

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE  
OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND  
SCHEDULED TRIBES**

**(FIFTH LOK SABHA)**

**SEVENTH REPORT**

**MINISTRY OF DEFENCE**

**(DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE PRODUCTION)**

**Reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled  
Tribes in the Defence Public Sector  
Undertakings**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI**

*April, 1972/Chaitra, 1894 (S)*

*Price: Re. 1.80*

43A

**LIST OF AUTHORISED AGENTS FOR THE SALE OF  
LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT PUBLICATIONS**

Sl. No.	Name of Agent	Agency No.	Sl. No.	Name of Agent	Agency No.
<b>ANDHRA PRADESH</b>			12.	Charles Lambert & Company, 101, Mahatma Gandhi Road, Opposite Clock Tower, Fort, Bombay.	30
1.	Andhra University General Cooperative Stores Ltd., Waltair (Visakhapatnam)	8	13.	The Current Book House, Maruti Lane, Raghunath Dadaji Street, Bombay-1.	60
2.	G.R. Lakshminpathy Chetty and Sons, General Merchants and News Agents, Newpet, Chandragiri, Chittoor District.	94	14.	Deccan Book Stall, Ferguson College Road, Poona-4.	65
<b>ASSAM</b>			15.	M/s. Usha Book Depot, 585/A, Chira Bazar, Khan House, Girigaum Road, Bombay-2 B.R.	5
3.	Western Book Depot, Pan Bazar, Gauhati.	7	<b>MYSORE</b>		
<b>BIHAR</b>			16.	M/s. Peoples Book House, Opp. Jaganmohan Palace, Mysore-1.	16
4.	Amar Kitab Ghar, Post Box 78, Diagonal Road, Jamshedpur.	37	<b>RAJASTHAN</b>		
<b>GUJARAT</b>			17.	Information Centre, Government of Rajasthan, Tripolia, Jaipur City.	38
5.	Vijay Stores, Station Road, Anand.	35	<b>UTTAR PRADESH</b>		
6.	The New Order Book Company, Eillis Bridge, Ahmedabad-6.]	63	18.	Swastik Industrial Works, 59, Holi Street, Meerut City.	2]
<b>HARYANA</b>			19.	Law Book Company, Sardar Patel Marg, Allahabad-1.	48
7.	M/s. Prabhu Book Service, Nai Subzimandi, Gurgaon, (Haryana).	14	<b>WEST BENGAL</b>		
<b>MADHYA PRADESH</b>			20.	Granthaloka, 5/1, Ambica Mookherjee Road, Belgharia, 24 Parganas.	10
8.	Modern Book House, Shiv Vilas Palace, Indore City.	13	21.	W. Newman & Company Ltd., 3, Old Court House Street, Calcutta.	44
<b>MAHARASHTRA</b>			22.	Firma K.L. Mukhopadhyay, 6/1A, Banchharam Akrur Lane, Calcutta-12.	82
9.	M/s. Sunderdas Gianchand, 601, Girgaum Road, Near Princess Street, Bombay-2.	6	23.	M/s. Mukherji Book House, 8-B, Duff Lane, Calcutta-6	4
10.	The International Book House (Private) Limited, 9, Ash Lane, Mahatma Gandhi Road, Bombay-1.	22			
11.	The International Book Service, Deccan Gymkhana, Poona-4.	26			

CORRIGENDA

to the

Seventh Report of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes (Fifth Lok Sabha).

---

<u>Page</u>	<u>Para</u>	<u>Line</u>	<u>For</u>	<u>Read</u>
6	1.8	16	corrct	correct
17	2.21	22	three	there
23	2.35	5	has	had
41	2.74	15	extent	extant
45	2.89	17	carrying	carried
46	-	15	Call	Cell
51	3.1	4	1972	1971
75	2.30	1-2	Caste Tribe	Caste/Tribe

## CONTENTS

	PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE . . . . .	(iii)
INTRODUCTION . . . . .	(v)
 CHAPTER I—INTRODUCTORY	
A. Organisation . . . . .	1
B. Issue of Directive . . . . .	5
C. Liaison with the Bureau of Public Enterprises . . . . .	7
 CHAPTER II—RECRUITMENT	
A. Assessment of Manpower . . . . .	9
B. Recruitment Procedure . . . . .	10
C. Inclusion of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe officer in the Recruitment/Promotion Board . . . . .	20
D. Recruitment of Graduate Engineers . . . . .	21
E. Recruitment of Trade Apprentices . . . . .	27
F. Recruitment of Casual Workmen . . . . .	33
G. Staff Position and Shortfalls . . . . .	24
H. Maintenance of Rosters . . . . .	40
I. In-service Training . . . . .	41
J. De-reservation . . . . .	43
K. Liaison Officer and Complaints Cell . . . . .	46
L. Housing Facilities . . . . .	48
 CHAPTER III—PROMOTIONS	
A. Promotion Procedure . . . . .	51
B. Supersessions . . . . .	56
 APPENDICES	
I. Department of Defence Productive Directive dated 28-10-1971. . . . .	59
II. Promotion Procedure. . . . .	68
III. Summary of Conclusions/Recommendations Contained in the Report . . . . .	72

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF  
SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES

(1971—73)

Sardar Buta Singh—*Chairman*

MEMBERS

*Lok Sabha*

2. Shri B. K. Daschowdhury
3. Shri D. Deb
4. Shri Hukam Chand Kachwai
5. Kumari Kamala Kumari
6. Shri Arjun Shripat Kasture
7. Shri M. Kathamuthu
8. Shri Kinder Lal
9. Shri Nihar Laskar
10. Shri Kartik Oraon
11. Shri Bhaljibhai Ravjibhai Parmar
12. Shri Dhan Shah Pradhan
13. Shri K. Pradhani
14. Shri Ram Dhan
15. Shri Ram Swaroop
16. Swami Ramanand Shastri
17. Shri S. M. Siddayya
18. Shri Babu Nath Singh
19. Shri K. Subravelu
20. Shri Tulmohan Ram

*Rajya Sabha*

21. Shri G. A. Appan
22. Shri Balram Das
23. Shri Golap Barbora
24. Shri Ganeshi Lal Chaudhary
25. Shri B. T. Kemparaj

(iv)

26. Shri K. P. Subramania Menon
27. Shri Brahmananda Panda
28. Shri Roshan Lal
29. Shri Sukhdev Prasad
30. Shri Melhupra Vero

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri B. K. Mukherjee—*Deputy Secretary*,
2. Shri J. R. Kapur—*Under Secretary*.

## INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman, Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, having been authorised by the Committee to submit the Report on their behalf, present this Seventh Report on the Ministry of Defence (Department of Defence Production)—Reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings.

2. The Committee took the evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Finance (Bureau of Public Enterprises), Department of Defence Production and Defence Public Sector Undertakings from 22nd to 26th October, 1971. The Committee wish to express their thanks to the Director General of Bureau of Public Enterprises, Secretary of the Department of Defence Production and the Managing Director/General Managers of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings and other officers of the Department of Defence Production and Defence Public Sector Undertakings for placing before the Committee material and information they wanted in connection with the examination of the subject.

3. The Report was considered and adopted by the Committee on 21st March, 1972.

4. A summary of conclusions/recommendations contained in the Report is appended.

NEW DELHI;  
April 5, 1972  

---

Chaitra 16, 1894 (S)..

BUTA SINGH,  
Chairman,  
Committee on the Welfare of  
Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes

## CHAPTER I

### INTRODUCTORY

#### A. Organisation

1.1. The Committee have been informed that there are at present eight Public Sector Undertakings under the Department of Defence Production, *viz:*—

- (1) Hindustan Aeronautics Limited, Bangalore
- (2) Bharat Electronics Limited, Bangalore
- (3) Mazagon Docks Limited, Bombay
- (4) Garden Reach Workshops Limited, Calcutta
- (5) Praga Tools Limited, Secunderabad
- (6) Bharat Earth Movers Limited, Bangalore
- (7) Goa Shipyard Limited, Goa
- (8) Bharat Dynamics Limited, Hyderabad.

1.2. It has been stated that company form of management has been adopted for these Public Sector Undertakings in order to secure for them the benefit of business and commercial method and greater flexibility in managing their production. All the eight companies, except the Praga Tools Limited, and the Goa Shipyard Limited, are wholly owned by the Government of India. In Praga Tools Limited, the Government of India holds nearly 77.6 per cent shares while about 16 per cent and 6.4 per cent shares are owned by the Government of Andhra Pradesh and the general public respectively. In the Goa Shipyard Limited, Mazagon Dock Limited holds 52 per cent shares; 22 per cent shares are owned by the Government of India and the remaining 26 per cent by semi-government institutions and general public.

1.3. A brief description of each of these Undertakings is given below:—

#### (1) *Hindustan Aeronautics Limited, Bangalore*

The Hindustan Aeronautics Limited came into being on the 1st October, 1964 by amalgamation of the erstwhile Hindustan Aircraft Limited with Aeronautics India Limited. It has four constituent



units, namely, the Bangalore Division, the MIG Complex, comprising the factories at Nasik, Koraput and Hyderabad, the Kanpur Division and the newly created Lucknow Division for the manufacture of aircraft accessories.

(2) *Bharat Electronics Limited, Bangalore*

The Bharat Electronics Limited was established in 1954 for the manufacture of professional electronic equipment and components. It has two main Divisions, namely, Equipments Division and Components Division. In the Equipments Division, BEL is manufacturing sophisticated and specialised electronic equipments such as transmitters/receivers, transreceivers and radars mainly for Defence Services and Civil Departments e.g. All India Radio, Police, Communications and Meteorological Department. In the Components Division, it manufactures several types of specialised components such as receiving valves, Germanium/Silicon Transistors and Diodes, Crystals, Ceramic and Mica Capacitors, Transmitting Tubes, Magnetrans, Television Picture Tubes and Cathode Ray Tubes.

It has been decided to set up a second factory of Bharat Electronics Limited at Ghaziabad for the manufacture of microwave and radar equipments. The estimated capital cost of the new factory excluding the Township, is Rs. 11.5 crores. The factory is expected to start production in about the middle of 1973-74.

(3) *Mazagon Docks Limited, Bombay*

The Mazagon Docks Limited was originally incorporated in 1934 with the British India Steam Navigation Company and the Peninsular & Oriental Steam Navigation Co. of the U.K. as the principal share-holders. It was acquired by the Government of India (Ministry of Defence) in 1960.

Before acquisition by the Government, the main activity of Mazagon Docks Limited related to ship repairs. In 1964, a scheme for expansion and modernisation of the yard was launched at an estimated cost of Rs. 832 lakhs. The expansion scheme has resulted in establishment of two new ship-building berths with necessary crange facility and other essential services. The tidal Kasara Basin has also been converted into an impounded wet dock capable of accommodating four medium size ships at a time. Cranage and other essential services have been provided for this wet dock. Also, new electrical/electronics shops and fitting out shops have been built alongside the Kasara Basin and modern machinery and equipment have been installed therein.

The facilities generated by the expansion scheme have equipped the yard to undertake construction of ships upto 145 metres in length and 24 metres in breadth (approximately 15,000 ton DWT). The yard has capacity to build various types of ships such as sophisticated warships in addition to passenger-cum-cargo ships, dredgers, tugs and barges. The Company has also built up substantial capacity for undertaking ship repair work and general engineering work, such as, repairs to machinery and equipment, precision machining, radiograph quality welding, etc.

(4) *Garden Reach Workshops Limited, Calcutta*

The Garden Reach Workshops Limited was acquired from the British India Steam Navigation Company and River Steam Navigation Company of the U.K. by the Government of India (Ministry of Defence) in 1960. The main activity of the Company at the time of acquisition comprised ship repairs. After the Government take-over, sustained efforts have been made to convert it from a predominantly ship-repair yard into a major establishment constructing large capacity dredgers and tugs for ports. The Company has also been gradually diversifying its activities into the General Engineering Field and has now established the production of the following types of equipment:

- (a) Deepwell Turbine Pumps and Centrifugal Pumps.
- (b) Haulages and Conveyors.
- (c) Electric Overhead Travelling Cranes.
- (d) Road Rollers.
- (e) Air Compressors.
- (f) Pressure Vessels and Heat Exchangers.
- (g) Fabrication and erection of equipments for Steel Plants (Bokaro and Bhilai).

Further diversification plans of the Company include the manufacture of various Deck Machinery items like Winches, Cargo Cranes, Windlasses, Steering Gears, etc. for the ocean going Vessels. It has also established a factory at Ranchi for the manufacture of Marine Diesel Engines of various types.

The Company is executing an expansion plan, envisaging modernisation and expansion of the existing yard facilities. The main features of this expansion plan are:—

- (i) Modernisation of the existing Dry Dock No. 1 into a building dry dock;

- (ii) Construction of a fitting out jetty; and
- (iii) Improving the yard facilities for material handling and ship construction.

The implementation of this expansion project will enable the Company to undertake the construction of two ocean-going vessels of 15,000 to 25,000 tons DWT capacity. The Company also has certain plans which would enable it to construct sophisticated light naval craft.

(5) *Praga Tools Limited, Secunderabad*

The Praga Tools Limited manufactures light machine tools e.g. drilling machines, Praga Tool and Cutter Grinder (Model 411) and Surface Grinder (Models 540 and 540-H), Pragagambin Milling machines, machine tool accessories such as Drill Chucks, Lathe Chucks, etc., certain precision items such as surface plates and gauges and some defence items. The Company also has a Forge and Foundry Division which is engaged in the manufacture of forgings such as auto and diesel spares and certain defence items, apart from supplying some of the forgings and castings required by the Machine Tools Division.

The Company's expansion projects relating to the manufacture of Surface Grinders, Milling Machines and Pratt Lathe Chucks are under execution and production of Surface Grinders in collaboration with M/s. A. A. Jones and Shipman Ltd., U.K. and of Milling Machines in collaboration with M/s. Gambin of France has been established. The plant and machinery for the Pratt Lathe Chucks Project has been received and installed and the production of these items is in full swing.

(6) *Bharat Earth Movers Limited, Bangalore*

The Bharat Earth Movers Limited was set up in May 1964 as a Government Company for the manufacture of heavy earthmoving equipment such as Scrapers, Dumpers etc., under a Technical Collaboration Agreement earlier concluded by the Government with Messrs Le Tourneau Westinghouse Company (since redesignated as Westinghouse Air Brake Co.). U.S.A., in October 1962. The Heavy Earthmoving equipment project had initially been assigned to Hindustan Aeronautics Limited, Bangalore Division, in view of the facilities available for carrying out the initial exercises in the Railcoach factory at Bangalore. The project, along with the Railcoach Division, was transferred to Bharat Earth Movers Limited with effect from 1st January 1965. In July 1965, it was decided that the manufacture of Crawler Tractors, which was then being carried on in the Ordnance factories under a Collaboration Agreement with

(7) *Goa Shipyard Limited, Goa*

M/s. Komatsu Manufacturing Co. of Japan, should be transferred to Bharat Earth Movers Limited.

This Company had originally been founded under the Portuguese law in November, 1957 under the name of Estaleiros Navais de Goa. After the liberation of Goa, the yard was given on lease to Mazagon Docks Limited with effect from the 14th April, 1962, and was being utilised mainly for minor ship repair works until 30th September 1967 when the lease was terminated and the Company was reconstituted as a subsidiary of Mazagon Docks Limited. The name of the Company was changed to Goa Shipyard Limited, and it started functioning under its own management and the Board of Directors with effect from the 1st October, 1967.

(8) *Bharat Dynamics Limited, Hyderabad*

The Bharat Dynamics Limited has been set up as a new Government Company at Hyderabad with an authorised capital of Rs. 5 crores, for the manufacture of missiles. Production in this undertaking has started recently.

**B. Issue of the Directive**

1.4. The Committee have been informed during evidence that the Department of Defence Production had received the draft directive from the Bureau of Public Enterprises on the 21st September, 1969. The Department, in turn, issued the presidential directive to all the Undertakings under it, except to the Praga Tools Limited, Secunderabad, and the Bharat Dynamics Limited, Hyderabad, on the 27th January, 1970. In the case of the Praga Tools Limited, it was found necessary first to amend the Articles of Association of the Company. But in the meanwhile, a copy of the Directive was sent to Praga Tools Ltd. also on 2-2-1970 with the instructions that this should be treated as a Government Directive for that Company also and this was noted by the Company at their Board of Directors' meeting held on 3.3.1970. So far as the Bharat Dynamics Limited was concerned, this Company was set up only in July, 1970 and it started functioning in October, 1970. Therefore, the directive was issued to them in February, 1971.

1.5. The Committee have been further informed during evidence that the draft directive sent by the Bureau of Public Enterprises had been accepted by the Department of Defence Production *in toto*.

1.6. Asked how many supplementary directives had been issued by the Department of Defence Production to these Undertakings, the representative of the Department of Defence Production stated that

only one supplementary directive was issued on the 17th February, 1971.

1.7. The Committee note that after the evidence of the representatives of the Department of Defence Production and of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings regarding reservations for, and employment of, Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings was given before the Committee from the 23rd to 26th October, 1971, the Department of Defence Production has issued further supplementary directives to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings on the 28th October, 1971 (Appendix I) and the 1st December, 1971, incorporating therein the various suggestions made by the Committee during the course of evidence.

1.8. Asked what was the machinery available with the Department of Defence Production to ensure that the provisions contained in the directives were being strictly followed by the Undertakings, the representative of the Department of Defence Production stated during evidence that there were two Joint Secretaries in the Department of Defence Production to deal with these Undertakings. It was their responsibility to see that the overall action required under the Constitution, as well as the follow-up action required under the instructions issued by the Bureau of Public Enterprises regarding the reservations for, and employment of, the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in these Undertakings, was taken. He further stated that the Department received from all the Undertakings annual statements showing the recruitment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. These statements were scrutinised and examined by the Department. The Department had no independent means of checking or verifying whether these returns were correct or not. Asked whether it would be possible for the Department to conduct sample checking of the returns received from the Undertakings, the representative of the Department stated that this had not been done so far, but this system could be introduced. However, all the Undertakings were autonomous corporations and they would not like the Department to interfere in their day-to-day working.

1.9. While the Committee would discuss in succeeding paragraphs the various matters discussed with the representatives of the Department of Defence Production, they would like to record here, their appreciation of the promptness with which the Department accepted most of the suggestions made during the evidence of its representatives and issued the directives incorporating those suggestions to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings. The Committee hope that the representation of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings

will now considerably improve if the instructions contained in those directives are implemented in toto by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings.

1.10. The Committee would like the Department of Defence Production to examine the annual returns received by it from the Public Undertakings under it specifically in the light of the directives issued to them regarding the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and to point out to the concerned Undertakings the shortcomings, if any, noticed therein, with a view to rectify them.

### C. Liaison with the Bureau of Public Enterprises

1.11. The Department of Defence Production has stated in a note furnished to the Committee that apart from the two draft directives, no other specific suggestions in regard to the employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the Public Undertakings have been received from the Bureau of Public Enterprises. It also appears from the material furnished by these Undertakings that special arrangements for liaison and coordination with the Bureau of Public Enterprises have not been developed by the Undertakings.

1.12. When this question was taken up with the Bureau of Public Enterprises, the Director-General of the Bureau of Public Enterprises stated during evidence that the Public Undertakings were autonomous bodies and they worked directly under the control of the administrative Ministries concerned and the role of the Bureau was purely an advisory one. He clarified that there was difference in the filling up of posts by Government and by the Public Undertakings. In the case of Government, the rules and regulations on the subject could be enforced. However, this was not possible in the case of Undertakings. Government could only prevail upon the Undertakings if some specific breach of the directive was brought to its notice. As per the recommendation of the Administrative Reforms Commission, it was not possible to interfere in the day-to-day working of the Undertakings, unless some irregularity was brought to the notice of the Bureau.

1.13. In reply to a further question, the Director-General stated:

“..... public undertakings are companies registered under the Companies Act. They are registered private companies. Of course, that does not prevent the Government to give very strong and specific directives in this particular regard. The trouble is that it will be little difficult unless a specific irregularity and non-compliance of the directive is pointed out. Government is not acting here as a Government, it is asking them as the majority shareholder.”

1.14. The Director-General further stated:

“..... we are extremely anxious about the present position which has developed over a period of time in regard to the position of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Public Enterprises and we will try to rectify the position to the extent possible and we can also assure you that we will not spare from our side any pains to achieve this objective.”

1.15. He further stated that the Bureau was not in executive charge of these Undertakings. Therefore, it would be very difficult for the Bureau to point out to the different Undertakings about their lapses in this regard. The Bureau could certainly point out to the administrative Ministry about these lapses. The Bureau was already examining the statistics received from the various Undertakings and was pointing out the shortfalls, etc. to the Ministries concerned.

1.16. The Committee have no doubt that close liaison and coordination between the Bureau of Public Enterprises, Department of Defence Production and Defence Public Sector Undertakings will go a long way in improving the representation of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Undertakings. While the Committee agree with the Director-General of Bureau of Public Enterprises that the role of the Bureau of Public Enterprises is purely an advisory one and that the Bureau can not interfere in the day-to-day working of the Undertakings, the Committee would like to stress that the returns from the Public Undertakings should be carefully examined by the Bureau on receipt, keeping in view the percentages of reservations and other measures prescribed for the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The deficiencies, if any, found in the representation of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Undertakings should immediately be pointed out to the Department of Defence Production so that necessary corrective measures are taken expeditiously. The Bureau should also, with the collaboration of the Department of Defence Production, keep a close watch to ensure that these deficiencies are made up as speedily as possible.

## CHAPTER II

### RECRUITMENT

#### A. Assessment of Manpower

2.1. It has been stated in a note furnished to the Committee that after taking into account the present and future workload, the short-term and long-term manpower requirements are assessed by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings themselves according to their approved procedures. The delegation of powers for creation or filling up of posts at various levels differs from Undertaking to Undertaking. In reply to a question, it has been stated that manpower requirements of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings (in respect of technical categories) during the Fourth Five Year Plan period, assessed on the basis of normal wastages and likely expansion of activities based on present projections, have been furnished to the Manpower Directorate of the Ministry of Home Affairs, who are engaged on the work of assessing the requirements of technically trained personnel in coordination with the Planning Commission.

2.2. The Committee desired to know whether the Department of Defence Production had taken up with the Ministry of Shipping and Transport and the Director-General of Employment and Training the question of increasing seats in favour of Scheduled Castes/Tribes in the Marine Engineering Colleges and Indian Institutes of Technology so that enough number of technically qualified Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates could be forthcoming for employment in the various Defence Undertakings. The representative of the Department of Defence Production stated during evidence that he had made an enquiry from the authorities concerned in this behalf. They informed him that even the existing reserved seats were not being fully filled up by the Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates. He felt that if greater interest was shown by the Director-General of Employment and Training in this direction, perhaps, more Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates could be forthcoming for taking up these technical courses. It would be better if some sort of survey could be undertaken by the Director-General of Employment and Training to find out the reasons for these shortfalls to suggest necessary corrective measures in the matter.

2.3. The Committee are unhappy to learn that even the existing seats reserved for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the



Marine Engineering College, Indian Institutes of Technology, etc., are not being filled up by the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe students. The Committee feel that unless more and more Scheduled Caste/Tribe students take up the requisite technical courses, their representation in the services of Defence Public Sector Undertakings is not likely to improve. The Committee would, therefore, stress the desirability of conducting a survey to find out the reasons for the inadequate intake of Scheduled Caste/Tribe students in technical courses in these technical institutions. The Committee suggest that close liaison and coordination between the Defence Public Sector Undertakings and the various technical institutions should be established so that adequate numbers of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe students could be given necessary education and training according to the requirements of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings.

2.4. The Committee also suggest that for purposes of recruitment, the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, should notify their requirements to the Placement Officers in the various Institutes of Technology so that students passing out from the Institutes could offer themselves for employment in those Undertakings.

### B. Recruitment Procedure

2.5. In a note furnished to the Committee by the Department of Defence Production, the recruitment procedure being followed by the Mazagon Docks Limited, Bombay, has been stated to be as follows:—

#### *Class I and Class II posts*

Appointment of Class I and Class II officers is made (i) by direct recruitment from the open market; and (ii) by promotion from amongst the Company employees.

#### *Class III and Class IV posts*

*Permanent Workman:*—Vacancies occurring through normal wastage are assessed annually in the month of April/May each year and deficiencies made good after surveying the work-load of the categories concerned on approval of Chairman/Managing Director. Appointments to the sanctioned vacancies are carried out through the Personnel Department. In those categories where there are no casual workmen, recruitment is made through the Employment Exchange. If suitable candidates are not available from the Employment Exchange press advertisements are issued.

*Casual Workman*.—Due to unpredictable and spasmodic nature of work, casual labour is demanded by Departments on a day-to-day basis and employment for varying periods is undertaken through the Personnel Department. The candidates are recruited through the Employment Exchange subject to their passing the laid down trade test. If suitable candidates are not available from Employment Exchange, press advertisements are issued.

*Apprentices*.—Apprentices are recruited annually on 1st August each year based on present and future requirements. The number of apprentices to be recruited in each category passes through various stages of scrutiny, starting with Senior Engineer Training by Departmental Heads|Managers and finally being reviewed by the Personnel Manager in consultation with the Chairman|Managing Director. For designated trades under the Apprentices Act, 1961, the quota of apprentices is fixed in accordance with the number of skilled workmen in the trade. Recruitment is made once a year and applications are invited through the local press advertisements|Employment Exchange.

*Clerical Staff*.—Recruitment is made through the Employment Exchange from graduates with experience. If suitable candidates are not available from Employment Exchange, press advertisements are issued.

2.6. Explaining the recruitment procedure being followed in the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited, the representative of the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited has stated during evidence that all the direct recruitment vacancies are notified to the local Employment Exchange or to the Central Employment Exchange. In notifying these vacancies special care is taken to specify the vacancies that are reserved for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. Posts in Grade II and above are advertised simultaneously with the notification to the Employment Exchange. In such cases, copies of advertisements are also sent to the Employment Exchange along with the notifications of the vacancies. When a local Employment Exchange is unable to sponsor suitable Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates, it referred the vacancy or vacancies to the Director General of Employment and Training who maintains an all-India list of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes registered with Employment Exchanges. If the Employment Exchanges are unable to sponsor the required number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, the vacancies are advertised locally or on an all-India basis. While doing so, it is specifically stated in the advertisement that the vacancies are reserved for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, as the case may be. Where direct recruitment, otherwise than through competitive examination, is made for a vacancy or vacancies re-

3394 L.S.—2

served for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes only, and not for any unreserved vacancy or vacancies also, advertisements are issued inviting applications from candidates belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes only, as the case may be, and not from general candidates. However, if the reserved vacancy or vacancies referred to above include any such vacancy or vacancies which have been carried forward to the third year of the recruitment, Scheduled Castes could be considered for such of the vacancies as are reserved for Scheduled Tribes and *vice versa*. Accordingly, in advertisements issued for those reserved vacancies which have been carried forward to the third year of recruitment, applications are invited both from the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates with a clarification that for a vacancy reserved for Scheduled Caste, Scheduled Tribe candidates would be considered only in the event of non-availability of suitable Scheduled Caste candidate and similarly, in respect of a vacancy reserved for Scheduled Tribe, Scheduled Caste candidate would be considered only in the event of non-availability of suitable Scheduled Tribe candidates.

2.7. The Committee understand that more or less a similar procedure for recruitment is being followed by other Defence Public Sector Undertakings.

*Liaison with Employment Exchange and advertisement*

2.8. The Committee have been informed during evidence that vacancies for the posts carrying a salary below Rs. 500 are notified to the Employment Exchange in the first instance. The Committee have been further informed that previously in the indents placed with the Employment Exchange it was merely stated that preference would be given to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes but now the actual number of posts reserved for them is being indicated in the indents. It is also clearly indicated in the indents that the educational qualifications and the age limit would be lowered/increased in respect of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

Asked whether the reasons for rejection of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates sponsored by the Employment Exchange are communicated to the Employment Exchange, the representative of the Mazagon Docks Limited has stated that the statement showing the number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes recruited out of the number of such candidates sponsored by the Employment Exchange is sent to the Employment Exchange together with the reasons for rejection of the candidates not selected.

2.9. The Committee have also been informed that in case the Employment Exchange is unable to sponsor the requisite num-

ber of Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates, they are asked to indicate in writing that they are not able to forward the required number of Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates and then the posts are advertised.

2.10. Asked about the time gap between the advertisement of a post and recruitment, the representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated during evidence that one month's time is given. A view was expressed during evidence that it might not be possible for the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes to come within one month as many of them lived in remote areas without adequate means of communication and, therefore, they should be taken even if they came late. The representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated that this difficulty must be experienced by everyone and merely not by the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. There are two aspects of this matter, one is about direct recruitment and the other about recruitment through the Employment Exchange. If Employment Exchange sends intimation to a person giving one month's notice, he should be able to come. Otherwise, whether one month is prescribed or six weeks are prescribed, the same difficulty would arise. Some reasonable period has to be prescribed and it would be better if the Employment Exchange sponsors the candidates within one month. So far as advertisements are concerned, they are also brought to the notice of the various social welfare organisations. These social welfare organisations should be able to contact the prospective candidates to send their applications within prescribed time.

2.11. The Department of Defence Production, in their letter No. F2(15)71D(HAL-II)(PS) dated the 28th October, 1971 addressed to all the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, has directed that:

“Whenever recruitment is required to be made to vacancies reserved for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes only, whether under the special *ad hoc* recruitment or otherwise, the requisition to the Employment Exchange or the open advertisement, as the case may be, should invite applications only from Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates. In the case of advertisements, a copy should simultaneously be forwarded to the following:

- (a) District Magistrates of the concerned State.
- (b) Department of Social Welfare of the State Government.
- (c) Recognised representative Associations of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes.

- (d) Secretariat of the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes c/o Lok Sabha Secretariat, New Delhi.
- (e) Commissioner for Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes, New Delhi.

The advertisement should also be published in at least one regional language paper of the State. This would be applicable to recruitment made on all-India basis also."

2.12. It has been further directed in the said letter that:

"The requisition to the employment exchange or the advertisement, as the case may be, should specifically indicate the *total number of vacancies to be filled as also the number of vacancies reserved for the Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes, separately.* Secondly, the concessions or relaxations in the matter of age limit qualifications or experience admissible to the Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe candidates should be clearly spelt out in the requisition or the advertisement."

2.13. It has also been directed in the said letter that:

"A point was made by the some Members of the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes that as the candidates from Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes generally reside in the interior rural areas, very often they do not get adequate notice when called by the employment exchange or other recruiting authorities. In order to meet this point, it is suggested that the requisitions to the employment exchange or the advertisements should generally allow a time limit of at least 4 to 6 weeks for applications|sponsoring of candidates. Secondly, even if the nominations|applications of Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe candidates possessing the required qualifications are received after the prescribed time limit their nominations|applications may be entertained against the reserved vacancies provided that these have not already been filled."

#### *Requirement of Experience for various posts*

2.14. It was pointed out during evidence that generally in the posts advertised by the various Defence Public Sector Undertakings, five to seven years' experience was stated to be required as an essential|desirable qualification. The Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, who started very late in education etc., could not be expected

to fulfil this requirement. Asked whether it could not be possible to waive this requirement in the case of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates, the representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated that it could be considered whether the period of previous experience required could be reduced for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. For example, where five years' experience is required, it could be reduced to two or three years for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. He has also stated that generally five to seven years' experience is required for very high posts, because unless the candidates possess the experience, they would not be able to work on the sophisticated machinery required for defence production. For the administrative posts, the period of experience could be reduced for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. He has also stated that no experience is prescribed for initial recruitment in the lower category of posts. He has further stated that:

“The point is that we have to make some compromise between the two. While selecting a man who has no experience, but he belongs to Scheduled Castes/Tribes, the needs of the undertaking have also to be kept in view. There are certain jobs where a man without experience will not be fitted in. From an ordinary candidate we will expect five years' experience in the case of the Scheduled Caste, we shall expect three years. But without experience, in my opinion, it would be very dangerous to recruit people, because they will not be able to discharge functions expected on a particular job. Moreover, experience is prescribed only when it is vitally necessary.”

2.15. He has further stated:

“We have to go by the job requirements. If we are recruiting a workman, we will say that ten years experience on similar installation would be required. But a Scheduled Caste candidate would have some preferences over other candidates. This experience, I again submit, even though it may be misunderstood, is prescribed only very rarely and for very senior positions where we want that a man must have some experience. It is not like direct recruitment to the I.A.S., where a man is recruited, given training kept, on probation and posted Magistrate, then Sub-Divisional Magistrate, etc. Here you are running a public sector undertaking or an industry. You have to look also to this aspect that there are so many sophisticated machines there. If you put a raw man, you might ruin them. It is only in those jobs where experience is necessary that is asked.”

2.16. He has, however, agreed that in the case of Personnel Manager, no previous experience should be insisted upon if he is otherwise qualified. The representative of Bharat Electronics Limited has added that one of the Assistant Personnel Managers in the Bharat Electronics Limited was a Scheduled Caste and was selected without any experience. He had been in service for a year. Then he was sent for training to Calcutta to get a diploma. The representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated that it is not always possible to recruit a man without experience and then give him training. Sometimes, the Undertaking could not wait for the person and somebody has to be recruited immediately to look after the work. He has further stated:

“We would suggest to all the Public Sector Undertakings that to ensure that the Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates do not fail to qualify for want of experience, they might introduce a training in which these people may be brought in for training.”

2.17. In the directive referred in para 2.11 above, it has been stated:

“The period of previous experience, where prescribed, may be restricted to the minimum essential period in the case of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates and it should be fixed lower than normally required from candidates of the general category. In particular, wherever previous experience of 5 years or longer is prescribed for the general category, relaxation of up to 2 years may be allowed in favour of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes.”

### *Concessions*

2.18. Asked to indicate the relaxations/concessions given to Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates at the time of recruitment, it has been stated in a note furnished to the Committee that Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates are entitled to relaxation in the upper age limit up to five years. Certain other concessions, for example, application of relaxed standards in the case of such candidates for the purpose of preliminary screening as well as at the written test/interview, as the case might be and relaxation in the prescribed period of previous experience etc. have also been prescribed.

2.19. The representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated during evidence that the prescribed concessions being given to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes is relaxation in age up to five years. The Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribe are also required to pay less amount as examination fee etc. Moreover, whenever

there is a question of two candidates coming up reasonably at par, then the Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidate is preferred to the other candidate.

The other concessions are not made known officially as it might invite criticism, for example, Bharat Electronics Limited gives 10 per cent concession in marks to Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates.

2.20. In reply to a question, the Committee have been informed in a note that 96 Scheduled Caste and 20 Scheduled Tribe candidates were recruited by the Mazagon Docks Limited by lowering the standards during the period from January, 1970 to 30th June, 1971. In the Praga Tools Limited, 16 Scheduled Castes were recruited by lowering the standards during 1969-70.

2.21. In reply to a question, the representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated that uniformity could not be prescribed for concessions and relaxations available to the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the different Defence Public Sector Undertakings, as in the case of Government offices. In the Defence Public Sector Undertakings the concessions depend upon the nature of the job for which the candidates are to be recruited. He has, however, agreed that some concessions should be prescribed for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The representative of the Mazagon Docks Limited has stated that they have also to give some preference to the sons of the employees etc. He said "I would like you to bear two important factors in mind. One is that there is always the pressure that the sons of employees should be given preference. We would also prefer to take the boys of the employees, as they would have a sense of belonging to the establishment. The second question is of taking them from States other than Maharashtra, should there be inadequate number from Maharashtra."

The representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated that so far as sons of employees are concerned, there may have been a few exceptions where the employee has died in service, and the job has to be given to his son. However, there is no general rule that they must be given preference. As to the second point there is no rule that an employee in the Undertaking must belong to the State where the Undertaking is located because the recruitment could be made from any part of the country. In reply to a question, he has stated that there is a general direction that preference should be given to the local people in giving employment. The representative of the Garden Reach Workshops Limited has added that the local Employment Exchange insists that for posts carrying a salary below Rs. 500/- only, they should be approached. He has stated that there is a 20 year old tradition in the Garden Reach Workshops Limited



that preference should be given to the sons of employees for recruitment in the Garden Reach Workshops Limited. After the directive from the Department of Defence Production that this preference should not encroach upon the reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, the matter was taken with the Employees Union and they have agreed not to insist upon the sons of employees being employed in preference to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

*Viva voce*

2.22. Asked whether it would not be possible to waive the *viva voce* examination for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, the representative of the Mazagon Docks Limited has stated that the *viva voce* test gives an opportunity to help an individual who may not have done very well in the written examination. He has stated: "I would like to mention that there is no such thing in the *viva voce* that a person has been deliberately rejected because he belongs to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. I may add that the other day a Scheduled Caste was selected in open competition in preference to a non-Scheduled Caste candidate. *Viva voce* can help a person who cannot express in written examination."

2.23. The representative of the Department of Defence Production has added that it should be considered whether in every recruitment there should be certain number of marks for the written examination and smaller fraction of that for the *viva voce* test and the total number of marks should then be assessed in aggregate. It should also be laid down that whenever a Scheduled Caste or Scheduled Tribe candidate is rejected, his case would be reviewed by the next higher authority.

2. 24. In the directive referred to in para 2.11 above, it has been stated that:

"The standards of preliminary screening as well as final selection should be suitably relaxed for candidates from Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes and fixed lower than what would ordinarily be prescribed for the general category subject, of course, to the minimum standard of suitability necessary for maintaining the efficiency of the undertaking. For example, if a first class degree or say 60 per cent marks in the degree examination is prescribed as the general qualifying standard for preliminary selection for calling candidates for written examination/interview, the qualifying standard for Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes may be simply a University degree or a lower percentage of marks in the degree examination. In the written examination or interview conducted for

making the selection also, the qualifying standard for the Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes candidates may be similarly fixed lower. Whenever, a *viva voce* test or interview is prescribed in addition to the written examination for the purpose of recruitment, the maximum marks allocated to *viva voce* or interview as compared to the written examination should be kept as low as possible."

2.25. It has also been stated in the same directive that:

"Cases of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates who are rejected in selection by a particular Selection Committee/Board should be reviewed by the next higher Selection Committee/Board. In cases, where there is no higher Selection Committee/Board or where the initial selections are by an individual officer, the review should be conducted at the next higher administrative level. This would apply also to the selections for internal promotion in the Undertaking."

2.26. The Committee note that the Department of Defence Production has already issued a comprehensive supplementary directive to the Defence Sector Undertakings, incorporating therein some of the suggestions made by the Committee during the evidence of the representatives of the Department, for improving the recruitment procedure followed by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings to augment the intake of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in their services. The Committee need hardly stress that the procedure envisaged in the said directive should be scrupulously observed by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings. The Committee suggest that the Department of Defence Production should keep a continuous watch on the Defence Public Sector Undertakings so as to see that the reservation orders and other measures laid down for the benefit of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes are properly and fully implemented.

2.27. The Committee feel that close coordination and liaison between the Defence Public Sector Undertakings and the Employment Exchanges is imperative for augmenting the representation of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings. The Committee suggest that precise reasons for the rejection of Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates, who have been sponsored by the Employment Exchanges, should be recorded and communicated to the Employment Exchanges. The Employment Exchanges should also be asked to furnish a fresh list of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates if suitable Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates are not available in the list furnished by them earlier.

### **C. Inclusion of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe Officer in the Recruitment/Promotion Board**

2.28. In reply to a suggestion made by the Committee that a Scheduled Caste/Tribe officer should be associated with the Selection/Promotion Boards set up by various Defence Public Sector Undertakings, the representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated during evidence that "If I have an officer of the Scheduled Caste/Tribe, I would certainly recommend to the Public Sector Undertakings to associate". He has stated that he would recommend to the Public Sector Undertakings to examine whether while recruiting the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates, they could associate either a senior employee of the Company or even a non-official belonging to the Scheduled Castes or Scheduled Tribes. The Defence Public Sector Undertakings could also request the Governments of the States concerned to depute one of their senior Scheduled Caste/Tribe officers for the purpose.

2.29. The representative of the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited has informed the Committee during evidence that in as many as 16 cases, a Scheduled Caste Officer was associated with the Promotion Board in the Bangalore Division of the Undertaking. In their directive dated the 28th October, 1971, the Department of Defence Production has directed the Defence Public Sector Undertaking as follows:

"The Undertaking should try its best to include in the Selection Committees/Interview Boards concerned with the direct recruitment or promotions a suitable officer belonging to the Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes. In case no such officer is available from within the undertaking, a suitable Scheduled Caste/Tribe officer from one of the other undertakings or from the State Government should be associated with the Selection Committee/Interview Board. Where a suitable Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe Officer even from the State Government is not available, efforts may be made to associate a suitable outside expert from these communities, if available."

2.30. The Committee hope that a Scheduled Caste/Tribe Officer would invariably be included in the Selection/Promotion Boards set up by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, as laid down in the directive referred to para 2.29 above, so that interests of the Sche-

**duled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates are adequately safeguarded.**

#### **D. Recruitment of Graduate Engineers**

2.31. The Committee desired to know the position regarding recruitment of Graduate Engineers in the various Defence Public Sector Undertakings. The replies furnished by the Department of Defence Production in respect of each of the Undertakings are given below:

*Bharat Electronics Limited, Bangalore*

2.32. The Committee have been informed during evidence that the Bharat Electronics Limited are recruiting a limited number of Graduate Engineers per year. The candidates are expected to possess a first class or second class degree. But in the case of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, these qualifications are lowered and all such eligible candidates who apply are called for examination and interview. He has further stated that in a written test 30 per cent marks are prescribed for passing the examination, but in the case of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes relaxation of as many as 10 per cent marks is given to make them pass in the written examination and become qualified for the *viva voce*. In the *viva voce* also, 30 per cent marks are reserved for passing; in the case of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, relaxation of 5 to 8 marks to make them qualify to pass the *viva voce* is given. The Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates are given preference in appointment to the extent of their reservations, irrespective of their rank in the selection list. Elucidating further, the representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated:

“When the number of applications is very large, we call only those who got a prescribed limit of minimum marks. If we have got a large number of applications that is who have got less than 50 per cent marks in the examination are normally not called for interview, but in the case of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes no such qualifying marks are prescribed. We call all of them for interview. If the other candidates fail in the first instance they are not considered for the subsequent examination but in the case of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes this facility is also given.”

2.33. In reply to a question, the representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated that in the Ghaziabad Unit of the

Undertaking, the following are the figures of recruitment of Graduate Engineers.

Year	Number of candidates	Number of SC	Number of ST
1969	6	Nil	Nil
1970	11	Nil	Nil
1971	51	7	Nil

2.34. In the Bangalore Unit out of 53 Graduate Engineers recruited in 1971, one is Scheduled Tribe but there is no Scheduled Caste. Asked why it is not possible to recruit even a single Scheduled Caste/Tribe Graduate Engineer in 1969-70, the representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated during evidence that perhaps no attention was being paid towards this problem before the issue of the directive. In reply to a question, he has stated that 48 Scheduled Castes/Tribes applied for the post of Graduate Engineers in 1971 in the Ghaziabad Unit. The Committee desired to know the reasons for the rejection of as many as 41 Scheduled Castes/Tribes when the number of vacancies there was quite large. In a note furnished to the Committee it has been stated:

“The answer furnished at the time of tendering evidence before the Committee gave the total number of 48 Scheduled Caste candidates that had responded to the advertisements issued for the Graduate Engineers both for Bangalore Unit as well as Ghaziabad Unit of BEL. Out of this number, only 43 candidates pertain to Ghaziabad Unit and the other 5 pertain to the Bangalore Unit. Out of the 43 called for test for the Ghaziabad Unit, only 13 sat for the test. Out of the 13, 9 were mechanical engineering graduates and 4 were telecommunication engineering graduates. In the written examination 7 candidates in the mechanical engineering and 4 in the telecommunication engineering passed. Subsequently, during the *viva voce*, 4 candidates in the mechanical engineering and 3 in the telecommunication engineering passed, thus bringing the total number of selected candidates to 7. The following is the break-up of marks obtained by the 5 mechanical engineers and 1

telecommunication engineer who have failed in the written test|viva voce:—

Faculty	Written examination	Viva voce
	(Marks : 70)	(Marks : 30)
Mechanical Engineering	(i)	..
	(ii)	..
	(iii)	6
	(iv)	7
	(v)	7
Telecommunication Engineering	(i)	4

For the recruitment of Telecommunication Graduate Engineers in the Bangalore Unit in the year 1971, five Scheduled Caste candidates had applied and all the five were called for the written test. But only two of them appeared for the test and passed in the written test. Both of them did not fare well in the interview, having scored only 20 per cent of the marks as against the pass marks of 30 per cent."

2.35. In reply to a further question, the Committee have been informed during evidence that the period of probation for the Graduate Engineers is one year and all of them are absorbed after they complete the training satisfactorily. However, there has been one or two cases where their period of training has to be extended but none of them belongs to Scheduled Castes/Tribes.

*Garden Reach Workshops Limited*

2.36. It has been stated that the following number of Graduate Engineers have been recruited in Garden Reach Workshops Limited during each of the last three years:

Year	Number of candidate	Number of SC	Number of ST
1968	8	Nil	Nil
1969	9	Nil	Nil
1970	10	Nil	4

*Bharat Earth Movers Limited*

2.37. It has been stated that the total number of Graduate Engineers recruited during the period from 1st January, 1970 to 30th

June, 1971 is 87, out of which four are Scheduled Castes and there is no Scheduled Tribe. The information regarding the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes recruited as Graduate Engineers in respect of the earlier years has not been maintained by the Bharat Earth Movers Limited as the presidential directive has become operative only from January, 1970.

*Hindustan Aeronautics Limited*

2.38. The Committee have been informed during evidence that the selection of Graduate Engineers for 1971 has not been completed till then and that interviews are still going on. However, no Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidate has qualified in the written examination. Asked what are the relaxations given to the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the matter of selection, the representative of the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited has stated during evidence that in the case of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, they are called for written examination if they possess the minimum qualifications. In the case of others, merit lists are drawn and sometimes candidates possessing more than 72 per cent marks in the degree examination are called for written examination. In the case of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, age relaxation is also given. Clarifying the position further, he stated:

“If a candidate had passed the University examination it does not mean that he will pass here also, but because there are candidates who pass in first division, second division and third division. We have prescribed a minimum qualification for entry into service, that is first class engineering degree, it means a minimum prescribed marks that a man must have before he can appear is 60 per cent. But in the case of other candidates the selection is at a higher level. We do not allow anybody below 68—70 per cent, whereas for Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates, we allow 60 per cent marks to sit in the examination.”

2.39. He has informed the Committee that this procedure has been adopted to eliminate in the first round the candidates who do not possess the minimum qualification.

2.40. In reply to a further question, it has been stated in a note furnished to the Committee that 3735 applications were received in 1971 for recruitment of Graduate Engineers (Management Trainees). Out of these four were from Scheduled Tribes and 81 from Scheduled Castes and 3650 from others. 958 were called for the written test out of which 43 were Scheduled Castes and 915 were general candidates. No Scheduled Tribe was found suitable for being called for the

written test. In reply to a further question, it has been stated that all Post Graduates in the general category and all first class Scheduled Caste Graduates were called for interview. No first class Scheduled Tribe Graduate applied. In the general category, first class Graduates with 65 per cent marks were also called. Out of the Scheduled Castes, one was selected. The cases of others are under review. It has been further stated that the written examinations were held in Delhi and Bangalore. In reply to another question, the representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated during evidence:

“A certain amount of distinction will have to be made. We cannot interview 4000 candidates. Probably, it will go up for the whole year which will also mean a tremendous problem. After all, the Constitution does not say that you debar a candidate, it says that you select the best candidate. The management who is a recruiting authority, after getting applications, may decide. Tomorrow, it may happen that there will be no unemployment and the management will get only a few applications. Today the position is that we get 4,000 applications. But I do not think there is anything illegal or unconstitutional for the management having invited applications, to reject from the applications a certain number because better candidates are available. This is a matter of opinion. As for the second question, so far as the Scheduled Castes are concerned, I would certainly plead with Hindustan Aeronautics Limited that in their case there must be some relaxation of standards. It is not necessary that the Scheduled Caste candidates should come up to the same level as the general candidates in the written tests. I have suggested that after selection, the Scheduled Caste candidates should have some in-service training so that the deficiency can be made up. We are all agreed on the objective, that the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates should get their due share in Government and semi-government services. The whole system whereby these candidates were judged on the same basis as the general candidates will have to be modified to some extent. Some of the other public undertakings have done it. If the minimum qualification for general candidates is 30 per cent it can be made 20 for Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates. But the fact remains that if among the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates, there are 10



vacancies and 200 of them apply, it should be proper for the management, if they so think, to call only 100 and not all the 200 of them. So far as recruitment of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates is concerned, some relaxation in educational qualifications will have to be made. Even if it means that we will be taking slightly inferior candidates, this preference has to be given. In private firms, they have got their own standards. They have a severe interview, sometimes two interviews. So far as the public sector is concerned, there is special responsibility cast on us of seeing that some additional weightage is given to enable recruits from Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates to come up. This question may therefore be left to Hindustan Aeronautics Limited regarding the management training. If I were Hindustan Aeronautics Limited Chairman, I would be prepared to convince my Board that although we may invite in regard to general candidates only those who have done 70 per cent or more and then prescribed a written test with fifty per cent qualifying marks, in the case of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates, as long as I do not get adequate number of candidates belonging to that quota I will lower the percentage to accommodate them. This is one of the suggestions all other public undertakings are already implementing. I think it would not be difficult to persuade Hindustan Aeronautics Limited to do the same."

#### *Praga Tools Limited*

2.41. The Committee have informed during evidence that no Graduate Engineers were recruited during 1968-69. In 1970, six Graduate Engineers were recruited of which one belonged to Scheduled Caste and one to Scheduled Tribe.

#### *Bharat Dynamics Limited*

2.42. The Committee have been informed during evidence that no Graduate Engineers have been recruited in the Bharat Dynamics Limited so far. The Bharat Dynamics Limited is only in the formative stage and it is assembling certain machinery at present. The machine shop has not been set up so far. When the whole plant starts working, then the question of recruitment of Graduate Engineers would arise and at that time the claims of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes would be kept in mind. For the present, however, the Bharat Dynamic Limited needs people with experience from the research laboratories and such persons are coming on deputation.

2.43. The Committee are unhappy to note that the number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes recruited as Graduate Engineers by all the Defence Public Sector Undertakings so far is negligible. The Committee are all the more unhappy that only one Scheduled Caste candidate was selected as Graduate Engineer by the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited, out of 43 Scheduled Caste candidates, possessing first class degrees, called for examination/interview. The position in the Bharat Electronics Limited is no better. Out of 11 Scheduled Castes candidates who passed the written test held by the Bharat Electronics Limited, only seven candidates were selected. The Committee feel that a larger number of Scheduled Castes could have been recruited as Graduate Engineers by lowering the standards of recruitment a little. The Committee would like the Department of Defence Production to examine in detail the procedure being followed by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings for the recruitment of Graduate Engineers with a view to suggest the extent to which the standards for recruitment could be relaxed for the Scheduled Castes/Tribes. The Committee would also like to impress upon the Department of Defence Production the desirability of devising adequate checks to ensure rigid application of the relaxed standards by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings in the recruitment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes as Graduate Engineers.

#### E. Recruitment of Trade Apprentices

2.44. The Committee desired to know the position regarding the recruitment of Trade Apprentices in the various Defence Public Sector Undertakings. The information received from them is given below:

##### *Garden Reach Workshops Limited*

2.45. The number of apprentices recruited and the number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes among them during the last five years is stated to be as follows:—

Year	Total No.	No. of S/Castes	No. of S/Tribes
1967	72	7	Nil
1968	63	13	Nil
1969	58	6	Nil
1970	Nil	Nil	Nil
1971	Nil	Nil	Nil

2.46. It has been stated that the number of apprentices required to be recruited is determined according to the ratio of tradesmen on the poll of the Company in the respective designated trades, as laid down by the Apprentices Act, 1961 and Rules there under, as per the advice of the Deputy Central Apprenticeship Adviser (Regional). The position is reviewed once in every six months to assess the number of apprentices required to be recruited in particular designated trades.

2.47. In reply to a question, it has been stated that the basic educational qualifications for recruitment of apprentices under the Apprentices Act, 1961 have been laid down by the Government. There are:—

- (i) Two standards below Matriculation or equivalent or three standards below Higher Secondary Examination or equivalent, for certain trades;
- (ii) Passed Matriculation or equivalent examination or passed X Class which is one class below Higher Secondary Examination with Science as one of the subjects for certain trades viz., Electricians, Refrigeration/Airconditioning, Mechanics etc.

It has been stated that since the qualifications are laid down by the Government, there is no scope for this Undertaking to lower the same.

2.48. Asked to explain the reasons for not recruiting any apprentices during the years 1970 and 1971, the representative of the Garden Reach Workshops Limited has stated during evidence as follows:—

“In early 1970 July we notified recruitment and called candidates for written examinations on a Saturday afternoon. On that date there was a very big demonstration from our ex-trade apprentices who could not be given regular employment because under the Act there is no compulsion for giving employment to the ex-trade apprentices and also the apprentices who were in the workshops who were undergoing apprenticeship. Their claim was that no fresh recruitment should be made till all the ex-apprentices were given employment. They demanded an assurances from the management that the existing apprentices will automatically be provided jobs as soon as they passed the examination. It became a very serious situation because about 400 apprentices surrounded the office of the Managing Director, Personnel Officer etc. So we had to withdraw or cancel the examination due on that date because they

not only surrounded the offices but also prevented the boys who were coming for the examination from entering the workshops. We had lengthy discussions with the representatives and we stated that while we do not give an assurance that everybody will be employed we would introduce a new scheme of taking some of these boys in whose case we do not have regular employment as tradesmen, giving them allied trades. For example, if I do not have vacancy for a carpenter. I will train him for one year as pattern maker. We gave that assurance and introduced it.

Then we went to the Board of Directors and we got sanction for special training facilities because we found that with the training facilities which were available, we were not able to take enough apprentices and give them proper training. We have now got approval of the Board for establishing a separate training school in which it would be possible for us to train at a time 150 boys from next year onwards. In January, 1972 we propose to go in for a major recruitment which will cover shortfalls which were created in the year 1970-71. In fact, we intend to take in 150 apprentices in 1972. We also expect a major demand coming from 1974 in our workshops because we have got a big expansion programme. We expect to be able to take an intake of 150 boys in a year for the next 4 to 5 years. It is our proposal that we shall give reservations to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes up to 45 per cent in this."

2.49. Asked whether all the apprentices are absorbed after training, it has been stated that there is no obligation for the employer to absorb the apprentices. But ex-apprentices are considered for employment against vacancies for tradesmen of particular trade, provided they pass the All India Trade Test conducted by the Apprenticeship Adviser.

*Mazagon Docks Limited*

2.50. The representative of the Mazagon Docks Limited has furnished the following figures during evidence in respect of recruitment of Graduate Apprentices under the Technical Graduate Training Scheme:—

Year	Number of candidates	Number of Scheduled Castes/Tribes
1969	15	Nil
1970	34	1
1971	16	1

*Goa Shipyard Limited*

2.51. The Committee have been informed during evidence that about 35 apprentices are being recruited each year. In response to an advertisement in 1971, ten applications were received from Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates and they are shortly to be called for interview. Twenty per cent of the requirements of apprentices by Goa Shipyard Limited, would be taken from Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in 1971. In reply to a question, it has been stated that apprentices are recruited according to non-designated trades and designated trades. Recruitment to the designated trades is made according to the designated trade rules. These candidates have to come from the local Industrial Training Institutes. The apprentices in the non-designated trades are recruited by the Training and Personnel Officer of the Goa Shipyard Limited, keeping in view the present and future requirements. The amount of stipend paid to these apprentices is Rs. 80 p.m. in the first year, Rs. 90 p.m. in the second year and Rs. 100 p.m. in the third year.

*Praga Tools Limited*

2.52. The Committee have been furnished with the following figures by the representative of the Praga Tools Limited during evidence:—

Year	Number of apprentices taken	Number of SCs	Number of STs
1968	17	Nil	Nil
1969	23	Nil	Nil
1970	19	3	1

2.53. It has been stated that recruitment for apprentices is made by the Director General of Employment and Training and the Undertaking has no say in the matter. The Undertaking has to agree to whatever candidates are sent by him. Asked whether the Undertaking could do anything if the Director General of Employment and Training is not able to send them the required number of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates, the representative of the Praga Tools Limited has stated: "We have no voice in that. But from the next list we will certainly draw their attention to it." Asked whether all the apprentices are absorbed by the Undertaking after training, it has been stated that there is no compulsion to do so. But since the boys are trained by the Undertaking, they are preferred to others.

*Bharat Dynamics Limited*

2.54. Asked during evidence whether the Bharat Dynamics Limited is recruiting any apprentices under the Apprentices Act, 1961, the representative of the Department of Defence Production replied in the negative. The representative of the Bharat Dynamics Limited has added that they are in touch with the Director General of Training and Employment on this subject.

*Bharat Electronics Limited*

2.55. The Committee have been furnished with the following figures by the representative of the Bharat Electronics Limited during evidence:

Year	Total Number	Number of SC	Number of ST
1969	73	7	Nil
1970	149	24	Nil
1971	60	8	i

*Bharat Earth Movers Limited*

2.56. In a note furnished to the Committee, the following figures for the period from 1st January, 1971 to 30th June, 1971 have been furnished:—

General Category	449
Scheduled Castes	96
Scheduled Tribes	7

It has been stated that information in respect of Scheduled Castes/Tribes for earlier years has not been maintained as the President's directive in this regard has become operative only from January, 1970.

*Hindustan Aeronautics Limited*

2.57. The representative of the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited has stated that apprentices are trained by the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited under the Apprentices Act, 1961 but all of them are not absorbed by the Undertaking, as it is not obligatory on their part to do so. However, if there are any Scheduled Tribe/Caste candidates among the trainees, they are given preference for absorption by the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited so that the reserved vacan-

cies could be filled up. Explaining the position further, he has added:

“The Government have a rule that every industry which employs a minimum of workers have to have an apprentice scheme. Therefore, we train them, but we have no obligation to employ them. If we have vacancies we employ them. But after we train them, it is open to anybody to employ them. In some of the new divisions, such as the Lucknow or the Nasik or the Koraput centre, where the apprentices who were trained were taken *en block*. But once the number gets filled up, it is not that the training stops. The training still continues.”

2.58. The Committee note the procedure being followed by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings for the recruitment of trade apprentices. The Committee appreciate the fact that Scheduled Castes|Tribes would be taken as trade apprentices upto 45 per cent of the vacancies by the Garden Reach Workshops Limited with effect from the current year, and similarly Scheduled Castes|Tribes to the extent of 20 per cent would be taken as trade apprentices by the Goa Shipyard Limited. The Committee hope that the other Defence Public Sector Undertakings will also similarly increase the in-take of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the vacancies of trade apprentices till such time their shortfall is made up.

2.59. The Committee note that the Defence Public Sector Undertakings have to take in the trade apprentices, as recommended to them by the Director-General of Employment and Training, and the Defence Public Sector Undertakings have no say in the matter. The Committee need hardly emphasise that the Defence Public Sector Undertakings should immediately point out to the Director-General of Employment and Training, if the number of Scheduled Castes|Tribes in the list forwarded to them by the Director-General of Employment and Training is not commensurate with the reservations in favour of Scheduled Castes|Tribes. The Committee would also like to impress upon the Director-General of Employment and Training strictly to adhere to the reservations in favour of the Scheduled Castes|Tribes while selecting candidates for the vacancies of trade apprentices.

2.60. The Committee suggest that avenues should be explored for absorbing the trade apprentices trained by an undertaking, if they have completed their training successfully. The cases of the Scheduled Caste|Tribe trade apprentices, who are trained by the Undertaking should merit special consideration.

### F. Recruitment of Casual Workmen

2.61. As has already been stated earlier, due to unpredictable and spasmodic nature of work, Casual Labour is recruited by the Mazagon Docks Limited on a day-to-day basis and employment for varying periods is undertaken through their Personnel Department. Candidates for casual vacancies are recruited through Employment Exchange who are requested to send as many Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates as possible. Subject to their passing the trade test laid down, they are given employment. If suitable candidates are not available from Employment Exchange, press advertisements are issued. In a note, the Goa Shipyard Limited also has stated that it follows the same procedure, as is being followed by the Mazagon Docks Limited, in this respect.

2.62. Asked during evidence whether there is any reservation for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the recruitment of casual labour, the representative of the Goa Shipyard Limited has stated that casual labour is recruited on day-to-day basis depending on work. There is no reservation for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the recruitment of casual labour. However, a scheme had been formulated to identify workers belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes by putting a rubber stamp on their cards so that they could be recruited as casual labour in preference to others.

2.63. The Committee desired to know the total number of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe casual employees in the Mazagon Docks Limited. In a note furnished to the Committee, the Mazagon Docks Limited has stated that the total number of temporary casual employees in Mazagon Docks Limited as on 30th June, 1971 is 2142. There are 100 Scheduled Castes and 14 Scheduled Tribes among them. Asked to state how many of the casual employees have been appointed against permanent vacancies during each of the last three years and what is the number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes among them, the following statement has been furnished by the Mazagon Docks Limited:

Year	No. of temporary (casual) workmen taken into permanent employment				Number of SC/ST employees among them							
	Ex-retrenched employees	Ex Employees	Other Employees	Total	Ex-retrenched employees		Ex emp.		Other emp.		Total	
					SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST
1968	63	57	161	277	2	..	5	..	14	..	21	..
1969	36	39	255	330	2	1	1	..	15	2	18	3
1970	19	15	204	238	..	1	1	..	11	2	12	3



2.64. The Committee note that there are no reservations in favour of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in recruitment of casual labour. They appreciate that the Goa Shipyard Limited has formulated a scheme whereby the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates are given preference in recruitment of casual labour. The Committee recommend that the other Defence Public Sector Undertakings should also have similar schemes so that more and more Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes may be recruited even in casual labour. The Committee would also like to emphasise that reservations should be strictly adhered to while appointing the casual labour against permanent vacancies by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings.

### G. Staff Position and Shortfalls

2.65. The Committee have been informed that 15 per cent of the vacancies are reserved for Scheduled Castes and  $7\frac{1}{2}$  per cent for Scheduled Tribes in respect of posts for which direct recruitment is made on all-India basis by means of open competitive test in all the Defence Public Sector Undertakings. The direct recruitment on all-India basis, otherwise than by the open competition test, the reservations in favour of the Scheduled Castes are  $16\frac{2}{3}$  per cent and for Scheduled Tribes  $7\frac{1}{2}$  per cent. In respect of posts, recruitment to which is made on regional basis, the percentages applicable in the different Undertakings have been stated to be as follows:

Name of the Undertaking	Scheduled Castes Percent- age reserved	Scheduled Tribes Percent- age reserved
Hindustan Aeronautics Limited . . . . .	13	5
Bharat Electronics Limited . . . . .	13	5
Bharat Earth Movers Limited . . . . .	13	5
Mazagon Docks Limited . . . . .	6	6
Garden Reach Workshop Limited . . . . .	20	6
Praga Tools Limited . . . . .	14	5
Goa Shipyard Limited . . . . .	4	5
Bharat Dynamics Limited . . . . .	14	5

2.66. The Staff position (as on 30th June, 1971) in the various Defence Public Sector Undertakings has been stated to be as follows:

Category/Class of posts .	Total No. of employ-ers	No. of employees		Percentage	
		SC	ST	SC	ST
I	2	3	4	5	6
<b>Hindustan Aeronautics Limited</b>					
(Bangalore Division)					
Class I Grade VII VI V IV III II	869	3	..	0.345	
Class II Grade I	1049	18		1.71	
Class III Group E D C B A	19,296	1802	27	9.33	0.134
<b>Bharat Electronics Limited</b>					
Class I	255	..	..	..	..
Class II	646	18	1	2.6	..
Class III	10,692	1460	11	13.6	0.1
<b>Bharat Earth Movers Limited</b>					
<b>Rail Coach Division</b>					
I	23	..	..	..	..
II	119	1	..	0.9	..
III	3,154	372	14	11.7	0.4
IV	578	108	3	18.7	0.5
<b>Earth Movers Division</b>					
I	29	..	..	..	..
II	157	5	..	3.19	..
III	2,432	420	3	17.2	0.12
IV	472	170	..	36.02	..
<b>Headquarters and Commercial Division</b>					
I	35	1	..	2.8	..
II	81	3	..	3.7	..
III	354	11	..	3.1	..
IV	75	10	1	13.3	1.5
<b>Mazagon Docks Limited</b>					
<b>Permanent</b>					
I	324	3	..	0.93	..
II	41	..	..	..	..
III	3,810	110	14	2.64	0.37
IV	2,001	164	13	8.20	0.65
<b>Temporary</b>					
I	2	..	..	..	..
II	..	..	..	..	..
III	..	..	..	..	..
IV	1,396	56	13	4.00	0.90

1	2	3	4	5	6
<i>Garden Reach Workshop</i>					
I	181	1	..	0.6	..
II	208	3	..	1.5	..
III	4,902	562	3	11.5	0.1
<i>Praga Tools Limited</i>					
I	48	2	..	4.00	..
II	84	3	..	3.6	..
III	1,359	200	9	15.00	0.7
IV	123	49	4	40.00	3.00
<i>Goa Shipyard Limited</i>					
I	12				
II	1	..	..	0.66	0.17
III	604	4	1		
<i>Bharat Dynamics Limited</i>					
I	16	..	..	..	..
II	3	..	..	..	..
III	84	23	—	27.38	—

2.67. The Committee have been informed that instructions were issued by the Department of Defence Production in April, 1964 to all the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, which were then in existence, enjoining upon them to implement the reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes while making recruitment for posts under them. However, since this was not a formal directive under the Articles of Association of each company, the reservation orders were not fully implemented by these undertakings for one reason or the other until 1970. This has necessitated the issuance of a Presidential directive to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings on 27th January, 1970. The Committee desired to know the number of persons recruited after 27th January, 1970 in the various categories of posts and the number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes among them. The information received from some of the Undertakings is tabulated below:

Category/Class of posts	Total No. of employees recruited	No. of employees		Percentage	
		SC	ST	SC	ST
1	2	3	4	5	6
<b>Recruitment made after 1-4-1971</b>					
<i>Bharat Electronics Limited</i>					
I . . . . .	3	..	..	..	..
II . . . . .	70	6	..	8.6	..
III . . . . .	376	70	1	18.6	0.27

*Mazagon Docks Limited***Recruitment made from 1-1-1970 to 30-6-1971**

Permanent									
I	.	.	.	.	50	..	..	..	..
II	.	.	.	.	11	..	..	..	..
III	.	.	.	.	507	28	5	5.6	1
IV	.	.	.	.	462	29	12	6.3	2.6
Temporary									
I	.	.	.	.	2	..	..	..	..
II	.	.	.	.	..	..	..	..	..
III	.	.	.	.	204	11	..	5.4	..
IV	.	.	.	.	360	10	4	2.8	1.1

*Garden Reach Workshop Limited***Recruitment made from 1-1-1970 to 30-6-1971**

I & II	.	.	.	.	75	1		1.33	
III	.	.	.	.	443	38		8.58	

*Bharat Earth Movers Limited***Recruitment made from 1-4-1970 to 30-6-1971**

## Railcoach Division

II	.	.	.	.	25	1	..	4	..
III	.	.	.	.	191	26	2	13.6	1
IV	.	.	.	.	62	13	3	21	5

## Earth Mover Division

I	.	.	.	.	10	..	..	..	..
II	.	.	.	.	73	1	..	1.4	..
III	.	.	.	.	1733	190	2	11	..
IV	.	.	.	.	326	75	..	23	..

## Commercial Division

I	.	.	.	.	10	..	..	..	..
II	.	.	.	.	37	..	..	..	..
III	.	.	.	.	205	11	2	5	1
IV	.	.	.	.	28	4	1	14	3

2.68. During evidence, the representative of the Department of Defence Production suggested the following steps for improving the representation of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services under the Defence Public Sector Undertakings:

- (i) Immediate ad hoc recruitment to recruit Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes only should be resorted to by all the Public Sector Undertakings. Advertisements should be issued inviting applications only from Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and wide publicity should be given to such advertisements. These advertisements should be

published in all-India newspapers and should also be inserted at least in one regional newspaper;

- (ii) Copies of advertisements should be sent to all recognised Scheduled Caste/Tribe Welfare Associations as well as to the District Magistrates of the areas concerned; and
- (iii) The standard of recruitment should be relaxed for the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. They should be given a short course of training so that they might come up to the required standards.

He has stated that these are his own suggestions and he would write to the Public Sector Undertakings in the matter.

2.69 Subsequently, the Department of Defence Production has issued a Directive on 28-10-1971 to the various Undertakings under it suggesting ways and means to improve the representation of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of those Undertakings. It has *inter alia* been stated in the said Directive:

“A review of the recruitment position in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings since the issue of the (earlier) Directives has revealed that practically in every Undertaking there are large shortfalls in the recruitment from amongst Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes against the vacancies reserved for these communities, the shortfall being particularly pronounced in posts falling in the categories of Class I and Class II. Moreover, the overall representation of Scheduled Castes|Tribes with reference to the total number of employees in the various grades is also generally very poor, mainly because prior to 1970 no reservations appear to have been made in favour of these communities in any of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings. Serious efforts to recruit suitable candidates of Scheduled Castes|Tribes against the reserved vacancies for these communities do not appear to have been made even after the issue of the (earlier) Directives. This matter has attracted considerable criticism from the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes.

\*

\*

\*

“During the year 1971 and, if necessary, also during the next two years, *ad hoc* special recruitment confined to the Scheduled Castes| Scheduled Tribe candidates alone may be made in order to ensure not only sufficient recruitment from these communities against the reserved quotas that

would normally be admissible in their favour with reference to the total recruitment during the respective years but also to wipe out the backlog of reserved vacancies carried forward from the year 1970. For this purpose, reservation even in excess of the quotas prescribed under the provisions of the Presidential Directives may be made in favour of the Scheduled Castes| Tribes during the 3-year period from 1971 to 1973 subject only to the limitation that the total number of reserved vacancies for these communities during the recruitment year does not exceed 45 per cent of the total recruitment to the relevant grade or category in the particular year. The provisions in the existing Presidential Directive in regard to the carry-forward of the unfilled reserved quotas for Scheduled Castes| Tribes for 3 recruitment years with provision for filling the reserved vacancies for Scheduled Castes by candidates from Scheduled Tribes, and *vice versa* in the third year will continue to apply.

\* \* \*

“For the purpose of computing the prescribed reservations for Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes in the case of recruitment to posts in Class IV or, where there is no Class IV in Class III, the recruitment to posts of scavengers| sweepers should be excluded, i.e. prescribed quotas of reservations should be computed with reference to the balance of posts filled to these categories. The position regarding recruitment to Class IV or, where there is no Class IV to Class III in the prescribed annual or other periodical returns may also be indicated separately (a) for posts of sweepers|scavengers, and (b) for other posts. It is also necessary that specific mention about the recruitment made against the reserved vacancies is made in the Annual Report of the Company.

\* \* \*

“In the case of vacancies of Clerks|Typists for which proficiency in type-writing is at present prescribed as an essential qualification for recruitment. this requirement may be waived, where necessary in order to make good the requirement against reserved vacancies, in favour of the Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes candidates possessing the minimum prescribed educational qualifications and they may be appointed on the condition that they would acquire prescribed standard of proficiency within a

stipulated period, say, six months. The standard of proficiency in type-writing in these cases may also be fixed lower than that ordinarily required from the general category, e.g. if general candidate are required to possess a typing speed of 40 words per minute, the qualifying speed for Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates may be fixed at 30 words per minute."

**2.70. The Committee are distressed to find the insignificant representation of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings in almost all the categories of posts. They also regret to note that even after the issue of the Presidential directive to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, the Defence Public Sector Undertakings did not pay sufficient attention towards the recruitment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes as per reservations prescribed for them. In the circumstances, the Committee need hardly emphasise that unless orders/instructions on the subject are followed in letter and spirit by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, the position is not going to improve. The Committee, however, would watch with interest the efforts being made by the Department of Defence Production to augment the intake of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Public Sector Undertaking.**

**2.71. The Committee suggest that the Department of Defence Production may consider the feasibility of conducting a survey about the employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Defence Public Sector Undertakings to find out what further steps are necessary to improve their representation in the services of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings.**

#### **H. Maintenance of Rosters**

2.72 The information received from the various Defence Public Sector Undertakings reveals that rosters are being maintained by them as per Government orders on the subject. The Study Groups of the Committee which visited various Undertakings during September, 1971, however, noted that in certain cases rosters were not being maintained properly. The Department of Defence Production has since issued revised orders to all the Defence Public Sector Undertakings on 28-10-1971 on the subject, which read as under:

"Immediate steps should be taken to ensure that the prescribed Rosters are strictly maintained in accordance with the provisions of the Government Directives. It should be made the special responsibility of the officer designated as Liaison Officer for matters concerning Scheduled Castes|

Scheduled Tribes in your Undertaking to ensure the proper maintenance of these Rosters. For this purpose, the Liaison Officer should be required to conduct an Annual Inspection of the Rosters which are being maintained to ensure proper implementation of the Government Directives.”

2.73 To facilitate effective and regular scrutiny of the Rosters, the Department of Defence Production has, alongwith the aforesaid orders, circulated to the Undertakings under it a proforma for conducting inspection of rosters, which may be seen at Annexure to Appendix I.

2.74. The Committee feel that the Roster is a mechanism to watch adequate in-take of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings and that it would cease to have any significance whatsoever if it is not maintained properly. Further, unless all the vacancies reserved for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes are actually filled and their appointments are in fact made according to the points mentioned in the Roster, the position regarding the representation of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings is not expected to improve. The Committee note that revised orders have been issued by the Department of Defence Production in October, 1971 for the proper maintenance of Rosters and their periodical checking by higher officers. The Committee hope that these Rosters will now be maintained in accordance with the extent orders and checked regularly.

#### I. In-service Training

2.75. The information received from various undertakings on the subject is tabulated below:

##### *Hindustan Aeronautics Limited*

2.76. The facilities for training are available to all employees including those belonging to Scheduled Castes|Tribes. However, the feasibility of introducing training schemes exclusively for Scheduled Castes|Tribes in certain technical trades for improving their skill and to raise their standards is under consideration.

##### *Bharat Electronics Limited*

2.77 Special pre-entry training in the relevant trades or disciplines, if necessary, may be arranged by the Undertaking for the Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe candidates selected for recruitment on the basis of relaxed standards of suitability or experience, in order



to equip these candidates with requisite skills or experience required for the satisfactory performance of their duties. Where feasible, special training classes may also be arranged by the Undertaking for the training of candidates from Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes in technical trades or disciplines for which the employment exchanges or the industrial training institutes are not in a position to sponsor the requisite number of qualified candidates from these communities, with a view to their eventual absorption in the reserved vacancies.

#### *Bharat Earth Movers Limited*

2.78 No in-service training has yet been started for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes as those recruited are given proper guidance and supervision on the job at all times.

#### *Mazagon Docks Limited*

2.79 Mazagon Docks Limited has started Training within Industry schemes in the various Departments to train Unskilled and Semi-skilled Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe employees to improve their skills and thereby gain promotion to higher grades.

2.80 In addition, there are 38 Scheduled Caste and 5 Scheduled Tribe candidates Skilled Gr. I (Class III) for whom a training Scheme to improve their skills for promotion to Grade II is contemplated. However, despite starting T.W.I. Scheme for training Unskilled|Semi-skilled to Skilled categories, some of the candidates belonging to Scheduled Castes|Tribes have shown their reluctance stating that they do not feel capable enough with their background to be able to undergo this course of training but they are being persuaded to take the training.

#### *Garden Reach Workshops*

2.81 There are no facilities for in-service training to the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees.

#### *Praga Tools Limited*

2.82 There are no in-service training programmes as such, the organisation being small. However, in case of direct recruitment against reserved vacancies, where candidates from these communities are not available according to the standards prescribed for the posts, candidates are taken on relaxed standards if they are not found unfit for the posts otherwise, and imparted necessary on-the-job training to bring them upto the required standards.

2.83 The representative of the Praga Tools Limited has agreed during evidence that the in-plant training would help the Scheduled

Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates to improve their standards of work and increase their chances of promotion to higher grades.

*Bharat Dynamics Limited*

2.84 The Company has been only recently started. The facilities for in-service training to the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees will, therefore, be provided at the appropriate time.

2.85 In the directive issued by the Department of Defence Production on 28.10.1971 to the various Defence Undertakings, it has been stated:

“Special pre-entry training in the relevant trades or disciplines, if necessary, may be arranged by the Undertaking for the Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates selected for recruitment on the basis of relaxed standards of suitability or experience, in order to equip these candidates with the requisite skills or experience required for the satisfactory performance of their duties. Where feasible, special training classes may also be arranged by the Undertaking for the training of candidates from Scheduled Castes/Tribes in technical trades or disciplines for which the employment exchange or the industrial training institutes are not in a position to sponsor the requisite number of qualified candidates from these communities, with a view to their eventual absorption in the reserved vacancies.”

2.86. The Committee feel that unless a special in-service training programme, especially for those Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates, who have been recruited by lowering the standard, is initiated by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, it may be very difficult to bring such employees at par with others and make them suitable for higher posts. The Committee note in this connection that all the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, except the Bharat Earth Movers Limited, the Garden Reach Workshop Limited and the Bharat Dynamics Limited, have some sort of training programme. The Committee also note that the Department of Defence Production has already issued a directive to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings to arrange special training programmes/training classes for the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates. The Committee hope that with the initiation of the training programmes in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings the Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates will be able to come up to the requisite standards.

### J. De-Reservation

2.87 The Committee desired to know the number of posts de-reserved by the various Defence Public Sector Undertakings in each of the categories of posts available during each of the last three years. The information received from the various Undertakings is tabulated below:

*Hindustan Aeronautics Limited*  
Bangalore Division

Group/Grade	No. of posts de-reserved	
	SC	ST
Group—D . . . . .	1	..
Group—E . . . . .	..	1
Grade—II . . . . .	..	1
Grade—III and above . . . . .	4	..

(These figures pertain to dereservations effected after 1st April, 1970, as there was no system of reservation prior to that).

*Bharat Electronics Limited*

	Class I		Class II		Class III		Class IV	
	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST
1968 . . . . .	..	..	70	58	..	32		
1969 . . . . .			5	2	131	95		41
1970 . . . . .	..	..	5	3	78	54	..	18

(Posts dereserved during the period 1-1-1970 to 30-6-1971)

*Bharat Earth Movers Limited*

Class	No. of vacancies dereserved		Remarks
	SC	ST	
	Class I . . . . .	..	
Class II . . . . .	2	2	
Class III . . . . .	20	29	
Class IV . . . . .	..	3	

*Praga Tools Limited*

Class	Posts de-reserved					
	1968		1969		1970	
	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST
Class I	..	..	2	1	..	..
Class II	..	..	2	1	2	1
Class III	..	..	8	7	..	4
Class IV	..	..	..	..	..	..

*Bharat Dynamics Limited*

(Position as on 31-8-1971)

Pay Scale	No. of Posts de-reserved	
	SC	ST
100—140	..	1
115—190	—	2
115—190	..	1
160—285	1	1

2.88 The Committee have been informed that no posts have been de-reserved in Mazgon Docks Ltd., Garden Reach Workshops Ltd., the Goa Shipyard Ltd.

2.89 It has been stated that before a particular post is de-reserved, prior approval of the Managing Director|General Manager|Board of Directors is taken according to the category of post. The periodical annual reports indicating the number of posts de-reserved are sent to the Ministry of Defence (Department of Defence Production), Cabinet Secretariat (Department of Personnel) etc. Asked whether intimation regarding de-reservation of vacancies is also sent to the Commissioner for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, it has been stated during evidence that such intimation is not sent. The representative of the Department of Defence Production, however, has agreed that this could be done. The Committee have further been informed during evidence that after a particular vacancy is de-reserved, Employment Exchanges are approached a second time and the vacancies are re-advertised. Efforts are made again till the avenues for filling these vacancies by Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates are exhausted. After de-reservation, the vacancies are carrying forward for a period of three years as per orders on the subject.

2.90. The Committee are unhappy to note that large numbers of posts have been de-reserved, especially in the Bharat Electronics Limited. The Committee feel that the procedure being followed by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings for de-reservation of posts needs close scrutiny to ensure that de-reservation of posts is avoided as far as possible. The Committee suggest that before a particular post is de-reserved, the matter should again be referred to the Employment Exchange in order to explore the possibility of getting Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates. They also suggest that precise reasons for de-reservation of posts should also be intimated to the Commissioner for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes for his information. The statistics regarding posts de-reserved during a year should also be included in the Annual Reports of the Department of Defence Production/Defence Public Sector Undertakings.

#### K. Liaison Officer and Complaints Call

2.91 The information received from the various Defence Public Sector Undertakings indicates that Liaison Officers have been appointed in all the Defence Public Sector Undertakings to ensure due compliance by the appointing authorities of the orders and instructions pertaining to the de-reservation of vacancies in favour of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and other benefits admissible to them.

2.92. The representative of the Garden Reach Workshops Limited has stated during evidence that another important duty of the Liaison Officer is to maintain liaison with the Employment Exchanges and the Social Welfare Department of the State Government as well as associations which have been set up for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Liaison Officer has also visited the Social Welfare Department of the State Government and he has been asked to meet the officials of the various associations also. Asked whether cases of supersessions are also referred to the Liaison Officer, he has stated that the Liaison Officer is not the promoting authority. However, at present no promotions could be made or vacancies created by the Departmental Heads without clearance by the Liaison Officer. He is in fact an authority to ensure that the rules and regulations are followed.

2.93 The Committee desired to know whether separate Complaints Cell have set up to look into the complaints/grievances of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The information received from the various Undertakings reveals that separate Cells have not been set up for the purpose. However, the grievance procedure be-

ing followed by them is comprehensive to cover all eventualities. The grievance procedure as intimated by the Mazagon Docks Limited is indicated below:—

- (a) A readily accessible machinery for ventilation and prompt redressal of day-to-day grievances is in vogue, viz., an employee takes his grievance through his shop Steward to his immediate superior (Technical Assistant or Foreman) — the latter hearing the grievance either settles it on the spot, or refers to his Departmental Head, normally well within 3 days. The Department Head is invariably in a position and does settle the grievance in consultation with the Shop Steward well within a week.
- (b) If the Departmental Head is unable to settle the grievance either because the matter is beyond his jurisdiction, or the issues involved are too complicated, he refers the matter to the Personnel Officer/Personnel Manager. Most grievances are settled at this level.
- (c) In the event of a grievance being of a very serious nature involving matters of policy, the Personnel Manager/Personnel Officer refers the matter to top Management—and invariably a joint consultative meeting is held with the leaders of the Union and the Management, and the grievance is redressed or a satisfactory solution reached within a reasonable time.

**2.94. The Committee note that Liaison Officers have been nominated in all the Defence Public Sector Undertakings for the effective implementation of the orders and instructions issued by the Ministry of Home Affairs/Department of Defence Production pertaining to the reservation of vacancies in favour of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and other benefits admissible to them. The Committee suggest that the charter of duties for the Liaison Officers, as laid by the Ministry of Home Affairs should be adopted by the Department of Defence Production and made applicable to the Liaison Officers appointed by the various Defence Public Sector Undertakings.**

**2.95 The Committee note the procedure being followed by the Mazagon Docks Limited for redressal of grievances of employees. They, however, feel that there is need for a separate Cell to attend to the complaints and grievances of Scheduled Caste/Tribe employees.**

### L. Housing Facilities

2.96. The Committee desired to know, during evidence, the reactions of the Department of Defence Production to a suggestion that out of turn housing facilities should be provided by the Defence Undertakings to their Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees, especially in the lower categories of posts, and for this purpose necessary reservations might be made. The representative of the Garden Reach Workshops Limited has stated that every Public Sector Undertaking had a certain limited percentage of accommodation available to it and this accommodation is given strictly according to the priority date of joining the service. No favour is shown to anybody. In each category of houses, each employee is put on a roster on the basis of the date of his joining the service. If preference is given to a junior person, there is bound to be heart-burning and dissatisfaction. He has added that any preference given to Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees in the matter of allotment of accommodation would cause resentment among other employees. He has said "we will be inviting more troubles than solving the problems." The representative of the Department of Defence Production has added that in the Central Government, if a Scheduled Caste or Scheduled Tribe employee got some preference in the matter of allotment of accommodation, others might not even come to know of it, because it was a huge organisation. But in the case of Public Sector Undertakings, there are housing colonies and if Scheduled Castes/Tribes are given preference and they are allotted a house out-of-turn, there might be resentment among others, and Scheduled Caste/Tribe employees might become unpopular. He has, however, agreed to consider the question of reservation in accommodation for Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees. In reply to a further question, he has stated that it would not be desirable for the Undertaking to build separate colonies for Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees.

2.97. Subsequently, in a directive issued on the 1st December, 1971, by the Department of Defence Production to the various Undertakings, it has been stated:

".....during the course of evidence before the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes held from 23-10-1971 to 26-10-1971 in connection with the examination by the Committee of the position regarding reservations for and employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, a suggestion was made by several

members of the Committee that as members of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, specially employees in the lower categories viz., Class III and Class IV, ordinarily experience difficulties in acquiring residential accommodation in the city areas, special preference be given to such employees of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings in the matter of provision of residential quarters in the Company's township quarters, wherever these exist. A decision has been taken by the Government of India in respect of Central Government employees working in offices in Delhi|New Delhi, vide the Department of Works, Housing and Urban Development Office Memorandum No. 12035(5)/69-Pol(II) dated 6-11-69 to reserve 5 per cent of the vacancies in Types I and II for Government servants belonging to the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. In the light of the position explained above, the matter has been considered and it has been decided that the Defence Public Sector Undertakings should also accord similar special consideration to their Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Scheduled Tribe employees of your Undertaking entitled Tribe employees. In pursuance of the above decision, the President hereby directs, that 5 per cent (five per cent) of the vacancies in houses of types I and II of the residential accommodation in the Companys townships or quarters, where these exist or which come up in the future, should be made available for allotment to those Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees of your Undertaking entitled to these types who specially apply for this benefit. The eligibility of allotment for types I and II in respect of Central Government employees according to pay ranges is as under:

(i) Type I—below Rs. 175 and

(i) Type II—Rs. 175/- to Rs. 349/-

**The** allotment of the houses in the above mentioned types is ordinarily made according to an applicant's turn in the appropriate waiting list maintained for this purpose. Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes employees who are senior enough otherwise and are covered in the general waiting list in their turn will be given allotment out of the general pool quota. I am to add that such employees who are to be given allotment out of the reserved quota



indicated herein will not be considered for out of turn allotment in these types of accommodation."

**2.98. The Committee are glad to note that the Department of Defence Production has issued a directive to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings to provide reservation of 5 per cent in the houses of types I and II in favour of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Committee suggest that the feasibility of extending similar reservations to other types of houses may also be considered by the Department of Defence Production.**

## **CHAPTER III**

### **PROMOTIONS**

#### **A. Promotion Procedure**

3.1 The concessions and safeguards for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the matter of promotion, as laid down in the directives issued by the Department of Defence Production to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings on 27-1-1970 and 17-2-1972 may be seen at Appendix-II.

3.2 The Committee, however, have noted during evidence that the procedure in regard to the reservation in promotions for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the various Defence Public Sector Undertakings is not uniform. The Committee desired to know the reasons therefor. The representative of the Department of Defence Production has stated that each Public Sector Undertaking decides how many posts in a particular grade would be filled by promotion and how many by direct recruitment, depending on their own assessment and availability of man-power with them. No percentage has been prescribed, though for every category of post certain rules have been laid down. It has further been stated during evidence that it is mentioned in the directive that where the promotions are through departmental competitive examination up to Class II level or where the promotions are by selection method in Class III and Class IV, for which element of direct recruitment does not exceed 50 per cent, reservations are but the Undertakings could fix their percentage depending on their own requirements.

3.3 The representative of the Mazagon Docks Limited has stated during evidence that a scheme has been framed very recently in regard to the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes for departmental training so that they are able to pass the trade test and are promoted to the higher grade. Special classes are being conducted partially in the working time and partially in non-working time to bring them up to the requisite standard. The representative of the Garden Reach Workshops Limited has added that Public Sector Undertakings faced many practical difficulties in this regard because the workmen do not want these classes to be conducted during office hours and they want that these should be conducted after office hours.

3.4 The representative of the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited has informed the Committee that there are two aspects of promotion; one is merit and the other is seniority. At the lower level, seniority plays a bigger part and merit a lesser part. But in the higher posts, it is vice versa. Mostly, in such cases, it is the performance of the individual in the shop-floor and the reports that emanate in respect of his work that counts with the Departmental Promotion Committee. The assessment of the candidates is done by the departmental heads from time to time. In case of subordinate staff there are no written confidential reports whereas for officers there are written reports and those reports form the basis for the Departmental Promotion Committee which meets at various levels and recommends the suitability of the candidates. In the case of special jobs, the candidates are tested whether they can do something better or not.

3.5 The Committee desired to know the number of employees promoted and the number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes among them in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings in the various categories of posts during each of the last three years. The information received from the Undertakings is tabulated below:

*Hindustan Aeronautics Limited*

(Bangalore Division)

Group/Grade	Scale of Pay (Rs.)	Total No. of employees promoted	Number Promoted	
			SC	ST
Group—B	115—190	275	48	..
Group—C	160—285	788	73	..
Group—D	190—340	283	18	..
Group—E	225—485	223	10	..
Grade—I	400—700	86	1	..
Grade—II	550—950	36	1	..
Grade—III	750—1350	20	..	..
Grade—IV	1150—1500	7	..	..
Grade—V	1350—1710	7	..	..

*Bharat Electronics Limited*

	Total No. promoted	Number of SC ST	
<i>1969</i>			
Class I	54		..
Class II	84	1	
Class III	1078	61	2
Class IV	87	12	
<i>1970</i>			
Class I	38		
Class II	152	1	
Class III	1710	90	..
Class IV	111	15	
<i>1971 (Upto June)</i>			
Class I	20		
Class II	119	..	
Class III	1250	80	4
Class IV	63	8	1

*Bharat Earth Movers Limited**(Railcoach Division)*

Category	Total No.	Number of SC ST	
Class I	1		
Class II	7		
Class III	265	17	
Class IV	..	..	..

(The figures are from 1-1-1970 to 30-6-1971).

*Mazagon Dock Limited*

1	Total No. promoted	Number of SC	Number of ST
1	2	3	4
<i>April 1968 to March 1969</i>			
Within Class I . . . . .	33	..	..
From Class II to Class I		..	
From Class III to Class I		..	
From Class III to Class II .	..	..	..
Within Class III . . . . .	301	6	
From Class IV to Class III . . . . .	13	3	
Within Class IV . . . . .	22	8	
<i>April 1969 to March 1970</i>			
Within Class I . . . . .	4		
From Class II to Class I . . . . .			..
From Class III to Class I . . . . .	3		..
From Class III to Class II . . . . .	..	..	..
Within Class III . . . . .	433	6	
From Class IV to Class III . . . . .	32	9	
Within Class IV . . . . .	8	8	
<i>April 1970 to March 1971</i>			
Within Class I . . . . .	46	..	
From Class II to Class I . . . . .		..	..
From Class III to Class I . . . . .	6		..
From Class III to Class II . . . . .	..	..	..
Within Class III . . . . .	343	8	..
From Class IV to Class III . . . . .	70		
Within Class IV . . . . .	30	2	..

*Garden Reach Workshops Limited*

		Total No. promoted	Number of SC	ST
<b>1968</b>				
Class I	. . . . .	13	..	..
Class II	. . . . .	5	..	..
Class III	. . . . .	62	3	
<b>1969</b>				
Class I	. . . . .	9		
Class II	. . . . .	14	..	
Class III	. . . . .	56	4	
<b>1970</b>				
Class I	. . . . .	12	..	
Class II	. . . . .	3	..	..
Class III	. . . . .	93	10	..

*Praga Tools Limited*

Category to which promotion was made	1968			1969			1970			
	Total	SC	ST	Total	SC	ST	Total	SC	ST	
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Manager	. . . . .	1	..	..	..	..	..	..	..	..
Asstt. Manager	. . . . .	2	..	..	..	..	..	3	..	..
Jr. Officer	. . . . .				2	..		4	..	..
Supervisor	. . . . .				3	1		3	..	..
Personal Assistant	. . . . .			..	2			1		..
Sr. Assistants	. . . . .			..	12			8		..
Draughtsmen 'A'	. . . . .						..	1		..
<i>Technical Workmen</i>										
Highly skilled (Cat. I)	. . . . .				..			3	..	
Skilled-I (Cat. II)	. . . . .		..					3	2	..
Skilled -II (Cat. III)	. . . . .							5	2	1
Semi-skilled-II (Cat. V)	. . . . .	..	..					8	7	
Semi-skilled-III (Cat. VI)	. . . . .	4	2		..	..	..	171*	25	2

\*Includes 155 temporary workmen absorbed in the Cat. VI after satisfactory performance in both the Divisions.

*Goa Shipyard Limited*

Year	Category	Total No. of employees promoted	No. promoted	
			SC	ST
1968	. Class III	72		
1969	. Class III	44		
1970	. Class I	1	..	..
	Class III	42	1	..

*Bharat Dynamics Limited*

No promotions have taken place so far as the recruitment has started only in March, 1971.

3.6. In the Directive issued to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings on the 28th October, 1971, the Department of Defence Production has stated as follows:

“Another point that emerged during the course of evidence before the Parliamentary Committee on Scheduled Castes/Tribes is that the position in regard to applicability of the reservations for or special consideration to Scheduled Castes/Tribes in the matter of promotions within the Undertaking has not in some cases been clearly understood. These provisions are clearly indicated in para 1(B) and paras 9 and 10 of the Presidential Directive contained in this Ministry’s letter No. F. 17(204) |69|D (PS) dated 27.1.1970 as amended by this Ministry’s letter of even number dated 17.2.1971. These provisions may please be brought to the notice of all Officers|Selection Committees, etc. concerned with promotions in your undertaking. They may also be suitably incorporated in the promotion rules or procedures of the Undertaking.”

3.7. The Committee note the procedure being followed in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings for filling up posts by promotion. In view of the fact that there are very few Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the higher posts in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, the Committee feel the greater promotion opportunities should be provided to them.

**B. Supersessions**

3.8. The Committee desired to know the number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes who have been superseded by others:

in the matter of promotions on the basis of seniority subject to fitness in various categories of posts. The information received from the Defence Public Sector Undertakings is tabulated below:

*Hindustan Aeronautics Limited*

Group/Grade	Scale of pay	Number
Group A . . . . .	100—4—140	..
Group B . . . . .	155—5—130—6—172—EB—6—190	7
Group C . . . . .	160—8—184—9—265—EB—10 —285	22
Group D . . . . .	190—12—310—15—340	4
Group E . . . . .	. 225—15—405—20—445— EB—20—485	1

3.9. No supersessions have taken place in the Bharat Electronics Limited, the Bharat Earth Movers Limited, the Mazagon Docks Limited, the Garden Reach Workshops Limited and the Praga Tools Limited.

3.10. The Committee desired to know the reasons for large number of supersessions in the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited. The representative of the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited has stated during evidence that normally supersession takes place when an individual does not measure up to the minimum requirements and his work is found to be unsatisfactory. Asked whether the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees, who are superseded, have a right to represent to the higher authorities, the representative of the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited has informed the Committee that their cases are reviewed by the Managing Director, whereas this does not happen in the case of other employees. The representatives of the Department of Defence Production has added that every employee has a right to represent to the Government. However, Government has to ask for the remarks of the Public Sector Undertaking in the matter. It would not be proper or even possible for the Government to take action *suo motu* to find out from the Public Sector Undertaking about the number of people superseded.

3.11. The Committee desired to know the number of cases reviewed personally by the Managing Director and the number of cases in which he reversed the decision of supersession of a Scheduled Caste or Scheduled Tribe employee. A nil statement has been furnished by the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited on the subject.



3.12. In reply to a further question, the representative of the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited has stated during evidence that the supersessions should be viewed in comparison with the number of persons promoted. There might be large number of persons promoted as compared to the supersessions.

3.13. The Committee are unhappy to find that there have been a large number of cases of supersession of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees in the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited. The Committee need hardly stress that supersession of Scheduled Caste or Scheduled Tribe employees should be avoided. In any case, full details about the supersessions should be reported to the Department of Defence Production in accordance with the orders of the Department of Personnel on the subject. They would also like that all such cases should simultaneously be reported to the Commissioner for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes for his information. The Committee also suggest that the figures of supersession may be included in the Annual Reports of the Department of Defence Production|Defence Public Sector Undertakings.

BUTA SINGH,

NEW DELHI;

April 5, 1972

Chaitra 16, 1894 (Saka)

Chairman,

Committee on the Welfare of

Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

## APPENDIX I

(Vide Para 1.7 of the Report)

MOST IMMEDIATE REGISTERED  
No. F. 2 (15) 71 D (HAL-II) D (PS)  
Government of India,  
Ministry of Defence,  
(Department of Defence Production)  
New Delhi the, 28th October, 1971.

To

- i) The Chairman,  
H.A.L., Bangalore.
- ii) Chairman-cum-Managing Director,  
MDL           Bombay  
GSL           Vasco de-Gama, Goa,  
BEL           Bangalore.
- iii) The Managing Director  
BEML          Bangalore  
PTL           Secunderabad  
GRW           Calcutta  
BDL           Hyderabad

SUBJECT:—*Reservation for Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes in the Defence Public Undertakings.*

Sir,

I am directed to refer to the Presidential Directives issued to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings *vide* the marginally noted references, on the above subject, and to say that a review of the recruitment position in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings since the issue of the above mentioned Directives has revealed that practically in every undertaking there are large shortfalls in the recruitment from amongst Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes against the vacancies reserved for these communities, the shortfall being particularly pronounced in posts falling in the categories of Class I and Class II. Moreover, the overall representation of Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes with reference to the total number of employees in the various grades is also generally very poor, mainly because prior to 1970 no reservations appear to have been made in favour of these communities in any of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings. Serious efforts to recruit suitable candidates of Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes

- 
1. F. 17 (204)/69/D (PS) dated 27-1-1970 to Defence PSUS other than BDL and PTL.
  2. No. F. 17 (204)/69/D (PS) dated 2-2-70 (PTL)
  3. No. F. 17 (204)/69/D (PS) dated 17-2-1971 (Supplementary) Directive to all Defence PSUS other than BDL)
  4. No. 17 (204)/69/D (PS) dated 27-2-1971 (BDL) with a copy each of the Directive dt. 27-1-70 and 17-2-1971.
-

against the reserved vacancies for these communities do not appear to have been made even after the issue of the Directives mentioned above. This matter has attracted considerable criticism from the Parliamentary Committee on Welfare of Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes. The specific remedial measures required to be taken have been considered and, in pursuance of Article \* of Articles of

\* HAL Article—159  
 BEL Article—114  
 BEML Article—159  
 MDL Article—182  
 GRW Article—189  
 GSR Article—191  
 BDL Article—154  
 PTL Article—68

Association of your Undertaking, the President hereby directs that the following special measures should be taken in order to ensure adequate recruitment from the Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes against the vacancies reserved for them:—

- (i) During the year 1971 and, if necessary, also during the next two years, *ad hoc* special recruitment confined to the Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes candidates alone may be made in order to ensure not only sufficient recruitment from these communities against the reserved quotas that would normally be admissible in their favour with reference to the total recruitment during the respective years but also to wipe out the backlog of reserved vacancies carried forward from the year 1970. For this purpose, reservations even in excess of the quotas prescribed under the provisions of the Presidential Directives referred to above may be made in favour of the Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes during the 3-year period from 1971 to 1973, subject only to the limitation that the total number of reserved vacancies for these communities during the recruitment year does not exceed 45 per cent of the total recruitment to the relevant grade or category in the particular year. The provisions in the existing Presidential Directives in regard to the carry-forward of the unfilled reserved quotas for Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes for 3 "recruitment years" with provision for filling the reserved vacancies for Scheduled Castes by candidates from Scheduled Tribes, and *vice versa*, in the third year ( will continue to apply.
- (ii) Whenever recruitment is required to be made to vacancies reserved for Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes only, whether under the special *ad hoc* recruitment as at (i) above or otherwise, the requisition to the employment

exchange or the open advertisement, as the case may be, should invite applications only from Scheduled Caste| Scheduled Tribe candidates. In the case of advertisements a copy should simultaneously be forwarded to the following:—

- (a) District Magistrates of the concerned State.
  - (b) Department of Social Welfare of the State Government.
  - (c) Recognised representative Associations of Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes *vide* Appendix X to the Ministry of Defence letter No. F. 17(204)|69|D(PS) dated 27.1.1970.
  - (d) Secretariat of the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes C|o the Lok Sabha Secretariat, New Delhi (35 copies).
  - (e) Commissioner for Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes, New Delhi.
- (iii) The advertisement should also be published in least one regional language paper of the State. This would be applicable to recruitment made on all-India basis also.
- (iv) For the purpose of computing the prescribed reservations for Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes in the case of recruitment to posts in Class IV or, where there is no class IV, in Class III, the recruitment to posts of scavengers|sweepers should be excluded, i.e., prescribed quotas of reservations should be computed with reference to the balance of posts filled in these categories. The position regarding recruitment to Class IV or, where there is no Class IV to Class III in the prescribed annual or other periodical returns may also be indicated separately (a) for posts of sweepers|scavengers, and (b) for other posts. *It is also necessary that specific mention about the recruitment made against the reserved vacancies is made in the Annual Report of the Company.*
- (v) The requisition to the employment exchange or the advertisement, as the case may be, should specifically indicate the *total number* of vacancies to be filled *as also the number of vacancies reserved* for the Scheduled Castes| Scheduled Tribes, *separately*. Secondly, the concessions

or relaxtions in the matter of age limit, qualifications or experience admissible to the Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribe candidates should be clearly spelt out in the requisition or the advertisement.

- (vi) The standards of preliminary screening as well as final selectoin should be suitably relaxed for candidates from Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes and fixed lower than what would ordinarily be prescribed for the general category subject, of course, to the minimum standard of suitability necessary for maintaining the efficiency of the undertaking. For example, if a first class degree or say 60 per cent marks in the degree examination is prescribed as the general qualifying standard for preliminary selection for calling candidates for written examintion|interview, the qualifying standard for Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes may be simply a University degree or a lower percentage of marks in the degree examination. In the written examination or interview conducted for making the selection also, the qualifying standard for the Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe candidates may be similarly fixed lower. Wherever a *viva voce* test or interview is prescribed in addition to the written examination for the purpose of recruitment the maximum marks allocated to *viva voce* or interview as compared to the written examination should be kept as low as possible.
- (vii) The period of previous experience, where prescribed, may be restricted to the minimum essential period in the case of the Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe candidates and it should be fixed lower than normally required from candidates of the general category. In particular, wherever previous experience of 5 years or longer is prescribed for the general category, relaxation of upto 2 years may be allowed in favour of Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes.
- (viii) Special pre-entry training in the relevant trades or disciplines, if necessary, may be arranged by the Undertaking for the Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribe candidates selected for recruitment on the basis of relaxed standards of suitability or experience, in order to equip these candidates with the requisite skills or experience required for

the satisfactory performance of their duties. Where feasible, special *training classes* may also be arranged by the Undertaking for the training of candidates from Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes in technical trades or disciplines for which the employment exchange or the industrial training institutes or not in a position to sponsor the requisite number of qualified candidates from these communities, with a view to their eventual absorption in the reserved vacancies.

- (ix) The Undertaking should try its best to include in the Selection Committees|Interview Boards concerned with the direct recruitment or promotions a suitable officer belonging to the Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes. In case no such officer is available from within the undertaking, a suitable Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe officer from one of the other undertakings or from the State Government should be associated with the Selection Committee|Interview Board. Where a suitable Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe officer even from the State Government is not available, efforts may be made to associate a suitable outside expert from these communities, if available.
- (x) In the case of vacancies of clerks|typists for which proficiency in type-writing is at present prescribed as an essential qualification for recruitment, this requirement may be waived, where necessary, in order to make good the recruitment against reserved vacancies, in favour of the Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes candidates possessing the minimum prescribed educational qualification and they may be appointed on the condition that they would acquire prescribed standard of proficiency within a stipulated period, say, six months. The standard of proficiency in type-writing in their cases may also be fixed lower than that ordinarily required from the general category, e.g., if general candidates are required to possess a typing speed of 40 words per minute., the qualifying speed for Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe candidates may be fixed at 30 words per minute.
- (xi) Cases of Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe candidates who are rejected in selection by a particular Selection Committee|Board should be reviewed by the next higher Selection Committee|Board. In cases, where there is no

higher Selection Committee|Board or where the initial selections are by an individual officer, the review should be conducted at the next higher administrative level. This would apply also to the selections for internal promotion in the Undertaking.

3. A point was made by some Member of the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes & Scheduled Tribes that as the candidates from Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes generally reside in the interior rural areas, very often they do not get adequate notice when called by the employment exchange or other recruiting authorities. In order to meet this point, it is suggested that the requisitions to the employment exchange or the advertisements should generally allow a time limit of at least 4 to 6 weeks for application|sponsoring of candidates. Secondly, even if the nominations|applications of Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe candidates possessing the required qualifications are received after the prescribed time-limit, their nominations|applications may be entertained against the reserved vacancies provided that these have not already been filled.

4. Another point that emerged during the course of evidence before the Parliamentary Committee on Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes is that the position in regard to applicability of the reservations for or special consideration to Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes in the matter of promotions within the Undertaking has not in some cases been clearly understood. These provisions are clearly indicated in para 1(B) and paras 9 and 10 of the Presidential Directive contained in this Ministry's letter No. F. 17(204)|69|D(PS) dated 27.1.1970 as amended by this Ministry's letter of even number dated 17.2.1971. These provisions may please be brought to the notice of all Officers|Selection Committees, etc. concerned with promotions in your undertaking. They may also be suitably incorporated in the promotion rules or procedures of the Undertaking.

5. It has also come to notice in the course of the evidence before the Parliamentary Committee on the welfare of Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribes that the prescribed Rosters have not in certain cases been properly maintained. Immediate steps should therefore be taken to ensure that the prescribed Rosters are strictly maintained in accordance with the provisions of the Government Directives referred to above. It should be made the special responsibility of the officer designated as Liaison Officer for matters concerning Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes in your Undertaking to ensure the proper maintenance of these Rosters. For this purpose, the

Liaison Officer should be required to conduct an Annual Inspection of the Rosters which are being maintained to ensure proper implementation of the Government Directives. To facilitate effective and complete scrutiny of the Rosters, a proforma for conducting the inspection of Rosters is enclosed *vide* the Annexure.

6. Details of the special steps proposed to be taken by your undertaking in pursuance of the above Directive may please be reported to the Department of Defence Production by 15th December, 1971.

Yours faithfully,

(MOHINDAR SINGH)

Deputy Secretary to the Government of India  
For and on behalf of the President of India.

Copy forwarded for information to:

- (i) Secretariat of the Committee on Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes to the Lok Sabha Secretariat, New Delhi (35 copies).
- (ii) Commissioner for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, New Delhi.
- (iii) The Bureau of Public Enterprises, Ministry of Finance, New Delhi (Shri A. N. Banerjee, Director General, BPE).
- (iv) The Department of Personnel, Cabinet Secretariat, New Delhi.
- (v) Secretary (DP)|J.S. (ALP)|J.S.(PS&C)|D.S. (R&A)|D.S. (PS)|O.S.D. (GRW|MD)|U.S. (HAL-I)|U.S. (HAL. II)|U.S. (PS|BEL).

### ANNEXURE

#### **Proforma for conducting inspection of rosters maintained for providing reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in service.**

Name of Office:

1. Whether separate rosters are being maintained for each grade or group of posts and within such grade|group, separately for (i) direct recruitment and (ii) for posts filled by promotion (where reservation is applicable in such posts filled by promotion) and whether all the appointments made during the period covered by the inspection are shown in the roster.



2. Whether the appropriate model roster viz, the one prescribed for (1) Direct recruitment on an all India basis by open competition (2) Direct recruitment on all India basis otherwise than by open competition (3) Direct recruitment on a local or regional basis or (4) promotion, as the case may be, is being followed.

3. Whether rosters are being maintained separately for (1) Permanent appointments and temporary appointments likely to become permanent or to continue indefinitely and (2) Purely temporary appointments of 45 days or more duration.

4. Whether the rosters are being maintained in the form prescribed viz. Appendix V to the Government Directive contained in the Ministry of Defence (Department of Defence Production) letter No. 17(204)|69|D(PS) dated 27-1-1970.

5. Whether the points have been earmarked in the roster for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes correctly according to the prescribed model roster for the particular type of recruitment.

6. Whether immediately after an appointment has been made, the particulars of the person appointed are entered in the Register in appropriate columns and the entry signed by the appointing authority or by the officer authorised to do so.

7. Whether any gap is left in the roster.

8. Whether the roster is being maintained in the form of a running account from year to year.

9. Whether before appointing a general candidate against reserved vacancy, (i) prior approval of the prescribed authority was obtained in the case of vacancies included in the roster for permanent appointment and temporary appointments likely to become permanent or to continue indefinitely, and (ii) whether the steps prescribed in para 7 of the Government Directive contained in the Ministry of Defence (Department of Defence Production) letter No. F. 17(204)|69|D(PS) dated 27-11-1970 to secure Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe candidates were taken in the case of vacancies included in the roster.

10. Whether an abstract is given after the last entry in a recruitment year showing the number of reservations carried forward to the following year separately for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. Whether these reservations have been shown as brought forward at the beginning of the roster for the following year.

11. Whether reservations have been carried forward to three subsequent "recruitment years" and exchange of reservations made between scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes before treating them as lapsed.

12. Any other remarks.

**summing up**

13. Brief recapitulation of defects and shortcomings noticed in the maintenance of the rosters and any other suggestions which the Inspection Officer has to make, with particular reference to the remarks given during the last inspection.

Signature of the Inspecting Officer

Designation:

Remarks of Head of  
Department|Chief  
Executive of the  
undertaking.

## APPENDIX II

(Vide para 3.1 of the Report)

*Promotion Procedure being followed by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings as laid down in the Directive issued by the Department of Defence Production on the 27th January, 1970, and 17th February, 1970.*

---

### **Concessions to employees of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in promotions by selection method—**

*“Promotions within Class I:*

In promotions by selection to posts within Class I which carry an ultimate salary of Rs. 2,000 per month, or less, the Scheduled Caste|Tribe Officers, who are senior enough in the zone of consideration for promotion so as to be within the number of vacancies for which the select list has to be drawn up, would be included in that list provided they are not considered unfit for promotion. Their position in the select list would, however, be the same as assigned to them by the Departmental Promotion Committee on the basis of their record of service. They would not be given for this purpose one grading higher than the grading otherwise assignable to them on the basis of their record of service.

In order to improve the chances of Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe officers for selection to the higher categories of posts in Class I, the following measures should be taken:

- (i) Scheduled Caste|Tribe officers in Class I services|posts should be provided with more opportunities for institutional training and for attending seminars|symposia|conferences. Advantage could in this connection be taken of the training facilities available at the Indian Institute of Public Administration, New Delhi, the Administrative Staff College, Hyderabad, etc., and
- (ii) It should be the special responsibility of the immediate superior officers of the Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe officers in Class I to give advice and guidance to the latter to improve the quality of their work.

Public Enterprises under whom Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe Class I Officers might be serving should ensure that these decisions are implemented with expedition. Public Enterprises (or the Heads of Departments) under whom such officers might be serving may specially watch the progress of these officers so that all appropriate steps are taken, wherever necessary, to improve the efficiency of these officers for the purpose of their selection to higher posts.

### **Promotion from Class III to Class II within Class II and from Class II to the lower rung or category in Class I**

In promotions by selection from Class III to Class II and within Class II and from Class II to the lowest rung or category in Class I, the following procedure will be adopted:

In promotions made by selection, employees in the zone of consideration numbering 5 or 6 times the estimated number of vacancies are normally considered for inclusion in the select list. After rejecting those who are unfit for promotion, the Departmental Promotion Committee proceeds to categorise the remaining eligible employees into three categories, namely, 'Outstanding', 'Very Good' and 'Good'. Thereafter, the Committee draws up a select list placing all employees in the 'Outstanding' category at the top, followed by those categorised as 'Very Good' and then by those categorised as 'Good', the *inter se* seniority within each category being maintained. As a measure of improving representation of Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes in services the following concession in grading shall be extended to them.

If within the zone of consideration, there are any Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees, those amongst them who are considered unfit for promotion by the Departmental Promotion Committee will be excluded from consideration. Thereafter, the remaining Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees will be given by the Departmental Promotion Committee one grading higher than the grading otherwise assignable to them on the basis of their record of service i.e. if any Scheduled Caste or Scheduled Tribe employee has been categorised by the Committee on the basis of his record of service as 'Good' he should be recategorised by the Committee as 'Very Good'. Likewise, if any Scheduled Caste or Scheduled Tribe employee is graded as 'Very Good' on the basis of his record of service, he will be recategorised by the Committee as 'Outstanding'. Of course, if any Scheduled Caste or Scheduled Tribe employee has already been categorised by the Committee on the basis of his record of service as 'Outstanding', no recategorisation will be needed in his case.

The above concession would be confined to only 25 per cent of the total vacancies in a particular grade or post filled in a year from the Select List. While making promotions from the Select List the appointing authority should, therefore, check up that the Scheduled Castes|Scheduled Tribes employees promoted in a year on the basis of this concession are limited to 25 per cent, of the posts filled in a year from the Select List prepared according to the procedure outlined above, i.e., the concession of giving higher grading should be given to one employee of Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe against every four vacancies. For this purpose, a continuous account of vacancies should be kept. If the number of vacancies in a year is not divisible by four, the remainder should be carried forward to the following year for the purpose of this accounting. For example, if there are six vacancies in a year, the concessions would be given to one employee of Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe against the first four vacancies and the balance of 2 vacancies would be notionally carried forward to the following year and added to the vacancies arising in that year to determine the number of employees of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes who should be given this concession.

Those Scheduled Caste|Scheduled Tribe employees who are senior enough in the zone of consideration so as to be within the number of vacancies for which the Select List has to be drawn, should be included in the Select List, if they are not considered unfit for promotion and should also be given one grading higher than the grading otherwise assignable to them on the basis of their record of service and their place in the Select List determined on the basis of this higher categorisation. This would imply that even where, in some cases, the Select List were to consist of, say, only 'Outstanding' non-Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribe candidates, adequate number of them being available from the zone of consideration, those Scheduled Caste|Schedule Tribe candidates who are high up in the zone of consideration and are within the number of estimated vacancies for which the Select List is being prepared will, even if they are only 'Good' and after higher categorisation by one degree are categorised as 'Very Good' have to be included in the Select List, but they will be placed below the 'Outstanding' candidates in the Select List.

#### **Safeguards to employees of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in promotions on the basis of seniority subject to fitness**

There will be no reservation for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in appointments made by promotion on the basis of seniority

subject to fitness, but cases involving supersession of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes Officers in Class I and II appointments will be submitted for prior approval to the Board of Directors. Cases involving supersession of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe officers in Class III and IV appointments will be reported within a month to the Board of Directors for information.

**Instructions to be followed while filling by promotion of vacancies reserved for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes**

(a) Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe officers who are within the normal zone of consideration should be considered for promotion along with other and adjudged on same basis as others and those Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes amongst them who are selected on that basis may be included in the general select list in addition to their being considered for separate, select list for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

(b) If candidates from Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes obtain on the basis of their position in the aforesaid general select list, less vacancies than are reserved for them, the difference should be made up by selected candidates of those communities who are in the separate select lists for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes respectively.

In the separate select list drawn up for (i) Scheduled Castes, and (ii) Scheduled Tribes, officers belonging to Scheduled Castes or Scheduled Tribes, as the case may be will be adjudged separately amongst themselves and not along with other officers, and if selected, they should be included in the concerned separate select list, irrespective of their merit as compared to other officers. It is needless to mention that officers not belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes will not be considered whilst drawing up separate select lists for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. For being considered for inclusion in the aforesaid separate select lists, the zone of consideration for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, as the case may be, would be of the same size as that for the general select list, that is, if for the general select list, the zone of consideration is 5 times the number of vacancies likely to be filled, the zone of consideration for the separate list for Scheduled Castes will also be 5 times the number of reserved vacancies for them, and likewise for Scheduled Tribes, subject, of course, to the condition that officers coming within such zone are eligible, by length of service etc. as prescribed for being considered for promotion.

### APPENDIX III

(Vide para 4 of Introduction)

#### *Summary of Conclusions/Recommendations contained in the Report*

---

Sl. No.	Reference to Para Number in the Report	Summary of Conclusions/Recommendations
1	2	3

---

1	1.9	While the Committee would discuss in succeeding paragraphs the various matters discussed with the representatives of the Department of Defence Production, they would like to record here, their appreciation of the promptness with which the Department accepted most of the suggestions made during the evidence of its representatives and issued the directives incorporating those suggestions to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings. The Committee hope that the representation of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Public Ssector Undertakings will now considerably improve if the instructions contained in those directives are implemented <del>in</del> <i>in toto</i> by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings.
2	1.10	The Committee would like the Department of Defence Production to examine the annual returns received by it from the Public Undertakings under it specifically in the light of the directives issued to them regarding the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and to point out to the concerned Undertakings the shortcomings, if any, noticed therein, with a view to rectify them.

---

1

2

3

3

1.16

The Committee have no doubt that close liaison and coordination between the Bureau of Public Enterprises, Department of Defence Production and Defence Public Sector Undertakings will go a long way in improving the representation of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Undertakings. While the Committee agree with the Director-General of Bureau of Public Enterprises that the role of the Bureau of Public Enterprises is purely an advisory one and that the Bureau can not interfere in the day-to-day working of the Undertakings, the Committee would like to stress that the returns from the Public Undertakings should be carefully examined by the Bureau on receipt, keeping in view the percentages of reservations and other measures prescribed for the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The deficiencies, if any, found in the representation of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Undertakings should immediately be pointed out to the Department of Defence Production so that necessary corrective measures are taken expeditiously. The Bureau should also, with the collaboration of the Department of Defence Production, keep a close watch to ensure that these deficiencies are made up as speedily as possible.

4

2.3

The Committee are unhappy to learn that even the existing seats reserved for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the Marine Engineering Colleges, Indian Institutes of Technology, etc. are not being filled up by the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe students. The Committee feel that unless more and more Scheduled Caste|Tribe students take up the requisite technical courses, their representation in the services of Defence Public Sector Undertakings is not likely to improve. The Com-



1

2

3

mittee would, therefore, stress the desirability of conducting a survey to find out the reasons for the inadequate intake of Scheduled Caste| Tribes students in technical courses in these technical institutions. The Committee suggest that close liaison and coordination between the Defence Public Sector Undertakings and the various technical institutions should be established so that adequate numbers of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe students could be given necessary education and training according to the requirements of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings.

5

2.4

The Committee also suggest that for purposes of recruitment, the Defence Public Sector Undertakings should notify their requirements to the Placement Officers in the various Institutes of Technology so that students passing out from the Institutes could offer themselves for employment in those Undertakings.

6

2.26

The Committee note that the Department of Defence Production has already issued a comprehensive supplementary directive to the Defence Sector Undertakings, incorporating therein some of the suggestions made by the Committee during the evidence of the representatives of the Department, for improving the recruitment procedure followed by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings to augment the intake of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in their services. The Committee need hardly stress that the procedure envisaged in the said directive should be scrupulously observed by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings. The Committee suggest that the Department of Defence Production should keep a continuous watch on the Defence Public Sector Undertakings so as to see that the reservation orders and other measures laid down for the benefit of the Sche-

1

2

3

---

duled Castes and Scheduled Tribes are properly and fully implemented.

7

2.27

The Committee feel that close coordination and liaison between the Defence Public Sector Undertakings and the Employment Exchanges is imperative for augmenting the representation of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings. The Committee suggest that precise reasons for the rejection of Scheduled Caste|Tribe candidates, who have been sponsored by the Employment Exchanges, should be recorded and communicated to the Employment Exchanges. The Employment Exchanges should also be asked to furnish a fresh list of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates if suitable Scheduled Caste|Tribe candidates are not available in the list furnished by them earlier.

8

2.30

The Committee hope that a Scheduled Caste Tribe Officer would invariably be included in the Selection/Promotion Boards set up by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, as laid down in the directive referred to in para 2.29 of the Report, so that interests of the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates are adequately safeguarded.

9

2.43

The Committee are unhappy to note that the number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes recruited as Graduate Engineers by all the Defence Public Sector Undertakings so far is negligible. The Committee are all the more unhappy that only one Scheduled Caste candidate was selected as Graduate Engineer by the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited, out of 43 Scheduled Caste candidates, possessing first class degrees, called for examination/interview. The position in the Bharat Electronics Limited is no better. Out of 11 Scheduled Caste candidates who passed

- 
- | 2 | 3 |
|---|---|
|---|---|
- 
- 14      2.70      The Committee are distressed to find the insignificant representation of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings in almost all the categories of posts. They also regret to note that even after the issue of the Presidential directive to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, the Defence Public Sector Undertakings did not pay sufficient attention towards the recruitment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes as per reservations prescribed for them. In the circumstances, the Committee need hardly emphasise that unless orders/instructions on the subject are followed in letter and spirit by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, the position is not going to improve. The Committee, however, would watch with interest the efforts being made by the Department of Defence Production to augment the intake of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Public Sector Undertaking.
- 15      2.71      The Committee suggest that the Department of Defence Production may consider the feasibility of conducting a survey about the employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Defence Public Sector Undertakings to find out what further steps are necessary to improve their representation in the services of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings.
- 16      2.74      The Committee feel that the Roster is a mechanism to watch adequate in take of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings and that it would cease to have any significance whatsoever if it is not maintained properly. Further, unless all the vacancies reserved for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes are actually filled and their appointments are in fact made according to the points mentioned in the Roster, the position regarding the representation of
-

1

2

3

---

Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the services of the Defence Public Sector Undertakings is not expected to improve. The Committee note that revised orders have been issued by the Department of Defence Production in October, 1971 for the proper maintenance of Rosters and their periodical checking by higher officers. The Committee hope that these Rosters will now be maintained in accordance with the extant orders and checked regularly.

17

2.86

The Committee feel that unless a special in-service training programme, especially for those Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates, who have been recruited by lowering the standard, is initiated by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, it may be very difficult to bring such employees at par with others and make them suitable for higher posts. The Committee note in this connection that all the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, except the Bharat Earth Movers Limited, the Garden Reach Workshop Limited and the Bharat Dynamics Limited, have some sort of training programme. The Committee also note that the Department of Defence Production has already issued a directive to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings to arrange special training programmes/training classes for the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe candidates. The Committee hope that with the initiation of the training programmes in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings the Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates will be able to come up to the requisite standards.

18

2.90

The Committee are unhappy to note that large numbers of posts have been de-reserved, especially in the Bharat Electronics Limited. The Committee feel that the procedure being followed by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings for de-reservation of posts needs close

---

1

2

3

---

scrutiny to ensure that de-reservation of post is avoided as far as possible. The Committee suggest that before a particular post is de-reserved, the matter should again be referred to the Employment Exchange in order to explore the possibility of getting Scheduled Caste/Tribe candidates. They also suggest that precise reasons for de-reservation of posts should also be intimated to the Commissioner for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes for his information. The statistics regarding posts de-reserved during a year should also be included in the Annual Reports of the Department of Defence Production/Defence Public Sector Undertakings.

- 19      2.94      The Committee note that Liaison Officers have been nominated in all the Defence Public Sector Undertakings for the effective implementation of the orders and instructions issued by the Ministry of Home Affairs/Department of Defence Production pertaining to the reservation of vacancies in favour of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and other benefits admissible to them. The Committee suggest that the charter of duties for the Liaison Officers, as laid by the Ministry of Home Affairs should be adopted by the Department of Defence Production and made applicable to the Liaison Officers appointed by the various Defence Public Sector Undertakings.
- 20      2.95      The Committee note the procedure being followed by the Mazagon Docks Limited for redressal of grievances of employees. They however, feel that there is need for a separate Cell to attend to the complaints and grievances of Scheduled Castes/Tribe employees.
- 21      2.98      The Committee are glad to note that the Department of Defence Production has issued a directive to the Defence Public Sector Undertakings to provide reservation of 5 per cent in
-

1

2

3

---

the houses of types I and II in favour of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Committee suggest that the feasibility of extending similar reservations to other types of houses may also be considered by the Department of Defence Production.

22

3.7

The Committee note the procedure being followed in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings for filling up posts by promotion. In view of the fact that there are very few Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the higher posts in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings, the Committee feel that greater promotion opportunities should be provided to them.

23

3.13

The Committee are unhappy to find that there have been a large number of cases of supersession of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees in the Hindustan Aeronautics Limited. The Committee need hardly stress that supersession of Scheduled Caste or Scheduled Tribe employees should be avoided. In any case, full details about the supersessions should be reported to the Department of Defence Production in accordance with the orders of the Department of Personnel on the subject. They would also like that all such cases should simultaneously be reported to the Commissioner for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes for his information. The Committee also suggest that the figures of supersession may also be included in the Annual Reports of the Department of Defence Production/Defence Public Sector Undertakings.

---