

PROCUREMENT OF X-ENGINES

[Action Taken by the Government on the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee contained in their 81st Report (17th Lok Sabha)]

MINISTRY OF DEFENCE (INDIAN NAVY)

**COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS
(2024-25)**

THIRD REPORT

EIGHTEENTH LOK SABHA



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

THIRD REPORT

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS
(2024-25)

(EIGHTEENTH LOK SABHA)

PROCUREMENT OF X-ENGINES

[Action Taken by the Government on the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee contained in their 81st Report (17th Lok Sabha)]

MINISTRY OF DEFENCE (INDIAN NAVY)



Presented to Lok Sabha on: 12.12.2024

Laid in Rajya Sabha on: 12.12.2024

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

December 2024/ Agrahayana 1946 (Saka)

CONTENTS

		PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS (2024-25)		(ii)
INTRODUCTION		(iii)
CHAPTER I	Report	1
CHAPTER II	Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government.....	7
CHAPTER III	Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government.....	17
CHAPTER IV	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration.....	18
CHAPTER V	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies/no replies	19

APPENDICES

- I Minutes of the Sitting of the Committee on Public Accounts (2024-25) held on 3rd December, 2024**
- II Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their Eighty First Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha)**

**COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS
(2024-25)**

Shri K. C. Venugopal - Chairperson

MEMBERS

LOK SABHA

2. Shri T. R. Baalu
3. Dr. Nishikant Dubey
4. Shri Jagdambika Pal
5. Shri Jai Parkash
6. Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad
7. Shri C. M. Ramesh
8. Shri Magunta Sreenivasulu Reddy
9. Prof. Sougata Ray
10. Smt. Aparajita Sarangi
11. Dr. Amar Singh
12. Shri Tejasvi Surya
13. Shri Anurag Singh Thakur
14. Shri Balashowry Vallabhaneni
15. Shri Dharmendra Yadav

RAJYA SABHA

16. Shri Ashokrao Shankarrao Chavan
17. Shri Shaktisinh Gohil
18. Dr. K. Laxman
19. Shri Praful Patel
20. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray
21. Shri Tiruchi Siva
22. Shri Sudhanshu Trivedi

Secretariat

1. Dr. Sanjeev Sharma - Joint Secretary
2. Shri Alok Mani Tripathi - Deputy Secretary
3. Shri Vijay Mishra - Executive Officer

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson, Committee on Public Accounts (2024-25) having been authorised by the Committee, do present this Third Report (Eighteenth Lok Sabha) on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee on Public Accounts contained in their Eighty First Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Procurement of X-Engine'.

2. The Eighty First Report was presented to Lok Sabha/laid in Rajya Sabha on 18th December, 2023. Replies of the Government to all the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Report were received. The Committee on Public Accounts considered and adopted the draft Report at their Sitting held on 3rd December, 2024. Minutes of the Sitting are given at Appendix I.

3. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in **bold** in the body of the Report.

4. The Committee also place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the Committee Secretariat and the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

5. An analysis of the action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the 81st Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) is given at Appendix-II

**NEW DELHI:
03 December , 2024
12 Agrahayana 1946 (saka)**

**K.C. VENUGOPAL
Chairperson,
Committee on Public Accounts**

CHAPTER – I

REPORT

This Report of the Committee on Public Accounts deals with the action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Eighty First Report (17th Lok Sabha) on "**Procurement of X-Engines**" based on Para 3.2 of C&AG Report No. 20 of 2022 pertaining to Ministry of Defence (Indian Navy).

2. The Eighty First Report was presented to Lok Sabha and laid in Rajya Sabha on 18th December, 2023. The Report contained six Observations/Recommendations. Action Taken Notes on all the Observations/Recommendations have been received from the Ministry of Defence (Indian Navy) and are categorized as under:

i. Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government:

Para Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 & 6

**Total: 06
Chapter – II**

ii. Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government:

NIL

**Total: 0
Chapter – III**

iii. Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration:

NIL

**Total: 0
Chapter – IV**

iv. Observations/Recommendations in respect of which Government have furnished interim replies/no replies:

NIL

**Total: 0
Chapter –V**

3. The Action Taken Notes furnished by the Ministry of Defence (Indian Navy) on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Eighty First Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) have been reproduced in the relevant chapters of this Report. In the succeeding paragraphs, the Committee have dealt with the Action Taken by the Government on some of their Observations/Recommendations which either need reiteration or merit comments.

4. The Committee desire the Ministry of Defence (Indian Navy) to furnish Action Taken Notes in respect of Observations/Recommendations contained in Chapter I within three months of the presentation of the Report to the Parliament.

Recommendation No. 4 of the 81st Report of the PAC (17th LS)

5. PREVENTION OF RESOURCE WASTAGE

The Committee had appreciated the decision of Indian Navy for taking timely measures in the context of Crimea Annexation. However, they were not inclined to agree with the decision of not reducing the number of X-Engines on account of decommissioning. In Request for Proposal (RFP)s, Indian Navy could consider adding the clause that the number of items may be increased / decreased at the time of final order, if not already included which is a general clause for each tender/Request For Proposal. The Committee had, therefore desired that Indian Navy should prepare standard Tender Document and conduct a thorough and timely review of X-Engines stock levels annually for all depots and initiate the process for procurement, maintenance, re-use, disposal/de-commissioning, as the case may be, and implement corrective measures as per guidelines in Navy Instructions (NI) -2006. The Committee, further, desired that future procurements should be based on actual needs, while simultaneously maintaining a plan for contingency/crisis keeping the national interest paramount.

6. The Ministry of Defence (Indian Navy) in their action taken reply stated as under:-

“In accordance with observations/recommendations of the PAC Report at Para 4 the following necessary actions have been taken by Indian Navy (IN):-

a) General clause in each tender/Request for Proposal for future orders that 'the number items/quantity may be increased or decreased at the time of final order' has been incorporated. Issues arising due to change in quantity post issue of RFP will have to be progressively addressed by the Contracting Authority on case to case basis prior Cost Negotiations as seller might not hold the prices due the necessity of Minimum Order Quantity.

b) Further, review of the X-engine stock level for all depots is being undertaken annually as per *IN* guidelines promulgated in 2014, to initiate the process for procurement, maintenance, re-use, disposal/ de-commissioning, as the case may be. The last review of the stock levels were undertaken in November 2023.

c) All future procurements of X-engines being initiated, will be against BER (Beyond Economical Repair)/ ABER (Anticipated Beyond Economical Repair) maintaining a ratio of 1:2 considering the short life span of X-engines for prompt onboard replacements, catering for actual needs whilst simultaneously maintaining plan for contingency/ crisis keeping the national interest paramount."

7. Audit in their vetting comments stated as under:-

a) "DPM 2009 provides for a Tolerance Clause, enabling the buyer to reserve the right to increase or decrease the quantity of the required item during the period starting from issue of Request for Proposal (RFP) till placement of the contract without any change in term and conditions and prices quoted by the seller. In view of existing enabling clause of DPM 2009 above, PAC may be apprised about the difference between general clause mentioned by the Ministry and tolerance clause as per DPM 2009.

b) The measures taken vis-à-vis outcome would be further watched in audit. "

8. The Ministry in their Updated Action taken reply stated as under:-

"In accordance with observations/ recommendations of the PAC Report at Para 4 the following necessary actions have been taken by Indian Navy (*IN*):-

a) The RFPs previously issued to OEM (prior Feb 2015 in the instant Contracts) had not included 'Tolerance Clause' as per DPM 2009 since Contracts were being concluded as per the format of 'General Agreement dated 04 November 92' between Government of India and OEM. However, in accordance with recommendations of PAC and as brought out by DG Audit (Navy), Tolerance Clause as per DPM 2009 is being included for future orders in each tender/ Request for Proposal.

b) Further, review of the X-engine stock level for all depots is being undertaken annually as per *IN* guidelines promulgated in 2014, to initiate the process for procurement, maintenance, re-use, disposal/ de-commissioning, as the case may be. The last review of the stock levels were undertaken in November 2023.

c) All future procurements of X-engines being initiated, will be against BER (Beyond Economical Repair)/ ABER (Anticipated Beyond Economical Repair) maintaining a ratio of 1:2 considering the short life span of X-engines, for prompt onboard replacements, catering for actual needs whilst simultaneously maintaining plan for contingency/ crisis keeping the national interest paramount.”

9. The Committee in their original report had desired that future procurements should be based on actual needs, while simultaneously maintaining a plan for contingency/crisis keeping the national interest paramount. The Committee note from action taken notes furnished by the Ministry that in accordance with recommendations of PAC and as brought out by DG Audit (Navy), Tolerance Clause as per DPM 2009 is being included for future orders in each tender/ Request for Proposal. The Committee, in this context, are surprised that Tolerance Clause which was already available in DPM 2009 had not been included in RFPs issued prior to February 2015. From the replies furnished by the Ministry of Defence, they do not find substantial difference between the general clause mentioned by the Ministry and tolerance clause as per DPM 2009. The Committee recommend that Ministry may comprehensively review their procurement procedures with a view to ensure that they have final authority to review as well as increase or decrease the quantities at the time of final order in all future orders. The Committee have also been informed that last review of the stock levels for X-Engines were undertaken in November 2023. In this context, the Committee desire to be informed about the details of the reviews undertaken in the last five years with respect to X-engines.

Recommendation No. 5 of the 81st Report of the PAC (17th LS)

ENHANCING 'MAKE IN INDIA' AND RESEARCH & DEVELOPMENT EFFORTS

10. The Committee had appreciated the Indian Navy for Innovative X-Engine Design prepared by their officer(s). Currently the progress is theoretical and its industrial

production and its evaluation for use is yet to be done. The Committee had emphasized the need to expedite actions aimed at achieving indigenous production of X-Engines, aligning with the goals of the 'Make in India' initiative and therefore, recommended that the Indian Navy needs to undertake research and development initiatives to address the current challenges and explore innovative approaches.

11. The Ministry of Defence (Indian Navy) in their action taken reply stated as under:-

“In accordance with observations/ recommendations of the PAC Report at Para 5, *IN* is adopting a multi-pronged approach towards indigenization of components of in-service engines and development of new engines. Few of the initiatives of *IN* are as follows:-

- a) RFP to Indian Industry for Procurement of 1.25 MW Gas Turbine Generators has been issued in Mar 23 and the Proposals of bidders has cleared Technical Evaluation and the case is at FET stage. This will boost the indigenous GT development efforts.
- b) Academia and Industry are pro-actively being engaged by IN to address current challenges in development/ production of Marine Gas Turbine. MoU signed with Indian Industry partner towards development of Indigenous Marine Gas Turbine.”

12. Vetting comments of Audit are as under:-

“ The measures taken vis-à-vis outcome would be further watched in audit.”

13. The Committee had emphasized the need to expedite actions aimed at achieving indigenous production of X-Engines, aligning with the goals of the 'Make in India' initiative and had therefore recommended that the Indian Navy need to undertake research and development initiatives to address the current challenges and explore innovative approaches. In this regard it has been informed by the Ministry that RFP to Indian Industry for Procurement of 1.25 MW Gas Turbine Generators has been issued in Mar 23 and the Proposals of bidders has cleared Technical Evaluation and the case is at FET stage. Further, Academia and Industry are pro-actively being engaged by Indian Navy to address current challenges in development/ production of Marine Gas Turbine. Also Memorandum

of Understanding (MoU) has been signed with Indian Industry partner towards development of Indigenous Marine Gas Turbine. In this context, while appreciating the steps already taken, the Committee recommend that vigorous efforts may be made to achieve concrete results so as to reach self sustenance in this domain within a limited time frame.

CHAPTER – II

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee take note of the critical role played by the X-Engines in achieving high navigational speeds required by the Indian Navy's SS Class Ships. The SS Class Ships are missile corvettes acquired by Indian Navy and integrated into their fleet. These X-Engines have a short life time, thereby, necessitating a sufficient stock for prompt onboard replacements. The Engine provisioning guidelines of 2014 were introduced to address past stock shortages and prevent future stock situations. However, the audit has brought to light several issues regarding the inventory holding of X-Engines, non-consideration of de-commissioned ships while placing order, and non-adherence to stock levels prescribed under NI-2006, which warrant careful scrutiny.

[Observations/Recommendation No.1 of 81st Report of the Committee on Public Accounts (17th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

The Observations/recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee have been noted for compliance.

“This para pertains to understanding of the subject by PAC and states that observations brought out by the audit regarding the inventory holding of X-Engines, non-adherence of de-commissioned ships while placing order and non-adherence to stock levels prescribed under NI-2006 warrant careful scrutiny. “Action Taken on the observations post scrutiny has been elucidated at ATN on SI No. 4; Para 4 of the 81st Report of the Public Accounts Committee.”

Vetting Comments of Audit

No further comments

Updated Action taken reply of the Ministry

Same as 'Action Taken' above

Sd/-
(Vikram Menon)
Rear Admiral
Joint Secretary (Navy & Def Staff)

(Ministry of Defence D (Parliament), MoD ID Note No. H-11013/36/2023)

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee note that the Navy's Instruction is a general guideline and does not cater for equipment specific service requirements. It has been reported that the matter of 'Nil ' stock situation directly affecting the operational capability of the platforms was experienced on four occasions before 2016, that is in 2006, 2009, 2012 and 2013. The only procurement undertaken since 1995 was for two engines in 2009. The Committee also note that the subsequent indents from 2009 to 2013 had all got bunched up and fructified into contracts on four occasions, that is in 2013, 2015 and 2016. The Committee have been informed that the decommissioning of the two ships in 2016 could not be taken into account as it would have resulted in delay in supply of the required X-Engines. Also, the Request for Proposal had already been issued in February, 2015 before the decision to decommission these two ships was taken. It has also been informed that the uncertainty created due to Annexation of Crimea also necessitated early placement of orders to secure the supply chain.

[Observations/Recommendation No.2 of 81st Report of the
Committee on Public Accounts (17th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

This para pertains to understanding of the subject by PAC and no observations were brought out. Hence, no actions have been taken by MoD on this para.

Vetting Comments of Audit

No further comments

Updated Action taken reply of the Ministry

Same as 'Action Taken' above

Sd/-
(Vikram Menon)
Rear Admiral
Joint Secretary (Navy & Def Staff)
(Ministry of Defence D (Parliament), MoD ID Note No. H-11013/36/2023)

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee observe that in all likelihood the procurement decisions in 2015 and 2016 were influenced by geopolitical uncertainties, which necessitated bulk procurement to address potential supply chain-disruptions due to the Crimea crisis. The Committee note the affirmation of the Ministry that there has been no consequential wastage of public money on account of ending of warranty as all the X-Engines have been earmarked for installation within their service *life*. *It has also been stated that the benefits of bulk procurement have been accrued on account of the conclusion of contracts in 2016. The Committee believe that the procurements have ensured operational readiness of SS Class ships in the on-going operational scenario. The Committee desire that the concrete roadmap prepared for the management of X-Engines of these ships may strictly be followed for catering the future requirements.*

[Observations/Recommendation No.3 of 81st Report of the Committee on Public Accounts (17th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

“In accordance with observations/recommendations of the PAC Report at Para 3, the stock position of X-Engines is being annually reviewed for initiation of procurement process and maintenance/overhaul of engines removed from onboard ships towards catering for future requirements of SS class ships.”

Vetting Comments of Audit

“The measures taken vis-à-vis outcome would be further watched in audit.”

Updated Action taken reply of the Ministry

Same as ‘Action Taken’ above

Sd/-
(Vikram Menon)
Rear Admiral
Joint Secretary (Navy & Def Staff)
(Ministry of Defence D (Parliament), MoD ID Note No. H-11013/36/2023)

Observation/Recommendation

PREVENTION OF RESOURCE WASTAGE

The Committee appreciate the decision of Indian Navy for taking timely measures in the context of Crimea Annexation. However, they are not inclined to agree with the decision of not reducing the number of X-Engines on account of decommissioning. In Request for Proposal (RFP)s, Indian Navy could consider adding the clause that the number of items may be increased / decreased at the time of final order, if not already included which is a general clause for each tender/Request For Proposal. The Committee, therefore, desire that Indian Navy should prepare standard Tender Document and conduct a thorough and timely review of X-Engines stock levels annually for all depots and initiate the process for procurement, maintenance, re-use, disposal/de-commissioning, as the case may be, and implement corrective measures as per guidelines in Navy Instructions (NI) -2006. The Committee, further, desire that future procurements should be based on actual needs, while simultaneously maintaining a plan for contingency/crisis keeping the national interest paramount.

[Observations/Recommendation No.4 of 81st Report of the Committee on Public Accounts (17th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

“In accordance with observations/recommendations of the PAC Report at Para 4 the following necessary actions have been taken by Indian Navy (*IN*):-

- a) General clause in each tender/Request for Proposal for future orders that ‘the number items/quality may be increased or decreased at the time of final order’ has been incorporated. Issues arising due to change in quality post issue of RFP will have to be progressively addressed by the Contracting Authority on case to case basis prior Cost Negotiations as seller might not hold the prices due the necessity of Minimum Order Quantity.
- b) Further, review of the X-engine stock level for all depots is being undertaken annually as per *IN* guidelines promulgated in 2014, to initiate the process for procurement, maintenance, re-use, disposal/ de-commissioning, as the case may be. The last review of the stock levels were undertaken in November 2023.

- c) All future procurements of X-engines being initiated, will be against BER (Beyond Economical Repair)/ ABER (Anticipated Beyond Economical Repair) maintaining a ratio of 1:2 considering the short life span of X-engines for prompt onboard replacements, catering for actual needs whilst simultaneously maintaining plan for contingency/ crisis keeping the national interest paramount.”

Audit vetting comments on Ministry's ATNs

- a) DPM 2009 provides for a Tolerance Clause, enabling the buyer to reserve the right to increase or decrease the quantity of the required item during the period starting from issue of Request for Proposal (RFP) till placement of the contract without any change in term and conditions and prices quoted by the seller. In view of existing enabling clause of DPM 2009 above, PAC may be apprised about the difference between general clause mentioned by the Ministry and tolerance clause as per DPM 2009.
- b) The measures taken vis-à-vis outcome would be further watched in audit.

Updated Action Taken

“In accordance with observations/ recommendations of the PAC Report at Para 4 the following necessary actions have been taken by Indian Navy (IN):-

- a) The RFPs previously issued to OEM (prior Feb 2015 in the instant Contracts) had not included ‘Tolerance Clause’ as per DPM 2009 since Contracts were being concluded as per the format of ‘General Agreement dated 04 November 92’ between Government of India and OEM. However, in accordance with recommendations of PAC and as brought out by DG Audit (Navy), Tolerance Clause as per DPM 2009 is being included for future orders in each tender/ Request for Proposal.
- b) Further, review of the X-engine stock level for all depots is being undertaken annually as per IN guidelines promulgated in 2014, to initiate the process for procurement, maintenance, re-use, disposal/ de-commissioning, as the case may be. The last review of the stock levels were undertaken in November 2023.
- c) All future procurements of X-engines being initiated, will be against BER (Beyond Economical Repair)/ ABER (Anticipated Beyond Economical Repair) maintaining

a ratio of 1:2 considering the short life span of X-engines, for prompt onboard replacements, catering for actual needs whilst simultaneously maintaining plan for contingency/ crisis keeping the national interest paramount.”

Sd/-

(Vikram Menon)

Rear Admiral

Joint Secretary (Navy & Def Staff)

(Ministry of Defence D (Parliament), MoD ID Note No. H-11013/36/2023)

Observation/Recommendation

ENHANCING 'MAKE IN INDIA' AND RESEARCH & DEVELOPMENT EFFORTS

The Committee appreciate the Indian Navy for Innovative X-Engine Design prepared by their officer(s). Currently the progress is theoretical and its industrial production and its evaluation for use is yet to be done. The Committee, emphasize the need to expedite actions aimed at achieving indigenous production of X-Engines, aligning with the goals of the 'Make in India' initiative and therefore, recommend that the Indian Navy needs to undertake research and development initiatives to address the current challenges and explore innovative approaches.

[Observations/Recommendation No.5 of 81st Report of the Committee on Public Accounts (17th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

In accordance with observations/ recommendations of the PAC Report at Para 5, *IN* is adopting a multi-pronged approach towards indigenization of components of in-service engines and development of new engines. Few of the initiatives of *IN* are as follows:-

- a) RFP to Indian Industry for Procurement of 1.25 MW Gas Turbine Generators has been issued in Mar 23 and the Proposals of bidders has cleared Technical Evaluation and the case is at FET stage. This will boost the indigenous GT development efforts.
- b) Academia and Industry are pro-actively being engaged by *IN* to address current challenges in development/ production of Marine Gas Turbine. MoU signed with Indian Industry partner towards development of Indigenous Marine Gas Turbine.

Vetting Comments of Audit

“The measures taken vis-à-vis outcome would be further watched in audit.”

Updated Action taken reply of the Ministry

Same as 'Action Taken' above

Sd/-
(Vikram Menon)
Rear Admiral
Joint Secretary (Navy & Def Staff)

(Ministry of Defence D (Parliament), MoD ID Note No. H-11013/36/2023)

Observations/Recommendation

COLLABORATION WITH RELEVANT INDUSTRIES AND ACADEMIC INSTITUTIONS

The Committee are of the opinion that by investing in preservation techniques, specialized lubricants, and equipments/processes required, for innovative storage methods, Indian Navy can mitigate the effects of prolonged inactivity of the X-Engines and enhance their operational reliability. The Committee, therefore, recommend that collaboration with relevant industries and academic institutions may be made for exploring the best storage practices. Further, training of manpower may also be undertaken for the purpose.

[Observations/Recommendation No.6 of 81st Report of the Committee on Public Accounts (17th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

In accordance with observations/ recommendations of the PAC Report at Para 6, *IN* is adopting the latest storage and preservation practices of X-engines. The same has been implemented for the first time in 2022 on one engine and is progressively being implemented pan Navy. The X-engines can be stored in Depots/ Yards with proper preservation techniques for a maximum inactive duration of 20 years (subject to re-preservation every 5 years) as authenticated by OEM.

Vetting Comments of Audit

No further comments

Updated Action taken reply of the Ministry

Same as 'Action Taken' above

Sd/-
(Vikram Menon)
Rear Admiral
Joint Secretary (Navy & Def Staff)
(Ministry of Defence D (Parliament), MoD ID Note No. H-11013/36/2023)

CHAPTER III

**OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT
DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES RECEIVED FROM THE
GOVERNMENT**

NIL

CHAPTER IV

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION

NIL

CHAPTER V

**OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH GOVERNMENT
HAVE FURNISHED INTERIM REPLIES/NO REPLIES**

NIL

**NEW DELHI:
03 December , 2024
12 Agrahayana 1946 (saka)**

**K.C. VENUGOPAL
Chairperson,
Committee on Public Accounts**

APPENDIX-I

MINUTES OF THE EIGHTH SITTING OF THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS (2024-25) HELD ON 03rd DECEMBER 2024

The Committee on Public Accounts sat on Tuesday, the 3rd of December 2024, from 1600 hrs to 1745 hrs in Committee Room '3', Block A, First Floor, Extension to Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri K.C. Venugopal - Chairperson

Members

LOK SABHA

2. Dr. Nishikant Dubey
3. Shri Jagdambika Pal
4. Shri Jai Parkash
5. Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad
6. Shri C. M. Ramesh
7. Shri Magunta Sreenivasulu Reddy
8. Smt. Aparajita Sarangi
9. Dr. Amar Singh
10. Shri Tejasvi Surya
11. Shri Anurag Singh Thakur
12. Shri Balashowry Vallabhaneni
13. Shri Dharmendra Yadav

RAJYA SABHA

14. Shri Shaktisinh Gohil
15. Dr. K. Laxman
16. Shri Praful Patel
17. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray
18. Shri Tiruchi Siva
19. Shri Sudhanshu Trivedi

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

1. Dr. Sanjeev Sharma - Joint Secretary
2. Shri Muraleedharan. P - Director
3. Shri Alok Mani Tripathi - Deputy Secretary
4. Shri Pankaj Sharma - Deputy Secretary
5. Shri Atul Bhawe - Deputy Secretary

REPRESENTATIVES OF THE OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER AND AUDITOR GENERAL OF INDIA

1. Sh. Rebecca Mathai - Dy. CAG
2. Ms. Atreyee Das - Dy. CAG
3. Ms. Smita S. Chaudhari - Dy. CAG
4. Sh. Samar Kant Thakur - Director General

REPRESENTATIVES OF THE MINISTRY OF XXXXXX

1. XXXXXXXXXXXX
2. XXXXXXXXXXXX
3. XXXXXXXXXXXX
4. XXXXXXXXXXXX
5. XXXXXXXXXXXX
6. XXXXXXXXXXXX
7. XXXXXXXXXXXX
8. XXXXXXXXXXXX
9. XXXXXXXXXXXX

PART A

XXXXX XXXXX XXXXX XXXXX XXXXX XXXXX

PART B

Thereafter, Hon'ble Chairperson stated that the following six draft reports may be taken up for consideration and adoption :-

- a) XXXXX
- b) XXXXX
- c) Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/ Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their 81st Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on "Procurement of X-Engines";
- d) XXXX
- e) XXXXX
- f) XXXXXX

After some deliberations, the Committee adopted the aforesaid Draft Reports without any modifications and authorised the Chairperson to finalise the Reports in the light of factual verification done by the Audit.

The Committee then adjourned.

A copy of the transcript of audio recording of the proceedings of the sitting has been kept on record.

APPENDIX-II
(Vide Paragraph 5 of Introduction)

ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS CONTAINED IN THEIR EIGHTY FIRST REPORT (SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)

- | | |
|--|--------------------------------------|
| (i) Total number of Observations/Recommendations | 06 |
| (ii) Observations/Recommendations of the Committee which have been accepted by the Government:
Para Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6 | Total: 06
Percentage: 100 |
| (iii) Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the reply of the Government:
Para No. – NIL | Total: 0
Percentage: 0 |
| (iv) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration:
Para No. – NIL | Total: 0
Percentage: 0 |
| (v) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies:
Para No. – NIL | Total: 0
Percentage: 0 |