(i) Review by the Government of working of the Madras Refineries Limited, Madras, for the year 1995-96.

Committee Reports

(ii) Annual Report of the Madras Refineries Limited, Madras, for the year 1995-96, alongwith Audited Accounts and comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General thereon.

[Placed in Library, See No. LT-1163/96]

(2) A copy of the Memorandum of Understanding (Hindi and English versions) between the Gas Authority of India Limited and the Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas for the year 1996-97.

[Placed In Library, See No. LT-1164/96]

12.03 hrs.

COMMITTEE ON PRIVATE MEMBERS' BILLS AND RESOLUTIONS

Fourth Report

[English]

PROF. PREM SINGH CHANDUMAJRA (Patiala): Sur I beg to present the Fourth Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Committee on Private Members' Bills and Resolution.

12.03¼ hrs.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC UNDERTAKINGS

First, Second and Third Reports

[English]

SHRI G. VENKAT SWAMY (Peddapalli): Sir, I beg to present the following Reports (Hindi and English versions) of the Committee on Public Undertakings:

- (1) First Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in their Forty-Third Report (Tenth Lok Sabha) on Mazagon Dock Limited.
- (2) Second Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in their Fifty-Fourth Report (Tenth Lok Sabha) on Rural Electrification Corporation Limited.
- (3) Third Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in their

Fiftieth Report (Tenth Lok Sabha) on Power Finance Corporation Limited.

12.03³/₄ hrs.

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENT ASSURANCES

First Report

[English]

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR (Dibrugarh) Sir. I beg to present the First Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Committee on Government Assurances.

12.04 hrs.

UTTAR PRADESH STATE LEGISLATURE (DELEGATION OF POWERS) BILL*

[English]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Shri Indrajit Gupta.

SHRI RAM NAIK (Mumbai North): Sir, I have given a notice to oppose the introduction of the Bill which is listed as Item No. 13 of the List of Business ...(Interruptions)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Mumbai-North East) : But where is the Home Minister to introduce the Bill?

SHRI SANTOSH KUMAR GANGWAR (Bareilly) : Mr. Deputy Speaker Sir, I have also objected to it.

(Enalish)

THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS (SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN): He is introducing the Bill in Rajya Sabha...(Interruptions) The Home Minister is in the Rajya Sabha. He is coming within two minutes.

(Translation)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can ask other minister to introduce it.

(English)

SHRI RAM NAIK: The Minister must inform you...(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN : This is only introduction. He is in the Rajya Sabha. He is coming just now.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : He is in the Rajya Sabha

Published in the Gazette of India extraordinary, Part-II. Section-2 dated 18.12.96.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: That cannot be an excuse...(Interruptions) This is a very important Bill which ha would like to introduce in the House. But when the time comes for its introduction, everybody has gone out...(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: Sir, the Minister of State for the Home is present here. ... (Interruptions)

[Translation]

277

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Mumbai-North-East):
You please adjourn the House and call the Minister from Rajya Sabha...(Interruptions)

(English)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Please listen to him.

[Translation]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: If a minister has to introduce the Bill both in Rajya Sabha and Lok Sabha at the same time then, he can not be present in both the Houses simultaneously. There are two ministers in the Ministry of Home Affairs. The Home Minister is engaged in Rajya Sabha. The Minister of State of Home Affairs is present here. What is the objection if he wants to introduce the Bill. He is not the minister of any other department.

[English]

SHRI RAM NAIK: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, now I want to oppose the introduction of the Bill. Let the Minister reply to it.

SHRI ANIL BASU (Arambagh) : Before the introduction how can be oppose it?

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: By giving a notice one can oppose it at the introduction level.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA): I beg to move for leave to introduce a Bill to confer on the President the power of the Legislature of the State of Uttar Pradesh to make laws.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Motion moved

"That leave be granted to introduce a Bill to confer on the President the power of the Legislature of the State of Uttar Pradesh to make laws."

SHRI RAM NAIK: I have given the notice to oppose the Uttar Pradeah State Legislature (Delegation of Powers) Bill. For making laws we are trying to give authority to the President. So, according to the rules, I have given a notice saying that I want to oppose the Bill because it cannot be introduced without complying with certain formalities.

Now what is the issue? I am referring to the rules and to the Directions...(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : No side-talks, please.

Legislature Bill

SHRI RAM NAIK: I am also referring to the Keul and Shakdher with regard to the introduction of a Bill. Rule 64 is relevant here. It pertains to the publications of a Bill in the gazette before the introduction. It says:

"The Speaker may, on request being made to him, order the publication of any Bill in the Gazette although no motion has been made for leave to introduce the Bill. In that case it shall not be necessary to move for leave to introduce the Bill and if the Bill is afterwards introduced, it shall not be necessary..."

So, if the Bill is not published in the Gazette what is to be done is the next alternative because this Bill has not been obviously published in the Gazette. When the Bill is not published in the Gazette and when the Minister wants to introduce it here, the Directions of the Speaker are very important.

I draw your attention to those Directions. Direction No. 19A is with regard to notice for leave to introduce Government Bills. It says:

"(1) A Minister desiring to move for leave to introduce a Biff shall give notice in writing of his intention to do so. (2) The period of notice of a motion for leave to introduce a Biff under this Direction shall be seven days, unless the Speaker allows the motion to be made at shorter notice."

This Bill is dated 12th December. So, definitely seven days' advance notice has not been given in accordance with the Direction. I do not know whether the Speaker has allowed him to introduce the Bill using his discretion. You might be better aware of this. But I am sure that neither such a notice nor the permission has been given because you are naturally trying to adhere to the rules. That is what is expected from the Chair also. When the seven days' notice has not been given in advance by the Minister.

SHRI P.C. THOMAS (Muvattupuzha): I am on a point of order on this.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Let him finish first.

SHRI P.C. THOMAS: At this stage the introduction of the Bill can be opposed only...(Interruptions)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : He can make his submission later.

SHRI P.C. THOMAS: Please hear my point of order first. Sir.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Under what rule?

SHRI P.C. THOMAS; I am referring to Rule 72. As per Rule 72, at this stage the introduction of the Bill can be opposed only on one or two grounds: The first ground

280

is that it is outside the legislative competence of this House and the second ground is that it is unconstitutional. Only on these two grounds the introduction of the Bill can be opposed at this stage. No other ground can be taken up now, if at all, the objections which are being raised are to be heard as a matter between the Speaker and the Government.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please sit down now. I have heard you. Let him complete.

SHRI P.C. THOMAS: I would request for your ruling.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Only the Minister will have to reply. The Minister will reply to it.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM NAIK: It is for the Chair to give a ruling. He has to examine the point. The Minister has to reply and it is for the Chair to give a ruling...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let one person raise the point of order, you raise it later on. Let him complete it first. At least let him complete first.

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI P.C. THOMAS: I would like to say that the hon. Member, Shri Ram Naik - I have a great respect for him - very well knows this rule and knows whether he can oppose it on this point, as stated by him.

At this stage, I would submit that it would be a wrong precedent to allow the objection raised by Shri Ram Naik in this way because rule 72 clearly bars any objection at this stage. It could be allowed only on the point of the legislative competence of the House. My hon, friend, Shri Ram Naik has not raised that objection at all. I would like to submit that under rule 72 this objection could not be raised. Therefore, I would humbly pray for a ruling of the Chair on this point of order first.

SHRI RAM NAIK: On this point of order, I would submit this. I am not at all challenging the Bill on the basis of the Constitution.

I am opposing it because the rules which are to be followed while introducing a Bill have not been followed. I am objecting only on that point.

Now, I am coming to the Direction by Speaker which deals with prior circulation of Bills for introduction. It says:

"No Bill shall be included for introduction in the List of Business...

(interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER : O.K., you have already had your say.

[English]

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM NAIK : Sir, direction 198 says :

"No Bill shall be included for introduction in the list of business for a day until after copies thereof have been made available for the use of Members for at least two days before the day on which the Bill is proposed to be introduced."

This is the point that I am raising. This Bill has been circulated only yesterday. So, this Bill cannot be introduced.

But there is another provision, i am drawing your attention to that provision also. That provision is very important and 'it shall not be included', it says:

"Provided further that in other cases where the Minister desires that the Bill may be introduced earlier than two days after the circulation of copies or even without prior circulation, he shall give full reasons in a memorandum for the consideration of the Speaker explaining as to why the Bill is sought to be introduced without making available to Members copies thereof in advance, and if the Speaker gives permission, the Bill shall be included in the list of business for the day on which the Bill is proposed to be introduced."

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF TOURISM (SHRI SRIKANTA JENA): The Speaker's permission is there.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please, let him conclude.

SHRI RAM NAIK: The provision says that he shall give full reasons. What are the reasons which are given in this memorandum?

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA : That is precisely the business of the Speaker.

SHRI RAM NAIK: I am arguing with the Chair; I am not arguing with you.

Sir, what does this memorandum say? It says, 'There is an Ordinance pertaining to Uttar Pradesh which is required to be replaced by an Act on or before 1.1.1997'. Everybody knows that. But the memorandum does not say which Ordinance has to be replaced. Nothing has been said in the memorandum. And, finally the memorandum says: 'It is requested that direction 198 of the Directions of the Speaker may kindly be relaxed in respect of Uttar Pradesh State (Delegation of Powers) Bill in order to permit the Bill being introduced'. So, no reason has been given as to why the Government wants a relaxation. If the relaxation has been given, I appeal to you that I oppose the introduction.

Legislature Alli

This Government is so lethargic that they do not observe the propriety of what is being done. They say that they do not want a BJP Government to be formed in Uttar Pradesh.

But at the same time, they can bring at least a Bill well in time. The Bill has not been brought in time and it has not been circulated in time. That is why i am opposing this. This cannot be called a reason. At this point, we cannot allow the House to be taken for a ride by this inefficient Government. The rules are there and they have to be followed. On the point of rule, i pray that this Bill should not be allowed to be passed.

(Translation)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: There are two questions here. First, the Home Minister is not present here. He is engaged in the other House. It has been said from here that minister of state is present here. At a times, a minister can be present in one House only. Now the Home Minister has arrived. Secondly, it is not known whether or not the Speaker has accorded the relaxation. I want to inform the House that he has already accorded the relaxation.

(Interruptions)

(English)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur): He cannot question the Speaker's decision...(Interruptions)

SHRI P.C. THOMAS: Rule 72 is very clear. His objection cannot be taken or sustained at this stage. The Speaker has already permitted this. Now, whether the action of the Speaker is correct or not is not to be discussed in the House. That cannot be discussed. That would be improper...(Interruptions)

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE (Dumdum): Sir, even when the Minister of Home was not present, the Minister of State was present. That is the first point. The second point is that the ruling has to be given not by the Minister but by the Chair. So, the ruling to the effect whether the Bill can be introduced or not should be given by the Chair and not by the Minister. Therefore, the question of competence and the level of Minister is not relevant at all. That is my submission.

[Translation]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I have already stated that the Minister of State is already present here, Mr. Speaker, has already accorded the relaxation. You are saying nothing new.

(English)

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: Since you have said that the Cabinet Minister was not here and he has come now. I am making this point...(Interruptions) Even if there is any objection, the ruling to the effect

whether it is constitutionally valid or not has to come from the Chair. The Minister has nothing to do with it...(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM NAIK: Sir, though I am not satisfied with the ruling, I will have to abide by it. I am not going to behave like those persons, those Ministers who do not follow the rules. I know the rules...(Interruptions) That is why when you gave the ruling, I said I will have to abide by it...(Interruptions)

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: This should be expunged...(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM NAIK: What is there to be expunged?...(Interruptions)

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: The words those persons' should be expunged...(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM NAIK: I withdraw those words. Please substitute it with 'hon. Members and hon. Ministers'.

Sir, I can only appeal to you that in future such relaxations should not be given to this incompetent Government...(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE Sir. this is very unfortunate. Shri Ram Naik is not a back bencher. He is a front bencher trying to replace Vajpayedii

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Back benchers are also respectable Members.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Certainly, all of them are respectable.

, in spite of the self-opinionated view of Shri Ram Naik, what he is trying to do is to challenge the ruling of the Speaker...(Interruptions) He is implicitly trying to challenge the ruling of the chair...(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

MR. DÉPUTY-SPEAKER : Please listen to me.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Let me say a few words.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Will you please listen to me?

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Madam Rita Verma ji, will you please listen to me?

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I would like to tell Hon'ble Shri Chatterjee Saheb that on his insistence he has withdrawn his words. However it is not proper to say

284

that he is not a back-bencher. Back-benchers, too, ere hen'ble Members...(Interruptions)

(English)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : It is vary unfortunate. What I said is, Shri Ram Naik, because of hia long experience, is not a back bencher...(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : He is competent enough to do that. He will defend himself.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : But he is occupying a front bench. That is all I wanted to say...(interruptions)

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Allahabad) : I would request Shri Chatteriee to atand up and say that he withdraws it...(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Why? ...(Interruptions)

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI : You are saying that he is not a back bencher as if being a back bencher is not good...(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : If what I said has any unintentional effect, then I withdraw it...(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : He has withdrawn it. So, the matter has ended now.

(interruptions)

SHRI SYED MASUDAL HOSSAIN (Murshidabad) : Hon'ble Former Speaker of this very House often used to say that there is no time for back-benchers that day. He used to repeat these workes quite often. Therefore. there is a precedent to call back-benchers ...(Interruptions)

(English)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : What is the issue now? He has withdrawn and the matter has ended there.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : The question is :

"That leave be granted to introduce a Bill to confer on the President the power of the L'egislature of the State of Uttar Pradesh to make laws."

Those in favour will please say 'Aye.'

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS : 'Aye.'

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Those against will please say 'No.'

SOME HON, MEMBERS : 'No.'

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : I think the 'Ayes' have it. The 'Ayes have it.

SOME HON, MEMBERS : The 'Noss' have it MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Do you want division?

SOME HON, MEMBERS : Yea.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Let the lobbles he cleared-

Now, the Lobbies have been cleared.

Before the division starts, every Members should occupy his or her own seat and operate the system from that seat only.

A Member has to press two buttons simultaneously for casting his or her vote.

One of the buttons to be pressed is on the railing of the bench in front of the Member. It is called the vote Initiation switch.

A Member has also to press one of the three push buttons in front of his or her aeat (green (A) for 'syes', red (N) for 'noes' and yellow (O) for 'abatain') scoording to his or her choice.

The vote initiation switch and one of the three push buttons are to be pressed simultaneously for a duration of ten seconds which is indicated in two ways. First, by a count-down on the total result display board, that is, 10,9,8...0. Second, the period between sounding of two audio-alarma.

The actual process of division starts with the first audio-alarm. A Member should press the buttons only after the first sudio-alarm is heard. After the expiry of ten seconds, the audio-alarm sounds for the second time, when the two buttons being pressed should be released.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : The question is :

"That leave be granted to introduce a Bill to confer on the President the power of the Legislature of the State of Uttar Pradesh to make lawa."

The Lok Sabha divided :

Division No. 1

12.30 hrs.

Ayee

Agarwai, Shri Jai Prakaah Ahmed, Shri M. Kamaluddin Alay Kumar, Shri S. Alagiri, Shri Samy. V. Antulay, Shri Abdul Rehman Anwar, Shri Tariq Bealu, Shri T.R. Banatwalla, Shri G.M.

Banerjee, Kumari Mamata

Barman, Shri Ranen

Barq, Shri Shafiqur Rahman

Basu, Shri Anil

Basu, Shri Chitta

Bauri, Smt. Sandhya

Baxia, Shri Joachim

Begum Noor Bano

Bhagora, Shri Tarachand

Bhagwati Devi, Shrimati

Bhoi, Dr. Kripasindhu

Biswai, Shri Ranjib

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chacko, Shri P.C.

Chatterjee, Shri Nirmal Kanti

Chaudhary, Shrimati Nisha A.

Chavan, Shri Prithviraj D.

Chennithala, Shri Ramesh

Choudhury, Shri Badai

Damor, Shri Somilbhai

Damor, Shir Somjibhai

Das, Shri Bhakta Charan

Das, Prof. Jitendra Nath

Dasmunsi, Shri P.R.

Dennis, Shri N.

Farook, Shri M.O.H.

Giri, Shri Sudhir

Hazarika, Shri Iswar Prasanna

Islam, Shri Nurul

Jos, Shri A.C.

Kandasamy, Shri K.

Karma, Shri Mahendra

Khan, Shri Sunil

Kodikunnil, Shri Suresh

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lahiri, Shri Samik

Magani, Shri Gulam Mohd. Mir

Mahato, Shri Bir Singh

Meena, Shri Bheru Lai

Maena, Shrimati Usha

Maghe, Shri Datta

Mehta, Prof. Ajit Kumar

Meti, Shri H.Y.

Misra, Shri Pinaki

Mukharjea, Shri Subrata

Muniyappa, Shri K.H.

Murmu, Shri Rup Chand

Namgyal, Shri P.

Nandi, Shri Yellalah

Netam, Shrimati Chhabila Arvind

Pal, Dr. Debi Prosad

Panabaka, Shrimati Lakshmi

Panigrahi, Shri Sriballav

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Jang Bahadur Singh

Patil, Shri B.R.

Patnaik, Shri Biju

Pattanayak, Shri Sarat

Pilot, Shri Rajaah

Premchandran, Shri N.K.

Raghavan, Shri V.V.

Rajesh Ranjan alla Pappu Yadav, Shri

Ram Babu, Shri A.G.S.

Ramana, Shri L.

Ramanathan, Shri M.

Ray, Shri Balai Chandra

Reddy, Shri K. Vijaya Bhaskara

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Dr. Y.S. Raja Sakhara

Riyan, Shri Baju Ban

Roy Pradhan, Shri Amar

Sahu, Shri A.C.

Sardar, Shri Madhaba

Scindia, Shri Madhavrao

Selja, Kumari

Shakya, Shri Ram Singh

Silvera, Dr. C.

Sudheeran, Shri V.M.

Sultanpuri, Shri K.D.

Swell, Shri G.G.

Thammineni, Shri Veerabhadram

Thomas, Shri P.C.

Tiriya, Kumari Sushila

Topdar, Shri Tarit Baran

Upendra, Shri P.

Venkateswariu, Prof. Ummareddy

Yadav, Shri D.P. Yadav, Shri Girdhari Yadav, Shri Ramakant Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

Adaul, Shri Anandrao Vithoba Anant Kumar Shri Badade, Shri Bhimrae Vlahnuli Baitha, Shri Mahendra Banshiwal, Shri Shyam Lai Barnaia, Sardar Surjit Singh Bhati, Shri Mahandra Singh Chaubey, Shri Lalmuni Chaudhary, Shri Ram Tahai Choudhary, Shri P.L. Chowdhary, Shri Pankaj Darbar, Shri Chhatar Singh Das, Shri Dwaraka Nath Drona, Shri Jagat Vir Singh Fernandes, Shri George Gadhavi, Shri P.S. Gangwar, Shri Santosh Kumar Geete, Shri Anant Gangaram Jag Mohan, Shri Jai Prakash, Shri Jain, Shri Satya Pal Jaiswal, Shri S.P. Jatia, Dr. Satyanarayan Joshi, Dr. Murii Manohar Joshi, Valdya Dau Dayai Kamal Rani, Shrimati Kumar, Shri V. Dhananjaya Mahajan, Shri Pramod Mahajan, Shrimati Sumitra Mandai, Shri Brahamanand o Maurya, Shri Anand Ratna * Molfah, Shri Hannan Naik, Shri Ram Nimbalkar, Shri Hindurao Naik Nitish Kumar, Shri

Pandey, Dr. Laxminarayan

Paranjpe, Shri Dada Baburao Paranipe, Shri Prakash Vishwanath Paswan, Shri Kameshwar Patel, Shri Vijay Patidar, Shri Rameshwar Premi. Shri Mangal Ram Rana, Shri Kashi Ram Rana, Shri Raju Rawale, Shri Mohan Rawat. Shri Bachi Singh 'Bachda' Sai, Shri Nandkumar Shah, Shri Manabendra Singh, Shri Chandrabhushan Singh, Shri Darbara Singh, Prof. Ompal 'Nidar' Singh, Shri Prahlad Singh, Col. Rao Ram Singh, Shri Sartaj Singh, Shri Satya Deo Sinku, Shri Chitrasen Sonker, Shri Vidyasagar Subhash Chandra Baheria, Shri Swaraj, Shrimati Sushma Tripathi, Lt. Gen. Prakash Mani Uma Bharati, Kumari Verma, Shri R.L.P.

13.00 hra.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER : Subject to the Correction* the result of the division is :

Ayes: 173

Noes: 111

· (Corrected result-Ayes 172, Noes : 111)

* The following members also recorded their votes

Aves

- 1. Shri Indrajit Gupta
- 2. Shri Srikanta Jena
- 3. Shri Kinjarappu Yerran Naidu
- 4. Shri R.L. Jalappa
- 5. Shrimati Kanti Singh
- 6. Shri Ramakant D. Khalap
- 7. Dr. S. Venugopala Chari
- 8. Shri Mohd. Maqbool Dar

Wrongly voted for Noes.

- 9. Shri Chandra Deo Prasad Verma
- 10. Shri Ayyanna Patrudu
- 11. Shri Sukdeo Paswan
- 12. Shri Nawal Kishore Rai
- 13. Shri Sydaiah Kota
- 14. Shri Lal Babu Yadav
- 15. Shri Pitamber Paswan
- 16. Dr. M. Jagannath
- 17. Shri Virendra Kumar Singh
- 18. Shri B.L. Shankar
- 19. Shri P. Kodandaramajah
- 20. Shri N.S.V. Chitthan
- 21. Shri Krishna
- 22. Shri A. Siddaraju
- 23. Shri K. Kandasamy
- 24. Shri P. Theertharaman
- 25. Smt. Ratnmala D Savanoor
- 26. Shri Shivanand Hemappa Kougalgi
- 27. Shrimati Sarada Tadiparthi
- 28. Shri Anchal Das
- 29. Shri Somnath Chatterjae
- 30. Smt. Geeta Mukheriee
- 31. Shri Hannan Moliah
- 32. Shri Sanat Kumar Mandal
- 33. Shri Syed Masudai Hossain
- 34. Shri D. Venugopal
- 35. Shri V.P. Sharmuga Sundaram
- 36. Shri Sode Ramalah
- 37. Shri Keshab Mahanta
- 38. Shri Haradhan Roy
- 39. Shri P.N. Siva
- 40. Shri Pratap Singh
- 41. Shri Tilak Raj Singh
- 42. Dr. K.P. Ramalingam
- 43. Shri V. Ganesan
- 44. Shri P. Sharmugam
- 45. Shri R. Gnanaguruswamy
- 46, Shri Mukhtar Anaes
- 47. Shri Shatrughan Prasad Singh
- 48. Smt. Subhawati Devi
- 49. Shri Harivansh Sahay
- 50. Shri S.P. Udayappan

- 51. Shri Ajay Chakraborty
- 52. Shri Ajay Kumar
- 53. Shri Pramothes Mukherjee
- 54. Shri Bhupinder Singh Hooda
- 55. Shri Sandipan Thorat
- 56. Shri Kallappa Awade
- 57. Shri Bhuma Nagi Reddy
- 58. Shri Mohammad Idris Ali
- 59. Shri Chitturi Ravindra
- 60. Shri Madan Patil
- 61. Shri V. Pradeep Dev
- 62. Shri Giridhar Gamang
- 63. Shri Kalp Nath Rai
- 64. Dr. Girija Vyas
- 65. Shri Paban Singh Ghatowar
- 66. Kumari Frida Topno
- 67. Shri Ishwarbhai Khodabhai Chavada
- 68. Shri Chhitubhai
- 69. Shri Udaysingrao Gaikwad
- 70. Shri Sat Mahajan
- 71. Dr. Atmacharan Raddy
- 72. Shri Th. Chaoba Singh
- 73. Shri Lakshman Singh
- 74. Shri Venkataraman Reddy
- 75. Shri S. Bangarappa

Noes

- 1. Smt. Maneka Gandhi
- 2. Shri Prem Singh Chandumajra
- 3. Shri Surender Singh
- 4. Shri O.P. Jindai
- 5. Shrimati Purnima Verma
- 6. Dr. Ramesh Chand Tomar
- 7. Shri Rajiv Pratap Rudy
- 8. Shri Dhirandra Agarwai
- 9. Dr. Ramvilas Vedanti
- 10. Shri Prabhu Dayai Katheria
- 11. Shri Sureah R. Jadhav
- 12. Shri Munni Lai
- 13. Shri Ashok Pradhan
- 14. Shri Narayan Athawalay
- 15. Shri Thawar Chand Gahlot
- 16. Dr. Ramkrishna Kusmaria

- 17. Shri Shivrei Singh
- 18. Shri Rajaram P. Godase
- 19. Shri Mahavir Vishwakarma
- 20. Shri Uttamaingh Pawar
- 21. Shri M.K. Annaeahlb Patil
- 22. Shri Manharan Lai Pandev
- 23. Shri Aahok Sharma
- 24. Shri Ravinder Kumar Panday
- 25. Shri Braj Mohan Ram
- 26. Shri Vijay Annaji Mude
- 27. Shri Namdao Diwathe
- 28. Shri Aahok Argai
- 29. Shri Virendra Kumar
- 30. Shri Manoj Kumar Sinha
- 31. Shri Madhukar Sarpotdar
- 32. Prof. Raaa Singh Rawat
- 33. Prof. Rita Verma
- 34. Prof. Chaman Lai Gupta
- 35. Shri Ram Nagina Mishra
- 36. Dr. G.R. Sarode
- 37. Shri Rajandra Singh G. Rana
- 38. Shri Chandreah Patel
- 39. Shri Vinay Katiyar
- 40. Dr. Mahadeepak Singh Shakya
- 41. Shrì Rajabhau Thakre
- 42. Shri Kıshan Lai Dilar
- 43. Shri Bhanu Pratap Singh
- 44. Shri Jayainh Chauhan
- 45. Dr. Vallabh Bhai Kathiria
- 46. Shri Ram Shakal
- 47. Shri Nakli Singh
- 48. Dr. Amrit Lai Bharti
- 49. Shri Shri-Ram Chauhan
- 50. Shrì Padamaen Chaudhary

The motion was adapted.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Minister may now introduce the Bill.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA): I introduce ** the Bill.

(English)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Now, Shri Surjit Singh Bamala will speak.

[Translation]

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Allahabad): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I raised a question. In that context. I would like to say that the manner in which the Government has imported wheat, smalls foul. It would not only affect the growers but also the consumers and the Government and also the amount involved. You just cast a glance at today's newspapers. It says:

(English)

"Government bungling led to wheat crisis"

[Translation]

Mr. Deputy Speaker Sir, where is the Hon'ble Food Minister is heading for?...(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: (South Delhi): Hon'ble Minister Sir, this question relates to your Ministry.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: This is an open bungling. You say that we shall import wheat and the standing committees of the Food Ministry say that there is no need of wheat import. I read out for you from today's "indian Express".

[English]

"The Government's decision to hurriedly import 2 million tonnes of wheat has erected a flutter in the Food Ministry with officials pointing out that according to current estimates, stocks for P.D.S. stands at 8.4 million tonne, enough last until May, 1997."

[Translation]

If we have got enough foodgrains stock until May, 1997 then, what is need for this import. The manner in which the import is being carried out, is horrible...(Interruptions) Adjournment Motion Comes first. Shri Barnala ji would also speak. However, why are you feeling uncomfortable? Shri Barnala ji haa given me the opportunity...(Interruptions). The Government has not yet made it clear as to with which company he has signed the agreement, at which place and at what rates. I fear that on the basis of what has published in the newspapers and the rates at international level, after the Sugar Scam, it is going to be another Scam, so to say wheat Scam. The manner in which the Government made the imports of Sugar at an inappropriate time, similarly today wheat import is being carried out at an inappropriate time and at an unrealised rates ...(Interruptions)

[&]quot; introduced with the recommendation of the President."