

# **LOK SABHA DEBATES**

## **(English Version)**

**Fourteenth Session**  
**(Fifteenth Lok Sabha)**



*(Vol. XXXV contains Nos. 11 to 21)*

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT**  
**NEW DELHI**

*Price : Rs. 115.00*

## **EDITORIAL BOARD**

### **Snehlata Shrivastava**

Secretary-General

Lok Sabha

### **Anita B. Panda**

Joint Secretary

### **Usha Jain**

Director

### **J.B.S. Rawat**

Additional Director

### **Kaveri Jeswal**

Joint Director

### **R.K. Mair**

Editor

## **© 2013 Lok Sabha Secretariat**

None of the material may be copied, reproduced, distributed, republished, downloaded, displayed, posted or transmitted in any form or by any means, including but not limited to, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission of Lok Sabha Secretariat. However, the material can be displayed, copied, distributed and downloaded for personal, non-commercial use only, provided the material is not modified and all copyright and other proprietary notices contained in the material are retained.

---

Original English proceedings included in English Version will be treated as authoritative and not the English translation of the speeches made in Hindi and other languages included in it. For complete authoritative version please see Original Version of Lok Sabha Debates.

### **INTERNET**

The Original version of Lok Sabha proceedings is available on Parliament of India Website at the following address :

<http://www.parliamentofindia.nic.in>

<http://www.Loksabha.nic.in>

### **LIVE TELECAST OF PROCEEDINGS OF LOK SABHA**

Lok Sabha proceedings are being telecast live on Lok Sabha T.V. Channel. Live telecast begins at 11 A.M. everyday the Lok Sabha sits, till the adjournment of the House.

### **LOK SABHA DEBATES ON SALE**

Printed copies of Lok Sabha Debates of Original version, English version, Hindi version and indices thereto, DRSCs reports and other Parliamentary Publications and Souvenir items with logo of Parliament are available for sale at the Sales Counter, Reception, Parliament House, (Tel. Nos. 23034726, 23034495, 23034496) New Delhi-110001. The information about all these publications and items is also available on the websites mentioned above.

---

---

© 2013 By Lok Sabha Secretariat

Published under Rules 379 and 382 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha  
(Fourteenth Edition) and Printed by Chaudhary Mudran Kendra, Delhi-110 053

---

---

## CONTENTS

*Fifteenth Series, Vol. XXXV, Fourteenth Session, 2013/1935 (Saka)*  
**No. 19, Wednesday, September 4, 2013/Bhadrapada 13, 1935 (Saka)**

SUBJECT	COLUMNS
PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE .....	1
MESSAGE FROM RAJYA SABHA .....	2
COMMITTEE ON MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT LOCAL AREA DEVELOPMENT SCHEME (LOK SABHA) Statement .....	2
MOTION RE: JOINT PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE TO EXAMINE MATTERS RELATING TO ALLOCATION AND PRICING TELECOM LICENCES AND SPECTRUM - EXTENSION OF TIME .....	2
MATTERS UNDER RULE 377	
(i) Need to provide drinking water in Jaitaran in Rajasthan from Indira Gandhi Canal Project Shri Gopal Singh Shekhawat .....	3-4
(ii) Need to set up Terminal Market at Sambalpur in Odisha Shri Amarnath Pradhan .....	4
(iii) Need to undertake repair of National Highway No. 37 from Barak to Kambiron Dr. Thokchom Meinya .....	4-5
(iv) Need to provide adequate health care facilities in ESI hospital at Mukkudal, Tirunelveli district, Tamil nadu Shri S.S. Ramasubbu .....	5
(v) Need to review the plan of setting up of Bio-diversity Park in Yamuna Khadar region in Delhi Shri Jai Prakash Agarwal .....	5-6
(vi) Need to develop the sites of Buddhist monuments and caves in the country as tourist destinations Shri Eknath Mahadeo Gaikwad .....	6-7
(vii) Need to increase the pension under Employees Pension Scheme, 1995 Shri M.K. Raghavan .....	7
(viii) Need to train the youth of Cuddalore district of Tamil Nadu to avail the benefits of National Rural Livelihood Mission Shri S. Alagiri .....	8

## SUBJECT

## COLUMNS

(ix) Need to impress upon the Government of Bangladesh to ensure safety and security of Hindus and other minority communities living there Shri Kabindra Purkayastha .....	8-9
(x) Need to provide stoppage of superfast AC train running between Bhuj and Mumbai at Samkhairi railway station in Kutch district of Gujarat Shrimati Poonam Veljibhai Jat .....	9
(xi) Need to expedite gauge conversion work of Ratlam-Fatehabad-Indore-Mhow-Khandwa-Amalakhurd-Akot-Akola section Shri Sanjay Dhotre .....	9
(xii) Need to provide full benefit of educational loan by State Bank of India to students of Indian Maritime University, Kolkata, West Bengal Shri Hari Manjhi .....	10
(xiii) Need to take necessary measures for construction of sewerage and drainage system under Jawahar Lal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission in Fatehpur city in Uttar Pradesh Shri Rakesh Sachan .....	10-11
(xiv) Need to address the problems of women working as cooks under mid-day meal scheme in schools in Uttar Pradesh Shri Ramashankar Rajbhar .....	11-12
(xv) Need to open branches of Nationalised Banks in Samastipur parliamentary constituency, Bihar Shri Maheshwar Hazari .....	12
(xvi) Need to convert National Highway No. 60 in Birbhum parliamentary constituency in West Bengal into a four lane road Shrimati Shatabdi Roy .....	12-13
(xvii) Need to set up Research and Development Centres and colleges in the field of agriculture, horticulture, fisheries and rubber in Kanyakumari district of Tamil Nadu Shrimati J. Helen Davidson .....	13-14
(xviii) Need to provide immediate financial assistance to Kerala distressed due to heavy rains Shri P. Karunakaran .....	14

SUBJECT	COLUMNS
(xix) Need to provide funds for construction of building for Kendriya Vidyalaya at Bhadrak in Odisha Shri Arjun Charan Sethi .....	14
(xx) Need to increase the Minimum Support Price of Jute Shri Nripendra Nath Roy .....	14-15
<b>SUBMISSION BY MEMBERS</b>	
Re: Need to resolve the issue of reservation policy for SC/ST/OBC for applying to newly created AIIMS like institutions and other institutes in the country .....	37-43
<b>PENSION FUND REGULATORY AND DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY BILL, 2011</b>	
Shri P. Chidambaram .....	47-51
.....	111-116
Shri Sanjay Nirupam .....	51-54
Prof. Saugata Roy .....	54-56
Shri Shailendra Kumar .....	56-58
Shri T.K.S. Elangovan .....	58-61
Shri Basu Deb Acharia .....	80-85
Shri Nishikant Dubey .....	85-91
.....	92-95
Shri Dara Singh Chauhan .....	95-96
Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab .....	96-100
Shri Anant Gangaram Geete .....	100-101
Shri S. Semmalai .....	101-102
Shri Gurudas Dasgupta .....	102-106
Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad Singh .....	107-108
Shri Name Nageswara Rao .....	109
Shri Narhari Mahato .....	110
Dr. Thokchom Meinya .....	110-111
Clauses 2 to 55 and 1 .....	116-149
Motion to Pass .....	149-157

## BUSINESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

52nd Report .....	106-108
-------------------	---------

## DISCUSSION UNDER RULE 193

Government of India's response and measures taken for relief and reconstruction in the wake of natural disaster in Uttarakhand

Shrimati Sushma Swaraj .....	158-171
Shri Satpal Maharaj .....	171-178
Shri Shailendra Kumar .....	183-186
Shri Jagdish Singh Rana .....	186-188
Shri Mahendrasinh P. Chauhan .....	188-189
Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal .....	189
Shri Sharad Yadav .....	190-191
Prof. Saugata Roy .....	191-194
Shrimati J. Helen Davidson .....	194-196
Sk. Saidul Haque .....	196-199
Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab .....	199-202
Shrimati Pratibha Singh .....	202-204
Dr. Sanjeev Ganesh Naik .....	204-206
Shri C. Sivasami .....	206-207
Shri Nama Nageswara Rao .....	207-210
Shri Sanjay Singh Chauhan .....	210-211
Shri Prabodh Panda .....	211-214
Shri Jagadanand Singh .....	214-216
Shri Prem Das Rai .....	216-217
Shrimati Mala Rajya Lakshmi Shah .....	217-220
Shri Pradeep Tamta .....	220-226
Shri N. Peethambara Kurup .....	226-227
Shri Rajendra Agarwal .....	227-228
Shri Mullapally Ramachandran .....	228-239
Shri Sushilkumar Shinde .....	240-241

## RIGHT TO INFORMATION (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2013

MOTION TO CONSIDER .....	180
SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY .....	180-182



## **OFFICERS OF LOK SABHA**

### **THE SPEAKER**

Shrimati Meira Kumar

### **THE DEPUTY SPEAKER**

Shri Karia Munda

### **PANEL OF CHAIRMEN**

Shri Basu Deb Acharia

Shri P.C. Chacko

Shrimati Sumitra Mahajan

Shri Inder Singh Namdhari

Shri Francisco Cosme Sardinha

Shri Arjun Charan Sethi

Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad Singh

Dr. M. Thambidurai

Shri Satpal Maharaj

Shri Jagdambika Pal

### **SECRETARY GENERAL**

Shri S. Bal Shekar



## LOK SABHA DEBATES

---

### LOK SABHA

Wednesday, September 4, 2013/Bhadrapada 13,  
1935 (Saka)

*The Lok Sabha met at Eleven of the Clock*

[MADAM SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Papers to be laid on the Table of the House.

...(Interruptions)

#### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FOOD PROCESSING INDUSTRIES (SHRI TARIQ ANWAR): I beg to lay on the table a copy of each of the following Notifications (Hindi and English versions) under Section 3 of the Essential Commodities Act, 1955:-

- (1) S.O. 2474(E) published in Gazette of India dated 16th August, 2013 notifying the specifications, mentioned therein, in respect of provisional fertilizer Zink Poly Phosphate to be manufactured in India for a period of two years from the date of publication of this notification.

[Placed in Library, See No. LT 9710/15/13]

- (2) The Fertilizer (Control) Third Amendment Order, 2013 published in Notification No. S.O. 2475(E) in Gazette of India dated 16th August, 2013.

[Placed in Library, See No. LT 9711/15/13]

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT (SHRI P. BALRAK NAIK): I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Memorandum of Understanding (Hindi and English versions) between the National Handicapped and Finance Development Corporation and the Department of Disability Affairs, Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment, for the year 2013-2014.

[Placed in Library, See No. LT 9712/15/13]

11.01 hrs.

#### MESSAGE FROM RAJYA SABHA

[English]

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Madam Speaker, I have to report a message received from the Secretary-General of Rajya Sabha:-

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 127 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to inform the Lok Sabha that the Rajya Sabha at its sitting held on the 2nd September, 2013 agreed without any amendment to the National Food Security Bill, 2013 which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 26th August, 2013."

11.01½ hrs.

#### COMMITTEE ON MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT LOCAL AREA DEVELOPMENT SCHEME (LOK SABHA)

[English]

#### Statement

SHRI RUDRAMADHAB RAY (Kandhamal): I beg to lay the statement (Hindi and English versions) of Final Action Taken replies of the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation on the recommendations contained in the 8th Report (15th Lok Sabha) of the Committee on MPLADS regarding Action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the 4th Report of the Committee on the subject "Effective monitoring of the MPLAD Scheme to avoid delays in execution of the MPLADS works".

11.02 hrs.

#### MOTION RE: JOINT PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE TO EXAMINE MATTERS RELATING TO ALLOCATION AND PRICING OF TELECOM LICENCES AND SPECTRUM - EXTENSION OF TIME

[English]

SHRI P.C. CHACKO (Thrissur): I beg to move:

"That this house do extend up to the last day of the next Session, the time for presentation of the report of the Joint Parliamentary Committee to examine matters relating to allocation and pricing of telecom licences and spectrum."

MADAM SPEAKER: The question is:

"That this house do extend up to the last day of the next Session, the time for presentation of the report of the Joint Parliamentary Committee to examine matters relating to allocation and pricing of telecom licences and spectrum."

*The motion was adopted.*

11.03 hrs.

MATTERS UNDER RULE 377\*

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, the Matters under Rule 377 shall be laid on the Table of the House. Members who have been permitted to raise matters under Rule 377 today and are desirous of laying them, may personally hand over slips at the Table of the House within twenty minutes. Only those matters shall be treated as laid for which slips have been received at the Table within the stipulated time. The rest will be treated as lapsed.

...(Interruptions)

**(i) Need to provide drinking water in Jaitaran in Rajasthan from Indira Gandhi Canal Project**

[Translation]

SHRI GOPAL SINGH SHEKHAWAT (Rajsamand): There is acute problem of drinking water in Jaitaran Assembly Constituency in my Parliamentary Constituency, Rajsamand (Rajasthan). Whatever little quantity of ground water is available there, it is contaminated with fluoride. The Government has proposed to connect this area with "Jawai Bandh". A scheme has already been formulated to supply water to various places of Pali district from Jawai Bandh and as such it will not be possible to supply water to the distant places like this. So it is my request to the Government that Jaitaran be connected with Indira Gandhi

\*Treated as laid on the Table.

Canal Project because the water from Indira Gandhi Canal has already reached Jasnagar and Kharia of Nagor and Jodhpur respectively, which are adjacent Jaitaran.

**(ii) Need to set up Terminal Market at Sambalpur in Odisha**

[English]

SHRI AMARNATH PRADHAN (Sambalpur): The farmers of Sambalpur and the neighbouring districts are facing difficulties of storage facility of their agricultural produce as 30% of their harvest presently going waste due to lack of high tech storage facility at Sambalpur. I am thankful to hon'ble Minister of Agriculture who had announced in Lok Sabha on 8th December, 2009 for setting up of Terminal Market at Sambalpur in order to ensure good support price to farmers as this Terminal Market will have all modern facilities to minimize waste while collecting agricultural produce from farm gate to storage gate. I request the Government to start this Terminal Market as this will be the best gift to the farmers of Sambalpur and entire western Odisha region by the UPA Government.

**(iii) Need to undertake repair of National Highway No. 37 from Barak to Kambiron**

DR. THOKCHOM MEINYA (Inner Manipur): BRTF/BRO has sought three days' time for repairing the worst section (from Barak to Kambiron) of NH-37 connecting Manipur with the rest of the country. Accordingly, movement of vehicles along the highway was prohibited from 21 to 23 August, 2013.

But when around 900 trucks left Jiribam for Imphal on 28 August, the highway section was found in the same condition as was before August 21. On that day, a large number of trucks loaded with fertilizers, rice, cement and other assorted goods were heading for Imphal. While some 100 trucks could somehow cross the Barak-Kambiron section with much struggle, some of the trucks plying behind got stuck in this sloughy section of the NH. Consequently, around 800 trucks have been stranded at Barak, Sibilong and Nung Dolan. Recently hon'ble Union Minister of State for Home Affairs had also inspected the condition of NH-37 along with hon'ble CM

of Manipur. Now I seek to inform you that construction of this NH-37 (53) was started in the beginning of 60s. Even after 50 years, this 222 km. long NH could not be constructed as an all weather road. I urge the Union Government to kindly repair the damaged section of N.H. 37. The construction of NH-37 (53) may also be expedited and make it an all weather road.

**(iv) Need to provide adequate health care facilities in ESI hospital at Mukkudal, Tirunelveli district, Tamil Nadu**

SHRI S.S. RAMASUBBU (Tirunelveli): At Mukkudal in my Tirunelveli District, Tamil Nadu, an ESI Hospital is functioning. It serves to a large number of villages Viz., Mukkudal, Alangulam, Kadayam, Pappakkudi Unions, etc. comprising of more than 60 villages. The poor people in this region are mostly engaged in the beedi industries and used to avail medical facilities from this hospital only.

However, this hospital is lacking certain basic facilities such as doctors, nurses, technicians, supporting staff, essential medicines, etc. It is having only 4 doctors out of the sanctioned strength of 14. Adequate number of specialists are also not available. About 400 patients are daily coming for treatment in the OPD. There are reports that even available doctors are not taking proper care of the patients. Though infrastructure is adequately available, because of scarcity of trained professionals, existing facilities are not being utilized properly. Salary given to the medical professionals is also consolidated i.e. very less. It is one of the biggest hospitals in this region. As a result, the poor workers are facing a lot of difficulties and they are also not able to afford huge cost of medicines and treatment from outside.

I shall, therefore, humbly urge upon the Union Government to improve the facilities and appoint adequate number of doctors, nurses and other allied medical staff at the ESI hospital, Mukkudal, Tirunelveli District, Tamil Nadu without delay which will benefit a large number of poor beedi workers in this region.

**(v) Need to review the plan of setting up of Bio-diversity Park in Yamuna Khadar region in Delhi**

[*Translation*]

SHRI JAI PRAKASH AGARWAL (North East Delhi): The land from Wazirabad to Okhla Barrage of Yamuna

Khadar was allotted to the poor, backward and landless farmers of Delhi through society on lease basis by the first Prime Minister Late Shri Jawahar Lal Nehru in 1949 under "Grow More Food" campaign.

The farmers not only made this area green but also conserved it. They made available to the Delhiites fresh vegetables, fruits, flowers and food grains by cultivating this land. Now the Delhi Development Authority proposes to make a bio-diversity park on the khadar land by acquiring it from farmers.

It is known to all that the entire land lies in the Yamuna river area where floods come every year. Since the farmers grow different seasonal crops, that land serves the purpose of a park only. In that case, it is not fair to develop a bio-diversity park in the Yamuna Khadar area. The country needs more employment than the parks and in the name of development of park, it is not proper to acquire the land of poor farmers. By doing so their means of livelihood will be snatched and they will reach at the stage of starvation.

It is also pertinent to mention that the 9792 hectare land of Yamuna Khadar recharges the ground water and the sand of Yamuna purifies the water like a sponge and makes it available to the residents of the capital. If in the name of bio-diversity any pucca work is done here the sand recharging capacity of Yamuna will come to a stand still as a result of which, drinking water problem will arise before the Delhiites.

In view of the above, I urge the Government to cancel the plan of developing a bio-diversity park in the Yamuna Khadar area and allow the farmers to continue farming on that land.

**(vi) Need to develop the sites of Buddhist monuments and caves in the country as tourist destinations**

SHRI EKNATH MAHADEV GAIKWAD (Mumbai South Central): I want to draw the attention of the Government to the Buddhist monuments and caves in the country. Madam, there are about 772 Buddhist monuments sites in the country. Very few of them are maintained by the Government. Most of the Buddhist Monuments sites and caves are in dilapidated condition. There are about 60 Buddhist caves in Karad in district Satara of Maharashtra which are in a dilapidated condition. The committee

constituted by Bihar State for Baudh Vihars in Bodh Gaya is dominated by Hindu members.

So, I demand from the Government that all the Buddhist monuments and caves in the country be developed as tourist place and in the committee constituted for Bodh Vihars of Bodh Gaya should have members of Buddhist community only.

**(vii) Need to increase the pension under Employees Pension Scheme, 1995**

[English]

SHRI M.K. RAGHAVAN (Kozhikode): There are around 35 lakh pensioners under the Employees Pension Scheme, 1995. More than 80% of these pensioners receive paltry sum as pension which is even Re. 1/- in a good number of cases. This is a mockery of the whole system of pension itself.

There has been a demand to fix a moderate pension scheme for these pensioners. It is under such a necessity that the Central Board of Trustees (CBT) EPFO on the recommendations of the Expert Committee dated 12th June 2009 had recommended a minimum of Rs. 1000/- as pension to these pensioners. It is understood that the CBT have further recommended the following:-

(a) the existing Government contribution to EPS, 1995 to be raised from the existing 1.6% to 1.79% so as to increase the minimum pension to Rs.1000/-; and (b) the additional cost involved could be met by withdrawing grant of two year bonus after completion of 20 years. This will also provide relief up to 5% to those pensioners who are drawing pension of Rs.1000/- and more.

The Government has been introducing various welfare measures including the Food Security Bill, etc as a social commitment to the citizens. While there is a suggestion for increasing the minimum pension to Rs.1000/- as part of the social commitment it is suggested that this amount is too less in the present context and it should be increased to Rs.3000/- per month.

In view of the same, it is requested to consider the subject matter as a welfare measure and sanction Rs. 3000/- as pension to the EPF beneficiaries. This will give a larger security cover to 35 lakh working class.

**(viii) Need to train the youth of Cuddalore district of Tamil Nadu to avail the benefits of National Rural Livelihood Mission**

SHRI S. ALAGIRI (Cuddalore): The Government launched the National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM) to improve the living standard of people living in rural areas. The number of trained youth came down to 356 in 2011-12 in comparison to trained youth in 2010-2011 in Cuddalore district resulting in deprivation of the large illiterate youth from availing the scheme of NRLM. The preference be given to local youth for training because the local youth is fully aware of location and condition of village where they are placed to work.

In this regard, it is requested that training may be given to the youth as per requirement of local people in Cuddalore district.

**(ix) Need to impress upon the Government of Bangladesh to ensure safety and security of Hindus and other minority communities living there**

SHRI KABINDRA PURKAYASTHA (Silchar): Unfortunately, atrocities like targeted attack against temples, open theft of Hindu property and rape of Hindu women and enticements to convert to Islam have increased sharply in recent years after the Jamaat-e-Islami joined the coalition Government led by the Bangladesh National Party. It is said that the Jamaat is totally and openly backed by Pakistan and the ISI. On the other, there is terrorist outfit like Huji. With the help of the BNP, anti minority forces have started heinous acts against Hindus and Buddhists.

The International Crime Tribunal of Bangladesh sentenced to death Delwar Hussain Sayeedi, the vice President of Jamaat-e-Islami who is notoriously known for his hatred for non-muslims. The people of Bangladesh rose in protest against the verdict of the Tribunal. This movement was led by Jamaat-e-Islami and BNP. It is so unfortunate that the main purpose of the protest is to attack Hindus and Buddhists and destroy their houses and businesses, vandalize their temples, set them on fire and rape the Hindu women. Many Hindus and Buddhists had to flee to India for safety of lives and their

women folk. The criminal attacks on Hindus took place mainly in Chittagong Division and districts scattered all over the Bangladesh.

I request the Government of India to take up seriously the matter with the Government of Bangladesh to ensure safety of Hindus and other minorities and also protect their business, property and honour.

**(x) Need to provide stoppage of superfast AC train running between Bhuj and Mumbai at Samkhairi railway station in Kachchh district of Gujarat**

SHRIMATI POONAM VELJIBHAI JAT (Kachchh): I request the Hon'ble Railway Minister that there is need to provide a stoppage of Superfast AC train running between Bhuj and Mumbai at Samkhairi railway station in the Kachchh district of Gujarat.

**(xi) Need to expedite gauge conversion work of Ratlam-Fatehabad-Indore-Mhow-Khandwa-Amalakhurd-Akot-Akola section**

SHRI SANJAY DHOTRE (Akola): The gauge conversion of Ratlam-Fatehabad-Indore-Mhow-Khandwa-Amalakhurd-Akot-Akola section popularly known as North-South Link was sanctioned in the year 2008-09. However, the most important section of the project i.e. Akola-Khandwa has not been completed till date despite the fact that the rate of return of this section is 25.02 per cent, the highest ever in the history of Railways. It is also a fact that the development work of backward regions of Malwa, Vidarbha, Marathwada and Telangana will be affected in the absence of such North-South Link.

The recent collapse/closure of Sewagram-Nagpur section for 3-5 days due to heavy rainfall and washing away of bridge and accumulation of soil under the tracks have thrown the Indian Railways out of gear causing large scale hardships to the passengers and residents of the affected regions. It has now become imperative that the work of gauge conversion of the Akola-Khandwa section, an important section of North-South Link, may be completed at the earliest to protect the interests of the passengers, residents and to give impetus to the development work of the backward regions.

**(xii) Need to provide full benefit of educational loan by State Bank of India to students of Indian Maritime University, Kolkata, West Bengal**

*[Translation]*

SHRTI HARI MANJHI (Gaya): The Government of India makes available education loans to such talented students of poor families, who are undertaking their higher studies in other states so that they do not face any financial hardship. As a result thereof, thousands of poor and talented students are able to continue their studies in various education institutions of the country and shape their future. No doubt, it is a commendable decision of the Government. But some banks have made the procedure of sanctioning the loan very complex due to which the number of beneficiaries of the scheme is reduced.

Such thing is happening in the Indian Maritime University, Kolkata campus which is one of the apex educational Institution of the country. The Alipur Branch of the State Bank of India gives maximum loan of Rs. 9 lakh to the students of the above mentioned institution for various courses, but this year this amount has been reduced to 7 lakh. Now when there is a rise in inflation, it is beyond reason to reduce the amount of loan. Earlier the procedure of sanctioning the loan was simple but now it is becoming more complex. The guardians are now being asked to produce No Objection Certificate from the nearby bank of their residence, whereas earlier this was done by the bank itself.

**(xiii) Need to take necessary measures for construction of sewerage and drainage system under Jawahar Lal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission in Fatehpur city in Uttar Pradesh**

SHRI RAKESH SACHAN (Fatehpur): No scheme has been sanctioned so far under Jawahar Lal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission for my constituency Fatehpur. Estimates of Rs. 275 crore for sewage work and of Rs. 150 crore for drainage work in Fatehpur city are pending with the steering committee of the state. Population of Fatehpur city is about two and a half lakh but sewerage system has not been constructed here so far as a result

of which, drains remain full of dirty water and in the absence of drainage system this dirty water collects in open space due to which mosquito menace has increased and different kinds of diseases are spreading. In the absence of drainage system for dirty water of the city, the residents of Fatehpur city have built underground sock pits inside and outside their homes for dirty water, consequently underground water of the city is also getting contaminated. Ground water is supplied for drinking in the city and people in the city are contracting different diseases like kidney disease due to consumption of this contaminated water. In the absence of drainage system, the environment of city is also getting polluted due to which the life of the citizens of Fatehpur has become hellish.

Therefore, I demand from the Ministry of Urban Development of Government of India that the two proposals for sewerage and drainage system under Jawahar Lal nehru National Urban Renewal Mission for Fatehpur city which are pending with the steering committee of the state, be called back and sanctioned at the earliest so that the work of sewerage and drainage system in Fatehpur city could be undertaken at the earliest. With these two works in Fatehpur city, the citizens can be saved from living a hellish life and environment can also be saved from pollution.

**(xiv) Need to address the problems of women working as cooks under mid-day meal scheme in schools in Uttar Pradesh**

SHRI RAMASHANKAR RAJBHAR (Salempur): The Mid-day meal Scheme is being implemented in the country. Cooks have been appointed in all the primary schools. Under this scheme, when good quality raw material is not supplied, how can these cooks prepare quality food? If these cooks point out the bad quality of the raw material, many children can be saved from falling ill and dying due to consumption of food under this scheme. But if they do so, they face the wrath of their employers and they are sacked. That is why they are forced to cook the bad quality food. Not only this, a Government order has been issued in Uttar Pradesh that only that cook will prepare food in a school whose child studies in that school. Now, let us think about it. The cooks are appointed in the schools when this scheme

was introduced. These cooks were the women and widows of the age group of 25 years to 50 years. After making them work for several years, they are being sacked because their children are not studying in those schools. No Government order is issued regarding their salary. I urge the Central Government to streamline the mid-day meal scheme and solve the problems of the women cooks. This is not fair to hold them responsible for bad quality of food.

**(xv) Need to open branches of Nationalised Banks in Samastipur Parliamentary Constituency, Bihar**

SHRI MAHESHWAR HAZARI (Samastipur): For increasing the number of branches of Nationalised banks in Bihar, the Government of Bihar has been making its demand to the Central Government and Reserve bank of India through various media that branches of nationalized banks be increased in Bihar. However, necessary action has not been taken so far in this regard. As a result, the people of the state of Bihar are not getting the full benefit of banking facilities.

In this context, I demand from the Government that new branches of Nationalized Banks be opened at the following places in my Parliamentary Constituency. First, at the headquarters of Xcindia block of district Samastipur; second, in Baghopur Bazar of Khanpur block of Samastipur district; at Shripur Gahar Chowk of Khanpur block of district Samastipur; fourth in Kusheshwar Sthan Bazar of district Darbhanga, fifth at Sati Ghat in Kusheshwar Sthan Western block of district Darbhanga and the Sixth, in Sahorbaghat of this very block.

Therefore, I demand from the Government that new branches of nationalized banks be opened at above places without delay so that people of Bihar could be benefitted.

**(xvi) Need to convert National Highway No. 60 in Birbhum parliamentary constituency in West Bengal into a four lane road**

*[English]*

SHRIMATI SHATABDI ROY (Birbhum): I want to draw your attention towards N.H. 60, the major portion



of which falls in my Birbhum parliamentary constituency in West Bengal.

The said national Highway is a very busy road. Lorry, buses and other vehicles ply on the road. It is needless to mention here that the number of the vehicles is so high that it causes jam every day. The said vehicles cannot run smoothly. Not only that accident takes place every day, this has become the accident prone zone.

I would appeal to the Government to convert this busy road into a four lane one as it will benefit both the people and business.

**(xvii) Need to set up Research and Development Centres and colleges in the field of agriculture, horticulture, fisheries and rubber in Kanyakumari district of Tamil Nadu**

SHRIMATI J. HELEN DAVIDSON (Kanyakumari): Kanyakumari district has 98% literacy rate compared to other districts in Tamil Nadu. Keeping in view the high literacy rate, Kanyakumari district has to be given more importance in the development of educational sector and other related facilities. Kanyakumari district depends on agriculture from where its major revenue is being generated. There are a total of 808 schools and 178 colleges in Kanyakumari district.

I would like to draw the attention towards the fact that there is no Research and Development Centre in Kanyakumari. For the development of agriculture, horticulture and fisheries, establishment of Research and Development Centre along with the relevant colleges will boost the educational sector very much. To safeguard the interests of population depending on the manufacturing and making of rubber, more and more avenues are required. Indian rubber, especially from Kanyakumari is having more demand in international market because of its good standard and quality. In order to sustain the quality and increase in production of rubber, a Research Education Centre is very much essential. To attract more students and to render qualitative education, establishment of Research and Development Centres alongwith colleges in the relevant fields are much needed.

Hence, I urge upon the Government to establish Research and Development Centres in the relevant fields in Kanyakumari District for the larger interest of the people.

**(xviii) Need to provide immediate financial assistance to Kerala distressed due to heavy rains**

SHRI P. KARUNAKARAN (Kasargod): I would like to place before the Government the loss occurred in Kerala due to monsoon calamity from 1st June to 1st July 2013. Almost all the agricultural produce and cash crops were severely affected. Infrastructure facilities such as bridges, roads, electricity have been damaged to a great extent. Scores of persons have died. The preliminary estimated loss comes to about Rs. 500 crores in real terms. Government of Kerala has already submitted a representation for immediate financial assistance to the State. Earlier there was heavy loss due to severe drought in the State. The drought and flood have adversely affected the economic and financial structure of the state. Therefore, I request the Government to take immediate steps to give financial assistance to the State.

**(xix) Need to provide funds for construction of building for Kendriya Vidyalaya at Bhadrak in Odisha**

SHRI ARJUN CHARAN SETHI (Bhadrak): The Kendriya Vidyalaya at Bhadrak of Odisha State has been functioning in a makeshift building ever since it was established in the year 2006. The Hon'ble Minister of Human Resource Development assured on the floor of the House that funds will be provided soon for the purpose by the Ministry.

Hence, I urge upon the Government to provide funds required for construction of school building for Kendriya Vidyalaya at Bhadrak in Odisha at the earliest.

**(xx) Need to increase the Minimum Support Price of Jute**

SHRI NRIPENDRA NATH ROY (Cooch Behar): This year the production of Jute is upto the satisfaction level in most districts of West Bengal. The quality of Jute

is undoubtedly superior and glossy this year in comparison to last few years. Due to enough rainfall throughout the State, the farmers did not face any problem regarding the rotting of the Jute. But, the problem arose when Jute Corporation of India fixed the Minimum Support Price of the Jute to Rs.2,300/- per quintal. You will be surprised to know that this is only Rs.100/- more from the previous year. It is a known fact that the prices of fertilizers have increased by more than 15% compared to last year and also there is huge input cost in the form of labour and making the soil ready for plantation. Now, after the declaration of MSP of Jute by Jute Corporation of India, the poor farmers are agitated throughout the State and also burnt dry jute in protests. I, therefore, request the Hon'ble Minister of Textiles, to increase the Minimum Support Price of Jute to Rs.5,000/- per quintal from Rs.2,300/-, so that poor farmers of West Bengal are benefitted.

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Jaswant Singh.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Gurudas Dasgupta.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please sit down. You have given these notices. I am asking you to speak on these motions.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, you have given me notices. You please sit down. If you sit down, I will call you. I have received notices also from your side. Please sit down.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please sit down. I have received your notices. Please sit down. Whatever notices I have, we will start with them. Please sit down. Notices

of Adjournment Motion are disallowed, but I will give you time to speak. Please go back to your seats.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: Basudebji, I will call you, please take your seat.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri T.R. Baalu, I will ask you to speak, but turn by turn.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: You will also be called, your name is also there. Please take your seat. I will call all of you. We are starting from hon. Jaswant Singh ji, please take your seat.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Jaswant Singh please.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Jaswant Singh does not want to speak.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI ANANTH KUMAR (Bangalore South): have given a notice of adjournment motion regarding rising prices of petrol and diesel...

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: OK. Pleast sit down for a minute.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Let me speak.

[Translation]

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV (Mainpuri): Madam Speaker, I will take only two minutes...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Alright, I will call every one turn by turn. First of all, I would like to tell you that I have disallowed all the notices of adjournment motion which I have received and I am giving opportunity to all to speak in zero hour.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Ananth Kumar ji, you speak.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: What are you doing? Don't do like this. Ananth Kumar ji, you speak.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI ANANTH KUMAR: Madam Speaker, I had given my notice for Adjournment Motion on the issue of petroleum and diesel price hike...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Ananth Kumar, this is under 'Zero Hour'.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANTH KUMAR : It is very unfortunate that this UPA Government led by the Congress is raising the prices of petrol and diesel every day ... (Interruptions) Recently, the price of petrol has gone up to Rs. 75 and that of diesel has reached Rs. 52. Our hon. Minister of Petroleum and Natural Gas, Shri Veerappa Moily, who hails from my State, has announced that the petrol pumps should be closed between 8 p.m. and 8 a.m.... (Interruptions) All the newspapers across the country and channels have reported his statement. ... (Interruptions) Why is the hon. Minister disturbing? ... (Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Let him speak.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANTH KUMAR: What is the major reason for petroleum price hike? What is the major reason for diesel price hike? The reasons is only the mismanagement of our country's economy by Dr. Manmohan Singh and Shri P. Chidambaram. ... (Interruptions) It is because of their

mismanagement. ... (Interruptions) Today, the rupee is devalued. The parity of rupee with the dollar has gone for a six. It is because of the mismanagement of the economy by the UPA Government. It is because of the mismanagement of the economy by the Congress.

We want to ask the hon. Minister of Finance why the rupee is getting devalued day by day like this. It is because of rupee's devaluation, the prices of petroleum and diesel are hiked.

We want only one thing. We want a clear assurance from the hon. Minister of Finance and the hon. Minister of Petroleum and Natural Gas that there will be no curfew or no closure of the petrol pumps across the country between 8 p.m. and 8 a.m. ... (Interruptions)

Not only that, we also demand that the petrol and diesel price hike should be rolled back. We want the roll-back of petrol and diesel prices. ... (Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: All right. Thank you so much, Shri Ananth Kumar.

SHRI ANANTH KUMAR : I want to put forth one more submission. I have not completed.

What is the tax component? They are collecting more than Rs. 1,40,000 crore. Last year they had collected Rs. 1,40,000 crore from the taxes on petroleum products. This year, it might have gone up much further. Therefore, I urge upon the Government, through you, Madam, that the taxes have to be reduced. The Central Taxes on petroleum products and diesel products should be reduced. On LPG, it should be reduced; on Kerosene, it should be reduced. It will be having a cyclic effect.

Madam, if they raise the price of petrol, price of diesel, there will be a cascading effect on the economy. There will be further inflation, further price rise. Already, in the market, we are getting onion at Rs.80 per kilogram. What about sugar? It is sold at Rs.42/- per kilogram. Even rice is sold at Rs.40/- per kilogram. This UPA Government, this Congress Party is not for the *Aam Admi*. It is for the *Khaas*

*Admi.* It is for the hoarders. It is for the blackmarketeers and dalals. *(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: All right, thank you so much.

SHRI ANANTH KUMAR : Therefore, the Finance Minister and the Petroleum Minister both should assure this House that first, there will not be any curfew on petroleum products that will be imposed on the country. Second, They should assure that they will roll back the petroleum price hike immediately....*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Basu Deb Acharia.

...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Shrimati Darshana Jardosh, Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal, Shri Virender Kashyap, Shrimati Jayshreeben Patel, Shri Hari P. Choudhary, Prof. Ramshankar, Shri Ramsinh Rathwa and Shri Shivarama Gouda are allowed to associate with Shri Ananth Kumar on price rise of petrol and diesel which he raised during the 'Zero Hour' today.

*[Translation]*

SHRI SANSUMA KHUNGUR BWISWMUTHIARY (Kokrajhar): Madam, I have also given notice, you call me also...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Yes, I will call you also.

...*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (Bankura): Madam, it is a matter of grave concern that the prices of almost all essential commodities are rising.... *(Interruptions)* Inflation has already crossed 10 per cent. The livelihood of the people of our country is in a very bad condition. The Government are deciding and they have deregulated the prices of petrol and diesel. Earlier, they deregulated the prices of petrol. Subsequently, they have deregulated the prices of diesel. As a result of this, the oil companies are increasing the prices of diesel and petrol every month. This time the increase in the price of petrol is almost, approximately Rs. 3/- During this year, the increase in the prices of petrol and

diesel has been for more than six times. He has also made a statement. He should clarify in this House that every month the price of diesel will be increased by Rs.5. He made a statement. He has also made a Statement that petrol pumps throughout the country would be closed from 8 p.m. to 6 a.m....*(Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF PETROLEUM AND NATURAL GAS (SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY): No such Statement has been made....*(Interruptions)* No such curfew is imposed. It is only an increase in the price....*(Interruptions)*

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Madam, this House is demanding that there should be restructuring in the tax, duties and cess. Whenever there is an increase in the price of petrol and diesel, there is an increase in the tax collection, realization of taxes. Whenever there is an increase in the price of petrol and diesel, it has its cascading effect. When the country is facing inflation, when the prices of almost all the essential commodities are rising beyond the capacity of the people of our country, by increasing the prices of diesel and petrol, this Government has increased the burden on the common people of our country. Without restructuring the tax, if the Government has reduced the tax and duties by 10 per cent on diesel and petrol, they need not increase the price of petrol, diesel and LPG. The price of LPG has been increased by Rs.50/- That means, this Government is reducing the subsidy putting burden on the common people....*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Please conclude now.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : We, therefore, demand that the increase in the prices of petrol and diesel should be rolled back forthwith. The Minister of Petroleum should make a Statement immediately to clarify in regard to what he has stated that every month there would be an increase in the price of petroleum by Rs. 5 ...*(Interruptions)* The increase in the prices of petroleum, diesel and LPG should be rolled back forthwith. ...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri M.B. Rajesh, Shri P. Karunakaran, Sk. Saidual Haque, Shri Shivkumar

Udasi and Shri Shailendra Kumar are allowed to associate with the issue raised by Shri Basu Deb Acharia.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI DARA SINGH CHAUHAN (Ghosi): Madam Speaker, this is an important issue. Please give an opportunity to all of us to speak...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: For now, only those who have given notices are being given opportunity to speak.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI PRABHUNATH SINGH (Maharajganj): Madam, please give me an opportunity to speak on this too...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Prabhunath ji, you associate yourself with this issue.

SHRI PRABHUNATH SINGH: Madam, I know how to speak. So I am speaking myself.

MADAM SPEAKER: OK. Please speak.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV: Madam, I also have to speak.

MADAM SPEAKER: After Prabhunath Singh ji you will be given opportunity to speak.

SHRI PRABHUNATH SINGH: Mulayam Singh ji, I am speaking on your issues only.

MADAM SPEAKER: You are not to speak on his issues. You have to speak on that issues only on which you have given notice.

SHRI PRABHUNATH SINGH: Madam Speaker, I have given notice regarding frequent price rise of diesel and petrol by which unnecessary burden is being put on the public frequently. The essential commodities are also affected by this. Especially the rise in the price of diesel affects the farmers more because in arid areas the farmers depend on diesel only. This has become a routine. I think the State taxes like sales tax, VAT etc. on diesel and petrol make the situation worse due to which

people particularly farmers face the situation of distress.

I would like to request the Government to reduce the taxes to reduce the price of petroleum products. If they are unable to reduce the taxes then subsidised diesel should be provided to farmers so that they can get relief and share the burden of this country by producing foodgrains with reasonable expenses thereon. The manner in which price of diesel is increasing, we can not even guess as to upto which level will it go. Its price is raised arbitrarily.

Madam Speaker, I request the Government with humility to control the prices of diesel and petrol as the entire House shares this concern.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV (Mainpuri): Madam Speaker, thank you very much. I will put my point in only two minutes. There are seventeen castes and those are most backward castes. The Uttar Pradesh Government had decided to include those castes in the list of Scheduled Castes and that had been implemented. They were even getting the facilities. After that the other Government came and repealed that order. Shri Buta Singh ji was Chairman of Scheduled Caste Commission. He had accepted the earlier decision of Uttar Pradesh Government. After his acceptance those castes got all the facilities.

I would like to put before you that there are socially, economically and educationally most backward castes among these castes. Kahar, Kashyap, Kewat, Mallah, Nishad, Kumhar, Prajapati, Gheedar, Bind, Bhar, Rajbhar, Dheemar, Batam. Turah, Gaur, Manjhi and Machhua are among these castes. The cabinet took a decision with regard to inclusion of these castes in the list of Scheduled Castes of Uttar Pradesh. A five member sub-committee confirmed it. The Principal Secretary, Social Welfare got sanction from the cabinet. The hon'ble Chief Minister has sent the whole proposal to Central Government to hon'ble Prime Minister and Minister of Social Justice and Empowerment in March, 2013 after getting this proposal passed by Legislative Assembly.

Through you, I would like to demand from the Central Government that please includes these seventeen most backward castes in the list of Scheduled Castes. These castes were earlier in the list of Scheduled Castes. They have got those facilities. Later on the other Government repealed that order *(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Vishwa Mohan Kumar and Shri Ramashankar Rajbhar associate themselves with the matter raised by Shri Mulayam Singh Yadav.

...*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MADAM SPEAKER: I am going by the notices which I have received. I am going by that. Please allow me to do that.

...*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA: We support this in the matter of backward castes.

MADAM SPEAKER: You have already spoken. Why you are standing?

...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Please sit down.

SHRI SHAILENDRA KUMAR (Kaushambi): Madam, Dada is associating himself with the matter raised by Mulayam Singh ji...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Sharad Yadav ji, you have given a notice. You will be given time to speak. Please sit down.

...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Saugata Roy ji.

*[English]*

PROF. SAUGATA ROY (Dum Dum): Madam, thank you for allowing me. I want to bring to the notice of the House that the economy continues to be in a mess, in spite of the Prime Minister's assurance the rupee fell by 61 points to reach 68, and then came down to 67 point something. The Sensex also fell very drastically, the

highest in at least 15 days. With the falling value of the Rupee, the price of petroleum products, including Petrol, Diesel, Cooking Gas, Kerosene and Aviation Turbine Fuel, have all increased or are going to increase. The Government is waiting for the Parliament Session to end to increase the prices. The Government has been a total failure in managing the economy, and preventing the drastic fall of the Rupee which has pushed up the price of imports, especially oil imports where 70 per cent of oil has to be imported from abroad. This is putting a terrible pressure on the economy. The price of public transport will go up, air fares will go up and the economy will be in a total mess. In spite of the Prime Minister assuring the House, the Government has not taken one drastic step to prevent the fall of the Rupee which has had a cascading effect on the economy, thereby raising inflation and the prices of common products as has been mentioned, including onions and sugar.

I, again, demand that the Government announce drastic steps to prevent the sharp fall in the value of the Rupee vis-à-vis the US Dollar and the English Pound and assure the countrymen. Goldman Sachs has said that growth will come down to 4 per cent. What will happen to employment? Some economists are predicting that the Rupee is going to touch 72 per Dollar in a month's time. Our imports will go through the roof and the common people will be subjected to tremendous misery against which we have protested, on behalf of our Party, yesterday. I reiterate our protest against the Government's total failure to manage the economy of the country.

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Shivkumar Udasi will associate himself with the matter raised by Prof. Saugata Roy.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Darjeeling): Madam Speaker, I have been endeavouring for the past several days to draw the attention of the House to, what I think is, an extremely important issue. That is the increasingly destructive conflict that has afflicted Syria. I think it is necessary for us to recognize that though civil wars, by their very nature, are extremely brutal and uncivil which Syria is currently going through, Syria is also being torn apart simultaneously by a fanatical, religious and sectarian conflict.

Madam, it is a matter of some regret to me that all these days that the threat of attack on Syria by Western Powers has been there, the Government and the House have not been able to mention this at all. I had occasion to mention this to the very affable, but not so able, Minister of External Affairs that this is a very dangerous situation that has arisen. I also drew his attention to, what I found was, a very objectionable statement by the Prime Minister of Great Britain, while speaking in the House, where he has spoken of having consulted with the Indian Prime Minister about wanting to attack Syria.

I did bring it to the notice of the Minister concerned and because of that, I am very glad, a Statement was issued, but I take objection even to that Statement because the Statement correcting the situation came across in a very strange language. Somebody from the High Commission announced that it was an 'innocent mistake' on the part of the Prime Minister of little Britain. This is a new language, Madam, in the world of diplomacy about mistakes becoming 'innocent mistakes.'

We, now, witness the US President having gone to the Congress to seek permission, without UN sanctions, to attack Syria. I do submit, Madam, that the Western world are not the policemen, or the keepers of global peace. This is unacceptable, and this must be unacceptable to India that the world in general takes a stand and most unfortunately the Indian Government reacts only belatedly to what I think is a globally very destructive situation.

I submit, Madam, that Syria is our neighbour. It is also the fulcrum of the Arab World. It is a civilisation that has nurtured Christianity and Islam. In fact, those of us who have studied this matter know that the Epiphany of St. Paul was when he was riding into Damascus, fell off his horse; a voice came, 'why are you going to kill the Christians' and he converted to Christianity on that account and became, in process, a saint. Surely, those who have studied history and military history know that Allenby, at the end of the Mesopotamian Campaign, rode into Damascus on a charger because he wanted to see it as an extension of the great campaigns of Christendom against Islam.

Either way it is unacceptable. The West has no authority to take action against any country whatsoever

and having already caused so much damage to our neighbourhood because, I submit, Madam, that we have to consider very seriously that US military intervention in Asia starting from Korea, Vietnam, Iraq, Afghanistan, half of western Pakistan, all this is now a desert from Peshawar to Morocco and it is entirely on account of Western intervention.

I do believe that the Government of India has to speak with much sounder and stronger voice against this kind of global policing or hegemony that we are witnessing. That is my appeal, Madam.

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Virender Kashyap, Shri Virendra Kumar, Shri Ashok Argal, Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab, Shri Ramen Deka, Shri K. D. Deshmukh, Shri Shivarama Gouda, Shri Shivkumar Udasi, Shri Ramesh V. Katti, Shri A. Sampath, Shri M.B. Rajesh, Shri P.K. Biju, Dr. Kirit P. Solanki, Shrimati Darshana Jardosh, Shri Mahendrasinh Chauhan, Shri Naranbhai Kachhadia, Sk. Saidul Haque, Shri Arjun Meghwal, Shrimati Jayshreeben Patel, Shri Ravindra Kumar Pandey, Shri Ramsingbhai Rathwa, Dr. Ram Shankar, and Shri Hasraj Ahir associate themselves with the matter raised by Shri Jaswant Singh.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Madam, I have also given a notice on this...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Sansuma Khunggur BwiswmuThiary, Please speak.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: BwiswmuThiary ji, be allowed to speak.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI SANSUMA KHUNGGUR BWISWMUTHIARY : Madam Speaker, I am quite thankful to you for giving me an opportunity to speak about the long pending genuine issue for the creation of a separate State of Bodoland...(Interruptions) I would like to urge upon the Government of India to take appropriate steps to help create the much long awaited...(Interruptions) separate State of Bodoland carving out of the present State of Assam...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: Please take your seat.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please listen to him. When you were speaking, he was listening.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please take your seat.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI SANSUMA KHUNGGUR BWISWMUTHIARY : The claim of the Bodo people for getting a separate State of Bodoland is very legitimate, very genuine, very democratic and it is our historical prerogative. Our question to the Government of India is, if the present Government of India could take a political decision to create the much, long-awaited separate State of Telangana, why there cannot be a similar kind of political decision in the case of Bodoland State also? So Madam, through you, I would like to urge upon the Government of India, once again, to take the political decision to create the much-awaited separate State of Bodoland without any furthermore delay...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: You all please take your seats.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Somebody is speaking.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Buiswmuthiary ji, please speak.

...(Interruptions)

Madam Speaker: Please let Shri Bwiswmuthiary be allowed to speak.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI SANSUMA KHUNGGUR BWISWMUTHIARY: I am sorry to say.... (Interruptions)

Listen to me.

MADAM SPEAKER: You continue.

SHRI SANSUMA KHUNGGUR BWISWMUTHIARY : We are in a great trouble; we are in a great tragedy these days....(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: You continue.

SHRI SANSUMA KHUNGGUR BWISWMUTHIARY : Respected Madam, Speaker, through you, I would like to urge upon the Government of India and all the learned Members of this august House to take appropriate steps to help create the much, long-awaited separate State of Bodoland in line with Telangana. Our vital question to the Government of India is, if the present Government of India could take a political decision in the matter of the creation of the much, long-awaited separate State of Telangana, why there could not be similar kind of a political decision in the case of the creation of a separate State of Bodoland? Why should there be double standard in Government of India's policy? Why there should be discriminatory policy? Let there be an inclusive policy approach from the Government of India to create the much, long-awaited separate State of Bodoland also ...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Thank you. Now Dr. Thambidurai.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI (Karur): Madam, thank you very much. Already I have given the notice for Adjournment Motion regarding the Cauvery river issue. This is a very important issue.... (Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: You all please listen to Thambidurai ji.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI : Madam, our hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu has written D.O. Letters to the hon. Prime Minister regarding the Cauvery river issue. It is a very serious matter. I wish to bring, through you, to the urgent notice of the Union Government an important issue related to the proposals of the Government of Karnataka to build reservoirs across the river Cauvery at Mekedatu for generation of hydroelectric power.



Also, Madam, another important issue is this. Cauvery Neeravari Nigama Limited, a Government of Karnataka Enterprise, has put out advertisements in newspapers inviting Expression of Interest for the restoration and rejuvenation of river Arkavathy and for the modernization of the Hemavathy canals. If the proposals are taken like this, it will affect Tamil Nadu. In this connection, Tamil Nadu Chief Minister has written to the Prime Minister to take necessary action and stop the Karnataka Government not to construct this kind of a new project; and without the consent of Tamil Nadu Government, Karnataka Government must not take up new projects on the river Cauvery.

Also, Madam, in a federal structure, no upper riparian State can unilaterally interfere with the natural flow of an inter-State river without the consent and concurrence of the lower riparian State.

Under the circumstances, I would request the Government of India to intervene in the matter and advise the Government of Karnataka and its Cauvery Neeravari Nigama Limited not to proceed with any projects in the Cauvery Basin till the Cauvery Management Board is formed. Further, the Government of Karnataka may be instructed to advise the Cauvery Neeravari Nigama Limited appropriately to withhold the Invitation for Expression of Interest called for by it for these two projects and also not to call for any Invitation for Expression of Interest for the projects of Karnataka lying in the Cauvery Basin till the Cauvery Management Board is formed and request the Government of India to form the Cauvery Management Board immediately and the Cauvery Water Regulatory Committee as suggested by the hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri S.S. Ramasubbu, Shri P. Lingam and Shri P.L. Punia are allowed to associate with the issue raised by Dr. M. Thambidurai.

...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Only what Shri T.R. Baalu is saying will go in record.

*(Interruptions)*... \*

SHRI T.R. BAALU (Sriperumbudur): Madam, the

farmers of Tiruchirappalli Thanjavur Thiruvavur Nagapattinam and Pudukottai are depending on the Cauvery water.

MADAM SPEAKER: No, you wanted to speak on Katchatheevu. You please come on Katchatheevu.

SHRI T.R. BAALU : They have already lost the first crop, kuruvai crop. Now they are depending upon the second crop, that is samba crop.

MADAM SPEAKER: Come on Katchatheevu, Baalu ji.

SHRI T.R. BAALU : Yesterday, the Law Minister of Karnataka Government has gone on record to construct dams across Cauvery. It is against lower riparian rights....*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: No. You please speak on Katchatheevu.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI T.R. BAALU : No, Madam. I have given a notice on the Cauvery issue... *(Interruptions)* It is on the same issue, Madam. ... *(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: No.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI T.R. BAALU : My leader, Dr. Kalaignar Karunanidhi was in power as the Chief Minister. ...*(Interruptions)* He opposed the construction of dams at Megadadu in Karnataka and written to the Government of India for intervention to stop them. ...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: All right. Thank you.

...*(Interruptions)*

**11.35 hrs.**

*At this stage, Shri Suresh Angadi, Shri P. Kumar, Shri T.K.S. Elangovan, Shri R. Thamaraiselvan and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Syed Shahnawaz Hussain.

...*(Interruptions)*

---

\*Not recorded.

[Translation]

SHRI SYED SHAHNAWAZ HUSSAIN (Bhagalpur): Madam Speaker, I want to speak about the Bhagalpur floods...*(Interruptions)* A heavy flood has come in Bhagalpur...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Please go back to your seats.

...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Syed Shahnawaj ji is speaking now. Allow him to speak now. Please go back to your seats.

...*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI SYED SHAHNAWAZ HUSSAIN: There is flood in the Ganga River, The whole area of Mirza Chowki, Peerpanti, kahalgaon has submerged...*(Interruptions)* The farmers are in a very bad condition because the banana farming is done in Naugachhia belt and that has totally submerged...*(Interruptions)* I would like to request you that this is a natural calamity because gates of Farakka have not been opened and water is logging in Bhagalpur and upto Bengal border. A heavy flood has come there...*(Interruptions)* There is a panic and distress in Bhagalpur. The State Government should provide total relief to the people. Boats should be arranged. There is lack of arrangements. People are in distress. Madam Speaker, I am raising this matter for several days because farming in a big area is done in Bhagalpur belt. The farmers there should be given full compensation. The Ganga is a National river. Floods have come there. Therefore, the central Government should also take notice of this. The flood in the Ganga is like that of Kosi river. The whole Bhagalpur is submerged. That is why I was bringing this matter to your notice...*(Interruptions)* I want that the Government take notice of this because the area of Peerpanti, Kahalgaon, Nath nagar, Nangachhia, Gopalpur etc. in Bhagalpur has submerged...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: He is speaking on a different subject. Please go back to your seats.

...*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI SYED SHAHNAWAZ HUSSAIN: There is heavy flood at the banks of Ganga. The Central Government is not co-operating. The Government should provide help as was given at the time of Kosi floods...*(Interruptions)* The Bihar Government should also start relief work speedily...*(Interruptions)* Farmers are in distress as cattle are not getting fodder. The entire North Bihar including Begusarai, Khagaria, Bhagalpur, upto Bengal and Farakka is situated at the Banks of the Ganga. When there is flood in the Ganga, the water is blocked at the gates of Farakka. There is agreement with Bangladesh. If Farakka gates are opened the fury of flood will be less...*(Interruptions)* That is why the level of the Ganga is increasing and the Government is not taking any notice...*(Interruptions)*

Madam Speaker, I request you that Central and State governments should take notice of this situation and the relief work in Bhagalpur area should be done speedily...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Please go back to your seats. He is speaking on a different subject. That subject is over. Please go back to your seats.

...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: We are on different subject now. Please go back to your seat.

...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: We have other works to do. Please go back to your seats.

...*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI SYED SHAHNAWAZ HUSSAIN: There is no big programme being run in the name of flood relief...*(Interruptions)* Hoses of people have

submerged...*(Interruptions)* I request the Government to give a statement on this. Bhagalpur as well as the floods on the banks of the Ganga...*(Interruptions)*

Madam, I am bringing before the House, the pain of Bihar. Bihar is suffering from drought as well as flood.....*(Interruptions)*

Madam Speaker, the Government should act on war footing for tackling the flood in Bihar.....*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: You have made your point.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SYED SHAHNAWAZ HUSSAIN: The Government should act on war footing for tackling the flood in Bihar ....*(Interruptions)* The Government should act on war footing...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI GANESH SINGH: Madam, I would like to draw your attention to the pitiable condition of National Highway in the country including Madhya Pradesh...*(Interruptions)* National Highway in M.P. have been badly damaged, these have been converted into potholes...*(Interruptions)* Entire length of 4700 kms of highways has been reduced to potholes. Movement of vehicles has come to a halt...*(Interruptions)* Gwalior-Shivpuri-Indore-Pune-Mumbai NH-3 is also affected...*(Interruptions)* NH-7, NH-25, NH-59, NH-69, and NH-75 have been badly damaged. I urge the Government to allocate necessary funds for repairs thereof. Roads have been reduced potholes due to rains...*(Interruptions)* Roads have been blocked at several places.

Madam, I am thankful to you for giving me a chance to speak.

DR. BHOLA SINGH (Nawada): Hon. Madam Speaker, I am highly grateful to you for giving me an opportunity to speak...*(Interruptions)*

Madam, this unprecedented flood situation has broken 42 years record. Population of about 60 lakh is badly affected by flood in Ganga especially in district Begusarai...*(Interruptions)* In Mathihani block in Begusarai district, Ramdiri, Sihma, Chalk, Balhapur, Mahenderpura and Ruchiyahi, Kachhan, Taula, Dhobiatol, Aakashpur,

Kamurudinpur, Jhumri in Begusarai block Barauni Nipaniya, Madhurapur, Bajalpura, in Tegara block; Chamtha, Chiraiya Tok, Rupsawaj in Bachhwada block; and Prayarpur, Dahadpur, Sadanandpur, Hussaina Bhagatpur, Manesarpur in Ballia block have been very badly devastated. The State Government is insensitive toward this havoc...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri P.L. Punia associates himself with Dr. Bhola Singh.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI RAMKISHUN (Chandauli): Madam Speaker, entire Poorvanchal in U.P. had been devastated by floods caused by the Ganga...*(Interruptions)* Last time also I had raised this issue ...*(Interruptions)* Crops have been totally destroyed...*(Interruptions)* Their homes have collapsed. Cattle are not getting fodder. Last year also, I had said that the financial assistance being given by the Central Government to the States is inadequate...*(Interruptions)*

**11.44 hrs**

*At this stage, Shri T.K.S Elangovan, Shri R. Thamaraiselvan and some other hon. Members went back to their seats.*

SHRI RAMKISHUN: Madam Speaker, I urge the Central Government to send a team for assessing the need for relief and provide financial aid to Uttar Pradesh immediately...*(Interruptions)* Very less compensation i.e. only Rs. 200-300 per acre, is given for crops damaged. My submission is that per acre a compensation of Rs. 10 thousands should be given in case of damage of crops...*(Interruptions)* At least Rs. 50 thousand should be given to the farmers whose houses have collapsed ...*(Interruptions)* Compensation should also be paid to those whose cattle have died. The Government had declared the Ganga a national river. Entire water flown from M.P. has devastated Poorvanchal region. In view of it, I urge the Government to send a central relief team...*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI MEENA SINGH (Arrah): Madam, I am thankful to you for allowing me to speak on flood situation. In absence of timely rainfall, half of Bihar is reeling under

drought...*(Interruptions)* Somehow, the farmers grow paddy crop with the help of tube wells but now, the floods caused by the Ganga, the Sone, the Punpun and the Ghagra have swept their crops. Six blocks in my constituency Arrah, namely Shahpur, Bihinya, Badhaira, Koilwar, Arrah Sadar and Udwan nagar are affected by floods...*(Interruptions)* due to which lakhs of people of hundreds of villages are badly affected. Life of people is badly disturbed. These areas are cut from their district headquarters...*(Interruptions)* crops of farmers in thousands of acres have been destroyed. Dozens of people have died in flood waters. People have left their homes and are staying near dams. In case, any one falls sick, he or she is taken to the hospital on a cot or in a boat...*(Interruptions)* Cattle are dying for want of fodder. There is a fear of breakout of a serious disease after the flood recedes. States Government of Bihar is making all out efforts for providing relief...*(Interruptions)* I am thankful to the Government of Bihar and Bhojpur administration in this regard. But for Central help, it is very difficult to tackle it ...*(Interruptions)* Therefore, I urge the Government to send a central team for assessing the losses caused by floods and every possible help should be rendered to Bihar and as far as possible relief and rehabilitation help should be made available to the people...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI P.L. PUNIA (Barabanki): Madam, I associate myself with the issue raised by Shrimati Meena Singh during zero-hour.

SHRI SUSHIL KUMAR SINGH (Aurangabad): Madam, I am thankful to you for allowing me to raise an issue of public interest ...*(Interruptions)* All the 38 districts in Bihar are either in grip of drought or floods. The entire area of Constituency Aurangabad and Gaya district alongwith South Bihar is facing drought ...*(Interruptions)* Dev, Kutamba, Navinagar and especially the Tandawa area of South Navinagar which is the southern part of Uttar Koyal canal, in Aurangabad district are totally reeling under the drought ...*(Interruptions)* Madanpur, Dev, Rafiganj blocks and Dumriya in district Gaya, Banke Bazaar, Gurua, Guraru, Paraiya, Konch, Tikari etc. blocks are affected by drought. The State Government has given subsidy on diesel so as to save the paddy crops of farmers...*(Interruptions)* But, the State has limited

resources. Enough can not be done out of these resources. I urge the Government of India to provide relief...*(Interruptions)* I would also like to say that arrangements must be made for irrigations to save Aurangabad and Gaya district the fury of drought...*(Interruptions)*

#### 11.49hrs

*At this stage, Shri R. Thamaraiselvan and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

DR. VINAY KUMAR PANDEY (Shrawasti): Madam Speaker, I am thankful to you for giving me an opportunity to speak on the problems of my constituency in Zero Hour which is reeling under the natural calamity. *(Interruptions)*

Madam, I come from this flood affected constituency. I feel it is my as well as my party's misfortune that the area where Shri A.B. Bajpayee jee belonged to and whose charismatic leadership the BJP poured, is facing the problems today. I rise to narrate the problems of my constituency and these people are still creating pandemonium in the well of the House. They have removed him from their banners and posters. ...*(Interruptions)*

Madam, about thirty villages including Galiba, Kundamahra, Majhari, Mahua, Ibrahim, Randwaria of Uttolla Tehsil of my constituency in Balrampur district are badly affected owing breach of embankments of Rapti River. The life of people here has paralysed as they don't have anything to eat. There is no fodder for the cattle, and no clothes to clad. Keeping in view the critical situation there, the district administration has made arrangements there at their own level whatever was possible. I am grateful to the Deputy Commissioner but that is not sufficient. The State Government is also not providing sufficient assistance. Through you, I demand from the Central Government that...*(Interruptions)* assistance should be provided there under CSR funding without any delay...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Alright, you have made your point. Shri Ramashankar Rajbhar.

SHRI P.L. PUNIA: Madam, I associate myself with the issue raised by Dr. Vinay Kumar Pandey ji during Zero Hour.

11.50 hrs.

*At this stage, Shrimati J. Helen Davidson and some other hon. members came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

SHRI RAMASHANKAR RAJBHAR (Salempur): Madam, one lakh people have been rendered homeless due to floods in Devaria district of my constituency in Ballia district. Today as many as 18 thousand people are living in tents. The flood in Ganga, Ghagra, Rapti etc river has broken all previous records in the whole Ballia and Devaria districts. There is devastating flood...(Interruptions) and cattle, animals and birds have become lifeless. People are dying for want of food and medicines. There is crisis of fodder for cattle. Through you, I would request the Government of India to provide assistance to the people without any further delay...(Interruptions).

MADAM SPEAKER: Alright you have made your point. Shri Sharad Yadav.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Sharad Yadav ji, do you want to speak?

...(Interruptions)

11.51 hrs.

*At this stage, Shri Suresh Angadi, Shri P. Kumar, Shrimati J. Helen Davidson and some other hon. members went back to their seats*

...(Interruptions)

11.52 hrs.

#### SUBMISSION BY MEMBERS

**Re : Need to resolve the issue of reservation policy for ST/OBC for applying to newly created AIIMS like institutes and other institutes in the country.**

[Translation]

SHRI SHARAD YADAV (Madhepura): Madam

Speaker, Yesterday I raised an issue. Hon. Minister is sitting here...(Interruptions). Madam Speaker, through you, today, I want to raise this matter again. Today hon. Kapil Sibal ji is here and the hon. Health Minister is also here...(Interruptions). At the time of Altmush Kabir ji there was a judgement of the Supreme Court. I was assured on behalf of the Government, I do not want to take anybody's name, that they will rectify it within eight days. You constituted a committee of Professors, Assistant Professors and Scientists on the request of the Prime Minister. It also gave its recommendations in favour of reservation of this category of people. Now the AIIMS, which have been opened in Odisha, Riapur, Patna, are not working properly. In Patna, many Departments No.-1, No.-2, No.-3 have been created, where there will be no reservation. I am saying all this because you had said that you will rectify it...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Address the Chair.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV (Mainpuri): Sharad Yadav ji, I had said...(Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD YADAV: I am coming to that.

In this regard you had said that you are going in for Review Petition. We, Mulayam Singh Yadav ji, Balu ji, Dara Singh Chauhan ji and Basudev Acharya ji had requested for constitution Amendment in this regard. This matter pertains to 80 percent people. It is the case of Adivasis, Dalits, and Backwards. Nine judges have given judgement in Indira Sahni case and you have not accepted their advice. This Constitution Bench has strengthened it, which said "Impose upon", which has an entirely different meaning. The second thing which they had said that the people belonging to weaker sections are very unfit. Through you, I simply want to tell the Government that it is a very serious matter. Only two days are left in the current session. You said about introducing Constitution Amendment Bill, but now it is not possible, whereas we had said even twenty days ago, but nothing happened. We would like to say that there is no other way except bringing a Constitution Amendment. Such a way should be found that this matter may not go into the courts. In the House, we all know that this matter belonging to weaker sections is to be rectified. But outside, people have a mindset of thousands of years of caste system.

Many decisions have come with regard to reservation, anybody can give decision according to his own fancy. I would like to request that the Government should make some foolproof and complete arrangement. Otherwise It will go on like this. Therefore, do something concrete and this matter will not be solved without Constitution Amendment. People shall continue to find way outs on one pretext or the other...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Alright, Now Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad Singh ji will speak.

...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Now nobody else will speak on this subject. Raghuvansh ji, you make your point.

...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: If you want you can associate yourself with the above subject and can give your name on the table of the House.

...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Shailendra Kumar, Shri P.L. Punia, Dr. Ram Chandra Dome, Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal, Shri Kirit Solanki, Shri Virender Kashyap, Shrimati Jyoti Dhurve, Dr. Anup Kumar Saha, Shri Pulin Bihari Baske, Shrimati Susmita Bauri, Shri Mahendra Kumar Roy, Shri Ganesh Singh, Shri Shakti Mohan Malik, Shri Vishwamohan Kumar, Shri Ramashankar Rajbhar, Shri Rakesh Sachan, Shri R.K. Singh Patel, Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat, Shri Virendra Kumar, Shri Ram Singh Rathawa, Shri Sohan Patai, Shri P.K. Biju, Shri C.R. Patil, Shri Ram Singh Bhai Patel Bhai Rathwa, Shri Ashok Argal, Shri Hansraj Ahir, Shri Ratan Singh, Shri T.K.S. Enalgovan, Prof. Ramshankar, Dr. Sanjeev Ganesh Naik, Shrimati Poonam Veljibhai Jat and Shri Vaidyanath Mahato associate themselves with the matter raised by Shri Sharad Yadav.

*[English]*

MADAM SPEAKER: Please do not ask for a discussion. What is all this?

...*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon'ble Minister wants to say something. Raghuvansh Babu, please sit down.

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY AND MINISTER FOR LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI KAPIL SIBAL): Madam Speaker, what has been said by Shri Sharad Yadav, is quite correct. Last time when he raised this matter, I had said in this House that we could immediately file a writ petition and if the verdict did not come in our favour, we could think over other suggestions. May be, we will bring a Constitution Amendment Bill. Last time on 14th August when this matter was raised, a writ petition had been filed the same day. Later on, on 17th August, we put an urgent application in the Hon'ble Supreme Court for immediate hearing in that case. Then I myself talked to the Registrar General asking him to place the writ petition for hearing at their earliest because the whole House was worried and wanted that there should not be any change in the pattern of reservation being given to the backward classes. ...*(Interruptions)* Through you, I would like to assure everyone that the policy of reservation which was in the past, is applicable even today and shall continue to be the same even in future...*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MADAM SPEAKER: First listen to him. We are not having a discussion. Nothing else will go on record.

...*(Interruptions)\**

MADAM SPEAKER: Please sit down. What is this?

...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: First you wanted the Minister to reply. Now he is replying. You do not want to listen.

*[Translation]*

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL: One thing more I would like to convey through you that I will immediately talk to the Attorney General to seek his opinion and shall issue D.O. in entire India that the policy of reservation which we had been following hitherto, is same even today and shall

---

\*Not recorded.

continue to be the same even tomorrow...(Interruptions)

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Minister wants to say something.

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): on the AIIMS.

MADAM SPEAKER: All right.

...(Interruptions)

**12.00 hrs.**

[Translation]

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV: Please do not give an equivocal reply...(Interruptions)

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL: We will talk after the review petition...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please listen to the Hon. Minister Ghulam Nabi Azad as to what he is saying. Ghulam Nabi ji, please speak.

GHULAM NABI AZAD: Madam, regarding the question of AIIMS that has been raised by hon. Sharad ji, Mulayam Singh ji, and several other colleagues, I would like to make it clear that as regards the advertisement of Dec. 2012 for the posts of 148 assistant professors, there was reservation since last several years and this judgement has no effect on that and we have not yet even considered that. Its last date was 31st January but there was a decision of the governing body of the AIIMS on the PG results which used to come in two batches, one the first January and the other one on first July. It was decided in the general body meeting that if there is a January batch and the last date of advertisement is in January, they should wait for 6-7 months so that second batch may also be included in that. So we did not take action to that in January and the last date of application for the second batch of PG was 31st July. Now it is only one month has elapsed and about 1800 applications has been received. So, Yesterday I have written to the director as the president of the Institute that since applications have been received for the first and the second batch, the interviews should be held at the earliest.

[English]

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN (Chennai North): Madam Speaker, we were asking about appointment in super specialty posts. he has not answered that.

[Translation]

SHRI SHARAD YADAV: Madam, first the advertisement had been given for it...(Interruptions)

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: I have also an answer of that. Last year, the advertisement had been given simultaneously for 37 posts of professors, therefore it was not withheld for reservation or no reservation. We have two cadres at the professor level in our AIIMS. For the first cadre, the professors are appointed through direct interview and their number is fixed but in respect of those who are appointed on the basis of assured promotion scheme as assistant professors, there is reservation in it. In the first instance, he is appointed as an associate professor, then he is promoted to the post of Additional professor and then to the next post of professor. Since 2005, there has not been any direct appointment of professor. The reason was that the professors who were recruited through APS route wanted that they should be allowed to appear for interview for the direct appointment of professor. Upto 2005, it was not the practice and they were not given permission but this time they have been permitted to appear even for the interview for direct post of professor alongwith those who had been appointed professor through APS route would also be allowed. That created a lot of dispute and those who had been appointed through APS route, were not prepared to accept them. So there was a tussle between these two categories, ones who were appointed through APS route and the others who were appointed through the direct route. Therefore, from 2005 onwards, it had been stopped. After a period of 7 years we had tried to resolve this dispute but it could not be resolved and in that situation the things had been stopped.

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Let us not have a discussion on this. No, we are not in the middle of discussion.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please, let us not have a discussion on this. What is this.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

DR. RAGHUVANSH PRASAD SINGH (Vaishali): Madam Speaker, Lakhs of candidates appearing in Civil Services Examination conducted by UPSC...(Interruptions)

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing else will go on record except what he is saying.

...(Interruptions)\*

[Translation]

DR. RAGHUVANSH PRASAD SINGH: Madam Speaker, their arrest was made by the police under Lok Manya Tilk Police Station. Madam, this civil services i.e. IAS examination which is difficult examination. It requires a lot of preparation. Somehow by foregoing meals to save money to come to Delhi and prepare here for IAS. However, all of a sudden, the pattern for IAS was changed, first in the preliminary examination and then in the final examination. This thing was done in the year 1979 also while they were provided 3 years additional chance. But this year no chance was given, not for even one year. As a result of this the poor candidates who are somehow making preparations in Delhi are very much perturbed. Not only this, out of 80 questions, nine have been made compulsory. It was decided in the house that English would not be made compulsory, even then English continues to be compulsory. Government should come out with its reply immediately in both the matters, as injustice is being repeatedly done with competitors while the Hindi speaking all falling this injustice in particular. Foreign language...(Interruptions) is favoured which makes it a serious matters...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Ganesh Singh, Dr. Ram Shankar, Shri Shalendra Kumar, Shri A. Sampat, Shri A.B.

\*Not recorded.

Rajesh, Shri P.K. Biju, Shri Prahlad Joshi, Shri P.L. Punia associated with the matter raised by Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad Singh.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Now Shri Gurudas Dasgupta.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: No discussion on this, please.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Now, Shri Gurudas Dasgupta.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Ananth Kumar

...(Interruptions)

SHRI ANANTH KUMAR (Banglore South): Madam, the State Government of Karnataka have every right to continue with their ongoing projects in the Cauvery basin...(Interruptions) It is well within our rights to continue with the Mekedatu Reservoir Project also...(Interruptions) The Cauvery Tribunal has given its final award, which is against the interest of the people and the farmers of Karnataka...(Interruptions) It is like a death sentence for us. ...(Interruptions) The Karnataka Government has challenged this final award of the Cauvery Tribunal in the hon' Supreme Court...(Interruptions)

**12.08 hrs.**

*At this stage, Shri P. Kumar and some other hon. members came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

This being the case, the people and the farmers of Karnataka have every right to continue with our ongoing projects and new projects in Cauvery, Hemavati, Kabini and Arkavathi rivers...(Interruptions)

**12.08½ hrs.**

*At this stage, Shri Adhi Sankar and some other hon. members came and stood on the floor near the table*



The Government of Tamil Nadu should not try to meddle and restrain the irrigation projects of Karnataka. ...*(Interruptions)* Therefore, I urge the Government of India to restrain the Tamil Nadu Government from interfering in the irrigation projects of Karnataka. ...*(Interruptions)* All the farmers and the people of Karnataka will continue with the ongoing and new projects, and we will be doing so to fully utilize Karnataka's share of Cauvery river waters....*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members Shri Prahlad Joshi, Shri Shivarama Gouda, Shri Nalin Kumar Kateel and Shri Suresh angadi are allowed to associate with the issue raised by Shri Ananth Kumar.

**12.09 hrs.**

*At this stage, Shri P. Kumar, Shri Adhi Sankar and some other hon. members went back to their seats.*

*[Translation]*

SHRI REWATI RAMAN SINGH (Allahabad): Madam Speaker, I have raised the matter regarding granting the status of Scheduled Tribe to the Kol community several times since the formation of 15th Lok Sabha and even before this...*(Interruptions)* Now Ministry of Tribal Affairs has been constituted separately while Government have referred this matter to R.G.I. R.G.I. RGI had rejected it on the basis of Census for 1931. I would request, through you, that Kol Community should be granted the status of Scheduled tribe...*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing else will go on record.

...*(Interruptions)*\*

*[Translation]*

SHRI REWATI RAMAN SINGH: If a girl from Uttar Pradesh gets married to the Madhya Pradesh boy, she gets the status of Scheduled Tribe...*(Interruptions)* and when a girl from Madhya Pradesh get married to a Uttar Pradesh boy, she is registered as Scheduled Caste...*(Interruptions)* Shri Mulayam Singh...*(Interruptions)* Uttar Pradesh Government and Shri Mulayam Singh sent this proposal twice. I would like to urge, through you, that since Ministry of Tribal Affairs has become an

\*Not recorded.

independence Ministry, it should be decided by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs and not by R.G.I....*(Interruptions)* This is what my request to you...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHALENDRA KUMAR (Kaushambi): Madam Speaker, Let the reply come...*(Interruptions)* It is very serious matter....*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Shailendra Kumar ji, now please sit down. Don't stand at will. Let him speak, it is zero hour. How can you expect a reply to everything? Now please sit down.

...*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Gurudas Dasgupta, please be very brief.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA: Madam, through you, I wish to draw the notice of the entire House to a very serious situation which concerns the sovereignty, integrity and national privacy of the country.

There is news that American Administration are having surveillance over India. There is news that India is under surveillance and NASA is doing the surveillance. In the list of the countries under watch of the American imperialism, first is Brazil, second is Egypt, and third is India.

We are under surveillance. The most astonishing point is there is a report that very near to Delhi, there is a post, there is a pillar, and there is a mechanism which allows the NASA to even know what Mr. Chidmabaram i saying to the Prime Minister. ...*(Interruptions)* Be careful when you are talking to your girlfriend. ...*(Interruptions)* Madam, the point is NASA is even recording telephonic conversations, Internet messages, and also E-mail. Everything is being recorded.

Madam, I would like to know from the Government whether it is a serious infringement of the political sovereignty of India. It is a serious intrusion into the privacy of the Indian citizens, as also of the Government. It is serious security hazard. There is nothing secret. Our Defence Minister having a discussion with the leaders of the Army is also being recorded. This is a serious

onslaught on the sovereignty of India, just like Syria.

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: Now please conclude.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : This is a question of international importance. America cannot be allowed to become the guardian of the entire world and do whatever they like. I wish the entire House joins me in condemning this. I am demanding a statement from the Government and also removal of all mechanism which is connecting with NASA surveillance.

I am making this appeal to the patriotic Government. They should believe it is a slur on them, on the Government, on us, and on everybody. Let the House join me in condemning American action. I am demanding a statement from the Government immediately.  
...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri P.K. Biju, Shri Shivkumar Udasi, Shri Devji M. Patel, Shri M.B. Rajesh and Shri Pralhad Joshi are permitted to associate with Shri Gurudas Dasgupta on the issue raised by him.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Rest of the 'Zero Hour' matters will be taken up at the end of the day. We will now take up item No. 7, and the hon. Minister to continue, please.

...(Interruptions)

**12.15 hrs.**

PENSION FUND REGULATORY AND DEVELOPMENT  
AUTHORITY BILL, 2011 – Contd.

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM): Madam, may I continue my speech?  
...(Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): The Government has not reacted so far. ...(Interruptions)

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: The hon. Speaker has called me now.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : The Government has not reacted so far. ...(Interruptions)

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: About what?  
...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: It is a time barred notice.

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Now you please sit down.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: The notice is time-barred. It has come after the time.

...(Interruptions)

**12.15½ hrs.**

*At this stage, Shri C.R. Patil and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

MADAM SPEAKER: Now, Shri Chidambaram to continue.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM : Madam, may I continue?  
... (Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Yes, please continue.  
...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: Now you please sit down.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing else will go in record.

...(Interruptions)\*

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Madam, I am continuing my speech.

(iii) The Standing Committee on Finance recommended that it should be mandatory for

\*Not recorded.

pension fund managers to ensure the safety of funds deposited by subscribers in order to provide complete security for their funds. It has already been provided in the PFRDA Bill, 2011 that the interests of subscribers would be protected by ensuring safety of the contribution of subscribers and by keeping the operational costs in check. ...*(Interruptions)*

(iv) The Standing Committee on Finance recommended permitting withdrawals and repayable advances from the pension account of the subscriber. The official amendments provide that withdrawal not exceeding 25% of the contribution made by subscriber will be permitted from the individual pension account subject to conditions, such as purpose, frequency and limits as may be specified by regulations by the PFRDA. ...*(Interruptions)*

(v) The Standing Committee on Finance recommended providing minimum assured/ guaranteed returns to the subscribers of the NPS. The official amendments provide that the subscriber seeking minimum assured returns shall be allowed to opt for investing his funds in such schemes providing minimum assured returns as may be notified by the PFRDA. ... *(Interruptions)*

(vi) The Standing Committee on Finance recommended that at least one-third of the fund managers are selected from the public sector. It is already provided in the PFRDA Bill, 2011 that at least one of the pension fund managers shall be from the public sector. This implies that there is no prohibition in the PFRDA Bill, 2011 that prevents more than one public sector pension fund managers from being chosen by the PFRDA, if these are selected on a competitive basis. ... *(Interruptions)*

(vii) The Standing Committee on Finance recommended establishment of a vibrant Pension Advisory Committee with direct representation from all major stakeholders to advise PFRDA on *suo moto* basis even on matters not referred to it. The official amendments provide that the

objects of the Pension Advisory Committee shall be to advise the authority on matters relating to the making of regulations under Section 51. Further, the Pension Advisory Committee may advise the Authority on such matters as may be referred to it by the Authority and also on such matters as the Committee may deem fit. ... *(Interruptions)*

#### 12.17 hrs

*At this stage, Shri M.B. Rajesh and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

Further, the recommendation of the Standing Committee on Finance on PFRDA Bill, 2011 on making NPS a truly National Pension System is already under implementation as the Government has already launched a co-contributory pension scheme called "Swavalamban" for unorganized sector workers, where some States are also co-contributing additional contribution to workers in specified sectors. ...*(Interruptions)*

It is expected that with the additional amendments to the PFRDA Bill, 2011, the concerns of all stakeholders including the Standing Committee on Finance would be adequately addressed. ...*(Interruptions)*

I commend the PFRDA Bill, 2011 for consideration and passing by this august House. ... *(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That the Bill to provide for the establishment of an Authority to promote old age income security by establishing, developing and regulating pension funds, to protect the interests of subscribers to schemes of pension funds and for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto be taken into consideration."

Now, Shri Nishikant Dubey.

*[Translation]*

SHRI NISHIKANT DUBEY (Godda): Madam, let the House come to order first...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Call, call your members back. You please speak to them. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI NISHI KANT DUBEY: Madam Speaker, I am not the leader...*(Interruptions)* First let the House come to order otherwise, it would be difficult to speak ...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Alright, Shri Sanjay Nirupam, you please speak.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SANJAY NIRUPAM (Mumbai North): Hon. Minister of Finance has come up with Pension Fund Regulatory Development Authority Bill, 2011 in the House today...*(Interruptions)* It is there to regulate the PFRDA constituted in 2005, It aims at regulating the pension system...*(Interruptions)* It is for providing it the legal authority that is why Hon. Minister of Finance has brought it...*(Interruptions)* I heartily support this bill brought by the Hon. Minister of Finance because it will provide relief in respect of problems that are faced by retired and senior citizens. ...*(Interruptions)* Senior citizen will feel relieved...*(Interruptions)* There are a number of schemes that we have in our country even before this pension scheme came into being. However...*(Interruptions)* they are based on defined benefits.

In 2003 Government decided that there should be a pension scheme based on defined acquisition that way a new pension scheme came into effect. The employees, who joined Central Government Service on or after 1st January, 2004 will be covered by this new pension scheme...*(Interruptions)* It provides that it will be compulsory for Central Government employees while for the other citizen it will be voluntary...*(Interruptions)* However in the year 2009 budget, it was declared that common man can also join this on regular basis and get benefited from the pension scheme...*(Interruptions)*

Madam, what is pension? In fact this pension is support to the persons concerned at a time when he is left with no support to fall back upon...*(Interruptions)* I consider this session a historical session because this session saw the passage of three great bills simultaneously. First one was related to the poor, the hungry, victims of malnutrition, that is Food Security Bill to take care of these problems...*(Interruptions)*. Second was Land Acquisition Bill which empowered farmers so

that nobody is able to acquire their lands on flimsy grounds and petty purposes is making them landless. Third one is pension bill that relates to senior citizen of this country. which will stand with them as their support in their old age...*(Interruptions)* In this way this session should be considered as historical. Though this had to face strong opposition, hurdles etc but somehow these three bills are going to be passed...*(Interruptions)* I would like to tell the people of the country and my fellow members, through you and through the Pension Bill that our country is considered to be youngest. It is said that about 60 to 65 percent of our population is in the age group of 25 to 35...*(Interruptions)* Please remember, these youths will grow old and for such old people there should be some arrangement, some foolproof arrangement has to be in place and that is what has been done through this bill.

Madam, I want to say two things with regard to this Bill. This Bill has been brought in with a view to regulating NPA. Why only NPS? There are already so many different pension funds through EPFO in our country. There are different rules for that...*(Interruptions)* I would like to state that the Government should gradually bring all the pension schemes under PFRDA. I know that the previous pension schemes are based on defined benefit but other pension schemes which are going to be launched now are contributory...*(Interruptions)* Still I would like to say that all the pension schemes should be brought in its fold by slow degrees. The important provision in this Bill is that all the pensioners have got the right of opening individual accounts, operate and handle it. Through this account pensioners will come to know as to how much money they have in their account...*(Interruptions)* Standing Committee gave suggestions, after accepting all the suggestions, one suggestion has not been accepted and that is if an account holder has pens to withdraw from this account and wants that withdrawal to invest afterwards, it has not been allowed by you...*(Interruptions)* You have kept provision of lower withdrawal from one account. I think, it is said in Chapter 5 or 6 that one more account can be opened. You are allowing withdrawal from another account. In my opinion, there should not be two accounts, one account is sufficient...*(Interruptions)* It would be better if the Government makes its stand clear in this regard.

Madam, there are so many other things also in the Pension Bill. Especially, the way the Pension Fund Regulatory Authority will work, its rights, its responsibilities, and the way it will save the interests of pensioners, I agree in this regard...*(Interruptions)* These provisions are very good, and stringent. Certainly these provisions will be beneficial for pensioners. But you have provided one thing under this pension scheme that a pensioner can invest some part of his account in equity market or debt market. You are fixing limit of 10 percent or so. I think this is Okay. But at anything you put money of pensioner in equity market, clash will start among regulators. How clash takes place among regulators? You might remember when ULIP which is a product of insurance sector was rolled out and when investment started through ULIP in equity and debt market, SEBI raised an objection that they could also be its regulator. Even today IRDA and SEBI dispute has not come to an end. I fear that if one part of NPS goes to equity market...*(Interruptions)* it is certain that in the coming days clash will take place between SEBI and ...*(Interruptions)* Pension Regulatory Authority. ...*(Interruptions)* Steps should be taken to prevent this conflict.

Lastly, NPS was introduced in the year 2003-04 ...*(Interruptions)* but only 52 lakh persons have become account holder of NPS, so far. It is going on at a very slow pace. I think that Government should publicize NPS more and more, and promote and encourage common people apart from Government officials and employees to join the compulsory pension scheme. Will this, people of our country who are of the age of senior citizens, will be secured. At last, old pension scheme is there in our country and it comes under the category of BPL. ...*(Interruptions)* Though it is not the part of this Bill. I take this opportunity to demand from the Government, through you that old age pension scheme should be made universal and this scheme should be implemented for all citizens of this country. I know that the committee set up on it, has maintained this will involve expenditure of 30 thousand crore rupees, yet the Government should be ready to give 30 thousand crore rupees, because it is a question of life security of 11 percent senior citizens of our country...*(Interruptions)* a universal old age

pension scheme should be implemented for the security of all senior citizens. I request you. I congratulate the Government and the Minister of Finance for presenting such a good Bill...*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

PROF. SAUGATA ROY (Dum Dum): Madam, on behalf of our party we oppose the Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority Bill. ...*(Interruptions)*

Madam, since before Independence the main attraction of a government job either in the Central or the State Government was that it ensured a pension which people get till the end of their life. And in Central Government, the spouse could also have the pension money till the end of his or her life. ... *(Interruptions)*

This Government, in 2004 started a new pension system. What was the new pension system? The new pension system said that people could invest in a pension fund and there could be several pension funds in the country of which one would be a Government company. ... *(Interruptions)*

This Bill has been pending since 2005. It was sent to the Standing Committee and the Standing Committee sent it back. The Government again brought amendments to the Bill in 2009, but so far the Bill was not passed. ...*(Interruptions)*

**12.30 hrs**

*At this stage, Dr. Ram Chandra Dore, Shri P. Lingam and some other hon. Members went back to their seats.*

PROF. SAUGATA ROY : It is all right if the Finance Minister opens a Pension Fund for the people who are not Central or State Government employees. Let the people in the unorganised sector, those working in the private companies invest or contribute in a pension fund and then you do what you want to do with it. You play the market. But as far as the Government employees are concerned, their security should be ensured and the Government should only invest in the Government security. Maybe the return will be less but let them at

least be given a social security for the future. ...*(Interruptions)*

What has the Minister done? He has gone ahead. He is setting up a Pension Fund Regulation and Development Authority. It will have a Chairman; it will have Members. It will have powers to impose service charges. It will have power to impose penalties. It will also have the option of investing in the stock market, in the share market. Now, basically if you play share market with people's social security money, it is subject to market risks. When somebody invests in a mutual fund, it is always written that the mutual fund is subject to market risks. So, you are subjecting the social security component to the market risk. This is an idea to bring more money, the savings of people, into the market so that the share market can move. ...*(Interruptions)*

I know that the option is there. If somebody wants, it is an individual based pension fund. So, if the subscriber wants he can decide that he shall only invest in Government securities. That freedom is given to him but what the pension funds will do is they will lure the people with greater returns and let them invest in pension fund where the return will be high. If the market crashes, like it does in America, what happens to the future of this scheme? ...*(Interruptions)*

After having set up a pension fund the Minister has set up an elaborate structure. I have nothing to say. If the Government insists it will lead this elaborate structure. It has also set up Advisory Committees on the pension funds. It has also allowed a 'person in place' point. Even bank branches will be able to collect deposits in the Pension Fund. I had said earlier that this pension fund idea takes away the concept of assured future for Government employees and that is why we are opposing this Bill...*(Interruptions)*

In an amendment the Finance Minister is allowing 26 per cent FDI into the pension fund. Madam, it is not clear to me as to what skill is required in investing money of the pension fund. Why do you want the foreign companies to come into our Pension Fund area and what benefit does it have? On the one hand the Bill says that you cannot invest pension fund abroad and on the other you say that you can have FDI. We oppose FDI up to 26

per cent in pension money....*(Interruptions)* We have urged the Finance Minister to have a pension fund for non-Government employees but please assure ...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Thank you so much. Please conclude now. Please take your seat.

PROF. SAUGATA ROY : Please assure the future of Central and State Government employees instead of creating a huge mechanism to promote your pension fund and bring poor man's savings into the market. ...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Please conclude.

PROF. SAUGATA ROY: Madam, the House must be in order. We have spoken in this din but the Bill should not be passed in a din. That is our point. Let there be order. Such an important Bill affecting the lives and future of millions of people should not be passed in a din, without proper discussion in the House and without discussion on the various amendments which the Members of this House have put forward...*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

SHRI SHAILENDRA KUMAR (Kaushambi): Madam Speaker, I am grateful to you that you have given me an opportunity to speak on Pension Funds Regulatory and Development Authority Bill, 2011. When I was reading this Bill, I remembered our friend and senior colleague, Shri Yashwant Sinha ji, had also recommended strongly in the standing committee that all should have the guarantee of fixed pension. It appears from this Bill that there is no provision for any fixed pension to pension beneficiaries. The way the Government has brought this Bill, the Central Government has decided to bring about changes in the new pension scheme. We see that today there are about 27 lakhs employees within the ambit of NPS. If the amount is less than two lakhs, those pensioners cannot withdraw it whereas he will have to choose the alternative of leaving NPS. Today it is provided in this Bill that under NPS one can go out of it at the age of 60 years or even less years of age. In our opinion, pension should be implemented as a right. In a way, everyone should have the right to pension. As compared to India, there are several such small and medium

countries in the world who give more pension than that of India. If it is seen, only thirty rupees has been provided as pension to the old age persons. Sometime back 3000 old age person of the country assembled at Jantar Mantar and staged dharna in which they articulated their right to pension. All of our colleagues have always raised this issue that the plight of the workers of unorganised sector is very pitiable today.

Madam, we have just now passed Food Security Bill in this House. If we see, provision of ration for old age persons has not been made adequately in the Food Security Bill. The needy persons are not able to get it in sufficient quantity. In India, even today, pension is not given to all needy persons. Pension has been arranged only for 25 percent people, and that too is received in six-six months. If they need it suddenly, it cannot be arranged. Even so, those old age persons are finding it very difficult to sustain with such a meagre pension. There is arrangement in our country that when some other pensioner dies only then new pension scheme is implemented. The Government gives pension only to those who fall in this BPL category and not to their sons. Therefore, enact such law by which APL, BPL or their employed sons should be excluded from that ambit. The old age people, who had staged Dharna, have demanded that universal old age pension scheme should immediately be formulated. Per month pension of 2500 rupees, should be 3000 rupees. It should be given to the persons eligible for pension as right. Pension should be reviewed at every two months or in three years. Provision should be made to increase pension after six month as per dearness. Second thing is that eligibility age for pension has been fixed at 55 years for men and 50 years for women...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Please conclude.

SHRI SHAILENDRA KUMAR: They have also demanded that eligibility age for pension should be 45 years for tribals, eunuch, women victim of human trafficking and flesh trade. ...*(Interruptions)*

MADAM SPEAKER: Your point has been covered.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHAILENDRA KUMAR: Third point, new

employees have been subjected to huge loss due to this Bill. New Pension Scheme has short comings. It covers Government employees only. There are 95 percent such citizens in the country who have been excluded from these provision. Through you, I would like to demand and conclude my point while opposing this Bill on behalf of my party.

*[English]*

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN (Chennai North): Madam Speaker, thank you for allowing me to speak on this very important subject of pension. ...*(Interruptions)* When this Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority Bill was introduced in the last Lok Sabha, we had opposed the Bill on the account that the pension fund should not be invested in private sector, and it should not be invested in private securities. ...*(Interruptions)*

Now, one more dangerous feature has been added in the Bill by way of an amendment. ...*(Interruptions)* Now 26 per cent of FDI is allowed from the pension fund. ...*(Interruptions)* The Government has not taken our views very seriously...*(Interruptions)* You know how the stock market fluctuates. Today, you know how the NIFTY is oscillating. You know how much the NIFTY has come down. ...*(Interruptions)* You know about the market fluctuations. ...*(Interruptions)* In this period, if the pension fund is allowed to be invested in the public issues, then the Government burden will increase. ...*(Interruptions)* The Government, in fact, has to bear more from their exchequer. ...*(Interruptions)* Why should the Government invest the fund in the market? ...*(Interruptions)* We have opposed this even when this Bill was introduced during the last Lok Sabha. ...*(Interruptions)*

Now, there are many other issues concerning the pensioners. ...*(Interruptions)* Under the Family Pension Scheme, I have seen pensioners drawing pension as low as Rs. 10 or Rs. 15. ...*(Interruptions)* Even an old age pensioner draw a pension of Rs. 1,000, whereas a person who has served the public sector undertaking or who has served the Government is drawing a pension as low as Rs. 100 or Rs. 200. ...*(Interruptions)* The Government should do something about that. ...*(Interruptions)*

In the banking sector there is a problem.

...(Interruptions) The All India Bank Employees Association has planned to go on hunger strike on 20th of this month. ...(Interruptions) There are instances where the management has failed to uphold the understanding reached with the trade unions. ...(Interruptions) So, there are various other issues regarding pension. ...(Interruptions) In this condition, The Government trying to invest pension funds in the private sector will not do any good to the pensioners themselves. ...(Interruptions) They will be affected....(Interruptions)

So my request is that the hon. Minister should immediately withdraw this clause that allows investment of pension funds in private securities. ...(Interruptions) It should be only on public securities. ...(Interruptions) So, I would request the hon. Minister not to invest the pension funds in the private securities and do not allow FDI in the pension scheme. ...(Interruptions)

With these words, I thank you Madam.

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri A. Sampath.

SHRI A. SAMPATH (Attingal): Madam Speaker, on my behalf, my leader Shri Basu Deb Acharia may please be allowed to speak.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri A. Sampath to speak now.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI A. SAMPATH: Madam Speaker, Shri Basu Deb Acharia will speak on this Bill...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Basu Deb Acharia, do you want to speak?

...(Interruptions) .

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA: Madam Speaker, I rise to oppose this Bill...(Interruptions) Madam, please bring the House to order...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please go back to your seats and bring the House to order.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. members, do not do that.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: Do not shout like this.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: That is very wrong. Do not insult the Chair.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Do not insult the Chair. Do not do that.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: Don't disrespect this place. Don't speak like this. We are trying our best to conduct the House and if you people cooperate in it that it would be much better.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: You talk with them.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Please go back to your seats. Please do not do these things.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MADAM SPEAKER: You people know to get angry only, shouting and crying.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: You people know to angry on us only.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

MADAM SPEAKER: Do what you like.

...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Yes, you do what you like.

...(Interruptions)



MADAM SPEAKER: Yes, you can do what you like. If you want to get angry with the Chair, you get angry with the chair. If you want to insult the Chair, you can insult the chair!

...(Interruptions)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Hazaribagh): Madam, this is no way to run the House. I want to say this much...(Interruptions)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

...(Interruptions)\*

MADAM SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 2.00 p.m.

**12.50 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Fourteen of the Clock.*

**14.00 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Fourteen of the Clock.*

[MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

PENSION FUND REGULATORY AND DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY BILL, 2011 - CONTD.

[Translation]

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Shri Basu Deb Achariya.

...(Interruptions)

**14.0½ hrs.**

*At this stage, Shri Ganesh Singh and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

[English]

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (Bankura): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, unless you bring the House to order, I cannot speak. ...(Interruptions) Please bring the House to order first. ...(Interruptions)\*

[Translation]

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: You speak.

...(Interruptions)

\*Not recorded.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: You please sit down.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 2.30 p.m.

**14.01 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Thirty Minutes past Fourteen of the Clock.*

**14.30 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Thirty Minutes past Fourteen of the Clock*

[SHRI P.C. CHAKO *in the Chair*]

[Translation]

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ (Vidisha): Mr. Chairman Sir, we are demanding today since morning that ours was an adjournment motion regarding coal block allocation, and we should have a discussion on it. Coal block allocation has become such an issue of corruption which is emerging in the country assuming different dimensions. You would recall that first of all the revelation of this case was made in that report of CAG in which it was said that 186000 crore rupees loss to the exchequer of the country has been made in coal block allocation and allegation of large scale nepotism was also made therein. This issue was raised in parliament also and went in Supreme Court also and the Supreme Court in its supervision referred this case to the CBI for investigation. Investigation was going on then a new dimension emerged out. At the time when CBI was to submit its affidavit in Supreme Court, Minister of Law called the CBI officers in his room and got changed all the comments relating to the Prime Minister they had written. The matter was so highlighted that the concerned Minister of Law had to resign. Mr. Chairman Sir, after that a third new stage came when CBI called for files from the Ministry of Coal for investigation, then Ministry of Coal, while raising their hands said that more than 150 files were there and later on this number increased to 189. 189 files were missing. This matter was highlighted again,

this matter was raised in Parliament, Statement from the Prime Minister was demanded, then the Prime Minister came to the House and he himself confessed that files were missing. We are locating. Here first question was from the Hon. Prime Minister if he would stay here I would ask him that the first step of the effort is to get on FIR registered. The Supreme Court in its observation asked whether they had got an FIR registered. We could also like to ask from Parliament that as to the whether they had got an FIR registered. Now this matter doesn't pertain to missing, it is in stolen category.

Mr. Chairman Sir, missing is the thing that I forget to place it somewhere, keep on searching then I will say it is missing and is not traced. But it is not traced up to four or six days then I should realize that the thing has not been lost by me while placing somewhere but has been stolen by someone. This matter is of theft. Therefore FIR should be registered immediately in this regard, but the Government has not got any FIR registered in this regard so far.

Another serious stage came for that we have given adjournment motion. Today two newspapers have reported. One Indian Express, its lead news is that investigation officer of CBI has said that he cannot take this investigation to a logical conclusion till Prime Minister is not examined....(Interruptions)

Secondly, Mail Today says that A.G. had himself given a list of missing files, and Prime Minister has rejected it. Those are so called missing files. There is a complete list and I am to say with full responsibility that the entire list is of those influential people who are related to Congress. Therefore, we wanted to raise this issue here today because this fourth dimension has cropped up and this is the only case. In the rest of all Prime Minister would get a clean chit...(Interruptions). In rest of the cases somewhere they had talked of Raja, somewhere talked of other person, but this is such an issue where Prime Minister is directly involved because at the time when this incident happened he himself was Minister of Coal. Therefore I, through you, would like to say that at first Government should tell us as to by when they will get FIR registered. If you don't get a FIR registered your integrity becomes doubtful that you don't want to trace these missing files. You don't want to trace these stolen files and no other pressure should be

imposed on CBI on the preface that an investigation officer has said investigation will not move further till Prime Minister is not examined, If the Prime Minister himself wants to find himself spotless and clean, he himself should come forward voluntarily so that truth may come out. For this I am putting myself before you. You come and examine me so that country could know the truth...(Interruptions) Therefore I would like to say whatever cases of corruption are ...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please you take your seats.

...(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: The cases of corruption unearthed by CAG till now, whether that is of CWG of 2G, the case of coal block allotment is most serious among these because the Prime Minister himself is in the ambit. Therefore, I demand that immediately an FIR should be registered and there should not be any pressure or interference in matter of investigation. ....(Interruptions)

SHRI SHAILENDRA KUMAR (Kaushambi): Hon'ble Chairman Sir, the matter raised by Leader of Opposition is a very serious matter. It has been seen that upto now a scam of 1,86,000 crore has been committed in the coal block allotment. The biggest question is that whether the Prime Minister is being protected for this or what extent the Prime Minister is responsible for that. Secondly, there is big question mark on the trustworthiness of the CBI. Whether Government is misusing the CBI or on whose directions CBI is working or there is question mark on the autonomy of the CBI. This is very serious matter. Who is responsible for that missing files? As far as the question of FIR is concerned, it is also a big question that against whom FIR should be registered. The Prime Minister has said that they are not responsible for the missing of file. Then against whom FIR should be registered and who is responsible for that. There should be clear answer in this regard.

Many other such scams have been committed and many reports of CVC have been submitted. Today, the people of the country have lost their faith in the leaders. All the cases of frauds and corruption should be unearthed. The image of leaders among the people is

being ruined and that can only be saved when some action is taken. I demand that Government should give clear answer in this regard.

SHRI SHARAD YADAV (Madhepura): Mr. Chairman Sir, I do not want to go into the details whatever Shshmajji has said....(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: You please address the Chair.

SHRI SHARAD YADAV: Rs. 1,86,000 crore, I would like to request you that who gave the information about the missing file. The hon'ble Minister of the Government of India Shri Sriprakash Jaiswal gave the information regarding missing file first of all. It was his first statement. But later on he gave another changed statement that most of the files have been found and some files are missing and those will also be traced. After that there is a statement of the Prime Minister. He also does not state that how many files are missing and how many are with the Government which are to be given to the CBI. Now, the number is not that much big but why Government is not transparent in giving the answer? The Prime Minister had been the Minister of this Ministry, therefore Government owes the responsibility. Why do the Ministers in the Government give different statements? The whole market, whole economy of the country has come to stand still and people are in difficult situation. Why do Government not speak in one voice? One Minister has suggested that Petrol Pumps will remain close from 8.00 in the night to 8.00 in the morning. The Prime Minister is denying this. It is surprising. Why this mismanagement? Whether opposition is doing all this? These days, there is visual media.

Today, it is the biggest thing that files are missing, Sushma ji has asked about the number of missing files and how many are remaining with you. Therefore, I would like to ask you as to how many files of people of this House or outside House, Congress Party or all our parties are missing...(Interruptions) Those files are missing because they are to be saved...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sharad ji, You please be brief.

SHRI SHARAD YADAV: I am concluding. It is clear that when Government acts the country runs. This Government does not act in any matter. We always try that this House functions but when House does not run then all these things happen. We have a lot of material.

We had to say much more on coal block issue but we could not get much time. I would like to request that I do not want to go into details about what the Supreme Court has said. They have said that the Government should report about the missing files. People of the country have not elected the Supreme Court. People have elected the Government. Who is responsible if file is missing from your custody? The Prime Minister says that he is not responsible for that. He is holding highest position and if he is not in a position to act then who will do this? He is the only person who is responsible for that...(Interruptions) Now Shri Sriprakash Jaiswal speaks like a great person is speaking...(Interruptions) His relatives, friends are in it. I have asked Sonia ji to suspend them....(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (Ghatal): Sir, where is the Coal Minister? We are discussing the matter regarding coal. ...(Interruptions) Prime Minister is not here, leave this matter...(Interruptions) Where is the Coal Minister?... (Interruptions) The Coal Minister must come. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Sir, you adjourn the House till the Coal Minister comes. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please wait. There are senior Ministers on the Government side. All that is discussed will be reported to him.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. After him, you will get time.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Sharad ji, please conclude.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, this is the discussion regarding coal. ...(Interruptions) The Coal Minister must come. ... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, he will come. Please take your seat.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Dasgupta ji, please allow the discussion to take place. The Coal Minister will come. Please take your seat.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI SHARAD YADAV: Mr. Chairman Sir, so many senior MPs are present here and the Prime Minister is not present here. All these colleagues are raising right issues. Our points should percolate down rightly otherwise under whom it will percolate Farukh Saheb or under Chidambram Saheb. It would have been unfortunate if the department of Government had been so big. I request you that the Government of India should immediately reveal as to how many files are missing?... (Interruptions) Secondly, it should also be informed that how many files have been given to the CBI? Thirdly, there should be transparency on the part of Government... (Interruptions) If there is any mistake, it should be owned. If it is not there then that should also be clarified.... (Interruptions) I beg your pardon, I had to speak. You have given less time, Kamal Nath ji is not present here. He has left with the directions that I should speak less.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN : Now, Shri Dara Singh Chauhan.

PROF. SAUGATA ROY : Sir, I am on a point of order on the business that is going on.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, first quote the rule.

PROF. SAUGATA ROY : Sir, it is under Rule 372.

I have no objection to the discussion being carried out on the missing coal files and on the Statement made by the Leader of the Opposition and other very important leaders. I am not speaking on the merits of the matter. But I want to understand, just for my knowledge, that under what rule we are discussing it.

You can say that we are doing this to bring peace in the House. But, at least, Sir, we must observe the Rule and follow the procedures. Rule 372 says that if the Minister makes a Statement, then there will be no discussion on the Statement.

The Prime Minister made a statement yesterday and he left the House. Some Members have pointed out that it is not a proper courtesy to leave the House immediately after speaking. But that was not Rules of Procedure; that

was a rule of behaviour. It is written that the Member should not leave immediately after he has given a speech.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please.

PROF. SAUGATA ROY : Sir, let me complete. If a discussion was to take place, it can only take place under Rule 342 where any Statement can be taken into consideration. Unless there is a proper notice and if you allow rampant speeches, then the rules of the House are not observed.

I would like you to illuminate me under what rule it is being discussed. I am not speaking on behalf of my party. My colleague Mr. Kalyan Banerjee will be speaking on the subject.

But please explain to me under what rule this discussion on the missing coal files is being carried on. If you say that "we are using discretionary power", you tell me under what discretionary powers, you are allowing a discussion on this... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, please take your seat.

The hon. Speaker had received a notice, and that notice was disallowed. The Speaker had given the ruling yesterday that after the Prime Minister's speech, there cannot be a discussion on that. But today, considering the precedent in this House, it was allowed. The precedent is that on a matter of public importance, the Speaker can permit; and using that precedent, we are allowing a discussion. So, a few Members would be allowed to speak.

PROF. SAUGATA ROY : Under what rule is this discussion taking place?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please understand.

SHRI SHARAD YADAV : Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. This is enough.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Prof. Saugata Roy, you are very

right that on the statement of the Prime Minister, a discussion is not allowed as per Rule 372. But there is a precedent in this House; and the Speaker uses that discretion and allows such discussion. Actually, this is not a discussion. These are only submissions. In a few minutes time, the leaders who want to speak and have already intimated to the Chair that they want to speak, can only make a submission.

This is not a discussion; this is only a submission. Please take only two or three minutes each.

[Translation]

SHRI DARA SINGH CHAUHAN (Ghosi): Sir, there has been continuous padmemonium in the House for many days on the issue of missing files of coal scam which is a matter of great concern. The House is not able to discuss many important national issues due to the ongoing pandemonium. the whole House is concerned about it, We all are concerned about those missing files. It is a matter of investigation as to how these files have gone missing, how many files are missing and the time period to which these files belong. Therefore, I myself and my party want to know as to what are reasons for all these things. Our leader has also put across this before the country through media. This matter should be investigated and truth should come out before the country and the Government should take appropriate action in this regard.

[English]

SHRI KALYAN BANERJEE (Sreerampur): Mr. Chairman, Sir, the whole procedure of allotment of coal blocks in our country is the greatest scam of the country. Mr. Chairman, Sir, it is very unfortunate that since 1993 when the coal blocks were being allotted to the people, no transparent procedure had been followed in our country. First of all, at the first stage, nobody was aware which coal blocks were being allotted. The persons, who got the benefit of the coal blocks, were only aware of it. After that, notice was being issued that the coal blocks should be allotted. That procedure was followed. Never was any tender floated for the allotment of the coal blocks. The country has given a lot of coal blocks to the persons concerned but this country has not received a single amount of revenue for the coal blocks.

Sir, the most dangerous part is that right from the beginning when the coal blocks were allotted, the minutes are there but in support of the minutes, there is not a single file or a single document. When the Standing Committee took up this matter for consideration, despite the nation's loss, the Ministry had failed to produce the records —I say records—in support of those minutes. Therefore, unless the ascertainment of the loss of coal blocks is on a presumptive value, the actual ascertainment cannot be done even by the Standing Committee since the files were not available. The Standing Committee gave its recommendation four months back that there should be a threadbare investigation by the Central Bureau of Investigation from the inception of the allotment of the coal blocks. It is not only for the losing of the files either from 2008 or 2009. This country wants to know the truth right from 1993 to 2009.

This is not a political target at all. People must know from 1993 to 2009 on what basis the coal blocks were allotted and what supporting documents are there for every minute. I am not speaking for a particular period. I am not speaking who are the parties in the power. I am speaking as a Member of Parliament that right from 1993 to 2009, there should be a threadbare investigation by the CBI to find out where the files have gone. It is not only the period from 2005 to 2009 but also from 1993 to 2009. That is my greatest submission before you, Sir.

Hon. Chairman, since you have said that it is purely for making a submission, I am making a great submission through you, kindly pass a Resolution that the whole investigation should be done from 1993 to 2009. Since I am the Chairman of the Standing Committee, I have spent a lot of time on this. I did not get a single document from 1993-2009. There must be an investigation to find out all the files during this period.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Basu Deb Acharia, please make your submission briefly.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (Bankura) : Mr. Chairman, Sir, I will be very brief in my submission. As we suggested that the Coal Minister would make a statement; then there would be a discussion and the Prime Minister would intervene, it is quite surprising at

there had not been any discussion in this House; although there was a discussion in the other House.

The Government agreed for a discussion. Yesterday, the issue of missing of files has been taken very casually by the Prime Minister in his statement. After four months, the Prime Minister said 'so-called missing files'. The Coal Minister has stated that the missing files were pertaining to the period prior to 2004. I want to know as to what the intention of the Government is behind making such a statement. Then afterwards, it was found that many of the files, which are missing, are pertaining to a period when the Prime Minister himself was in charge of Ministry of Coal.

When there is a Screening Committee and justification for allotment of coal blocks was done by it in the files; each and every file was approved by the Prime Minister as he was in charge of the Ministry, I want to know as to why after so many days, after 3-4 months, the House was told that if the files are not found, there would be an enquiry. Why has FIR not been lodged? *[Translation]* Why FIR has not been registered so far? Everyone knows how many files are missing. *[English]* Everybody knows about it because this is the biggest scam – Allotment of coal blocks. In 21st Century, this is the biggest scam of Rs.1,86,000 crore. How these coal blocks were allotted? ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN : Do not listen to the prompting, you please complete your speech.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA: It is a scam of Rs.1,86,000 crore. The highest amount is involved in it. Whose money is this? It is the people's money. How the public fund has been distributed. The Supreme Court, while giving judgement on 2G Spectrum, not only cancelled 122 licences but it observed that the natural resources, mineral resources belong to the nation, to the people.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please wind up. This is a brief submission and not discussion.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : How were these people allowed to loot and plunder the natural resources of our country? *[Translation]* Therefore I demand that an

FIR should be lodged immediately. Allotment of coal blocks be cancelled. *[English]* This is the demand of the entire Opposition that all the allotment should be cancelled and a time-bound enquiry should be held. It took more than one year. ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Acharia ji, please take your seat Thambidurai ji, you please start.

...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Acharia ji, I have called the next speaker. Please take your seat.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : So, we demand cancellation of allotment of the coal blocks and a high level enquiry should be conducted in this case. ...*(Interruptions)*

**15.00 hrs.**

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI (Karur) : Mr. Chairman, corruption is a serious issue in this country. CAG has indicated so many scams involving the Government. The CAG has indicated scams like Commonwealth Games, 2G Spectrum Allocation, Coalgate, Railgate, land allocation for airport and so many others.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Confine to this.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI : I am coming to the point. It is the duty of the Government to take action and create confidence among the people that the Government is running properly. When the Government fails, the court takes this power. Unnecessarily the Government and the Parliament are embarrassed now as the judiciary is taking over all the power and is dictating. They are only saying that corruption is there. The court gives dissection to take action by the Government and judgment also. In spite of the judgment, the Government is not taking any action. Therefore, it does not create confidence in the Government is administration and the system. That is why, this is a serious matter.

Now I come to the missing coal block allocation files. Coal is very important for our country. What happened is that allocation of coalfields to particular companies has not been in order. That is what the CAG has indicated. When CAG has pointed it out, the

Government should have looked into it, but it failed. Therefore, some persons went to the court with a PIL.

Then the CBI said that it could not get relevant files to report to the court. This is also a very serious matter because at that time, our hon. Prime Minister was in-charge of the Coal Ministry. That is why we are taking it very seriously. Yesterday, when the hon. Prime Minister gave the statement, what he said was that the Government is making all efforts to locate the papers requisitioned by the CBI. That means, they are not in a position to give the files. Still they are making efforts to identify where they are located. This is the answer the Government is giving. Even when the hon. Prime Minister makes this kind of a statement, it definitely makes all the hon. Members feel agitated. At that time when we wanted to raise this issue, we could not do so because he left the House suddenly. Therefore, today we are discussing this matter. The Government must make all out efforts to see that all the files related to the allocation of coal blocks are located and given. They should file an FIR also against those who are responsible for mishandling the issue and those who are responsible for missing these files. It is very important.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB (Cuttack): Mr. Chairman, I was listening to the hon. Prime Minister's statement when it was being read out yesterday. After it was distributed, most of us went through it again and again. Some intelligent Members reacted instantly. But, today we are actually discussing on the missing coal files relying on the statement which the hon. Prime Minister has made.

In the statement that the hon. Prime Minister has made, he called it 'so called missing files'. He has also mentioned about more than 1.5 lakh pages of documentation have been handed over to the CBI. He has also mentioned 'if the records in question are indeed found missing...' That means, there is still doubt in the mind of the Prime Minister that the Government can locate some document, some file which is being termed today as missing.

I come to the point very briefly, Mr. Chairman. I have faith in the Prime Minister as the head of the Government when he says in the House of People that

the Government shall do its best to locate it. But, at the same time I would say very humbly that the timeframe is being stipulated by the apex court. Can the Government not frame a timeframe that within this time, we will locate it and hand over to the Apex Court? Why do you have to wait for the Supreme Court's direction? Why does the Government has to wait? In this matter, the CBI was asking for certain files. I would not say what transpired in PAC, what transpired between the C&AG and the Coal Ministry and what the Coal Ministry has been saying in different forums, but I will confine myself only to this statement that the CBI itself has posed before the Supreme Court that 'certain files, which we had asked for, have not been supplied to us.' It has not been mentioned how many files they had asked for and how many files have not been given, but it is stated that 'certain files which we had asked for, have not been provided.'

At the same time, I would say that there are two ways of reporting. One is filing a First Information Report which we normally call FIR; and another is to file a station diary. Why is this House asking the Government to file an FIR? Why am I saying that you file a station diary? It is because it will enable us and the whole nation to know how many files are actually required by CBI that are not being provided by the Ministry of Coal. If that is not told to us, there will be a lot of confusion. As such, there has been a disconnect because I believe, most of us believe that CBI is a part and organ of the establishment and if the establishment itself goes to the Apex Court and says that we are not being provided the files which we require for our investigation, then there is a disconnect and there is every logic to agitate it in this House or outside.

I thank, the media – print media as well as electronic media - because they have been persistently pursuing this issue. That is why, there is tremendous pressure on the establishment, on the CBI and also, to a certain extent, on the court to find the actual position. I would say that when all this was coming out in the media, the C&AG came out with a statement.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please conclude now. It is not a full-fledged discussion, only a submission.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB : Sir, I am not making a speech.

These are certain issues, I think. The C & AG says that 'nobody has asked us about the files. It may be with us. We can provide that.' By collating a number of documents from different Departments and from different Ministries also, a file can be prepared and submitted. It is not that everything is missing, but when a doubt is created, the Government should take appropriate measures to clear that doubt as soon as possible. Time should not be wasted to locate these files and time should not be asked from the court that a time-frame can be made.

With these words, I conclude.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Gurudas Dasgupta.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, first of all, I should tell you that kindly bear with me....(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, this is not a discussion, only a submission. So, take two minutes and finish.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, please do not remind me off and on.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have to because we are running out of time.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Please do not go on reminding from the Chair. ...(Interruptions) The point is that we cannot decide the time. You must say 'what is the time?' ...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, we have already decided the time.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : I do not know when you decided. Please let me make my submission, if you want. ...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, you can please make it as quickly as possible.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : The first point is that this is an *impromptu* discussion which has been agreed upon without any parliamentary precedent. This *impromptu* discussion has been agreed upon to buy

peace in the House so that the Government's agenda can get through. ...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do not go into that. Come to the topic.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : I am free to make my comment. If it is unparliamentary, you can expunge it. You cannot say what I am to say.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Dasgupta, I will call the next speaker after two minutes.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, in that case, I will walk out.

MR. CHAIRMAN: When your time is over, I will call the next speaker.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, do not interrupt.

MR. CHAIRMAN: After two minutes, I will call the next speaker.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, you must know that you cannot interrupt. ...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I can even ask you to withdraw that word, but you take your time and finish.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, you can ask me to withdraw from the House. You are only omnipotent. ...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please say what you want to say on this coal issue.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : You are omnipotent. (Interruptions)\*

SHRI NEERAJ SHEKHAR (Ballia): It is wrong to say like that. ...(Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Why am I saying it? It is agitating because firstly, I say, files are not missing; files are not stolen; but files are removed.

Secondly, another thing to be noted is that when the files were removed, it was not told by anybody; it came in the Press because there was somebody among 'you' to give the news to the Press.

First of all, it is a removal with an intention, and the

---

\*Not recorded.



counter-intention was the leakage to the Press that led to the discussion in the House. Secondly, kindly understand, hon. Chairperson, this is an important thing because the highest ever amount is involved in this. It is not a normal issue; *yeh koi chhota chori nahin*. When the country is in deep economic crisis, the highest ever amount is involved in this case.

Thirdly, we are not asking the Prime Minister, but we are asking the Coal Minister — the Prime Minister was also the Coal Minister at that time, so it is not a question of asking the Prime Minister. Therefore, the Minister in-charge, who happens to be the Prime Minister, must take the moral responsibility.

Fourthly, I am not making a speech, kindly remember, there was a change of statement and because of the change of statement, the Minister had to go. While the change of statement took place, it should be noted that in the whole process, the Attorney-General was thoroughly involved. That makes the whole situation very suspicious.

The Government is not found to be involved in corruption. The Government is found to be involved in suspicion. There are people among 'you' to leak the news. There are people among 'you' to remove the files. But there are 'no' people in 'you' to take the moral responsibility. It is the caricature of parliamentary system. That is why we are extremely aggrieved. You have put the country in poor light before the entire world. Parliament is put in poor light because you are doing something unparliamentary.

Therefore, Sir, I ask you to kindly remember that this is not a normal issue. We are discussing it when neither the Prime Minister nor the Coal Minister is there! What is the precedent you are creating before the House? This is a mockery of parliamentary system, which is being done under your Chairmanship, Sir!

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am not expunging anything that you have said because you are a senior Member.

[Translation]

SHRI ANANT GANGARAM GEETE (Raigad): Mr. Chairman Sir, the coal scam is the biggest scam in the country. It involves an amount of rupees one lakh and 86

thousand crore. In the beginning, the Government was not ready to admit that there has been a scam, but finally it had to accept it and then it cancelled some of the coal blocks allotted to certain people. Cancellation of coal block is a kind of acceptance that there has been a scam.

Mr. Chairman Sir, my submission is that the allotment of all the coal blocks wherein some kind of irregularity has taken place, should be cancelled. It is my first demand. The nation has a right to know the name of beneficiaries of this coal scam. The name of beneficiaries should be made public. The matter is subjudice in the Supreme Court and the Government has said that some of the files relating to the allotment are missing. If it is so, then it is shameful for the Government. It clearly indicates that the Government does not want that the matter should be investigated and action be taken against the persons involved in the scam. The Government is making efforts to protect them.

Mr. Chairman Sir, I would like to draw your attention as well as that of the House towards one point. Often it has been said that mining has not even started in the coal blocks which have been allotted. But, see the allottee companies have mortgaged the allotted coal blocks with the Banks and have taken loans of crores of rupees from various banks. This fact should be brought to the notice of public as well as that of the House that which are the banks that have sanctioned such loans alongwith the loan amount. May be, mining has not taken place, but the Banks have sanctioned loans worth crores of rupees. The people of this country have put crores of rupees in banks. The manner in which the loot of Rs. 1 lakh 86 thousand crore has taken place should be brought to the knowledge of the people. The Government has no right to say that the files have gone missing. The Government should immediately make the said files available to the court and take action against the guilty person.

SHRI NAMA NAGESHWARA RAO (Khammam): The CAG Report has indicated that there has been a coal scam involving rupees one lakh 86 thousand crore. at the same time, there have been irregularities in allotment also. It is the biggest scam in the post independence era. After the CAG Report was tabled in the House, this matter was raised a number of times and the investigation was

started on the directions of the Hon. Supreme Court. Some files relating to allotment of coal block are stated to be missing. In fact, these files have been stolen. The files have been removed. This fact indicates that there have been irregularities and therefore, the files have been stolen. The files have been removed to protect some people and the entire responsibility rests with the Prime Minister. All the Members desire that the Prime Minister make a statement in the House so that the country can come to know the whole thing. But, the statement reveals that even PMO is making efforts to trace the missing files. What does it mean? When the Prime Minister himself say, that the files are being located? People should know how the Government is functioning. Most of the scams have surfaced during UPA rule. We have not even thought that the Prime Minister would leave the House immediately after making statement over the scam.

My submission is that an FIR should immediately be registered in this regard. First, files should be traced later it can be handed over to the CBI for investigation. Such thing has never happened in the country. I want the Government to take it seriously and the guilty should be brought to book.

SHRI PRABHUNATH SINGH (Maharajganj): Mr. Chairman Sir, the leader of the opposition has raised very serious issue. It seems the files are missing. Have the files been stolen or removed. CBI wants to investigate the matter but the files are not available.

The Prime Minister in his statement has assured that the files are being traced.

Mr. Chairman Sir, I want to make two points Sushma ji, too had been a Minister and I do not think that a Minister or a Prime Minister would keep all the files under lock and key and keep the key with himself. If such was the practice during NDA's rule, then Sushma ji and Sharad Yadav ji may be aware of it. Manmohan Singh ji was looking after the Ministry of coal, being a Prime Minister. If an officer of CBI raises a finger on the Prime Minister, he should be taken to task. No efforts should be made to malign the office of Prime Minister. In the name of transparency, no one has a right to tarnish his image. Files should be traced by all means. If files are not traceable action should be taken. Person behind removal

of stealing files should be punished. Officers of CBI, who have made such statement, should also be punished. It is my demand.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much for discussion.

Now we take up Item No. 7. Shri Basu Deb Acharia to speak.

15.53 hrs.

PENSION FUND REGULATORY AND DEVELOPMENT  
AUTHORITY BILL, 2011 - CONTD.

[English]

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (Bankura): Mr. Chairman Sir, I rise to oppose the Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority Bill. The UPA Government was trying to provide statutory backing to what has been implemented from 1.1.2004 and an Authority has also been created. Where is the necessity for bringing a Bill for an Authority? Where is the necessity to change from defined return to defined contribution.

Since the time, the Government adopted new liberal economic policy in 1991, we have been observing that one after another, reforms and measures had been taken in the past. The Government's share in the nationalized banks has been reduced.

Our public sector companies are being disinvested, privatised. FDI has been allowed in insurance sector to the extent of 26 per cent, and there is a reform in pension system. Prime Minister, while making a statement on the economic situation or the falling value of rupee, pointed out in this House that certain difficult reform measures are now required to be taken and one such measure was reforms in pension system.

I am surprised, though I should not be, that many of the economic policies being adopted by this Government are on being directed by the United States of America. What is the interest of the United States of America that they are pressuring our Government to change or reform our pension system? What is the interest of the World

Bank and the International Monetary Fund? In 2001 itself the International Monetary Fund recommended that there should be a change in our pension system.

We know that the country is facing an economic crisis and this crisis is of Government's own making. Because of the policies that this Government has been pursuing, today the country is confronted with this crisis. But in order to overcome the crisis, should the burden on common man be increased? In order to overcome the crisis, should the social security available to workers and employees of our country be reduced? To overcome this crisis, should contractorisation or outsourcing be resorted to?

We have seen in 2007-08 and 2008-09, the two years of global economic melt. At that time in UPA-I when Mr. Chidambaram was the Finance Minister he made a statement here that our country will be insulated from the global economic crisis, global economic meltdown. But subsequently what we found was that Rs.1,86,000 crore were paid for a bailout package. This bailout package was meant for whom? This bailout package was utilised for what purposes? It is utilised to clear their balance sheet.

And during these two years we have seen the International Labour Organisation Report that more than 35,00,000 have lost their jobs in our country. More than three lakh workers in diamond cutting and polishing industry in Surat lost their jobs. So, workers have lost their jobs, unemployment is growing. Therefore, here is a job-loss growth, not job-less growth.

In order to overcome this crisis, certain measures which appear to be anti-worker and anti-employee had to be taken by the Government and they are being taken. This measure is changed in the pension system of our country. The existing pension system, pay as you go, was initiated long back, when we were not independent.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please wind up – you have taken seven minutes.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : I have just started.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You might have just started speaking on the Bill, but you have taken time – more than seven minutes.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Let me speak.

It was initiated, when we were not independent. Pension was not a charity. We have seen one Pay Commission after another – from the first to the sixth. In regard to pension, all the six Pay Commissions have uniformly recommended or stated that pension is an inalienable right of the employees and workers of this country. So, this is not a charity. You are now taking away this right. With these measures, *[Translation]* The rights of workers and employers of our country are being snatched.

*[English]*

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have exceeded your time.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : I am addressing you.

What has been done is that there will not be both implicit and explicit assured benefits because it will depend upon the market conditions. In clause 20 of the Bill, it has been stated that there shall not be any implicit or explicit assurance of benefits except market based mechanism, to be purchased by subscriber. We would move an amendment to this. I do not know how the BJP is satisfied with this; it has no assurance or no assured return; in spite of that, I do not know how they are satisfied and how they have decided to support this Bill.

What will happen and what will be the risk? If there is a major market shock, the subscriber to the new pension scheme may end with no ability to purchase annuity.

He will have to purchase annuity; there are a number of schemes and the employee will have to choose one of those schemes. Since annuity is and cannot be cost-indexed, the real worth of annuity might fall, depending upon the inflationary pressure on the economy. The Minister may reply to this point.

The subscriber, as I have said, is to make a choice of investment portfolio; and the civil servants being mostly uninformed, the Group-D employees, about finance and investment-related schemes, they might end up in making wrong choices which would eventually rob him off the old-age pension. Subscriber has per force to contribute to the choices of investment manager whose priority depends on how much profit he could make through investment of the huge corpus of pension fund in volatile

markets. What is being done, Mr. Chairman? Ten per cent is being deducted from the salary of the employees who have joined after 1.1.2004. The Government is contributing another ten per cent. A fund has been created. That fund has been handed over to fund manager. Except one, all the fund managers belong to corporate houses. A huge corpus fund consisting of employees share and the Government's contribution will be handed over to the corporate houses. That means public money will be utilised for private purposes.

There will be two categories of employees. One category of employees will continue to enjoy defined contribution and defined benefit. They will get an assured income. There will be another category of employees, ten per cent of whose salary has been deducted, will be deposited, but the Government will not be able to tell how much pension he will get after his retirement. When we used to extend our support to the UPA I Government, I asked this question several times to the then Minister of Finance, Shri P. Chidambaram as to how much an employee will get after his retirement. He was not able to tell as it depends on the conditions of the market. ...*(Interruptions)*

If the market falls, the employees will lose everything. Why are we bringing this Bill? Why are such measures being taken by this Government? A large number of employees are there. There are more than one crore of Central Government, State Government, bank employees and others. Why are you creating two categories of employees now? It is violative of the Constitution. It violates article 14, Right to Equality. This Bill violates article 14 of the Constitution, Right to Equality, by creating two classes of employees. By whose direction and by whose intent is it being done?...*(Interruptions)*

He has stated that most of the recommendations of the Standing Committee have been accepted except one. Which one? It is the most important recommendation. The Committee in its Report said: "The Committee, therefore, desire that the Government must devise a mechanism to enable subscribers to be ensured of such minimum assured guaranteed returns of their pension so that they are not put to any disadvantage vis-à-vis other pensioners." So, they are being put in a disadvantageous position vis-à-vis other pensioners.

Sir, there has been a historic strike for two days. The entire working class, all the 11 trade unions joined together and called a strike for two days on the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> February, 2013. The demand of the entire working class, all the trade unions from the INTUC to the BMS was that the Government should withdraw the New Pension Scheme because this is a discrimination against a large section of employees and workers. This deprives the workers and the employees of the benefit of pension. What will happen after their retirement? Pension is not a charity. The Committee which was appointed by the Sixth Pay Commission observed this...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Basu Deb Acharia, please take your seat now.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA: That Committee has observed this and one of the reasons was this.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall be calling the next speaker. You may take your seat.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : One of the reasons for which the New Pension Scheme has been introduced is to reduce the outflow of money. But the observation made by the Committee appointed by the Sixth Pay Commission is that the Contributory Pension Scheme would, in effect, increase for a period spanning from the next 34 years from the existing Rs.14,284 crore to Rs.57,088 crore! If we go by the New Pension Scheme, the outflow of money will be more than the existing one. So, I demand that the Government should not press for the passage of this Bill. This is against the workers and the employees of the country. This is an anti-labour and anti-employees Bill. So, the Government should restore the earlier system which is there in our country "Defined contribution with defined returns." If there is no defined return, how much benefit, how much pension will the employees and workers get? It will depend upon the market conditions. The market will determine how much benefit the employees and workers will get after retirement. There will be no scope for family pension if an employee dies. There is no scope for gratuity also.

As this is an anti-worker, anti-employee Bill, we oppose it. I appeal to the entire Opposition including the Members from the Treasury Benches to oppose this anti-labour, anti-worker measure of this Government.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, please be aware of the time allotted to each Party. It was a very good speech but the time allotted to Shri Basu Deb Acharya's party is 5 minutes whereas you have taken 22 minutes. The observation from the Chair is interpreted as interruption. That is why I am making this clear. Please be aware of the time allotted to the various Parties.

[Translation]

SHRI NISHIKANT DUBEY (Godda): Mr. Chairman Sir, I am thankful to my leader hon. Sushma Swaraj ji that she gave me a chance to speak on this Bill. I also wanted to speak. It is a coincidence that Hon. Sushma Swaraj ji told me that I have to speak on behalf of the party on this Bill and it is a happy moment for me. I think I should start with the statement which Hon. Basudev Acharya ji was referring to. The hon. Prime Minister said in the House as follows :

[English]

The Prime Minister said, and I quote:

"Madam, Speaker, the easy reforms of the past have been done. We have the more difficult reforms to do such as reduction of subsidies, insurance and pension sector reforms, eliminating bureaucratic red tape and implementing Goods and Services Tax. These are not low hanging fruit and they need active political consensus."

[Translation]

It means the pension reforms are difficult reforms for the Government and the country and this is evident in this House. Trinmool Congress is opposing it. Basudev Acharya Sahib is also opposing it and so is Gurdas Babu. But our party is supporting it and the support is because the country is in crisis. How in crisis? The crisis is even bigger than the crisis of 1991. I can say it that there are some such issues in the country, as this country got independence on 15th August, 1947. The economic policy, thereafter was changed by Prime Minister Manmohan Singh in 1991. In 1994 when we signed the Dunkel Draft, due to which economy of the country deteriorated and the situation worsened. As a result of that, the country is facing such a crisis in which the pension reforms are much needed. Why the crisis is bigger than 1991? It is so

because in 1991, our short term loan was only 10 percent and today, the short term loan in the country is 25 percent. Even then we are saying that the country is not in crisis. The Finance Minister is not in agreement with us. I was referring to the pages of history 1967-68 and that of this Congress. I was going through the topics related to the congress working committee. The dispute started in congress working committee which divided the congress. Indira ji separated while she retained the name of the party. The crisis was of the same type. The crisis was that we were to import wheat from America. The crisis was that we devaluated rupee. The devaluation which took place today similarly happened in 1967-68 when Indira ji visited America to meet Johnson. At that time the value of one dollar was Rs. 4.75. When Indira ji returned from America, she signed two agreements. One the wheat will be imported and secondly the value of dollar which was Rs. 4.75 she made it Rs. 6.75. The devaluation was about thirty percent. To overcome the crisis the steps taken and suggestions made by Indira ji were she nationalised the Banks. The scam in coal was very high and the coal sector and mining sectors were nationalised.

Today when I view the entire situation, I find the country at the same point and it will not be surprising if emergency is imposed like it was imposed in 1975. Now we do not have an option of nationalisation. That situation has come to an end when you started nationalisation of banks. As all the speakers were saying, the NPA of banks is increasing. The NPA of bank is definitely increasing. You are not in a position to control the banks. As the Credit Rating Agencies viz. J.P. Morgan, Nomura and HSBC have said that the next GDP growth rate will not be more than 4.1 or 4.2. Then what will you do for the population of 120 crore? The coal scam which surfaced, if you see 1967-68, the nationalisation the situation of India was exactly the same. Is this country moving towards 1967-68 or 1991? The Congress Government should be ready to answer these questions. It is a matter of anguish when intemperate language is used for the Prime Minister in the Parliament. I agree with the Prime Minister. Nobody has the right to use unparliamentary language for the Prime Minister. Sometimes, I am angry with my own party. But when I find that the CBI lodged an FIR against your

own Minister Shri Dasari Narayan Rao and Bagrodia Sahib who are the Ministers of State. Then how can you sheer the responsibility as a Cabinet Minister? when somebody tries to show you the right direction, the right path, you feel that the opposition is putting hurdles in it, It is not allowing it. ...(Interruptions)

SHRI NEERAJ SHEKHAR (Ballia): It is on the Pension Bill.

SHRI NISHIKANT DUBEY : I am speaking on the Pension Bill only. It is because the Prime Minister said that the Pension reform....(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN : If you speak on the Bill, you will get more time.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI NISHIKANT DUBEY : I will tell its reason, what is behind it?

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please address the Chair.

....(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI NISHIKANT DUBEY : Mr. Chairman, There is a story that 'Shani' was the favourite disciple of God Shankar. As the other day Chidambaram Sahib was saying that a team of economists have made 8 per cent growth possible. That team is still there. Only one difference took place that an 4, 5, 7 years they have grown old, otherwise there is no difference. Because Manmohan Singh ji, Montek Singh Ahluwalia Sahib and Rangrajan Sahib are the same and their team has done all this. But the reason is that in your high headedness you do not want to understand the economy of the country.

The story about 'Shani' is that wherever he lived, that house suffered from 'Sadhesati'. Because much hue and cry is going on in the world. 'Shani' went to God Shankar and told him that you are likely to have

'Sadhesati'. God Shankar replied that he cannot be affected by 'Sadhesati' as he was the strongest of all the gods and well informed God. First of all he told to his 'Nandi' to leave the place. You return to me after seven and half years and asked Parvati ji to go to her parents house, and he himself sat in the cremation ground tenaciously, as he was not to have any effect. When after seven and half years 'Shani' met God Shankar, God Shankar asked him about his effect on him? I had been doing all things comfortably. He replied Lord, your Nandi is not with you, your entire family, mother Parvati is not with you, Sati is not with you. And you are asking me what I have done. What I do? I only do this much that I took away the wealth and broke the families. Today on the economy of the country the price rise is at the top. Unemployment is at the top 'Shani' is to make you understand. Who is 'Shani'? You blame the opposition for not letting on the proceedings of the House run. ...(Interruptions)

Now I come to the Pension Bill. How much important is this Pension Bill for us and to what extent we have been cooperative with the Government, how the Government is not ready to take support from us? The Reforms which Hon. Atal Bihari Vajpayee ji undertook, the pension reform was one of the major issues. He constituted two committees in 2001 one was Social Justice Committee a high level committee and Oasis Committee. He constituted two committee keeping in view that the number of youths in the country is if increasing the number of aged persons are also likely to increase.

They conducted a market survey which suggest that the Pension Fund would be of the order of Rs. Four thousand fifty five billion. However Government do not have that much of funds. Our budget is in the range of Rs. Fourteen-fifteen lakh crore while the Government do not have sufficient funds. Now you can understand from where Rs. Two hundred Fifty lakh crore would be arranged. According to a conservative estimate for this pension reform Rs. One hundred Fifty lakh crore would be required. Because of this Hon. Atal Bihari Vajpayee adopted the recommendations made by those two committees as the basis and constituted Pension Fund by issuing a notification in the year 2003. This is our bill. There we acted in hurry, while you claim that we do not

cooperate. Let me tell you, you introduced it in March 2005 and within a period of just 3 months, that is in July 2005 the standing committee, whose Chairman was Shri B.C. Khanduri of BJP returned it to you. We returned it within a period of 3 months only. Now since you were ruling the country with the support of left party, you just could not muster enough courage, and the Bill could not be brought for four years. The Bill which was introduced as early as 2005 could only be introduced in 2009. But in 2009 the Parliament elections caused it to make fall.

Therefore, You again brought this Bill on 24 th March 2011. Mr. Chairman, kindly recollect the date, the day when this Bill was being introduced, Shri Basudeb Acharia opposed it and demanded for a division. At that time not even one member was there on the Congress benches. Only Hon. Minister of Finance, Shri Pranab Mukherjee, who is President of India today, who became jittery for division meant that the introduction of the Bill will not be possible. I hurriedly went to Shrimati Sushma ji to know the further course of action. She said that this Bill belongs to us and we will help in its introduction and indeed we did help in its introduction. When the Bill was introduced on 24th March, 2011, then it went to the standing committee on 29th March, 2011. I am a member of that standing committee. We returned it on 31st August 2011 after three months only after the date of its receipt. You kept sitting on this Bill for two years. What was the problem that stopped you to move further? There is a song suggesting the delay is not intentional, but it does occur. You did not intend to delay, but opposition is not allowing you to move on. In 1956 we gave you a voluminous draft of the Corporate Bill which you have been able to get passed now only. The entire Direct Tax Code of 1961 was prepared and handed over to you by us. Shri Gurudas Babu is also there in the standing committee. Shri Yashwant Sinha is the Chairman of the committee. Your Ministers make lengthy speeches on subjects, be it banking reforms, insurance reforms, pension reforms or any of such Bill but you will not find any situation where we have been lagging behind to lend our support. So if you seek support, the entire country has the right to know that we never failed to support you in any cause meant for the progress of the nation. Please don't let the proverb of 'Tekna chor' prove right.

Why we are supporting this Pension Bill? we are supporting this Pension Bill because it contains many of the clauses suggested by us and you have accepted them. You have accepted them and we have helped you in drafting this Bill. It contains two major clauses which were being opposed by Shri Basudeb Acharia on the grounds of the major provision of assured returns. We wanted that all Government employees should get assured returns for which you made the provision for the right of investing the funds in Government Securities and said that of the four portfolio members, one would have to be from the Central PSU and one from the Central Government. That is why we are supporting this Bill in other words supporting you.

Secondly, 26 percent FDI which we have in regard to insurance has its own big story. Because when we brought insurance Bill, yours was the only party which opposed it. You had challenged the then Finance Minister that you would not allow it to pass in any circumstances. You had on the floor of the House made our former Minister of Finance Shri Yashwant Sinha to commit that the limit of FDI in insurance will not be allowed to go beyond 26 percent at any cost in any circumstances. Not only this, you said that I.P.O. could be brought after a period of 10 years. At that time we proposed 26 percent FDI and were ready for 23 percent are, but you did not agree. Today you are allowing IPO. Today, you feel that the entire insurance sector is on the verge of collapse. The industrialists here, because if we talk of corporate then it has become customary in our country either to support the corporate or oppose it. You will not take the right stand. Today don't you know that you are saying the same thing. The money that has been invested here by corporate, it is a big game. Mr. Chairman, I know it very well for instance they permitted 100 percent FDI in Telecom sector, while when we were in power. We made 49 percent from 26 percent and contemplating to further raise it to 74 percent, then this Government which took over during that time it was 74 percent. Since they wanted FDI, they raised it to 100 percent.

Mr. Chairman their game is like this, I am telling this very seriously on the floor of the House to the Hon. Minister of Finance, the FDI of all the companies is 100

percent, they are making it 100 percent to legalize that. They are talking of 100 percent FDI. Similarly the number of insurance companies that are there in our country they have equity to the extent of 49 percent or over 49 percent, they want to legalize that. They want them to benefit that is why during our rule when the multi-brand was surfaced, you called us traitor. Your Chief was Shri Priyaranjan Dasmunshi when you had talked of 46 percent FDI in insurance sector. You should have been strict about these things. As regards our extending support to you, it is because the form of the Bill that existed in 2004, there we proposed for investment option, which you have accepted.

**16.00 hrs.**

That is why we are supporting you. we had said about Tier and Tier two cities, there you put essential feature, we are trying to improve the Bill as much as we can.

**16.0½ hrs.**

(SHRI FRANCISCO COSME SARDINA *in the Chair*)

This relates to 80 crores of people, not just restricted to Central Government employees, autonomous body's employees and private sector employees. Only 12 percent people in the country are such who enjoy the pensions scheme while about 13-14 percent funds from the Government is going constantly for that purpose. It is growing, at some places it is 27 percent.

Mr. Chairman, I, through you, like to tell the Hon. Minister that he has done injustice with jharkhand....(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (Ghatal): Hon. Chairman, Sir, according to the List of Business of the House, at 4 o'clock, hon. Leader of the Opposition will start a discussion. Now it is 4 o'clock.

[*Translation*]

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ (Vidisha) : Mr. Chairman, let this Bill be completed first, thereafter I will

express my views in a peaceful atmosphere. In case if is not done, it make the Hon. Minister of Finance sit here till the discussion lasts. The Bill will come thereafter. There is no need to leave both the matter incomplete. Let PFRDA be complete, then we will discuss Utrakhand in a peaceful atmosphere.

[*English*]

MR. CHAIRMAN : There is also a request from the Government, please.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : I am ready to agree to that suggestion but there has to be reasonable time for the Opposition because the Principal Opposition is supporting the Bill. We are in the Opposition. Therefore, there has to be reasonable time as far as the procedure in the Parliamentary system. is concerned...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Member, you will get your time.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : Sir, I do not want an advice from the Minister. Please listen to me. I want an assurance that those who are really opposing the Bill will get reasonable time to speak.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All of you, who are supposed to speak, will get enough time. So, we will take up the Bill first.

**16.03 hrs.**

THE PENSION FUND REGULATORY AND  
DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY BILL, 2011 - Contd.

[*English*]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Nishikant Dubey, You may please continue.

[*Translation*]

SHRI NISHIKANT DUBEY (Godda): I was telling about the reasons for which we have been supporting tis Bill. I had said that the subscriber should have an option of hundred percent investment in Government securities. That has been included by the Government in Clause 20. Then I had demanded that among the pension funds,



one should be that of the public sector. They have tried to include that demand in Clause 23. We also talked about FDI. They have agreed for 26 percent FDI but in the insurance we are not ready to accept their provision of 49 percent investment. We depend on their proposal. Then we had also asked for the provision of administrator which they have included in Sub-clause 3. We had also said about setting up a special committee which they have included in the new clause 44. All of these are such issues for which we are supporting this Bill. But there are several things for example the people have been becoming old and poor for them, whatever money is required, the Government is not competent to give it, because the kind of policy the Government has brought, has been causing disgrace to this Government. Even the farmer's Loan Waiver Scheme has not checked the incidence of farmer's suicide. The Government knows as to how much corruption has taken place in it. They themselves have inquired into it. The standing committee is also looking into all these things. The Government has also admitted that there has been a very big corruption in it. Secondly they bought in NAREGA and as the chairman of a vigilance monitoring committee, I know that there is a corrupt practice of 50-60 percent in it. It is not creating something of significance. It would have been better, had you given Rs. 2 lakh crore under the Direct Benefit Transfer Scheme for the creation of assets, you would have had something concrete of that value. Give them employment. Why don't you give them stipend or pension? If you add the same in this very pension scheme, I will feel that something very good has been done because today 88 percent are being deprived of pension. Even today, after a period of 10-11 years, you have a fund of only Rs. 21000 crore which was to be that of Rs. 2 lakh 50000 crore with which infrastructure is to be developed. The way there is dependence on insurance, in the same way there is to be lesser dependence on Pension. You are not seeing it in that perspective. The new Land Acquisition Bill is very good for the farmers but you are not able to dispel certain fears such as whether industries would be set up with it or whether there would be development of people or whether farmers would get its benefit, because that right has been given to the collector.

Whether there would be that much or yield with the Food Bill that you have passed. Instead of importing wheat from America, Shrimati Indira Gandhi gave a clarion call for bringing in Green Revolution for which this country should be grateful to her. To what extent do you agree with Shri Sharad Pawar today when he is talking of GM crops. Whether you would be able to give it? How much increase would be there in the burden of subsidy, because how the fertilizers lobby is behaving and IFFCO and Kribhco have been given to private sector and import is increasing. Your Ministers are also saying that they can import oil from Iran on currency exchange basis. They are talking of closure from 8 to 12 hrs or Anand Sharma, Saheb is talking of mortgaging of gold. All these fears have been looming large in this country. There is a crises of trust. In that regard the Asian Development Bank has made some recommendations and your own surveys have been saying:-

[English]

It says:

“Unorganised sector workers with a capacity to make regular pension contributions and who are interested in voluntarily saving for their old age.”

[Translation]

What are you saying in this regard? It is not a survey conducted by me but it has been got conducted by you. This is the survey of the Asian Development Bank about the New Pension Scheme.

[English]

It further says:

“Persons in salaried employment who are excluded from formal pension and provident fund arrangements including EPFO schemes by virtue of working in firms with less than 20 employees.”

[Translation]

What are you thinking in this regard? Then there is a third point which is most important.

[English]

It further says:

“Government and private sector salaried employees

who are covered by mandatory pension and provident fund arrangements but are not confident that their present retirement benefits will provide an adequate income replacement and are interested in voluntarily contributing to a supplementary retirement savings programme.”

*[Translation]*

What is your view in respect of all these three things? You yourself have prepared this report of the Asian Development Bank. All these things are very necessary for the new pension sector the NPS. These things are more necessary for the organized sector and for the infrastructure. What are you saying in this regard? If you bring in something and have some views in this regard, we also want to play a contributory constructive role in it as a responsible opposition as we do not want to relapse into the crisis of 1991. If you bring in this Bill in this way, we will stand by your side.

SHRI DARA SINGH CHAUHAN (Ghosi): Mr. Chariman Sir, many many thanks to you for giving me an opportunity to speak on this important Bill. Through you, I would like to tell the hon'ble Minister that he is going to give a practical shape to this important Bill but there is a deep resentment on it among the Government employees of the entire country who work their whole life for the people and particularly those who joined after 2004 because in the last days of their life the Government is going to deprive them of their right to live which was available to them not today but even before the independence of this country. Therefore, I would like to tell that pension is not a charity but their right. A conspiracy is being hatched to deprive them of their right. There are two categories of people in this country. One are those who are in the Government service before 2004 and provision of pension is there for this category of people and in this very country there is a different provision for that category of people who joined the Government service after 2004. Due to this dual system, there is resentment among the Government employees of this country. Under the new system which the Government proposes to introduce, 10 percent of their total salary and 10 percent thereof on behalf of the Government will be invested into the share market and after that investment,

60 percent of the amount after all market fluctuations will go to the contributing person and where will go the remaining 40 percent amount is not known. There is no guarantee in this Bill whether the contributing person would get back the remaining amount.

Hon'ble Chairman, Sir, there are big domestic and foreign Capitalists and industrial Houses in the share market and it is their game. In the fluctuations of share market, it is all likelihood that the hard earned income of the employees, who want its returns in the form of pension, will be lost. I think that the way Shri Nishikant ji is showing his inclination to cooperate on behalf of the Bhartiya Janata Party will make both the parties equally responsible for the loss of pension. Hon'ble Chairman Sir, I am not going to make a long speech but want to say only this much that the way this game of share is going on and the way in which the money of employees will be invested in the share market, makes it very clear that in this game everybody is not a gainer and either of them is a loser because in the older days there was a small game of gambling in the villages but now there are very big persons of the cooperate Houses are the players of present share market and they are the only gainers in the game. All others stand to lose. So, I think that the same situation is prevailing here and all the money of employees which will be invested in this big gambling only the big people will win and all others will be the losers. That is my apprehension.

So, if the Minister brings an amendment in the interest of employees, which is their right, than certainly it can be considered. With these words I would like to demand that the retired people are getting pension, but there are so many big undertakings like BSNL and MTNL, where pension system is not in force and Government do not pay anything in case of sudden death. So, think about such people seriously. There is apprehension among the employees in the country, you should consider their case with sympathy. With these words, I conclude my speech.

*[English]*

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB (Cuttak): Mr. Chairman Sir, I stand here to participate in the discussion on the Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority Bill, 2011.

Till 2009, old age pension was available only to the Government employees and individuals in the organized sector. In 2000, the Old Age Social and Income Security Report under the chairmanship of Dr. S.A. Dave, recommended that the pension scheme be extended to the unorganized sector. In October, 2003, an interim Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority was constituted through a notification to develop and regulate the pension sector.

In December 2003, the Union Government through a Notification implemented the New Pension Scheme for its employees appointed from January 2004 onwards. The New Pension Scheme shifted the pension scheme for Government employees from the Defined Benefits System to a Defined Contribution System. This Bill, of course, lapsed with the dissolution of the Fourteenth Lok Sabha in 2009. In March 2011, this PFRDA Bill, 2011 was introduced. This seeks to give statutory status to the interim PFRDA and changes the name of the New Pension Scheme under the previous Bill to the New Pension System.

The Defined Benefit System applicable to Government servants appointed before 2004 and Employee Pension Scheme subscribers, promises a fixed monthly pension. This amount is linked to pay drawn, number of years of services, etc., and has no direct linkage to the contribution of the employee or employer towards a pension fund. The entire investment risk is borne by the pension fund managers and the Government. The total benefits liable from such a scheme could amount to be higher than the funds available, which could lead to delays and defaults.

Traditionally, a large proportion of pension fund around the world has been of the DB type. However, many have been under-funded and some have collapsed. This has led to a debate in a number of countries regarding the sustainability of their pension and social security system.

In the DC system, the employee bears the entire investment risk and there is no risk of default by the fund as the liability of the fund to its subscriber equals the assets owned.

I agree with the view that fiscal stress of the Defined

Benefit Pension System was the major factor driving pension reform for the organised public sector Government employees. The new system is available on a voluntary basis to all persons including self-employed professionals and others in the unorganised sector. While making PFRDA a statutory body on account of the burgeoning fiscal stress of pension payments on Central and State revenues and need to provide a viable alternative to the populace at large to save for old age income security, there is a need to correct the flaws in the national pension system and make it an attractive retirement savings product.

The coverage of vast masses of unorganised sector workers under NPS is a tremendous challenge as about 88 per cent of the workers are without the benefit of any formal pension provision. How are you going to popularise the scheme to achieve the intended objective?

It is heartening to observe that the NPS has delivered average returns of 9.33 per cent for State and Central Government employees in the past years. The NPS has outperformed the EPF and GPF. The three public sector fund managers, SBI, LIC and UTI, have done a good job, given the dismal equity market that is prevalent today. Of course, an increase in yields on Government securities and other debt instruments has helped. Nevertheless the performance only reinforces the point that NPS is a sound vehicle for accumulating a corpus for retirement compared to EPF whose management is opaque and return is sub-optimal.

This Bill provides flexibility in investment of the fund. Beneficiary can instruct his chosen management agency to invest higher amounts in share market.

Pension funds are allowed to be invested up to 60 per cent in equities in the United Kingdom. While providing this choice is welcome, a word of caution is required. Pensioners in the United States of America have lost about 1/3rd of their pay outs to the global recession. Yet, I would say it is not a shortcoming of the Bill because beneficiaries are allowed to opt for safe option of investing wholly in Government securities. The Bill allows private citizens to invest in the NPS, however they will not be entitled to a matching grant by the Government.

On the negative side, the returns from NPS are taxable. I would like the Government to respond to this aspect. Can you make certain provisions to free this, to popularise this scheme to take it out from the tax net. One does not understand why cannot the Government provide a guaranteed return on the investments?

Standing Committee on Finance had recommended introduction of minimum guarantee. There should be minimum assured return. The Government issues 20 year treasury bonds and pays a fixed rate of interest on these. The Government can issue 50 year bonds. The money deposited by Government employees, who want an assured return, can wholly invest in these bonds. This should not put additional burden on the Government.

Some, of course, object to the Bill because it allows investment in share market. But, such investment is made only if the beneficiary gives appropriate directions. There is no compulsion. Those, who think that the Bill will help control fiscal deficit, are wrong. I do not think this will happen.

The Government should ease investment norms to allow higher exposure in equities. Central and State Government NPS are allowed to invest up to maximum 15 per cent in equities. The limit is 50 per cent for non-Government employees joining NPS. There is no reason why a person who joins the work force at the age of 21, should not be allowed to invest a large portion of his contribution in equities, if he chooses to take risk in the initial stages?

Lastly, there was no provision for foreign investment policy in the pension sector in the Bill. However, later the Cabinet has cleared FDI in pension sector and it shall not exceed 26 per cent. But, along with that it is also mentioned in the proposed amendment, that is to be moved by the Minister, that and I quote "Or, such percentage, as may be approved, for an Indian insurance company, under the provisions of the Insurance Act, 1938, whichever is higher." This move is fraught with uncertainties. There is need for clarity. Who would come? You want to rope in partners. When it is not happening in insurance sector, how do you expect foreign players will come running to your arms in pension sector?

The pension sector is in nascent stage. Rather

allowing foreign investment in pension funds, as per the tune of insurance, would make our sector vulnerable to speculation. I am not against FDI *per se*, but foreign investment of pension intermediaries should be kept at 26 per cent.

[Translation]

SHRI ANANT GANGARAM GEETE (Raigad): Mr. Chairman, the Minister has presented the Pension Regulatory and Development Authority Bill, 2011 here for constitution of some institution or authority. The Government is going to constitute an authority to safeguard the retired life of the employees of Government of India and State Governments. They are going to introduce a uniform new pension scheme for all, which will be known as the National Pension Scheme in future.

Mr. Chairman, this scheme is contributory, and a pension fund will be established with equal contribution of the employees and Government. You are going to constitute an establishment through this bill at the national level for this pension fund. It is the responsibility of the Government to take care of the safety of the Government employees in old age, whether it is the Government of any party. Therefore, the Leader of opposition and BJP have extended their support to this bill. Supporting this bill, I would like to express one of my concerns.

You can invest the money from this Pension fund, which you are going to create, in both Government and private sectors. Investment in private sector creates apprehensions in the mind of public. So, the Government should clearly explain in this House that how it will invest this fund and how it will be safeguarded? Today, one after another scam are being committed and the Government is losing faith of the public. So, what are you going to do that there may not be any cheating with the future of lakhs of employees of the Central Government and the State Governments. We are going to infuse safety and faith among the employees, it should be in reality. I request that Mr. Minister should clarify it in this House.

We are not opposing the Bill, we are supporting it because it is necessary to cooperate with each other in future. We will not oppose any step, which the Government may want to take to safeguard the future in

the scenario of present economic crisis in the country. I would request the Minister to put his views in detail in the House regarding the scheme of safeguarding the future of the employees of the Government of India and State governments.

[English]

SHRI S. SEMMALAI (Salem): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I thank you for giving me this opportunity to speak on Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority Bill, 2011. If any Bill or any amendment is brought in good faith, it should be beneficial at large, but I do not think that this Bill confers any advantage or any benefit to the pensioners. So, hon. Finance Minister has to explain in what way this Bill is more beneficial and better than the previous scheme. I do not find any social security in this Bill.

To my knowledge, the new National Pension Scheme is brought to rescue the Government from the resource crunch it is now facing, but not for the benefit of the Government servants or pensioners. I think, in order to reduce the commitment of the Government towards pension contribution, this scheme was evolved. At this juncture, it is very pertinent to quote the ruling given by the Apex Court which says:

“Pension was not a bounty payable on the sweet will or pleasure of the Government and pension is a valuable right vesting in a government servant.”

If the spirit and essence of the judgement is understood by those in power, policy prescriptions will be evolved more to the benefit of the pensioners. To put it plainly, the scheme intends to reduce the financial burden of the Government and to pump more funds in the stock market. I am of the strong opinion that the Bill paves the way for the entry of international market players in our economy, which is not conducive to growth. As we all know, pension sector is a capital-intensive industry and requires huge capital. So, allowing FDI in pension sector will eventually help the corporates at the cost of the poor pensioners.

There is a major flaw in the Bill. The absence of assured returns to the subscribers is a dismal aspect of the National Pension Scheme. Depending on the inter-

play of market forces, returns are going to be determined. In the Employees' Provident Fund Scheme, there is an assured interest on the subscription made by the employees, but no such assured return is guaranteed here and depending on the fluctuation of the stock markets, returns are going to be determined. This is a major flaw in the National Pension Scheme. The notice of amendment given by Shri Mahtab and some of our colleagues is a well thought out one. I also endorse their views. The basic lacuna is the absence of minimum assured returns.

Government employees and Government servants under the New Pension Scheme are not happy with the policy because they are not sure of what they would get at the time of their retirement. As senior hon. Member, Shri Basu Deb Acharia pointed out earlier, they cannot plan their future after retirement because they do not know what definite amount they would receive at the time of retirement. They have been compelled to join this scheme. If a choice is given to them, I am sure that they would join the Defined Benefit Based Scheme only. The employees, who have joined service before 1<sup>st</sup> January, 2004 are placed in a better position as regards their pensionary benefits compared to those who joined service on or after 1st January, 2004 because they are in a highly disadvantageous position. How is the Finance Minister going to convince them or is going to help them?

In short, Mr. Chairman, Sir, this is an action of the Government where we cannot look back with a sense of satisfaction and look ahead with a sense of hope and promise.

Before conclusion, I would like to request the Government, particularly the hon. Minister of Finance, to look at the National Pension Scheme as a social security scheme for the retirees rather than as a way of resource mobilisation.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (Ghatal): Sir, I rise to point out that this is not a Pension Regulatory Bill; this is only a fixed deposit scheme regulatory bill.

According to the English Dictionary, “Pension is not flexible.” ‘Pension’ is a “Defined income on retirement.” This is the accepted definition of ‘pension’ all over the world.

It is no wonder that this Government is bringing forward a Bill withdrawing the age-old social security for the old people, leaving them in uncertainty, and withdrawing its commitment to the older generation on this or that plea.

This Government is following the footsteps of the Western countries in the world. In different countries in the world, there have been working class agitations. Hon. Minister has the majority since the principal Opposition Party has decided to support it. I know the Bill is going to be passed. But let me tell you frankly that this is a world wide phenomenon – of withdrawal of social security, known as ‘pension’. He is only following their footsteps. There, there have been tremendous agitations against it. In India also, there is tremendous agitation against it. But since they have the majority within the Parliament, and since the principal Opposition Party has decided to lend its support, they will get it passed very easily. But the point is it is not a Pension Regulatory Bill; it is a fixed deposit regulatory bill.

The first point I will make is this Fund is being generated. The Minister seems to be very generous. *[Translation]* You do not have to say anything. We have opened the doors. Those who want to exit may deposit it in the Government securities. *[English]* He seems to be very generous, but he is not. He is not what he pretends to be. He is opening the door for the inflow of foreign fund, maybe, a part of the fund to step up or to stimulate the Stock Exchange. Stock Exchange is in crisis. In order to stem the crisis, sometimes, he advises LIC to pump in funds; sometimes, he advises public sector to invest funds because his only concern is to show the world that India has a vibrant economy as it is reflected in Bombay Stock Exchange. The falsification of truth is sought to be justified by showing the upward movement of the Bombay Stock Exchange. Therefore, in order to stimulate the movement of the price in the stock market, he is opening the door — that a part of the Pension Fund Scheme will be will be invested in the stock market. This is a new development.

Whatever may be the choice, the Government allows the savings of the common people to be invested in speculation. You pass the Bill. But you will call a spade a spade. For the first time, the savings of the employees

have been allowed to be invested in the stock market. This is number one departure. You are allowing speculation at the cost of the savings of the common employees.

The second thing is about FDI. FDI will come or not, that is a different thing. There has been a persistent demand all over the world that Indian market particularly, Insurance and Pension Fund should be opened to FDI. There has been a persistent demand. The hon. Finance Minister has an obligation towards them. Therefore, he is obliged to concede to the demand of FDI. This is a second departure. There have been demands all over the world about FDI in the pension. All over the world, there has been a demand that Insurance and Pension fund should be opened knowing full well, that US Senate, for whom we swear every morning, had produced a Report which called the private insurance companies as the “bunch of swindlers”. We are inviting them because we want FDI. But how far is he going to succeed to bring FDI? That is a matter which remains absolutely uncertain. In retail, we have liberalised. How many companies have come? We have liberalised Defence. How much investment has come? We have liberalised every sector. How much of foreign funds have come to help the Government to tide over the crisis of the shortage of foreign funds?

Sir, hon. Minister says that you can invest in the Public Sector. What does it mean? Investment in Public Sector equity will depend on the profit of that company which means it is not a defined income on retirement. It is a flexible return depending on the profit generated by that company. There are people to be misled because if the Government shows the door, then people can enter the door of doom. They have given the option that you can go to the stock market. There are people knowingly or unknowingly-because they have some belief still now-left for the political system of the country. But what is going to be the fate? I was told by the hon. Finance Minister said that stock market is giving good return – 11 or 12 or 13 per cent. Maybe my information is right. Maybe my information is wrong. But the point is – I am certain - there may be a black Friday. There may be a doomsday. There may be a total blood bath in the stock market which means knowingly or knowingly - leaving it

to the choice of the common people allured by the decision of the Government - you ask them to face the uncertainties of the stock market. Where is the retirement? What is the condition of the old people in our country? Every day we come across that old people being ill-treated by their own children. Every day we find an appeal to a court saying that "my son has driven me out". Everyday we come across the complaints that the parents are being beaten by their children. We need a social security. Pension with a defined income had given the security. Now, it is uncertain because the Government cannot bear the burden. Why can the Government not bear the burden? What is the actuarial calculation that was made? Since this pension fund is a long investment fund, maybe for 30 years, the entire fund can be utilized for the development of the infrastructure of the country, it will be in the control of the Government.

But the Government is afraid. That is not the point. The point is, theoretically, this Government is sold out to the wretched philosophy of the Western capitalism. There may be a smile today in the lips of the Finance Minister. But there may be tears tomorrow in the eyes of thousands of people. There may be a smile. But the smile may be deceptive. There may be tears in the eyes of the many. Therefore, let us not smile. We are creating a situation where a section of the employees who had been under Assured Pension Scheme, are left to the mercy of swindlers, speculators in the stock market.

Secondly, even if it is in the Government security, the return on Government security may change. Today it may be eight per cent; the next Government may declare seven per cent. A section who had invested in eight per cent may be getting more. The next Government may declare six per cent. The new people who are joining, they may be getting less. Therefore, Sir, it is uncertain, uncertain and uncertain. Taking the parliamentary majority, they can bulldoze any enactment they like. Mind it that it is being opposed by a large section of the people whose voice is not heard in the Parliament. Therefore, Parliament is not the only place.

The question is that pension is an age-old security system. It is being demolished. That is being done at the cost of the people who had given their service to the

Government for 30 years and a reward to the people who had been serving you. You are throwing them into the womb of lack of security. From light to darkness, from well-defined to flexible, from smile to tears, what remains for the common people? Everyday, hon. Minister is asking the Reserve Bank to reduce the interest rate. Now he has his own man there. The Reserve Bank may fall in line. The earlier Governor did not do it. You are reducing interest rate in the fixed deposits in banks; you are reducing interest rate on small savings; and you are reducing interest rate on Government securities.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Kindly conclude.

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA : I would conclude the sordid story, if I say that it is the betrayal of the interest of the common people who had been obediently serving the social system for a long time. The Government is making the future of the common working people uncertain by reducing the interest rate in banks, by reducing the interest rate in small savings, giving them not a defined pension but a flexible pension and allowing them to go for uncertainties, depending on the speculation in the stock market. This is a sordid story and one of the last chapters of the achievement of my dear Finance Minister because you are not too long here. This is one of the last chapters added to the story of a great betrayal of the Indian nation by the Government known as UPA-2. Let us believe it. You may do whatever you like. But it will rebound. I am representing the voice of the Indian working people. All the trade unions have united including the INTUC and BMS. I represent them. By representing them, I would say that you are going a wrong way. It would rebound and it would rebound. There will be no smile, only tears.

---

16.49 hrs

## BUSINESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

### 52nd Report

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB (Cuttack): Sir, I beg to present the Fifty-Second Report of the Business Advisory Committee.

---

16.50 hrs.

PENSION FUND REGULATORY AND DEVELOPMENT  
AUTHORITY BILL, 2011 - **Contd...**

[Translation]

DR. RAGHUVANSH PRASAD SINGH (Vaishali): Sir, this Pension Bill was proposed by Shri Yashwant Sinha in 2003, when he was the Minister. At that time, he had introduced the new pension scheme and since then this Bill has reintroduced for passing today after the lapse of 10-12 years. What an alliance between the Government and the Opposition. This is an anti working class Bill. All the trade unions of the country are against this bill for whom you are going to frame this law. All India Railway Men's Federation's Shiv Gopal Mishra has written and requested to save the interest of the labourers. Save the labourers from this non-welfare act. They are disturbed by it.

Sir, this pension scheme is under the social security scheme. Lord Buddha said in Pali two and a half thousand years ago that "Bajjinam Sadbhav Parihaniya Dhamma", [English] "Seven virtues of Vajjians leading not to decline". [Translation] The society which observes all the virtues will progress. What is there in these seven virtues? I have the six kinds of virtues and there remains one virtue that such a society will make progress where old persons are honoured, they are heard, they are safeguarded and that society will not decline. On the same pattern, a new pension scheme has been brought for the working class of the country whereas old pension scheme exists. All are speaking on the pros and cons of that scheme. I will also speak on this subject.

Sir, my question is that there is a pension scheme for the Government employees on their retirement, old age pension, Indira Gandhi Pension Scheme for the BPL people. But what about the rest of the old people. Why this discrimination that there is pension for employees, pension for BPL families but no pension for the farmer. Why are they deprived of the social security? So, my question is that there should be a principle of equality, at least a pension of three thousand rupees should be there for all types of old people. This is my first question.

Why is this discrimination? When we visit the

villages, widows come and say that their names are not included in the BPL category. When we go to the farmer, they also ask as to what is their fault that their names are not included in the BPL category. This differentiation between the BPL and APL should be bridged and a new pension scheme should be introduced. A national pension scheme is going to be introduced. Farmers, general old age persons and all the old people in the country should be provided social security, pension under this scheme. This is my point.

Sir, secondly, till date, 15.4 lakh crore rupees has been deposited under the pension head in the country. The capitalists and multi-nationals of the world are eyeing this money and planning how to usurp it. This money will be invested in the share market. Today, the condition is very bad. Rupee has been devalued, current accounts deficit has increased, fiscal deficit has increased. If the share market collapses, then from where will the pension be paid to the poor and old persons. What will happen to those who have been made dependent on the stock market. Earlier, it was his own money and he used to get the pension. Now, they say, that they will invest it in the capital market. If some good investment is made then it is alright, but if the stock market goes bust then what will happen to him? It is a risky job. That is why the Left is putting up a resistance. Why are you feeling weak, we are here to see. We are with the working class. Their union is preparing to fight. So, we should not be afraid. We will continue to fight for the working class. Even in foreign countries where it has been implemented through multinational companies, what benefit has been gained? They have also suffered only losses. Therefore, seeing the present situation, all are apprehensive and worried that how it is going to happen and what happened in all these ten years when new pension scheme was implemented in 2003 and there was no law. Now they are framing a law to set up an authority which will have three full timers and three... (Interruptions) since they are anti-working class, therefore they will get... (Interruptions) and all those workers, common man, poor man, we will take their side in any case. We are against the capitalists, stock market players or middlemen. Farmers should also get pension. Farmers and old people, all should get pension. The Government should implement a comprehensive pension scheme that is what I want to say.



[English]

SHRI NAMA NAGESWARA RAO (Khammam): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I thank you for giving me this opportunity to speak on Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority Bill, 2011.

[Translation]

Mr. Chairman, the Government is bringing this Bill without taking into confidence the stakeholders, mainly the employees. The involvement of all stakeholders should have been there with regard to such an important Bill and it should have been discussed with everyone. Minimum income security was needed for social security, but all this has not been considered in it. Provisions have been made in this Bill to allow sensitive pension fund in speculation share market and that too without guaranteed return. Whatever is being invested from one side, what will be the guarantee of return on it, these words will be allowed for all, but there is no provision of guarantee in this pension bill. After doing job throughout his life, an employee was to live on pension in his old age after the retirement. But, if the money meant for his pension, remains in the share market and if the share market collapses or there is no return on the money so, invested, then what the Government will do? What is its guarantee? Therefore, minimum guarantee should be provided. Similarly, there is no provision for the unorganised sector. It is being covered only to the extent of 10-12 per cent the rest of unorganised sector is not being covered. The more important thing is that there is nothing about old age farmers.

**17.00 hrs.**

There should be a provision for old age farmers also who cannot do cultivation after a certain age. They are not thinking at all about the farmer. A farmer provides food to the entire country after toiling in the field throughout his life. There should be some provision for farmers in this pension bill. There is income tax provision for whatever return will be received on it. This should be deleted. Besides, minimum guarantee assurance should be given in it. Through you, we demand from the Government to bring these amendments. We oppose this Bill.

[English]

SHRI NARAHARI MAHATO (Purulia): Thank you Chairman, Sir for giving me this opportunity to participate in the Pension Fund Regulatory Development Authority Bill. A number of Members have participated in the discussion on the Bill.

**17.01 hrs.**

(SHRI ARJUN CHARAN SETHI *in the Chair*)

Today, crores of employees throughout the country are looking at the Parliament. I am surprised to find that the Government has brought forward the PFRDA Bill for discussion in the House and the principal Opposition Party is supporting the hon. Finance Minister in this move.

Sir, I would say that pension is the social security of an employee who has served the nation for more than 30 years. In the old age, pension is the only source of one's living. I wonder what was the necessity of bringing this Bill before the House? This Bill had come up before the House in 2003 when NDA was in power. Ten years later this Bill is again before the House. Earlier also, when the Left supported the UPA-1 Government, we opposed this Bill. Pension is the social security of the Central and State Government employees as also the public sector employees. This Bill is very harmful to the future of these employees. The people of our nation are looking at what harm the Government and the principal Opposition are doing to the future of the employees of our country.

I conclude my speech by saying that I oppose the Pension Fund Regulatory Development Authority Bill.

\*DR. THOKCHOM MEINYA (Inner Manipur): Sir, I rise to support this important Bill, namely, The Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority important Bill, 2011. It is a move in the right direction. After passing this Bill the Interim Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority will now become a statutory permanent Authority. This Authority will promote, develop and regulate the National Pension System which was earlier known as New Pension System. Interim Authority

\*English translation of the Speech originally delivered in Manipuri.

was set up in 2003 by a Government Notification. This Interim Authority could not be regularized this authority and make it a statutory body.

Sir, I believe that the entire House would like to extend and expand the scope of the National Pension System. We would like to provide social and income security to all the senior citizens of this country. The present number of subscribers is about 25 lakhs. We need to further popularize this Pension System. We may urge upon the States and Union Territories to encourage this National Pension System.

Sir, in times to come, we have to ensure social security and income security to all our senior citizens. In this respect we may look at the American model of social security for elderly citizens.

At present, I would like to request the hon. Finance Minister to fix the annuity amount at 50% not at 40% - that will ensure better pension for our senior citizens.

I believe all of us know the history of this Bill. It is a long pending Bill of 2005 and it has gone through the Departmentally Related Standing Committee. Important recommendations of the Committee have been incorporated – for instance, emergency withdrawal and cap on foreign investment, etc. and it is not a controversial Bill. I hope all of us will support this important piece of legislation; let us pass this Bill in one voice.

Last but not the least, I whole heartedly support the Bill which is brought by our hon. Finance Minister Shri P. Chidambaramji.

**THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM):** Mr. Chairman, I am grateful to the hon. Members, 15 of them, who have participated in this discussion on the Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority Bill.

Sir, this Bill was first introduced in 2005. It was once reported by the Standing Committee on Finance chaired, at that time, by Maj. Gen. (Retd.) Khanduri. The Standing Committee favourably reported the Bill. There were one or two dissent notes, mainly from the Left Parties. That Bill lapsed with the dissolution of the Lok Sabha.

The Bill was again re-introduced in 2011 and this is one of the rare Bills that went through another Standing Committee procedure. This time, the Standing Committee was chaired by Mr. Yashwant Sinha. This Committee also favourably reported the Bill. There was only one Member who dissented to the Standing Committee's report. The point I wish to make is that, at least, in the Standing Committee, there was very wide consensus for the Bill except one dissenting voice to the Bill that is now under consideration.

Secondly, when my friend, Shri Nishikant Dubey, spoke, I thought he will take credit for the fact that the interim PFRDA was actually notified by Shri Vajpayee's Government in October 2003.

**SHRI NISHIKANT DUBEY :** I said that.

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** That may have been lost in translation. The notification was made on 22.12.2003 and the New Pension Scheme came into force from 1.1.2004. So, when the UPA Government took office, the Scheme had come into force and all Government servants recruited after 1.1.2004 are covered by the New Pension Scheme. Every Government servant in service prior to 1.1.2004 is under the old scheme. Nobody is affected, nobody is complaining and they are not aggrieved.

The Government servants who were recruited after 2004 have been recruited with the clear stipulation that pension will be under the New Pension Scheme. To the best of my knowledge – I have been in the Finance Ministry earlier for some time and now again – I think by and large the Government servants have come to accept the fact that the New Pension Scheme is, in the long run, a beneficial Scheme. They may begin to earn pension only 28 or 29 years after they join service.

There are one or two other developments on which I thought I should comment. I know Shri T.K.S. Elangovan and Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad Singh have some reservations. But the point is, the 2005 Cabinet which approved the Bill, had Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad Singh as a member. He was the member of the Cabinet which approved this Bill. Shri Elangovan's Party had many members in the Cabinet which approved this Bill. Therefore, I suppose that memories are short. I acknowledge and I respect their right to express their

concerns. But when it comes to supporting the Bill finally, I have no doubt in my mind that our colleagues will support us in this Bill.

Actually, what you must remember is that you cannot turn back the clock. Twenty-six States have already joined the NPS. For example, Shri Semmalai opposed the Bill. But I want to remind him that Tamil Nadu also, by a Notification made on 6th of August, 2003, joined the New Pension Scheme with effect from 1.4.2003. It is hardly necessary for me to point out who was in Government in Tamil Nadu in 2003. Therefore, 26 States have already joined the NPS.

I will give you presently the number of employees who have joined the NPS. Today, the States have 17,76,973 subscribers. The cumulative contribution of the Central Government, the State Government and other NPS-like subscribers runs to Rs. 34,965 crore. ...(*Interruptions*) All I am pointing out is, I assume that the State Governments take a decision after a most careful consideration, after considering it in their State Cabinet. The State Governments were not obliged to join. They joined voluntarily. Only for the Central Government employees, it is mandatory from 1.1.2004. Twenty-six State Governments have joined. Total number of subscribers of the Central Government is 12,01,636; of State Governments, as on 14th of August, it is 17,76,973; of the private sector, it is 2,57,754; in NPS-lite Schemes, like Swalamban and similar Schemes, it is 20,46,849. The total is 52,83,212. The total asset under the management is Rs. 34,965 crore.

Now, the Standing Committee made a number of recommendations. I have accepted all except one. I think some one here quoted the wrong recommendation and alleged that we have not accepted that. That is not correct. The only recommendation that we are not able to accept is the Standing Committee said that we must allow a repayable advance; now, that would convert the NPS into a current account or even a over-draft account. That is not the purpose of the NPS. The purpose of the NPS is, at the end of his or her career, a man or a woman must have a large amount of money, a cumulative amount, so that forty per cent of that is mandatory annuitisation so that they will get an annuity as pension and the remaining sixty per cent can be taken as lump-sum. This 40 per

cent mandatory annuitization is also a minimum. If you want, the entire accumulation can be used for annuitization. We have accepted all the recommendations. In my opening Statement which I made, which many Members may not have heard because of an extra decibel level at that time, I had made it clear. I think all the recommendations of the Standing Committee have been accepted but for one. Only this one recommendation we have not been able to accept and I have given you the reasons.

The NPS actually offers a wide choice, as Shri Mahtab has pointed out. In fact, he was even advancing the other argument: "Why are you placing restrictions? Why do you not allow full freedom of choice?" Now, we think that at the current stage of development of the pension market and the current stage of development of the bond market, the equity market and the other instruments of investment, we should strike a balance. We have, therefore, struck a balance. There are clear restrictions on how much can be invested in the equity market, the e-market; how much can be invested in the Government bond market, the G-market; and how much can be invested in the C-market, the corporate bond market. The bond market is relatively under-developed in India. Therefore, we have to have this balance. But we have allowed the employees to have a choice that they would like all their money to be invested only in Government bonds. That has been allowed. We have also said that if you want an assured return, then the Authority will notify which are the schemes which are promising an assured return and you can then choose saying : "my money shall be invested only in the assured returns." So, every single recommendation of the Standing Committee which has a bearing on risk, which has a bearing on capacity to take risk, has been accepted. I think this is the way the legislation should be made. Government indeed makes legislation but Government is not the repository of all the wisdom. When it goes to a Standing Committee with opposition parties members on it, which Committee is chaired by a Member of the Opposition party, when Government receives their advice, when we find that there is merit in what they are saying, we accept it. After all, we represent the different shades of opinion of about 130 crore people. So, when we get these recommendations, we are willing to accept. That is

how, I believe, legislation should be made. This is a good example of how legislation should be made. It was notified by a previous Government; the Bill was introduced by a new Government; again re-introduced by the second UPA Government; it went to two Standing Committees chaired by two distinguished Members of the Opposition. Then, we have accepted suggestions and now we have reached a very broad consensus.

I think while I have heard all of you, I take your advice seriously for future guidance. The PFRD Authority is sitting in the Gallery. He must have listened to you very carefully; he must have noted your views. We will ensure that the NPS is improved; made more secure and made more attractive for the subscribers.

Sir, I do not wish to make a long speech. The point I am trying to say is that the NPS has been there with us for nine years. We have a non-statutory Authority today and that is not good. A sum of Rs.35,000 crore should not be managed by a non-statutory Authority. It must be managed by a statutory Authority. All that this Bill does is to make the non-statutory Authority a statutory Authority. Now, he has legal powers. He can take action; he can pull up people, he can punish people, he can fine people and he can impose penalties. That power was not available so far. Now, we have got a statutory Authority.

So, with these words, I commend this Bill. I am grateful to all the hon. Members.... (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI HUKMADEO NARAYAN YADAV (Madhubani): Pension should be provided for farmers also.

[*English*]

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Sir, many suggestions have been made which are outside the scope of this Bill. We have got this Swavalamban Scheme introduced by my distinguished predecessor.... (*Interruptions*) The Swavalamban Scheme has been introduced. The Swavalamban Scheme is attracting a large number of people. The Government makes a contribution. As they make a contribution of Rs.1000, the Government makes a contribution. It has to still gain currency. It has to be popularized more. We will do so. But the Old Age

Pension is not under this Scheme. That is a separate Scheme. That is a very different Scheme. This is a Scheme which is now accepted world-wide, namely, "a Defined Contribution". "Save for your pension as you earn during your career." That is the motto under which all the Schemes around the world are converging. You save as you earn. So, as you earn, you save, not for the current period but you save for your retirement.

So you save, accumulate over a period of time; the accumulation is managed by professionals; the accumulation adds to the total of your total wealth. At the time of retirement, that wealth is available for an annuity which will give you an assured pension every month for the rest of your life. That is the principle under which this has been formed. I am grateful to hon. Members. All other pension schemes which are there – old age pension, or some other pension scheme – they are outside this Act. They will be dealt with by the Ministry or Department concerned; we can make improvements there. For example, there are many other schemes. This is about people who have got a regular income, who can earn. As they earn today, they have got Current Account; they have got Savings Bank Account; some of them have got the Fixed Deposit Account. But they have no saving which actually matures at the time of retirement. Therefore, accumulation for pension is the way to save for retirement. That is what this scheme has introduced – on the day of retirement, there is a lump sum. Forty per cent of it is mandatory annuitisation but you can annuitise the entire 100 per cent, it will give you a larger annuity. You can also take a lump sum out of that.

With these words, Sir, I commend the Bill. I am grateful to the hon. Members for the support, and I request that all hon. Members, irrespective of the reservations they may have expressed, which I respect, I acknowledge, please move this Bill so that this Bill is passed.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Now, motion for consideration of the Bill. The question is:

"That the Bill to provide for the establishment of an authority to promote old age income security by establishing, developing and regulating pension

funds, to protect the interests of subscribers to schemes of pension funds and for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto be taken into consideration.”

*The motion was adopted.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House will now take up clause by clause consideration of the Bill. The question is:

“That clauses 2 and 3 stand part of the Bill.”

*The motion was adopted.*

*Clauses 2 and 3 were added to the Bill*

#### **Clause 4 Composition of Authority**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Minister, to move Amendment No. 3 to Clause 4 of the Bill.

Amendment made:

Page 3, lines 29 and 30, for “experience in economics, finance, law or administrative matters”, substitute “experience in economics or finance or law”. (3)

(Shri P. Chidambaram)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:

“That clause 4, as amended, stand part of the Bill.”

*The motion was adopted.*

*Clause 4, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

*Clauses 5 to 19 were added to the Bill.*

#### **Clause 20 National Pension System**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, the hon. Minister to move Amendment No. 4 to Clause 20 of the Bill.

Amendment made:

Page 11, for lines 28 and 29, substitute—

“(b) withdrawals, not exceeding twenty-five per cent of the contribution made by the subscriber, may be permitted from the individual pension account subject to the conditions, such as purpose, frequency and limits, as may be specified by the regulations;”. (4)

(Shri P. Chidambaram)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Minister, to move Amendment No. 5 to Clause 20 to the Bill.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Sir, I beg to move:

Page 11, for lines 33 and 34, substitute—

“Provided that—

- (a) the subscriber shall have an option of investing up to hundred per cent of his funds in Government Securities; and
  - (b) the subscriber, seeking minimum assured returns, shall have an option to invest his funds in such schemes providing minimum assured returns as may be notified by the Authority;”.
- (5)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab, are you moving your amendment?

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB (Cuttack): Yes, I beg to move:

That in the amendment proposed by Shri P. Chidambaram and printed as Sl. No. 5 in List 1 of amendments,—

after “minimum assured returns as may be notified by the Authority;”

insert “Provided further that the rate of minimum assured return shall not be less than the rate of interest for the time being payable on the deposits under the Employees’ Provident Funds Scheme framed under the Employees’ Provident Funds and Miscellaneous Provisions Act, 1952;”. (14)

I am moving Amendment No.14 to Clause 20 where I had mentioned that relating to the Amendment that has been moved by the hon. Minister to specify because – provided further – this is my amendment, that after minimum assured returns as may be notified by the authority. Of course this was discussed. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Minister has already replied to your to your points.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB : No, he has not specified. My amendment is – provided further that the rate of minimum assured return shall not be less than the rate of interest for the time being payable on the

deposits under the Employees Provident Funds Scheme framed under the Employees' Provident Fund and Miscellaneous Provisions Act, 1952. That is my amendment and I move this amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Hon. Minister, do you want to say anything on this?

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Government bond gives a return and everybody knows that the best return given on any bond is the Government bond and that is the assured return. Now, how can I stipulate today that the return will be more than this or less than that? At any given time, the Government bond's return is known and it is notified everyday. So, a person can always choose that his money should only be in Government bonds and that is the end of the matter.

MR. CHAIRMAN : So, Mr. Mahtab, are you withdrawing your amendment?

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB : No, I am not withdrawing. I want a division on this amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I shall now put Amendment No. 14 moved by Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab to the vote of the House.

The question is:

That in the amendment proposed by Shri P. Chidambaram and printed as Sl. No. 5 in List 1 of amendments,—

*after* "minimum assured returns as may be notified by the Authority;"

*insert* "Provided further that the rate of minimum assured return shall not be less than the rate of interest for the time being payable on the deposits under the Employees' Provident Funds Scheme framed under the Employees' Provident Funds and Miscellaneous Provisions Act, 1952;". (14)

I think 'Noes' have it.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB : Sir, 'Ayes' have it. I want division.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let the Lobbies be cleared—  
Now, the Lobbies have been cleared.

The question is:

That in the amendment proposed by Shri P. Chidambaram and printed as Sl. No. 5 in List 1 of amendments,—

*after* "minimum assured returns as may be notified by the Authority;"

*insert* "Provided further that the rate of minimum assured return shall not be less than the rate of interest for the time being payable on the deposits under the Employees' Provident Funds Scheme framed under the Employees' Provident Funds and Miscellaneous Provisions Act, 1952;". (14)

*The Lok Sabha divided:*

DIVISION No. 1                      AYES                      17:34 hrs.

Acharia, Shri Basu Deb

Anandan, Shri M.

Baske, Shri Pulin Bihari

Bauri, Shrimati Susmita

Biju, Shri P.K.

Das, Shri Khagen

Dasgupta, Shri Gurudas

Dome, Dr. Ram Chandra

Haque, Sk. Saidul

Karunakaran, Shri P.

Kumar, Shri P.

Lingam, Shri P.

Mahato, Shri Narahari

Mahtab, Shri Bhartruhari

Malik, Shri Sakti Mohan

Manian, Shri O.S.

Natarajan, Shri P.R.

Panda, Shri Prabodh

Rajesh, Shri M.B.

Rao, Shri Nama Nageswara

Rathod, Shri Ramesh

Roy, Shri Mahendra Kumar

Saha, Dr. Anup Kumar

Sampath, Shri A.

Satpathy, Shri Tathagata

Semmalai, Shri S.

Sivasami, Shri C.

Sugumar, Shri K.

Tarai, Shri Bibhu Prasad

Thambidurai, Dr. M.

Venugopal, Dr. P.

**NOES**

Abdullah, Dr. Farooq

Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash

Angadi, Shri Suresh

Antony, Shri Anto

Awale, Shri Jaywant Gangaram

Baalu, Shri T.R.

Baghel, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh

Bairwa, Shri Khiladi Lal

Bais, Shri Ramesh

Baite, Shri Thangso

Baitha, Shri Kameshwar

Baliram, Dr.

Bansal, Shri Pawan Kumar

Barq, Dr. Shafiqur Rahman

Basavaraj, Shri G. S.

Basheer, Shri Mohammed E.T.

Bhagat, Shri Sudarshan

Bhoi, Shri Sanjay

Biswal, Shri Hemanand

Chacko, Shri P.C.

Chakravarty, Shrimati Bijoya

Chaudhary, Dr. Tushar

Chaudhary, Shri Arvind Kumar

Chaudhary, Haribhai

Chauhan, Shri Dara Singh

Chauhan, Shri Mahendrasinh P.

Chidambaram, Shri P.

Chitthan, Shri N.S.V.

Choudhary, Shri Harish

Choudhry, Shrimati Shruti

Choudhury, Shri Abu Hasem Khan

Chowdhary, Shrimati Santosh

Dasmunsi, Shrimati Deepa

Davidson, Shrimati J. Helen

Deo, Shri V. Kishore Chandra

Devi, Shrimati Ashwamedh

Devi, Shrimati Rama

Dhanapalan, Shri K. P.

Dhruvanarayana, Shri R.

Dhurve, Shrimati Jyoti

Dias, Shri Charles

Dikshit, Shri Sandeep

Dubey, Shri Nishikant

Dudhgaonkar, Shri Ganeshrao Nagorao

Elangovan, Shri T.K.S.

Engti, Shri Biren Singh

Ering, Shri Ninong

Gaikwad, Shri Eknath Mahadeo

Gandhi, Shri Rahul

Geete, Shri Anant Gangaram

Ghatowar, Shri Paban Singh

Gogoi, Shri Dip

Gouda, Shri Shivarama

Handique, Shri B.K.

Haque, Shri Mohd. Asrarul

Hegde, Shri K. Jayaprakash

Hooda, Shri Deepender Singh

Hossain, Shri Abdul Mannan

Hussain, Shri Ismail

Hussain, Shri Syed Shahnawaz

Jahan, Shrimati Kaisar

Jain, Shri Pradeep

Jakhar, Shri Badri Ram

Jardosh, Shrimati Darshana

Jhansi Lakshmi, Shrimati Botcha  
 Jindal, Shri Naveen  
 Joshi, Shri Mahesh  
 Joshi, Shri Pralhad  
 Kachhadia, Shri Naranbhai  
 Kamal Nath, Shri  
 Kashyap, Shri Virender  
 Kataria, Shri Lalchand  
 Khandela, Shri Mahadeo Singh  
 Kharge, Shri Mallikarjun  
 Khatgaonkar, Shri Bhaskarrao Bapurao Patil  
 Killi, Dr. Kruparani  
 Kowase, Shri Marotrao Sainuji  
 Krishnasswamy, Shri M.  
 Kumar, Shri Ramesh  
 \*Kumar, Shri Shailendra  
 Kumari, Shrimati Chandresh  
 Kumari, Shrimati Putul  
 Kurup, Shri N. Peethambara  
 Lakshmi, Shrimati Panabaka  
 Lalu Prasad, Shri  
 Maharaj, Shri Satpal  
 Mahato, Shri Baidyanath Prasad  
 Mcleod, Shrimati Ingrid  
 Meena, Shri Namoo Narain  
 Meghwal, Shri Arjun Ram  
 Meghwal, Shri Bharat Ram  
 Meinya, Dr. Thokchom  
 Mirdha, Dr. Jyoti  
 Mishra, Shri Govind Prasad  
 Mohan, Shri P.C.  
 Moily, Shri M. Veerappa  
 Mukherjee, Shri Abhijit  
 Muniyappa, Shri K.H.  
 Nagpal, Shri Devendra  
 Naik, Shri P. Balram

Naik, Shri Shripad Yesso  
 Narah, Shrimati Ranee  
 Narayanasamy, Shri V.  
 Natrajan, Kumari Meenakshi  
 Nirupam, Shri Sanjay  
 Ola, Shri Sis Ram  
 Pal, Shri Rajaram  
 Pandey, Dr. Vinay Kumar  
 Pandey, Shri Gorakhnath  
 Patel, Shri Dinsha  
 Patel, Shri Kishanbhai V.  
 Patel, Shri R.K. Singh  
 Patel, Shrimati Jayshreeben  
 Pathak, Shri Harin  
 Patil, Shri C.R.  
 Patil, Shri Pratik  
 Pilot, Shri Sachin  
 Pradhan, Shri Amarnath  
 Punia, Shri P. L.  
 Purandeswari, Shrimati D.  
 Purkayastha, Shri Kabindra  
 Raghavan, Shri M.K.  
 Rai, Shri Prem Das  
 Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally  
 Ramasubbu, Shri S.S.  
 Rana, Shri Jagdish Singh  
 Rao, Dr. K.S.  
 Rathwa, Shri Ramsinh  
 Rawat, Shri Ashok Kumar  
 Reddy, Shri Gutha Sukhender  
 Reddy, Shri K.J.S.P  
 Reddy, Shri K.R.G.  
 \*Reddy, Shri S.P.Y.  
 Ruala, Shri C.L.  
 Sachan, Shri Rakesh

---

\*Voted through slip.

---

\*Corrected through slip for Noes.



Sahay, Shri Subodh Kant  
 Sanjoy, Shri Takam  
 Sardinha, Shri Francisco Cosme  
 Saroj, Shri Tufani  
 Saroj, Shrimati Sushila  
 Sayeed, Shri Hamdullah  
 Selja, Kumari  
 Shah, Shrimati Mala Rajya Laxmi  
 Shanavas, Shri M.I.  
 Shariq, Shri S.D.  
 Shekhar, Shri Neeraj  
 Shekhawat, Shri Gopal Singh  
 Shetkar, Shri Suresh Kumar  
 Shinde, Shri Sushilkumar  
 Shivaji, Shri Adhalrao Patil  
 Sibal, Shri Kapil  
 Siddeshwara, Shri G.M.  
 Singh, Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad  
 Singh, Rajkumari Ratna  
 Singh, Shri Ajit  
 Singh, Shri Ganesh  
 Singh, Shri Ijyaraj  
 Singh, Shri Jagdanand  
 Singh, Shri Jitendra  
 Singh, Shri R.P.N.  
 Singh, Shri Radhe Mohan  
 Singh, Shri Ratan  
 Singh, Shri Rewati Raman  
 Singh, Shri Sukhdev  
 Singh, Shri Sushil Kumar  
 Singh, Shri Uday Pratap  
 Singh, Shri Vijay Bahadur  
 Singh, Shrimati Pratibha  
 Singla, Shri Vijay Inder  
 Solanki, Dr. Kirit Premjibhai  
 Solanki, Shri Makansingh  
 Suklabaidya, Shri Lalit Mohan

Sule, Shrimati Supriya  
 Suresh, Shri D.K.  
 Suresh, Shri Kodikkunnil  
 Sushant, Dr. Rajan  
 Swaraj, Shrimati Sushma  
 Tamta, Shri Pradeep  
 Tandon, Shrimati Annu  
 Tanwar, Shri Ashok  
 Taviad, Dr. Prabha Kishor  
 Taware, Shri Suresh Kashinath  
 Tewari, Shri Manish  
 Thakor, Shri Jagdish  
 Tharoor, Dr. Shashi  
 Thirumaavalavan, Shri Thol  
 Thomas, Prof. K.V.  
 Tirath, Shrimati Krishna  
 Tiwari, Shri Bhisma Shankar alias Kushal  
 Toppo, Shri Joseph  
 Udasi, Shri Shivkumar  
 Vardhan, Shri Harsh  
 Venugopal, Shri K.C.  
 Verma, Shri Sajjan  
 Verma, Shrimati Usha  
 Vishwanath Katti, Shri Ramesh  
 Viswanathan, Shri P.  
 Vyas, Dr. Girija  
 Wakchaure, Shri Bhausahab Rajaram  
 Yadav, Shrimati Dimple  
 Yadav, Shri Dinesh Chandra  
 Yadav, Shri Hukmadeo Narayan  
 Yadav, Shri Anjankumar M.  
 Yaskhi, Shri Madhu Goud

MR. CHAIRMAN: Subject to correction, \* the result of the Division is:

\*The following members also recorded/corrected their votes through slips.

Ayes - Shri S.P.Y. Reddy = 31

Noes 202 + S/Shri S.P.Y. Reddy and Shailendra Kumar = 204

Ayes: 32

Noes: 202

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:

Page 11, for lines 33 and 34, *substitute—*

“Provided that—

- (a) the subscriber shall have an option of investing up to hundred per cent of his funds in Government Securities; and
- (b) the subscriber, seeking minimum assured returns, shall have an option to invest his funds in such schemes providing minimum assured returns as may be notified by the Authority;”.

(5)

*The motion was adopted.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Basu Deb Acharia, are you moving your Amendment No. 11 to Clause 20?

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Yes, Sir, I am moving. It is a very important amendment. My amendment is that minimum guaranteed pension shall not be less than the pension under the existing defined pension scheme available to the Central Government employees; restore back to the existing pension system. This is very important.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Minister has already replied to the debate.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : I beg to move:

Page 11, for lines 39 and 40,—

*substitute* “(g) minimum guaranteed pension shall not be less than the pension under the existing defined pension system available to the Central Government employees appointed before the 1st day of January, 2004 and referred to in clause (d) of sub-section (3) of section 12;”. (11)

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are entitled to move your amendment, no doubt, but the hon. Minister has already replied to the debate in detail and he has already mentioned this point also.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : He has not replied to this particular amendment. I cannot accept his amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendment No. 11 to Clause 20 moved by Shri Basu Deb Acharia to the vote of the House.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Sir, I want a division.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Lobbies have already been cleared.

The question is:

Page 11, for lines 39 and 40,—

substitute “(g) minimum guaranteed pension shall not be less than the pension under the existing defined pension system available to the Central Government employees appointed before the 1<sup>st</sup> day of January, 2004 and referred to in clause (d) of sub-section (3) of section 12;”. (11)

*The Lok Sabha divided:*

**DIVISION No. 2                      AYES                      17:37 hrs.**

Acharia, Shri Basu Deb  
Anandan, Shri M.  
Baske, Shri Pulin Bihari  
Bauri, Shrimati Susmita  
Biju, Shri P.K.  
Das, Shri Khagen  
Dasgupta, Shri Gurudas  
Dome, Dr. Ram Chandra  
Haque, Sk. Saidul  
Karunakaran, Shri P.  
Kumar, Shri P.  
Lingam, Shri P.  
Mahato, Shri Narahari  
Mahtab, Shri Bhartruhari  
Malik, Shri Sakti Mohan  
Manian, Shri O.S.  
Natarajan, Shri P.R.  
Panda, Shri Prabodh

Rajesh, Shri M.B.

Rao, Shri Nama Nageswara

Rathod, Shri Ramesh

Roy, Shri Mahendra Kumar

Saha, Dr. Anup Kumar

Sampath, Shri A.

Satpathy, Shri Tathagata

Semmalai, Shri S.

Sivasami, Shri C.

Sugumar, Shri K.

Tarai, Shri Bibhu Prasad

Thambidurai, Dr. M.

Venugopal, Dr. P.

**NOES**

Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash

Angadi, Shri Suresh

Antony, Shri Anto

Awale, Shri Jaywant Gangaram

Baalu, Shri T.R.

Baghel, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh

Bairwa, Shri Khiladi Lal

Bais, Shri Ramesh

Baite, Shri Thangso

Baitha, Shri Kameshwar

Baliram, Dr.

Bansal, Shri Pawan Kumar

Barq, Dr. Shafiqur Rahman

Basavaraj, Shri G. S.

Basheer, Shri Mohammed E.T.

Bhagat, Shri Sudarshan

Bhoi, Shri Sanjay

Biswal, Shri Hemanand

Chacko, Shri P.C.

Chakravarty, Shrimati Bijoya

Chaudhary, Dr. Tushar

Chaudhary, Shri Arvind Kumar

Chaudhary, Haribhai

Chauhan, Shri Dara Singh

Chauhan, Shri Mahendrasinh P.

Chidambaram, Shri P.

Chitthan, Shri N.S.V.

Choudhary, Shri Harish

Choudhry, Shrimati Shruti

Choudhury, Shri Abu Hasem Khan

Chowdhary, Shrimati Santosh

Dasmunsi, Shrimati Deepa

Davidson, Shrimati J. Helen

Deo, Shri V. Kishore Chandra

Devi, Shrimati Ashwamedh

Devi, Shrimati Rama

Dhanapalan, Shri K. P.

Dhruvanarayana, Shri R.

Dhurve, Shrimati Jyoti

Dias, Shri Charles

Dikshit, Shri Sandeep

Dubey, Shri Nishikant

Dudhgaonkar, Shri Ganeshrao Nagorao

Elangovan, Shri T.K.S.

Engti, Shri Biren Singh

Ering, Shri Ninong

Gaikwad, Shri Eknath Mahadeo

Gandhi, Shri Rahul

Geete, Shri Anant Gangaram

Ghatowar, Shri Paban Singh

Gogoi, Shri Dip

Gouda, Shri Shivarama

Handique, Shri B.K.

Haque, Shri Mohd. Asrarul

Hegde, Shri K. Jayaprakash

Hooda, Shri Deepender Singh  
 Hossain, Shri Abdul Mannan  
 Hussain, Shri Ismail  
 Hussain, Shri Syed Shahnawaz  
 Jahan, Shrimati Kaisar  
 Jain, Shri Pradeep  
 Jakhar, Shri Badri Ram  
 Jardosh, Shrimati Darshana  
 Jhansi Lakshmi, Shrimati Botcha  
 Jindal, Shri Naveen  
 Joshi, Shri Mahesh  
 Joshi, Shri Pralhad  
 Kachhadia, Shri Naranbhai  
 Kamal Nath, Shri  
 Karwaria, Shri Kapil Muni  
 Kashyap, Shri Virender  
 Kataria, Shri Lalchand  
 Khandela, Shri Mahadeo Singh  
 Kharge, Shri Mallikarjun  
 Khatgaonkar, Shri Bhaskarrao Bapurao Patil  
 Killi, Dr. Kruparani  
 Kowase, Shri Marotrao Sainuji  
 Krishnasswamy, Shri M.  
 Kumar, Shri Ramesh  
 \*Kumar, Shri Shailendra  
 Kumari, Shrimati Chandresh  
 Kumari, Shrimati Putul  
 Kurup, Shri N. Peethambara  
 Lakshmi, Shrimati Panabaka  
 Lalu Prasad, Shri  
 Maharaj, Shri Satpal  
 Mahato, Shri Baidyanath Prasad  
 Mcleod, Shrimati Ingrid  
 Meena, Shri Namoo Narain  
 Meghwal, Shri Arjun Ram  
 Meghwal, Shri Bharat Ram

Meinya, Dr. Thokchom  
 Mirdha, Dr. Jyoti  
 Mishra, Shri Govind Prasad  
 Mohan, Shri P.C.  
 Moily, Shri M. Veerappa  
 Mukherjee, Shri Abhijit  
 Muniyappa, Shri K.H.  
 Nagpal, Shri Devendra  
 Naik, Shri P. Balram  
 Naik, Shri Shripad Yesso  
 Narah, Shrimati Ranee  
 Narayanasamy, Shri V.  
 Natrajan, Kumari Meenakshi  
 Nirupam, Shri Sanjay  
 Ola, Shri Sis Ram  
 Pal, Shri Rajaram  
 Pandey, Dr. Vinay Kumar  
 Pandey, Shri Gorakhnath  
 Patel, Shri Dinsha  
 Patel, Shri Kishanbhai V.  
 Patel, Shri R.K. Singh  
 Patel, Shrimati Jayshreeben  
 Pathak, Shri Harin  
 Patil, Shri C.R.  
 Patil, Shri Pratik  
 Pilot, Shri Sachin  
 Pradhan, Shri Amarnath  
 Punia, Shri P. L.  
 Purandeswari, Shrimati D.  
 Purkayastha, Shri Kabindra  
 Raghavan, Shri M.K.  
 Rai, Shri Prem Das  
 Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally  
 Ramasubbu, Shri S.S.  
 Rana, Shri Jagdish Singh  
 Rao, Dr. K.S.  
 Rathwa, Shri Ramsinh

---

\*Voted through slip.

Rawat, Shri Ashok Kumar  
Reddy, Shri Gutha Sukhender  
Reddy, Shri K.J.S.P  
Reddy, Shri K.R.G.  
Reddy, Shri S.P.Y.  
Ruala, Shri C.L.  
Sachan, Shri Rakesh  
Sahay, Shri Subodh Kant  
Sanjoy, Shri Takam  
Sardinha, Shri Francisco Cosme  
Saroj, Shri Tufani  
Saroj, Shrimati Sushila  
Sayeed, Shri Hamdullah  
Selja, Kumari  
Shah, Shrimati Mala Rajya Laxmi  
Shanavas, Shri M.I.  
Shariq, Shri S.D.  
Shekhar, Shri Neeraj  
Shekhawat, Shri Gopal Singh  
Shetkar, Shri Suresh Kumar  
Shinde, Shri Sushilkumar  
Shivaji, Shri Adhalrao Patil  
Sibal, Shri Kapil  
Siddeshwara, Shri G.M.  
Singh, Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad  
Singh, Rajkumari Ratna  
Singh, Shri Ajit  
Singh, Shri Ganesh  
Singh, Shri Ijyaraj  
Singh, Shri Jagdanand  
Singh, Shri Jitendra  
Singh, Shri R.P.N.  
Singh, Shri Radhe Mohan  
Singh, Shri Ratan  
Singh, Shri Rewati Raman

Singh, Shri Sukhdev  
Singh, Shri Sushil Kumar  
Singh, Shri Uday Pratap  
Singh, Shri Vijay Bahadur  
Singh, Shrimati Pratibha  
Singla, Shri Vijay Inder  
Solanki, Dr. Kirit Premjibhai  
Solanki, Shri Makansingh  
Suklabaidya, Shri Lalit Mohan  
Sule, Shrimati Supriya  
Suresh, Shri D.K.  
Suresh, Shri Kodikkunnil  
Sushant, Dr. Rajan  
Swaraj, Shrimati Sushma  
Tamta, Shri Pradeep  
Tandon, Shrimati Annu  
Tanwar, Shri Ashok  
Taviad, Dr. Prabha Kishor  
Taware, Shri Suresh Kashinath  
Tewari, Shri Manish  
Thakor, Shri Jagdish  
Tharoor, Dr. Shashi  
Thirumaavalavan, Shri Thol  
Thomas, Prof. K.V.  
Tirath, Shrimati Krishna  
Tiwari, Shri Bhisma Shankar alias Kushal  
Toppo, Shri Joseph  
Udasi, Shri Shivkumar  
Vardhan, Shri Harsh  
Venugopal, Shri K.C.  
Verma, Shri Sajjan  
Verma, Shrimati Usha  
Vishwanath Katti, Shri Ramesh  
Viswanathan, Shri P.  
Vyas, Dr. Girija

Wakchaure, Shri Bhausaheb Rajaram

Yadav, Shrimati Dimple

Yadav, Shri Dinesh Chandra

Yadav, Shri Hukmadeo Narayan

Yadav, Shri Anjankumar M.

Yadav, Shri Mulayam Singh

Yaskhi, Shri Madhu Goud

MR. CHAIRMAN: Subject to correction\*, the result of the Division is:

Ayes: 31

Noes: 204

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:

“That clause 20, as amended, stand part of the Bill.”

*Clause 20, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

*Clauses 21 and 22 were added to the Bill.*

#### **Clause 23 Pension Funds**

*Amendment made:*

Page 12, for lines 38 and 39, substitute –

“Provided that at least one of the pension funds shall be a Government company.”. (6)

(Shri P. Chidambaram)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Basu Deb Acharia, are you moving your Amendment No. 12 to Clause 23?

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Yes, Sir, I am moving my Amendment. My amendment is, all the pension fund shall be Government companies. There is an amendment by the Minister that there will be one Government company. My amendment is all the companies should be Government companies.

I beg to move:

Page 12, line 38, –

for “at least one of the pensions fund shall be a Government company”

\*The following Members also recorded/corrected their votes through slips.

Ayes 31

Noes 204 + Shri Shailendra Kumar = 205

*substitute* “all the pensions fund shall be Government companies”. (12)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendment No. 12 to Clause 23 moved by Shri Basu Deb Acharia to the vote of the House.

*The amendment was put and negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:

“That clause 23, as amended, stand part of the Bill.”

*The motion was adopted.*

*Clause 23, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

#### **Motion Re: Suspension of Rule 80 (i)**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Minister to move the motion.

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM): Sir, I beg to move:

“That this House do suspend clause (i) of rule 80 of Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha in so far as it requires that an amendment shall be within the scope of the Bill and relevant to the subject matter of the clause to which it relates, in its application to the Government amendment No. 7 to the Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority Bill, 2011, and that this amendment may be allowed to be moved.”

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:

“That this House do suspend clause (i) of rule 80 of Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha in so far as it requires that an amendment shall be within the scope of the Bill and relevant to the subject matter of the clause to which it relates, in its application to the Government amendment No. 7 to the Pension Fund Regulatory and Development Authority Bill, 2011, and that this amendment may be allowed to be moved.”

*The motion was adopted.*

#### **New Clause 23A ‘Certain restrictions on foreign companies or individual or association of persons.**

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Minister to move Amendment No.7.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: I beg to move:

Page 12, after line 44, insert—

23A. The aggregate holding of equity shares by a foreign company either by itself or through its subsidiary companies or its nominees or by an individual or by an association of persons whether registered or not under any law of a country outside India taken in aggregate in the pension fund shall not exceed twenty-six per cent of the paid-up capital of such fund or such percentage as may be approved for an Indian insurance company under the provisions of the Insurance Act, 1938, whichever is higher. 4 of 1938

*Explanation.* – For the purposes of this section, the expression “foreign company” shall have the meaning assigned to it in clause (23A) of section 2 of the Income-tax Act, 1961.’. (7) 43 of 1961

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab, are you moving your Amendment No. 15 to New Clause 23A?

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB : Yes, Sir. I would like to move my amendment and I also want to say something.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, this is an amendment to the amendment that has been moved by the Finance Minister today. Here, I want to omit the last part of the sentence. His amendment says that the aggregate holding of equity shares by a foreign company either by itself or through its subsidiary companies or its nominees or by an individual or by an association of persons whether registered or not under any law of a country outside India taken in aggregate in the pension fund shall not exceed twenty-six per cent of the paid-up capital of such fund. Up to this point, I agree. My amendment is regarding the line which follows this sentence. My amendment is that you delete the wordings which follow this sentence. Do not tag it with the insurance sector. I agree that you need foreign capital...(Interruptions) Let me complete, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The hon. Minister is to reply.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB : I know that but let me complete. I have a right to express my opinion. I

have a right to express my interest. ...(Interruptions) Sir, please see the Rule book. I do not have to remind the Members who are going to express themselves in a way but I will be demanding a division on this because I want a cap on FDI. Do not relate it because this will relate to further difficulty. When the insurance sector FDI will increase to 49 per cent, here you will get a provision that you will increase it to 49 per cent. My point is that as in the insurance sector a commitment was given by the then Government to keep it at 26 per cent, restrict it at 26 per cent, and do not tag it with the insurance sector. That is my amendment.

I beg to move:

That in the amendment proposed by Shri P. Chidambaram and printed as Sl. No. 7 in List 1 of amendments,—

omit “or such percentage as may be approved for an Indian insurance company under the provisions of the Insurance Act, 1938, whichever is higher.”. (15)

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Sir, I assume that the hon. Member has read the Report of the Standing Committee. It is the Standing Committee which said, in 2005, and I quote:

“The Committee is of the view that the decisions relating to permitting FDI in the pension sector and deployment of pension funds should in no way be in variance with the related provisions applicable to the insurance sector.”

The Insurance Act provides today 26 per cent. So, what we have provided in the Pension Act is the same as provided in the Insurance Act. If the Insurance Act is amended by Parliament, what we are saying is that amended ratio will also apply to pension. This is introduced on the basis of the Standing Committee’s recommendation. The Standing Committee’s recommendation had only one dissenting Member and nobody dissented to this recommendation. So, what we are doing is to make it absolutely clear that pension will follow insurance. ...(Interruptions)

PROF. SAUGATA ROY (Dum Dum): We have opposed to FDI both in pension and insurance. ...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: It would not go on record.

*(Interruptions)...\**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Mahtab, please sit down. You have already moved the amendment and made a speech also.

*...(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Let us put it to vote.  
*...(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendment No. 15 to the New Clause 23A moved by Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab be adopted.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB : Sir, I want a division.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: All right....*(Interruptions)*  
His amendment does not do away with FDI.  
*...(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, the Lobbies have already been cleared.

The question is:

That in the amendment proposed by Shri P. Chidambaram and printed as Sl. No. 7 in List 1 of amendments,—

omit “or such percentage as may be approved for an Indian insurance company under the provisions of the Insurance Act, 1938, whichever is higher.”.  
(15)

*The Lok Sabha divided:*

**DIVISION No. 3                      AYES      17.45 hrs.**

Acharia, Shri Basu Deb

Anandan, Shri M.

Bandyopadhyay, Shri Sudip

Banerjee, Shri Kalyan

Banerjee, Shri Prasun

Baske, Shri Pulin Bihari

Bauri, Shrimati Susmita

Biju, Shri P.K.

Das, Shri Khagen

Dasgupta, Shri Gurudas

Dome, Dr. Ram Chandra

Haldar, Dr. Sucharu Ranjan

Haque, Sk. Saidul

Karunakaran, Shri P.

Kumar, Shri P.

\*Kumari, Shrimati Putul

Lingam, Shri P.

Mahato, Shri Narahari

Mahtab, Shri Bhartruhari

Malik, Shri Sakti Mohan

Manian, Shri O.S.

Naskar, Shri Gobinda Chandra

Natarajan, Shri P.R.

Panda, Shri Prabodh

Paul, Shri Tapas

Rajesh, Shri M.B.

Rao, Shri Nama Nageswara

Rathod, Shri Ramesh

Roy, Prof. Saugata

Roy, Shri Mahendra Kumar

Roy, Shrimati Shatabdi

Saha, Dr. Anup Kumar

Sampath, Shri A.

Satpathy, Shri Tathagata

Semmalai, Shri S.

Shetti, Shri Raju

Sivasami, Shri C.

Sugumar, Shri K.

Tarai, Shri Bibhu Prasad

Thambidurai, Dr. M.

Trivedi, Shri Dinesh

\*Venugopal, Dr. P.

**NOES**

Abdullah, Dr. Farooq

Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash

\*Not recorded.

\*Voted through slip.



Angadi, Shri Suresh	Dhurve, Shrimati Jyoti
Antony, Shri Anto	Dias, Shri Charles
Awale, Shri Jaywant Gangaram	Dikshit, Shri Sandeep
Baalu, Shri T.R.	Dubey, Shri Nishikant
Baghel, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh	Dudhgaonkar, Shri Ganeshrao Nagorao
Bairwa, Shri Khiladi Lal	Elangovan, Shri T.K.S.
Bais, Shri Ramesh	Engti, Shri Biren Singh
Baite, Shri Thangso	Ering, Shri Ninong
Baitha, Shri Kameshwar	Gaikwad, Shri Eknath Mahadeo
Baliram, Dr.	Gandhi, Shri Rahul
Bansal, Shri Pawan Kumar	Geete, Shri Anant Gangaram
Basavaraj, Shri G. S.	Ghatowar, Shri Paban Singh
Basheer, Shri Mohammed E.T.	Gogoi, Shri Dip
Bhagat, Shri Sudarshan	Gouda, Shri Shivarama
Bhoi, Shri Sanjay	Handique, Shri B.K.
Biswal, Shri Hemanand	Haque, Shri Mohd. Asrarul
Chacko, Shri P.C.	Hegde, Shri K. Jayaprakash
Chakravarty, Shrimati Bijoya	Hooda, Shri Deepender Singh
Chaudhary, Dr. Tushar	Hossain, Shri Abdul Mannan
Chaudhary, Shri Arvind Kumar	Hussain, Shri Ismail
Chaudhary, Haribhai	Hussain, Shri Syed Shahnawaz
Chauhan, Shri Dara Singh	Jahan, Shrimati Kaisar
Chauhan, Shri Mahendrasinh P.	Jain, Shri Pradeep
Chidambaram, Shri P.	Jakhar, Shri Badri Ram
Chitthan, Shri N.S.V.	Jardosh, Shrimati Darshana
Choudhary, Shri Harish	Jhansi Lakshmi, Shrimati Botcha
Choudhry, Shrimati Shruti	Jindal, Shri Naveen
Choudhury, Shri Abu Hasem Khan	Joshi, Shri Mahesh
Chowdhary, Shrimati Santosh	Joshi, Shri Pralhad
Dasmunsi, Shrimati Deepa	Kachhadia, Shri Naranbhai
*Davidson, Shrimati J. Helen	Karwaria, Shri Kapil Muni
Deo, Shri V. Kishore Chandra	Kashyap, Shri Virender
Devi, Shrimati Ashwamedh	Kataria, Shri Lalchand
Devi, Shrimati Rama	Khandela, Shri Mahadeo Singh
Dhanapalan, Shri K. P.	Kharge, Shri Mallikarjun
Dhruvanarayana, Shri R.	Khatgaonkar, Shri Bhaskarrao Bapurao Patil
	Killi, Dr. Kruparani
	Kowase, Shri Marotrao Sainuji

Krishnasswamy, Shri M.  
 Kumar, Shri Ramesh  
 \*Kumar, Shri Shailendra  
 Kumari, Shrimati Chandresh  
 Kurup, Shri N. Peethambara  
 Lakshmi, Shrimati Panabaka  
 Lalu Prasad, Shri  
 Maharaj, Shri Satpal  
 Mahato, Shri Baidyanath Prasad  
 Mcleod, Shrimati Ingrid  
 Meena, Shri Namu Narain  
 Meghwal, Shri Arjun Ram  
 Meghwal, Shri Bharat Ram  
 Meinya, Dr. Thokchom  
 Mirdha, Dr. Jyoti  
 Mishra, Shri Govind Prasad  
 Mitra, Shri Somen  
 Mohan, Shri P.C.  
 Moily, Shri M. Veerappa  
 Mukherjee, Shri Abhijit  
 Muniyappa, Shri K.H.  
 Nagpal, Shri Devendra  
 Naik, Shri P. Balram  
 Naik, Shri Shripad Yesso  
 Narah, Shrimati Ranee  
 Narayanasamy, Shri V.  
 Natrajan, Kumari Meenakshi  
 Nirupam, Shri Sanjay  
 Ola, Shri Sis Ram  
 Pal, Shri Rajaram  
 Pandey, Dr. Vinay Kumar  
 Pandey, Shri Gorakhnath  
 Patel, Shri Dinsha  
 Patel, Shri Kishanbhai V.  
 Patel, Shri R.K. Singh  
 Patel, Shrimati Jayshreeben  
 Pathak, Shri Harin

Patil, Shri C.R.  
 Patil, Shri Pratik  
 Pilot, Shri Sachin  
 Pradhan, Shri Amarnath  
 Punia, Shri P. L.  
 Purandeswari, Shrimati D.  
 Purkayastha, Shri Kabindra  
 Raghavan, Shri M.K.  
 Rai, Shri Prem Das  
 Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally  
 Ramasubbu, Shri S.S.  
 Rana, Shri Jagdish Singh  
 Rao, Dr. K.S.  
 \*Rathwa, Shri Ramsinh  
 Rawat, Shri Ashok Kumar  
 Reddy, Shri Gutha Sukhender  
 Reddy, Shri K.J.S.P  
 Reddy, Shri K.R.G.  
 Reddy, Shri S.P.Y.  
 Ruala, Shri C.L.  
 Sachan, Shri Rakesh  
 Sahay, Shri Subodh Kant  
 Sanjoy, Shri Takam  
 Sardinha, Shri Francisco Cosme  
 Saroj, Shri Tufani  
 Saroj, Shrimati Sushila  
 Sayeed, Shri Hamdullah  
 Selja, Kumari  
 Shah, Shrimati Mala Rajya Laxmi  
 Shanavas, Shri M.I.  
 Shariq, Shri S.D.  
 Shekhar, Shri Neeraj  
 Shekhawat, Shri Gopal Singh  
 Shetkar, Shri Suresh Kumar  
 Shinde, Shri Sushilkumar  
 Shivaji, Shri Adhalrao Patil  
 Sibal, Shri Kapil

\*Voted through slip.

\*Voted through slip.

Siddeshwara, Shri G.M.  
 Singh, Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad  
 Singh, Rajkumari Ratna  
 Singh, Shri Ajit  
 Singh, Shri Ganesh  
 Singh, Shri Ijyaraj  
 Singh, Shri Jagdanand  
 Singh, Shri Jitendra  
 Singh, Shri R.P.N.  
 Singh, Shri Radhe Mohan  
 Singh, Shri Ratan  
 Singh, Shri Rewati Raman  
 Singh, Shri Sukhdev  
 Singh, Shri Sushil Kumar  
 Singh, Shri Uday Pratap  
 Singh, Shri Vijay Bahadur  
 Singh, Shrimati Pratibha  
 Singla, Shri Vijay Inder  
 Solanki, Dr. Kirit Premjibhai  
 Solanki, Shri Makansingh  
 Suklabaidya, Shri Lalit Mohan  
 Sule, Shrimati Supriya  
 Suresh, Shri D.K.  
 \*Suresh, Shri Kodikkunnil  
 Sushant, Dr. Rajan  
 Swaraj, Shrimati Sushma  
 Tamta, Shri Pradeep  
 Tandon, Shrimati Annu  
 Tanwar, Shri Ashok  
 Taviad, Dr. Prabha Kishor  
 Taware, Shri Suresh Kashinath  
 Tewari, Shri Manish  
 Thakor, Shri Jagdish  
 Tharoor, Dr. Shashi  
 Thirumaavalavan, Shri Thol  
 Thomas, Prof. K.V.  
 Tirath, Shrimati Krishna

Toppo, Shri Joseph  
 Udasi, Shri Shivkumar  
 Vardhan, Shri Harsh  
 Venugopal, Shri K.C.  
 Verma, Shri Sajjan  
 Verma, Shrimati Usha  
 Vishwanath Katti, Shri Ramesh  
 Viswanathan, Shri P.  
 Vyas, Dr. Girija  
 Wakchaure, Shri Bhausheeb Rajaram  
 Yadav, Shrimati Dimple  
 Yadav, Shri Dinesh Chandra  
 Yadav, Shri Hukmadeo Narayan  
 Yadav, Shri Anjankumar M.  
 Yaskhi, Shri Madhu Goud

MR. CHAIRMAN : Subject to correction\*, the result of the Division is:

Ayes: 40

Noes: 198

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendment No. 7 for adding a New Clause No. 23A moved by Shri P. Chidambaram, to the vote of the House.

The question is:

Page 12, after line 44, insert—

'Certain restrictions on foreign companies or individual or association of persons.	23A. The aggregate holding of equity shares by a foreign company either by itself or through its subsidiary companies or its nominees or by an individual or by an association of persons whether registered or not under any law of a
---	--

\*The following Members also recorded/corrected their votes through slips.

Ayes 40+ Shrimati Putul Kumari and Dr. P. Venugopal = 42  
 Noes 198 + Shrimati J. helen Davidson, S/Shri Ramsinh Rathwa, Shailendra Kumar and Kodikkunnil Suresh = 202

\*Voted through slip.

country outside India taken in aggregate in the pension fund shall not exceed twenty-six per cent of the paid-up capital of such fund or such percentage as may be approved for an Indian insurance company under the provisions of the Insurance Act, 1938, whichever is higher. 4 of 1938

Explanation. – For the purposes of this section, the expression “foreign company” shall have the meaning assigned to it in clause (23A) of section 2 of the Income-tax Act, 1961.’. (7) 43 of 1961

*The motion was adopted.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:

“That New Clause 23A be added to the Bill.”

*The motion was adopted.*

*New clause 23A was added to the Bill.*

*Clause 24 to 43 were added to the Bill.*

#### **Clause 44 Establishment of Pension Advisory Committee**

*Amendment made:*

Page 18, for lines 40 and 41, substitute—

“(4) The objects of the Pension Advisory Committee shall be to advise the Authority on matters relating to the making of the regulations under section 51.

(5) Without prejudice to the provisions of sub-section (4), the Pension Advisory Committee may advise the Authority on such matters as may be referred to it by the Authority and also on such matters as the Committee may deem fit.”. (8)

(Shri P. Chidambaram)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Basu Deb Acharia, are you moving your Amendment No. 13 to Clause 44?

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Yes, Sir, I am moving my Amendment.

I beg to move:

Page 18, line 35,—

*after “associations,”*

*insert “unions,”. (13)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendment No. 13 to Clause 44 moved by Shri Basu Deb Acharia, to the vote of the House.

*The amendment was put and negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:

“That clause 44, as amended, stand part of the Bill.”

*The motion was adopted.*

*Clause 44, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

*Clauses 45 to 50 were added to the Bill.*

#### **Clause 51 Power to make regulations**

*Amendment made:*

Page 20, after line 39, insert—

“(fa) the conditions of its purpose, frequency and limits for withdrawals from individual pension account referred to in clause (b) of sub-section (2) of section 20;

(fb) the conditions subject to which the subscriber shall exit from the National Pension System referred to in clause (h) of sub-section (2) of section 20;

(fc) the conditions subject to which the subscriber shall purchase an annuity referred to in clause (i) of sub-section (2) of section 20;”. (9)

(Shri P. Chidambaram)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:

“That clause 51, as amended, stand part of the Bill.”

*The motion was adopted.*

*Clause 51, as amended, was added to the Bill*

*Clauses 52 to 55 were added to the Bill.*

#### **Clause 1 Short title, extent and commencement**

*Amendment made:*

Page 1, line 6, for "2011", substitute "2013". (2)  
(Shri P. Chidambaram)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:  
"That clause 1, as amended, stand part of the Bill."  
*The motion was adopted.*

*Clause 1, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

### Enacting Formula

Amendment made:

Page 1, line 1, for "Sixty-second", substitute "Sixty-fourth". (1)  
(Shri P. Chidambaram)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is:  
"That the Enacting Formula, as amended, stand part of the Bill."  
*The motion was adopted.*

*The Enacting Formula, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

*The Long Title was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Minister to move that the Bill, as amended, be passed.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM : Sir, I beg to move:  
"That the Bill, as amended, be passed."

MR. CHAIRMAN: Motion moved:  
"That the Bill, as amended, be passed."

PROF. SAUGATA ROY : Sir, I want to speak. In the third reading, one speaks only against the principle of the Bill. Our Party is not satisfied with the Bill as it has come, because it jeopardizes the social security of the salaried class. Instead of protecting or giving social security to the unorganized sector, what it is doing is that it is partly taking away the security enjoyed by the Central and State Government employees under the guise of investing monies of the pension fund into the stock market. This is basically a ploy to boost up the stock market and we are, in principle, opposed to it.

We are also opposed to the introduction of FDI in

the pension sector. We do not think that any particular skill is required for fund management of pension so that we need foreign direct investment to the extent of 26 per cent in the pension sector or even in the insurance sector. We have always opposed entry of foreign direct investment in the financial sector of the country because it creates instability in the financial sector and jeopardizes the security of the basic middle classes. Those who are rich can play the stock market. Those who are middle class like us, cannot play this stock market. After retirement we want a steady income.

Lastly, I should mention one short point which is not directly related to this. Many people have petitioned. There is a pension linked to the Employees Provident Fund. This is in a terrible condition as the workers are sometimes getting less than Rs.500 as pension from the EPF linked pension fund also. I feel that in the EPF linked pension fund, the minimum pension should be Rs.1000. That is why, on this principle, we shall vote against the Bill when the Motion to moved that that the Bill be passed is pressed. We shall move for Division on that point.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : We want Division.

PROF. SAUGATA ROY : We want Division.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Lobbies are already cleared.

The question is:

"That the Bill, as amended, be passed."

The Lok Sabha divided:

**DIVISION No.4** **AYES** 17. 54 hrs.

Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash

\*Angadi, Shri Suresh

\*Antony, Shri Anto

Awale, Shri Jaywant Gangaram

\*Baal, Shri T.R.

Baghel, Shrimati Sarika Devendra Singh

Bairwa, Shri Khiladi Lal

Bais, Shri Ramesh

Baite, Shri Thangso

\*Voted through slip.

Baitha, Shri Kameshwar  
 Baliram, Dr.  
 Bansal, Shri Pawan Kumar  
 \*Basavaraj, Shri G. S.  
 Basheer, Shri Mohammed E.T.  
 Bhagat, Shri Sudarshan  
 Bhoi, Shri Sanjay  
 Biswal, Shri Hemanand  
 Chacko, Shri P.C.  
 Chakravarty, Shrimati Bijoya  
 Chaudhary, Dr. Tushar  
 Chaudhary, Shri Haribhai  
 Chauhan, Shri Mahendrasinh P.  
 \*Chidambaram, Shri P.  
 Chitthan, Shri N.S.V.  
 Choudhary, Shri Harish  
 Choudhry, Shrimati Shruti  
 Choudhury, Shri Abu Hasem Khan  
 Chowdhary, Shrimati Santosh  
 \*Dasmunsi, Shrimati Deepa  
 Deka, Shri Ramen  
 Deo, Shri V. Kishore Chandra  
 Devi, Shrimati Ashwamedh  
 Devi, Shrimati Rama  
 Dhanapalan, Shri K. P.  
 Dhruvanarayana, Shri R.  
 Dhurve, Shrimati Jyoti  
 \*Dias, Shri Charles  
 Dikshit, Shri Sandeep  
 Dubey, Shri Nishikant  
 Elangovan, Shri T.K.S.  
 Engti, Shri Biren Singh  
 \*Ering, Shri Ninong  
 Gaikwad, Shri Eknath Mahadeo  
 Gandhi, Shri Rahul  
 Geete, Shri Anant Gangaram  
 Ghatowar, Shri Paban Singh

Gogoi, Shri Dip  
 Gouda, Shri Shivarama  
 \*Handique, Shri B.K.  
 Haque, Shri Mohd. Asrarul  
 Hegde, Shri K. Jayaprakash  
 Hooda, Shri Deepender Singh  
 Hossain, Shri Abdul Mannan  
 Hussain, Shri Ismail  
 Hussain, Shri Syed Shahnawaz  
 Jain, Shri Pradeep  
 Jakhar, Shri Badri Ram  
 Jardosh, Shrimati Darshana  
 \*Jhansi Lakshmi, Shrimati Botcha  
 Jindal, Shri Naveen  
 \*Joshi, Shri Mahesh  
 Joshi, Shri Pralhad  
 \*Kachhadia, Shri Naranbhai  
 Kamal Nath, Shri  
 Kashyap, Shri Virender  
 \*Kataria, Shri Lalchand  
 Khandela, Shri Mahadeo Singh  
 Kharge, Shri Mallikarjun  
 Khatgaonkar, Shri Bhaskarrao Bapurao Patil  
 Killi, Dr. Kruparani  
 Kowase, Shri Marotrao Sainuji  
 Krishnasswamy, Shri M.  
 Kumar, Shri Ramesh  
 \*Kumar, Shri Shailendra  
 Kumari, Shrimati Chandresh  
 \*Kumari, Shrimati Putul  
 \*\*Kurup, Shri N. Peethambara  
 Lakshmi, Shrimati Panabaka  
 Lalu Prasad, Shri  
 Maharaj, Shri Satpal  
 Mahato, Shri Baidyanath Prasad  
 Mahtab, Shri Bhartruhari

---

\*Voted through slip.

---

\* Voted through slip.

\*\* Corrected through slip for Ayes.

\*Mcleod, Shrimati Ingrid  
 \*\*Meena, Shri Namu Narain  
 \*Meghwal, Shri Arjun Ram  
 Meghwal, Shri Bharat Ram  
 Meinya, Dr. Thokchom  
 Mirdha, Dr. Jyoti  
 Mishra, Shri Govind Prasad  
 Mohan, Shri P.C.  
 Moily, Shri M. Veerappa  
 Mukherjee, Shri Abhijit  
 Muniyappa, Shri K.H.  
 Nagpal, Shri Devendra  
 Naik, Shri P. Balram  
 Naik, Shri Shripad Yesso  
 Narah, Shrimati Ranee  
 Narayanasamy, Shri V.  
 Natrajan, Kumari Meenakshi  
 Nirupam, Shri Sanjay  
 \*Ola, Shri Sis Ram  
 Pal, Shri Rajaram  
 Pandey, Dr. Vinay Kumar  
 Patel, Shri Dinsha  
 Patel, Shri Kishanbhai V.  
 Patel, Shri R.K. Singh  
 Patel, Shrimati Jayshreeben  
 Pathak, Shri Harin  
 Patil, Shri C.R.  
 Patil, Shri Pratik  
 Pilot, Shri Sachin  
 Pradhan, Shri Amarnath  
 Punia, Shri P.L.  
 Purandeswari, Shrimati D.  
 Purkayastha, Shri Kabindra  
 Raghavan, Shri M.K.  
 Rai, Shri Prem Das  
 \*Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally

\*\*Ramasubbu, Shri S.S.  
 \*Rao, Dr. K.S.  
 Rao, Shri Nama Nageswara  
 Rathod, Shri Ramesh  
 Rathwa, Shri Ramsinh  
 Rawat, Shri Ashok Kumar  
 Reddy, Shri Gutha Sukhender  
 Reddy, Shri K.J.S.P  
 Reddy, Shri K.R.G.  
 Reddy, Shri S.P.Y.  
 Ruala, Shri C.L.  
 \*\*Sachan, Shri Rakesh  
 Sahay, Shri Subodh Kant  
 Sanjoy, Shri Takam  
 Sardinha, Shri Francisco Cosme  
 Saroj, Shri Tufani  
 Saroj, Shrimati Sushila  
 Sayeed, Shri Hamdullah  
 Selja, Kumari  
 Shah, Shrimati Mala Rajya Laxmi  
 \*Shanavas, Shri M.I.  
 \*Shariq, Shri S.D.  
 Shekhar, Shri Neeraj  
 Shekhawat, Shri Gopal Singh  
 Shetkar, Shri Suresh Kumar  
 \*Shinde, Shri Sushilkumar  
 Shivaji, Shri Adhalrao Patil  
 Sibal, Shri Kapil  
 Siddeshwara, Shri G.M.  
 Singh, Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad  
 Singh, Rajkumari Ratna  
 Singh, Shri Ajit  
 Singh, Shri Ganesh  
 Singh, Shri Ijyaraj  
 Singh, Shri Jagdanand  
 Singh, Shri Jitendra  
 Singh, Shri R.P.N.

\* Voted through slip.

\*\* Corrected through slip for Ayes.

\* Voted through slip.

\*\* Corrected through slip for Ayes.

Singh, Shri Ratan  
 Singh, Shri Rewati Raman  
 \*Singh, Shri Sukhdev  
 Singh, Shri Sushil Kumar  
 Singh, Shri Uday Pratap  
 Singh, Shrimati Pratibha  
 Singla, Shri Vijay Inder  
 Solanki, Dr. Kirit Premjibhai  
 Solanki, Shri Makansingh  
 Suklabaidya, Shri Lalit Mohan  
 Sule, Shrimati Supriya  
 Suresh, Shri D.K.  
 Suresh, Shri Kodikkunnil  
 Sushant, Dr. Rajan  
 Swaraj, Shrimati Sushma  
 Tamta, Shri Pradeep  
 Tandon, Shrimati Annu  
 Tanwar, Shri Ashok  
 Taviad, Dr. Prabha Kishor  
 Taware, Shri Suresh Kashinath  
 Tewari, Shri Manish  
 Thakor, Shri Jagdish  
 Tharoor, Dr. Shashi  
 Thirumaavalavan, Shri Thol  
 Thomas, Prof. K.V.  
 Tirath, Shrimati Krishna  
 Tiwari, Shri Bhisma Shankar alias Kushal  
 Toppo, Shri Joseph  
 Udasi, Shri Shivkumar  
 Vardhan, Shri Harsh  
 Venugopal, Shri K.C.  
 Verma, Shri Sajjan  
 Verma, Shrimati Usha  
 Vishwanath Katti, Shri Ramesh  
 Viswanathan, Shri P.  
 Vyas, Dr. Girija  
 \*Wakchaure, Shri Bhausahab Rajaram

Yadav, Shrimati Dimple  
 Yadav, Shri Dinesh Chandra  
 Yadav, Shri Hukmadeo Narayan  
 Yadav, Shri Anjankumar M.  
 Yadav, Shri Mulayam Singh  
 Yaskhi, Shri Madhu Goud  
**NOES**  
 \*Acharia, Shri Basu Deb  
 \*Anandan, Shri M.  
 \*Bandyopadhyay, Shri Sudip  
 Banerjee, Shri Kalyan  
 Banerjee, Shri Prasun  
 Barq, Dr. Shafiqur Rahman  
 \*Baske, Shri Pulin Bihari  
 \*Bauri, Shrimati Susmita  
 \*Biju, Shri P.K.  
 Chaudhary, Shri Arvind Kumar  
 Das, Shri Khagen  
 Dasgupta, Shri Gurudas  
 Dome, Dr. Ram Chandra  
 Dudhgaonkar, Shri Ganeshrao Nagorao  
 Haldar, Dr. Sucharu Ranjan  
 Haque, Sk. Saidul  
 \*\*Karunakaran, Shri P.  
 Karwaria, Shri Kapil Muni  
 \*\*Kumar, Shri P.  
 \*\*Lingam, Shri P.  
 \*Mahato, Shri Narahari  
 \*Malik, Shri Sakti Mohan  
 Manian, Shri O.S.  
 Mitra, Shri Somen  
 Naskar, Shri Gobinda Chandra  
 Natarajan, Shri P.R.  
 Panda, Shri Prabodh  
 Paul, Shri Tapas

---

\*Voted through slip.

---

\* Voted through slip.

\*\* Corrected through slip for Ayes.



Rajesh, Shri M.B.  
Rana, Shri Jagdish Singh  
Roy, Prof. Saugata  
\*Roy, Shri Mahendra Kumar  
Roy, Shrimati Shatabdi  
Saha, Dr. Anup Kumar  
Sampath, Shri A.  
Satpathy, Shri Tathagata  
Semmalai, Shri S.  
Shetti, Shri Raju  
Singh, Shri Radhe Mohan  
\*\*Sivasami, Shri C.  
\*\*Sugumar, Shri K.  
\*Thambidurai, Dr. M.  
Trivedi, Shri Dinesh  
Venugopal, Dr. P.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Subject to correction<sup>\*\*\*</sup>, the  
result of the Division is:  
Ayes: 174  
Noes: 33

*The motion was adopted.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now the Lobbies may be opened.

---

\*Voted through slip.

\*\*Corrected through slip for Ayes.

\*The following Members also recorded/corrected their votes  
through slips.

**Ayes 174** + S/Shri Suresh Angadi, Anto Antony, T. R. Baalu,  
G. S. Basavaraj, P. Chidambaram, Shrimati Deepa Dasmuni,  
S/Shri Charles Dias, Ninong Ering, Shri B. K. Handique, Shrimati  
Botcha Jhansi Lakshmi, S/Shri Mahesh Joshi, Naranbhai  
Kachhadia, Lalchand Kataria, Shailendra Kumar, Shrimati Putul  
Kumari, S/Shri N. Peethambara Kurup, Shrimati Ingrid Mcleod,  
S/Shri Namo Narain Meena, Arjun Ram Meghwal, Sis Ram  
Ola, Mullapally Ramachandran, S. S. Ramasubbu, Dr. K. S.  
Rao, S/Shri Rakesh Sachan, M. I. Shanavas, S. D. Shariq,  
Sushilkumar Shinde, Sukhdev Singh and Bhausahab Rajaram  
Wakchaure – S/Shri P. Karunakaran, P. Kumar, P. Lingam, C.  
Sivasami, and K. Sugumar = **198**

**Noes 33** + S/Shri Basu Deb Acharia, M. Anandan, S.  
Bandyopadhyay, Pulin Bihari Baske, P. K. Biju, Shrimati Susmita  
Bauri, S/Shri P. Karunakaran, P. Kumar, P. Lingam, Narhari  
Mahato, Sakti Mohan Malik, Mahendra Kumar Roy, C. Sivasami,  
K. Sugumar and Dr. M. Thambidurai – S/Shri N. Peethambara  
Kurup, Namo Narain Meena, S. S. Ramasubbu and Rakesh  
Sachan = **44**

17.55 hrs.

DISCUSSION UNDER RULE 193

**Government of India's response and measures taken  
for relief and reconstruction in the wake of  
natural disaster in Uttarakhand**

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN : Now, we take up Discussion  
under Rule 193.

Shrimati Sushma Swaraj.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Order please.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: We are going to have a very  
important discussion. Please have silence in the House.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Order please.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ (Vidisha) : Mr.  
Chairman, with heavy grief I have risen to speak about  
the tragedy of Uttarakhand. We had thought that we  
should have raised this discussion on 5th August itself  
when the Monsoon Session started, because this is the  
biggest natural calamity occurred in the country between  
these two sessions. Therefore, it was the demand of the  
sensitivity that it should have been discussed in the  
beginning of the session but for some reason or other  
this discussion kept on getting deferred and today after  
one month of the Monsoon Session, because Monsoon  
Session started on 5th August and today is 4th September  
and the discussion has started that too at 6pm. At least, I  
am satisfied that this discussion is starting before the end  
of this session. If the session would have ended without  
discussion, then I would have also felt regret and those  
victims would have also felt that no one discussed their  
grief.

Mr. chairman, calamities had occurred in this country  
earlier also. If only I mention some of the previous years

then I can count the big calamities from the State you come from i.e. tornado in Odish, earthquake in Gujarat and tsunami in South. These were such calamities which ruined people within seconds. House and employment were also snatched away. But the calamity of Uttarakhand is different in two ways from these calamities. One is that the geographical impact of Odisha, Gujarat and tsunami of South was limited. Tornado and earthquake were limited to one State each. Tsunami was affecting three-four States of South. But the impact of Uttarakhand calamity extended to the entire country. people of almost all the States of the country were affected by it. This is the first difference. The second big difference is that in this calamities we saw extremes of extreme. If on the side, the extremes of natural calamities were seen then on the other hand, the extremes of helplessness of people were also seen. If we saw the height of valour of army and para-military forces on one side, on then the other side, we saw the height of patience of the Air Force Pilots. If, on one hand, we saw the extreme of inaction of State Government, then on the other hand, we saw the extreme of insensitiveness of the looters. Because of these extremes, this tragedy has come in the category of first of its kind.

#### 18.00 hrs

After some days when this session started, the hon'ble Minister of Defence placed this statement in the house with regard to relief and rehabilitation. I want to say, today the hon'ble Minister of Home Affairs is sitting here. He was ill and then could not come. Hon'ble Home Minister, I do not know if you have read that statement or not. That statement is a bundle of falsehood. ...*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MR. CHAIRMAN : It is 6 o'clock now. If the House agrees, we may take up the RTI Bill after the discussion under 193. Now, it is extended till the discussion is over.

...*(Interruptions)*

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No. We should take it up tomorrow.... *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats.

...*(Interruptions)*

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI (KARUR): You have to take the sense of the House. ...*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Mr. Chairman, let us finish this discussion first....*(Interruptions)* Do not scuttle it. We will see afterwards. We will go ahead according to the mood of the House....*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MR. CHAIRMAN: After the discussion is over, next item will be taken up.

...*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Mr. Chairman, I was telling the Minister of Home Affairs that I do not know if he saw that statement or not. That statement was a bundle of falsehood. It was based on baseless facts. The Minister of Defence said in that statement:

*[English]*

"Highly commendable work was done by the State Government and the Central Ministries and agencies in this long hour of crisis."

*[Translation]*

So far as the central agencies are concerned, I, standing here thank the Jawans of Army, Air force, Para Military forces, ITBP and NDRN who have shown the indomitable courage and saved the lives of thousands people by risking their lives. Standing in this House, today, I salute them on behalf of the entire nation and express gratitude on my behalf and on behalf of the House to them. I pay my tributes to their memory. But so far as the State Government is concerned, Mr. Home Minister, I would like to state that the State Government has proved totally unable and incapable. Minister of Defence says:

*[English]*

"The State Government immediately initiated necessary steps for rescue and relief as the first responder."

[Translation]

The fact is that this calamity took place on 16th morning and till the night of 18th, neither the State Government nor the Central Government, nor media and nor the country knew about the seriousness of it. In the night of 18th, the Leader of Opposition of Uttarakhand, Shri Ajay Bhatt called me. He said to me that Didi, the Kedar Valley is completely washed away. All hotels, all dharamshalas, all shops have been washed away. He said that 5000 mules and their handlers, all have been washed away but no relief work has started so far. I said you cut the phone and I will talk to the Minister of Home Affairs right away. Shindeji is sitting here. I disconnected his phone and rang up Shindeji and said that the Leader of Opposition of Uttarakhand had called me and told me this. On this, Shindeji said that he was in contact with the Chief Ministers of both Uttarakhand and Himachal Pradesh. There is nothing so serious. 10-12 people have died. I have today summoned 12 helicopters of Army and I will summon 12 tomorrow. Shindeji, whatever you had said, I have told the same verbatim here. I said it is not so, you have not been given full information. The issue is much bigger than this, so only 12 helicopters will not do. It requires hundreds of helicopters. You call the Army. Only the helicopters of Army be called. He said he will do something. I tweeted at that very time SOS from Uttarakhand and wrote every thing in it that thousands of people have died and that just then I had a talk with the Home Minister. He has assured me to do all the things in this respect. I was to leave for London the next day and Air India flight of 2 o'clock was already booked. First of all, I cancelled my flight and the visit. I made a call to Ajay Bhatt and told him that I had a talk with Shindeji and something will be done from tomorrow. I am to say that the Minister of defence is calling the State Government as the first responder. While the first helicopter that took off on 18th was of the Army. The rescue work, in a systematic way, could only be started on 19th whereas the calamity occurred on 16th at 7AM.

Sir, if the meaning of immediately is more than seven hours, then I have nothing to say. In Hindi immediately means at once. Today, I am talking here with full responsibility that the first helicopter of Army took off on

18th and the rescue work started from 19th. You will be surprised to note that the State Government, whom the Defence Minister was appreciating, after 29 days on 15th June it deployed 4 additional district magistrates to the four calamity affected places. I have the copy of Government's order. On 15th June, Shri Sachin Kurbe from Guptkashi in Kedarnath Region, Shridhar Babu Addanagi, made incharge of Bhatwari, Harshil and Gangotri region, Dr. V. Shamargan from Gochar to Tharali Gwaldam region and Dr. Deepak Rawat was made incharge of Muniyari and Dharchulla region. These four Government orders of 15th June are with me. If you permit or so desire I will lay them on the Table of the House. The district Magistrates will be deployed to four places after 29 days. This is the response of the State Government.

Mr. Chairman, these regions were declared as Disaster affected areas after 40 days. Officers were deployed after 29 days and the areas declared as Disaster affected after 40 days. The dead bodies were not taken out for 30 days. I am unable to describe the extent of mutilation of the dead bodies that were taken out after 30 days. The grief was beyond measure. The plunderers had a field day. They chopped the fingers of the dead bodies and took away the rings. The jewellery were removed from the dead bodies. Hon. Home Minister, Sir, when cremations were done, bodies were left half burnt. When the plunders were active at that place, at that time the Chief Minister of the State was taking Guard of Honour at the Circuit House. The policemen who should have been there on duty to save the people and protect the dead bodies from the plunders, they at that time were paying salute to him. You say that the State Government has done a commendable job. The Defence Minister says that the communication system was restored immediately. I want to say that had the communication system been restored immediately then the relatives would not have been so helpless. The pins of the victims were much more helpless than the victim themselves. If the communication system would have been restored, telling them people could have phoned their family members telling them not to worry and though stuck up, they were alive. But there was no communication. No phone was working. No one could be contacted. Even the wrong information was being passed on to the family members. Many people were told

that their pins were coming by a certain helicopter. They reached the helipad in Dehradun from their houses. They waited seeing helicopters land one after another. They waited for four-five helicopters but when they could not see their relatives, they found that wrong information was given to them.

[English]

The Defence Minister says,

“Essential supplies like food, drinking water, medicines, kerosene oil, blankets, etc., were continuously provided by airdropping as well as land routes.”

[Translation]

Mr. Home Minister, I want to tell you that JCB was there but there but not diesel, Ration was available in Badrinath Temple, they wanted to give food, but there was no gas. Gas was finished, we asked for the supply of Kerosene, but it could not be sent for two days. Which essential supplies are you talking about? People sent truck loads of supplies. But it kept lying on the helipad and could not be supplied to the people. The articles were getting rotten in the godowns of Guptkashi, but it could not be made available to the people. What are you talking about? Which State Government are you talking about? There were no signs of the State Government or administration. You yourself went there and found and said about the lack of coordination, then you appointed a nodal officer from the centre and asked him to coordinate the work. The Army said they have no officer or employee for guidance from the State Government, we do not even know the places where to go? One Helicopter got crashed. On that day, we felt that perhaps no helicopter will take off. People will feel afraid. But, like I have said, I salute them. The helicopter got crashed there and 20 people died, 5 crew members and 20 other people died in it. But without any sign of panic, another helicopter with Captain got ready and engaged in the rescue operation. I, therefore, said, if anyone deserves appreciation then it is the Army and the Air Force. But, there is no need to appreciate the State Government. The State Government has been proved so much weak and useless that I want

to tell here that it is this very reason that I had demanded the dismissal of the State Government.

Mr. Chairman, It is not a mishapening which occurred just like this. It could have been averted. The Meteorological Department had given a prior warning that the rain will set in from 16th June. ISRO had warned about cloud burst and asked to stop the pilgrim age to hills. I am saying today, if you would have alerted the pilgrims and advised them at Rishikesh, Rudhraprayag and Gauri Kund not to proceed further, the lives of more than 20 thousand people could have been saved because more than 20 thousand people were there at Rishikesh, Gaurikund, Rudraprayag and Kedarnath. None of them survived. All those lives could have been saved. But my charge is that there was neither any preparation for this age pilgram nor any sensitivity afterwards and nor any preparedness for the relief and rehabilitation.

I would like to say that the Government which could not provide the figures of deaths till today, you are admiring it and commending it?

Mr. Chairman, the Minister of Disaster Management had said after 10 days that the toll figure will reach upto 5 thousand. Their own Speaker Kunjwal had said that the death toll will reach 10 thousand and in an affidavit to Supreme Court it has been mentioned that 822 people died in it. The Defence Minister in a Statement said 520 people died. See the difference, where is 5 thousand, 822 and it stopped at 520. You could not tell the number of missing persons. You do not know how many persons went missing. Mr. Chairman, it is said in our area that people can have consolation for the dead but not for the missing. When a dead body is cremated, it seems that the person has gone forever. But the wait for the missing persons always remains alive. There is a song of film:-

"Jara si ahat hoti hai to dil sochta hai ki kahin ye wo to nahi."

Even today, thousands of wives are waiting for their husbands. Thousands of mothers are waiting for their sons. Thousands of children are waiting for their parents. Perhaps, one day the door bell will ring and we will open the doorthen we will fond our husband, our mother, our child standing there.

Mr. Chairman Sir, they have not been able to give the figures of missing persons till today. I would like to say that in this age of information can we not provide correct figure? Hon. Minister of Home Affairs, I would like to request you, if you send a circular to all the police stations of the country and ask them the number of people died and missing under their police stations then you will get a correct figure. I called for the figure of my Parliamentary Constituency Vidisha. The received figures 23 people of my Vidisha district have died, 10 people of my district Raisen and 23 people of Nasarullaganj in Budhani have died and some are missing. You will be surprised that seven people of a family of Banygodi village, eight people of a family of Rithvad village, thus upto seven and eight people of one family have died. Therefore it is my suggestion that you should call for at least correct figures of those people. How will you carry out relief and rehabilitation work? You are making announcement by sitting here that you will provide three and a half lakh rupees to each but how when you will have no address? I repeat my suggestion once again that a circular to all the police stations of the country should be sent on behalf of the Centre and you call for the figures of the persons missing and died from those police stations so that you can present correct figure before the people. The figure from 520 upto 10 thousand does not match with each other.

Sir, alongwith it one more question has arisen, development versus destruction. It is the result of spate of tempering with nature, polluting environment, constructing dams on the rivers in the name of development in Uttarakhand. For what are we making development? We carry out development by spending millions and billions of rupees, one day the nature gets annoyed and brings such a horror that it destroys everything. When will our eyes open, whether they will not open even after this tragedy, even after the calamity? A temple of Dhari Devi is situated there and that devi is called the protector of Uttarakhand. A power project is going on above that temple also in which there was a plan to submerge Dari Devi. Uma Bharti, the leader of our party was trying her best to save that Dhari Devi. She had visited each and every house. She had gone to meet hon. Prime Minister with a delegation alongwith me under the leadership of

Advaniji. She had met the Minister of Environment hundreds of times. We were assured by the Hon. Prime Minister, by the Minister of Environment that Dhari Devi will not be removed from there at any cost. The idol of Dhari Devi is separate but Dhari Devi is that rock about which we were requesting to save.

Sir, you know that it is not just a coincidence only. I would like to tell the people of the House that Dhari Devi was submerged on 16th June there and on the same day, the deluge in Kedarnath took place. It was such a deadly deluge which took thousands of lives and created havoc. There is a Shloka in our Shastras - "Apujyam Yatra Pujyante Pujanam tulyatikrama, Trini Tatra Bhavishyanti Durbhiksham Maranah Bhayam" which means where worship is made of impious persons and pious persons are disgraced then three things happen there - famine, death and fear. Their venerable, protector Devi of Uttarakhand, Dhari Devi was disgraced there and these three things happened. People are dying of starvation also, death is dancing and fear is also prevalent there. Therefore, I would like to say that this question of development versus destruction is there. The number of dams that are being built on Ganga ji, you know it. The Chaturvedi committee of Planning Commission has approved 70 dams on Ganga, Bhagirathi and Alaknanda. Today, Rewati Raman Singh ji is not present here. He has allowed the discussion in this House twice. He goes to the Prime Minister taking all of us Members with him.

Sir, Ganga is not an ordinary river for us, Ganga is mother for us. I don't know whether you were present in the Central Hall or not. I was surprisingly happy, I was so happy when hon. Prime Minister of Japan when addressing the Members of Parliament of both Houses jointly had mentioned the name of Ganga as "Ganga Maiya". Those people respect our feelings. They respect our faith. They mention Ganga as "Ganga Maiya" and our people are planning to put Ganga in a tunnel. The stream of Ganga ji should flow constantly, the stream of Ganga should flow as pollution free and we are making efforts for that but these people are planning to take Ganga in a tunnel. The people of Uttarakhand are bound to face such kind of calamities and the whole country becomes its victim. Therefore, I would like to say here that you should

carry out the work to rehabilitate Dhari Devi. I demand from here that all the dams being built on "Ganga Maiya" should be cancelled. The amount of money already spent on them would still be less than the amount to be spent on relief and rehabilitation work. Whatever money has been spent, you don't show us. Don't tell us estimates that such amount has been spent. Valuable lives are being lost. Today, the entire Uttarakhand is standing on the verge of destruction. That is why I would like to say to the Hon. Minister of Home Affairs that all the dams being constructed on "Ganga Maiya" should be cancelled. Dhara Deve should be rehabilitated. If Uttarakhand is to be saved then relief and rehabilitation is a separate thing, but until Dhara Devi is rehabilitated no relief and rehabilitation work will be completed.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, so far as rehabilitation and relief work is concerned, our Party had constituted a Committee in which our brother Syed Shahnawaj Hussain was a Member from here, Bhagat Singh Koshyari ji, Member of Parliament, was a Member from there and Uma Bharti was leading it. They all three had gone there. They had visited each and every place. The report they had given me was very surprising. I am dividing the relief and rehabilitation work in two parts - one, immediate work and the other, long term work. I would like to say to the Hon. Minister of Home Affairs that he would be stunned to know what they have provided and what has reached there. Mr. Chairman, Sir, the State Government has demanded 8000 crore rupees for rehabilitation of the people by displacement of villages and 5000 crore rupees for reconstruction work, thus 13000 crore rupees have been demanded. The Central Government had announced 1000 crore rupees and that 250 crore rupees were outstanding against earlier calamity that had occurred. Those 250 crore rupees have been adjusted therein and zero money has been left for calamity relief work. They have no single paisa with them today for calamity relief work. Similarly, you had released 300 crore rupees for the Border Road Organization. 270 crore rupees were outstanding. After adjustment, only 30 crore rupees have been left. Which roads you will make in 30 crore rupees?

Thirdly, for ponies the Central Government has announced to give 10 thousand rupees and State

Government has announced to give 15 thousand rupees. The price of a pony is not less than 70-80 thousand rupees. What they will do after getting 15 thousand rupees from you? Nobody would be able to purchase a single pony there. Fourth, the tourism has completely finished there and the statement of their Chief Minister has played a very big role in it. Do you know, what the Chief Minister has said? He has said that don't come to Uttarakhand and if someone comes then he/she should come on their own responsibility. They cannot provide them any protection. Such a statement is given by the Chief Minister. You know that even today Mussoorie, Dhanaulti, Auli, Ranikhet, Almor, Kausani, Ramgarh, Haridwar and Nainital are such tourist places in Uttarakhand which have no effect of calamity. Therefore, if tourists are allowed to visit these places then their economy can be revived but the Chief Minister of Uttarakhand, as I said he is lazy, does not want that anybody should come. He is saying that nobody should visit Uttarakhand. The tourism there was completely been finished. I would like to say to the hon. Minister of Home Affairs that even today 1000 vehicles, against which they have taken loan, are lying trapped in Badrinath.

The crisis of livelihood has arisen before them. I request for waiving of their loans also. People have taken loans from banks to open hotels and shops. I also request to waive off those loans. The most difficult thing is to get gas supply. Hotels and shops have closed. The Central Government says that let the State Government send a proposal only then they will give it. I have already said that State Government is very lethargic. It is not sending the proposal. The State Government will not send any proposal and you will not release the supply of gas then how the hotels and shops will open. Do not expect any proposal from the State Government, dismiss the State Government and take charge of Uttarakhand.

Mr. Chairman Sir, nobody has received even one rupee in the name calamity relief. All the names I have mentioned here have been given Rupees two lakhs on behalf of the Madhya Pradesh Government. They are ten people of Raisen district, 23 people of Vidisha, 23 people of Nasullaganj. You have said that you will provide three and half lakhs to each. The Uttarakhand Government said

that it will give three and half lakhs. In total they were to receive seven lakh each. Now Uttarakhand has backed out. They have said let the Central Government give and State Governments may give as much they like...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. SEMMALAI (Salem): Madam, Tamil nadu Government has given Rs. 5 crore.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: That you will speak.

[*Translation*]

Whatever the State Governments had to give on their behalf they have given it. We have given two lakh rupees each. If Uttarakhand Government is not willing to give further then the balance also we will give. But you were to give three and half lakh and that also you have not given. I have told you that you do not have figures then how you will give it? First of all, you collect the data and start giving this money. Upto when they will keep waiting? You have not given a single penny in the name of calamity relief.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to say one more thing to the Minister that there is no provision in the NDRF for giving compensation to Dhaba, Khomcha and Tea Stall. If these shops are destroyed then there is no such provision. Hon'ble Home Minister please modify the criteria is. People had opened Dhaba, Khomcha and Tea Stall there. Till the criteria is modified, they will not get a single rupee. Therefore, the criteria should be changed.

The tenth point is that even today 256 villages are cut off from the roads there. Therefore, it has become too difficult to provide food supply, medical help and drinking water there. The connectivity of these 256 villages has come to an end. Connectivity should be provided there at the earliest by repairing the roads so that they can be provided foodgrains and drinking water.

Alongwith this, I was saying about some long term measures. Home Minister, Sir, do not turn the pages and kindly listen to whatever I am saying.

HOME MINISTER (SHRI SUSHIL KUMAR SHINDE): I am hearing you.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: It is more necessary. Close that and hear to me.

I am saying all this so that the calamity does not re-occur. The Long term measures are for non-recurrence of such calamity and even if it re-occurs. Then what should we do? First, GIS mapping should be done of whole Uttarakhand. With the help of GIS mapping you will come to know that the places where Roads, Helipads, Hospitals and Schools exist and make a CD of GIS mapping which should be with each of the officer so that if any eventuality happens again then they will not have to search for those places. Because the officers who came there and deputed there at that time were not from Uttarakhand. Most of them came from South Maharashtra and Gujarat. They were not well-informed about the places there because they were deputed there only three months back. If they will possess CD of GIS mapping they will come to know about the places where school, road and helipads exists. Therefore, please get the GIS mapping done there. Secondly, when the 'Yatra' starts there should be compulsory registration of each yatri. They should be given a micro-chip so that their location is identified. If you have to find him you can know about his location through that chip. Thirdly, you get the 'pucca' helipads constructed in all the villages there, You do not know when and where the calamity occurs? They make it at the time of calamity only. The 'kuchha' helipad made there was the cause of crash of first helicopter there. Twenty people died in that crash. Earlier, also a helicopter was crashed there because of temporary helipad. Therefore, 'Pucca' helipads should be made in all the villages. Fourth, every District Magistrate should have a satellite phone. You have written them satellite phone were given. When you gave those phones to them? You imported those from Singapore and Hongkong after the calamity. That is what I am saying to you that there was no prior preparedness for 'Yatra'. Whether satellite phones should not be there in the 'Yatra' in Uttarakhand? You gave orders for importing those and then those were given. Satellite phones should have been available there. You provide satellite phones there.

Make all weather roads there. China border is barely 25 kms from there. They have all weather roads. This is not such a technique which only China can have and we cannot develop that. After all we faced such a big calamity. The biggest drawback in that was non-connectivity. We were not able to go there but only doing air-dropping.

That too was hampered because of bad weather and helicopters were unable to go there. If China has made all weather roads. You can get that technique from Japan and China. But make all weather roads there by acquiring technique. If there are all weather roads, helipads in all the villages, Satellite phones with all the District Magistrates and GIS mapping and micro chips with the 'Yatris', we can face such a situation anytime when there is such an eventuality with much ease. Therefore, note down all these long term measures which I have mentioned and act accordingly.

Again, I am saying that the Government did not make prior preparations. Neither alerted the 'Yatris' nor shown any sympathy with them. Do you know the State Government had said that it will give thousand rupees to each 'Yatri'? I saw an interview of a lady from Rajasthan. She said that officers are sitting here and they are giving two hundred or five hundred rupees instead of two thousand rupees and taking signatures as having received two thousand rupees from them. I have said this because of inactiveness and height of non-sensitivity of State Government. Rings from the fingers of dead bodies were taken by cutting their fingers, ornaments were taken away from the dead bodies and half burnt dead bodies were lying there. This was the height of inhumaneness and I have with facts and figures and also have given suggestions.

Sir, if you want to make this discussion meaningful then take note of this so that these incidents do not reoccur. I have said that cancel all the dams on the river Ganga and restore the 'Dhari Devi' at its place of. I pray to 'Dhari Devi' tha 'O' mother goddess such tragedy should never occur, not only in Uttarakhand but anywhere in the whole country. With this request, I conclude my speech and you please restore the place of 'Dhari Devi'.

SHRI SATPAL MAHARAJ (Garhwal): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am grateful to you for having given me an opportunity to speak on calamity in Uttarakhand.

Sir, my country is weeping, Garhwal is weeping, Kumaun is weeping, entire Uttarakhand is crying. I would like to place some incidents of old era before you. There is one reference in Puranas that the God told Manu Maharaj that He will submerge the whole earth. The God

adopted the shape of a fish and did good to the 'Rishis' after becoming a fish and the whole earth was sunk into water. Similarly, it is also said about Noha, Yahua said to Noha that I will submerge the whole earth in water, you make a boat and keep one pair each of various species. Same way Hazrat Nuh told by Allah Talla that he would submerge the earth into water. He covers entire earth with water. After all it is the outcome of what? If we look at it scientifically, this is nothing but Global Warming. The heat generated on earth is melting the snow, melting the glaciers. Even flood is caused at Gomukh, the originating place of our river Ganga. It is the impact of global warming.

Sir, I would like to quote an article published in 'Dainik Jagran' dated 2nd August, 2004. Laxmi Prasad Pant from Dehradun writes in that article that Chaurabari glacier can create havoc like bomb on Kedarnath dham at any time. Landslide is constantly taking place from six kilometer long glacier located exactly behind the temple. And rise in temperature has created unprecedented lakes around Chaurabari. Though these snow lakes are located on the back of this glacier. Therefore, if volume of water increases, these lakes may burst and will create devastation in Kedarnath Dham from Yamunotri and Badrinath side. If we look into the report of leading snow experts, who are back from a survey of Chaurabari Glacier, we find that the picture is not rosy. Our experts have expressed similar apprehension way back in the year 2004. They said that when it rains over the glacier, the snow melts because of high temperature of rain water falling on glaciers and it causes unprecedented floods. Just, the leader of opposition made a mention of Dhari Devi. Dhari Devi is not a stone, it is an idol which has flown into water from Kalimath. Bhagwati told someone in a dream that take me out from here. The idol was taken out from there and it was placed over a stone. The Dhari Devi has no roof over here and it remains under open sky. She has reached here with the flow of water. It is said that when Dhari Devi was removed from there, a flood occurred. The calamity struck Kedarnath at 6 o' clock on 16th. Glaciers in Chaurabari burst as there was heavy downpour. Because of large volume of rain water falling on glaciers, these started melting and volume of water in the river increased to four times which created mild flood



at six o'clock in the morning on 16th. Goddess Dhari Devi was shifted from there at 6.30 p.m. on the 16th. Second thing is that other glacier, alongwith a large glacier at Chaurabani burst and it wreaked havoc on 17th. The floods took such a devastating shape that the roads, National Highways were swept away and there was hue and cry all over Uttarakhand. Five districts in Uttarakhand were very badly affected. Kedarnath, Rambara, Gaurikund, Sonprayag, Kalimath, Jal Chaumasi, Baxier Bangar, Rasi, Gonder in Rudraprag district, Govind Ghat, Pandukeshwar, Tharali, Ghat, Narayanbagad, Urgam, Lohajung in district Chamoli, Uttarkashi, Gangori, Bhatwari, Harsil in district Uttarkashi and Dharchula, Jaulibi, Madkot, Baluakot, Tawaghat in district Pithoragarh and Kupcoat in district Bageshwar were severely affected by the calamity.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, I want to say that the villages in Uttarakhand have been very badly affected. Water kept flowing from Upper reaches and people had to desert their homes. Rambara has been totally swept away. Rambara has vanished from the map itself. Villages have caved in. 1700 villages in Uttarakhand have been badly affected and 4000 other villages have been severely affected in the calamity. 4481 people of other states are missing, 800 people are alone from Uttarakhand. 1898 houses have been totally destroyed, 430 houses in Rudraprayag district and 355 houses in Chamoli. When we met the hon. Prime Minister and Shrimati Sonia ji and narrated the condition of Uttarakhand, tears rolled down their eyes.

Sonia ji has attachment for Chamoli. Whenever earthquake or calamity struck Chamoli, every time Sonia ji visited there. The Prime Minister said that all the help will be provided and the Government would give very possible help for reconstruction, rehabilitation.

Sir, I want the BRO to take up construction of roads including realignment of damaged roads. Through realignment level of roads will be raised. PWD in Uttarakhand should take up small state roads and by lanes.

Two thousand mules trapped in Govindghat in Chamoli were rescued. See the irony when mules got nothing to eat, they started eating mud. Not only this, they sometimes ran after men to eat them. Mules were

rescued with great difficulty. Cloud burst in Urgam, Govindghat, Bhyndar, Pulna, Jeti, Noli-Hindoli-Barituli, Jasyara, Nosari, Badsuli, Pindar and Lohani ghat caused severe disaster. 90 motor and pedestrian bridges, including 20 important ones in Rudraprayag, Chamoli, Uttarkashi, Pithoragarh were swept away. Bridges at Chouthani, Nalai, Mulund, Malgaon, Bagwan, Bhuragar, Harmal, Skuligad, Chopriyan, Kalimath, Chandrapuri, Silli, Malyasu and Dharchula were very important.

I want to say that 1956 roads have been closed in the state, 968 drinking water projects and 135 bridges have been damaged badly. At several places power supply has been disrupted and communication network has come to a halt. I would thank the Hon. Prime Minister who has immediately granted financial aid of Rs. 1000 crore and the Minister of Tourism gave an aid of Rs. 100 crore. Various other Ministers also gave a financial assistance of Rs. 840 Crore. The Ministry of Railways helped passengers trapped at various places in reaching them their destination without charging any fare. The Ministry of Renewable Energy distributed 20 thousand solar lights. The Ministry further wants to distribute 20 thousand more solar lights. Dr. Girija Vyas has resolved that the houses damaged in the said calamity will be repaired/reconstructed under the Swarn Jayanti Shahri Rojgar Yojana and Rajiv Gandhi Awas Yojana. Shrimati Krishna Tirath has resolved to reconstruct damaged Aanganwadi buildings. The Indian Air Force deployed its fleet of C - 130 J and 45 Choppers to ferry trapped people. The army, ITBP, SSB, Nehru Mountaineering Institute and the local people also rendered great help in rescuing people trapped in remote areas.

The Parliamentarians have sent us assistance from their salary and MPLADS. I would like to thank all of them. The people of the country, organisations, Corporate, Saints, Government Employees have also given their invaluable contributions.

The committee constituted under the Chairmanship of the Hon. Prime Minister has approved a package of Rs. 6600 crores. I would like to say with all this assistance, I salute the efforts done by our Army, Airforce, ITBP, SSB, who saved the lives of the people. We will also reciprocate their efforts with our blessings. We have

nothing else with us except our blessings. We will enrich your lives with our blessings.

I would like to thank all those who helped us a lot. I would like to tell that the 45 helicopters of Airforce saved 23,775 people. They undertook about 3,470 sorties. Eight thousand jawans, 150 forces and 12 helicopters saved 38750 persons. In this rescue operation nine personnel of National Calamity Action Force six personnel of ITBP and five persons of Airforce, died in an helicopter accident. I on my behalf and on behalf of the House pay homage to them.

More than 100 Satellite phones have been made available to establish Immediate Link System in Kedarnath, Badrinath, Parkot, and Harsil. The Government of India have contributed by sending 80 doctors, 11 psychiatrists and 5 public health teams including necessary equipments. A total amount of Rs. 28 crore, 99 lakh and 17 thousand has been given to the District Officers from STRFICM Relief Fund and TR-24 for various Districts. An amount of Rs. 18 crore, 80 lakh and 22 thousand has been spent. A total 1998 buildings have damaged in various districts of the State. It includes 430 buildings in Rudraprayag district and 355 buildings in Chamoli district. Around 375 families of the State are staying in Charity Homes (Dharmshalas) and 780 families are living at a rent of Rs. 2000 per month. The number of affected villages is about one thousand. We have yet to provide foodgrains in 344 villages. The foodgrains are being made available through helicopters, on foot and with the help of mules.

I would like to say that at present a problem has emerged. The people who are missing presumed to be dead. In army when a body is not traceable, it is presumed dead. It is a technical word. They should resumed as dead and financial assistance may be provided to the bereaved family so that their children could be given job on compassionate grounds. They should be able to get pension funds and salary. For this purpose, this technicality of presumed dead is essential.

I had requested the Prime Minister also, and he had said that on lines of Tsunami, because during Tsunami also the dead bodies were not found, he will definitely look into it and the people who are missing will be

presumed dead. B.R.O. and the PWD should be engaged in the construction of roads and bridges and the people who are involved in the work and are working day and night, should be given some encouragement amount by the Government so that their morale would remain boosted. It should be our resolution that those who have served in Uttarakhand, their back must be patted. The employees, who have faced public in many ways, must be given some encouragement amount. The Trolleys should be installed at many places so that pregnant women could be taken from one side of the mountain to the other side. In the same way if we want to make accurate forecasting of calamity, then we shall have to install Dopler Radars in Uttarakhand. I had raised this issue earlier also and radars have been installed in Nainital, but on Garhwal side dopler radars have not been installed. By doing so we shall be able to forecast cloud burst and heavy rain in the area. It is very necessary to install radars in Uttarakhand. The land for rehabilitation of displaced persons should be land marked and Geological survey of India should give report in this regard that the land on which the people are settled is safe and will not slide. An N.O.C. in this regard should be obtained. Many Sadhu-Sants and corporates have come forward and offered to construct houses in Uttarakhand. It is a state where River Ganga Flows. It is Dev Bhoomi, the land of Gods. They want to reconstruct our Dev Bhoomi. In such a situation safe locations should be identified on the basis of the report of Geological Survey of India because if all the people will be resettled in lower areas, then who will defend our border line.

Mr. Chairman, Niti and Mana border area in the mountains adjoins China Border. The people should be settled there so that the safety of the country could be ensured. Therefore, Shankaracharyaji established Char Dham. Badrika Ashram Dham was established, so that the forehead of the country could be protected. Today when we utter the name of Kedarnath and Badrinath, the sentiments of the country are united. With a view to unite the country, he established four Dhams in four corners of the country. In this way our Adi Shankaracharya was a nationalist. Drawing inspiration from them we should see to it that how pre-fabricated houses could be constructed there so that the people of mountains can be re-settled in

mountains itself, because their deities and their land, which we call Dev Bhoomi, is in mountains. Their agriculture is in mountains. That is why they should be re-settled in mountains.

Here we talk about tourism. We have lagged far behind in the matter of tourism. You must have seen an image again and again on Television that the statue of Lord Shivji is flowing in water. People thought that Rishikesh and Haridwar have submerged. This way negative publicity was made. But I would like to say that our Mussorie, Almora, Nainital and Ramnagar are safe. I would invite all the people to come to our Uttarakhand and have Darshan of 'Devbhoomi'. We will have to expand our Dhams. Today we have four Dhams - Yamnotri, Gangotri, Kedarnath and Badrinath. But there are many places which are related to Goddess Bhagwati, we will have to develop them. We will have to develop Chandravadani, Jwalpa and Kartikey Swamy. If we develop them, the tourists will definitely be visited Uttarakhand. There are places in Uttarakhand where Funicular Railway can be developed. In Greece people travel by Funicular Railway. In our Uttarakhand also the Funicular Railway and ropeway should be developed.

I would like to inform the House that a Pooja is going to start in Kedarnath, which is one of our 12 Jyotirlingas on 11th September. It is very big job in itself. As you know when Pandvas came, they had killed their own clan people. They went to Krishna and asked the way for their salvation. Lord Krishna advised them to have glimpses (Darshan) of Shiva. If you have Darshan of Shiv, it will pave way for their salvation. When they reached for Darshan of Shiva, the story goes that Shankar in Kedarnath put his head in earth and it emerged in Nepal. The same Shiva is known in Nepal by the name of Pashupati Nath and the same in India is known as Kedarnath. There is one Shiv, one soul but two countries. It is the power connecting these two countries which is going to be worshipped on the 11th instant. For this purpose I invite the people. I would say that Uttarakhand is reeling under tragedy.

Many hydel projects have been mentioned here where we are constructing dams at many places. Although after Tehri Dam, Dams are not being constructed in

mountains. You are generating power only from the fun of the river. The country needs energy. Safe energy is hydel power.

You must have seen that Fukushima happened in Japan. Nuclear reactor exploded in Chernobyl. It has a devastating effect. Even today, butter and milk which comes from there is checked whether it is contaminated by radio-active traces. You must have seen that Toyota Cars which came from Japan were recalled, because radioactive water of the sea had entered into them. Thus the alternative of nuclear technology is our hydel power project. Mother Ganga is flowing. Mother means one who nourishes everybody. Ganga is generating electricity and contributing in the reconstruction of the country. We should consult our scientists and environmentalists to generate electricity safely. It should not be stopped. Alongwith this we have to promote solar energy in Uttarakhand. We have to promote wind energy. High winds blow in our mountains. By installing wind turbines, we can produce a huge amount of wind energy. It should be our resolution to make Uttarakhand, Oorja Pradesh. I have called it Oorja Pradesh because it has a lot of potential. I would only like to say that hydel Power Projects may not be shut only because a huge calamity occurred. Rather there should be deliberations in this regard. With the cooperation of all of you, it could be decided as to how Uttarakhand can contribute in the development of nation. We will have to take decision keeping all things in mind.

Mr. Chairman, I would only say that -

When a link is connected to the other, it becomes a chain of love. Friend, we are simply human beings even if stones are put together, it becomes a wall.

Let us resolve in this House that we shall reconstruct Uttarakhand and develop our Devbhoomi. The way in which you have cooperated with us by contributing funds from MPLADS, it will help in providing roofs over the heads of those who are spending their lives under the sky, houses will be made for them and they will get employment. It should be our resolution. We all should contribute with the intention that -

Sarve Bhawantu Sukhin, Sarve Santu Niramaya,  
Sarve Bhadrani pashchayanti Ma Kashchid dukh  
Bhagbhaved!

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let us continue this discussion tomorrow.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY) : I would request the hon. Minister to reply tomorrow to this discussion on uttarakhand.

Now the RTI Bill may be taken up. ...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI NAMA NAGESWARA RAO (Khammam): Mr. Chairman, it is a very important issue...(Interruptions). We were in Utrakhand for ten days...(Interruptions)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: We will have discussion over this tomorrow...(Interruptions)

SHRI NAMA NAGESWARA RAO: How it can be...(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Tomorrow it will be continued. [Translation] You see sense of the House. Why are you creating noise. ...(Interruptions)

SHRI NAMA NAGESWARA RAO: What should I do, if not make a noise. What are you talking about ...(Interruptions)

SHR V. NARAYANASAMY: You can have discussion over this tomorrow...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, let the Minister speak first.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: What are you speaking? Let him speak.

(SHRI SATPAL MAHARAJ *in the chair*)

**18.58 hrs.**

[English]

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: It was decided that the issue

of Utrakhand would be taken today and other Bills would be taken up tomorrow...(Interruptions)

Members have left on this assumption. You have not informed clearly at that time. Therefore, you see that discussion on Utrakhand is taken up...(Interruptions) This is the consequences at that time. You can not change it now.

[Translation]

SHRI SHARAD YADAV: Mr. Chairman, Sir you were speaking very good. We also wanted to speak, but in this regard I would like to inform Thambidurai that the Press Gallery above is vacant. If you have to speak in the House, then go ahead. If you would speak tomorrow...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: We will take up Uttarakhand tomorrow. There is no problem, we will continue tomorrow.

...(Interruptions)

**18.59 hrs.**

RIGHT TO INFORMATION (AMENDMENT)  
BILL, 2013

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, we shall take up the Right to information (Amendment) Bill, 2013. Mr. Minister.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): I beg to move:

"That the Bill to amend the Right to Information Act, 2005 be taken into consideration."

The Right to Information Act, 2005 was enacted for setting out a framework for effectuating the right to information for citizens and to secure access to information under the control of public authorities, in order to promote transparency and accountability in the working of every public authority. ...(Interruptions)

The Central Information Commission in one of

its decision dated 03.06.2013 has held that the political parties namely AICC/INC, BJP, CPI (M), CPI, NCP and BSP are public authorities under section 2(h) of the said Act. The Government considers that the CIC has made a liberal interpretation of section 2(h) of the said Act in its decision. The political parties are neither established nor constituted by or under the Constitution or by any other law made by Parliament. Rather, they are registered or recognized under the Representation of the People Act, 1951 and the rules/orders made or issued thereunder.

**18.59½ hrs**

*At this stage, Shri C. Sivasami and Shri M. Anandan came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

...(Interruptions)

**19.00 hrs.**

It has also been observed that there are already provisions in the Representation of the People Act, 1951 as well as in the Income Tax Act, 1961 which deals with the transparency in the financial aspects of political parties and their candidates. ...(Interruptions)

**19.0 ½ hrs**

*At this stage, Sk. Saidul Haque and Shrimati Susmita Bauri came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please go to your seat.

...(Interruptions)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, declaring a political party as public authority under the RTI Act would hamper its smooth internal working, which is not the objective of the said Act and was not envisaged by Parliament under the RTI Act. ...(Interruptions) Further, the political rivals may misuse the provisions of the RTI Act, thereby adversely affecting the functioning of the political parties. ...(Interruptions)

In view of the above, the Government has decided to amend the RTI Act to keep the political parties out of the purview of the RTI Act, with a view to remove the adverse effects of the said decision of the CIC. ... (Interruptions) It is also necessary to give retrospective

effect to the proposed amendment with effect from the date of the said decision of the CIC, that is, 3<sup>rd</sup> June, 2013. ...(Interruptions)

With these words, I commend the Bill for consideration of the House and passing.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Motion moved:

“That the Bill to amend the Right to Information Act, 2005 be taken into consideration.”

MR. CHAIRMAN : This is a very important Bill. We can continue the discussion on Uttarakhand tragedy tomorrow. Please go back to your seats. (Interruptions)

SHRI DINESH TRIVEDI (Brrackpur): Mr. Chairman, Sir, many hon. Members are demanding that we should continue with the discussion on Uttarakhand tragedy. It is a very big tragedy which happened there. The House is supreme and we should continue with that discussion now. ...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Okay. If you are all insisting, we can continue with that discussion now.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Allright, if it is the sense of the House, then we can hold discussion on Uttarakhand.

**19.02 hrs**

*At this stage, Shri C. Sivasami and Shri M. Anandan went back to their seats.*

**19.02 ½ hrs**

*At this stage, Sk. Saidul Haque and Shrimati Susmita Bauri went back to their seats*

**19.03 hrs**

DISCUSSION UNDER RULE 193

**Government of India's response and measures taken for relief and reconstruction in the wake of natural disaster in Uttarakhand....Contd.**

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now we shall take up the discussion under rule 193 regarding the natural disaster in Uttarakhand.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE): Mr. Chairman, Sir, it was decided that we will take up the RTI Amendment Bill and pass it today. If we do not complete it today, we will have to extend the Session.

[Translation]

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ (Vidisha): Get discussion on Uttarakhand completed and take up the reply tomorrow...(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE: We will have to sit late tomorrow.

[Translation]

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ (Vidisha): We will discuss it tomorrow...(Interruptions) Let there be open debate on Uttarakhand. All of us want to speak on it. It is a severe calamity, let it be discussed upon. ...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Shailendra Kumar.

[Translation]

SHRI SHAILENDRA KUMAR (Kaushambi): Hon. Chairman, Sir, I am thankful to you for having allowed me to participate in discussion under Rule 193. I have heard the views of hon. Leader of Opposition, Views of hon. Minister and also your views. But, the discussion on Uttarakhand should have been taken up much earlier. It would have been better, if it was taken up for discussion right in the beginning of the session. But, better late than never. There was heavy down pour in the month of June. It is reported to be around 440 per cent. Apart from cloud burst, earth quake also struck and glaciers got melted. These were the major causes behind the said tragedy. Today we are discussing about relief, rehabilitation and reconstruction work. Just now, the Leader of the Opposition spoke on the manner in which the Government of India has acted.

The statement of the hon. Minister of Defence was not that praise worthy. You have thanked everyone for the relief measures taken. But see the irony, when the

people of Uttarakhand were reeling under such a severe tragedy, advertisements on behalf of the State Government of Uttarakhand were appearing on TV, in newspapers etc. We are aware that each advertisement costs lakhs and crores of rupees. Mps donated from MPLADS fund, general public and other bodies also donated money, therefore, we should ensure that the donations should not be misused. Secondly, Relief Management Committees of the Government proved to be a white elephant. So far as our party Samajwadi Party is concerned, Our leader Mulayam Singh Yadav ji was against bifurcation of State as small states have been facing more problems. Major reason behind this tragedy is that the State has not been able to stand on its feet so far. People were not getting the desired information from emergency control rooms. Entire villages were swept away. People have not been able to reach upto these villages so that some help or relief work can be rendered. Nor relief material has reached there. As per the report of Chief Secretary, The Government of Uttarakhand there has been a loss to the tune of Rs. 13,000 crore. The Central Government has given Rs. One thousand crore. 13,000 crore loss is a huge loss. The Central Government should assess it and render help so that rehabilitation work can be undertaken. So far as the Indian Air Force is concerned, they rendered great help, though aircraft crashed resulting in death of its pilot. Army personnel also rendered great help. Personnel of ITBP, BRO, SSB, medical services and other departments also rendered much needed help. They deserve kudos. The State Government is demanding 13,800 crore. But the Prime Minister has provided only one thousand crore.

Sir, the National Disaster Management Authority has been created. But the required relief aid has not been provided by it. Even the hon. Supreme Court has adversely commented upon it. It has sought an affidavit stating the details of relief measures being undertaken. So far, we are not dead sure about the exact number of casualties, the number of people still missing etc. There is suspense over whether to declare the missing persons as dead or not. We need to ascertain the exact figure of casualties. The month of September has arrived if it was possible, the missing person would have appeared. But

so far we are not sure about the number of persons missing and those died.

But the number of missing persons and those died is not known so far. UNO has said that eleven thousand people have died, we will have to see to it whether this information is correct or not. So far as the group of Ministers is concerned, a team of Antony Saheb, Pawarji, Chidambaram ji and Shinde Saheb has been formed, they are very learned Members of the Cabinet. I think it will be a very good coordination of relief and relief will be provided. Till today 245 roads are closed there. Rupees 1500 crore have been demanded for the repair of those roads. I would like that Central Government should provide it on priority basis so that relief could be provided. 752 villages are still lying isolated where relief material and relief work have not reached. How many people from which State are missing? I would not like to tell it in details, but the number of people from Uttar Pradesh is largest. The Government of Uttar Pradesh has provided relief material of worth Rs. 25 crore and cash amount in the name of relief and many such States have provided relief so that all the people could get assistance.

As you have told that in calamity affected areas bills for electricity and water will not be realized upto 31st March 2014. But what we have made available there, it should be reviewed. So far as the reconstruction of the Kedarnath temple is concerned, it is a very old temple and biggest tragedy has taken place there. I would like that the Jawans whether they are from ITBP or Indian Force or Army martyred there during performing relief work should be awarded with Paramveer Chakra and assistance should be provided to their family members. The Government has also announced that five lakh rupees will be provided to each of the dependents of the families of those people who have died or are missing there. In this regard, I would like to tell that the two people from Ghaziabad who have been died there, our Uttar Pradesh Government has announced to provide 20 lakh rupees each to their dependents. Such kind of announcement should be made from your own part also so that livelihood of their family members could be sustained.

Mr. Chairman Sir, I would like to conclude my point

by giving one more suggestion. A centralized policy should be framed for the hilly states. Green bonus should be introduced there and exploitation of mountains should be checked. The very sensitive mountains should be declared as Eco Sensitive Zone and whatever developmental work is to be carried out there should be done after due consideration. It has also been seen that in entire Uttarakhand 13000 small scale industries or commercial units have been ruined. There is a need to help them. In the aftermath of this calamity the people who have become poor, surviving in distress, their girls and children are being pushed in illegal trafficking. Many such elements are active there. It was also heard that the jewellery of the deceased people were looted by cutting their ears, hands, and throats etc. It also should be seen by the State Government.

The agriculture fields have been badly damaged there due to this calamity and these have been buried under debris. To reclaim that land 'Bhumi Sena' should be formed or grant should be provided to the people. There are 45 dams in Uttarakhand. They are illegal dams, they have been constructed widely. Natural calamity has occurred there due to binding of rivers because course of the rivers gets changes due to this. Playing with the mountains is the result of this calamity. I would like that some pilgrimage should be got started to remove the fears prevailing among the pilgrims. This was the State Government who also get some assistance in the form of revenue and economically could be independent. With this, I conclude.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Hon. Members who want to lay their written speeches on the subject can do so.

SHRI JAGDISH SINGH RANA (Saharanpur) : Mr Chairman, Sir, I am grateful to you for giving me an opportunity to put forth my views and on behalf of Bahujan Samaj Party during this discussion. The severe natural calamity occurred in Uttarakhand has destroyed, ruined and displaced most of the people residing there. They have neither any shelter to cover their heads nor any means of livelihood left for them. Thus Uttarakhand is passing through a very bad phase. This natural calamity has created large scale unemployment in Uttarakhand. All the means of transportation like roads, bridges etc

have also been damaged here. The main economic source of Uttarakhand were tourist spots and religious places. But now tourism industry has been completely destroyed. I expect from Union Government and from the State Government, both that the reconstruction and redevelopment of industries, roads, pilgrimages and houses of local residents destroyed here due to severe havoc must be exploited in Uttarakhand so that the people could be rehabilitated.

In this context, I would like to say that National President of our Party Km. Mayawati ji has said in her suggestion that not only Uttarakhand but other hilly States of the country such as Himachal Pradesh are also required much attention from the Union Government. The union Government should chalk out solid rules and policies on its level for those States. Necessary steps should be taken to introduce green bonus in these States to check indiscriminate exploitation of mountains, and hilly regions should be declared as Eco-Sensitive Zone. I appeal to the Union Government that it should provide all possible help to the Government of Uttarakhand State for rehabilitation of calamity affected families and for permanent arrangement of their livelihood.

Uttarakhand tragedy has occurred due to our damaging activities of environment. Therefore, as far as possible the environment should not be damaged further, and there is a need to take concrete and effective steps for this also. Not only this it is often seen that these hilly regions have to suffer huge loss of lives and property due to cloud bursts. It means, the people of these regions mentally prepared themselves to face such situation of land sliding and cloud bursting and sometimes much bigger tragedy than this. Approximately more than 13 thousand industries have also been affected badly due to this natural calamity occurred in Uttarakhand. To revive these industries, the banks and finance companies will have to work together. As we all know that development in Uttarakhand have almost taken place alongside roads and roads have been built parallel to river Ganga and its tributaries. In this severe devastation all the commercial buildings, residential buildings built alongside river, roads, electricity poles, transmission lines have been destroyed completely, thereby small businesses, electricity units, hotels etc have been either closed down

or damaged. Uttarakhand needs maximum funds to settle all these things. One thousand crore rupees provided to Uttarakhand by the Union Government is like a drop in the ocean. I urge the Union Government to provide reasonable fund for rehabilitation of the residents of Uttarakhand and they should be brought into main stream of development of the country again.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN : Those hon. Members who want to lay their written speeches on the subject can do so.

[Translation]

\*SHRI MAHENDRASINH P. CHAUHAN (Sabarkantha) : The whole country is shocked and terrified on vast destruction because of heavy downpour in Uttarakhand situated in the lap of Himalayas. The devastating face of nature not only warns us but also forces us to realise that if we fail to wake up soon we may have to face more serious repercussions. Apart from recent devastation in Uttarakhand, various other natural calamities that occurred in recent years indicate to a serious threat looming large.

Today whole country stands with calamity stricken people of Uttarakhand but one question arises - whether the Government would take concrete measure for preventing recurrence of such devastating calamities. Environmentalists have been warning us constantly against ill-effects of large size dams but our Governments have overlooked their advices on the pretext that dams are necessary for development. The Government talks of many things but, in fact, concrete step is hardly taken.

Today we are facing crucial question - how to take effective measures for disaster management in these highly sensitive hilly areas? We have failed to check excessive exploitation of hill resources, prepare comprehensive development policy and also failed to make strategic arrangements for ensuring safety of hills. Had the Government banned the construction activities in the banks of river, we would not have to face this much loss of lives and property even after this natural calamity. Apart from this unplanned development,

---

\*Speech was laid on the Table.



increasing pressure of population is also one of the important reasons for such condition.

By looking at relief activities going on in Uttarakhand one can easily judge how unable we are in trackling natural calamities. It is true that a resourceful country like America also finds itself helpless in case of natural calamities. But so far as India is concerned, it is quite clear that we do not pay much attention on this respect. It is a pertinent question before Himalayan States as to why they allowed such kind of activities which have made these areas more sensitive so far as floods and landslide is concerned.

Therefor, the extant calamity has created the pressure that we should give a new thought to the developmental aspect of Himalayan region.

\*SHRI ARJUN RAM MEGHWAL (Bikaner): I would like to make the following points under Rule 193 on Uttarakhand calamity.

1. The State Government of Uttarakhand should approve a separate project funded under the funds received from MPLADS so that a separate project can be completed out of it and it should be an innovative project.
2. 'Death Certificate' should be issued for persons died or missing in the said calamity as in absence of it the dependents do not get compensation.
3. The CSR contribution from corporate sector should be utilised for rehabilitation of Uttarakhand. This provision should be made mandatory.
4. The projects should be completed in the name of States/political parties which have provided the funds. Such projects should be completed in a time bound maner.
5. Comprehensive mechanism should be developed with the help of science and technology for disaster management.
6. Adequate funds should be provided to BRO for providing rural roads connectivity.

SHRI SHARAD YADAV (Madhepura): Mr. Chairman, Sir, Uttarakhand calamity has taken a very serious shape. Hon. Sushma ji and other Hon. Members have expressed their view in this regard. It seems the world is facing threat and our country faces more serious threat. Himalayan region is the origin point of a number of rivers and the condition of these rivers is an open secret. We are inviting crises and the condition is such that only gods or goddesses cannot prevent these calamities. Our people have been praying for saving the country from natural calamities but we can control them only through scientific temper. Uttarakhand has power plants, tourist places and rivers. In view of recent calamity, we should endeavour to save Himalayas. Whole country was dumbfounded over this tragedy and the army had to be called for relief work. Armies, the world over, are doing stupendous task so far as tackling natural calamities is concerned. I pay tribute to our soldiers who laid their lives while undertaking relief measures. They should be given adequate compensation. The State government has given compensation, as was announced by it, whereas, the Centre is yet to pay it. Why there is delay in such matters. When tragedy struck Kosi, it took time to handle the situation as in such horrifying situation even America finds it difficult to overcome the things immediately. All this work has been started by that civilisation, to which we usually put on high pedestal. We are irritating them. Mahatma Gandhi had taught us that we should not fiddle with the nature. People in our country had never gone against the nature and it was just because of it that we have remained intact, as we were. But, now we are fiddling with the nature, rivers are being overexploited. Huge quantity of sand and silt is removed from the rivers. We have built dams, controlled flow of water. Beyond Naroda, not a drop of water comes from Himalaya in river Ganges. I want to say an aid of Rs. 1000 crore is not going to do anything. It is highly inadequate. People in these areas live in very difficult conditions. They cultivate crops on hilly areas. They make both ends meet with great difficulty. And this tragedy has snatched everything from them. Now, the Government should immediately compensate their losses. I urge the Government to prepare Himalayan Policy so as to save it. If we fail to save it, we son't be able to save our country.

---

\*Speech was laid on the Table.

Two-third of this country will be gone. All the rivers are originating from Himalayas. Glaciers have melted and even Ganga itself is shrinking but it is not having any effect on us. We only are making hue and cry. Now, there is a hue and cry over the big tragedy occurred at present. We are accusing each other. I would like to say that we are responsible for this tragedy. Animals and birds of this world have not created imbalance in nature, it is the human beings who did so. We are so adamant that we are always ready to mistreat the rivers in whatsoever manner possible. We worship them but our behaviour is not accordingly. Therefore, I would like to request that a Himalaya policy should be framed. With the formulation of Himalaya policy the security of the country alongwith the future circumstances likely to occur in the country could be made better. If we have to save the Himalaya we need to save the rivers. If we want to save the Himalayas, we will have to look in the hydro electricity factor. Since centuries such devastation has not occurred in Himalayas. Himalaya is there since thousands of years. People used to go there for peace but now they are going there for business purposes. They are digging the mountains and eroding the soil. There is no scientific way to construct the roads and dams. So, I would like to request you to constitute a ministry on Himalayas and formulate the Himalaya Policy and the first and foremost work of the Ministry should be to save the Himalayas. If you will not save the Himalayas it is impossible to save this country at any cost. The devastation in Uttarakhand is an indication of the fact that the future of the country is in dark and therefore, it is requested that Himalaya policy may be formulated so save the country. We can get electricity but water can never be retrieved. If there is no water, there is no life. Water is life and if we would have wasted the water, there will be no life on earth. With these words I conclude. I don't want to speak much. Today I was not prepared to speak but I was called all of a sudden. I would like to extend my sincere thanks to you for giving me this opportunity to speak.

*[English]*

MR. CHAIRMAN : Members, who want to lay their speeches, can do so.

PROF. SAUGATA ROY (Dum Dum): Sir, I rise to

speaking on the disaster that took place in Uttarakhand in the month of June. You are a representative of those areas and your speech was anguished today and I felt that the pain of the people is reflected. Maharani of Tehri Garhwal is also here. She represents those people, particularly Chamoli, Uttarkashi and Pithoragarh. All these districts are affected. The main two dhams, Kedarnath and Badrinath were severely affected.

Today we have three things to do. It is almost three months or two-and-a-half months since the disaster took place. One should really ponder over the causes of the disaster because it was a wake up call. Geologists and everybody knows that Himalayas are a seismically and ecologically sensitive zone and it is based on tectonic plates, which rest on one another. So, earthquakes and landslides can take place at any time.

But what have we done? Experts say that massive deforestation, violation of all construction norms in hydro power projects, of which there are 336 operational hydro power projects in Uttarakhand, and complete absence of disaster management plans led to the massive scale of destruction in the Himalayas. Also, there is human greed where we lived on the course of the rivers where in a State of one crore people, there are 2.5 crore pilgrims. This total thing needs to be looked into and there should be controlled access of people to places of pilgrimage and tourism. Like for Mansarovar, every year the Government regulates the number of pilgrims. There should be also some control on the entry of pilgrims. All of them go with pious wishes but they cannot violate the ecological norms.

The scale of devastation is massive. In a reply to a Parliament Question given on 6<sup>th</sup> August, it has been stated that the number of human lives lost is 540; number of missing persons is 5474; number of houses damaged 4726; and number of persons rescued to safer places 108000.

Now, the main thing is that two institutions were found lacking. One was the Uttarakhand Government which did not have a disaster management programme in place. The second organization which failed was the NDMA, National Disaster Management Authority, headed by the Prime Minister. It was found that it had no

immediate response to the whole problem. Had it not been for our Armed Forces and Para-Military Forces, the disaster would have been total, and I give my salute to the members of the Armed Forces who risked their lives. You know that in an helicopter accident, so many IAF personnel were killed. I pay my tribute to them. The best performance was by the IAF which deployed 45 helicopters and rescued 23775 persons. They are the best. The NDRF, National Disaster Response Force, rescued 9500 people.

ITBP, Indo-Tibetan Border Police, which patrols the Indo-China Border in Maharani's constituency, rescued 33,000 persons. The Indian Army deployed 8000 personnel and 12 Army helicopters. They evacuated about 12,000 persons. Nehru Institute of Mountaineering, Uttarkashi formed five rescue teams, one of which was headed by Bachendri Pal, the Everester, and they rescued 6,500 persons. If it was not for these specialised organizations, the disaster would have been more massive.

Sir, the other point I want to make is that the Prime Minister, after his aerial survey, sanctioned Rs.1,000 crores for the relief and rehabilitation work. The kith of each dead person was given an amount of Rs.5 lakh. It seems that they have accepted the recommendation that those missing persons, who are registered missing, their families will also get Rs.5 lakh, which is a good thing.

Now a massive reconstruction exercise should be started. But, it does not mean that immediately you allow all the hotels and big houses which were built on the site of Alaknanda and Mandakini, should be allowed. Very carefully, the Uttarakhand Government should now control new construction and a proper attention should be paid on it. I think, Sir, the at national level, a conference should be called with top geologists in the world, who should discuss as to what the way should be to maintain the sensitive zone of Uttarakhand. It is absolutely necessary. It is a national disaster. These are the holiest places for Hindus. Therefore, it is necessary to preserve them as well as the nature and the lives and security of the Uttarakhand people.

Sir, I shall conclude by saying that you asked the hon. Members of Parliament to contribute money from

their MPLAD funds for this cause. I can humbly state that I contributed Rs.20 lakh from my MPLAD fund for Uttarakhand reconstruction and Rs.1 lakh to the Prime Minister Relief Fund from my own income. But, only 223 MPs have come forward. Through you, Sir, I appeal to all MPs – there are 800 MPs and odd – that they should contribute at least Rs.10 lakh for relief and rehabilitation work. An amount of Rs.50 lakh by each MP from his MPLAD fund is allowed. They should at least contribute Rs.10 lakhs for this purpose. Only 223 MPs have come forward for this, which I find very little. We should all unite to rehabilitate the Uttarakhand people. And, I hope, Sir, before long under your stewardship, Uttarakhand finds back its normal life. Their cattle – you were mentioning even mules – died because they could not get food. All these people who have lost cattle, who have lost mules, should be rehabilitated and normal life should start again in Uttarakhand. We should learn from the mistakes of the past. Our human greed should not destroy the Himalayas rather a considerate approach towards rebuilding of the Himalayas should be started.

SHRIMATI J. HELEN DAVIDSON (Kanyakumari): Respected Mr. Chairperson, I am very much thankful to you for giving me an opportunity to speak on the Discussion under Rule 193, regarding Government of India's response and measures taken for relief and reconstruction in the wake of natural disaster in Uttarakhand.

Sir, it is really a shocking incident that had happened in the holy land. My heart beat increases while I recapitulate the pictures and sceneries that we have seen in various media. While speaking on this issue related to the devastating natural calamity of Uttarakhand, think of those who have experienced this disaster personally there in Uttarakhand.

Hats off to the Army personnel, paramilitary forces, Indian Air force and other allied agencies, who have made it possible and saved thousands of helpless people and their valuable lives, while thousands of children, men and women, elderly people have gone to the pilgrimage of Badrinath, Uttarkashi, Gangotri, Yamunotri and other places.

During the relief and rescue operation, due to the

bad weather and heavy rainfall, there was a tragic incident of a helicopter crash in which one Army Officer from Tamil Nadu lost his life. I honour the memory of these people.

Our hon. Prime Minister visited Uttarakhand to take stock of the situation on 19th June. He announced assistance of Rs.1,000 crore to the State. That is not enough; more funds need to be allocated by the Central Government.

I would like to add one point that after every big disaster happens we debate it for a while. But, this is very alarming and a wake up call for all of us. I would like to recall the disaster caused by tsunami in 2004 when thousands of innocent lives were lost. We are being hit by one after another disaster in various parts of our country.

On this occasion I would like to emphasize on the disaster caused by sea erosion. In my constituency 47 villages are in sea-shore area. All over India, thousands of villages are in sea-shore areas. Due to sea erosion, sea water enters into villages causing massive loss to the lives of people including destruction of houses, land, crops, animals and other valuables. Due to disasters like sea-erosion, a number of people belonging to the fishermen and other communities die or their families are severely affected. I would like to draw the attention of the Government that no relief and rehabilitation operations are carried out by the Government after these disasters strike. I urge upon the Government that sea-erosion must be declared as a natural calamity and it should figure in the list of natural calamities. The fishermen go deep into the sea and in case any disaster occurs, they lose their lives. To deal with such cases, adequate welfare measures and schemes should be launched by the Government.

The fishermen families do not even get the death certificate when they go to deep sea for fishing and lose their lives. Death certificates should be issued to them within a period of six months to one year. Now it takes seven years for the Government to give the death certificate after the death of a fisherman.

In Tamil Nadu, whirlwind is causing damage to cash

crops like banana. When banana plants are destructed due to whirlwind, its cultivators suffer a huge monetary loss. Since whirlwind does not come under natural calamities, the Central Government is not allocating funds to the State Government. Therefore, I would like to urge that whirlwind damage should come under the head of natural calamities.

I would like to say that cutting across party-line, we must together rise to the occasion setting aside our differences and affirm our commitment to the welfare and wellbeing of the people of Uttarakhand and also those who are affected by the natural disasters.

*[Translation]*

PROF. SAUGATA ROY: Sir, whether Kedarnath and Badrinath are in your constituency?...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, he belongs to Yamunotri and Gangotri.

*[English]*

SK. SAIDUL HAQUE (Bardhaman-Durgapur): Mr. Chairman, please permit me to speak from here.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay, you are permitted.

SK. SAIDUL HAQUE : We all know about the tremendous devastation, death and destruction that happened in Uttarakhand, due to cloudburst, landslide and also flash floods. We know that Kedarnath, Gaurikund, Badrinath, Rudra Prayag were severely devastated.

I congratulate the Indian Army, Indian Air Force, ITBP and Border Road Organisation for doing tremendous work. But I wonder, what is alarming is that the State Government is callous to face this situation. I am saying this only because of the slow pace of rescue operations. When the Chief Minister was heckled by a group of women, only then he admitted that the State was not prepared to face this kind of a tragedy.

Not just that; the irony of the situation is that 48 hours before the disaster happened on June 15th, on June 13th the Regional Meteorological Centre in Delhi forecast heavy rains across Uttarkhand. But the State Government paid no attention to it. There was a warning

from the Meteorological Department, but the Uttarakhand Government issued a warning only on 16th, that is, after two days and took the help of the Indian Army on 18th. So, two days passed in-between that also. Had it been done earlier, so much of devastation could have been avoided.

Not only the present Congress Government, but I also accuse the previous BJP Government. It is because the previous BJP Government and the present Congress Government ignored the National Mission for Sustaining the Himalayan Ecosystem which was launched in 2008. Here, I would also refer to the 2008 report of the C&AG. That report categorically told about the rampant destruction of the Garhwal Himalayas and cautioned that it would bring about a great environmental impact.

I would tell what happened during the tenure of the BJP Government and the present Congress Government. They allowed to have 242 hydro-electric projects out of which 42 are already in operation while 200 are in the pipeline which would be built on the Bhagirathi and Alakananda Rivers. What is more interesting is that 70 hydel projects are proposed on the two main tributaries of the Ganga-Alakananda and the Mandakini and two 20 kilometre long tunnels are being built to divert the flow of these rivers for hydel projects, and constant blasting of riverbanks has affected the local ecology. That is not all. The green cover in the hills that checks and absorbs the flow of water has been eroded in the name of hydel energy. So, by what they did in the name of development, they invited death and destruction. So many geoscientists and environmentalists had talked about this kind of a thing, but both the Governments paid no attention to check it so as to maintain the ecological balance.

In fact, landslides are a regular feature in Uttarakhand. I am quoting from ISRO. After the Malpa (Pithoragarh) tragedy in 1999, ISRO told that landslides are a regular feature in Uttarakhand. In 1970, there was a landslide in Alakananda Valley. In 1978, Kanodiya landslide took place. In 2003, Varunavat Parvat landslide happened. In 2009, Munisiyari landslide took place. In 2010, large scale landslide took place in the State. In 2012, landslide in Uttarkashi and flash flood in Ukhimath took place.

All these events of the history tell us that this zone is vulnerable to such calamities, but there has not been done any local planning or local effort to control them. A number of hotels and residential and commercial buildings have been built without proper planning. The number of cars, jeeps and taxis increased more than six times. The total population of Uttarakhand is about one crore while the number of tourists and pilgrims visiting the State is almost 2.5 crore each year. This unchecked construction of buildings and increase in the number of tourists led to damage of ecological system in the area of the Bhagirathi River and the Alakananda River.

The Central Government cannot shirk its duty. I say this because the Central Government had assured the Supreme Court that it would not allow construction of any dam within 135 kilometres of the Ganga. In spite of that, 70 dams had been built within a distance of 150 kilometres of the Alakananda and the Mandakini. So, the Central Government also cannot shirk its duty. It is need of the time that there should be development and there should electricity, but it should not be at the cost of death and destruction.

Now, I come to relief and rehabilitation. The Prime Minister has already announced a relief of Rs. 1,000 crore. All the CPI (M) Members of Parliament, from this House as well as the Upper House, have given Rs. 50 lakh each from the MPLADS. We are ready to donate more for the relief and rehabilitation work, but the question is what the Ministry of Home Affairs is doing. The Home Ministry is the nodal Ministry for providing financial assistance. They have constituted the National Disaster Management Authority. They have also established the National Disaster Response Fund, Distress Response Fund and National Disaster Mitigation Fund, but what is the Central Government doing in the case of both the NDRF and the SDRF? The Central Government should provide 70 per cent for NDRF. It should provide 90 per cent in the case of special States. But the Central Government is not doing its action.

My last point is about the National Disaster Management Authority whose ex officio Chairman is the Prime Minister himself, but there is lack of performance

on the part of the NDMA. The Uttarakhand tragedy has exposed its defunct status. It needs to be addressed because C&AG presented its Report on Disaster Preparedness in India in April, 2013. What is the C&AG's observation? It says,

- “1. No national plan for disaster management was formulated till date;
2. None of the major projects undertaken by NDMA have been completed;
3. National Disaster Mitigation Fund not yet established;
4. Communication system for disaster management not developed;
5. Effective national disaster response force has been hampered for shortage of trained manpower and training facilities.”

That is why I am calling the attention of the House, through you, Sir, to the fact that both the National Disaster Management Act, 2005 and the National Policy on Disaster Management, 2009 have not been properly implemented. This House, in the past, has discussed the issue of pollution of the Ganga River twice. The Standing Committee on Water Resources has also discussed this issue, but it has not yielded any results.

That is why I urge upon the Government to take appropriate action so that such kinds of incidents do not happen in the future.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB (Cutback): Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir, for this opportunity. I stand here today to participate in the discussion on the Statement made by the hon. Minister of Defence regarding Government of India's response and measures taken for relief and reconstruction in the wake of natural disaster in Uttarakhand raised by Shrimati Sushma Swaraj on 30th August, 2013.

At the outset, I would say that one does not need an Usain Bolt to predict that India's response time is poor. The disease spreads across the board and in almost every sphere. Little wonder then that when disaster strikes, all we manage to do is indulge in blame game.

Had we been a little bit proactive, a number of lives could have been saved, along with it property worth crores. But neither the National Disaster Management Authority nor the Uttarakhand Government chose to act when the country's premier scientific body, ISRO, sounded the alarm bells. An alarm was sounded out by ISRO's MOSDAC (Meteorological and Oceanographic Satellite Data Archival Centre), a facility set up to promote the exchange of satellite data, on the day the disaster struck.

Unfortunately, both the NDMA and the State Government authorities chose to sleep over the highly important alert. This MOSDAC alert was sounded a good 16 hours before the monsoon came down with all its fury, but it failed to get the authorities into action mode. MOSDAC showed clearly that eleven places were feared to be affected by severe rain and cloud burst and listed Barkot, Kirtinagar, Muni-ki-Reti, Pauri, Raiwala, Rishikesh, Rudraprayag, Srinagar, Tehri and Uttarakashi. NASA had also predicted 25 days before through a satellite picture that the Chorabari Glacier's soft ice is melting very fast, but Indian scientists could not gauge the devastation that it may cause.

When warnings are there stating heavy to very heavy rains coupled with landslides at places, is it not enough to suggest that there is going to be crisis of this magnitude? It is beyond debate, the debate that the mountainous terrain is inherently risky and because of its proximity to Himalayas is extremely prone to sudden changes in weather. Between 15<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> June, Uttarakhand saw an unusual 261 centimeters of rain, when the State normally gets only 16 centimeters of rain through the whole month of June. What is surprising in this entire episode is that there is lack of preparedness to deal with a disaster of this magnitude.

The Indian Armed Forces played a heroic role in rescue and evacuation, but several official agencies were found to be lacking in their job. What has become apparent is that the civilian administration has been less than responsive. National Disaster Management Authority needs to be revamped. Their inadequacies have been exposed in almost every emergency they have tackled, Uttarakhand being the most glaring example. We need professionals with experience in different fields.

The interface between NDMA and the civil administration also needs to be better structured and better tuned. In our country, the level of preparedness for disaster management is extremely uneven and requires considerable strengthening. Since the civil administration remains ill-equipped for undertaking quick response to major disasters, the armed forces have been the primary option to handle major disasters. The involvement of the armed forces in disaster response and relief operation is important in civil-military relations. Efforts should be made for using the expertise of the armed forces to bolster the capacity of the civil authorities including the disaster response forces. It should achieve self-reliance and thus, reduce the dependence on the armed forces. The Department of Disaster Management should not be the changed name of Department of Relief and Rehabilitation, Home Guards and Emergency Fire Services with ad-hoc personnel. It should work like a crack-team.

Sir, we are informed that a Task Force set up to review functioning of the NDMA has submitted its Report to the hon. Home Minister recommending changes to the Disaster Management Act, 2005 which governs NDMA. What have they suggested? They have said that it is necessary to slim down the body and there is an urgent need to integrate it with other Government agencies to ensure smooth coordination and accountability. The C&AG has very recently come down very heavily in the functioning of NDMA and the report says and I quote:

“The performance of NDMA in terms of project implementation had been abysmal. So far, no major project taken up by NDMA has been completed. It was noticed that NDMA selected projects without proper ground work and as a result, either the projects were abandoned mid-way or were incomplete after a considerable period”.

Lastly, Sir, I would say that there are two practical steps the State of Uttarakhand Government need to take to prevent occurrences in future. One, it needs to create a pilgrim and tourist management system and two, it ought to devote more attention and money to regulating tourism infrastructure to service tourists, hotels, shops, parking lots, and mini-malls which have come up, not

just on road side but even on river beds, crumbling slopes and forest areas. There is a need to have a regulatory body to oversee land use. The Uttarakhand population is 1.08 crore and as per the Ministry of Tourism, tourist arrivals are 2.5 crore. This is a recipe for disaster. Builder's greed has led to nature's fury. Rampant construction has brought this disaster. One of our eminent engineers Shri Bishnu Prasad Das who is known throughout the country has written an article very recently on 31<sup>st</sup> August, 2013 in The Hindu that the devastating landslides that have occurred were caused by the undercutting of the fragile hill-slopes for highways rather than by dams which actually helped to mitigate the floods. I read that small portion though it is a big article.

“On the contrary, the Tehri reservoir on the Bhagirathi held back the incoming devastating flood which attained a peak of 7000 cubic meter per second and since the release was restricted to a mere 400 cubic meter per second causing the reservoir to rise by 25 meters a day, the flood damage below the Tehri dam was minimal. Without the Tehri dam, the combined flood of the Alkananda and the Bhagirathi would have exceeded 35,000 cubic metre at Rishikesh possibly wiping out the prosperous urban river stretch at Rishikesh, Haridwar and Saharanpur.”

This needs to be stressed upon. There is an idea that is being quoted that dams are actually the culprits. But what this engineer has stated here is that it has protected these three major urban areas besides the banks of River Ganga. The path ahead should be to learn lessons by an informed debate. The immediate need is to enforce flood plain zoning below Rudraprayag on the Alkananda and Maneri Bhali on the Bhagirathi and disallow permanent structures in flood prone zones.

Finally, I would say that three 'R's should always be kept in mind — first, is Rescue followed by Relief which should be followed by Reconstruction and Rehabilitation. The National Disaster Response Force should work in tandem with the State Disaster Response Force. With these words, I conclude.

\*SHRIMATI PRATIBHA SINGH (Mandi) : I would like

---

\*Speech was laid on the Table.

to express my views on the matter of urgent public importance concerning my state, particularly my Parliamentary constituency.

The state of Himachal Pradesh has suffered unprecedented loss on account of untimely and heavy monsoon rains this year. The districts of Kinnaur and Sirmour, which are adjoining to the state of Uttarakhand, were severely affected during the fury unleashed by rain, cloudbursts and even heavy snowfall from 15<sup>th</sup> to 17<sup>th</sup> June, 2013. Besides these districts, whole of the State was also affected by the unprecedented rains in particular district Mandi, Kullukangra and Shimla. As per the data of the Indian Meteorology Department, during the monsoon, compare to the other years, the rainfall was 576% to 1358% above normal, has been recorded for these three days.

Timely intervention by the State administrative machinery ensured minimal loss of life, and effective relief and rescue operations were carried out. Still the loss to private and public property has been immense. People in the affected areas have lost their houses, agricultural lands, standing agriculture and horticulture crops, including full-grown orchards thus shattering the rural economy and livelihoods. About 10,000 houses have been either fully or partially damaged in the State; and even the partially damaged ones are not habitable. More than 64 persons have lost their lives during this natural calamity. Public infrastructure especially roads, water supply, irrigation schemes, electricity infrastructure, community assets etc. have been badly damaged requiring years of investment to restore it back to normal.

The state has submitted a detailed memorandum seeking central assistance to the extent of Rs.1972.08 crore for relief and rehabilitation under the National Disaster Response Fund. This memorandum was given to the Government of India in the first week of July. The central team too has visited the state and assessed the situation, but assistance from NDRF is still awaited. The attention of this august House is drawn towards this issue of extreme importance in Himachal Pradesh and to deliberate on the steps being taken or planned by the Government of India to ensure rehabilitation of the

affected people of the State and restoration of damaged public infrastructure.

DR. SANJEEV GANESH NAIK (Thane): Sir, I would like to extend my sincere thanks for giving me an opportunity to speak on this topic pertaining to Uttarakhand.

Firstly, I would like to pay my homage to the people killed and soldiers martyred there. Perhaps you may recall that 15 days back I went there with my family. When I saw the incident on TV felt grieved to see that this was the same place where I had been to fifteen days back. It is very disheartening to say that thousands of people died there and it is very sad. Saying goes that one who takes birth bound to die, but he will die in this manner, nobody would have even thought about this. I went there with the President of Badrinath and Kedarnath and MLA of the area, Shri Ganesh ji. This incident occurred after we returned from there and this disaster has devastated the place which now looks very different from what it was earlier used to be. As you have said in your statement that huge assistance is required to be given to it. Alongwith the humans, animals also died there and there is no information about them. I think that keeping all these things in view the place requires economic assistance of more than 30 thousand crore rupees. I think Gangotri-Yamunotri are in the area of Maharaja ji and Badrinath-Kedarnath falls in your area. These two places are very important according to the Hindu religion and Hindustan.

Sir, though you, I would like to request the Union Government that Master Plan for these places which are called the Char-dhaams of North India needs to be formulated for maintaining their existence for hundred and thousand years for people. As you have said we need to make considerations keeping in mind the future circumstances. Like when temples of Kedarnath and Badrinath were constructed, All these things would have been considered as if you have a look at the walls of the temple, they are not even affected by the huge rocks came sliding over there. I think it will take around 10-15 years to remove those rocks. I have seen myself that the form of some rivers have changed. I think the State Government and Union Government should make a



master plan to consider all these things. As it has been told that there are temporary (Kutch) helipads for the helicopters. They are not adequate. Earlier, it was said that it takes 10-15 days to complete Char-Dhaam yatra. I did my Yatra in one and a half day. Thousands of people are coming there due to this. I would like to request that Government to maintain a record regarding the people coming there on a particular day, the people going to Kedarnath and Badrinath and further to Yamunotri and Gangotri. In absence of this we are not getting to know about the number of people came there, the people who stayed put over there and the number of people died. There is no information regarding this. I would like the Union Government and the State Government to take concrete steps in this regard.

Sir, I would like to thank the Union Government for providing huge assistance. I would like to thank all the people who have extended their help. I want the Government to keep one thing in mind that there are small villages having 25-40 houses. We need to bring all of them together at one place making it one thousand, one and a half thousand and two thousand. The Government needs to consider this thing to avoid any disaster in future. I think big godowns needs to be set up there so as to save people from famine. Similarly, as you have said, funicular needs to be installed and it is necessary to install these. If we will arrange these, more tourists are likely to visit these places as we are not immortal but these dhaams are likely to exist till the existence of this earth.

#### 20.00 hrs.

I feel that for the next hundred years, two hundred years such funicular are required so that maximum tourist could come and take a glance. Pilgrims from various areas visit these places.

Hon'ble Chairman, through you I would like to request that we need to make a plan regarding Mandakini river which is a great threat to the area. For a good future of the place I would like to request the Union Government that it may provide the monetary assistance but the place requires more planning than anything else.;

Hon'ble Chairman, through you, I would like to

request the Government that this fact may be considered without taking into consideration whose government is there whether it takes five years or ten years considering that it is the most important place of our country.

Hon'ble Chairman, I would like to extend my sincere thanks for giving me this opportunity to speak.

[English]

\*SHRI C. SIVASAMI (Tiruppur): Hon'ble Chairman Sir, I thank you for giving me an opportunity to speak in the discussion on natural disasters in Uttarakhand under Rule 193. The State of Uttarakhand has so many tourist centres. Large number of tourists from all over the country and abroad visit Uttarakhand every year. The Union and Uttarakhand State governments are responsible for planning and providing basic infrastructure facilities including lodging, transport, road and medical facilities to the visiting tourists and pilgrims. Uttarakhand witnessed a natural disaster of such a huge magnitude and destruction was so unprecedented due to unplanned activities and shortcomings in providing basic infrastructure and amenities in the State. Thousands lost their lives. Large number of people lost their belongings. Losses incurred in the State of Uttarakhand due to natural calamity amounted to several thousands of crores of rupees. While overcoming such a natural calamity the State concerned and the Union government have together failed to undertake relief measures efficiently. It is a matter of concern. Tourists were stranded for so many days in many places of Uttarakhand without proper food, clothing, medical facilities and even without any hope of returning to their respective native places. I also wish to state that Union government had not instantaneously undertaken the relief and rescue measures in the State of Uttarakhand. As soon the information regarding stranded tourists belonging to Tamil Nadu was received, Hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu Dr. Puratchithalaivi Amma had sent a team headed by the Tamil Nadu State Revenue Secretary immediately to the disaster-affected Uttarakhand. This team stayed in Uttarakhand for 15 days. Pilgrims from Tamil Nadu, who were stranded in Uttarakhand, were airlifted and sent to Delhi. These pilgrims were then made to stay in a camp

\*English translation of the speech originally delivered in Tamil.

set up with helpline facilities in Tamil Nadu House, New Delhi. The government of Tamil Nadu had provided food, accommodation and air travel to Tamil Nadu free of cost to all such pilgrims. Not only pilgrims from Tamil Nadu but also the pilgrims of other States were also helped by the government officials of Tamil Nadu ensuring their safe return to their respective native places. I also recall that an helicopter pilot named Mr. Praveen sacrificed his valuable life while engaging in rescue work in Uttarakhand. Hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu Dr. Puratchiththalaivi Amma is a towering personality who remains a frontrunner among leaders of the world. She has displayed swift action and efficiency at a time when natural calamity of such a huge magnitude struck. When disastrous Tsunami struck Tamil Nadu, there was huge devastation in the State and Hon. Chief Minister Dr. Puratchiththalaivi Amma undertook several relief measures in a laudable way which were appreciated by world nations. Former US President Mr. Bill Clinton had felicitated Hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu Dr. Puratchiththalaivi Amma in this regard. The government of Sri Lanka had also invited a team of government officials from Tamil Nadu to visit their country to impart training on successful implementation of relief work. Union government should have taken relief and rescue measures in the State of Uttarakhand soon after such a devastating disaster. At the time of such a natural disaster that had taken place outside Tamil Nadu, Hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu Dr. Puratchiththalaivi Amma with utmost generosity had donated Rs. 5 Crore as immediate financial aid to the State of Uttarakhand. Union government should work in such a way to mitigate the destruction caused by natural disasters. In Tamil Nadu when farmers were affected due to drought like condition and their crops were damaged, Hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu Dr. Puratchiththalaivi Amma announced a financial assistance of Rs.15,000/- per acre to each of the drought-affected farmers. Union government has not still provided crop insurance amount to Tamil Nadu. I urge that the Union government should take necessary action to release the crop insurance assistance that is due to the State of Tamil Nadu.

*[Translation]*

SHRI NAGESWARA RAO (Khammam): You have

given me the opportunity to speak on Uttarakhand. I want to make one special request to you in this regard. When Uttarakhand disaster occurred, we spent 9 days in this operation with those people. Therefore, please give me at least 9 minutes to speak on it.

Sir, when such a disaster took place, many things have been said in this regard by several experts and technical people. Many people have said it man-made disaster. Many people have termed it as the flood of the policy failure. But whatever has happened, has happened. Therefore, when such disasters takes place, its full responsibility is on NDMA, but it also failed completely. The Chairman of NDMA is our Hon'ble Prime Minister and Uttarakhand is near Delhi, but this Government totally failed in the way the rescue operations were conducted.

Mr. Chairman, we heard each and every word of their speech. Firstly, he said about Uttarakhand, secondly, he was speaking something on behalf of the Government; but we do not agree with him. He was saying that Sonia Gandhi ji and Prime Minister went over there. The Prime Minister did only area survey. Today, he would say that a committee of Ministers has been constituted and it is looking after all things. Why this Minister did not go to Uttarakhand at that time and sit in Dehradun? Today, it is the biggest disaster of the country. Lakhs of people have been affected by it. I came to know from the reply of the question asked in this Parliament session that 1600 villages have been affected, and 5474 people are still missing. We have not been able to locate them till today. Why it happened so? The hon. Prime Minister announced Rs. one thousand crore and everyone was thinking that the announced amount would come. The State Government could not give three per cent of that. Though, the demand is for Rs. 13 thousand crore, but the loss occurred is more than that, however only Rs. 395 crore have been released over here. At one time Rs. 250 crore were given and the second time Rs. 145 crore were given. They are giving written reply to a parliament question that whatever is needed for the state, we will extend full help, financial support, logistic support. In the current session, reply to a question comes on 13.08.213. It is very unfortunate. Even after the State is affected so much, the Central Government has not

woken up. Mr. Chairman, this incident had taken place on 16th. Our leader Chandrababu Naiduji and me had both come to Delhi. By that time, some people had come to Delhi with a few people of Andhra Pradesh. Maximum pilgrims were from Andhra Pradesh. 2780 pilgrims of Andhra Pradesh got stuck up at that time. In our State, there is Congress Government and in Center also there is Congress Government. We had thought that they would save the Telugu people. This incidence took place on 16th. We came to Delhi on 23rd. There was no one to give them food in the Andhra Bhawan of Delhi. Women could not take bath for till six days together. They could not get the rooms opened in Andhra Bhawan. We people have to stage a Dharna. Chandrababu Naiduji and me staged dharna at road and got opened all rooms in Andhra Bhawan. At that time there were 120 persons in Andhra Bhawan. They were sitting on the road, they were given food while they were sitting on road. We asked them to open the canteen, nothing was there for them to eat and to take bath for the last six days. We got the room opened. After that we went to Dehradun. We met the Hon'ble Chief Minister, Vijay Bahugunaji. As at least 3000 people of Andhra Pradesh got stuck up, in the same way, pilgrims from all over India got stuck up. We thought to save the people...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRI NAMA NAGESWARA RAO: Mr. Chairman, it is very unfortunate, very sad that we could not arrange transportation to bring those people after such an incident took place, at a time when we have our 13 Ministers in the Central Government, 30 MPs of Andhra Congress and there is Congress Government in Andhra Pradesh. For the first time, we put in service direct special flight. By five flights people of Andhra Pradesh were taken to Hyderabad. We did arrangement of transportation and were with those people for nine days. A woman was struck by a rock and she had a wound at head and got a fracture hand, even then she came six kilometers on foot. There was a 70 years old person also, re remained lying for six days at the place where horses were tied...*(Interruptions)* The Govt. failed in the way care should have been provided and the affected people should have been protected. While the Central Government was nearby, no one could concentrate. Had the Central Government

concentrated, we could have saved so many people, there were many chances to save them. But because of the policies of the Government, many pilgrims visiting from all over the country died and many went missing.

Finally, I want to say that there is a demand of at least Rs. 13 thousand crore, out of which the Govt. have given 3 per cent i.e. Rs. 395 crore so far, the balance may please be given. Mr. Chairman, you know that so many villages have been devastated.

At last, I would like to state that such a failure should not be repeated in future. We hope that they will formulate policy for the future and will try to save the people of the country.

SHRI SANJAY SINGH CHAUHAN (Bijnor): Mr. Chairman, through you, with a heavy heart we wish to extend our condolences to all those families today whose members had come happily from their houses, but could not return and perhaps will never return. It is a very serious matter. Only he knows this trauma who has faced it. I will not speak much. It was a natural calamity. Whenever such a big calamity occurs, be it in the house, in the State or in the country, the Government handled it with great courage. One man has to take the responsibility. All of you took care of it with courage.

I will conclude after giving two-three suggestions. Hindustan is a country of religious faith. There should be some policy which may tell the difference between religious tourism and tourism for enjoyment. Our religious spots are becoming tourism centres and are becoming very loaded. I will even say that our traditions or the principles that should have been followed are not being followed there. For its monitoring, Vaishno Devi, Amarnathji Shrine Boards are examples. There should be a well-planned way at every religious spot.

Secondly, the seven years law should not apply in case of those persons who have gone missing. Whatever amendment may be done for that in the law, the Government with special effect should ensure that they get certificate at the earliest as deemed dead. Thirdly, I would like to say about trees. Sir, you all know about there, after hearing you nothing remains to say. But, through you, I would like to state to the Government that criminal offence has been done. There might have been

Government of anyone, I do not want to level allegation on anybody. The way trees have been cut in Uttaranchal, is criminal. It should be inquired into. The trees which are right for us environmentally, should be planted. The Ganga river did not ruin us, but we came in the way of the Ganga. We violated so many things and the result is before us.

The border of my Parliamentary Constituency, Bijoor starts from Uttaranchal. The Ganga river passes through 155 kms across my area, but we failed to formulate any policy for it. There should be such a law that the people living near the Ganga river are not affected. Every year hundreds of people are affected, thousands of people are ruined. This is my one wake up call, we have heard the danger bell. This debate has been done here on this basis. It is a very serious debate. People have given very good suggestions. therefore, it should not end here with this discussion only but after proper consideration, a complete policy may be formulated for the hilly States of Himalayas like Jammu and Kashmir, Himachal Pradesh and Uttaranchal which are our crown. May Goddess Ganga bless all of them. May these States prosper again and tourism get started here as it used to be earlier.

[English]

SHRI PRABODH PANDA (Midnapore): Mr. Chairman, Sir, at the very outset, I express my profound sorrow and pay tribute to the persons who lost their lives due to the unprecedented catastrophe which occurred in Uttarakhand.

Sir, you might be remembering that in this House itself, we had discussions twice on pollution of the Ganga and the situation of the Himalayas. But I do not understand what sense of the House has been taken by the Government. It seems no sense has been taken up and only discussions took place for the sake of discussion.

I am not going to narrate the catastrophe. It has already been mentioned by several Members and it has been coming out in media also. But if we go through the chronology of events, the catastrophe occurred with the combination of massive rainfall, glaciers flow, snow melt, debris and thousands of land slides.

I listened to your speech very attentively as you are coming from that area which has been affected the most. You very rightly mentioned about the global warming. So far as global warming is concerned, what would be our task? Our task is not to create more problems. The opinion of the experts is that the reservoirs and tunnels built for the dams contribute in increasing the localised temperature, disturbing the ecological balance. It is pertinent to mention that due to the proximity of the Himalayas, this can be of immense danger. Cloudbursts are reported increasingly after the construction of Tehri and other projects in recent years. The Government should take this point into account.

I am just going to mention some points. The Char Dham Yatra is the main economic source of thousands of families in the hills, but no yatra plan or management plan was ever initiated and implemented by the Uttarakhand Government. ...*(Interruptions)* So, there should be a plan. But so far there is no plan.

The second point is, highways, hotels and massive building construction near the river banks caused a great loss too.

The third point is, the main reason behind the catastrophe is commercial exploitation of the Himalayas in the name of bumper to bumper developmental hydro projects. More than 500 sites have been identified for hydro power projects in the Ganga basin. Out of this, 70 projects are in pipeline in the main Ganga-Bhagirathi and her tributary Alaknanda and Mandakini.

The existing and the under-construction projects have severely affected the entire vicinity. Loss of grazing lands, dried water sources, disrupted flora, fauna and wild life due to uncontrolled heavy blasting for tunnelling, road building and power houses are seen besides massive de-forestation and unchecked dumping of muck in the river bed at all construction sites. This causes landslides and land sinking in monsoons and unstable the entire area.

So, what is meaning of development? In case of development, all these points should be taken into consideration. In the name of development, everything cannot be done. Not even a single village in the vicinity

of the already existing projects can be termed as developed. So, these are the points.

So, my first suggestion is, implement the eco-zone notification keeping in mind the rights and privileges of local people; and further construction of roads and buildings should be carried out under proper master plan and guidelines of eco zone.

My second suggestion is, 150 kms. of the valley from the glacier line all across Himalayas must be declared and framed as Cultural Eco Sensitive Zone to maintain the original pristine state of the area.

My third suggestion is, scrap all the under construction dams, tunnelling, barrage and reservoir formation in Himalayas.

So, all these points should be taken into consideration.

I have two more questions to ask about the mismanagement of the Disaster Management Authority. ...*(Interruptions)* There is no correct figure about the rain fall, landslides, etc. What is the role of the Central Water Commission? What was the forecast of Meteorological Survey of India? So, all these things should be taken into consideration. So, these are my suggestions.

My last suggestion is that, we should not have discussions just for discussion sake. We should think of something for the coming days. Please constitute a High Power Committee from the Centre to monitor everything. That cannot left only to the State Government. Or, this is not the case of a particular Department or Ministry. Please constitute a High-Powered Committee. If you involve the Members of Parliament from both the Houses, it will be better. If it is not possible, it should be constituted involving experts. That should really be a High-Powered Committee to monitor everything above the developmental works, relief works and all these things. ...*(Interruptions)*

Lastly, Sir, I would just respond to your last sentence:

Sarve bhavantu sukhinah,  
Sarve santu niramayah,  
Sarve bhadrani pashyantū,  
Ma kashcit dukkha bhagbhavet.

Only good wishes will not do. You have to do something. If you have to do something, you should be honest, you should be sincere to the cause. Otherwise, everything will be a futile exercise... *(Interruptions)* It will be a great loss. So, this is my suggestion.

*[Translation]*

SHRI JAGDANAND SINGH (Buxar): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I thank you for giving me the opportunity to share my views on the plight of Uttarakhand.

Sir, the entire House has got same views in this matter, may be, Uttarakhand is the one which is suffering from this tragedy every Member who rose to speak on this matter shared the same views. Such occasions are the reminder of the fact that we are the citizen of the country where river Ganga flows. This is the tragedy of Uttarakhand. The reason for this tragedy lies in the catchment area of Ganga river. Probably in the history of Uttarakhand situated in Himalayas, it had never been imagined that due to such terrible and unprecedented rain, this kind of awful tragedy would take place and perhaps such tragedy has never ever occurred before. I don't want to go into the details of the extent of the accident, the people killed due to said accident and the difficulties faced. But, I would like to put across two three things.

Sir, nobody could have stopped the rain which caused this tragedy. When there is a cloud burst, nothing can stop the water falling down from that burst cloud. When there is 400 per cent rain in a limited time such tragedy is bound to happen which we are discussing right now, wherein roads, houses, means of development generated for so many years were swept away with the water. This is the result of the said massive rain. However, if we are discussing this matter here after 70-75 days then the focus of this discussion should be only one that is how to reconstruct Uttarakhand. I heard that the Uttarakhand Government was rendered helpless and hence could not do anything. I belong to Bihar. I have seen the floods for so many years. I know that the area which gets submerged in water, the local administration there also become helpless since it also gets affected with the flood along with the common people. But, It has also been said that Hon. Prime Minister visited the place

and also the institutional system prevailing in India could not extend help to Uttarakhand in a proper manner. On the other hand, it is also said that Air force and Army which are the institutions of the Central Government were appreciated. The people engaged in the work of disaster management extended their help there only on the directions of the Government of India. Sir, if the whole country had not supported, if all the people had not extended their help, we could not have saved Uttarakhand which was totally devastated where roads were closed and there were no means of transport and some people were stuck up on the mountain and some were saving their lives living near the river bank. I am saying this because when Kosi tragedy occurred, we were the one who bore the brunt of the tragedy and we noticed that is the whole country had not united at that time, no one could have saved Bihar after the Kosi tragedy.

Sir, on the lines of reconstruction work started after the Kosi tragedy, we should focus our discussion on one point as to how to reconstruct Uttarakhand. Our four 'Dhams' are situated there. Our tourists will go there. All the facilities meant for them have been destroyed. We have to move ahead from there. Whenever I hear that the development works carried out in Uttarakhand are the cause of this destruction, I get surprised. Uttarakhand has water, forest, and center of beliefs as the 'Land of God'. These are the assets of Uttarakhand. The day when management of water will be stopped in the hills of Himalayas and there will be a check on the development works, there will be nothing not only in Uttarakhand and Himachal Pradesh but also in Sikkim, Bhutan, Na Arunachal Pradesh. They are the basis of their life. If there were no Tehri Dam, we actually would have seen as to how this water of Uttarakhand can cause damage to all parts of the country. Uttar Pradesh, Bihar and Bengal are low lying areas but the single large reservoir in Tehri has absorbed all the water of Bhilangana, Dauliganga and Bhagirathi barring Alaknanda and Mandakini. If that water had flown down, along with the water after Rudra Prayag from where Ganga originates, we would have seen the extent of damage it may cause to the low lying areas. Do not focus this discussion on the point that due to inappropriate development in Uttarakhand present damage has been caused. We can not stop all the development works in Uttarakhand in the name of

environment and forest. Therefore, I would like to request the House through you that while expressing our views, sorrow and grief within limits, we should not put the future of Uttarakhand in jeopardy since water is there main wealth. If we stop the water management, it will cause a great loss to Uttarakhand in the same manner as will happen if we stop the extraction of petroleum products from where they are found. Therefore, I would like to say that water management should be done in a proper manner even if there are cloud bursts, causing damage to roads, but the reconstruction work has to be carried out by the people of the country unitedly. We should unite together to reconstruct Uttarakhand in the same manner as we are expressing our views here in unison so that we do not cause damage to Uttarakhand focussing on other issues.

Sir, I would like to conclude my speech extending my sincere thanks to you for giving me the opportunity to speak.

[English]

SHRI PREM DAS RAI (Sikkim): Sir, I thank you very much for giving me this opportunity to take part in this discussion under Rule 193 on the tragedy that occurred in Uttarakhand. It is fortuitous that you are in the Chair and you were the man on the spot but let me also at this point thank the Uttarakhand Government and the Government of India that several families from Sikkim were rescued in time. I would like to place on record the gratitude to the Government of Uttarakhand and the Government of India from our State.

This morning, it was very apparent in the discussions that ensued in 'Zero Hour' that many MPs from Bihar made their representations with respect to either drought or flood or both droughts and floods that are happening in their States. It is with regularity every year that we hear this. Every year, we hear of one big tragedy. In 2011, on September 18, we had a massive earthquake in Sikkim. Even as recent as two days ago, several families in West Sikkim were washed away because of landslides. This kind of regularity of natural disasters, as we would like to call them, is happening on an absolute regular basis. Therefore, that brings us to the question as to how prepared are we in dealing with these kinds of natural disasters.

I recall that when Tsunami happened, the Government of India made a provision and quickly put up early warning systems for the Tsunami. Now this is something which, I hope and pray, will give us early warning if there were to be a tsunami. But what is important to understand is that the entire Himalayan belt is a seismic zone, it is a very fragile mountain system and, with climate change, the precipitation of rain is going to become increasingly more vociferous, and, therefore, I think, early warning systems, as you have rightly said, should be immediately put up all across the Himalayas so that any part of the Himalayas which is susceptible to disaster gets early warning.

The other thing which I would like to reiterate, and which the hon. Member Shri Sharad Yadav said today, is that we need to have a new Ministry, a Ministry that looks after the mountains. These geographical formations, be it a desert area, be it coastal areas, are today recognised as biodiversity hot spots and, therefore, we need to see as to how we can deal with environmental disasters or environmental development that needs to take place. Finally, I would just like to make one more point and this is with regard to the NDRF. I think much has been said with respect to the kind of work and the kind of valour that our people from the Armed Forces have shown. I can tell you that we did not have to import the kind of forces for rescue and rehabilitation because in the State of Sikkim, what we have done is, we have taken disaster management to the grassroots and each panchayat is being equipped with disaster management techniques. I think that is the way forward. It is not that by sitting at the Centre that we need to do this kind of disaster management training. Capacity building has to be done at the grassroots, at the level of panchayats. I think our State has shown the way forward.

*[Translation]*

SHRIMATI MALA RAJYA LAXMI SHAH (Tehri Garhwal): Hon. Chairman, Sir, I would like to draw the attention of the Union Government to the natural disaster occurred in Uttarakhand, particularly, in Kedarnath area during 16-17 June last year and want to share my experience. The natural disaster occurred in Uttarkashi, Chamoli and Rudra Prayad in Tehri district of Uttarakhand

is beyond imagination. I experienced that since I had been there in Uttarkashi area for about one month since 18 June. Today, this topic is being discussed and several views have been expressed here. I am happy about it. The Members from almost every State have expressed their views on the said tragedy. I would like to extend my thanks to all of them.

I also would like to say that if our defence services were not there, people of Uttarakhand along with the people who came here from various parts of the country couldn't be saved. I regret to state that the people of Uttarakhand did not get the support of the Uttarakhand Government as much as was expected. It is a fact as I had been there for one month with the people of Uttarkashi where this disaster took place. I would like to share the experience I had there and what I saw there.

Uttarkashi, which is a Himalayan region, is in a very bad shape. Particularly in Uttarkashi the condition of every village is very bad, roads are damaged and there is no connectivity. This is not a good thing. The arrangements made for the locals are not up to the mark. The foodgrains sent there were not distributed properly. I was there and I know what happened and didn't happen there. The preliminary work which should have been done there were not carried out. I regret to state that after seeing all of this happened on 19, since, I am a Member of Committee on Defence, I called up the Committee on Defence and asked for Air Force planes as small helicopters were not of much help as they could accommodate only two or three persons. When the planes reached there much help could be provided to the people. As you have said that there is no need of Defence in Sikkim, I understand that but in our region such system doesn't exist. Defence personnel, locals and police personnel were the one who saved us. I would like to thank those who saved the people of our country, the locals and the tourists. I also would like to say that I stayed at the same place where Defence personnel did. I would like to share my experience with you. There is difference between the experience felt at a place of tragedy and gained just by sitting in a office. Therefore, I would like to say that defence personnel used to fly the helicopter at 6 A.M. They did not even care for their life and only the people who were present there could tell

what kind of risk they took. Even an helicopter crashed. I personally knew the Captain and the Commander of the said chopper. I had been to Harsil and Gangotri, First I went to Gangotri. Situation was very bad there. I was to fly by the ill-fated helicopter that crashed in Harsil. As I failed to board the said chopper and thereby escaped the accident. I wholeheartedly salute defence personnel who saved maximum number of people. Today, the condition in Uttarkashi is very bad, but if the Government had been alert, there would not have been so much losses. Calamity struck even in 2012 and if the funds provided at that time had been spent properly, condition in Uttarkashi would not have been so much bad. Road connectivity to the village of Uttarkashi Chinyalisor has been completely washed away. 46 women are pregnant in that village and their delivery is due this month only. But how will they be helped in the absence of road connectivity. Recently I went there. People have got inadequate help. You won't believe, Patwaris were giving only Rs. 255 for land, which was not sufficient to pay even taxi fare. There should not be such a great injustice, Since I am aware of the facts of that area, I would explain you as to what is going on there? I had met the hon. Prime Minister also and I said that the State has no funds. All the departments are starved of funds. He said that how it could be, as the Central Government has given enough funds. The Government may have sent the funds, but where has it gone? Money has come from various sources. It has not been given to the proper people, I do not know where the money is. I want to know where to money has gone especially funds donated out of MPLADS? People of Tehri have not got any money. I want to know where the money has gone? You won't believe people who are unable to walk, were carrying meals on their shoulders. Wheat was distributed in place of flour but how to grind it as there were no grinders. Salt was also not given. Food was getting wasted but it was not getting distributed. In Harsil, poor people were distributing meals from their homes. I told them to distribute the meals before it gets spoiled. But there were no proper arrangements. In the event of such a disaster there should not be any discrimination. It stands to be the matter of humanity.

Today, it is my maiden speech. I am just sharing

my experience. I hope you don't mind. I want to say that acting while sitting in the office and working on the site are two different things. As Shri Rao has said that he felt a lot as he was there and I, too, was present on the spot. In the capacity of an MP from the affected area, I want to say that justice should be done with us. I further want to say that we, people of Tehri Garhwal have lost everything. But so far we have not been treated well. Mr. Chairman, Sir, you are aware that the displaced people have not got the shelter to stay. Dobrachati bridge in Pratapnagar has not been constructed so far. It is a very small bridge. A very large bridge has been constructed in Mumbai, why such a small bridge has not been constructed here? It is so sad that such a long wait for a small bridge. The way we are treated is very bad. The Government should look at us. When the disaster occurred, entire attention was paid to save the tourists and none bothered for the locals, whereas the locals have lost everything. They can't even go to their damaged houses. The Government should pay proper attention to them. They should be paid fare compensation. Their loans should be waived off. As we are aware, life in hills is very difficult. In such a situation we should not see that someone belongs to BPL and the other belongs to APL category as they have lost everything. All of them should be treated equally, whether they are rich or poor. There is no arrangement in schools or hospitals. Hospitals have neither proper doctors nor machinery. Some of the hospitals have no facility for blood test. No facilities are available for x-ray. Not only Tehri Garhwal, I demand that in the entire tragedy stricken Uttarakhand, they should be treated well and they should be given whatever they need. I want to say this also that the funds provided to the State, has not been distributed. You, too, had been there. But, I want to say that it should be fair and it should be distributed. It should be given to everyone who needs it. Help should be provided also to those who have donated everything from their houses to the needy ones. They should also be treated equally.

SHRI PRADEEP TAMTA (Almora): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am thankful to you for giving me an opportunity to speak. At the outset, I would like to thank the Hon. Prime Minister, the Hon. Chairperson of UPA, the treasury benches and also the Opposition who have stood with



the people of Uttarakhand in the hour of the crisis. Today also, the hon. Members expressed their grief over the said crisis. The said calamity was unprecedented. It has not spared any part of Uttarakhand. The calamity shattered right from the district Uttarkashi, touching Himachal Pradesh Pithoragarh district of my Lok Sabha Constituency which touches Nepal and Tibet borders. It struck the whole state at the same time. It was peak season for tourist arrival in Badrinath and Kedarnath and consequently thousands of pilgrims struck. This grave human tragedy attracted the attention of the entire country. Every year, for the last five years, I have always been apprehensive of happening something ominous during rainy season, especially in the months of June and July. In 2009, in cloud burst in Musyari which is in my constituency, 40 people were killed, 3-4 villages got washed out in Almora in 2011. In 2010, school children got buried in a school building, when it collapsed. It happened in Sumgarh-Bageshwar. Many children. Many children died therein. Last year, in cupcoat in Bageshwar in my Parliamentary Constituency tragedy struck in a village, Pothing. This year, Dharuchula-Munsiyari was cut off from rest of the world.

Today, similar condition is prevailing in whole Uttarakhand. Everybody's attention was towards the pilgrims as it was a peak season. As per the forecast of Meteorological Department Monsoon arrived 10-15 early. First spell of rain created havoc in the entire Uttarakhand. The Centre as well as the State tried to give all possible help. It was a very devastating calamity. I do not think we were prepared to face such a catastrophic tragedy. But the State Government made every possible effort. But, the question is why does calamity occur every year? Every year, we face cloud burst, landslides and tremors. It has become the common phenomena for the last 8-10 years. After all, how longer will it continue? But, we can't run away from our responsibility by saying that these are natural calamities as these contain some human content also.

This is man-made natural calamity. Both are somewhere inter-related. We need to understand about the reasons of its occurrence. The life giving rivers whether it was Ganga, Alaknanda or Kali Dhauli river in my region, all caused catastrophes. The water flows was

huge but the question is about the availability of sand, dust and mud in these rivers. Why these led to the disasters? What are the policies in this regard? We all need to contemplate in this connection. Everyone opines that Himalayas are very sensitive zone. It is a fragile zone. As per the earthquake, Himalayas fall under Zone-5. Whether we should formulate our policies based on this criteria or not? We need to have a relook on the archaic technique of roads construction. Now, since we have rescued all the people across Uttarakhand after this tragedy, the topmost priority for us is to restore the road connectivity. In my area, from Dharchula, I myself reached there on the date, 18th and this area is connected with Kailash Mansarovar, Tibet, and Nepal. The first point was Jauljibi. The distance of 20-30 kilometers from Jauljibi was covered by either on foot or by jeep intermittently. First of all, the historic foot-over bridge at Jauljibi, connecting India and Nepal, where fair is also organized every year, got washed out. After that, there is Balwakot where as you must have seen in the live telecast regarding Uttarkashi shops, 20-25 shops got washed out simultaneously in the river. The big houses of the people got washed out in the river. People of a number of villages, like Gothi beyond Balwapur, New Basti, New Sovla, Ghatta Baggar etc told us that they have been staying in the tents and will go back to their houses after two-three months. Where will they go? The entire village near Sobala Dar got washed out. The Government could not get land there to set up tents as well. When I visited Dharchula and found that there were no tents at all. I thought that people must have lodged a complaint to the Administration because we had no option except the helicopters. The four motor bridges had got washed out there. The big tents could not be carried in the helicopters. I personally visited the place and found that there was no place to set up tents. Presently, they are staying in GIC Dharchula. Me and Disaster Management Minister were present there. People said that when after three months, once situation returns to normalcy and the students of Inter College ask their college to resume the classes, where will we go.

In Ghatta Baggar, the majority of the inhabitants from weaker section have been staying temporarily in the tents set upon the forest land. They are also facing the

same problem that after two-three months of rainy season where will they take the shelter. The State Government has also sent a plan for rehabilitation. A request has been made to you in this regard and I personally request you that we need to relocate the 290-292 villages which have been identified by the State Government in Uttarakhand and the number of these villages is more than 300. The question before us is where to relocate these villages. There are two category of villages. One category of villages is the one which we have categorised as Sensitive Zone. We need to formulate a long term policy for such villages. There are some villages where people are still staying in tents. Our Government is making shelters for them but how long will they be able to stay in those shelters. The farmers and people of villages can be rehabilitated either in the hilly area of Uttarakhand or in the lowland terrains, But, if you want to rehabilitate them in those hilly areas, we need to take cognizance of the geography of that area because there is scarcity of forests and land. Approximately 1400 families of Pithoragarh are also required to be rehabilitated. State and Union Government need to think about those 1400 families. Shall we provide them with one acre land? If the farmer is not provided agricultural ,and, he will not like to be at another place. Regarding the Resettlement and Rehabilitation proposal of 8,000 crore rupees made by the State Government needs the maximum support from you, the Union Government and the Hon'ble Prime Minister. We need to formulate a holistic policy for those villages. My submission is that in the lowland teraaain of Udham Singh Nagar, over a period of time we have allotted land to various sorts of people. We have allotted land for Industry and Real-Estate. We have allotted land for the refugees of other states. The people of far-flung areas of Uttarakhand got displaced, the people of Sobla-Dar got displaced and complete village got washed out and there is no place left for their rehabilitation. They are also requesting for one acre to be given to them. The State Government can do this only with the support of the Union Government. In 1977 when I was a student, a landslide occurred in our Tawa Ghat. A village was devastated totally. 30-40 people lost their lives in this landslide, Later on, the State Government decided to relocate this village at some other place. It was rehabilitated at Sitarganj, Udham Singh Nagar. One

acre land was allotted to every person. Presently, those people are living there peacefully.

Hon'ble Speaker, through the Chair, I would like to submit that oresently connectivity is the major problem there. It will take more than 6 months to repair the complete road from Tawa Ghat to Gunji.

**21:00 hrs.**

Jeeps are plying from Dharchula to Tawa Ghat. But, in the area beyond Tawa Ghat and Dharchula where our tribals migrate for 6 months and return after 6 months; similarly the area of Johar beyond Munsyari Tehsil where our people go for 6 months, the connectivity is completely collapsed. In this regard, we spoke to BRO and our District Administration also skoke and if connectivity needs to be re-established then we need the support of Defence Ministry. in order to repair those roads, the support of helicopters is required and in this regard BRO has communicated to Defence Ministry also. In this connection, the problem of connectivity can be resolved quickly if we get support of Union Government. Without elaborating further, Sir I would like to submit one point through the Chair that in the year 2007 Hon'ble Prime Minister had said in the meeting of National Development Council that we will have to see Himalayas from the perspective of Himalayas. The requirements of Himalayas cannot be equated with rest of the country rather we need to have specific vision for Himalayas and based on this only a Task Force was constituted by the Planning Commission. Mr. B.G. Mukherjee, who was the Tribal Secretary to the Govt. of India has submitted a report to the Union Government, which is pending with Ministry of Environment and I too have a copy of that report.

Sir, In the year 1982, a Committee was constituted under the Chairmanship of Swaminathan and that Committee had also drawn attention to the fact that the policy formulation for Himalayas should be Himalayas-specific. A Committee was also constituted under the Chairmanship of Mr. S.Z. Kasim, which suggested to form a Himalayas Development Authority for the complete region of Himalayas. A new vision is required for the development of Himalayas. I would like to share with you all that the river originating from Himalayas are life-

giving rivers but we have distorted them. The dynamite is being used for the construction of roads which is proving fatal for the fragility of the mountains. The sludge and muck is there due to the 280 megawatt underground power project of NHPC which is non-functional. The power project muck did not flow away rather remained there only, and on the top of that, the water sludge and silt received through tunnel from Dang above proved detrimental to the 280 megawatt power project. We need to take care of the aspect of Power Projects in Himalayas; though we are not making dams but the explosions being carried out for the formation of tunnels are weakening the mountains. Therefore, after the dams, we also need to have a re-look on Run-of-the-River Projects.

It has been stated even in the report of the Committee that for the sensitive zones of the entire Himalayan region, we need to reconsider the model of development in that region. The technology of the road construction should be at par with the roads constructed across the world, in Europe, America, China has taken its roads to our borders and these are immune to landslide. We should construct all-weather roads there.

In the end, I would submit one more point to Hon'ble Home Minister that we have a number of several roads for connectivity; some of them are being constructed by Defence Ministry and some by Home Ministry but there has not been much progress in the pace of the construction of these roads during the last eight-ten years. There is a Munsiyari zone of 150 kilometres which is deprived of any connectivity. The connecting road of 60 kms was under construction for the last ten years but it has not yet been completed. We need to pace its speed. We need to expedite the construction of the road upto the borders of Sobla-Dar-Bailing. The road of Tawa Ghat-Gunji is being constructed from the upper side and the people have requested that if construction work from lower side is also accelerated then it will facilitate connectivity for the people. It will help the people being stranded during the rains. Presently we are dependent on the helicopters only but instead of this, we will be able to move ahead through the roads also. In this end, I would like to add one more thing that since the issue of Pilgrimage also came up, besides affecting the pilgrimage of Badrinath and Kedarnath, this tragedy has

hampered completely our Kailash Mansarovar yatra also. Across the India, Kailash Mansarovar Yatra passes through my Constituency area Tawa Ghat. During this tragedy, pilgrimage went upto Kailash via Gunji. The pilgrims used to go from Tawa ghat to Gunji on foot through roads, but Govt. of India has stopped that pilgrimage. Through the Chair, I would like to make a request to Union and State Governments that this should the Kailash Mansarovar yatra should not be stopped. That is a major source of income also for our region. Simultaneously, as long as the pedestrian roads are not repaired, the yatra can be resumed from Pithoragarh or Dharchula, since State Govt. has constructed helipad in Gunji, We have airstrip in Pithoragarh and Charchula also. For that purpose, if some sort of subsidy can be given to the pilgrims, then Kailash-Mansarovar yatra can be resumed.

With these words, I would like to express my sincere thanks to you for giving me time to speak. Again, I would express gratitude towards Union and State Government for supporting us in this hour of crisis.

[English]

\*SHRI N. PEETHAMBARA KURUP (Kollam) : I would like to express my views on the statement made by the Minister of Defence on 06.08.2013 regarding Government of India's response and measures taken for relief and reconstruction in the wake of natural disaster in Uttarakhand raised by Shrimati Sushma Swaraj on the 30th August, 2013.

The Uttarakhand tragedy is a man-made disaster of unforgivable magnitude, and not death and devastation caused by nature's fury. This unmitigated failure happened due to sand mining, stone quarrying forest cutting and construction mafias by bending or breaking about rules and regulations that strike at the ecological balance of a sensitive region. Uttarakhand Chief Minister, Vijay Bahuguna called the calamity a "Himalayan Tsunami".

The extensive death and destruction wreaked by the heavy rain, cloudbursts, flash floods and landslides in the hills of Himachal Pradesh and Uttarakhand

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table.

foremost serve to remind man how small he is compared to the power of nature.

In this connection, I would like to commend up on the exemplary search rescue and relief operations carried out by the Army, Air Force, NDRF, ITBP and SSB in Uttarakhand and Himachal Pradesh.

What we witnessed in the Himalayas in June 2013 was nature's fury that was waiting to happen. Nature has been giving us enough indications which we choose to ignore. The Himalayan zone is ecologically very sensitive zone, while rampant construction in unscientific manner has made thing worse. It is high time we strictly regulate all such construction activities to minimize damage to the hills.

*[Translation]*

\*SHRI RAJENDRA AGRAWAL (Meerut): I want to express my views on the ongoing discussion under Rule 193 regarding Uttarakhand calamity. The Hon'ble Leader of Opposition and other Hon'ble Members have elaborately apprised the house on the magnitude of this calamity, its causes and results thereof, the status of disaster management, unprecedented heroic efforts made by the Army and Defence forces in the relief work. The Hon'ble Members also discussed the current condition of Uttarakhand caused by this natural calamity and the expected efforts required to be made for immediate reconstruction of Uttarakhand. Associating myself with these views, I would like to draw attention of the House on two-three points.

First of all, the apathy of the State Government during this calamity was extremely painful and of grave concern. There were many facets of this apathy. The calamity of Uttarakhand was terrible. Due to some reasons or the other the Government failed to forecast this calamity in time. I do not want to comment on those reasons, but the government had got the information of the magnitude of this calamity by 18-19 May. The complete Kedar Valley got wiped out, the bridges got broken, numerous Innards (Dharamshalas), hotels got washed away, but the Government was so indifferent to the situation that from the day one till one to one and

half month of the calamity the Ministers of the Government kept under-estimating the loss of life. When the Speaker of Legislative Assembly of Uttarakhand gave statement about casualty of more than ten thousand people, the insensitive Head of the Government immediately refuted this statement. Hon'ble Chief Minister kept on treating the number of dead bodies recovered as the death toll. Hon'ble Speaker Madam, I failed to understand the motive of Chief Minister behind such an act. The another aspect of apathy was apparent in the arrangement of relief work. The Chief Minister was nowhere seen involved in the co-ordination, supervision or planning of the relief work. On the contrary, Chief Minister and his Government was engaged in Disaster Tourism and planning to get the pictures of their leaders printed on the relief material. This level of apathy was unfortunate.

This challenging moment of national calamity could have become a subject of national beckoning. These holy places belong to the whole country. Pilgrims across the country visit there but the narrow vision of the Union and State Governments have lost an opportunity to consolidate the whole country in this honour of distress. Volunteers from each state went for the help, but the Uttarakhand Government could not accord them their due recognition.

Uttarakhand is a special region. It needs to be deliberated upon from its geographical point of view. This is the repercussion of our unwarranted tinkering with the nature and many of the Hon'ble Members have elaborately expressed their concerns on this issue. I don't want to repeat them but it is of paramount importance that we should learn a lesson from the calamity for the future.

In the end, I would like to conclude my submission by expressing my sincere condolence for the affected families of the Uttarakhand natural calamity.

*[English]*

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I express my deep gratitude to all the distinguished Members, who have actively participated in the meaningful discussion on Uttarakhand disaster. ...*(Interruptions)*

---

\* Speech was laid on the Table.

[Translation]

SHRI ARJUN RAM MEGHWAL (Bikaner): The reply was scheduled for tomorrow. ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Reply is to be given now only. It was not scheduled for tomorrow

...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN: Shrimati Sushma Swaraj has initiated the discussion and she has immensely contributed to this debate. Her speech was insightful. She has given a graphic picture about the Uttarakhand disaster as also the aftermath of the disaster. I specially thank her for her valuable suggestions and observations.

Sir, this august House has benefited greatly from the observations made by the hon. Chairman, Shri Satpal Maharaj as also Raje Lakshmi ji and Pradeep Tamta ji. These hon. Member are coming from the State of Uttarakhand.

Sir, 16 other hon. Members have also contributed to this fruitful discussion. I thank each one of them for their contribution.

Sir, Uttarakhand disaster, as everybody has explained, is a disaster which is unprecedented, and which is beyond all imaginations. The rescue and relief operation was done under extremely hostile conditions, inclement weather and difficult terrain. Fighting against all odds, we were able to rescue 1,35,000 persons to safer places within a short span of time. This is something which we should admire and, in fact, recognize.

Sir, this massive operation is the largest operation in such heights under inclement weather and difficult terrain. It is a remarkable feat. There is no doubt about that. This is a landmark operation under such conditions and it is a world record that is being acknowledged by the world community at large.

Before I start my speech, I wish to pay homage to the known and unknown persons who have lost their lives in this harrowing disaster. The Indian Air Force, the Indian Army, ITBP, NDRF, the Border Roads Organisation, the Armed Forces Medical Services, NGOs, etc. have done

commendable role in the rescue and evacuation operations.

Sir, you know that 20 personnel of Indian Air Force as well as ITBP and NDRF personnel have sacrificed their lives in the tragic helicopter accident. You must understand that. Those people have done a commendable job during this rescue operation. Their valour, their commitment and their courage will be long remembered. I salute them for this.

Sir, the solidarity of the people is praiseworthy. In such a colossal disaster, people from all sections of society, forgetting their differences and cutting across political affiliations, came together to save their brothers. It was a Herculean task; it was a stupendous task. The world over the rescue as well as the evacuation operations were praised by one and all. It was a collective action. The Union Government, the State Government, Ministries, Departments and other agencies have put in their efforts in these rescue and evacuation operations. There was remarkable coordination in the rescue and relief operations, leaving no room for any major complaint as such.

Before I come to reply to the significant questions posed by the hon. Members, I draw the attention of this august House to the alarming trend of disasters which are taking place globally. We all know that disasters are taking place at an alarming proportion. A study by the Centre for Research on Epidemiology of Disasters, an organisation which has got direct collaboration with the World Health Organisation, indicates that in the first decade of the 20th century, there were only 73 disasters globally. Now, when it comes to the question in the first decade of the 21st century, the disasters have gone up to 4495. This is an alarming global trend and this is to be seriously addressed by each and everyone who is present here and also by those who are outside this House.

What are the reasons for increase in disasters? The reasons could be many. There will be pressure of population, interference of man with nature, global warming and as we all know climate change has also contributed to a great extent for such disasters globally. It is a fact that disasters cannot be prevented altogether. But, we will be able to reduce the risk, impact and severity

of disasters using modern technology, timely mitigation measures, constant training and capacity building, etc. In such a situation what is required is the involvement of the community in a bigger way. Then only will we be able to mitigate or reduce the intensity or severity of these calamities. This must be a continuous ongoing process.

I come to the question of Uttarakhand disaster. We all know and Maharaja knows better that the Uttarakhand calamity occurred two weeks before the monsoon set in over there. Uttarakhand received rainfall of 385.1 mm during the period from 1st June to 18th June 2013. This is against the normal rainfall of 71.3 mm and in excess by 440 percentage points; that is, five times more than the normal rainfall Uttarakhand receives. From 16th June to 18th June, it was extremely heavy rain over there. It was torrential rainfall over there. That was the condition in Uttarakhand immediately after the disaster had taken place.

A question has been raised whether the State Government has done anything after this disaster had taken place. As Smt. Mala Rajya Laxmi Shah has already pointed out, this is no time for us to indulge in blame game and we should appreciate what the State Government has done during such a calamity. I wish to inform this august House that in all such calamities the first responder will be the State Government. In this case also, on receiving the Indian Meteorological Department warning, the State Government issued advisories to all the concerned agencies; district and police administration. Announcement was made by the police at Kedarnath, Rambada, Gaurikund, alerting the general public about the disaster. The district administration stopped further movement of pilgrims. Paying heed to the announcement, a good number of pilgrims halted at Rishikesh – hon. Maharaja knows about it.

On 16th June itself, the State Government requisitioned the services of ITBP, Army, Indian Air Force, NDRF, etc. A concerted effort of these forces and the local civil officials, NGOs, etc., could evacuate more than 1.35 lakh people in the shortest possible time. That is a record.

Sir, if I do not make a mention of the great services rendered by our Indian Army, Indian Air Force as well as

our paramilitary forces, that will be a wrong thing on my part. I would like to make a mention of the services rendered by them. You all know that the Indian Air Force has done a heroic job. You will not believe that for the first two days, nobody could take off an aircraft or a helicopter for rescue operations. Against all odds, our daring and adventurous pilots, risking their lives, took off their helicopters and landed along the banks of the gushing river. They rescued 38,700 persons and 3,470 sorties have been carried out by them. That is an adventurous feat on their part. You all know that Indo-Tibetan Border Police Force guard our borders in Uttarakhand. The ITBP has rescued the largest number, 33,000 persons from difficult terrains. That is also a record.

Coming to the question of State Civil Aviation Department, they have also done their job. They rescued 13,000 people. Hon. Members know that wherever the National Disaster Response Force has been deployed, the State Government has been able to obtain the service promptly. The kind of adventure and the kind of commitment that they have shown in the past is commendable. They have rescued 9,500 persons. The Nehru Institute of Mountaineering in Uttarkashi, about which some of the hon. Members have already made a mention, was able to rescue 6,500 persons. It is not a small thing.

All the hon. Members were mentioning about the relief camps. I would like to tell that 69 relief camps had been set up for 1,51,080 persons. Some camps, as you all know, are still running for local residents. Food, medicine, kerosene, blankets and other essential commodities or items were supplied either by way of air-dropping or by land.

A Missing Persons Cell, that is to be admired, was set up in the capital of Uttarakhand. It was working in the most professional manner. All the scientists, officials as also the NGOs, who had gone over there, saw for themselves how it was working and they were all in praise of this Missing Persons Cell. You all must bear this in mind.

Sir, a sum of rupees five lakh has been declared to be given to the next of the kin of the dead or feared to be dead or missing. The next of kin of 113 dead persons

and 818 missing persons have been granted ex gratia so far. The rest of the people will also be given money. Whenever we get a clearance certificate or verification certificate from the concerned State Government. Immediately on receiving that, we will be paying the ex gratia amount to the tune of rupees five lakh to the next of the kin of the deceased or missing persons. In this amount of rupees five lakh, rupees two lakh are being given by the hon. Prime Minister from the Prime Minister National Relief Fund, Rs. 1.5 lakh are coming from National Disaster Response Fund and Rs. 1.5 lakh are coming from the kitty of the State Government.

Sir, every hon. Member was asking about the road connectivity. Border Roads Organisation and PWD have to reconstruct 1,956 roads which are totally destroyed because of the flash floods and fury of the nature. Of these, 1,681 roads have been opened for vehicular traffic. I do not claim or say that pucca roads have been constructed over there. No, it is not possible. Still heavy rain is going on there, inclement weather is there and climate is very bad. Since adverse climatic conditions are prevailing over there, it is not possible to construct pucca roads, but temporary roads have been constructed over there. Normal vehicular traffic has been disrupted on 271 roads. We are seized of the matter. The mule tracks are also to be reconstructed, about which Maharaja was telling me yesterday. The work of reconstruction of mule tracks as well as foot tracks is hampered due to heavy monsoon as also recurring landslides. Time frame has been fixed for BRO and PWD by the Government of India and the State Government for opening of mule tracks, jeepable and motorable roads in some major sectors.

Coming to the question of power supply, in 3,758 habitations, power supply was totally disrupted due to the disaster. Normal power supply was restored in 3,741 habitations; 17 habitations are without normal electricity still. We have alerted the State Government. The State Government is doing its best, but because of the inclement weather, it is not possible for them to provide electricity to the rest of the habitations.

Coming to the question of drinking water, drinking water supply has been disrupted in 968 habitations. It has been restored in 950 habitations; eighteen habitations

are without water supply and that is a major matter. We have taken up the matter with the State Government to provide water as early as possible. They have reported back that because of the difficult terrain and inclement weather, it is not possible for them to provide water over there.

Coming to the communication network, you all know that immediate point-to-point communication by telephone was established in Kedarnath, Badrinath and Harsil. More than 100 satellite phones, somebody has been referring to the satellite phones, have been provided to various Central and State Government agencies immediately after the disaster.

Coming to the question of tourism, which is the mainstay and the backbone of the people over there, in order to augment the livelihood of the people, Uttarakhand Tourism is planning to conduct a study – that is exactly what everybody was, in fact, informing the House – on carrying capacity of various tourist destinations in the State. Uttarakhand Tourism is also planning to evolve regulation, registration system to control tourists' movement with biometric support at all important points. This was one demand raised by the hon. Members. It is also planned to ask the Tour Operators to get the tourists insured before entering Uttarakhand.

Sir, I have contacted the Minister of Tourism the other day. He has sanctioned an amount to the tune of Rs. 100 crore as a special package for the development of tourism infrastructure over there.

Now, I am coming to the services being rendered by the Union Government immediately after getting the information about this gruesome disaster. Sir, the Government of India has promptly mobilised all the Ministries and agencies to supplement the efforts of the State Government. I have already mentioned about the services being rendered by the Army, Indian Air Force and the Paramilitary forces in this great crisis.

The National Crisis Management Committee, you all know, has coordinated all the efforts with the Central Government agencies in concert with the State Government. The hon. Prime Minister Dr. Manmohan Singh as also the Chairperson of the UPA Shrimati Sonia Gandhi have paid visit to Uttarakhand on 19th June itself.

The Prime Minister on reaching over there announced an amount to the tune of Rs. 1,000 crore to the hapless people of Uttarakhand. The hon. Home Minister Shri Sushilkumar Shinde, who is sitting here, visited Uttarakhand twice – on 22nd June and on 28th June. He has gone over there to have a special meeting with the hon. Chief Minister of Uttarakhand as also senior officers there. He reviewed the relief and rehabilitation activity over there. Although he is my senior, I know that what he has done from the Home Ministry's side. Throughout the crisis, he was the person who was monitoring the activities, while sitting in the office in North Block.

Sir, in view of the magnitude of the calamity, a Cabinet Committee under the hon. Prime Minister has been constituted, we are all aware of that, for providing broad guidelines for expeditious rehabilitation and reconstruction. The Inter-Ministerial Group under the Cabinet Secretary is drawing up a time-bound action plan for reconstruction of Uttarakhand.

Sir, a member of NDMA, who was the former Secretary of the Home Ministry, has been specially deputed to go over there and coordinate the activities of the State Government and Union Government in a perfect manner. I would like to make it clear that his service was commendable.

Sir, the Government of India supplemented the efforts of the State Government with 80 doctors, 11 psychiatrists and public health team with required equipments.

Another important thing which I would like to place on record is this. It is commendable that there has not been any outbreak of epidemic or infectious disease despite the death of numerous people and animals. That is also a record. An inter-ministerial team has been sent by no less a person than our hon. Home Minister, who is sitting here. They have visited Uttarakhand to make an on the spot assessment of the loss over there. The team has submitted its report. It was discussed in the Inter-Ministerial group led by the Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs. It now has gone to the High Level Committee; that High Level Committee is led by no less than a person than our Agriculture Minister Shri Sharad Pawar, wherein our hon. Home Minister, Finance Minister and Vice-

Chairman of the Planning Commission are the other Members. They have assessed the gravity of the situation and from the National Disaster Relief Fund, they have announced an amount to the tune of Rs. 1,187.87 crore to the State of Uttarakhand.

Sir, the Cabinet Committee under the Chairmanship of our Prime Minister is examining long-term rehabilitation of Uttarakhand. You all know that the Planning Commission is the nodal department to coordinate the Central Government assistance to State for medium and long-term rehabilitation and reconstruction of infrastructure as well as for the livelihood package. An external assistance package is being worked out –it is for the information and benefit of the hon. Members from Uttarakhand, by the State Government with the support of the World Bank, Asia Development Bank and International Fund for Agriculture Development with the coordination of Department of Economic Affairs under the Ministry of Finance.

Sir, a mention has been made by some Members about the Indian Meteorological Department's warning at the time of this crisis. We all know that the main responsibility of the IMD is forecasting the weather. That warning is of general nature and you all must understand that. Some misunderstandings have been created that IMD has given a warning about this sort of flash flood and disaster and all that. No such information was given by the Indian Meteorological Department. I had a discussion with the scientists of the Department yesterday and day before. They gave me information about that general warning of heavy to very heavy rain on 15th and 16th of June, 2013. Sir, immediately after getting information, as I mentioned earlier, the State Government alerted all agencies to be on their toes and they have done their maximum at that particular point of time. Sir, monsoon as I said, set in Uttarakhand, two weeks early. Pilgrims had already reached higher levels before warning could be issued. When the catastrophe struck on 16th and 17th, it was humanly impossible to evacuate a single person because of continuous inclement weather and difficult terrain.

Sir, we need to improve and we need to examine the technical feasibilities of enhancing our capabilities and scientific organisations. In this connection, I would like to



say that the Ministry of Earth Sciences has decided to go in for Mountain Meteorological Services and Integrated Himalayan Meteorological Service. Under this project, nine Doppler weather radars are proposed for the fragile Himalaya region alone. The IMD has already prepared a comprehensive proposal for about Rs. 360 crore for Integrated Himalayan Meteorological Programme.

Sir, I made a mention about the Missing Persons Cell. This Missing Persons Cell – is in fact functioning in a most professional manner. I already mentioned about it. They collected details from various districts, States sources like E-mails, websites, SMS, police department, call data from different towers, between 14th and 19th June, 2013, from and to pilgrims mobiles were traced for cross-checking last calls with date, time and location. What all information is there with the Missing Persons Cell, is an accurate information. We are collecting more information from the centres. We will have fool-proof information about the number of persons who have lost their lives or are missing. The information as on 27th July, 2013 reflects 5,359 persons as missing which includes 4,421 pilgrims from other States and 938 local residents. 91 Nepali citizens are also missing. We are very seriously collecting the details about the missing persons. About 396 bodies have been cremated. ...*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

SHRI RAJENDRA AGARWAL: How long will they be treated as missing?...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him complete his point of view. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI RAJENDRA AGARWAL: How long will they be treated as missing?...*(Interruptions)* I acknowledge that Hon. Minister is standing...*(Interruptions)* how long will they be treated as missing...*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MR. CHAIRMAN : He is talking about the death certificates.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN: I will come to that...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is coming to that. Please have patience.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN: About 396 bodies have been cremated by the police with full honour and rituals after DNA sampling. Some bodies were cremated by the villagers because de-composed bodies were scattered here and there. A number of bodies were washed in the gushing waters. Many are presumed to be buried under debris.

Coming to the question of national disaster management, every Member, almost all the Members have in fact, expressed their apprehensions. ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Minister, he has a very relevant question.

SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN: What is it about?

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is regarding issuing of the death certificates to the missing persons.

...*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

SHRI RAJENDRA AGARWAL: There is one more point...*(Interruptions)* It is a matter pertaining to their business or something relating such as houses etc....*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am speaking the same thing.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI ARJUN RAM MEGHWAL: There is one more issue in this. Uttarakhand Government is not issuing Death Certificate. ...*(Interruptions)* They say that Death Certificate will be issued by the concerned State Government. ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Uttarakhand Government can not issue Death Certificate. That will be issued by the concerned State Government only.

...*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Minister, they have a question

regarding the issuance of a death certificate for the persons who are missing.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RADHE MOHAN SINGH (Ghazipur): Hon'ble Speaker, the issue of missing persons is related to every state ....(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is fine. Hon'ble Minister has heard your point of view. He will furnish the reply.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Could you throw some light on this?

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. He is coming to that. Please be seated.

...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. CHAIRMAN: You please sit down. The Hon. Minister is giving a reply. He has got hold of your sentiments

...(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN: Sir, I can collect the information and provide to the Members. I will pass it on to the hon. Members....(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is a technical question. When will the persons who are missing, be treated as dead? The persons who are missing, when will the Government issue death certificates to them? That is the question.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE): Inquiry is still going on by the State Government, the Police and the local authorities. As soon as all information is collected, we will direct the State Government to carry out this information and do it quickly within two, three months....(Interruptions)

SHRI ARJUN RAM MEGHWAL : Who will issue the death certificate?...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE: If a person belonging to Gujarat or Rajasthan goes missing, a report will be filed at the police station....(Interruptions). A report will be filed that the person had gone on pilgrimage. Thereupon, they will get it verified from the police, only then he will be considered as missing. They will not accept the certificate without that...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Minister, it is the sentiment of the Hon. Members that they should be provided help on compassionate ground.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Hon. Minister has given reply.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay, I understand. Hon. Minister has been telling that he will act upon it when the information is given.

...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has the answer now. Please be seated. He will now give the answer.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions)...\*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him speak. Let the Minister speak.

[Translation]

SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE: They can give it, but in this process some wrong people can come under the ambit thereof. Therefore, before providing rupees 5 lakhs we have to make complete investigations. We will instruct the State Governments to provide the record of all the missing persons as the Minister of State has told clearly. Not only this, we are also collecting DNA reports. The weather is inclement on that side. Mr. Chairman,

\*Not recorded.

Sir, you belong to that area and you know very well that helicopters do not land there. We don't know how many people are trapped under the debris. As soon as the rain halts we will excavate the area. Mr. Chairman, Sir, you know it very well that the JCBs cannot be sent through the ordinary helicopter 17. We have requisitioned the 126 special planes. We have also de-assembled the parts and will sent that plane to the Kedarnath where it will be assembled again and then we will start the excavation. The work is going on. Please have patience ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon'ble Minister, the main concern of the Members is with regard to the certificate so that their problems are resolved and their children can get employment on the compassionate grounds. As regards compensation they will accept that the individual has died.

...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE: Whenever a body is recovered from the debris we collect its DNA...*(Interruptions)* and whenever we get any identification mark we write to the State Government on its basis and if it gets tallied, there is no problem in providing help...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Hon'ble Minister is speaking, please listen to him.

...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. Let the Minister speak.

...*(Interruptions)\**

[Translation]

SHRI RAVINDRA KUMAR PANDEY (Giridih): ...*(Interruptions)* If you say so I will give it in writing. ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay, you give it in writing.

...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN: I am coming to that point. There is no need to wait for seven years. The Registrar General of India has given a detailed circular. Death certificate will be issued by Uttarakhand officers based on the inquiry report from the respective States. That is all. There ends the matter.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. That is done.

SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN: Coming to the question of the National Disaster Management Authority, disaster preparedness, and the Disaster Management Act of 2005, every single Member has mentioned this point. Everybody is apprehensive of the functions being carried out by NDMA.

In this connection I wish to inform the august House that in the year 2011 a task force was constituted by Government of India to study the functioning of the National Disaster Management Authority as also the National Disaster Management Act of 2005, as also the disaster preparedness of this country. The task force has already submitted its report last April and we are examining the report. We will definitely be coming out with very positive steps in this connection. The task force recommends restructuring of NDMA and amending the Disaster Management Act, apart from other matters.

Some Members have expressed concern about the fragile ecology and environment of Uttarakhand. This is a very serious matter and I fully share the sentiments of the hon. Members about the ecologically fragile nature of Uttarakhand. The Government of India is seriously seized of the matter. The Central and the State Governments in fact have sensitized all the agencies to involve the stakeholders in preservation of ecological balance, forest cover and planned development.

**21.39 hrs**

(DR. M. THAMBIDURAI *in the Chair*)

The revered Himalayas is one of the youngest mountain ranges on the planet. It is home to one of the richest biodiversities of the world. It is the 'water tower' of the world. It is very critical for 40 per cent of humanity. Therefore, we are sensitizing the State Government and

---

\*Not recorded.

we are sensitizing all the Ministries. The Environment Ministry has been contacted. Every other Department has been alerted and sensitized. They have been apprised of the importance of the ecology of the fragile Himalayas.

Coming to the question of Char Dham, we all know that Char Dham consist of Gangotri, Yamunotri, Kedarnath and Badrinath. Puja was unaffected at the three Dhams except Kedarnath. It has been decided that Kedarnath temple will also be restored and daily puja will be commenced on 11th September, 2013.

Coming to the foot bridge on River Mandagini at Shri Kedarnath Ji has been constructed. It is planned to be replaced by iron bridge by 10th September 2013. The bridge on Mandagini at Rambada is also expected to be completed by 10th September 2013. The road connectivity up to Soneprayag has been restored. The pedestrian route from Soneprayag to Rambada is nearing completion. The pedestrian route from Rambada to Kedarnath is also to be restored by 10th September 2013. As I said, the regular pooja at Kedarnath will be resumed on 11th September 2013.

Sir, as I have already mentioned, the primary responsibility in any disaster lies with the State Government. The Central Government provides necessary logistic and financial support to the State Government. As disasters are becoming more and more complex due to large ecological global environmental changes, the disaster management, as all the hon. Members shared the view, needs continuous upgradation. I wish to mention that the response to the Uttarakhand disaster was tremendous. All, irrespective of the differences, came together to save maximum number of people – 1,35,000 people have been evacuated and rescued. It comes from our observation that we need to further strengthen and augment the disaster management mechanism. The report of the task force is, as I said, under the examination of the Government of India. We will come out with an action plan as early as possible. I place on record my deep gratitude to the hon. Members who have taken part in this discussion. I am sure that the State Disaster Management Plans and the National Disaster Management Plans will take into account the learnings from Uttarakhand so that the systems are

improved significantly and the losses due to the natural calamities are reduced to the minimum.

Sir, our dream is to build a disaster-resilient India. That would be the true homage that we can pay to the people who lost their lives in this horrendous disaster.

---

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN : Now, we shall take up 'Zero Hour'.

[Translation]

SHRI KAPIL MUNI KARWARIA (Phoolpur) : Hon'ble Chairman, I would like to draw the attention of the Government to the floods which have ravaged the urban areas of Allahabad including dozens of mohallas like Salori-Shivkuti, Chota Bhaghada, Beligaon, Bhardwajpuram, Rasulabad, Jodhwala Bakshi Daraganj, Meorabad, Umarpur-Neeva, and the rural areas like Karehada, Asarawal, Phulwa, Bisona including Mubarakpur, Fatehpur, Peerdallu, Ahmadpur, Rangpura, Mansaeta, Jagdishpur, etc of Sohraun tehsil and Badra, Sonauti, Dhokri, Paremberur, Leelapurkala, Dakshini Kotwa, Kakara, Jamunipur, Leelapurkhurd, Belwar, Tiwaripur of Phulpur tehsil. The public life has come to a halt, a few houses of these villages have submerged upto two-three storeys and people are compelled to live on their roof tops. A majority of the rural population has migrated. Several houses in the urban and rural areas have got buried.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Ganga and Yamuna rivers have been flowing above danger mark for the past one and half months, due to which the floods have not receded. Several houses have got damaged. Several people have lost their lives and thousands of houses have got damaged because of being inundated for the last one and half month. The crop of the farmers spread in thousands of acres of land has got damaged. The condition is pitiable and they are living on the verge of starvation. The fodder for cattle is a big problem and the cattle are dying because of the non-availability of the fodder.

Mr. Chairman, the State Government has set up

the flood relief centres to deal with the fury of floods, but these centres lack basic facilities like pure drinking water, food and toilet, etc. The State Government has not made arrangement for boats due to which people are marooned. There is so much mismanagement in the flood relief camps that a pig got hold of a child in a camp located in the Anie Besant's School and he was saved after much effort. The people whose houses have got damaged should be given compensation. The farmers should be given compensation at the rate of Rs. 10,000 per acre. It is feared that an epidemic can strike the area. Therefore, arrangement should be sprinkle the anti-epidemic chemicals in the area. At the end, I, through you, would like to demand that a new embankment should be built on the banks of Ganga and Yamuna rivers.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN : I would request the hon. Members to be very brief as many Members are interested in making submissions during the 'Zero Hour'. You please mention only the points.

SHRI JAGDANAND SINGH (Buxar): The Western Bihar, mainly its Buxar and Bhojpur districts are worst affected areas by floods. Millions of people have been marooned for the past two months. The rains which struck Uttarakhand have also submerged the entire Eastern UP and Bihar. More than the volume of water, it is the longer duration of floods which is a major cause of concern. We have never seen that the water of Ganges have affected the people continuously for two months. People along with their cattle have taken shelter on the embankments. There is no means of transport available. The labourers have got no employment. The standing kharif crop of the farmers has been destroyed. You cannot even imagine the magnitude of problem which we have been facing. The attention of the entire country has been drawn to Uttarakhand but if the Government of India had thought that this water would ultimately go down to the ocean through Uttar Pradesh, Bihar and Bengal. The efforts being made by the Government of Bihar with its limited resources are not sufficient for the people. People have to ferry their patients upto four kilometers to get medicines. In the absence of any employment people are starving. There is no fodder available for their

livestock. The diseases are numerous. You cannot even imagine our problems. All blocks of Buxar namely Semari block, Chausa, Brahmpur and Chakki etc have been submerged. The tributaries of the Ganga like Thora, Mehssa, Dharmavati, Gagia have got substantial amount of water. No doubt it is the duty of the State Government to provide relief but I would like to request the State Government that both the Centre and the States should coordinate their efforts for disaster management. I request the Government of India to intervene in this matter and help the people of the State, otherwise it will be impossible to save the people and their livestock. We have to make arrangements to provide fodder, medicine and will also have to deal with the effects of the situation once the floods recede.

SHRI PULIN BIHARI BASKE (Jhargram): Mr. Chairman, Sir, a tribal woman has been raped at Banaghat in district Jalpaiguri of West Bengal. This incident happened in the evening of 27th August. I had been trying to raise the issue on the floor of the House and I request to grant me some more time as I have got an opportunity today.

Everybody knows that Delhi is the most unsafe place for women but it has been proved now that Bengal particularly Kolkata and Jalpaiguri are the most unsafe places for women. Now West Bengal has taken number one position in this regard instead of NCR. You know that an incident has happened in Kamdhuni and a tribal boy has been murdered in Katua. An incident has happened in Kharagpur also but Jalpaiguri Police failed to apprehend the culprit. The condition of victim is very critical. His backbone has been broken and he is facing difficulty in speaking. There is an Act also for prevention of atrocities on SC, and ST and tribals which was passed in 1989 and that too has been enacted. I demand compensation for them and demand that police should take immediate action in this matter and culprit should be arrested. The girl who is the victim of injustice should get relief and adequate compensation. This matter should be considered seriously....(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN : All right, you send the slip.

...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shrimati Susmita Bauri is permitted to associate herself with the issue raised by Dr. P. Baske during the 'Zero Hour'.

[Translation]

SHRI SATPAL MAHARAJ (Garhwal): Sir, I would like to draw the attention of this House towards trained 'Shiksha Mitra' of Uttarakhand. Sir there 'Shiksha Mitra' are regularly rendering their services to different schools of the State for the last 8-10 years. Now their services are to be adjusted as Assistant Teachers. The 'Shiksha Mitra' who have been appointed and got appointment letters prior to 22 August, 2010 need not to fulfil the condition of T.E.T. then why they are being put in a situation of dilemma by repeatedly raising this matter.

I would also like to say that the trained Gurrillas of Uttarakhand should be adjusted in the N.D.R.F. being raised for disaster management in the state so that services of those trained 'Gurrillas' could be utilised in the event of disaster in the state.

The honorarium of 'Asha Workers' should be increased and 'Anganwadi' workers should get increased number of leaves and honorarium. Sir, I request the Central Government that there is no compulsion of T.E.T. for 'Shiksha Mitra' who were appointed before 22 August, 2010 to become Assistant Teachers. This should be made clear to them.

[English]

SHRI ANTO ANTONY (Pathanamathitta): Sir, I thank you for giving me this opportunity.

I request the Government to revoke the recent circular of the National Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development (NABARD), which has adverse impact on the Primary Agricultural Credit Societies (PACS) and farmers in the country. The circular seeks to transfer the assets of Primary Agricultural Credit Societies to District Cooperative Banks so that the former may function as a business correspondent to the latter.

The cooperative movement in India was started with an aim to encourage and promote thrift and mutual help among the farmers in the country and to protect farmers from the exploitation of the money lenders. Keeping in

view these objectives, the Primary Agricultural Credit Societies were formed under the Cooperative Societies Act of 1904. These credit societies are easily accessible to the farmers in the country than the Nationalized and Scheduled Banks do. Today, the Primary Agricultural Credit Societies are not only playing a major role in protecting the farmers from the exploitation of the money lenders but also they are doing the best in availing seeds and fertilizers in a reasonable price and also procuring food grains by ensuring maximum returns to the farmers. The Primary Agricultural Credit Societies are finding their financial resources for these farmers' supportive programmes from the reasonable interests collected from the agricultural loans. If the NABARD circular is implemented, then the Primary Agricultural Credit Societies will not be able to grant agricultural loans and their income would be confined to only one per cent commission allocated by the District Cooperative Banks. The Primary Agricultural Credit Societies cannot sustain in such a condition and the fading of them will ultimately affect the agricultural sector in the country as a whole.

Therefore, I would request the Government to kindly protect the interests of the farmers in the country by revoking the recent circular on the Primary Agricultural Credit Societies issued by the NABARD.

[Translation]

SHRI RAVINDRA KUMAR PANDEY (Giridih): Sir, through you, I would like to demand from the Government of India that there are 16 Panchayats in Beriadih Colliery under Giridih Lok Sabha constituency of Kolanchal area and after the commencement of Panchayati Raj System no work under MNREGA has been done till date in these 16 Panchayats and no Panchayat Bhawan has been built. No Dalit family has been provided Indira Awas also. People there say that no work can be done there due to non issuing to NOC. The fact is that Police line was built there, Park and Guest House were built and many other projects of Jharkhand Government were started there. But when the matter of Indira Awas for Dalit families and Panchayat Bhawan comes, officers of Coal India put objections to these. I request you that immediate action should be taken in this matter so that the people may be benefitted, otherwise the Panchayat should be disbanded.

SHRI S. SEMMALAI (Salem): Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir, for giving me this opportunity. The subject matter relate to the National Highways Authority of India (NHAI). Salem city in Tamil Nadu, which has the population of 8.5 lakhs, is facing severe drinking water problem. The Tamil Nadu Government under the leadership of hon. Puratchi Thalaivi Amma is now implementing a special drinking water scheme to provide safe and clean drinking water to the people of Salem city. The work of laying pipeline is in progress. Nearly 90 per cent work has been completed. The remaining work is pending because of the delay in giving permission by the NHAI. Salem Municipal Corporation has sent a proposal to the NHAI seeking its permission for laying pipeline across the NH-7 at one point near Karuppur, along the Service Road for a short distance. Local officers of the NHAI, the Project Director at Salem, Chief General Manager at Chennai have also recommended. Salem Municipal Corporation was asked to deposit an amount of Rs.5.5 crore, which the Corporation has agreed to remit the amount but the permission is yet to be accorded.

As the Member of the Parliamentary Constituency, I represented the matter several times. Considering the importance and urgency, the hon. Minister of Road Transport and Highways may be pleased to expedite the matter and direct the NHAI to grant permission for laying the pipeline as early as possible.

[Translation]

SHRI HARSH VARDHAN (Maharajganj, U.P.): Sir, I would like to draw your attention towards a very important subject.

There was come non-combatant enrolled category in the Indian Armed Forces after Independence. With the passage of time this non-combatant enrolled category people were given a status of sepoy in Army and Navy and they were given rupees two thousand as military pay. There are three wings of Indian Armed Forces. It is a matter of regret that this was implemented in two wings Army and Navy but 12 thousand non-combatant enrolled persons have not been given status of sepoy in the Air Force till date and military service pay is also not given. Two wings of Armed Forces of the same country is being

given a facility but one wing is deprived of it. There are only 12 thousand such persons in Air Force. There is great resentment in the Air Force due to this. Personnels may not be expressing it but there is resentment among MR. CHAIRMAN them, this should be kept in mind and Air Force personnel should also be provided this facility.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal, Shri Rajendra Aggrawal, Shri Dilip Gandhi and Shri A.T. Nana Patil associate themselves with the matter raised by Shri Harsh Vardhan.

SHRI IYARAJ SINGH (Kota): Sir, today, about 65 percent of the people of country reside in rural areas. Even today most of the roads in the villages are dirt roads (Kachi Sarak). There is no proper drainage of water causing mud on the roads.

**22.00 hrs.**

When there is dirt road or muddy road near school the students face great difficulty in reaching their school particularly when there is rainy season, this becomes more difficult. I would like to put forward before the House and Government that that such a planning should be done that metalled roads are made in the villages particularly near schools.

SHRI PURNAMASI RAM (Gopalganj): Mr. Chairman, Sir, a Railway Bridge cum road was constructed from Bigha in Bihar to connect Panihawan, Uttar Pradesh. N.H. 28B road was constructed which goes to Panihawan of Uttar Pradesh and Padrona from Bagha. Earlier this land was with Forest Department, therefore Railway purchased an alternate land near Madanpur and planted trees on that. Even after that, forest department unjustifiably put objections on it and did not allow repair work on that road. It is in a very bad condition and daily accidents occur there and people get killed.

Through you, I would like to demand from the hon'ble Transport Minister that some solution regarding immediate repair work of that road should be provided so that frequent accidents do not occur there and people have easy and safe way for commutation.

[English]

DR. SANJEEV GANESH NAIK (Thane): Mr.

Chairman, Sir, I would like to draw the attention of the Central Government, through you, and particularly the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways to a matter of urgent public importance relating to four laning of Panvel-Indapur (84 km.) section which is included in NHDP-III and awarded by the National Highways Authority of India. The remaining length of this section between Indapur and Zarap (366.170 km.) stretch is included in NHDP-IV requires urgent four laning due to heavy traffic on the highway. The hon. Minister of Road Transport and Highways has been urged by the hon. Chief Minister of Maharashtra to include this stretch under NHDP-IV during the meeting held on 21st September, 2011 at Mumbai. Accordingly, the stretch is included under NHDP-IV vide Ministry's letter dated 26th September, 2011. The MoU for appointing the State PWD as the implementing agency and preparing the feasibility report has also been submitted to the Ministry by the State PWD and signing of MoU is solicited. The approval of feasibility report is required to enable the State PWD to process LA estimates for financial approval.

Sir, the compliance report is submitted to the Central Government on 16.10.2012 regarding the issues raised by the Ministry on the feasibility report on four laning of National Highway No. 17 from Indapur to Zarap. So, I request the Government that this project should be implemented as soon as possible as this is a very important stretch of the National Highway No. 17.

[Translation]

SHRI DEORAJ SINGH PATEL (Rewa): Mr. Chairman Sir, Last day Saipur police station incharge in my Parliamentary Constituency Rewa, Madhya Pradesh...\*

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: The names will be deleted from the record.

[Translation]

SHRI DEORAJ SINGH PATEL (Rewa): He threatens the poor people of Rewa and harass them. He shot Gauribaria...\* for not giving him bride.

---

\*Not recorded as order by the Chair.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Names will not go on record. Please don't mention any name.

[Translation]

SHRI DEORAJ SINGH PATEL (Rewa): After shooting them they were taken to hospital and authorities of the hospitals also could not manage to extract the bullet from their body upto one week. I visited them in the hospital. I saw that both of them were crying with pain. When I reached there the , the authorities gave them injection. When I came back from there, they were left without any treatment. After that they were put in Jail.

Sir, through you I would like to know that as to whether the police station incharge had any warrant pertaining to their arrest from any court. Secondly, I would like to know that whether he was given any right to shoot by any competent officer. I would like to demand through this House that Justice should be provided to them.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN : It is a State subject. Shri Arjun Meghwal. Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions)...\*

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is a State subject.

[Translation]

SHRI ARJUN RAM MEGHWAL (Bikaner): Sir, I am going to raise an important issue through you. University Grants Commission grants recognition to different universities of the country under section 12b of UGC Act. There is one case of Maharaja Ganga Singh University situated at Bikaner Headquarter in my Parliamentary Constituency area Bikaner. The Board of Management of University has recommended for recognition of case under Section 12b. After that the State Government of Rajasthan also recommended through a letter for the recognition to UGC. When the Governor came to Bikaner then we met him with a delegation and he also sent a recommendation letter of UGC. Through you, I would like to say that this issue wal also raised under Matters under rule 377 and thereafter, a team of the Ministry of Human

---

\*Not recorded.



Resource Development went to Bikaner. The team conducted the inspection and has said that the University is equipped with all the necessary facilities.

Through you, I would like to request the Ministry of Human Resource Development to grant recognition to Maharaja Ganga Singh University located at Bikaner under Section 12B of the UGC so as to facilitate all the students of Bikaner division to pursue higher education.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I am having a list of number of speakers, therefore, you have to cooperate with me. So, you may please take one minute each and if you take more time I will not be in a position to accommodate all of you and that will not form part of the record. That is why I would request you to be brief do that I can accommodate all of you. Shri Mahendra Singh Chauhan.

[Translation]

SHRI MAHENDRASINH P. CHAUHAN (Sabarakantha): Sir, I thank you for giving me time to express my view point. My Parliamentary Constituency Sabarakantha is a dalit and tribal dominated area. Most of my area's population depends on agriculture and animal husbandry for earning their livelihood. Even after a lapse of 67 years of independence, not even a single public sector enterprise has been set up in this area. The youth of my constituency migrate to various parts of cities in search of employment where they are compelled to live a hellish life due to which villages are getting emptied.

Sir, this area is deprived of development till date. Apart from some private industries, no public sector undertaking has been set up here till date. Besides, basic facilities like road, water and electricity etc., labour force is also available at cheaper rates but despite this it is astonishing that this area is not industrially developed.

Sir, through you, my request to the Government is that immediate steps may be taken for industrial development of this area.

SHRI RAJENDRA AGRAWAL (Meerut): Sir, I am thankful that you have given me an opportunity to speak.

I have expressed my concern several times in the House regarding cross border terrorism, and the message regarding various measures being taken by the Government has also been flashed in the entire country. However, I would like to draw the attention of the House and the Government towards serious negligence committed on the border of the country while importing commodities. Container scanners are used at major ports of the world so that the commodities being exported or imported can be identified without opening the container. Such scanner is installed only at Mumbai port in our country. I had visited Wagah Border between India and Pakistan near Amritsar almost three months ago in the month of May. The movement of large number of trucks takes place there but no container scanner is there.

Sir, India provides safe roads for containers heading towards Nepal. The custom department of India does not check such containers on the way from Kolkata port till Nepal.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: What do you want from the Government, please tell me? Do not quote others, please.

[Translation]

SHRI RAJENDRA AGRAWAL: Sir, I would like to conclude after saying two sentences. We all have the information about the use of Nepal route by the terrorists for the operation of their activities. It is a great matter of concern that scanners are not fixed for the containers going to Nepal.

I request through you that container scanners should be installed at every place of movement at the borders of the country so that no unwanted or unauthorised items could come into the country and could be checked.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Arjun Ram Meghwal associate himself with the matter raised by Shri Rajendra Agrawal ji.

[English]

\*SHRI RAVNEET SINGH (Anandpur Sahib) : Sir, a language or a mother-tongue unites the people speaking

\* English translation of the Speech originally delivered in Punjabi.

that language. It serves as a bonding-link among its speakers. Punjabi is a rich language spoken in about 70 countries of the world by around 15 crore people. However, it is unfortunate that step-motherly treatment is being meted out to Punjabi in Chandigarh – the capital of Punjab. It is being discriminated against in this city.

Sir, Chandigarh city of today was built only by displacing people of 28 villages of Punjab. The mother-tongue of the residents of these 28 villages was Punjabi. The mother-tongue of a majority of people residing in Chandigarh today is also Punjabi or Hindi. However, the Chandigarh administration has accorded official language status to English, ignoring these facts and the ground-reality. Sir, constitutional norms have been violated by the Chandigarh administration in this regard. It is also an injustice to the 11 lakh residents of Chandigarh. As per our constitution, only the mother-tongue of the residents of a particular area can be accorded the status of official language over there.

Sir, I would like to ask the powers-that-be as to how they have accorded English as the official language of Chandigarh despite the fact that there is not a single person in Chandigarh whose mother-tongue is English?

Sir, in this august House today, I urge upon the Central Government to immediately accord Punjabi the status of official language of Chandigarh. The Government must put an immediate end to the step-motherly treatment being meted out to Punjabi in Chandigarh.

*[Translation]*

SHRI RAJARAM PAL (Akbarpur): Mr. Chairman, Sir, thank you very much that you have given me an opportunity to speak. Today, land of farmers is being acquired in the whole country in the name of development, but farmers are not being provided compensation in lieu of that. No member of their family is being provided job in any industry. Rail-road, transport and any other department. A new rail line is being laid for Rail freight train in my Parliamentary Constituency Akbarpur Dehat due to which thousands of farmers have been affected. Some farmers are affected with 1/4 of their land and someone is affected with 1/3 and someone with total land in that Rail line project. Only few amount

of money is being given in the name of compensation. In my opinion the compensation which is being given should be given on the basis of estimation for the next fifty years and one member of each affected families and their dependents should be provided job as it was provided in the case of affected farmers of Raibreyilly Coach Factory. I wrote a letter to hon'ble Railway Minister, hon. Chairperson of UPA Sonia ji also and apprised them about the matter. The farmer of my area are agitating and sitting on 'Dharna' and demonstrating. Therefore, through you I would like to demand from Hon. Railway Minister that our farmers should be provided compensation on the lines of Rail Coach Factory Raibreyilly.

*[English]*

SHRI S.S. RAMASUBBU (Tirunelveli): Mr. Chairman, Sir, more than 1500 students of the prestigious Indian School of Mines (ISM), Dhanbad are observing their peaceful demonstration at Jantar Mantar from 2<sup>nd</sup> September onwards. Their need is conversion of the institute, ISM, into IIT (Indian Institute of Technology). It is the best institute in Asia. Now it has become a full-fledged engineering institute with branches such as computer science, electrical, electronics, mechanical; all the courses are there.

The proposal of conversion has been passed in Jharkhand State Assembly also. National Development Council, Planning Commission also accepted this one. The Governor of Jharkhand also sent the letter to the Central Government to convert this institute into an IIT during September, 2009.

Sir, this institute has all the infrastructure facilities. Our hon. Minister, Shri Oscar Fernandes and myself went there to find out the grievances of the students. Their only demand is, it must change it as an IIT. This is the demand. The genuine demand must be fulfilled by our Government. It is very important because 5000 students are studying. They come from all over India from all the States, from Tamil Nadu, Karnataka, Andhra Pradesh etc. Students from almost all the States are studying in that institute. I urge upon the Government to fulfill the reasonable and essential request of the student.

SHRI J.M. AARON RASHID (Theni): I want to speak in my mother tongue, Tamil.

MR. CHAIRMAN : The Interpreter is not available.

SHRI J.M. AARON RASHID : Okay I will speak in English. Sir, in 2009, Bodi metre gauge conversion project has been taken up. So far, it has not been completed. In the first year, 2010-11, they have given Rs. 20 crore; in 2011-12 they have given Rs. 15 crore; in 2012-13 they have given only Rs. 3 crore. People are accusing me like anything. All the 75-kilometre area is full of bushes. Now, every year, people are transporting 25 lakh tonnes of tea, cardamom, pulses, food grains and all other things. These people are suffering a lot. Highway problems are there. A lot of people, who are taking advantage of the situation, are threatening the small farmers and are taking money from them. So, my request is that this gauge conversion project should be taken up at once and immediate solution should be given to be people of Theni district. It is a long-pending matter.

Sir, two bridges have to be constructed. They have not yet been constructed so far. It had already been announced that they would construct the over bridges in Theni as well as in the Collectorate area.  
...(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN : You talk about the railway line.

SHRI J.M. AARON RASHID : Sir, I am talking about the railway line. There is a lot of traffic in Theni. I had made this request earlier also. The hon. Railway Minister also had sent a team to inspect that. So, my request is that the over bridges should be constructed and also the gauge conversion should be taken up and completed in time.

[Translation]

SHRI ASHOK KUMAR RAWAT (Misrikh): Sir, it has been the intension of hon'ble Supreme Court that the people should get easy and speedy justice by decentralisation of judiciary. Munsif Courts have also been established in many Tehsils of different States of the country as per the orders of hon'ble Supreme Court. But in my Parliamentary Misrikh there is one Tehsil Billohar which is a very old and big Tehsil and there are 409 revenue villages under it and there is one 'Nagar Parishad' also. The headquarter Tehsil which is for Kanpur city is 60 kilometers away and that is being

associated with Kanpur Dehat which is 110 kilometers away and 75 kilometers away from Kanpur city and Kanpur Dehar is 125 kilometers away. It means the people have to cover more distance from Kanpur Dehat in comparison to Kanpur city and will have to face a lot of difficulties of communication and about 6 to 60 hours time will have to be spent there on. Poors will not be able to get justice which is against the theory of natural justice and in violation of the intension of civil society and Supreme Court. Adequate accommodation for establishing 'Mukhyalaya Parishad Billohar Court' is also available and in the light of orders of Supreme Court area is available near Billohar Tehsil but civil court has also been established. I would like to request through the House that in the light of orders of Supreme Court inspite of Tehsil Billohar district Kanpur city Munsif court should be established for easy and speedy justice necessary action may be taken for again associating Kanpur city with judicial area.

SHRI BHISMA SHANKAR ALIAS KUSHAL TIWARI (Sant Kabir Nagar): Sir, I would like to draw the attention of the Government towards the tragedy of floods in my area. There are hilly rivers Ghaghra, Tapti, Ami, Kuwano which flows in our area. Roads upto 50-50 meters have cut due to floods in Ami river but have not been repaired even after passing of three months and embankments of Ghaghra river has damaged upto two kilometers due to which hundreds of villages have been affected and lakhs of poor people in two districts living in hundreds of villages in Sant Kabir Nagar district comprising Dahisar block and Belghat block in district Gorakhpur are badly affected. It is feared that epidemics like encephalitis, Kala-azar may not spread there because villages are water-logged and diseases are increasing and pporfanchal is prone to these diseases. Every year thousands of people die due to these diseases. I request the Central Government that this matter should be got investigated and find out the reasons of damages to the embankment. It is due to different attitude of authorities and the State Government has not provided any relief even after one and half month and people there are compelled to migrate. I would like to request to the Government that special disaster relief should be provided there and

rehabilitation of people should be ensured. They are also the citizens of this country and have the right to live with dignity but they are on the roads.

SHRI RADHE MOHAN SINGH (Ghazipur): Hon'ble Chairman, Sir, thank you for giving me an opportunity to speak on such an important subject.

Sir, today floods in poorvanchal of Uttar Pradesh is being mentioned here. Thirty five years ago, in 1978, such big catalysm of floods was seen there. The flow of Ganga in Ghazipur, Ballia, Allahabad, Banaras is so fast that Ganga looks like an ocean. There is water everywhere and crops, fields are totally submerged in water. People and even animals are badly affected. I would like to congratulate hon'ble Chief Minister of Uttar Pradesh, Shri Akhilesh Yadav that he has arranged to provide five kilo flour, rice, spices, soap, oil and kerosene oil to the flood affected people thrice and all other facilities like successfully organising the 'Kumbh Mela'. But, I am saying that situation is same there even after making all these arrangements. The biggest problem of the flood remains unchanged. I would like to request to the Central Government that the villages in the flood affected areas in the Uttar Pradesh should be linked with the road under Pradhan Mantri Sadak Yojana and it will prove a great work done there. About 82 villages of Jamania, 20 villages of Karanda and 15 villages of Saidpur are affected by floods. Today, Army is engaged in relief work there.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your demand?

[Translation]

SHRI RADHE MOHAN SINGH: Sir, I would like to say only this that Dharampur, Katria, Sokni and Badhariya are the villages in Sadar Tehsil. The villages of Jamania are Bara, Gehmar, Sabbalpur, Deoria, Pasayedraya, Khrona, Patna and Manjhanja villages in Saidpur. Through you, I would like to urge the Government that if these villages are linked with roads, then in the event of floods in future, people and their animals can be evacuated through these roads.

[English]

SHRI O.S. MANIAN (Mayiladuthurai): Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir for giving me this opportunity to raise a matter of urgent public importance.

Due to the failure of monsoon and denial of Cauvery water by the Karnataka Government, our State of Tamil Nadu faced a severe drought during the year 2012-13. There was no rain throughout the year in Tamil Nadu. All the agricultural activities were severely affected due to this. The shortage of ground water also spoiled the coconut trees severely.

The farmers lost their livelihood. The Tamil Nadu Government under the able leadership of Dr. Puratchi Thalaivi Amma announced so many welfare schemes to save the poor farmers from the severe drought. The Tamil Nadu Government paid Rs. 15,000 as compensation for those who are holding one acre of cultivable land. A team from the Central Government also visited the drought affected places to assess the damage of crops in Tamil Nadu and submitted a report to the Central Government. But till now, the Centre has not taken any action on the report. No compensation has been announced by the Centre.

The share of the Central Government which is to be paid through the Crop Insurance Scheme to the affected agriculturists, is till now pending. I would therefore request that the Centre should come forward to pay the arrears crop insurance for the year 2012-2013 immediately.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Venugopal.

DR. P. VENUGOPAL (Tiruvallur): Sir, I do not want to speak. I would just associate with what Shri Manian has spoken.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right. The name of Dr. P. Venugopal will be associated on the matter raised by Shri Manian.

The House stands adjourned to meet again tomorrow, the 5th September, 2013 at 11 a.m.

### 22.25 hrs

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Thursday, September 5, 2013/ Bhadrapada 14, 1935 (Saka).*