

**19**

**COMMITTEE ON EMPOWERMENT OF WOMEN  
(2008-2009)**

**(FOURTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**‘WORKING CONDITIONS OF WOMEN IN MTNL’**

**MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY**

**(DEPARTMENT OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS)**

*[Action Taken on Fifteenth Report of the Committee on  
Empowerment of Women (Fourteenth Lok Sabha)]*

**NINETEENTH REPORT**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI**

**FEBRUARY, 2009/MAGHA, 1930 (Saka)**

**NINETEENTH REPORT**  
**COMMITTEE ON EMPOWERMENT OF WOMEN**  
**(2008-2009)**

**(FOURTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**'WORKING CONDITIONS OF WOMEN IN MTNL'**

**MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY**  
**(DEPARTMENT OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS)**

*[Action Taken on Fifteenth Report of the Committee on  
Empowerment of Women (Fourteenth Lok Sabha)]*

Presented to Lok Sabha on 13<sup>th</sup> February, 2009

*Laid in Rajya Sabha on 13<sup>th</sup>, February, 2009*



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT**  
**NEW DELHI**

**February, 2009/Magha, 1930 (Saka)**

E.W.C. No. 53.

PRICE: Rs. \_\_\_\_\_

© 2009 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

Published under .....

## CONTENTS

PAGE

Composition of the Committee on Empowerment of Women (2008-2009)

### INTRODUCTION

<b>CHAPTER I</b>	Report
<b>CHAPTER II</b>	Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government.....
<b>CHAPTER III</b>	Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government..... ...
<b>CHAPTER IV</b>	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee .....
<b>CHAPTER V</b>	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies.....

### APPENDICES

<b>I</b>	Minutes of the sitting of the Committee on Empowerment of Women (2008-2009) held on 27 <sup>th</sup> January, 2009.....
<b>II</b>	Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Fifteenth Report of the Committee (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) .....

**COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON EMPOWERMENT OF WOMEN  
(2008-2009)**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Hon'ble Chairperson - Smt. Krishna Tirath**

**MEMBERS**

**LOK SABHA**

2. Smt. Priya Dutt
3. Smt. Tejaswini Seeramesh Gowda
4. Smt. Jayaprada
5. Smt. Preneet Kaur
6. Smt. Sushila Kerketta
7. Shri Tek Lal Mahato
8. Shri Rajesh Kumar Manjhi
9. Prof. M. Ramadass
10. Smt. K. Rani
11. Smt. Minati Sen
12. Smt. Karuna Shukla
13. Smt. C.S. Sujatha
14. Smt. B. Jayaben Thakkar
15. Shri P. C. Thomas
16. Shri M.P. Veerendrakumar
17. Shri Kinjarapu Yerrannaidu
18. Smt. Maneka Gandhi
19. Shri Kiren Rijju
20. Smt. Yashodhara Raje Scindia

**RAJYA SABHA**

21. Smt. Shobhana Bhartia
22. Smt. Hema Malini
23. Shri Jabir Hussain
24. Shri Banwari Lal Kanchhal
25. Smt. Kanimozhi
26. Smt. Brinda Karat
27. Smt. Syeda Anwara Taimur
28. Dr. C.P. Thakur
29. Dr. Prabha Thakur
30. Shri Ambeth Rajan

**SECRETARIAT**

1. Shri S. Bal Shekar Joint Secretary
2. Shri C.S. Joon Director
3. Smt. Mamta Kemwal Deputy Secretary-II
4. Shri Shams Afroz Senior Executive Assistant

\*\*\*\*

## INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson of Committee on Empowerment of Women, present the Nineteenth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on the Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Fifteenth Report of the Committee on Empowerment of Women (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on 'Working Conditions of Women in MTNL'.

2. The Fifteenth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on Empowerment of Women (2007-08) was presented to Lok Sabha and laid in Rajya Sabha on 24<sup>th</sup> April, 2008. The Action Taken Replies of the Government to all the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Report have been received.

3. The Draft Action Taken Report was considered and adopted by the Committee on Empowerment of Women (2008-2009) at their sitting held on 27<sup>th</sup> January, 2009.

4. An Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Fifteenth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee is given in Appendix II.

5. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in thick type in the body of the Report.

**NEW DELHI**  
**4<sup>th</sup> February, 2009**  
**15<sup>th</sup> Magha, 1930 (Saka)**

**KRISHNA TIRATH**  
**CHAIRPERSON**  
**COMMITTEE ON EMPOWERMENT OF WOMEN**

## CHAPTER I

### REPORT

This Report of the Committee deals with the action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Fifteenth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on Empowerment of Women on the subject 'Working Conditions of Women in MTNL'.

2. The Fifteenth Report of the Committee was presented to Lok Sabha on 24<sup>th</sup> April, 2008. Replies of the Government in respect of all recommendations have been received and are categorized as under:-

- i) Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government.  
Para Nos:- 46, 49 and 50.
- ii) Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government.  
Para No:- 51.
- iii) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee.  
Para Nos:- 43, 44, 47 and 48
- iv) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies.  
Para Nos:- 45 and 52.

3. The Committee desire that replies in respect of recommendations contained in Chapter 1 should be furnished by the Government expeditiously.

**4. The Committee will now deal with those action taken replies of the Government which need reiteration or merit comments.**

**A. Ascertain reasons for low representation of women employees.**

**Recommendation (Para No. 43)**

5. In the post Globalization era there has been substantial increase in the employment opportunities but at the same time it has multiplied the professional hazards that women face at their work place. Although the working conditions of women employees engaged in the organised sector have improved when compared with those engaged in the unorganised sector, the Committee feel that the problem lies in the structural inhibition in the policy formulation that affects the conceptualization of gender sensitive work environment.

The Committee are constrained to note the low percentage of women employed in MTNL. The Committee also note that majority of women employed in MTNL are mostly in Group 'C' and 'D' posts. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) should conduct a study and find out the reasons for such a low percentage of women employees in MTNL and take appropriate measures to enhance their representation in the organisation. The Committee further desire that efforts should be made to increase the number of women employees in Group 'A' so that the management of the organization becomes more gender sensitive.

6. The Ministry of Communication and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) have submitted the following reply in this regard:-

“The recommendation of Committee has been noted and directions have been issued to MTNL in respect of conducting a study to find out



reasons for low percentage of women employees in MTNL and taking measures to enhance their representation at various levels, including at top executive (Group'A') level in MTNL.”

**7. The Committee note from the reply furnished by the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) that the directions have been issued to conduct a study to find out the reasons for low percentage of women employees in MTNL and taking measures to enhance their representations at various levels including top executives (Group 'A' level) in MTNL. The Committee are of the view that mere issuance of guidelines or directions would not serve the purpose. What is needed is to ensure strict compliance of the guidelines. The Committee desire that the MTNL should be asked to conduct a study to ascertain the reasons for low representation of women employees within a prescribed time frame. The Committee further desire that the findings of the above stated study conducted should simultaneously be made available to this Committee.**

**B. Special courses and training modules for SC/ST candidates.**

**Recommendation (Para No. 44)**

8. The Committee are distressed to note that there are just 2 Scheduled Tribe women in Group 'A' services of MTNL without any intake of Scheduled Caste women. The Committee are further constrained to note that between the year 2002-2005, 621 recruitments were made in Group 'B' services. However, women employees comprised only 12.2% of it. The Committee feel that merely organising walk-in-interviews does not absolve the Ministry and MTNL of their responsibility to encourage SC/ST candidates to avail employment opportunities. The Committee, therefore, desire that the Ministry should give directions to MTNL to organize regular Recruitment Drives in SC/ST majority areas and encourage SC/ST candidates specially women candidates to come forward and join the organization. The Committee do not accept the plea of 'non-availability of

candidates' for less number of SC/ST categories for group 'A' posts in MTNL. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry should ask MTNL to devise courses and training modules for such candidates to help them compete with the mainstream candidates.

**9. The Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) have submitted the following reply in this regard:-**

“MTNL is making sincere efforts to fill the back log vacancies of SC/ST. Difficulties are being faced, particularly in the cadre of JAO, as professionally qualified candidates from these categories are not available in the open market. Therefore, the qualification for intake in JAO Cadre was relaxed, Special Recruitment Drives including Walk-in Interview to fill the back-log vacancies followed. Then MTNL were able to fill 3 posts of JAOs in the month of March, 2008. Group'A' level officers have been posted from DoT. They have not been recruited by MTNL.”

**10. The Committee in their original report were concerned to note the less representation of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe women in Group 'A', Group 'B' Services of MTNL. The Committee felt that merely organizing walk-in interviews does not absolve the Ministry and MTNL of their responsibility to encourage Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates to avail employment opportunities. The Committee desired that along with special recruitment drives, MTNL should devise courses and training modules for such candidates to help them compete with other candidates. The Ministry in their reply have stated that difficulties are being faced particularly in the cadre of JAO, as professionally qualified candidates from these categories are not available in the open market. Therefore, the qualification for intake in JAO was relaxed and special recruitment drives including walk-in interviews to fill the backlog vacancies were organized. However, the Committee feel that the Ministry/MTNL have ignored the**

**recommendation made by the Committee and have not taken any step to devise courses and training modules for Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates to help them compete with mainstream candidates. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their recommendation and desire that earnest steps should be taken by the Ministry in this regard under intimation to this Committee.**

**C. Absorption of Group 'A' officers in MTNL  
Recommendation (Para No. 45)**

11. The Committee are surprised to note that absorption issues of MTNL Group 'A' officers commenced in March 2005, almost 20 years after MTNL was set up in April, 1986. The Committee take serious note of the delay on the part of the Ministry to address the issue of absorption. The Committee, therefore, desire that the Ministry in coordination with MTNL should take earnest steps to settle the issue of absorption of MTNL Group 'A' officers and furnish a report to this committee at the earliest.

12. The Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) have submitted the following reply in this regard:-

“Status Note on Absorption of Group'A' Officers in BSNL/MTNL as on 01.12.2008

i) Consequent upon formation of MTNL and BSNL, Group 'A', 'B', 'C' and 'D' employees of the Department of Telecommunications were transferred to these PSUs on 'as where is' basis on deemed deputation. About 3,97,000 Group 'B', 'C', 'D' employees already stand absorbed in BSNL/MTNL.

ii) The Cabinet in its meeting held on 2<sup>nd</sup> February, 2005 approved the Department's proposal for absorption of Group 'A' officers in MTNL/BSNL. As per Cabinet's decision, the period of deemed deputation of Group 'A' officers was to be for a period upto five years, i.e. upto 30.09.2005. It was also decided by the Cabinet that with a view to ensure uniformity with Group 'B' officers, Group 'A' officers may also be absorbed in MTNL/BSNL w.e.f. 1.10.2000.

iii) Options were accordingly invited vide letter dated 24.03.2005 from approximately 3000 Group 'A' officers of different services for absorption in BSNL/MTNL or continuation in Government service. Group 'A' officers individually and through their Associations sought clarifications, raised certain demands and also filed a series of court cases. Necessary clarifications as also the fresh decisions of the Government on the demands of Group 'A' officers were issued from time to time. However, Group 'A' officers were not satisfied with the clarifications/fresh decisions and most of them did not exercise their option.

iv) In the meantime, Department of Telecommunications continued dialogue with the Indian Telecom Service Association (ITSA). Some time back, a Committee including representatives of the said Association, was formed to consider the absorption related issues in finer details.

v) The above said Committee made certain recommendations involving liberalization of certain terms already offered to Group 'A' officers. Representatives of the said Association in the meeting held under the chairmanship of the then Secretary, Department of Telecommunications expressed confidence that if these recommendations are implemented, majority of the ITS officers would seek absorption in BSNL/MTNL.

vi) Based on the recommendations of the above Committee, a Note dated 2.5.2008 on the subject of absorption of Group 'A' officers of Indian Telecom Service (ITS), Indian P&T Accounts & Finance Service (IP&T A&FS) and other services in BSNL/MTNL was submitted to the Cabinet for its consideration. The Cabinet, in its meeting held on 15.05.2008, decided that the matter may, in the first instance, be considered by a Group of Ministers (GOM). Accordingly, a Note dated 5.5.2008 was submitted for consideration by GOM. The said Note was considered by GOM on 10.6.2008. Based on the decisions taken by GOM, a fresh Note dated 3.7.2008 on the subject was submitted for consideration by the Cabinet.

vii) The Cabinet in its meeting held on 24.7.2008 considered the proposals made in the Note dated 03.07.2008 and approved the proposals with certain directions. Pursuant to the Cabinet decision dated 24.7.2008, a revised option letter dated 26.08.2008 was issued on the subject of Calling of Option for absorption of Group 'A' officers of MTNL/BSNL. Besides, in pursuance of the Cabinet decision, the period of deemed deputation, without deputation allowance, of officers belonging to various Group 'A' services of DoT transferred to MTNL/BSNL was also extended till 22.12.2008 or the date of allocation, whichever is earlier.

viii) Subsequent to the issue of the above option letter dated 26.8.2008. Department of Telecommunications received requests/representations for modifying certain general terms and conditions of absorption as also seeking clarifications on various points. After considering the said requests, revised general terms and conditions for absorption incorporating certain additional incentives/benefits for absorption were issued on 29.09.2008. Clarifications on the points raised in the representations have also been issued.

ix) As per option letter dated 26.8.2008, the last date prescribed for submission of options by Group 'A' officers was 16.10.2008 for officers working/retired in BSNL/MTNL/DOP and 06.10.2008 for officers working/retired in DoT/other Departments/borrowing organizations. However, in compliance with the order dated 17.10.2008 passed by Hon'ble High Court of Delhi in a writ petition filed by Indian Telecom Service Association, the last date for receipt of options of the eligible Group 'A' officers was extended upto 31.10.2008.

x) The options received from Group A officers for absorption in MTNL/BSNL or for continuation in Government Service are being processed in the Department of Telecommunications as per the prescribed procedure.

**13. The Committee had taken a serious view of the delay in the absorption of the Indian Telecommunication Services (ITS) Group 'A' Officers in MTNL/BSNL and had desired that the issue be settled at the earliest. However, they find from the status note furnished by the Ministry that the issue is still in a fluid state. It has been observed that even after calling for option for absorption of Group 'A' officers in MTNL/BSNL, a lot of confusion exists with regard to the terms and conditions for absorption. The Committee feel that the lack of clarity in the absorption issue would only vitiate the atmosphere. Moreover, the telecom majors cannot afford to lose the expertise of these highly qualified and experienced Engineering Service Officers in the present environment of tough competition from private telecom players. If the implementation of the recommendation of the joint committee of the Members of the Government and ITS Association would suffice in prompting the majority of ITS officers in seeking absorption to MTNL/BSNL, the Committee are of the view that the Government should not shirk its responsibility of offering them the best to**

**keep them with these organizations. The Committee desire that they may be apprised of the final outcome of the absorption process with details.**

**D. Timely submission of audited accounts by the welfare organizations.  
Recommendation (Para No. 47)**

14. The Committee note that welfare organizations namely, Telecom Women Central Organisation (TWCO) at Delhi and MTNL Women's Organisation at Mumbai are engaged in various welfare programmes for women employees. These organisations have been carrying out various programmes such as running crèches, tailoring centres, health camps, etc. However, the Committee are constrained to note that TWCO, Delhi, has not been able to submit the audit figures for the year 2004, due to which special grants for welfare programmes for 2005-06 and 2006-07 could not be sanctioned. The Committee also note that the amount sanctioned for Mumbai Women Organisation has decreased from Rs 76,694/- in 2004-05 to Rs 47,806/- in 2006-07. The Committee feel concerned to find delay in submission of audited figures and decrease in the grants for welfare activities is a matter of great concern. The Committee feel that welfare activities in any organisation are an essential component of the entire system, which not only lead to optimum output but also create healthy work environment. The Committee, therefore, recommend that TWCO, Delhi Unit should be instructed to submit the audited figures at the earliest and streamline their accounting procedures. The Committee also recommend that the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) should conduct annual review of welfare programmes being carried out by the welfare organisations so that realistic grants are made annually for welfare programmes.

15. The Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) have submitted the following reply in this regard:-

“The quantum of Fund depends upon the numbers of Programmes undertaken by the Women’s Welfare Organization in the Units. Mumbai Unit, in the year, 2007-08, has sanctioned Rs. 62806/- to the women’s Welfare Organization. Similarly, Rs. Two Lakh has been approved by MTNL for Delhi Chapter of TWCO on 22.07.2008.”

**16. The Committee in their original report noted that there had been delay in submission of audited accounts by TWCO, Delhi and decrease in grants for Mumbai Women Organization. The Committee in this regard recommended that there should not be any delay in submission of audited accounts and annual review of welfare programmes should be conducted by MTNL. However, the Government in their Action Taken Report have evaded specific replies to both the recommendations. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that there should not be any delay in submission of audited accounts by the welfare organizations and there should be annual review of welfare programmes by the MTNL at Mumbai and Delhi.**

**E. Specify amount for disseminating information about welfare schemes  
Recommendation (Para No. 48)**

17. The Committee also feel that apart from devising welfare programmes for women employees, extensive efforts need to be made by the Ministry and MTNL to build awareness so that maximum number of women employees benefit from the programmes. The Committee recommend that specific amount should be fixed for disseminating information about the welfare schemes carried out by the welfare organizations of MTNL at Mumbai and Delhi.

18. The Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) have submitted the following reply in this regard:-

“The suggestion has been noted for further action please.”



**19. The Committee in their original Report felt that apart from devising welfare programmes for women employees, extensive efforts should be made by the Ministry and MTNL to create awareness so that maximum employees could benefit from such programmes. The Ministry have responded by stating that the suggestion has been noted for further action. However, the Committee feel that a mere noting of the suggestion does not address the issue. The Ministry/MTNL should have taken some concrete steps in this regard. The Committee, therefore, again recommend that specific amount should be fixed for disseminating information about welfare schemes carried out by the welfare organizations of MTNL at Mumbai and Delhi.**

**F. Timeframe redressal of cases against sexual harassment  
Recommendation (Para No. 52)**

20. The Committee take serious note of the fact that the Committee on Sexual Harassment at work place was constituted as late as in 2001 in MTNL, Corporate Office and Delhi Unit and in 2000 in Mumbai Unit, whereas the directions of the Supreme Court for the constitution of such a Committee at work place came into force in 1997. The Committee, feel that the management of MTNL has taken the matter rather lightly leading to delay in the constitution of Committee against Sexual Harassment. The Committee also find that there has been delay on the part of the management to settle complaints. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) should periodically monitor cases which are pending with the management so that justice is neither delayed nor denied.

The Committee also feel that the awareness level among the women employees regarding their rights and prerogatives has to be heightened. The Committee, therefore, desire that the Ministry in consultation with the MTNL should take appropriate measures to increase the awareness level among the women employees and make them more conscious towards their rights and additional incentives and facilities provided to them.

21. The Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) have submitted the following reply in this regard:-

“MTNL is making sincere efforts to sensitize the work force on the subject and the following activities have been undertaken in the past in this direction:-

- i) Awareness building workshops are continuously organized for employees (Male & Female) at all levels.
- ii) Code of Conduct issued by the National Commission for Women was displayed on the Notice Boards.
- iii) Any articles published in the newspaper on subject are also displayed on the Notice Boards.
- iv) As a continual effort, action is in hand for conducting Refresher Awareness Workshops covering employees.”

**22. The committee applaud the efforts made by MTNL to sensitize the work force at work place. The Committee also appreciate the organizing of Refresher Awareness Workshops to enhance the level of awareness among women employees regarding their rights and prerogatives. However the Committee are constrained to note that the Ministry have not responded to the recommendation made by the Committee regarding periodical monitoring of cases which are pending with the management so that**

**justice is delivered to the aggrieved party. The Committee therefore reiterate their recommendation that there should not be any delay on part of the management to settle complaints against sexual harassment within a timeframe and there should be periodical monitoring of the pending cases by the Ministry.**

## **CHPATER II**

### **OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS, WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT**

#### **Recommendation (Para No. 46)**

The Committee are constrained to find the backlog in SC/ST recruitment and promotional quota in the MTNL Mumbai Unit. The Committee found that in the Direct Recruitment there was a backlog of 29 vacancies (Group 'B') for SC category and 46 vacancies (Group 'B') for ST category in Mumbai Unit as on 31.12.2006. In the Promotional Quota there was a backlog of 63 vacancies (Group 'B') for SC category and 52 vacancies (Group 'B') for ST category in the Mumbai Unit as on 31.12.2006. The Committee feel that despite codification of promotion policy and launch of regular recruitment drives, the issue of backlog in vacancies in the case of SC/ST category remains a matter of serious anxiety and concern. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry should conduct early scrutiny of the reasons for such backlog and take measures to rectify the same. The Committee also feel that such persistent backlogs not only hamper the functioning of the organisation but also acts as disincentive for the candidates seeking employment and halts the process of empowerment.

#### **Replies of the Ministry of Communications & Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications)**

The backlog vacancies in the cadre of JTO and JAO for MTNL Mumbai pertain to vacancies upto the year 1999, when both these cadres were in Group C and recruitment to these cadres was made at Circle Level. DoT subsequently upgraded the post of JTO and JAO from Group C to Group B and in the course

of absorption DoT employees of the respective cadre were effected in MTNL on 01.10.2000.

Similarly, backlog shown against Group C posts pertains to vacancies upto 1999 in Mumbai Unit. Consequent upon the completion of absorption process of Group C & D and subsequent to the Board's decision in the 192<sup>nd</sup> Meeting held on 16.2.2004, it was decided to impose a ban on all type of recruitment except in key areas where posts have to be manned by professionally qualified personnel. Accordingly, there has not been any recruitment in Group C&D posts since then.

[U.O. No.59-47/2007-SU-IV dated 2.12.2008]

#### **Recommendation (Para No. 49)**

The Committee appreciate the efforts made by the Ministry and MTNL for organising various training programmes for the employees of MTNL such as customer care service, programme on attitude /behaviour changes, disposal of appeal under RTI Act, corporate success through people, etc. The Committee, however, note that there is uneven representation of women in the above stated training modules. The Committee are surprised to note that since 2007, no women employee of Mumbai Unit has been nominated for any of the training programmes in India. The Committee, therefore, recommend that there should be more consistency in nominating women employees for such training modules. The Committee also desire that the training modules should be further diversified as per the changing needs of the organisation.

**Replies of the Ministry of Communications & Information Technology  
(Department of Telecommunications)**

In the year 2007-08, CETTM, MTNL Mumbai has imparted training to 5389 employees, which includes 1114 female employees. In addition to the above, MTNL Corporate Office have deputed 7 female employees for Training/Seminar/Workshop at foreign locations. These figures are in addition to the figures already supplied. However, the suggestions given by the Committee has been noted for compliance.

[U.O. No.59-47/2007-SU-IV dated 2.12.2008]

**Recommendation (Para No. 50)**

The Committee find that the MTNL has made some security arrangements for the women employees who work during the night shift by having the buildings guarded round the clock, having the facility of dormitories wherein women can stay after their shift duty etc. However, the Committee are disturbed to point out the inability of the MTNL to provide pickup and drop facility especially for women employees who work during night shifts. The Committee feel that to have a balance between the personal and professional life of women employees, it is important that they are able to reach their homes after they get over with their duties. The Committee, therefore, urge the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) to take up the matter with MTNL on priority basis and take urgent steps to have suitable

arrangement of pickup and drop facility for employees who serve during odd hours.

**Replies of the Ministry of Communications & Information Technology  
(Department of Telecommunications)**

Mumbai Unit has informed that employees working in Night Shifts are dropped to the nearest Railway Station in the morning so that they can reach home by the safest and fastest mode of transport, i.e., local trains. MTNL takes good care of its employees and this practice is being followed in agreement with the Recognised Unions. The employees are satisfied with the present arrangement.

[U.O. No.59-47/2007-SU-IV dated 2.12.2008]

## **CHAPTER III**

### **OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS, WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT**

#### **Recommendation (Para No. 51)**

The Committee note that MTNL has been following the directives of the Government of India regarding transfers in the organization, which has been termed as Rational Transfer Policy. However, the Committee is constrained to point out that women employees have to face hardships because of erratic transfers in the organization, which often compels them to leave their jobs or go on leave without pay. Having regard to the fact that working women have to shoulder dual responsibilities both at the family and professional level, the Committee, would like the Ministry to give directions to MTNL to be sympathetic towards the transfer requests made by women employees on genuine grounds. The Committee further recommend that the Ministry should devise a mechanism whereby MTNL employees could be transferred from MTNL to BSNL and vice versa, since both the organizations are under the same Ministry.

#### **Replies of the Ministry of Communications & Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications)**

MTNL Units are following Rotational Transfer Policy for regulating transfers of its employees and efforts are being made to accommodate the employees on the merit of individual cases.

It is to inform that Non-executive cadre are Circle Cadre and transfers are effected within the same circle, i.e., within Delhi and Mumbai Circles. Inter-



Circles transfers are only considered in case employees apply on their own volition.

Executive Employees have All India Transfer Liability, however, presently MTNL operates in Delhi and Mumbai only. Therefore, at the best transfer can be effected amongst these two cities.

As regards transfer of Gr. `A' Officers, it is to inform that majority of the Gr. `A' Officers are still working in MTNL on deemed deputation basis and their transfers are regulated by DoT.

As regards suggestion for devising a mechanism whereby regular MTNL employees could be transferred to BSNL and vice-versa, these two organizations being two separate legal entities, it may not be possible.

[U.O. No.59-47/2007-SU-IV dated 2.12.2008]

## **CHPATER IV**

### **OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE**

#### **Recommendation (Para No. 43)**

In the post Globalization era there has been substantial increase in the employment opportunities but at the same time it has multiplied the professional hazards that women face at their work place. Although the working conditions of women employees engaged in the organised sector has improved when compared with those engaged in the unorganised sector, the Committee feel that the problem lies in the structural inhibition in the policy formulation that affects the conceptualization of gender sensitive work environment.

The Committee are constrained to note the low percentage of women employed in MTNL. The Committee also note that majority of women employed in MTNL are mostly in Group 'C' and 'D' posts. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) should conduct a study and find out the reasons for such a low percentage of women employees in MTNL and take appropriate measures to enhance their representation in the organisation. The Committee further desire that efforts should be made to increase the number of women employees in Group 'A' so that the management of the organization becomes more gender sensitive.

**Replies of the Ministry of Communications & Information Technology  
(Department of Telecommunications)**

The recommendation of Committee has been noted & directions have been issued to MTNL in respect of conducting a study to find out reasons for low percentage of women employees in MTNL and taking measure to enhance their representation at various levels, including at top executive (Group A) level in MTNL.

[U.O. No.59-47/2007-SU-IV dated 2.12.2008]

Comments of the Committee on Recommendation No.43.  
(Please see Para No.7 of Chapter I of the Report)

**Recommendation (Para No. 44)**

The Committee are distressed to note there are just 2 Scheduled Tribe women in Group 'A' services of MTNL without any intake of Scheduled Caste women. The Committee are further constrained to note that between the year 2002-2005, 621 recruitments were made in Group 'B' services. However, women employees comprise only 12.2% of it. The Committee feel that merely organising walk-in-interviews does not absolve the Ministry and MTNL of their responsibility to encourage SC/ST candidates to avail employment opportunities. The Committee, therefore, desire that the Ministry should give directions to MTNL to organize regular Recruitment Drives in SC/ST majority areas and encourage SC/ST candidates specially women candidates to come forward and join the organisation. The Committee do not accept the plea of 'non-availability of candidates' for less number of SC/ST categories for group 'A' posts in MTNL.

The Committee, therefore, recommend that the ministry should ask MTNL to devise courses and training modules for such candidates to help them compete with the mainstream candidates.

**Replies of the Ministry of Communications & Information Technology  
(Department of Telecommunications)**

MTNL is making sincere efforts to fill the backlog vacancies of SC/ST. Difficulties are being faced, particularly in the cadre of JAO, as professionally qualified candidates from these categories are not available in the open market. Therefore, the qualification for intake in JAO Cadre was relaxed, Special Recruitment Drives including Walk-in Interview to fill the backlog vacancies followed. Then MTNL were able to fill 3 posts of JAOs in the month of March, 2008.

Group `A` level officers have been posted from DoT. They have not been recruited by MTNL.

[U.O. No.59-47/2007-SU-IV dated 2.12.2008]

Comments of the Committee Recommendation No.44  
(Please see Para No.10 of Chapter I of the Report)

**Recommendation (Para No. 47)**

The Committee note that welfare organizations namely, Telecom Women Central Organisation (TWCO) at Delhi and MTNL Women's Organisation at Mumbai are engaged in various welfare programmes for women employees. These organisations have been carrying various programmes such as running crèches, tailoring centres, health camps, etc. However, the Committee are

constrained to note that TWCO, Delhi, has not been able to submit the audit figures for the year 2004, due to which special grants for welfare programmes for 2005-06 and 2006-07 could not be sanctioned. The Committee also note that the amount sanctioned for Mumbai Women Organisation has decreased from Rs 76,694/- in 2004-05 to Rs 47,806/- in 2006-07. The Committee feel concerned to find delay in submission of audited figures and decrease in the grants for welfare activities is a matter of great concern. The Committee feel that welfare activities in any organisation are an essential component of the entire system, which not only lead to optimum output but also create healthy work environment. The Committee, therefore, recommend that TWCO, Delhi Unit should be instructed to submit the audited figures at the earliest and streamline their accounting procedures. The Committee also recommend that the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) should conduct annual review of welfare programmes being carried out by the welfare organisations so that realistic grants are made annually for welfare programmes.

**Replies of the Ministry of Communications & Information Technology  
(Department of Telecommunications)**

The quantum of Fund depends upon the numbers of Programmes undertaken by the Women's Welfare Organization in the Units. Mumbai Unit, in the year 2007-08, has sanctioned Rs.62806/- to the Women's Welfare Organization. Similarly Rs. Two Lakh has been approved by MTNL for Delhi Chapter of TWCO on 22.07.2008.

[U.O. No.59-47/2007-SU-IV dated 2.12.2008]

Comments of the Committee Recommendation No.47  
(Please see Para No.16 of Chapter I of the Report)

**Recommendation (Para No. 48)**

The Committee also feel that apart from devising welfare programmes for women employees, extensive efforts need to be made by the Ministry and MTNL to build awareness so that maximum number of women employees benefit from the programmes. The Committee recommend that specific amount should be fixed for disseminating information about the welfare schemes carried out by the welfare organisations of MTNL at Mumbai and Delhi.

**Replies of the Ministry of Communications & Information Technology  
(Department of Telecommunications)**

“The suggestions has been noted for further action.”

[U.O. No.59-47/2007-SU-IV dated 2.12.2008]

Comments of the Committee Recommendation No.48  
(Please see Para No.19 of Chapter I of the Report)

## CHAPTER V

### OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH THE GOVERNMENT HAVE FURNISHED INTERIM REPLIES

#### Recommendation (Para No. 45)

The Committee are surprised to note that absorption issues of MTNL Group 'A' officers commenced in March 2005, almost 20 years after MTNL was set up in April 1986. The Committee take serious note of the delay on the part of the Ministry to address the issue of absorption. The Committee, therefore, desire that the Ministry in coordination with MTNL should take earnest steps to settle the issue of absorption of MTNL Group 'A' officers and furnish a report to this committee at the earliest.

#### Replies of the Ministry of Communications & Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications)

Status Note on Absorption of Group 'A' Officers in BSNL/MTNL as on 01.12.2008

- i) Consequent upon formation of MTNL and BSNL, Group 'A', 'B', 'C' and 'D' employees of the Department of Telecommunications were transferred to these PSUs on 'as is where is' basis on deemed deputation. About 3,97,000 Group 'B', 'C', 'D' employees already stand absorbed in BSNL/MTNL.
- ii) The Cabinet in its meeting held on 2<sup>nd</sup> February, 2005 approved the Department's proposal for absorption of Group 'A' officers in MTNL/BSNL. As per Cabinet's decision, the period of deemed deputation of Group 'A' officers was to be for a period upto five years, i.e. upto 30.09.2005. It was also decided by the Cabinet that with a view to ensure uniformity with

Group 'B' officers, Group 'A' officers may also be absorbed in MTNL/BSNL w.e.f. 1.10.2000.

iii) Options were accordingly invited vide letter dated 24.03.2005 from approximately 3000 Group 'A' officers of different services for absorption in BSNL/MTNL or continuation in Government service. Group 'A' officers individually and through their Associations sought clarifications, raised certain demands and also filed a series of court cases. Necessary clarifications as also the fresh decisions of the Government on the demands of Group 'A' officers were issued from time to time. However, Group 'A' officers were not satisfied with the clarifications/fresh decisions and most of them did not exercise their option.

iv) In the meantime, Department of Telecommunications continued dialogue with the Indian Telecom Service Association (ITSA). Some time back, a Committee including representatives of the said Association, was formed to consider the absorption related issues in finer details.

v) The above said Committee made certain recommendations involving liberalization of certain terms already offered to Group 'A' officers. Representatives of the said Association in the meeting held under the chairmanship of the then Secretary, Department of Telecommunications expressed confidence that if these recommendations are implemented, majority of the ITS officers would seek absorption in BSNL/MTNL.

vi) Based on the recommendations of the above Committee, a Note dated 2.5.2008 on the subject of absorption of Group 'A' officers of Indian Telecom Service (ITS), Indian P&T Accounts & Finance Service (IP&T A&FS) and other services in BSNL/MTNL was submitted to the Cabinet for its consideration. The Cabinet, in its meeting held on 15.05.2008, decided



that the matter may, in the first instance, be considered by a Group of Ministers (GoM). Accordingly, a Note dated 5.5.2008 was submitted for consideration by GoM. The said Note was considered by GoM on 10.6.2008. Based on the decisions taken by GoM, a fresh Note dated 3.7.2008 on the subject was submitted for consideration by the Cabinet.

vii) The Cabinet in its meeting held on 24.7.2008 considered the proposals made in the Note dated 03.07.2008 and approved the proposals with certain directions. Pursuant to the Cabinet decision dated 24.7.2008, a revised option letter dated 26.08.2008 was issued on the subject of Calling of Option for absorption of Group 'A' officers of MTNL/BSNL. Besides, in pursuance of the Cabinet decision, the period of deemed deputation, without deputation allowance, of officers belonging to various Group 'A' services of DoT transferred to MTNL/BSNL was also extended till 22.12.2008 or the date of allocation, whichever is earlier.

viii) Subsequent to the issue of the above option letter dated 26.8.2008. Department of Telecommunications received requests/representations for modifying certain general terms and conditions of absorption as also seeking clarifications on various points. After considering the said requests, revised general terms and conditions for absorption incorporating certain additional incentives/benefits for absorption were issued on 29.09.2008. Clarifications on the points raised in the representations have also been issued.

ix) As per option letter dated 26.8.2008, the last date prescribed for submission of options by Group 'A' officers was 16.10.2008 for officers working/retired in BSNL/MTNL/DOP and 06.10.2008 for officers working/retired in DoT/other Departments/borrowing organizations. However, in compliance with the order dated 17.10.2008 passed by Hon'ble High Court of Delhi in a writ petition filed by Indian Telecom

Service Association, the last date for receipt of options of the eligible Group 'A' officers was extended upto 31.10.2008.

x) The options received from Group A officers for absorption in MTNL/BSNL or for continuation in Government Service are being processed in the Department of Telecommunications as per the prescribed procedure.

[U.O. No.59-47/2007-SU-IV dated 2.12.2008]

Comments of the Committee Recommendation No.45  
(Please see Para No.13 of Chapter I of the Report)

### **Recommendation (Para No. 52)**

The Committee take serious note of the fact that the Committee on Sexual Harassment at work place was constituted as late as in 2001 in MTNL, Corporate Office and Delhi Unit and in 2000 in Mumbai Unit, whereas the directions of the Supreme Court for the constitution of such a Committee at work place came into force in 1997. The Committee, feel that the management of MTNL has taken the matter rather lightly leading to delay in the constitution of Committee against Sexual Harassment. The Committee also find that there has been delay on the part of the management to settle complaints. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (Department of Telecommunications) should periodically monitor cases which are pending with the management so that justice is neither delayed nor denied. The Committee also feel that the awareness level among the women employees regarding their rights and prerogatives has to be heightened. The Committee, therefore, desire that the Ministry in consultation with the MTNL should take

appropriate measures to increase the awareness level among the women employees and make them more conscious towards their rights and additional incentives and facilities provided to them.

**Replies of the Ministry of Communications & Information Technology  
(Department of Telecommunications)**

MTNL is making sincere efforts to sensitize the work forces on the subject and following activities have been undertaken in the past in this direction.

- i) Awareness building workshops are continuously organized for employees (Male & Female) at all level.
- ii) Code of Conduct issued by the National Commission for Women are displayed on the Notice Boards.
- iii) Any articles published in the newspaper on subject are also displayed on Notice Boards.
- iv) As a continual efforts, action is in hand for conducting Refresher Awareness Workshops covering employees.

[U.O. No.59-47/2007-SU-IV dated 2.12.2008]

Comments of the Committee Recommendation No.52  
(Please see Para No.22 of Chapter I of the Report)

**NEW DELHI**  
**4<sup>th</sup> February, 2009**  
**15<sup>th</sup> Magha, 1930 (Saka)**

**KRISHNA TIRATH**  
**CHAIRPERSON**  
**COMMITTEE ON EMPOWERMENT OF WOMEN**

**APPENDIX I**  
**MINUTES**  
**COMMITTEE ON EMPOWERMENT OF WOMEN (2008-2009)**

**Fourth Sitting**  
**(27.1.2009)**

The Committee sat on Tuesday, the 27<sup>th</sup> January, 2009 from 1500 hrs. to 1600 hrs. in Hon'ble Chairperson, EWC's Chamber (Room No. 130, Parliament House Annexe), New Delhi.

PRESENT

**Smt. Krishna Tirath** - **Chairperson**

**MEMBERS**

**LOK SABHA**

2. Smt. Tejaswini Seeramesh Gowda
3. Shri Rajesh Kumar Manjhi
4. Smt. Minati Sen
5. Smt. C. S. Sujatha
6. Smt. Jayaben Thakkar
7. Shri P.C. Thomas
8. Shri M.P. Veerendrakumar

**RAJYA SABHA**

9. Smt. Syeda Anwara Taimur
10. Dr. C.P. Thakur
11. Dr. Prabha Thakur
12. Shri Ambeth Rajan

**SECRETARIAT**

- |    |                    |                     |
|----|--------------------|---------------------|
| 1. | Shri S. Bal Shekar | Joint Secretary     |
| 2. | Shri C.S. Joon     | Director            |
| 3. | Smt. Mamta Kemwal  | Deputy Secretary-II |

2. At the outset, Chairperson welcomed the Members to the sitting of the Committee.

3. The Committee then took up for consideration the draft Action Taken Report on the subject '**Working Conditions of Women in MTNL**'. After some deliberations, the Committee adopted the draft Action Taken Report without changes and authorised the Chairperson to finalise the Report and present the same to Parliament.

*The Committee then adjourned.*

## APPENDIX II

(Vide Para 4 of the Introduction)

### ANALYSIS OF ACTION TAKEN BY GOVERNMENT ON THE FIFTEENTH REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON EMPOWERMENT OF WOMEN (14<sup>TH</sup> LOK SABHA)

(i)	Total No. of Recommendations	10
(ii)	Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government: Para Nos. 46,49 and 50.	03
	Percentage to Total	30%
(iii)	Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government: Para No. 51.	01
	Percentage to Total	10%
(iv)	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee: Para Nos. 43,44,47 and 48.	04
	Percentage to Total	40%
(v)	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies: Para Nos. 45 and 52	02
		20%