GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
RURAL DEVELOPMENT
LOK SABHA

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO:4889
ANSWERED ON:26.04.2010
RECOMMENDATIONS OF N.C. SAXENA COMMITTEE
Kishor Shri Kamal

Will the Minister of RURAL DEVELOPMENT be pleased to state:

(a) the details of suggestions/recommendations made by the N. C. Saxena Committee in regard to the identification of poor people to include in the BPL List;

(b) whether several Members of Parliament have raised objections on the said recommendations/suggestions and opined that the new criteria suggested by the N. C. Saxena Committee for identification of poor are against weaker sections of the society particularly Scheduled Castes;

(c) if so, the details of the shortcomings pointed out by them; and

(d) the action taken by the Government thereon?

Answer

MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT(SHRI PRADEEP JAIN `ADITYA`)

(a) The recommendation of the Expert Group under chairmanship of Dr. N.C. Saxena include automatic exclusion of rural households from the BPL list, automatic inclusion in the BPL list and grading remaining households. For automatic exclusion of rural households from the BPL list, the Expert Group recommended indicators such as ownership of land, ownership of motorized vehicles, ownership of mechanized farm equipment, regular employment and Income tax payers. The Expert Group recommended automatic inclusion of rural households from certain groups in the BPL list such as designated `Primitive Tribal Groups`, designated `Maha Dalit Groups`, single women headed households, households with disabled person as bread-earner, households headed by a minor, households dependent on alms for survival, homeless households and households with bonded labourers. The Expert Group recommended that remaining households may be ranked on a scale of ten based on caste, community, religion, occupation, educational status and age of head of Household.

(b) & (c) Shri Kamal Kishor, Member of Parliament (Lok Sabha) from Bahraich (UP) has raised objections on the recommendations of N.C. Saxena Committee through a D.O. letter No.F11637/MP/KK/VIP/2010 dated 18th February 2010 addressed to Minister for Rural Development and Panchayati Raj. Hon`ble MP has expressed his fear that Parameters recommended by Saxena Committee may not help in identification of real poor particularly from weaker sections of the society and SCs/STs etc. He has further stated that Communities/Castes like Iron smith, cobbler, Potter, Barber, Sweeper, Safaikarmachary, Weaver, Teli etc come under self employed and get 2 points only in recommended scoring pattern. Most of these communities do not have land/assets and mostly belong to SCs and are likely not to be in the BPL list. The scores and methodology appear to be anti-poor and SCs / STs and methodology gives lot of scope for manipulation particularly on account of new definitions of a household.

(d) The report of the Expert Group has been circulated among the State Governments/UT administrations and the concerned Central Ministries for their comments. It has also been posted on Ministry`s website at www.rural.nic.in. The methodology is being examined in consultation with State Governments and experts. There is a proposal for pre-testing the methodology to enable finalisation of the same.