnished by the Ministry of Defence (MoD) reveals that the shortage of manpower in the officers' cadre has been persisting during all these years in all the three services of the armed forces. These statistics also bring out that the extent of deficiency of officers notably in the army, has assumed alarming proportions after an increase in the authorised strength of officers in the army was made during the nineteen eighties. In fact, the reported shortage of officers in the army stood at a staggering figure of 23.8 per cent of the authorised strength followed by 16.7 and 12.1 per cent in the navy and the air force respectively during the year 2007. In terms of the absolute numbers, the deficiency of officers in 2007 was 11,087 in army, 1,493 in navy and 1,366 in air force. While several steps are stated to have been taken from time to time to overcome the problem of shortage of manpower in the armed forces, the Committee are perturbed to note that all these measures have not proved efficacious enough to meet the requirements of officers in the three services particularly during the last two decades. To the utter dismay of the Committee, the MoD have attributed this shortage of manpower in officers' cadre mainly to low priority being accorded to military career by the present day youth due to lucrative job opportunities available in the civil sector. The Committee are not inclined to accept this plea of the MoD in view of the fact that a substantially large number of talented youth offer themselves both for competitive examinations conducted by the Union Public Service Commission (UPSC) for recruitment of officers in the armed forces as well as for non-UPSC entries. The Committee's examination of the subject matter and their interaction with the ex-servicemen and experts having experience in this field has brought out that the entire issue of shortage of officers in the armed forces continues to be viewed in isolation without properly appreciating the complexities of the various aspects of the manpower planning and human resource management in all its ramifications resulting in present State of affairs in the armed forces. The Committee have dealt with some of the important areas of concern requiring urgent attention and

priority action on this subject and other related issues in the succeeding paragraphs of the Report.

### **Reply of the Government**

The Ministry has been continuously taking steps to address the issue of shortages of officers. Important steps already taken in this regard include implementation of recommendations of A.V. Singh Committee (phase I), whereby all officers including Short Service Commission officers are now eligible for substantive promotion to the rank of Captain, Major and Lt. Col. after 2, 6 and 13 years of reckonable service, upgradation of a total of 750 posts of Lieutenant Colonels to Colonels rank. Reduction in the qualifying service required for promotion as Colonel to 15 years as against 20 years earlier. Increase of the tenure of SSC officers from 10 to 14 years. Upgradation of a total of 1896 additional posts in the ranks of Colonel, Brigadier, Major General and Lieutenant General (and equivalent) in the three Services towards implementation of A.V. Singh Committee (phase II), implementation of the recommendations of the VI Central Pay Commission with substantial improvements in the pay structure of officers of Armed Forces etc. These measures will go a long way to make service in the Armed Forces more attractive which will contribute towards reduction in shortages.

Ministry of Defence have further gone into the question of addressing the issue of Shortage of officers in the Armed Forces in its entirety. A Multi pronged approach has been adopted for addressing the entire gamut of issues involved. These include measures to implement the balance recommendations of A.V. Singh Committee regarding restructuring of officers cadre, improving Cadre mobility, increasing in-Service intakes, initiation of new entry schemes, making Short Service Commission more attractive, augmentation and capacity enhancement of Selection and Training infrastructure etc.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 2)**

The MoD have informed the Committee that the manpower planning in the army is a complicated issue because of the factors like induction and wastage of personnel annually; large number of services within services with varied manpower requirement; wide rank structure with varying retirement ages for different categories; different recruitment patterns for various trades and regions; and above all, uncertainty in planning due to unforeseen and unpredictable circumstances such as wastages due to death; disciplinary cases; medical grounds; and pre-mature retirement and the likes. The Committee are unable to comprehend as to how Ministry could term manpower planning as a

complicated issue on account of factors such as annual induction, wastages, large number of services within services etc., since these factors have been in existence for a long time and can easily be anticipated and taken care of well in time by the authorities entrusted with the task of maintaining service records. The Committee also feel that although the wastages due to death or disciplinary cases or pre-mature retirement cannot be anticipated, yet these factors cannot throw the process of manpower planning out of gear simply because the number of such cases is usually very small. Obviously, the systems and procedures created in the armed forces for this purpose are not sound enough to generate precise information required for proper assessment of manpower requirements. This view of the Committee is strengthened by the finding contained in chapter II of the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the year ended March, 2006 on Union Government (Defence Services), which clearly highlights that there was a mismatch between the authorization and actual manpower held in respect of PBORs in the army due to incorrect assessment of manpower. In the opinion of the Committee, all these facts are clearly indicative of the shortcomings in the existing systems which ultimately have an adverse bearing on the recruitment in a timely manner. They, therefore, desire that the MoD should take appropriate steps to update their systems by utilizing the latest technological methodology of digital data base to address the issue of assessment of manpower requirements for induction.

### **Reply of the Government**

#### **ARMY**

**Central Audit:** Central audit of manpower is carried out by Staff Duties Directorate annually to establish the correct authorization of manpower to each regiment/corps.

**Manpower Tracking and Management System (MTMS):** To assist in monitoring of manpower, Manpower Tracking and Management System (MTMS) has been put in place which is a quarterly report on manpower prepared by the record office. It is submitted to Additional Directorate General of Manpower (Policy and Planning), Management Information System Organization (MISO) and the respective personnel sections of Line Directorates in addition to others for monitoring and reconciliation.

**Two year recruitment cycle:** Prior to 31 March 2000, recruitment vacancies were released annually. One year time was too cramped with four (three monthly) sub-cycles which gave very little flexibility to cater for slippages and turbulence in recruitment. Two years recruitment cycle

has been adopted *w.e.f.* April 2000 with four (six monthly) sub-cycles which now provide adequate leverage to cater for modification/review, under which recruitment releases are made for one sub cycle of six months each at the time.

**Computer model for release of recruitment vacancy:** To workout the number of vacancies for recruitment, an 'excel' based computer model has been developed in-house and is in use. It takes into consideration superannuation, wastage (premature retirement, death, invalidment, desertion, discharge and training wastage), number of recruits under training and recruits passing out and being inducted into the system. With help of this computer model anticipated holding and authorized strength of the army on a future date can be worked out, as close to the actual strength and vacancies released accordingly.

**Automation:** The process for having a digital database has already commenced and is in an advanced stage of implementation.

## AIR FORCE

Manpower forecast and induction plan for officers is based on a methodology that has been evolved with experience over a period of time. It involves logical analysis of the data and intelligent prediction for the future. The accuracy of manpower forecast and induction plan has a direct bearing on the formulation of correct human resource policies for effective cadre management in future. Induction plan is prepared to overcome the shortages in a planned and phased manner. The plan is prepared branch-wise and is based on the existing authorized establishment. Anticipated future establishments are not taken into consideration. IAF has incorporated the Regression Analysis method to forecast wastages. It is a data analysis method developed by College of Defence Management, Secunderabad, which establishes relationship between two dependant variables like strength and wastage in these cases. The in-service wastage figures thus obtained have been observed to be fairly accurate. Hence, IAF has adopted a scientific method of forecasting wastages in the process of working out the induction plan.

## NAVY

**Manpower Planning:** Indian Navy has put in place a very scientific and logical system of manpower planning using available Information Technology. The recruitment planning of the Navy is aimed at deciding the number of candidates to be inducted into the Navy each year for filling the various posts available in different branches. The number depends on the vacancies lying unfilled, those likely to arise as a result

of outgo of serving personnel during the time taken for recruitment and training of new entrants, as well as new posts that may be sanctioned during this period for manning the new ships/facilities which are newly commissioned. Manpower planning in the Navy is carried out on the basis of long and short term reviews of Navy's manpower requirement. The long term review is carried out at a broad macro level, covers a period of approx. 5-10 years, whereas the short term review looks at a scenario of 2-3 years. The long term review provides a broad indication of the intake levels and the short-term review, on the other hand, is able to take advantage of more up to date and reliable inputs and forecasts, and is, therefore, useful for fine tuning.

**Calculation of Intake Levels:** The required annual intake levels are derived by taking into account the anticipated growth in the sanctioned strength, the anticipated wastage during the given period, the current shortages and subtracting the number of personnel already in the training pipeline. This figure divided by the number of years gives the average annual intake.

No difficulty has been experienced in terms of manpower planning in the Navy. The system of the Navy has stood the test of time. The induction targets are being calculated accurately and the patterns established in respect of manpower have been observed to be satisfactory.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 3)**

According to the MoD, the deficiencies in the officers' cadre in the Army persist due to attrition of the force levels from time to time and the unpopularity of the military career on account of lucrative alternative options available; frequent transfers; early retirement age based on rank held; and risk factor. The Committee are unable accept this reasoning in view of the fact that these aspects not only form essential part of military services but also continue to remain the basic tenets on which the manpower planning in military is based. On the other hand, the Committee's examination of the information furnished to them reveals that the shortage of officers have reached unprecedented levels in the range of 23 to 26 per cent only after the authorized strength of army officers was increased by 26 per cent in the nineteen eighties. The fact that the number of officers in the Army has been registering increase *albeit* marginally during the past two decades is a clear indicator that there has been no reduction in the availability of volunteers for induction in the Army as is being asserted by the MoD and it is only the lack of adequate infrastructure for pre-commission training which appears to be coming in the way of enhanced intake necessitated on account of

substantial increase made in the authorized strength. While expressing their grave concern over the failure of the MoD in initiating appropriate timely measures to enhance the training infrastructure required for matching increased authorized strength of the officers, the Committee desire that the MoD should go into the entire gamut of this issue in all the three services and urgently formulate a plan of action for implementation in a time bound manner.

### **Reply of the Government**

Shortage of officers has been continuing in the Armed Forces for quite some time for a variety of reasons. Ministry of Defence has been continuously taking steps to address the issue of shortages of officers by way of motivating service officers to continue in service and attracting talented youth to join the Armed Forces through improvements in service conditions, besides other measures. Towards implementation of recommendations of A.V. Singh Committee (phase I), all officers including Short Service Commission officers are now eligible for substantive promotion to the rank of Captain, Major and Lt. Col. after 2, 6 and 13 years of reckonable service. A total of 750 posts of Lieutenant Colonels have been upgraded to Colonel's rank. The qualifying service required for promotion as Colonel has been reduced to 15 years as against 20 years earlier. The tenure of SSC officers has been increased from 10 to 14 years. A total of 1896 additional posts in the ranks of Colonel, Brigadier, Major General and Lieutenant General and their equivalents in the other two Services have been upgraded towards implementation of A.V. Singh Committee (phase II). The implementation of the recommendations of the VI Central Pay Commission with substantial improvements in the pay structure of officers of Armed Forces will also go a long way in making service in the Armed Forces more attractive which will contribute towards reduction in shortages.

The Ministry has comprehensively examined the issue of shortage of officers in the Armed Forces in its entirety. Steps required to be taken on the entire gamut of issues having a bearing on the issue of shortages have been identified. Accordingly, wide ranging proposals have been initiated. These proposals include implementation of the balance recommendations of Ajay Vikram Singh Committee (AVSC) Report ('peel' factors), with suitable modifications, aiming at further improving cadre mobility and making the Armed Forces more attractive, initiation of new entry schemes, increasing in-Service entries, augmentation of Selection Infrastructure and Training Infrastructure etc. Augmentation of Training and Selection Infrastructure forms a significant part of the proposed measures to improve intakes.



### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 4)**

The Committee's examination brings out that there is presently no shortage of manpower for holding ranks other than officers in the army. The Committee are however, not inclined to accept the contentious reasoning of the Ministry that such shortages in the navy and the air force are within the manageable proportions. Obviously, there is lack of appropriate advance action in making planned induction of the manpower in both these services. Although a large number of potential candidates volunteer themselves for a career both as officers and lower ranks in the armed forces, the Committee feel that there is an imperative need to motivate and encourage the younger age-groups particularly in rural areas by way of wider dissemination of information for raising their level of consciousness about the positive aspects of Defence services as well as the criteria of qualifications and the modes of selection prescribed for entry at different levels in various branches/cadres of the three services. The Committee also feel that the growing security challenges are becoming primary issues of concern before the nation and every Ministry/ Department of the Government have to contribute their share in giving support to the various dimensions of the defence services. The Committee, therefore, emphasise that the MoD should devise multipronged strategies in consultation with the three defence services, important Ministries/ Departments having a bearing on them and also the State Governments so as to have full impact on the target age groups.

### **Reply of the Government**

There are existing established strategies for reaching out to the potential candidates all over the country for motivating them to take up a career in the Armed Forces. The Forces have undertaken sustained image projection and publicity campaign to create awareness among youth on the advantages of taking up a challenging and satisfying career. Focused publicity drives in various institutions to attract potential candidates are undertaken. Awareness campaigns, participation in career fairs and exhibitions, advertisements in print and electronic media, motivational lectures in schools, colleges are undertaken. Information is disseminated through official websites. Training imparted through NCC Units in schools/colleges and Sainik Schools spread across the country contributes in spreading awareness about career in Armed Forces. Activities like Air Shows, Sky Diving, Adventure activities, and visits by Naval Ships to small/medium ports are organised to give exposure to the local populations and enthuse them to take up Armed Forces as a career.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 6)**

The Committee in their 29th Report (14th LS) had, *inter-alia*, recommended that the sanctioned strength of NCC should be sufficiently augmented with adequate funding to cover all schools/colleges in the waiting list and also those who like to enrol their students. The Committee are convinced about the immense potential of NCC cadets and the infrastructure created for the purpose and they strongly feel that the coverage under NCC needs to be widened within shortest possible time and earnest efforts directed towards optimal utilization of this resource.

### **Reply of the Government**

With the view to cover the institutions on the waiting list for introduction of NCC in a phased manner, training for NCC Senior Division/Wing has been reduced from 3 years to 2 years, thereby providing NCC coverage to additional 90,000 cadets by the end of the third year.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 7)**

The Government have established Rashtriya Indian Military College, five Military schools and 22 Sainik Schools in various parts of the country to act as feeder institutions for the National Defence Academy (NDA). Although the curricula of these institutions are specifically designed to train the students for entry to the armed forces, the Committee are perturbed to find that a very small percentage of students from these institutions are presently opting for a career in the defence services. The Committee feels that it is high time that the MoD took concrete policy initiatives to optimally utilize this infrastructure created for training the younger generation to prepare them for a career in the armed forces by further strengthening the quality of teaching faculty and providing adequate financial assistance to these institutions as well as to the students selected from economically weaker sections of the society.

### **Reply of the Government**

#### **Sainik Schools**

The Sainik Schools follow the CBSE pattern of curriculum and a number of measures have been initiated to achieve academic excellence. These include posting of only select rank Cols. or equivalent from the education branches of the three services as Principal to provide experienced and professionally competent academic leadership. Annual in-service professional training for all teaching and administrative staff is conducted with specialist resource personnel from reputed education related institutions like NCERT, National University of Education Planning

and Administration (NUEPA) and similar State run body for improvement of Board results. Specialised resource personnel are co-opted to train and guide cadets appearing in the board exams. Additionally, Services Selection Board (SSB) oriented training is provided using professional resource personnel. Sainik Schools have been conceived as financially self-sustaining institutions. A major portion of the recurring expenditure is met out by the fees payable by the parents. The State Government are responsible for the creation/maintenance of physical infrastructure and meeting a portion of the recurring expenditure. The State Governments award scholarships on merit-cum-means basis to the boys of their respective States. As far as the Union Government is concerned, a budget provision of Rs. 17.60 crore exists under Defence Service Estimates to meet expenditure on subsidies towards fee and dietary charges, incentives for cadets joining the National Defence Academy, scholarships to wards of Defence personnel/ex-servicemen and training grants to these schools. The Ministry of Defence also provides training grants to the schools regularly to upgrade their training infrastructure and skills. Rs. Two crore have been provided from the Union Budget of 2008-09 to each School to upgrade their training infrastructure. In addition, Central Government has decided to provide 80 per cent of the additionality to the Sainik Schools by way of grant-in-aid to meet the additional financial liability on account of implementation of the Sixth Central Pay Commission. Every year at least two Sainik School teachers are selected for the national award conferred by the President on Teachers Day. The Sainik Schools have shown an upward trend in the number of cadets joining the National Defence Academy in keeping with the primary aim of establishing of Sainik Schools to prepare boys academically, physically and mentally for entry into the National Defence Academy. Details of the number of cadets from Sainik Schools joining NDA during the last five years are given in Annexure-'A'.

### **Rashtriya Indian Military College**

The training infrastructure at Rashtriya Indian Military College is being optimally utilized. The standard of faculty at the College is above average. Adequate funds to the institution and financial assistance to the students is being provided. Details of the number of cadets from Rashtriya Indian Military College joining NDA during the last four years are given in Annexure-'B'.

### **Rashtriya Military Schools**

The aim of Rashtriya Military Schools is to provide quality education and prepare the cadets for a career in the Armed forces. Constant efforts are made to improve the infrastructure and ambience of these institutions.

In the Budget allocation for the financial year 2008-09 and 2009-10, an allocation of Rs. 5.54 crore and Rs. 5.00 crore respectively has been made for Rashtriya Military Schools for Major Works Projects. In addition to this, the following public funds have been allotted during the financial year 2008-09 to Rashtriya Military Schools:—

- (i) ATG : Rs. 7.00 Lakh each school
- (ii) I&M : Rs. 27.00 Lakh each school
- (iii) Lib. Grant : Rs. 1.67 Lakh each school
- (iv) IT : Rs. 100 Lakh all 5 schools
- (v) SAG : Rs. 45 Lakh (RMS, Dholpur, Belgaum and Chail)

Efforts are being made to fill up the vacancies of teachers in Rashtriya Military schools. Fee charged from the wards of PBOR entitled category is highly subsidised. The non-entitled category *i.e.* wards of officers and civilians are being offered scholarships @ 15% of total strength as under:—

- (i) Income below Rs. 1,00,000 per annum — waiver of full fee.
- (ii) Income Rs. 1,00,000 - Rs. 1,50,000 per annum — waiver of 50% of fee.

In order to rejuvenate Rashtriya Military Schools, Project Officers (Lt. Col./Major), Library NCO, Computer NCO, PT Instructor and Drill Instructor have been provided to each school.

#### **Annexure 'A'**

##### **NDA Intake from Sainik Schools – Last five years**

Sl. No.	Year	Course Numbers	NDA authorized course strength in the year (two courses)	Course-wise Intake of Sainik Schools cadets	Total intake of Sainik Schools cadets in the year	Percentage of Sainik Schools cadets joined NDA
1.	2004	111 - 112	600	38 and 87	125	20.9
2.	2005	113 - 114	600	18 and 96	114	19.0
3.	2006	115 - 116	600	42 and 131	173	28.5
4.	2007	117 - 118	600	43 and 120	163	27.1
5.	2008	119 - 120	595	28 and 158	186	31.2

## Annexure 'B'

### NDA Intake from Rashtriya Indian Military College – Last four years

Sl. No.	Term	Appeared	Joined NDA	Percentage
1.	May 2005	30	20	66.66
2.	Nov. 2005	35	24	68.57
3.	May 2006	37	20	54.00
4.	Nov. 2006	42	26	61.90
5.	May 2007	29	24	82.75
6.	Nov. 2007	28	17	60.71
7.	May 2008	26	21	76.92
8.	Nov. 2008	26	21	76.92

### Recommendation (Paragraph No. 9)

The Committee note that different procedures are being adopted by the three services for recruitment of PBORs/Sailor/Airmen. While Air Force and Navy adopt a system of recruitment on all India basis, the recruitment of PBORs in the Army is made through recruitment rallies on the basis of the concept of census based Recruitable Male Population. The Committee understand that the recruitment rallies so held in different parts of the country for recruitment of PBORs attract a large number of candidates. Besides causing inconvenience to the candidates coming for the recruitment rallies, their large number also sometimes assume unmanageable proportions resulting in stampede as is being reported in the media from time to time. Considering the fact that the recruitment procedure for PBORs involves a number of stages, the Committee strongly recommend that a system of inviting applications in advance for such rallies should be put in place and the eligible candidates called in batches for smooth conduct of selection tests. The Committee are in no doubt that such a system will not only discourage instances of impersonation and involvement of touts but also project a bright image of the defence services.

### Reply of the Government

Prior to 1998, Indian Army was following the Application System of recruitment. The system had to be changed on account of the following drawbacks:—

- (i) The system encouraged proliferation of touts/agents and their increased influence over potential candidates.

- (ii) It was very restricted in nature and not easily accessible to the public.
- (iii) Remote areas/backward areas were not covered.
- (iv) A large number of applications were misplaced in postal transit thus candidates were not screened.

To overcome above drawbacks, 'Open Rally System' was brought into effect in 1998 with the aim of ensuring that recruitment is transparent and fool proof. Recruitment through "Open Rallies" facilitated recruitment in the remote areas. Each district is covered at least once if not twice in a recruitment year. The involvement of touts in this procedure has been greatly curtailed. During the rallies, specific dates are earmarked for each district/tehsil as also for various categories, to avoid over crowding during rallies.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 11)**

As brought out earlier in this report, the pre-induction training infrastructure especially in the army is inadequate to meet the enhanced manpower requirement of the officers in the armed forces. The Committee have been informed during evidence that a proposal to set up another officers' training institute to meet the training requirement of increased induction of SSC officers in the army has been approved "in principle" but it would require detailed financial approval from the Ministry of Finance. In the light of the fact that creation of new infrastructure for imparting pre-induction training not only involves huge financial implications but also long drawn and time consuming process, the Committee strongly feel that earnest efforts should be directed towards large scale and rationalized expansion of existing training institutes in a time bound manner so as to ensure optimal and efficient utilization of these institutions. The Committee are in no doubt that besides being cost-effective, such a step would also put minimal pressure on the manpower required for running such institutions and requisitioned from already depleted strength of the officers.

### **Reply of the Government**

Augmentation of Pre-induction Training infrastructure and enhancement of their capacity are among the important measures taken up by the Ministry for addressing the issue of shortage of officers in the Armed Forces. The proposals in this regard are being appropriately progressed. As such, efforts are already under way for rationalized expansion of pre-commission Training Institutes.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 12)**

The Committee note that the training period is counted towards service in case of PBOR in the armed forces. However, the same benefit is not extended to officers inducted in the armed forces. The Committee feel that there can be no plausible explanation for not adopting uniform practices in this regard and they desire that the period of pre-induction training imparted to the officers in the armed forces should be reckoned as service rendered for the purposes of pensionary benefits.

### **Reply of the Government**

The issue of counting of training period of officer cadets for all purposes was deliberated upon by the VI Central Pay Commission (VI CPC). The VI CPC have observed that the successful completion of training is a pre-requisite for the grant of Commission in the Defence Forces, a situation which is not totally comparable with the civilian side. They have further observed that counting of the service spent under training for all purposes would imply that officers would get promoted as Captain one year after commission instead of 2 years at present and this residency period appears to be extremely short. Therefore, the Commission did not recommend any change in the present provisions relating to pre-commission service. Further, as no wage/salary is paid to the trainee and induction to training is not after recruitment (as in the case of PBOR and Civil Services), the training period cannot be counted as service for officers.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 18)**

The Committee note that statutory and non-statutory channels are available to the Defence service personnel for seeking redressal of their service related grievances. While the efficacy of this system stands proved by candid admission of Defence Secretary that a few promotions had been given on the basis of statutory complaints, the Committee need hardly emphasise that such complaints are required to be entertained on priority and first cum first served basis so as to display a sense of equity, fair play and justice. The Committee trust that the MoD will expeditiously take appropriate steps in this regard.

### **Reply of the Government**

Statutory and Non-Statutory complaints are handled as per laid down guidelines and it is endeavoured to dispose of such complaints within the stipulated time frame.

## **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 19)**

Appropriate steps should also be taken to ensure that the adverse entries made in the Annual Confidential Reports (ACRs) are invariably communicated to the officers concerned within a prescribed time frame with a view to affording them an opportunity to clarify their position for appropriate action. Proper systems should also be put in place to avoid any delay in forwarding the ACRs to the concerned quarters for being placed before the selection boards so as to avoid any cause of complaints from the eligible officers in the zone of consideration. The feasibility of reducing the number of officers reviewing the ACRs should also be considered in the positive light.

### **Reply of the Government**

#### ARMY

As per extant provisions, adverse remarks in Annual Confidential Reports (ACRs) are always communicated to the concerned officers by their Initiating Reviewing officers as applicable.

Timely initiation of ACRs is monitored. A system has been put in place under which details of ACRs not received in the stipulated time-frame are automatically generated and intimation to HQ Commands is forwarded for expediting their movement.

The system of reporting being followed in the Army is a three tier, one which has an 'initiator', 'moderator' and a 'balancer' in the chain. The initiating and the reviewing officers endorse all ACRs while outstanding ACRs are reviewed by Senior Reviewing Officer also. The system has been in vogue since independence and has stood the test of time.

#### NAVY

The Naval Appraisal System has incorporated certain measures to ensure that any adverse remark in the Annual Confidential Reports is conveyed to the officer on whom the ACR is being rendered. This is done through a Performance Appraisal Discussion on the ACR wherein the Initiating Officer is required to advise the appraisee on his/her performance during the period under consideration. Further, all specific adverse remarks are required to be countersigned by the appraisee in the ACR.

In order to obviate any delays in processing the ACRs the Navy has instituted a system wherein the appraisee receives an



acknowledgement slip from all officers in the chain of reporting, when they receive the ACR for endorsing their comments. This ensures that the officer can monitor the progress of the ACR and can address the concerned person, should there be any delay on any account.

There are only three levels of reporting in the case of more than 90% officers of the Navy. This is primarily on the grounds that it allows objective analyses of the performance of individuals through comparison with his peers, who would be carrying out similar tasks in different organizations. This also entails that there are one or more Flag officers in the Chain of Reporting, depending on the rank of the officer being reported upon, whose experience would ensure adequate moderation, if required.

## AIR FORCE

Appropriate instructions already exist for mandatory communication of adverse grading/comments to afford adequate opportunity to all to clarify their position. A time frame has been stipulated for processing and transmission of ACRs to ensure that the ACRs of officers in zone of consideration are available to the selection boards and the adherence to the same is closely monitored. The number of officers reviewing ACRs is in consonance with those required to ensure a just appraisal to all officers across the board.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 20)**

The fact that a large number of cases relating to service matters of armed forces personnel are pending with various courts of law is a clear indicator that the satisfaction level for seeking redressal of grievance through normal departmental channels is distressingly low. Obviously, the existing systems and procedures are not sound enough to provide appropriate remedy to the aggrieved defence personnel. The Committee are in no doubt that the laws governing the three services require a thorough review in the light of various judgments delivered by the courts during recent times. The Committee also feel that there is a need to identify those weak spots in the system which opens the floodgates of litigation. The Committee expect the MoD to give serious attention towards this aspect so as to avoid unnecessary litigation involving huge financial burden and loss of man-hours.

### **Reply of the Government**

There is a well established redressal mechanism in the Services for redressal of grievances. Despite this, a number of court cases *inter alia*,

relating to service matters, disciplinary matters etc. do arise. The issue of review of laws/regulations pertaining to the Services for appropriate changes is an ongoing process. The Government has also constituted the Armed Forces Tribunal for adjudication of complaints and disputes pertaining to Service matters and appeals arising out of Court Martials with a view to provide for quicker and less expensive justice to the members of the Armed Forces.

#### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 21)**

The Committee understand that preparatory action has been taken by the Ministry to establish the Armed Forces Tribunal. However, the tribunal is yet to be notified under Section 4 of the relevant Act. The Committee trust that an urgent action would be taken to operationalise the Tribunal without any further delay.

#### **Reply of the Government**

Notification under Section 4 of the Armed Forces Act has been issued on 07.08.2009 for establishing the Tribunal by specifying the 'appointed day' under Section 3 (c) of the Act. The Principal Bench of the Tribunal at Delhi has started functioning from 10.08.2009. The Government is making all efforts to facilitate the functioning/ operationalisation of all other Benches of the Armed Forces Tribunal.

#### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 22)**

The Committee are in no doubt that while the chain of command and control has to be kept intact to maintain highest level of discipline in the Armed Forces, there is need for attitudinal change in the mindset of those in the higher echelon in view of the socio-economic changes in the society and the enhanced level of the educational qualification amongst the personnel holding lower ranks in the armed forces. The Committee feel that it is high time that multipronged strategies are devised and adopted with a view to bringing in necessary reforms in the armed forces. They, therefore, desire that concrete steps should be taken to discard undesirable discriminatory practices based on rank structure and gender bias. Needless to say that such step would not only result in redressal of genuine grievances of lower ranks but also help in better management of stress level in the armed forces.

#### **Reply of the Government**

Adequate safeguards/mechanisms exist to prevent any kind of discrimination including based on rank structure or gender bias. There is a well established redressal mechanism in the Services for redressal

of grievances for all ranks. Continuous measures are taken on an on going basis aimed at reducing stress of Armed Forces personnel.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 23)**

The Committee are of the view that the Ministry of Defence may come forward on their own and play a proactive role in addressing the legitimate and genuine grievances of the members of the armed forces considering the fact that the constitutional and legal provisions restrict them to form associations or unions. The Committee feel that such an act on the part of the Ministry will prove efficacious enough in boosting the morale of the armed forces personnel.

### **Reply of the Government**

#### **ARMY**

Army personnel are entitled to redress of grievances relating to denial of military rights through Non Statutory Complaints. Such complaints are submitted and processed alongwith laid down channels. If the complainant is not satisfied with the outcome of Non Statutory Complaint he may submit a Statutory Complaint on the same subject to the Central Government.

Detailed procedures to process the grievances of personnel through Command/Staff Channel are in place. There is also a forum called "Dreamer's Club" on official Army Website on internet, where every officer and Personnel Below Officer Rank (PBOR) can share innovative ideas and can also participate in discussion. The disclosing of identity is optional, the suggestion and ideas are analysed in detail at the highest level on regular basis and suitable corrective actions are taken to improve the existing system and processes.

#### **AIR FORCE**

Officers and airmen are entitled to submit a representation to Superior Officer, who shall investigate into the complaint. Besides the above, a statutory right is also available to a person tried by a Court Martial to submit a petition against the finding and sentence of a Court Martial at the pre and post confirmation stage.

In the IAF, there is no gap between officers and staff in regard to discussing (personal or other) problems openly. The facility of open interviews with Air Officer Commanding/ Station Commander/ COs on any issue is available to tall air warriors for speedy redressal of grievances as well as to instill confidence and faith in the leadership.

Periodic counselling of subordinate staff is carried out by supervisors/section commanders and Branch Head/Commanding Officers. Special emphasis is put on inter-personal relationship and constant interaction at all levels.

Facility has been provided to all service personnel to post any suggestion/complaint at the CAS Website on the IAF Intranet, which are addressed expeditiously.

Various forums already exist in the IAF where personnel can project their grievances for redressal. These forums are being extensively and effectively utilized. A well defined mechanism exists in the IAF wherein the redressal of the grievances is provided to the personnel within the parameters of the organization. Some of these are enumerated below:—

- (a) **Adm. Help Cell:** Adm. Help Cells called 'Samvedna' are established at each station. These provide a single point contact in the station for welfare of all AF personnel.
- (b) **CAS website:** There is a facility available for all service personnel to post any suggestion/complaint on the CAS website on the IAF Intranet. These are considered at appropriate level and feedback given expeditiously.
- (c) **Open Interview:** Air Officer Commanding (AOC)/Station Commander in all stations grant opportunity of open interview to all personnel. The grievances brought out by them are heard by the AOC/Stn. Cdr. personally and addressed appropriately.
- (d) **Welfare Meeting:** Welfare meetings for PBORs and Darbars for DSC personnel are held periodically by Air Officer Commanding/Station Commander/Commanding Officer. Points related to welfare are addressed promptly.
- (e) **Helpline:** In most of the Command HQ, helpline has been set up which can be contacted at all times by all personnel in the Command. Setting up of such helpline in the remaining Command HQ is in progress.
- (f) **AFWWA:** A Air Force Wives Welfare Association (AFWWA) looks after the welfare of the families of the air warriors. Besides ensuring **welfare of** the families, all the grievances put forth by the wives of air warrior are promptly addressed.

## NAVY

In the Navy, the 'Divisional System' is a time tested forum which provides for regular interaction between officers and sailors. In this system, a group of sailors are assigned to one Divisional Officer (who may be their Departmental Officer) acting as their 'friend, philosopher and guide'. The sailors are encouraged to share all their problems including personal, domestic, service and any other issue agitating them. The Divisional Officer renders all possible help in the form of informing appropriate agencies, authorities and Command to ensure 'Redressal of their Grievances' in an informal environment. In addition Divisional Officer's Period (DOP) is conducted periodically and problems posed by sailors are recorded with remedial measure taken. The sailors in the Navy have a well laid down system of forwarding their requests to Divisional Officer pertaining to their welfare, promotion, domestic issues and the same are disposed off in a time bound manner at appropriate levels which can reach right up to the 'Chief of the Naval Staff'.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 25)**

The Committee note that certain criteria have been laid down in the three services for considering the request for pre-mature retirement or resignation from the Services. The Committee's examination of the subject matter has revealed that such requests from officers are considered on merit of the case and requirements of the service. Undoubtedly, discretionary powers in such matters result in discontentment among officers in a number of cases. The Committee, therefore, stress that the Ministry of Defence should lay down clear-cut, objective and well-defined policy guidelines in this regard leaving no scope for arbitrary decisions. It should also be ensured that cases of similar nature are treated in an equitable manner.

### **Reply of the Government**

Guidelines and mechanisms for considering requests for premature retirement are already laid down for the three services. These are applied uniformly and in an equitable manner.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 26)**

The Committee consider it desirable that the Government should make it mandatory for all the armed forces officers including those serving in Defence Public Sector Undertakings to seek permission from the Government for taking up post-retirement employment within two years of their release from the Services. Stringent action should be contemplated against those violating such stipulations.

## **Reply of the Government**

As per present instructions, armed forces officers are required to seek permission of the Government prior to taking up commercial employment within one year of their release from service.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 31)**

The Committee notes that the charter of DRDO requires them to render advice to the three services and inter-services organizations on scientific aspect of weapons, military operations, support and logistics in all likely threats of conflict. Taking into account the multifarious responsibilities assigned to the Secretary (R&D) to act as Director General of DRDO and DG of Aeronautical Development Agency besides being Scientific Advisor to Raksha Mantri, the Committee in their (14th Lok Sabha) had observed that such a situation diluted the efficacy of the DRDO. They had accordingly desired that one person in DRDO should not be entrusted with a number of responsibilities. The Committee have now been informed by the Ministry of Defence that the whole issue of management of DRDO was being looked in to by a Committee headed by Dr. P. Rama Rao and that Committee had submitted its confidential report in March, 2008. Considering the fact that DRDO has an important role in rendering advice on scientific aspects of weapons and military operations to the three Services, the Committee feel convinced that any further delay in taking decision in such a crucial matter will have an adverse impact on the effective functioning of both the DRDO and the three Services.

## **Reply of the Government**

The DRDO Review Committee headed by Dr. P Rama Rao had submitted its confidential report to the Government in March, 2008. The report is under study and analysis by the Government.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 32)**

To sum up, the Committee's examination has revealed certain deficiencies and shortcomings in manpower planning and human resource management in the armed forces. Broadly, the areas of concern are:—

- (a) Absence of proper system for assessment of manpower requirement;
- (b) Inability to meet persisting shortage of officers;
- (c) Inadequate initiatives to encourage and motivate the younger generation to join armed forces;

- (d) Lack of awareness among the eligible youth regarding recruitment procedures;
- (e) Need for improvement in the recruitment procedures;
- (f) Adequate pre-induction training infrastructure;
- (g) Desirability of better management of career prospects and working conditions; and
- (h) Need for multipronged strategies for welfare of serving defence personnel and ex-servicemen.

Although the MoD have maintained that several policy initiatives have been undertaken to address the issues, the Committee are of considered view that some of these initiatives are still on paper while the others will take a long time to fructify. The Committee strongly feel that the armed forces deserve to be accorded the status of a national service in view of the unique nature of duties being performed by them in all parts of the country. They, therefore, desire that a permanent high powered Core Group comprising representatives from the MoD; the three defence services; and the Ministries/Departments connected with the matter relating to the defence services in any manner should be constituted by the Government so as to ensure effective and timely implementation of the various steps contemplated from time to time or are in the process of being introduced for improving the quality of life of defence service personnel engaged in protecting national security concerns in difficult situations away from their family for prolonged periods.

### **Reply of the Government**

The Ministry is already seized of the entire gamut of issues covering the areas raised by the Committee. The Ministry has 'in principle' approved wide ranging measures covering different aspects for implementation. Based thereon, specific proposals have been initiated which are being suitably progressed for approval and implementation. Thus the Ministry is fully alive to the issues pertaining to manpower planning and human resource management in the armed forces and appropriate action in this regard is already under way. The welfare of ex-servicemen is being looked after by a full fledged Department (Department of Ex-Servicemen Welfare) under Ministry of Defence. Appropriate forums already exist for coordination between the Services and Ministry of Defence. Wherever required, inter-ministerial consultations with the concerned Ministries is done/will be done at an appropriate level. As such, it is not considered necessary to constitute a separate permanent high powered Core Group.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 33)**

With the advent of technological development and fast changing nature of warfare in the modern times, the need for hi-tech training has become a necessity for maintaining a highly skilled force. The Committee are, however, distressed to find that a number of serving officers and other ranks being sent for training is abysmally low in the three services as is evident from the statistics furnished by the MoD which bring out that the percentage of officers sent for training as against the officers in position is 24 in Army followed by 5 per cent and 3 per cent in Navy and Air Force respectively. The picture in respect of PBORs sent for training as equally dismal with such figures being 6 per cent in Air Force, 4.8 per cent in Navy and a poor 1.7 per cent in Army. The Committee is dismayed to find that despite depleted strength, the services are not able to impart requisite training to the majority of serving officers and other ranks on the latest technological changes and the state-of-the-art equipment inducted from time to time. Undoubtedly, availability of inadequate infrastructure and facilities in the training institutions is adversely affecting the modernization of the armed forces. The Committee, therefore, desire that the existing training infrastructure should be expanded at a large scale keeping in view the future requirements including those necessitated due to enhanced induction of manpower in the future. Appropriate steps should also be simultaneously taken to expeditiously meet the manpower requirements in the training institutions and to ensure that the existing hi-tech training infrastructure is put to optimal use.

### **Reply of the Government**

#### **ARMY**

In order to enhance infrastructure to impart hi-tech training, a detailed policy on establishment of Computer Training Laboratories (CTLs) and Campus-Wide Networks (CWNs) has been formalized.

One-fourth (24%) of the Army officers are on training at any given time. As far as PBOR is concerned the figure is 1.7%. Increase of this figure is *inter alia* dependent upon the ability of units/formations to spare the increased numbers of PBOR from operation and training commitments.

With a view to enhance Training Infrastructure in Training Establishments. A capital expenditure grant called 'Modernisation of Laboratories and Training Infrastructure (MOLTI)' has been specially instituted for this purpose based on Army's Five Year Plans. The outlay



for this grant is substantial enough to meet the projected requirements of Category A establishments. Utilising this grant, large amount of infrastructure has come up and continues to be created.

## AIR FORCE

The Air Force provides necessary training to its personnel as per the requirements. This includes training on existing as well as modern state-of-the-art equipment. In-service courses are also undertaken at various stages of their service career to develop the skills of the personnel. The training tasks are worked out keeping the requirements of the personnel in mind.

The present infrastructure for cadets at Air Force Academy (AFA) is of world class standard which is being progressively upgraded as per various modernization programmers. With an increase in induction of trainees and the evolving changes of training patterns necessitated by advancement in technology, the IAF has felt the need to develop the infrastructure at its training establishments. Action for further development of training infrastructure with all modern facilities/amenities has been initiated.

## NAVY

The training philosophy in the Navy entails the following:–

Integrated approach for training of officers as they are required to shoulder leadership and managerial responsibilities in addition to furthering their professional knowledge at every stage of their career.

Vertical specialisation approach for training of sailors primarily due to their limited responsibilities and short duration of initial engagement as compared to the officers.

Both officers and sailors are trained at regular intervals, in various facets to keep pace with advancements in technology by means of various courses/attachments. These professional courses are interspersed with tenures on boardships to consolidate the learning absorbed during courses. 100% officers and sailors undergo the professional training upto certain stage.

In addition to the structured professional courses, operator/maintainer training for the newly inducted equipment is conducted by the Original Equipment Manufacturer (OEM) as part of the contract. The

requisite training aids/live equipment/simulators are procured for the training schools to impart further training to the replacement crew as part of the Pre-Commissioning Training (PCT). Thereafter, personnel are given On the Job Training (OJT) to gain first hand knowledge in handling the equipment.

The new Naval Academy at Ezhimala has been commissioned in January, 2009. The current strength of the academy is 750 cadets.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 34)**

The Committee notes that a policy envisaging implementation of e-learning by 2012 in three phases in army was introduced in August, 2005. Considering the fact that the format of e-learning will not only shorten the duration of the training but also enhance the capability level, the Committee desires the MoD to make concerted efforts to ensure that the policy is implemented strictly in accordance with the time schedule prescribed in this regard. They also desire that an appropriate mechanism to monitor progress of this policy be put in place in the Ministry and the project not allowed to languish on any account of any factor.

### **Reply of the Government**

#### **ARMY**

In order to monitor e-learning implementation in the Army, a steering committee will, all stake holders as members, has been constituted. A road map with timelines for implementing various activities associated with e-learning such as network architecture, content development etc., has also been issued to all concerned. A number of measures have been implemented for expediting of e-learning in the Army. Concerted efforts are being put in to ensure that e-learning policy is implemented as per time schedule.

#### **AIR FORCE**

In respect of IAF, e-learning is planned to be introduced in the in-service courses for the officers, such as Basic Professional Knowledge Course (BPKC), Advanced Professional Knowledge Course (APKC), Basic Air Staff Course (BASCO) and Intermediate Staff Course (ISCO) and for airmen in Modules II and III, as part of their Modular Pattern Training. This will be implemented, once the IAF communication network termed AFNET, for which the work is underway, comes into operation.

## NAVY

E-learning has been implemented in Navy since 2006 at the Naval Training Command, Kochi. The system enables distributed learning for professional training in various Professional Schools through Campus Area Network (CAN) in the form of Sharable Content Object Resource Management (SCORM) compliant e-learning packages.

Further, to implement e-learning in the entire Navy, a project proposal is in concept development stage. The proposal is to provide learning through on-line courses, based on the Data Centre model with Navy-wide downward connectivity.

The proposal envisages a comprehensive naval portal on public domain and a Satellite based Naval Educational Network (SANEN) for providing access to remote areas. The services proposed to be provisioned are, as follows:—

- (a) Professional and Educational Development.
- (b) Resource Centre based Knowledge Management (KM) Services.
- (c) In-house and Vocational On-line Courses.
- (d) Educational/Academic On-line Courses.
- (e) Resource Centre for all exams for Officers and Sailors.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 35)**

It has been informed during evidence by the representative of a Service that the available training infrastructure especially for hi-tech training needed to be increased with “speed”. The Committee consider that this aspect requires utmost attention in the MoD, particularly in view of the findings of Comptroller and Auditor General of India (C&AG) contained in his report on Union Government (Defence Services) for the year ended March, 2007 which reveals an instance where the issue of procurement of new simulator has been pending for over four years in the MoD thus adversely affecting the operational as well as on-the-job training of the submarine crew. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that the MoD should consider delegation of appropriate power and authority to the service headquarters to enable them to take timely measures on such issues so as to ensure increased and effective combat capabilities of the forces.

## **Reply of the Government**

Financial powers of the Vice Chief of Army Staff/Vice Chief of Naval Staff/Deputy Chief of Air Staff/Chief of Integrated Service Command have been enhanced from Rs. 30 crores to Rs. 50 crores for sanctioning Capital Acquisition Scheme for procurement of equipment and stores.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 38)**

The Committee understand that there is an urgent need to gear up our armed forces to meet the challenges of growing threat perception in view of the fact that the global security scenario is fast changing with the advent of technological advancements in the nature of warfare. This not only necessitates state-of-the-art training facilities but also requires sustained efforts for being ready for tomorrow. The Committee, accordingly, desires that the MoD should pay serious attention towards this aspect and devise an effective training strategy to meet the long-term technological requirements of the armed forces keeping pace with the changing times and implement it in an efficient manner with adequate budgetary support. Any constraints experienced in implementation of this strategy should be adequately addressed well in time so that the schedule of imparting knowledge on the upgraded technologies to the armed forces personnel is not disturbed. The concept of jointness and tri-services training should also be taken into account so as to ensure effective integration of the combat capabilities and better coordination in situation of war.

## **Reply of the Government**

Training in the three services is an ongoing process. Keeping pace with strategic objectives and operational and tactical focus, Armed Forces have constantly refined and endeavoured to update the training curriculum, syllabus and procedures. The art of warfare and conduct of training in the Armed Forces is a dynamic process. Indian Armed Forces have been continuously refining the system of training so as to keep pace with the technological advancements and ever changing face of the future battlefield. The training is structured in keeping with ever changing environmental realities. All the three services have kept pace with the induction of state-of-the-art equipment through extensive upgrades in technology, intensive training aids. There has also been a thrust on the improvement of training infrastructure, examination and revision of the existing curriculum and its use. The Services have gone for e-learning, computerised war game packages and extensive use of Information Technology.

Jointness in warfare is the effective integration of the combat capabilities of the three Services. The issue of jointness and tri-service training in the Armed Forces is being addressed adequately. The raising of Headquarters Integrated Defence Services and Theatre Command in Andaman and Nicobar Command (ANC) are some significant steps in this direction. The issue of joint training of officers in the Armed Forces is addressed both at the pre-commissioning and in-service stages. National Defence Academy (NDA) is the main institution which imparts pre-commission training to cadets of the three Services, while in service formations and units organise war games and exercises besides visits to each other stations to enhance awareness and understand each others capabilities and limitations. Further, various training establishments also impart joint training to service officers at the induction, middle and higher level like Defence Service Staff College, Wellington. The Higher Command courses of the Army, Navy and the Air Force and Higher Defence Management Course also contribute to the call of joint training in a big way.

### **CHAPTER III**

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT**

##### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 10)**

The Committee note that while the duration of pre-induction training in the case of graduate level entry for Short Service Commission (SSC) and Permanent Commission (PC) is same in the Navy and the Air Force, the period of such training imparted to graduates of SSC at OTA is only one year as against one and a half years in the IMA for those seeking PC in the army. The Committee have been informed that the training imparted for PC is more vigorous than that of SSC. Taking into consideration the fact that the pre-induction training is imparted for developing the qualities of leadership demanded of every army officer after commissioning, the Committee find it rather strange as to why and how the candidates for PC and SSC are trained differently when they are expected to perform similar duties after being commissioned as officers in the Army. The Committee, therefore, desire that the modules and duration of training for graduate level entries for SSC and PC in the Army may be thoroughly reviewed with a view to bringing in parity in imparting pre-induction training to them on the lines of practices being adopted by the other two Services.

##### **Reply of the Government**

Terms and conditions of service of each entry in Army are different and no parallels can be drawn. Duration of pre-induction training is also different for various entries. The pre-induction training is thus essentially based on the employment and role which an individual is expected to perform on induction. Considering the role and employment of SSC officers, it has been kept at one year keeping in view their service period of 14 years. The senior-most rank the SSC officers achieve is that of Lt. Colonel and whereby they will only command a sub-unit. On the other hand, a PC officer is likely to command battalions or higher

formations and hence has to be groomed/trained accordingly. In case of Air Force and Navy such command structures (section, platoon, company or battalion) do not exist and their training is mainly related to skill (flying) or Technical. Hence, the pre-induction training period is same for SSC as well as for PC officers.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 16)**

Although the Government appointed AV Singh Committee and implemented its Report with a view to fulfilling individual career aspirations of the Officers in the armed forces, the Committee find it strange that no such efforts have been directed towards PBORs in the three Services. The Committee desire that similar steps should be taken for career advancement of PBORs.

### **Reply of the Government**

Following steps have been taken for career advancement of PBORs:—

- (a) **Assured Career Progression:** Pursuant to the recommendations of the 6th Central Pay Commission, PBORs will be entitled to minimum three financial upgradation after 8,16,24 years of Service.
- (b) **6th Central Pay Commission:** Pay and allowances of PBORs in the three Services have been revised pursuant to the recommendations of 6th CPC with some improvements.
- (c) **Qualifying Service for Pension:** With the implementation of recommendations of 6th Central Pay Commission, full pension has been delinked from 33 years of qualifying service. A PBOR shall be granted pension @ 50% of the last reckonable emoluments subject to minimum qualifying service of 15 years.
- (d) **MoU with Indira Gandhi National Open University:** MoU with Indira Gandhi National Open University for award of BA, BSc., B. Tech. and BBA degrees to PBOR to enhance their career prospects post-retirement. Army has entered into an MoU with Indira Gandhi National Open University (IGNOU) for establishment of IGNOU—Army Community Colleges that will empower the Regimental Training Centres/Human

Resource Development Centres (HRDCs) of the Army to grant IGNOU recognised formal degree to PBOR based on their in-service training. As per MoU signed on 4th September, 2009, Army Regimental Training Centres (RTCs) and HRDCs will be empowered to grant PBOR certificates, Diplomas and Associate Degree based on the in-service training imparted in the training Centres, HRDCs and Army School of Instructors. The award of associate degree to soldiers will enable them to obtain a degree from IGNOU after they undergo a course module prescribed by IGNOU. Thus, the Army-IGNOU community Colleges will create flexible learning opportunities for personnel of the Indian Army that would enhance their academic skill, status and confidence and provide them with better post retirement opportunities in civil job market.

- (e) **Cadre Review:** To address the enhanced aspiration level of PBOR, a study group headed by the Director General, Army Air Defence has been constituted to carryout a holistic appraisal of the existing rank structure of PBOR in all Arms and Services in the Army.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 37)**

The Committee's examination has also brought out that the number of officers being sent for training abroad is minuscule. The Committee feel that the training abroad provide opportunity to the armed forces officers to upgrade their knowledge in a different environment and the skills so acquired can be shared and gainfully utilized by the services. The Committee, therefore, desire that the policy for sending officers for training abroad should be reviewed in a positive light and emphasise should be laid on identifying those specialized areas where inadequate facilities exist in the country.

### **Reply of the Government**

The country has advance training facilities which are at par with those of most developed nations and the high quality of training imparted alongwith the high professional standards have been appreciated by the foreign officers and foreign delegations undergoing training and visiting these institutes. However, training with foreign armed forces both at the individual level and participation in service to service exercises involving



other countries are also undertaken. Selected officers and students from the Tri-Services Institutes visit Training Institutes outside the country and also host delegations from other countries so as to benefit from each others' experience and core competence.

## CHAPTER IV

### RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION

#### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 5)**

The Committee also feel that it is equally important to simultaneously initiate concrete steps for the larger involvement of the three services for imparting pre-selection Services Selection Board (SSB) oriented training in all schools and educational institutions including technical education institutions by utilizing the services of professionally qualified defence personnel so as to supplement the governmental efforts in disseminating the defence related information specially in those areas where such infrastructure is weak, inadequate or non-existent.

#### **Reply of the Government**

Sainik Schools, spread across the country and NCC units operating in Schools /Colleges across the country are engaged in imbibing Military oriented training, physical fitness etc. among the students. The training imparted by these organisations contributes in spreading career awareness of students about the Armed Forces and motivates them to take up Armed Forces as a career. These schools are excellent feeder organisations for the defence forces.

Further, Rashtriya Military Schools are premier training establishments of the defence services engaged in the pursuit of imparting quality education and also preparing the students for a career in the Armed Forces. The five Rashtriya Military Schools located at Chail, Ajmer, Belgaum, Bangalore and Dholpur besides providing State of the art educational facilities to the cadets are also grooming them as future potential officers of the defence services. To achieve this aim, the cadets are put through various outdoor activities as well as SSB training capsules. Pre-SSB training is a regular feature in Rashtriya Military Schools. The services of both serving and retired Group Task Officers (GTOs) and

Psychologists are taken to develop the personality of the cadets, inspire them by widening their knowledge base and equip them adequately to face the Services Selection Board.

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see para 8 of Chapter-I of the report)

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 8)**

The Committee find that a number of procedures for recruitment of permanent Commissioned and short service commissioned officers through UPSC and Non-UPSC mode have been put in place for entry in the combatant and other specialized and allied wings of the three services in the armed forces. However, all the candidates aspiring to become officers have to invariably under-go Service Selection Board (SSB) tests having same format both the combat and technical services. The Committee's examination has brought out that the format of SSB tests has not undergone any major changes in the last three decades except that the process now involves two stages in which the candidates are first screened on the basis of psychological test and only those who qualify these tests are assessed in the second stage. Although this system is stated to be scientific enough to determine the suitability of a candidate for the armed forces, the Committee have been informed during the evidence that the present system of selection procedure has been examined by a committee appointed by the Chiefs of Staff and its report has *inter alia* highlighted that the "procedures for selection are extremely rigorous". The Committee's interaction with an ex-serviceman having expertise in this field has also brought out that the selection process in the SSB tests is negative in approach and the whole exercise is directed towards finding enough reasons to reject a candidate rather than carrying out an appraisal of his good traits for selection. It has also been pointed out that the most of the assessors hesitate to give clear-cut assessments and keep most of the candidates as border liners implying thereby that the whole selection process is unable to determine suitable of such candidates. Even the Defence Secretary admitted during evidence that some of these tests are rigorous and impracticable and require a "fresh look". These facts lends credence to the Committee's view that the SSB tests for selection of officers in the armed forces continue to be based on antiquated practices and no serious attempt have been made to adopt and implement the modern techniques of selection. While emphasizing that there should not be any compromise with the quality and traits required for serving the Armed Forces, the Committee recommend that an exhaustive review of the

selection process through SSB tests should be undertaken at the earliest and latest techniques available for selection of candidates in an objective manner should be put in place to inspire confidence among the candidates volunteering for a career in the Armed Forces. Since a good number of youth coming from rural background face considerable difficulties in communicating in particular language, steps should also be taken to ensure that such candidates are not subjected to language barriers while assessing their suitability for the Armed Forces. Needless to say that language and communication abilities of such selected candidate can be improved to the desired level while imparting pre-induction training to them.

### **Reply of the Government**

The selection procedure adopted by the Services Selection Boards is scientific and is aimed at assessing the officer like qualities of an individual. The ability of an individual to withstand physical and mental stress is assessed to determine his/her suitability for an Armed Force.

The selection process is designed to select a prospective candidate to meet the service requirements. The procedure is centrally standardized by Defence Institute for Physiological Research (DIPR), New Delhi for all three services. The process has delivered results and has stood the test of time.

The emphasis during the testing of verbal abilities is on communication skills and not on a language in particular and as long as a candidate is able to comprehend the instruction given to him and act accordingly it is considered good enough. Fluency in spoken English or knowledge of English is not a limiting factor for a candidate during testing.

Keeping with the modern techniques of selection, which have evolved, the changes in the socio economic background and the envisaged changes in the service requirement a project on "Comprehensive Selection System in Armed Forces" has been taken up by DIPR for evolving a new selection system based on cognitive abilities.

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please *see* para 11 of Chapter-I of the report)

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 13)**

The Committee note that the cadets undergoing training before induction as officers are not being paid any stipend except in the case

of graduate cadets who are reported to be paid a monthly stipend of Rs. 8,000/- during training. The Committee understand that all the cadets taking pre-induction training for joining the armed forces in the officers' cadre do not necessarily come from affluent background and they strongly feel that there is an imperative need to extend appropriate financial support on the basis of their educational qualifications so as to enable them to meet out their pocket expenses as well as the expectations of their family members. They, therefore, strongly recommended that all the cadets undergoing pre-induction training at NDA or similar institutions must be paid Rs. 10,000/- and the graduate entrants Rs. 15,000/- as monthly stipend during the entire period of training before being commissioned in the armed forces. The Committee also desire that the MoD should take up this matter expeditiously with the Ministry of Finance at the highest level and impress upon them the need for extending such a benefit

### **Reply of the Government**

Post VI Central Pay Commission (VI CPC), the fixed stipend to cadets at IMA, OTA and Cadet Training Wings at CME, MCEME and MCTE has been increased to Rs. 21,000/- per month. However, the Commission did not recommend grant of a stipend in NDA and similar training academies in view of the fact that no payment is required to be made by Cadets to such training academies and the training results in award of a degree and subsequent employment in the Defence Forces.

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see para 14 of Chapter-I of the report)

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 15)**

The Committee note that the substantive promotion upto the rank of Lt. Colonel or equivalent in the three services is made by time-scale on completion of the stipulated period of 13 years of reckonable commissioned service. However, promotion of the officers to the rank of substantive colonel not promoted by selection is made subject to their being fit, only after completion of 26 years of reckonable commissioned service. The Committee's examination has brought out the rank structure in armed forces being of steep pyramidal shape has little scope for the officers to climb up the hierarchical ladder. The opportunities for their promotion are further restricted because of limited availability of training facilities for Higher Command Course. Needless to say that the officers not selected for promotion or for Higher Command Course feel

demotivated which ultimately results in adverse effect on the overall efficiency of the armed forces. The Committee, therefore, desire that in order to achieve the functional efficiency; combat effectiveness; and to keep down the age profile of the brigade commanders or equivalent in the three Services of armed forces, the MoD should take appropriate measures to introduce a system whereby the strength of permanent commissioned officers *vis-à-vis* SSC Officers is gradually brought to level of 30 per cent of the authorised strength in each of the three Services and the time scale promotions upto the rank of Brigadier and equivalent in all the Services are made by bringing in appropriate reduction in the length of reckonable commissioned service so as to fulfil the individual career aspirations as well as to keep the morale of officers high. The Committee need hardly point out that such a measure would have negligible financial implications consequent upon implementation of new pay-bands in the armed forces besides going a long way in keeping the rate of attrition at lower levels.

### **Reply of the Government**

The AV Singh Committee had recommended that the ratio of Permanent Commissioned officers to Short Service Commissioned officers should be brought down. The Cabinet has already granted its approval 'in principle', to the reduction in the Permanent Commissioned officers cadre and corresponding increase in the support cadre (including Short Service Commission Officers). Specific proposals in this regard, keeping in view the specific requirements of the three Services, are being examined by the Ministry.

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see para 17 of Chapter-I of the report)

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 17)**

The Committee note that limited opportunities exist for promotion of the officers in the armed forces due to steep rank structure. This fact necessitates that fair and transparent systems are put in place for allaying the fears in the minds of officers serving armed forces. Although the constitution of selection boards for promotion is stated to be fixed, the Committee understand that there is no fixed time schedule for holding the meetings of such boards in different services. Undoubtedly, any delay in holding the meetings of such boards may sometimes result in denial of promotion to the officers otherwise eligible. During evidence, the Defence Secretary informed the Committee that he would not like to

hazard a guess on the allegations made by those who are not promoted that the dates were played with to rule them out and made a promise that he would certainly look into this aspect. The Committee trust that the Ministry would not only pay serious attention towards streamlining the procedures in this regard but also ensure that the meetings of all selection boards for promotions in different wings of the three services are held at a regular interval of six months every year to make selection for the posts anticipated in ensuing six months so that not even a single deserving officer is deprived of his legitimate right. Any deviation from the stipulated time schedule in holding meetings of the selection boards for promotion should be viewed seriously and appropriate action taken against those found responsible.

### **Reply of the Government**

#### **ARMY**

Selection Boards (SBs) for consideration of officers for promotion to the select ranks are to be held once a year to make selection for vacancies accruing in the ensuing 'one' calendar year. Presently, two SBs are being held in a calendar year.

#### **AIR FORCE**

A streamlined procedure exists for conduct of Promotion Boards. The Board is conducted between February to March every year.

#### **NAVY**

The Navy conducts Promotion Boards on a yearly basis which are based on the anticipated vacancies of the entire year.

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please *see* para 20 of Chapter-I of the report)

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 27)**

The Committee note that the Department of Ex-servicemen Welfare has been created in 2004 under the Ministry of Defence to formulate various policies and programmes for the welfare and resettlement of ex-servicemen (ESM) in the country. According to the information available with the Committee, this Department is assisted by Kendriya Sainik Board (KSB) and Directorate General of Resettlement (DGR). While the KSB lays down general policies for the welfare of ESM and their dependants

and also administers welfare funds, the office of the DGR has been entrusted with the responsibility of implementing schemes and programmes of the Government for ESM which includes pre and post-retirement training, re-employment, self-employment, etc. The Committee are however, surprised to find that despite existence of such an elaborate mechanism, there are a number of areas which require focussed attention for dignified resettlement and rehabilitation of ESM. Undoubtedly, there is an urgent and imperative necessity to address the legitimate needs of ESM and the Committee strongly recommend the following measures:—

- (i) In order to enable ESM to derive their due benefits from the welfare schemes formulated for them by the Government, the Ministry of Defence should urgently devise a foolproof mechanism for compulsory registration of all ESM with the relevant Zila Sainik Boards which in turn should forward such data to Rajya Sainik Boards and DGR for being maintained at State and National levels. Needless to say that complete and precise data on the number of ESM in the various States and the country as a whole would be immense use to the various agencies involved in formulating and implementing policies and programmes being contemplated for the welfare of ESM.
- (ii) Based on the accurate data on ESM so available with DGR, the Ministry should ensure adequate allocation of funds to DGR for efficacious implementation of various schemes being launched for welfare of ESM in the country.
- (iii) In their 4th Report (14th Lok Sabha), the Committee had reiterated their earlier recommendation for setting up of 'National Commission on Ex-servicemen'. The Committee have now been informed during oral deposition that the proposal for establishing such a Commission has since been cleared by the Raksha Mantri. The Committee trust that the 'National Commission on Ex-servicemen' with statutory powers will be established soon so as to ensure accountability of existing structure put in place for implementation of various welfare schemes for ESM.
- (iv) The Committee understand that the revised pension policy being implemented as a sequel to the recommendations of the Sixth Central Pay Commission continues to remain a contentious issue between the Government and the ESM. The Committee desire that appropriate and expeditious action should be taken to resolve this issue in accordance with the general principles of equity.



## **Reply of the Government**

- (i) Process of computerisation has been started at Rajya Sainik Board/State Hqrs. and Zila Sainik Boards/District Hqrs. level. Funds for the same have also been released to all the State Governments. Completion of computerisation is likely to take time. Once the system is in place, computerised data at State and District level would be available and the authorities may be in a position to ensure compulsory registration.
- (ii) Adequate funds are being provided to the Directorate General (Resettlement) under the head 'Training' and the same are being utilized for training of Officers as well as PBOR. The welfare schemes for Ex-Servicemen are being handled by Kendriya Sainik Board, the funds for which are being provided out of the Armed Forces Flag Day Fund (AFFDF). In addition, various State Governments have their own schemes for benefit of the Ex-Servicemen residing in the States.
- (iii) The recommendation for setting up of 'National Commission on Ex-Servicemen' has been considered but has not been found feasible as a number of bodies such as Directorate General (Resettlement), Kendriya Sainik Board at the Centre and Rajya Sainik Boards at the State level already exist to undertake welfare schemes for Ex-Servicemen and their families.
- (iv) A Committee was set up under the Chairmanship of Cabinet Secretary on the direction of PM to look into the issue of One Rank and One Pension (OROP) and other related issues. The following recommendations have been made to substantially improve the pension of Personnel Below Officer Ranks (PBOR) and Commissioned Officers:—

### **Personnel Below Officer Ranks**

- I. The proposal of Ministry of Defence to bring pre 10.10.1997 PBOR pensioners at par with post 10.10.1997 PBOR pensioners may be agreed to.
- II. The proposal of the Ministry of Defence to reckon the enhanced rate of classification allowance *w.e.f.* 1.1.2006 on notional basis for the purpose of calculation of pension (as in the case of reckoning MSP for determination of pension) may be agreed to.

III. In order to reduce the gap between pre and post 1.1.2006 PBOR pensioners, it is proposed to follow the principle of the Award of Group of Ministers (GoM) of 2006 in the following manner:—

- (a) To reckon the pension of all pre 1.1.2006 PBOR pensioners with reference to a notional maximum in the post 1.1.2006 revised pay structure corresponding to the maximum of pre-Sixth Pay Commission pay scales as per fitment table of each rank.
- (b) Also to continue with the enhanced weightages awarded by the GoM.

#### **Commissioned Officers**

IV. The proposal to remove the linkage of full pension with 33 years of qualifying service *w.e.f.* 1.1.2006 instead of 1.9.2008 in the case of Commissioned Officers may be agreed to. A similar dispensation will have to be extended to civilians who have retired between 1.1.2006 and 31.8.2008.

V. In order to address the issue of disparity in the pension of pre and post 1.1.2006 pensioners at the level of Lt. General/equivalent/Additional Secretary and equivalent civilian categories, a separate pay scale starting at Rs. 67,000/- and going up to Rs. 79,000/- may be created and all officers of the level of Lt. General/equivalent/Additional Secretaries may be fixed in this scale. As a result of this, the pension of pre 1.1.2006 Lt. Generals will get fixed at Rs. 36,500/- and those of Additional Secretary at Rs. 33,500/-.

#### **All Defence Pensioners**

VI. It is proposed to agree to broad banding of percentage of disability/war injury pension for pre 1.1.1996 disability/war injury pensioners.

VII. It is proposed to remove the cap on war injury element of pension in the case of disabled pensioners belonging to Category E.

2. Government letter has already been issued on 30.10.2008 implementing the Committee's recommendations Nos. (II) and (IV).

## **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see para 26 of Chapter-I of the report)

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 28)**

The Committee understand that besides their primary responsibility of protecting the territorial integrity, the services of the armed forces personnel are often requisitioned to assist the civil authorities during internal security problems and rescue/relief operations during natural calamities. Considering the fact that a large number of defence services personnel retiring at a comparatively younger age, well trained and experienced enough to handle problems of internal security and natural calamities, the Committee are of the view that it would be in the national interest that the Government devised an appropriate scheme for inducting retiring armed forces personnel as a distinct force on the lines of Central Paramilitary Forces personnel (CPMF). The Committee are in no doubt that such a scheme would not only address the problems being experienced in lateral induction of Ex-servicemen in CPMF but also result in substantial financial savings to the Government on recruiting procedures, training and pension payments. It would also minimize instances if frequent deployment of the armed forces for secondary duties as the services of the distinct force having professional experience would always be available to assist the civil Authorities.

### **Reply of the Government**

The issue of lateral transfer of army personnel into Central Paramilitary Forces (CPMFs) has been under dialogue with Ministry of Home Affairs. The issue is yet to be resolved. The Sixth Central Pay Commission, in their report, have also recommended a scheme of lateral transfer of defence personnel to Central Police Organisations/Defence civilian organizations after rendering 7-17 years service in the defence, with a view to, *inter-alia*, provide lifetime employment to defence personnel. However, as per decision of the Government on the recommendations of the VI CPC as contained in the Ministry of Finance Resolution dated No. 1/1/2008-IC dated 29th August 2008, the recommendation related to lateral shift of Defence Personnel to Central Paramilitary Forces will be examined separately. The recommendation for inducting retiring armed forces personnel as a distinct force for civil duties on the lines of CPMFs.

## **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see para 29 of Chapter-I of the report)

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 29)**

The Committee note that civilian manpower and infrastructural support to the services Headquarter office of inter-services organizations under the Ministry of Defence are provided by the office of the Chief Administrative Officer (CAO). While the office of CAO is responsible for providing administrative cover to the civilian personnel so employed including various categories of Armed Forces Headquarter (AFHQ) civilian cadres, the Committee are surprised to find that the proposals regarding cadre restructuring etc., of AFHQ civil services require consultation with the Department of Personnel and Training (DoPT) which is reported to be playing no role in career management of AFHQ civil cadres. While the Group of Ministers in paragraph 6.76 of its Report on 'Reforming the National Security System' had recommended in 2001 that 'a committee may be set up to look into the issue of better utilization of AFHQ civil service officers within the Ministry of Defence' the Committee's examination of the subject matter has, however, revealed that nothing substantial has been done in this regard participation of this service within the Ministry remains inadequate. The oral deposition and the written submission made before the Committee also highlighted that despite recruitment to various groups of AFHQ civilian cadres through common examination, their service conditions continue to be at variance with similarly placed services under the Government. Undoubtedly, the bleak career prospects and absence of any lateral movements in the Ministry of Defence have an adverse impact on the functioning of these cadres where a number of cases relating to service matters are reported to have been under protracted litigation. In the light of the fact that cadre were introduced with the specific aim of providing specialized infrastructural support to the three service Headquarters and inter-service organizations, the Committee desire that appropriate steps should be taken to strengthen the AFHQ civilian cadres by restructuring their service conditions with a view to bringing in parity with similarly placed services in the Government.

### **Reply of the Government**

The issue for utilisation of Armed Forces Headquarters (AFHQ) Civil Service Officer in MoD Secretariat in pursuance of the GoM's recommendations contained in para 6.76 of its Report on 'Reforming the National Security System' has been examined twice in consultation with the Department of Personnel and Training (DoP&T). On both occasions, the DoP&T have not agreed to the proposal for utilising the AFHQ CS

in MoD (Sectt.). A Cadre Restructuring of Armed Forces Headquarters Civil Service (AFHQ CS) has been done in 2008 with the approval of Ministry of Finance.

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please *see* para 32 of Chapter-I of the report)

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 36)**

The Committee are concerned to note that the number of Field Firing Ranges (FFRs) is gradually decreasing over a period of time. Although the army had a total of 104 FFRs at one point of time, the number of such Ranges is expected to come down to mere seven by the year 2014. One of the important reasons attributable to the depleting number of these Ranges is reported to be the clearances required to be obtained by the State Governments from the Ministry of Environment and Forests to permit use of forest land for non-forest activities in accordance with the Forest Conservation Act, 1980 and Supreme Court judgment delivered in 2002. While the MoD is stated to have initiated a process of consultation with all stakeholders in order to find a mutually acceptable solution to the problem, the Committee feel that it is high time that the Ministry imitated expeditious and concrete steps to resolve this issue in the national interest in a time bound manner.

### **Reply of the Government**

#### **ARMY**

There are 92 notified Field Firing Ranges (FFRs) in the inventory, of which notification of 57 ranges has expired. Cases of 04 ranges are under active consideration by State Governments for re-notification.

#### **Actions Taken**

- (i) Favourable judgment of Hon'ble Supreme Court with respect to NPV.
- (ii) Advance sensitization of environment prior to expiry of notification for taking timely actions to renotify ranges.
- (iii) Interaction by HQ Commands with respective State Governments.

#### **AIR FORCE**

The Air Force has seven air-to-ground ranges, located in Gujarat, Rajasthan, Punjab, West Bengal, Uttar Pradesh, Madhya Pradesh and

Assam-Meghalaya border. However, operations of following ranges are severely constrained due to the restrictions imposed by civil air traffic as well as proliferation of habitation/industries in the vicinity:—

- (i) Dollang Mukh Range (Assam)
- (ii) Singpur Range (Gujarat)
- (iii) Sarmat Range (MP)
- (iv) Tilpat Range (UP)

Despite the above limitations, IAF continues to use these ranges for its air-to-ground firing practices within the laid down safety parameters.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please *see* para 35 of Chapter-I of the report)

## CHAPTER V

### RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH FINAL REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT ARE STILL AWAITED

#### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 14)**

In order to improve the cadre mobility and reduce the existing problem of high rate of supersession, the AV Singh Committee on restructuring of officers' cadre of army officers had *inter alia* recommended that SSC cadre should be enhanced with a corresponding reduction in the regular cadre by making SSC sufficiently attractive so that adequate number of candidates opt for this entry. The Committee have been informed that Raksha Mantri has since conveyed his "in principle" approval on certain proposal/action plans aimed at increasing the SSC entry with a view to restructuring the officers' cadre and reducing shortage of officers in the armed forces. The Committee understand that all such proposals including its financial implications are in the process of submission to the MoD for approval. While expressing the hope that this proposal will be expeditiously translated into reality, the Committee would like the Ministry to also consider the following suggestions so as to make SSC more attractive:—

- (i) One of the measures suggested by the A.V. Singh Committee to make SSC entry attractive related to lump sum grant of Rs. five lacs and Rs. ten lacs after five years and ten years of services respectively. The Committee has been informed that a proposal is under consideration for grant of lump sum amount to SSC officers at the rate of Rs. ten lacs after ten years of service and for Rs. two lacs for each completed year of service beyond ten years. Keeping in view the fact that SSC officers seeking release after rendering 14 years of services in the armed forces would be at such a crucial juncture of their age where they require financial support to meet their increasing liabilities, the Committee feel that the rate of lump

sum amount to be made payable in this case should be kept at the rate of Rs. 1.5 lacs for each year upto ten years of service followed by Rs. 2.5 lacs for each completed year of service beyond ten years. The Committee feel convinced that such an enhancement would go a long way in attracting larger segments of the youth towards SSC in the Armed Forces.

- (ii) A.V. Singh Committee had also recommended for reduction in number of papers for appearing in civil service entrance examination along with age relaxation for SSC officers. The Committee note that the emergency commissioned officers inducted after 1962 war were given such an exemption to appear in the Civil Service Examination and the whole system of such recruitment has since been stopped years ago. They find it rather strange that the Ministry have now put forth the plea that such a proposal at this stage has wider ramifications and is outside their purview. Keeping in view the rich experience and knowledge gained by the SSC officers during their career and the services rendered to the nation by them during prime of their youth, the Committee consider it desirable that appropriate concessions for appearing in civil service entrance examination may be extended to the SSC officers on the same analogy as was adopted in the case of Emergency Commissioned officers. Effective steps should also be taken for introducing innovative schemes for lateral induction of SSC officers into Central Paramilitary Organisation.

### **Reply of the Government**

Implementation of the balance recommendations of Ajay Vikram Singh Committee (AVSC) Report ('peel' factors), with suitable modifications alongwith measures to make Short Service Commission more attractive are being progressed for Cabinet approval in consultation with the concerned Ministries.

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 24)**

The defence service personnel are frequently deployed in different parts of the country and such transfers have an adverse impact on their



wards in meeting domicile requirements specified in certain States for the purposes of admission to under-graduate level courses in academic and professional institutions. During their examination of the subject, the Committee have been informed by the Ministry of Human Resource Development (HRD) that “there is only one domicile *i.e.* of the Union of India” under Article 5 of the Constitution. The Ministry of HRD have also stated that the policy of the Central Government as laid down in paragraph 3.8 of the National Policy of Education enunciates that “steps will be taken to facilitate inter-regional mobility by providing equal access to every Indian of requisite merit, regardless of his origin” in the matters connected with higher education in general and technical education in particular. Considering the unique nature of duties required to be performed by defence services personnel in all parts of the country, the Committee desire the Ministry of Defence to take up the matter with the State Governments with a view to examining the feasibility of doing away with the domicile requirements at least in the case of wards of defence services personnel till such time the Government enact an appropriate legislation to implement the constitutional provisions and the policy framework envisaged in this regard.

### **Reply of the Government**

The Ministry has taken up with the State Governments for waiving off Domiciliary conditions for admission of wards of defence personnel in colleges/institutions in the States/Union Territories. In this regard Raksha Mantri has written to the Chief Ministers of States and Lt. Governors of States (Annexure-C).

### **Recommendation (Paragraph No. 30)**

Canteen Store Department is yet another organization rendering useful contribution in providing ‘service to the services’. The Committee are of firm view that organizations of such nature as well as the civilian employees contributing towards the functioning of the three Services in different parts of the country have to be treated in an equitable manner. They, therefore, desire the Government to make an objective assessment of the service conditions of such civilian employees in the defence services with a view to taking appropriate steps to bring in requisite improvements for efficient functioning of the Services.

## **Reply of the Government**

A proposal for cadre review has been initiated. Review of Recruitment Rules for various posts in Canteen Stores Department has been undertaken. Pay Anomalies Committee has been constituted. In-house training programmes for staff in order to improve their efficiency have been undertaken.

## APPENDIX

### MINUTES OF THE FIFTH SITTING OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE (2010-11)

The Committee sat on Monday, the 17th January, 2011 from 1500 to 1545 hrs. in Committee Room 'D', Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

#### PRESENT

Shri Satpal Maharaj — *Chairman*

#### MEMBERS

##### *Lok Sabha*

2. Shri Harish Chaudhary
3. Shri H.D. Devegowda
4. Dr. Sucharu Ranjan Haldar
5. Shri Bhaskar Rao Patil Khatgaonkar
6. Prof. Prasanna Kumar Patasani
7. Shri A.T. Nana Patil
8. Shri Amarnath Pradhan
9. Shri Bajju Ban Riyan
10. Shri Mahabali Singh
11. Rajkumari Ratna Singh

##### *Rajya Sabha*

12. Shri Avinash Rai Khanna
13. Shri T.K. Rangarajan
14. Shri Birender Singh
15. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav
16. Shri Naresh Gujral

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri T.K. Mukherjee — *Joint Secretary*
2. Smt. Sudesh Luthra — *Director*
3. Smt. Jyochnamayi Sinha — *Deputy Secretary*

2. At the outset, the Chairman welcomed the members to the sitting of the Committee. The Chairman apprised the Members that in connection with examination of the subjects 'Functioning of Military Cantonments and Stations' and 'Management of Defence Land', during the current term, after taking permission from Hon'ble Speaker, the Committee had sought opinion of 13 States. So far only Punjab Government has responded, although the stipulated deadline given for furnishing the Committee has expired. Besides, the Committee had also invited opinion of 27 experts. In response, only 3 experts have responded. In view of the inadequate response on such important subjects, the Committee unanimously decided to invite the views of experts, various stakeholders and public at large by issuing through DAVP press communique in print and electronic media.

3. The Committee then took up for consideration and adoption the draft report on action taken by the Government on the recommendations/ observations contained in the Thirty-fourth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on 'Human Resource Planning, Shortage of Manpower, Infusion of Hi-Tech Training and Infrastructure for the Armed Forces' and adopted the same without any modification in the report. The Committee, then, authorised the Chairman to present the same to the House on a date convenient to him.

*The Committee then adjourned.*

## APPENDIX

### ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS CONTAINED IN THE THIRTY-FOURTH REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE

		Total Percentage of Total	
1.	Total number of recommendations	38	
2.	Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government		
	Para Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 7, 9, 11, 12, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35 and 38	23	61
3.	Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's replies		
	Para Nos. 10, 16 and 37	03	08
4.	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee		
	Para Nos. 5, 8, 13, 15, 17, 27, 28, 29 and 36	09	23
5.	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government are still awaited		
	Para Nos. 14, 24 and 30	03	08