

I have very closely followed the discussions in the House on the subject of the recall of Uttar Pradesh Governor from the time the initial notices under Rule 184 from the hon. Members in the Opposition were taken up for consideration. I have also taken stock of the substance of all arguments for and against the issue from the beginning. I have particularly taken note of, and studied, the statements made by the Union Minister of Home Affairs and the Union Minister of Parliamentary Affairs and the reported observations of the Governor of Uttar Pradesh that the hon. Prime Minister is satisfied with the law and order situation in Uttar Pradesh, which have not been denied so far. Having done this, I hold, with due respects to all concerned, that the voice from the Treasury Benches has not been unanimous. Lack of this unanimity of voice in the Treasury Benches in this regard is a matter of very serious concern, which is inconsistent with the principle of collective responsibility of the Council of Ministers to the House, as spelt out in Article 75 (3) of the Constitution. This responsibility is joint and indivisible. The matter is especially grave considering that Uttar Pradesh is the most populous State in the country and law and order situation therein has implications for the country as a whole.

I have also noted the assurance given by the Governor of Uttar Pradesh in his communication addressed to me that he holds the Home Minister in high respect and that it was not his intention to contradict or criticise the Home Minister when he revealed to the Press the statistics and information in his possession.

The assurance given by the Governor is, no doubt, welcome but the fact remains that he has not specifically, and in clear terms, denied the remarks attributed to him in the Press reports about which a reference has been made in the House.

On the contrary, he has reiterated that he had merely revealed to the press the statistics and information in his possession. Law and order situation is not a mere matter of statistics of number of lives lost, even as each human life is valuable. The overall situation does not detract from the fact of emergence of discordant notes and mixed and confusing signals from the Government side on the law and order situation in U.P.

The Government and the House owe it to the people of our country in general, and of U.P. in particular, to assess the situation through objective discussions. A discussion on the law and order situation in the State is bound, even if indirectly, to lead to a discussion on the conduct of the Governor which, under the rules, cannot be allowed except on a substantive motion under Rule 184.

In the circumstances, after giving a careful thought to all aspects of the matter, I admit the notices of motion under Rule 184.

12.16 hrs.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

[*English*]

Annual Reports, Annual Accounts and Review on the working of the film and Television Institute of India, Pune for the year 1995-96 etc.

THE MINISTER OF CIVIL AVIATION AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI C.M. IBRAHIM): I beg to lay on the Table:

- (1) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Film and Television Institute of India, Pune, for the year 1995-96.
- (ii) A copy of the Annual Accounts (Hindi and English versions) of the Film and Television Institute of India, Pune, for the year 1995-96, together with Audit Report thereon.
- (iii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government of the working of the Film and Television Institute of India, Pune, for the year 1995-96.
- (2) Statement (Hindi and English versions) showing reasons for delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.
- (3) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Press Council of India, New Delhi, for the year 1995-96, alongwith Audited Accounts.
- (4) Statement (Hindi and English versions) showing reasons for delay in laying the papers mentioned at (3) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-1474/97]

[Placed in Library. See No. LT 1475/97]

12.16 1/2 hrs.

[*English*]

RULES COMMITTEE

Second Report

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (MAVELIKARA): I beg to lay on the Table, under sub-rule (2) of rule 331 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, the Second Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Rules Committee.