

LOK SABHA DEBATES (English Version)

**Fourth Session
(Twelfth Lok Sabha)**



**Gazettes & Debates Unit
Parliament Library Building
Room No. FB-025
Block 'C'**

Acc. No.....

Dated.....

(Vol. X contains Nos. 21 to 24)

**Gazettes & Debates Unit
Parliament Library Building
Room No. FB-025
Block 'C'**

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

Price : Rs. 50.00

EDITORIAL BOARD

Shri S. Gopalan
Secretary-General
Lok Sabha

Dr. A.K. Pandey
Additional Secretary
Lok Sabha Secretariat

Shri Hamam Singh
Joint Secretary
Lok Sabha Secretariat

Shri P.C. Bhatt
Chief Editor
Lok Sabha Secretariat

Shri A.P. Chakravarti
Senior Editor

Shri V.K. Chhabra
Editor

[ORIGINAL ENGLISH PROCEEDINGS INCLUDED IN ENGLISH VERSION AND ORIGINAL HINDI PROCEEDINGS INCLUDED IN HINDI VERSION WILL BE TREATED AS AUTHORITATIVE AND NOT THE TRANSLATION THEREOF.]

CONTENTS

[Twelfth Series, Vol. X, Fourth Session 1999/1921 (Saka)]

No. 21, Saturday, April 17, 1999/Chaltra 27, 1921 (Saka)

SUBJECT	COLUMNS
MOTION OF CONFIDENCE IN THE COUNCIL OF MINISTERS. .	1—30,31—50
Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee .	3—15
OBSERVATION RE: CASTING OF VOTE BY A MEMBER AFTER BECOMING CHIEF MINISTER.	30—31

LOK SABHA DEBATES

LOK SABHA

Saturday, April 17, 1999/Chaitra 27,
1921 (Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at
Eleven of the Clock

[MR. SPEAKER in the Chair]

MOTION OF CONFIDENCE IN THE COUNCIL OF MINISTERS — *Contd.*

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Prime Minister, Shri Vajpayee, please.

(Interruptions)

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ (Baramulla) : Please give me five minutes' time.

MR. SPEAKER : No, please.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You cannot speak because yesterday's sitting went up to six o' clock of today morning. Please take your seat.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ : Please allow me for five minutes.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (Bankura) : Please allow him for one minute...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Prof. Soz, please take your seat. Now, the Prime Minister.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Prof. Soz, please take your seat. You cannot speak now. Please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please take your seat. Now, the Prime Minister please.

(Interruptions)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : You allow him one minute.

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE (Calcutta South) : No...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : There is no such procedure. Please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : There is no such procedure. Please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Sathiamoorthy and Shri Muthiah, please take your seats.

(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF POWER, MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF NON-CONVENTIONAL ENERGY SOURCES (SHRI P.R. KUMARAMANGALAM) : We are telling that we sat till 5.45 in the morning. What is this?

SHRI VAIKO (Sivakasi) : Let the Prime Minister speak now.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please take your seat. When this is not the practice, I am not allowing you.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Acharia, you are a senior Member. What is this? Please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Now, the hon. Prime Minister, please.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please take your seat. Shri Lalu Prasad, please understand this is not the procedure. What is this? Please take your seat.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (Mavelikara) : Please allow me to speak for one minute.

MR. SPEAKER : Please take your seat. How can I allow you? Please understand this is not the procedure. Yesterday's sitting went up to six o' clock of today morning. Please understand this.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Yesterday's sitting went up to six o' clock of today morning. Please understand.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (Baramati) : It is a sensitive issue. Please allow me for only one minute.

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Sharad Pawar, I am appealing to you, do not create any new precedent.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN : He was not here yesterday.

MR. SPEAKER : Yesterday's sitting went up to six o' clock of today morning.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Chaubey, please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : This is not good. You are all senior Members. Please understand.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Senior Members should not behave like this.

Now, the Prime Minister, Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee.

[Translation]

PRIME MINISTER (SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, day before yesterday, while initiating the discussion on the confidence motion, I had said that before speaking, I would like to hear. Now today it is my turn. So I too should be heard uninterrupted. The opposition has complained that...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV (Sambhal) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, mike is not working well. Please have it repaired.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Hon'ble Prime Minister, could you please use the second mike also?

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I thank the Hon'ble Members that they want to hear me.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : We do want to hear you.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : I was saying that the opposition has a complaint and they have alleged that I did not observe canons of political morality. Parliament is in session. Hon'ble Members and the opposition were going to get opportunities to vote against the Government almost daily.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : First of all congratulate Shri Chandra Shekhar on his birthday...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : When the Leader of the House is speaking, do not disturb him.

[Translation]

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : Will you not allow even felicitations?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : I, in the House...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : Today is the birthday of Chandrasekharji.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Whose birthday is today?

MR. SPEAKER : Today is the birthday of Chandrashekhar Saheb.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Many happy returns of the day!

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have been associated with the Parliament for about 40 years. I have seen many minority Governments. There was minority Government run by Smt. Indira Gandhi. Nobody then accused her of unprincipled politics. Shri Narasimha Rao also continued to head the minority Government.

I do not want to go into what was done to convert that minority Government into a majority one but if the opposition wanted to know whether I enjoyed majority or not, it could bring forward a motion in this regard. Why the opposition instead of knocking at the door of the Hon'ble President of India, did not bring forward a Motion against me? When the Hon'ble President desired that we should seek the vote of confidence, we at once agreed to it. The debate has continued for two days. It is going to be over soon. It could still be better in quality and standard. We claim to be the greatest democracy of the world. We indeed are. But, judging us from the goings-on in our Parliament, what the countries which have recently joined the mainstream of democracy, must be feeling about us, can easily be gauged. When shall our social life break loose from the trammels of allegations and counter-allegations? When we hurt allegations, we feel called upon to corroborate them. We can just repeat what has appeared in the press or the media in corroboration. But that is not a very foolproof or effective way.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, my Government was formed just 13 months back. We are being subjected to a trial of strength. I never claimed to be seasoned statesman. But I do submit that I have never aspired for anything

than to serve the country. When I was in the Opposition, nobody ever charged me with doing anything detrimental to the interests of the country. Then, have I changed my character after coming to power? Does power change a man to such an extent? If it is true, what to say of people who remained in power for 40 long years. We all know the conditions in which the elections were held. On the basis of the results of the elections, it was only the coalition Government that could be forward. Even at the very last moment, we had submitted to the Hon'ble President that since democracy is a game of numbers, we didn't have with us the adequate number of M.Ps., and that if someone also was in a position to form the Government, he should better invite him for the purpose and we would prefer to sit in opposition for some days more. But nobody was prepared to form the Government. But now, surprisingly enough, after 13 months, they are ready to form the Government. It is a good thing.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, the main opposition said that theirs would be the constructive opposition and that they would neither support anybody, nor get support from anybody and would wait for the day when they will get clear cut majority. Pachmarhi seems to have been left far behind. New alliances are being formed. Our alliance has come in for comments. But they are entering into new alliances. We had contested elections together with most of the parties who became our allies later. Soon after taking over the views of the Government, we presented before the country a National Agenda for Governance. But now in their negative approach and sinister design to oust us, such parties are coming together as are ideologically poles apart. We have been maintaining right from the very beginning that the Indian politics is taking a new turn in which the regional parties too have to play an important role. Emergence of regional parties is reflective of our diversity. It also goes to prove that the parties carrying the label of All India parties have failed to represent the hopes and aspirations of the States in real terms. We have been running the Government for the last 13 months. Many regional parties are with us. Those who deserted us later also did not behave in a manner that militated against the unity and solidarity of the country. We had our differences but their faith in the unity of the country remained unshakeable. It is a welcome offer. But the manner in which the Congress Party criticised the regional parties in its election manifesto of 1998 does not speak of a healthy attitude. I quote :

[English]

"By their very nature, regional parties lack a national perspective and can never rise above local ethnic considerations. They adopt populist platforms for coming to power. They incite narrow linguistic or ethnic sentiments. Very soon these

agendas become a recipe for economic disaster and social turmoil."

[Translation]

If this is your assessment of the regional parties, then how and on what basis will you enter into an alliance with them? I also quote below for the benefit of our friends belonging to the leftist parties a relevant comment of the Congress Party about the regional parties :-

[English]

"As for the Left Parties, even after seven decades, the CPI and the CPM, have not been able to integrate themselves into the national mainstream".

[Translation]

It is a very serious charge. It is part of the Congress manifesto. It is a declaration. Now an alliance is perhaps being entered into in an attempt to integrate the Left Parties into the national mainstream.

[English]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur) : We do not need their certificate either way.

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : The Janata Dal was in a fix. We do not know what decision it has taken. I refresh the memory of my friends belonging to the Janata Dal by quoting below. The very language used by the Congress Party to describe the Janata Dal :-

[English]

"The Janata Dal was born in a convulsive fit of anti-congressism in 1989. It is a collection of disparate groups and embittered individuals driven by egos. It can hardly be called a serious political formation. Like an amoeba, it lives on splitting itself into smaller and smaller groups. Its platform of social justice is hollow and is just a misleading cover for the practice of a divisive caste politics."

[Translation]

If this is going to be the basis for their coming together, then their protestations of stability have no meaning. An attempt was made to destabilise my Government. Besides, my Government was charged with being run by parties suffering from inner contradictions. Does the formation you contemplate

[Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee]

to foster and it is not likely to materialise—owe its origin to any single ideology? Do you have any programme or one leadership? The other day Shri Lalu Prasad ji said, "You step down and not in five minutes but in one minute, we will come forward with an alternative." If it is so, should not the House be taken into confidence about that alternative. Does not the nation have a right to know that when you are asking a government formed on the basis of a mandate from the people to step down ...*(Interruptions)* People had given mandate to us, not to you...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

SHRI RAJESH PILOT (Dausa) : Ten parties have got 25 per cent and our party alone has got 21 per cent votes.

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, during these 13 months, we have tried to implement our programme...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE : Sir, this running commentary should be stopped immediately otherwise we will interrupt.

MR. SPEAKER : There should be no running commentary please. What is this?

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : We have tried to move ahead on the basis of the national agenda. National agenda is a programme of five years and we intend to accomplish it within that stipulated period. There is no denying the fact that there is perceptible improvement in every field in our country since we took over. Whether it is a question of national security, or of economy or of diplomatic relations with other countries, we can right fully claim that we have tried to make rapid strides in every sphere and achieved success in our efforts.

Surprisingly enough, even the nuclear tests conducted by us came in for criticism. We were asked as to what danger was lurking in before the country. In 1974, I was in the House when the nuclear test was conducted under the leadership of Smt. Indira Gandhi. We had welcomed it, despite being in the Opposition because that test had been conducted for the defence of the country. What was the danger at that time before the country? Should we prepare for self defence only when some danger stares us in the face? If we prepare ourselves in advance, the danger that is imminent would be warded off without

taking any practical shape and that was precisely the reason for our deciding to conduct nuclear tests. The nuclear tests were part of our programme. These have found mention in it. There was no secret, no mystery about it.

About the nuclear test, Shri Chandrashekarji has given vent to some of his views. I am afraid, I cannot subscribe to his views. He has his own peculiar way of thinking. But what our own experience of 50 years tells us. Should we not become self-reliant in the matter of defence? We don't have only one neighbour. We have several neighbours. What is at present happening in Europe should serve as a warning to us. Pokharan-II test was not conducted for the satisfaction of any ego. Nor was it meant to show off any bravado. It has been our policy, may the policy of the country, to have the minimum deterrent. That should also be credible. Hence the decision for the test. We knew before hand that some difficulties were bound to come in but we had a firm belief that the nation would surmount them and that was exactly what happened.

Economic sanctions couldn't deter us from moving forward. Nor could they prevent us from taking vital decisions about own defence. But besides the test, we also announced that there would be 'no first use' of nuclear weapons by us. We also declared that we would not use nuclear weapons against those who do not have them. We also pronounced a ban on nuclear tests. In fact, we could conduct one more test in Pokharan but we refrained from it when we realised, that the scientists had completed their work for readying the nuclear deterrent. Nuclear weapons can be used for defence purposes. These have been used even for avoiding wars. There was peace in Europe all these years. There was no war in the world divided into two camps. It was basically due to the fact that there was balance of power and so they desisted from creating any trouble for each other. That is the concept behind the deterrent. The need of the hour is that the entire House should ponder over it.

Even Agni-II has been subjected to criticism. The other day we were in for a big shock to read in the newspapers that one of our old friends accused us of having succumbed to pressure to shelve Agni-II test. But by then the test had been conducted and Agni-II was heading towards its destination with full speed. If we had not conducted the test that day, her statement could give rise to a good deal of confusion, not only in India but in other countries also.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, during our 13 months in office we never took any decision under international pressure. Nor shall we do so in future. I do not think there shall ever be a Government in India which would work under pressure. But I know that such a Government had been there in our country. Prior to

our conducting the nuclear test, successive governments, particularly the Congress Party Government, wanted to move in this direction. Former President, Venkataramanji, who was then Defence Minister, to which office Shri Mulayam Singh was elevated later, unfolded, the mystery that all preparations for the nuclear test had been made, the entire paraphernalia for being taken to Pokharan for the purpose was ready. I was also to be present at the time of the test but the Government could not conduct the test because international pressure was there. Shall we work under international pressure, shall we not take our own decisions in the matter of security? Pressure is being mounted on us as well. But we have accorded topmost priority to the security of the nation. A burnt child dreads the fire. So is our case. We have to be on our guard all the time. Independence and sovereignty of the country must be protected at all costs. We can proceed to establish social service only when our country is well protected. If our borders are intact and free from any danger of attack, we will be in a position to guard our people to undertake constructive work and strain their every nerve for the defence and overall prosperity of the nation.

We have suffered three aggressions such a situation should not recur. We do not equip ourselves with the intention of launching an attack on any country. We have no such intentions. I have been asked to explain as to how Pokharan-II and Lahore bus journey are related to each other. They are the two sides of the same coin. We must first have the needed strength to defend ourselves. Then we should extend the hand of friendship. But we must be honest in our offer of friendship. We must also be equally honest in preparing ourselves for self-defence. As stated by my friend, Shri George Fernandes yesterday, in 1977-78 when the Janata Government was formed under the prime-ministership of Shri Morarji Bhai, I was entrusted with the portfolio of External Affairs. At that time also, I had endeavoured to establish friendly relations with our neighbours including Pakistan. Now, not only with Pakistan but with other neighbouring countries also, our relations have improved. What national interest does it serve to say that relations have not improved in the face of the fact that our relation with these countries have actually improved? What will be the reactions of those countries to such statements? What will be its repercussions in the world outside? We have entered into a major trade agreement with Srilanka. We signed a transit treaty with Nepal. A bus is proposed to ply between Calcutta and Dhaka. It is at present under trial. Elections are being held in Nepal these days. It is for the first time that India is not an issue in elections there and no allegations and counter allegations over India are being exchanged there. Political parties there are also satisfied with the

policies being pursued by India. We do not want to interfere in the internal affairs of any neighbouring country but at the same time we brook no interference from any country in our affairs. When I went to Lahore recently killings had taken place in Rajouri about the same time. I immediately took up this matter with the Pakistani Prime Minister. We told him categorically that if such killings continued to take place, atmosphere of goodwill and harmony would not be created, in the absence of which no cooperation between the two countries would be possible.

The situation in Jammu & Kashmir has changed now. Sporadic incidents are, of course, taking place. But these too have to be stopped. It is the duty of the neighbouring country to contribute its mite in this respect but credit for this change in Jammu & Kashmir situation goes to the people there. They want to live peacefully there. Now they cannot be made seapegoats. Attempts to provoke them to indulge in unlawful activities by inciting their sentiments would prove futile in future. Jammu & Kashmir is not in the news now-a-days. If at all it is in the news, it is only to know as to how many tourists are going there, how many persons visited that state, which film companies are shooting films there etc, etc. It is indicative of the improved situation there. We have also succeeded to some extent to improve the situation in the North-East. Efforts are afoot in this direction. Concrete steps have been taken and are proposed to be taken for the economic development of that area. Actually speaking, these are not the party issues. These are the national issues.

Yesterday, it was stated here that we did not take the opposition into confidence. The allegation that in our national agenda, we talked of evolving a consensus but did not followed it up in practice, is not tenable. We have had discussion wherever it was called for. We have taken the opposition into confidence wherever it was necessary. Government alone cannot take such a vast country with diversities galore along with it. It is the responsibility of all the parties involved. Did we not fulfill our responsibility in this behalf when we were in the opposition. Had Smt. Indira Gandhi informed us, the opposition beforehand about the first nuclear test conducted in Pokharan? No, she had not done so. Such an information is never passed on before hand. But we never made it an issue of complaint. Such questions, however, continued to crop up. our endeavour is to move ahead after consulting all concerned and to resolve our disputes with the cooperation of all parties. In this, the opposition too will have to fulfill its responsibility.

Opportunities for exchange of views can be further expanded. Yesterday, we were made the target for criticism even on the question of representation

[Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee]

of women. We have held talks with different parties. We are prepared to bring forward a bill tomorrow and have it passed if we are assured that it would not be opposed and these would be no scramble, but last time... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI LALU PRASAD (Madhepura) : Has anybody seen tomorrow?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : What is he saying? Mr. Speaker, Sir, there was a consensus that the Bill be passed in its present form and if representation is to be given to different groups, it may be considered later but the Congress Party did not accept it. Now allegations are being levelled against us. The whole world knows that we are not in majority in Rajya Sabha. Many important Bills have been passed there thanks to the cooperation of the opposition. The Opposition considered them important and they were essential also in the interest of the nation. But because of differences in the opposition, certain Bills remained pending. Blaming us for that state of affairs would indeed be doing injustice to us. We shall try to bring forward those Bills again. When we had taken over the economic condition of the country was in a very bad shape. Can anybody deny the fact that the economic condition of the country has registered an improvement? No one can do it. Even if we choose to criticise by adopting a narrow approach, we would have to accept the fact that the situation has improved during the last six months - GDP is 5.8 percent, reserve is 32 billion and inflation is 4.6 percent - This can be managed. Then, an atmosphere of political uncertainty is created which has an adverse effect on our economy. This we are witnessing these days. Will this game plan continue every year? If your Government comes into being, that would also be a coalition government and you too would have to face all the odds. We have more support than the opposition. Is their exercise limited only to bringing us down? Will the country be kept in the dark? Will it be called morality or principled politics? Whatever it is, it should be done in the open. But this is not being done. We have made the country strong from the point of view of security, have improved the economic situation, and have created an atmosphere of peace and cooperation in the country. Ours is a vast country. Some accidents here and there cannot be helped. But efforts have been made to check them without losing time. My friend who preceded has thrown light on this. Shri Yashwant Sinha dwelt at length on the economic situation and apprised the House of the changes that have taken place in the economic front. There has been a record food production this year. Storage facilities are falling short. Credit for this goes to the farmers. We claim no credit for this. The policy being followed for years

is showing good results. But if there are floods and cyclones causing destruction to the crops, then there is need for all of us to face the situation unitedly. But that gives rise to the desire to derive political mileage out of such a situation. This tendency must change, our farmers deserve kudos for the record food production. We are aware of their problems. Last year a decision was taken to increase the price of urea. But now a demand has been made on behalf of the farmers and their organisations to lighten their burden. We assure them that allout efforts would be made to alleviate their sufferings.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, it is very necessary to reduce the prices of inputs. There is need to protect the farmers from natural calamities.

Crop Insurance Scheme is on the anvil, Agriculture policy is being finalised. We are being charged that though we have completed one year in office, we are unable to give an agriculture policy to the nation. You couldn't do it even after 50 years. Agriculture policy is being given final shape. The process of consultations with others is in its last stage. The matter concerns the interests of the farmers. Therefore, cooperation of all of us is necessary.

In the last session, there was a lot of excitement over the memorandums concerning the reservation of Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and other backward classes. The period of reservation is coming to an end. The Government has decided to bring forward a Bill in the House to extend the period of reservation for another ten years. Two of the memorandums brought out in 1997 are pending before the courts. Our endeavour is to get the verdict of the courts thereon as early as possible. The Bill on one of the subjects is ready and the same will be introduced in this very session. The need of the hour is to find a way out to fill the backlog of SC/ST and backward classes in the services. The present arrangement in this regard is not satisfactory. If this continues, it will not be possible to liquidate the backlog for years; on the contrary it will increase further. It is imperative to avoid this situation. We need co-operation of all in this connection. We appreciate the sentiments of people of SC/ST and other backward classes on this issue. Some delay has definitely taken place. But we will not accelerate the process. The ambitions and expectations of the Members and people of these classes will be taken due care of.

SHRI BUTA SINGH (Jalore) : We had requested that all concerned be called and a consensus evolved.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : We will do that.

SHRI BUTA SINGH : Had that request been acceded to, the matter would have been resolved in

the House itself...*(Interruptions)* He is our Prime Minister also. Why are you so possessive. Can't we say anything to him?...*(Interruptions)* You have not done that, otherwise this problem would have been solved...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, a point referred to in the discussion relates to the dismissal of an officer of the Navy.

12.00 hrs.

My friend, the Defence Minister has expressed some views in the House in this regard. I would appeal to the Hon'ble Members to go through the document brought out by the Defence Ministry in this connection. That document is not meant for publicity. It is a statement of facts. Decision should be hammered out on the basis of facts and not on the basis of allegations and counter-allegations. If after perusing that document, House reaches the conclusion that something more is needed to be done in the matter, Government's cooperation would be forthcoming. A suggestion has been made. Shri Indrajit Gupta raised a question, "Cannot we discuss the matter?" The discussion should not be held in a vacuum. It should not take place in an atmosphere of allegations and counter-allegations. There should be a solid base for it and that solid base is there. Discussion can take place on the basis of the document. That has been published. A committee of some prominent Members of the House can also be constituted. Shri Indrajit Gupta, Shri Gujaral, Mulayam Singh Yadav ji, and Chandrashekhar ji would not be allowed to excuse themselves. Shivraj Patil ji and others can also be included in it. They may examine the facts and if they are of the opinion that besides discussing the matter in the House, there should also be a parliamentary Committee, then I assure the House that there would be no objection from Government's side. But if allegations are made on the basis of the material appearing in the media, then someone should take responsibility for it. Persons who level allegations should atleast realise that they would also be asked to prove them. The document published by the Defence Minister and the statements made by him in this regard are in accordance with the decision taken by the All-party committee which had met in your chamber. He did not reveal any mystery. He did not try to mislead the House or the country but if nonsensical allegations are hurled on the Defence Minister, it causes a jolt to the entire machinery as also to him. A way-out can be found of this imbroglio. Problems can be sorted out. In fact, we should give up the habit of perceiving everything with coloured lenses.

Whenever any public matter comes up, our first reaction is to see something wrong in it. If there is anything wrong, that should be looked into.

We have been fighting against the corruption for the last 40 years. There is no question of our compromising with it. If we had compromised yesterday, the need for seeking this vote of confidence would not have arisen. We have tried to run the coalition Government along smooth lines.

DR. SHAKEEL AHMAD (Madhubani) : But it did not run.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : It is running and will pick up further speed today evening. Mr. Speaker, Sir, it is not a question of running or not running the government. The question is whether this country will run or not and the mandate of the people will be honoured or not. By condemning a coalition government if another coalition government is formed, will the latter survive the odds for which the former was held guilty. A coalition government, has its own limitations...*(Interruptions)* We have yet to come to terms with these limitations and act accordingly. I can understand the hesitation and the reluctance of the congress party. They are between two minds. They have an ardent desire to oust us and to share power and to take a decision to go ahead on their own. There are difficulties in it. But I am confident, that a democratic way would be found out to overcome these difficulties. It is good that discussion continued for two days. There was more heat than necessary in the discussion. We should exercise some restraint and this applies to all parties. Democracy is our most potent weapon which we have accepted as a way of life. It guarantees equality of opportunity to all citizens. It is essential to strengthen democracy with a view to unifying the country.

Sangamaji talked of the institution. Later Chandrasekhar ji also laid stress on it. Institutions should be safeguarded and certain principles should be observed. About me, it has been said that I of course, follow certain principles but I have been so besieged and beleaguered that I have been rendered helpless and hamstrung. I am not so weak a person. We have taken decisions which are in the interest of the nation with all the force and determination at our command. I fail to understand as to how it occurred to my friends in the opposition and particularly Shri Mulayam Singh ji, who at times assumes belligerent postures, that there are differences between me and Advani ji...*(Interruptions)* Just think over it.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : I never doubted your wisdom and knowledge. My only regret is that you have been labelled a mask.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Do not worry about the mask. The mask can be thrown away.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : If you throw away this mask, we will be with you.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Very good, then be prepared to join us.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : The day you throw away this mask, we shall stop opposing you.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, we can understand that there can be differences between, the Leader of the opposition, Shri Sharad Pawar and Shri Shiv Shankar ji. But why are we being put in the dock. Between Advaniji and me, it is not plain political companionship but a life long association. He has been assisting me ever since I got elected to the Lok Sabha. He has discharged his duties as Home Minister of India quite efficiently. There can be difference of opinion on various questions. Are you all of one opinion? Mulayam Singh ji do you and Beni Prasad ji never differ on any matter?...*(Interruptions)* I know.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : Never.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I appeal to the House to take the decision as the time for it has come. During our span of 13 months, which people gave us to serve them, we have indicated that if we are allowed to have our full term, we will bring about radical changes in the country. After all elections are held for 5 years. 13 months time is not a very long time. But the footprints that we have left on the sand of time during these 13 months are ineffacable and unchangeable. By criticising us, facts cannot be covered up. By giving vent to your anger and bitterness and by personal insinuations, our achievements cannot be undone. You may not accept opinion polls. But are they not indications enough that people wanted us to serve longer and our government to continue for its full term. I am sure, this House will take a decision in our favour.

(English)

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, please take your respective seats.

SHRI KHARABELA SWAIN (Balasore) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, the Chief Minister of Orissa is here. He has come here. He may be a Member but he wants to be the Chief Minister. At the same time, will he vote here? Will it be ethical also? I would like to know about it...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, I am appealing to you to take your seats first.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, please take your seats.

(Interruptions)

(Translation)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Fatmi, please take your seat.

(English)

Shri Basu Deb Acharia, please take your seat...*(Interruptions)*

(Translation)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Venugopalachary, please take your seat.

(English)

Hon. Members, please take your seats.

(Interruptions)

(Translation)

MR. SPEAKER : Please take your seats.

(Interruptions)

(English)

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, Shri P.R. Kumaramangalam has requested that Shrimati Vijaya Raje Scindia and Shri Shivraj Singh Chouhan, who are seriously ill and have been brought into the Lobby by wheel chairs, may be permitted to cast their votes in the Inner Lobby. If the House agrees, they may be permitted to cast their votes in the Inner Lobby.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS : Yes.

MR. SPEAKER : A doctor may also be kept there for attending to her.

SHRI P.R. KUMARAMANGALAM : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have written a letter to you regarding the normal method which is adopted. I wonder what the Leader of Opposition feels about it. There is a precedent, there are rulings. I would request you to kindly rule whether that is permitted or not permitted with regard to the voting by the Chief Minister of Orissa.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (Baramati) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, he is a regular Member of this House. He has not resigned from his membership and he is not a Member of any other House. So, as an elected Member of this House, he has got every right to cast his vote in the House on this particular occasion.

THE MINISTER OF STEEL AND MINES (SHRI NAVEEN PATNAIK) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, let him go to Orissa and do his job there.

SHRI P.R. KUMARAMANGALAM : Sir, he receives emoluments from the State Government of Orissa,

from the Consolidated Fund of Orissa. That being so...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (Baramati) : He never exercised his voting right in the State Assembly because he is not a Member of the State Assembly and that is why, he has got every right to vote here. Unless and until he resigns from the membership of this House, he has got every right to vote here.

[Translation]

SHRI RAGHUVANSH PRASAD SINGH (Vaishali) : They are not aware of the basics of the law and parliamentary conventions.

[English]

SHRI NAVEEN PATNAIK : Let him go and work in Orissa. There is plenty of work to do in Orissa. Let him go back to the Secretariat in Bhubaneswar*(Interruptions)* Let him go back to Orissa*(Interruptions)* He receives salary from the State Government of Orissa. Let him go back there*(Interruptions)*

SHRI KHARABELA SWAIN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, he is the Chief Minister of Orissa. How can he come here and vote?....*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Please go to your seat.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down. Why are you disturbing him?

SHRI RAGHUVANSH PRASAD SINGH : It is not illegal. The convention of the House in this regard say that you have got no right to stop him from voting. The wrong convention should not be started....*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing will go on record except what Shri Shiv Shanker says.

*(Interruptions)**

[Translation]

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : He has right to vote. The voting has begun, press the button*(Interruptions)*

[English]

SHRI K. KARUNAKARAN (Thiruvananthapuram) : There are a number of precedents. I can quote any number of precedents.

* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER : I have called Shri Shiv Shanker.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : What is the justification?....*(Interruptions)* How can he be disqualified?

MR. SPEAKER : I have called Shri P. Shiv Shanker.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Under the Constitution, only the President of India can disqualify a Member. There is a well-known procedure. How can he be disqualified?*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : I have called Shri Shiv Shanker. Are you going to say anything?

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER (Tenali) : Yes*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Shiv Shanker wants to raise something. I have called him.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Rao, please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : What is this?

(Interruptions)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : Sir, a meaningless and a bogus argument has been raised for the sake of raising that point....*(Interruptions)* Why do you go on interrupting me?....*(Interruptions)* After a person is elected, he has to take the oath or affirmation under article 99 of the Constitution which Shri Giridhar Gamang had taken. I will read article 99:

"Every member of either House of Parliament shall, before taking his seat, make and subscribe before the President, or some person appointed in that behalf by him, an oath or affirmation according to the form set out for the purpose in the Third Schedule."

Shri Giridhar Gamang had done that. Then, the vacation of seat or the disqualification of a Member takes place only by virtue of article 101 of the Constitution which reads as under :

"(1) No person shall be a member of both Houses of Parliament and provision shall be made by Parliament by law for the vacation by a person who is chosen a member of both Houses of his seat in one House or the other.

[Shri P. Shiv Shanker]

- (2) No person shall be a member both of Parliament and of a House of the Legislature of a State..."

That is important. He is not a Member of the House of the Legislature....(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : "...and if a person is chosen a Member both of Parliament and of a House of the Legislature of a State, then at the expiration of such period..."

He must be elected as a Member of the Legislature, it is only then at the expiration of such period....(Interruptions) Please see Article 101(2) where it is written :

"No person shall be a Member both of Parliament and of a House of the Legislature of a State, and if a person is chosen a Member both of Parliament... "he must be chosen-" ...and of a House of the Legislature of a State, then, at the expiration of such period as may be specified in rules made by the President, that person's seat in Parliament shall become vacant,..."

Now, since he has not been elected there, therefore he continues to be a Member here. There are precedents. Shri Bansi Lal, as the Chief Minister of Haryana, had come here to vote. There are precedents of that nature, so I think, there is no basis in that....(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT, MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY AND MINISTER OF DEPARTMENT OF OCEAN DEVELOPMENT (DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI) : Sir, kindly see Article 102 of the Constitution. It says :

"(1) A person shall be disqualified for being chosen as, and for being, a Member of either House of Parliament-

- (a) if he holds any office of profit under the Government of India or the Government of any State, other than an office declared by Parliament by law not to disqualify its holder;"

Article 101 does not apply here. This is Article 102 which is applicable....(Interruptions) No, I am not yielding. So, the office of the Chief Minister of a State is an office of profit....(Interruptions) From the point of view of Parliament, it is an office of profit....(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Sir, I am sorry, the Minister for Human Resource Development has not the slightest knowledge of the constitutional provisions. Sir, kindly see the explanation to the point he just now referred to, even if at all it is relevant. Explanation to Article 102 says:

"For the purposes of this clause..."
....(Interruptions)

Dr. Joshi read Article 102(1) (a). The very explanation to the very same Article says :

"For the purposes of this clause a person shall not be deemed to hold an office of profit under the Government of India or the Government of any State by reason only that he is a Minister either for the Union or for such State."

...(Interruptions) Sir, under Article 103(1) "If any question..." (Interruptions) Sir, they are a bunch of ignorant people. The hon. Minister does not know the Constitution of India! They do not know anything.

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE (Calcutta South) : He does not know anything....(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : As per Article 103, on this issue even this House cannot decide. Article 103 says :

"(1) If any question arises as to whether a Member of either House of Parliament has become subject to any of the disqualifications mentioned in clause (1) of article 102, the question shall be referred for the decision of the President and his decision shall be final."

Sir, you cannot disqualify. You are not yet the President of India....(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, please.

SHRI BALRAM JAKHAR (Bikaner) : Sir, I have had presided over this House for ten years. There are conventions and I have my experience that Members had voted here. So, there is no question of his disqualification. We should not refer to these things any longer. Until and unless he is elected there, he can vote here and he has to resign 14 days after his election there, otherwise there is no question at all....(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri P.C. Thomas, please take your seat. I have called Shri Advani to speak.

(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI L.K. ADVANI) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, the legal luminaries are here. I have been discussing the law in the Constitution. But in so far as the proceedings of

Parliament are concerned, what is most important is that when similar situations have arisen in the past...*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ (South Delhi) : I have come here after submitting my resignation...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : You have no work to do...*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ (South Delhi) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want to make the position clear. I went as the Chief Minister while remaining as a Member of Parliament. I resigned from the Assembly and then came to the Parliament...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Mohammad Ali Ashraf Fatmi, please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Sir, I never came as the Chief Minister to Parliament. I never voted as the Chief Minister in the Parliament. I resigned from the Assembly and then came here...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down. What is this? Now, Shri L.K. Advani.

(Interruptions)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Mr. Speaker, Sir, at this point of time we are not arguing before a Court of law; we are arguing before the Speaker. In the case of Parliament, what is most relevant is what had happened in the past whenever such situations had arisen. What had been the Chair's ruling in this regard whenever a similar situation had arisen?

I have before me a situation which arose in 1972 when Shri Siddarth Shankar Ray who had assumed the office of the Chief Minister of West Bengal expressed through the Minister of State for Home Affairs his desire to speak in the Lok Sabha on the Demands for Grants of the Home Ministry...*(Interruptions)*

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE That is true...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : This is the Chair's ruling. He was informed that a Member who had assumed the Office of a Minister in a State can-not participate in the proceedings of the House...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Muthiah, I have not called you to speak. Please take your seat. What is this?

(Interruptions)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, in another case, Shri Vasantrao Patil, Member who had been appointed as the Chief Minister of Maharashtra came briefly in the House; he just entered into the House. Immediately, Prof. Madhu Dandavate objected even to his presence in the House and he left the House immediately.

These are the two cases I have cited. In one case, the Chief Minister immediately left the House when objection was taken to his presence. In the second case, the Chief Minister of West Bengal just wanted to speak in the House and the Chair ruled that he cannot speak in the House; he cannot take part in the proceedings of the House...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : No ruling can override the Constitution...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, in this case the Chief Minister of Orissa has come to take part in the voting of the House, which can be crucial, which can be decisive and which can change the history of the country...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : That shows the nervousness of the Home Minister...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, I would appeal to you that keeping regard of the earlier-rulings given by the Chair, you should order Shri Giridhar Gamang to go back to Orissa...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : You should have welcomed him. This is your morality...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I call upon Shri Jaipal Reddy to speak.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : We are told about morality by them...*(Interruptions)*

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE Yes...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Mahabubnagar) : Sir, I would like to submit to Shri Advani through you that the so-called convention which he referred to cannot be cited in the face of the letter of the law, in the face of the expressed provisions of the Constitution of India. Now, let me read the Constitution...*(Interruptions)* Article 101 deals with the vacation of seats...*(Interruptions)*

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE : What about the proxy vote? These are the proxy votes.

MR. SPEAKER : I have allowed him please.

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE : Please allow me also, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER : I allowed Shri Jaipal Reddy.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I would like to mention a few points relating to the Constitutional position very briefly. Article 101 deals with the vacation of seats. Article 102 of the Constitution of India deals with the disqualification of the Members. Even if somebody had incurred disqualification, that disqualification does not come into operation automatically except under Article 103. Article 103 has not been invoked. Nobody in this House is competent to disqualify anybody. Shrimati Sushma Swaraj was Chief Minister. She became Member of the other House. No doubt, she resigned her seat. She came back and I support that contention. I am not asking that she should be disqualified but after having taken advantage of this, it cannot lie in the mouth of the BJP leaders, least of all Shri Advani, to take, this position.

[Translation]

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Mr. Speaker, Sir, Shri Jaipalji has taken my name...(Interruptions)

SHRI RAGHUVANSH PRASAD SINGH : First, give me an opportunity to speak...(Interruptions)

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : No, we will speak, he is sitting on our side...(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Mr. Speaker, Sir, please let me speak first. Shri Mulayam Singh ji, please sit for a while...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I will call you also. Please sit down. Sushmaji will speak first.

(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Mr. Speaker, Sir, Shri Jaipal Reddy...(Interruptions) Raghuvansh ji, please sit down.

SHRI RAGHUVANSH PRASAD SINGH : It is violation of rule...(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down. I have not called you.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing will go on record.

(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : This will not go on record.

[Translation]

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Mr. Speaker, Sir, you have identified me, but they are speaking. You first let them sit, then only I will speak. At least let me speak...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down. I will call you later on. Please sit down. I have called Sushmaji.

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : What is this? You are always on a point of order.

[Translation]

SHRI RAGHUVANSH PRASAD SINGH : Listen to my point of order...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : We will listen to your point of order later on...(Interruptions)

SHRI RAGHUVANSH PRASAD SINGH : The point of order is on the top, my point of order should be listened...(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : His point of order may be listened.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : What is your point of order?

[Translation]

SHRI RAGHUVANSH PRASAD SINGH : Refer to rule 376 Clause 6, Sub clause 'c'.

[English]

Rule 376, Clause-6, Sub-clause 'c' says.

"A Member shall not raise a point of order even when a question on any motion is being put to the House."

[Translation]

Mr. Speaker, Sir, you have put down the question, whether this House expresses its confidence in the Council of Ministers. We have said no. Now, the bell should be rung. There is no scope of point of order. I am on point of order. This rule should be followed and it should be seen that no point of order can be raised in between three votes. In part C, it is written.

[English]

"A Member shall not raise a point of order when a question on any motion is being put to the House."

[Translation]

Please see, it is clearly written over here. Oral rules stand nowhere in front of written rules. Written rule should be followed. You have called the question, now voting on it should be held. There is no scope for the point of order. You should give ruling on it and voting should be held.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Mr. Speaker, Sir, while citing the two examples the hon'ble Minister of Home Affairs has just said in the House that once Shri Siddarth Shanker Ray was not allowed to speak in the House, as he was the Chief Minister at that time...*(Interruptions)* Please listen to me, when you have raised the question, listen its reply also. He said, second time, the objection was raised even on the entry of a Chief Minister in the House. Shri Jaipal Reddy took my name and said how Sushmaji became the Chief Minister and how she has come into the House. I would like to present the clear record before you. I have followed the established conventions. I would like to repeat that I have followed the established conventions. I became the Chief Minister of Delhi, while I was also a Member of Parliament. Mr. Speaker, Sir, the Parliamentary session begin on 28th November. I was Chief Minister till 4th December, I didn't even entered the House, and the question of taking part in the proceedings of the House doesn't arise. I resigned on 5th from Assembly. It is clearly written in the constitution, that you can keep only one seat. I resigned on 5th of December from Assembly and entered the House and started taking part in the proceedings of the House. When I was Chief Minister, I didn't take part in the sittings of the House even once. I didn't even enter the chambers. Therefore, Sushma Swaraj has followed the convention, about which examples are cited by hon'ble Advaniji. The allegation of Shri Jaipal Reddy or Members of the other side that how Sushmaji had become the Chief Minister while holding the post of a Member of Parliament is totally wrong and totally baseless. I have followed the convention, which has been cited by the Minister of Home Affairs...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : The Chair has to give its ruling, the book of rules is with the Chair.

[English]

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (Mavelikara) : Sir, I am explaining something. That will explain everything to everybody.

MR. SPEAKER : What is your submission?

PROF. P.J. KURIEN : What I am going to say will certainly help you in taking a decision because it is not that only one Member of Parliament from our side was selected as Chief Minister. From the

Congress' side two MPs were elected as Chief Ministers, one of Rajasthan and the second of Orissa.

In the case of Rajasthan, he was elected to the Assembly. So, he resigned. In the case of Orissa, election was not held. He is not a Member of the Assembly...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Prof. Kurien, you are talking about Shri Giridhar Gamang, not about the Houses they got elected.

(Interruptions)

PROF. P.J. KURIEN : When I was issuing the whip, I considered this matter with legal experts also. Then, I was advised that Shrimati Sushma Swaraj was a Member of this House and elected as Chief Minister. By virtue of becoming a Chief Minister, if she loses the Membership, then he will also lose. If she has lost the Membership to come back here, she should be re-elected by the people. Now, if he loses and if he is not a Member, he has already ceased to be a Member and he cannot come here without being elected. This is my point.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL (Latur) : I am referring to three articles of the Constitution of India. The first article to which I am making a reference is Article 100. Article 100 reads like this :

"Save as otherwise provided in this Constitution, all questions at any sitting of either House or joint sitting of the Houses shall be determined by a majority of votes of the members present and voting, other than the Speaker or person acting as Chairman or Speaker."

The last portion is not relevant here.

Now, this is the article which is very relevant to the voting in the House. Every question has to be decided on the basis of the vote given by the Member. Now, whether a present Member, Shri Giridhar Gamang, is a Member of this House or not can be decided by reading Article 102 and Article 103.

Now, Article 102 provides that if any question arises as to the qualification, as to the Membership of a Member of this House, then the matter is referred to the President and the President refers that matter to the Election Commissioner. The Election Commissioner takes the voting and he forwards his finding to the President and on the basis of the finding forwarded by the Election Commissioner, the President takes the decision and says that the Member is qualified or says that the Member is disqualified. That is one thing.

Secondly, I come to the disqualification under the Anti-Defection Law. Now, that is decided by the hon. Speaker himself. The case is presented to the

[Shri Shivraj V. Patil]

hon. Speaker and the hon. Speaker decides whether a Member is qualified or disqualified. If the hon. Speaker says that the Member is qualified, then he sits and vote and if he says that he is disqualified, he goes.

There is a third method, that is, the resignation of a Member. If a Member gives a resignation and goes out of the House, he is not allowed to vote. These are the three contingencies in which the voting has to take place.

Now, the decision as to the qualification or disqualification is provided in Article 103. Article 103 reads like this :

"If any question arises as to whether a member of either House of Parliament has become subject to any of the disqualifications mentioned in clause (1) of article 102, the question shall be referred for the decision of the President and his decision shall be final."

Now, here is a Member who was elected to this House and as is pointed by Shri P. Shiv Shanker, he came to this House, took the oath, participated in the House. So, he is still a Member of this House. He has not resigned. Your goodself has not said that he is disqualified. The President has not said that he is disqualified. He has a right. He is not a Member of the Legislative Assembly in Orissa. He cannot vote there. He has a right to vote here as a Member of this House.

13.00 hrs.

In view of this fact, it will be wrong to disallow the Member to vote in this House because he is not disqualified. He is qualified and is sitting in this House.

[Translation]

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I will not speak much (1), the point of view of hon'ble Member, Shri Raghuvansh Prasad Singh is absolutely right. (2), with the start of voting process the hon'ble Minister of Home Affairs has become obstacle in its path. This question is not of any rule and legislation. The Government is despondent, therefore, Mr. Speaker, Sir, please begin the voting.

[English]

THE MINISTER OF URBAN AFFAIRS AND EMPLOYMENT (SHRI RAM JETHMALANI) : Sir, kindly have a look at article 88 of the Constitution ...*(Interruptions)*

SOME HON. MEMBERS : No, no...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI : Do you not want to hear a sensible argument?...*(Interruptions)* Sir, article 88 of the Constitution says that every Minister shall have the right to speak in, and otherwise to take part in the proceedings of either House, except that he shall not be entitled to vote...*(Interruptions)* I have every right to participate in the debate. The only restriction is that I cannot vote. This is an article of the Constitution. If they are so ignorant, they should read article 88 of the Constitution...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI LALU PRASAD (Madhepura) : Sir, I am on a point of order...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Lalu Prasad Ji, please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR : Mr. Speaker, Sir, actually the process of voting has been started. You have moved the motion, you have asked for the voting, some Members said 'Aye', some Members said 'No', and Shri Girdhar Gamang also has participated in the voting. In this background, I do not think any person who is not a Member of this House has got any right to speak in the House...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Mr. Speaker Sir, I have great respect for the erudition and understanding of Shri Shivraj Patil, the former Speaker of this House. Sir, I listened carefully to Shri Shivraj Patil on this issue. The issue that this House is discussing today is not whether Shri Gamang is a Member of this House or not, whether he is disqualified or not, the issue is whether a Member who has become the Chief Minister is entitled to participate in the proceedings of this House or not...*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI RAGHUVANSH PRASAD SINGH : Please give ruling on it...*(Interruptions)* Your ruling is required...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members please take your seats.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri S. Jaipal Reddy, please take your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I am appealing to you to please take your seats.

(Interruptions)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, I quote from page 816 of 'Practice and Procedure of Parliament' written by Kaul and Shakhder. I would invite the Leader of Opposition to pick up this book of Kaul and Shakhder and refer to page 816. It says:

"Where a member... is appointed Minister in a State... Such a member, if he comes to the House, is not entitled to participate in the proceedings of the House or to vote."

The issue is not whether Shri Gamang is qualified or disqualified. The issue is whether he is entitled to take part in the proceedings of the House or not. On that, all the rulings till now, including this authentic document which we always refer to in the House, are that he cannot participate or vote... (*Interruptions*) Also, Shri Gamang was allotted division number 308 earlier. That has been cancelled by the Secretariat... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : How can the Secretariat cancel it?... (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI LALU PRASAD : The hon'ble Minister of Home Affairs has given the reference of ruling by the Chair. The ruling of the Chair does not apply to the Constitutional Acts. If a bonafide Member of the Lok Sabha is elected from the two places, he has to resign from one place within 14 days. The rule has been stated very clearly in the Constitution ... (*Interruptions*) Shri Raghuvansh Prasadji has said that he has casted his vote. Now, they want to dilute it, don't go by it, tell them to come into main stream and let voting start.

[*English*]

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : Sir, something has been wrongly read by our friend. He has read it out of context. If you kindly look up, it says :

"Where a Member of either House of Parliament is appointed a Minister in a State but does not resign his seat in Parliament, he incurs no disqualification."

What more do you want? This is what it is. Then, the Amendment to Article 103 of the Constitution has come in 1977, where it says:

"If any question arises as to where a Member of either House of Parliament has become subject to any of the disqualifications mentioned in clause (1) of Article 102, the question shall be referred for the decision of the President."

This has come into effect in 1977, and the explanation part which was read by my friend, Shri Somnath Chatterjee, has come into force in 1985.

So, what he has read is the 1971 case about Shri Siddarth Shankar Ray. It has no relevance because of the later Amendment.

SHRI N. JANARDHANA REDDY : Sir, I got elected to the Rajya Sabha in April 1972. In 1978, though I was a Member of the Rajya Sabha - let me give me the example,... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI LALU PRASAD : Two Members are absent and, therefore, he is prolonging.

SHRI N. JANARDHANA REDDY : In 1978, I had taken oath as a Minister... (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : They are prolonging it, because their Members have not arrived.

[*English*]

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR : Sir, please give the ruling.

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, please take your seats. Please allow the Chair to speak. Shri Lalu Prasad, please sit down. What is this?

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI LALU PRASAD : Since two Members are not present, they are disturbing the voting procedure.

[*Translation*]

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : They are prolonging it, because their Members have not arrived.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Lalu Prasad, please take your seat. What is this?

(*Interruptions*)

13.15 hrs.

OBSERVATION RE: CASTING OF VOTE BY A MEMBER AFTER BECOMING CHIEF MINISTER

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, Shri Raghuvansh Prasad Singh has raised a point of order. Under Rule 376, sub-rule 6(c) of Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, a Member shall not raise a point of order when a question on any motion is being put to the House. So, there is no point of order in this case.

With regard to the notice received from the hon. Parliamentary Affairs Minister on Shri Giridhar

Gamang's attendance in the House, hon. Members, as per provision of Article 101(4) of the Constitution if a Member of Lok Sabha is, without permission of the House, absent from all meetings of the Lok Sabha for a period of sixty days, the House may declare his seat vacant.

There are instances where Members, on their appointment as Ministers in the States, have signed the Attendance Register of Lok Sabha to avoid loss of seats for non-attendance in the House.

However, in a few instances, it had been observed from the Chair that while such Ministers continued to be Members, it would not be desirable for them to participate in the deliberations of the House. Accordingly, such Members withdrew from the House forthwith.

Shri Giridhar Gamang who is the Chief Minister of Orissa continues to be a Member of Lok Sabha. He has come to cast his vote on the Confidence Motion. In view of the aforesaid, I leave it to the good sense of the Member as regards the question of casting his vote on the Confidence Motion.

MOTION OF CONFIDENCE IN THE COUNCIL OF MINISTERS — *Contd.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now, the Motion will be put to the vote of the House.

The question is ;

"That this House expresses its confidence in the Council of Ministers."

Those in favour will please say 'Aye'.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS : 'Aye'

MR. SPEAKER : Those against will please say 'No'.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS : 'No'

MR. SPEAKER : I think the 'Ayes' have it.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS : The 'Noes' have it.

MR. SPEAKER : Now division. Let the Lobbies be cleared -

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, the lobbies are cleared.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Dr. Subramanian Swamy, please sit down.

Hon. Members, this is an important announcement. Kindly go through it very seriously.

Now, I would like to explain about the method of operation of the Automatic Vote Recording Machine. Please listen to me carefully.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Again I am appealing all the hon. Members. Please listen to me carefully.

I am also asking you, Shri Laluji. Kindly put your head phone on.

If you want to listen in Hindi, please switch on No. 2 and if you want to listen in English, please switch on No. 3.

Before a Division starts, every Member should occupy his or her own seat and operate the system from that seat only.

You may see the red bulbs above display boards on either side of my chair which are already glowing. This means, the voting system has been activated.

For voting, only after you hear the sound of first gong, press immediately the following two buttons simultaneously :

The two buttons are :-

The first one being the "RED" button in front of the Member on the Head Phone Plate; and also

The second button which is fixed on the top of Desk of seats, being your choice of voting.

If you want Ayes, press Green colour.

If you want Noes, press Red colour.

If you want Abstain, press Yellow colour.

Important: It is essential to keep both the Buttons pressed together till the second gong sound is heard and the red bulbs are "off" as otherwise your vote will not be registered. Last time there was a mistake by some of the Members.

Do not press the Amber button (P) during Division.

In case vote is not registered, you can call for voting through slips.

I hope the operational method is now clear to all of you. If you are not clear or if you want, I am prepared to repeat the process once again.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS : Not necessary.

MR. SPEAKER : The Lobbies are already cleared.

The question is :

"That this House expresses its confidence in the Council of Ministers."

The Lok Sabha divided:

Division No. 2

13.35 hrs.

Ayes

1. Abdullah, Shri Omar
2. Acharya, Shri Prasanna
3. Adityanath, Shri
4. Advani, Shri L.K.
5. Agarwal, Shri Dharendra
6. Agnihotri, Shri Rajendra
7. Ajmeera, Shri Chandu Lal
8. Aliwal, Shri Amrik Singh
9. Ananth Kumar, Shri
10. Apang, Shri Omak
11. Argal, Shri Ashok
12. Arumugham, Shri S.
13. Ayanur, Shri Manjunath
14. 'Bachda', Shri Bachi Singh Rawat
15. Badal, Shri Sukhbir Singh
16. Baimda, Shri Ramchandra
17. Bais, Shri Ramesh
18. Baitha, Shri Mahendra
19. Ballu, Shri T.R.
20. Bandyopadhyay, Shri Sudip
21. Banerjee, Kumari Mamata
22. Barnala, Sardar Surjit Singh
23. Barwala, Shri Surender Singh
24. Behera, Shri Padma Nava
25. Bhargava, Shri Girdhari Lal
26. Bisen, Shri Gauri Shanker Chaturbhuj
27. Bose, Shrimati Krishna
28. Bwiswmuthiary, Shri Sansuma Khunggur
29. Chandel, Shri Suresh
30. Chandumajra, Prof. Prem Singh
31. Chaplot, Shri Shanti Lal
32. Chaubey, Shri Lal Muni
33. Chaudhari, Shri Manibhai Ramjibhai
34. Chaudhary, Shri Haribhai
35. Chaudhary, Shri Ram Tahal
36. Chaudhry, Sqn. Ldr. Kamal
37. Chauhan, Shri Chetan
38. Chauhan, Shri Jaysinhji
39. Chauhan, Shri Nand Kumar Singh
40. Chauhan, Shri Sriram
41. Chellamella, Dr., Suguna Kumari
42. Chikhalia, Shrimati Bhavna Devrajibhai
43. Choudhary, Shri Krishna Kumar
44. Choudhary, Shri Shakuni
45. Choudhry, Shri Pankaj
46. Chouhan, Shri Shivraj Singh
47. D'Souza, Dr. Beatrix
48. Dahal, Shri Bhim
49. Dalit, Ezhilmalai, Shri
50. Datt, Vaidya Vishnu
51. Dattatreya, Shri Bandaru
52. Dave, Shrimati Bhavna Kardam
53. Delkar, Shri Mohan S.
54. Deo, Shri Bikram Keshari
55. Devi, Shrimati Kailasho
56. Dhaliwal, Shrimati Satwinder Kaur
57. Diler, Shri Kishan Lal
58. Drona, Shri Jagat Vir Singh
59. Durai, Shri M.
60. Dwivedi, Shri Ramesh Chandra
61. Fernandes, Shri George

- | | |
|-----------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|
| 62. Foley, General Neville | 96. Kuleste, Shri Faggan Singh |
| 63. Gadhavi, Shri P.S. | 97. Kumar, Shri V. Dhananjaya |
| 64. Gandhi, Shrimati Maneka | 98. Kumaramangalam, Shri P.R. |
| 65. Ganeshamurthi, Shri A. | 99. Kuppusami, Shri C. |
| 66. Gangwar, Shri Santosh Kumar | 100. Kusmaria, Dr. Ramkrishna |
| 67. Gautam, Shrimati Sheela | 101. Lallugmuana, Shri H. |
| 68. Geete, Shri Anant Gangaram | 102. M. Master Mathan, Shri |
| 69. Gehlot, Shri Thawar Chand | 103. Mahajan, Shrimati Sumitra |
| 70. Ghafoor, Shri Abdul | 104. Maharia, Shri Subhash |
| 71. Goel, Shri Vijay | 105. Mahtab, Shri Bhartrahari |
| 72. Gupta, Shri Chaman Lal | 106. Mahto, Shrimati Abha |
| 73. Hegde, Shri Anant Kumar | 107. Mallikarjuniah, Shri S. |
| 74. Indora, Dr. Sushil | 108. Mandal, Shri Jai Krishan |
| 75. Jag Mohan, Shri | 109. Mann, Shri Zora Singh |
| 76. Jain, Shri Satya Pal | 110. Maran, Shri Murasoli |
| 77. Jaiswal, Dr. Madan Prasad | 111. Marandi, Shri Babu Lal |
| 78. Jaiswal, Shri Shanker Prasad | 112. Marandi, Shri Som |
| 79. Jatiya, Dr. Satyanarayan | 113. Maurya, Shri Anand Ratna |
| 80. Javiya, Shri Gordhanbhai Jadavbhai | 114. Mensinkai, Shri B.M. |
| 81. Jigajinagi, Shri Ramesh C. | 115. Mishra, Shri Indrajeet |
| 82. Joshi, Dr. Murli Manohar | 116. Mishra, Shri Shyam Bihari |
| 83. Kainth, Shri Satnam Singh | 117. Mishra, Shri Ram Nagina |
| 84. Kamal Rani, Shrimati | 118. Misra, Shri Janardan Prasad |
| 85. Kanodia, Shri Mahesh | 119. Misra, Shrimati Sukhda |
| 86. Kashyap, Shri Bali Ram | 120. Mohale, Shri Punnu Lal |
| 87. Katheria, Shri Prabhu Dayal | 121. Mohan, Shri Anand |
| 88. Kathiria, Dr. Vallabhbbhai | 122. Munda, Shri Kariya |
| 89. Khandelwal, Shri V.K. | 123. Muni Lall, Shri |
| 90. Khandoker, Shri Akbor Ali | 124. Murmu, Shri Salkhan |
| 91. Khanduri, Major General Bhuvan Chandra,
AVSM | 125. Naidu, Shri Girajala Venkat Swamy |
| 92. Khanna, Shri Vinod | 126. Naidu, Shri K.P. |
| 93. Khurana, Shri Madan Lal | 127. Naik, Shri Ram |
| 94. Koli, Shri Ganga Ram | 128. Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar |
| 95. Krishnamraju, Shri U.V. | 129. Nayak, Shri Upendra Nath |

- | | |
|----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|
| 130. Nitish Kumar, Shri | 164. Rajput, Shri Ganga Charan |
| 131. Oram, Shri Jual | 165. Raju, Shri Vijaya Rama |
| 132. Palanimanickam, Shri S.S. | 166. Ram, Shri Braj Mohan, |
| 133. Pandey, Dr. Laxminarayan | 167. Ramachandran, Shri Gingee N. |
| 134. Pandey, Shri Ravindra Kumar | 168. Ramamurthy, Shri Vazhapady K. |
| 135. Panja, Dr. Ranjit Kumar | 169. Ramshakal, Shri |
| 136. Panja, Shri Ajit Kumar | 170. Rana, Shri Kashiram |
| 137. Pant, Shrimati Ila | 171. Rana, Shri Raju |
| 138. Paranjpe, Shri Dada Baburao | 172. Rao, Shri Ch. Vidyasagar |
| 139. Paranjpe, Shri Prakash Vishwanath | 173. Rawale, Shri Mohan |
| 140. Parymohan, Shri K. | 174. Rawat, Shri Baijnath |
| 141. Passi, Shri Raj Narain | 175. Rawat, Shri Bhagwan Shankar |
| 142. Patasani, Dr. Prasanna Kumar | 176. Reddy, Shri Bhuma Nagi |
| 143. Patel, Dr. A.K. | 177. Reddy, Shri Chada Suresh |
| 144. Patel, Dr. Ashok | 178. Reddy, Shri G. Ganga |
| 145. Patel, Shri Chandresh | 179. Reddy, Shri N.R.K. |
| 146. Pathak, Shri Harin | 180. Rishidev, Shri Ramjidas |
| 147. Patidar, Shri Rameshwar | 181. Roy, Shri Devendra Bahadur |
| 148. Patil, Shri Annasaheb M.K. | 182. Sahu, Shri Chandrashekhar |
| 149. Patil, Shri Babagouda | 183. Sahu, Shri Tarachand |
| 150. Patil, Shri Balasaheb Vikhe | 184. Sai, Shri Larang |
| 151. Patil, Shri Jaisingrao Gaikwad | 185. Sakshi, Dr. Swami Sachchida Nand Hari |
| 152. Patnaik, Shri Naveen | 186. Samantaray, Shri Prabhat Kumar |
| 153. Pawar, Shri Uttamsingh | 187. Samaon, Shri Chatin Singh |
| 154. Potai, Shri Sohan | 188. Sanghani, Shri Dileep |
| 155. Prabhu, Shri Suresh | 189. Sangwan, Shri Kishan Singh |
| 156. Pradhan, Dr. Debendra | 190. Sankeshwar, Shri Vijay |
| 157. Pradhan, Shri Ashok | 191. Sarkar, Dr. Bikram |
| 158. Prasad, Shri Hari Kewal | 192. Sarnaik, Shri Ajay Kumar S. |
| 159. Purkayastha, Shri Kabindra | 193. Sathi, Shri Harpal Singh |
| 160. Radhakrishnan, Shri Varkala | 194. Satpathy, Shri Tathagata |
| 161. Rai, Shri Kalpnath | 195. Scindia, Shrimati Vijaya Raje |
| 162. Rajaiah, Shri M. | 196. Sedam, Shri Baswaraj Patil |
| 163. Raje, Shrimati Vasundhara | 197. Sethi, Shri Arjun |

198. Shah, Shri Manbendra
 199. Shakya, Dr. Mahadeepak Singh
 200. Shanmugam, Shri N.T.
 201. Shanta Kumar, Shri
 202. Sharma, Shri Krishan Lal
 203. Shastri, Dr. Bizay Sonkar
 204. Shetty, Shri Jayarama, I.M.
 205. Sikdar, Shri Tapan
 206. Singh Deo, Shrimati Sangeeta Kumari
 207. Singh, Shri Raghvendra
 208. Singh, Dr. Ram Lakhan
 209. Singh, Dr. Sanjay
 210. Singh, Shri Amar Pal
 211. Singh, Shri Ashok
 212. Singh, Shri Bashist Narayan
 213. Singh, Shri Chhattra Pal
 214. Singh, Shri Devi Bux
 215. Singh, Shri Digvijay
 216. Singh, Shri Gyan
 217. Singh, Shri H.P.
 218. Singh, Shri Jagannath
 219. Singh, Shri Maheshwar
 220. Singh, Shri Nakli
 221. Singh, Shri Prabhunath
 222. Singh, Shri Raghuvansh Prasad
 223. Singh, Shri Rajveer
 224. Singh, Shri Rama Nand
 225. Singh, Shri Sartaj
 226. Singh, Shri Sohanveer
 227. Singh, Shri Surender
 228. Singh, Shri Sushil Kumar
 229. Singh, Shri Tejveer
 230. Singh, Shri Th., Chaoba
 231. Singh, Shri Virendra
 232. Sinha, Shri Yashwant
 233. Sirpotdar, Shri Madhukar
 234. Sodhi, Shri Daya Singh
 235. Sompal, Shri
 236. Srikantappa, Shri D.C.
 237. Srinivas, Shri M.
 238. Swain, Shri Kharabela
 239. Swami, Shri Chinmayanand
 240. Swaraj, Shrimati Sushma
 241. Syed Hussain, Shri
 242. Tandel, Shri Devji Bhai J.
 243. Thakkar, Shrimati Jayaben Bharatkumar
 244. Thakur, Dr. C.P.
 245. Tiwari, Shri Lal Bihari
 246. Tiwari, Shri Prabhash Chandra
 247. Tomar, Dr. Ramesh Chand
 248. Tripathi, Shri Chandramani
 249. Tripathy, Shri Braja Kishore
 250. Tur, Shri Tarlochan Singh
 251. Uma Bharati, Kumari
 252. Vaiko, Shri
 253. Vajpayee, Shri Atal Bihari
 254. Varma, Shri Ratilal Kalidas
 255. Varma, Shri Sushil Chandra
 256. Vasava, Shri Mansukhbhai
 257. Vedanti, Dr. Ramvilas
 258. Veerappa, Shri Ramchandra
 259. Venugopal, Shri D.
 260. Venugopaloachary, Dr. S.
 261. Verma, Prof. Rita
 262. Verma, Shri Bhanu Pratap Singh
 263. Verma, Shri R.L.P.
 264. Verma, Shri Virendra
 265. Vijayashankar, Shri

266. Virendra Kumar, Shri
267. Yadav, Shri Jagdambi Prasad
268. Yadav, Shri Satya Pal Singh
269. Yerrannaidu, Shri K.

Noes

1. Acharia, Shri Basu Deb
2. Ahamed, Shri Moinul Hassan
3. Ahamed, Shri E.
4. Ahire, Shri D.S.
5. Ahmad, Dr. Shakeel
6. Ahmad, Shri Akbar
7. Ajaya Kumar, Shri S.
8. Ajna, Shri Udai Lal
9. Ambareesh, Shri
10. Ambedkar, Shri Prakash Yashwant
11. Annayyagari, Shri Sai Prathap
12. Anwar, Shri Tariq
13. Athawale, Shri Ramdas
14. Awade, Shri Kallappa
15. Baghel, Prof. S.P. Singh
16. Bairwa, Shri Dowarka Parshad
17. Bala, Dr. Asim
18. Banatwalla, Shri G.M.
19. Bapiraju, Shri K.
20. Barman, Shri Ranen
21. Barq, Dr. Shafiqur Rahman
22. Basu, Shri Anil
23. Bauri, Shrimati Sandhya
24. Baxla, Shri Joachim
25. Bhagat, Shri Indra Nath
26. Bhajan Lal, Shri
27. Bhakta, Shri Manoranjan
28. Bhardwaj, Shri Paras Ram
29. Bhargava, Shri Ram Shankar
30. Bhonsle, Shri Abhaysinh S.
31. Bhonsle, Shrimati Rani Chitralkha
32. Bhuria, Shri Kantilal
33. Bijoy, Shri Bijoy Kumar
34. Biswal, Shri Ranjib
35. Budania, Shri Narendra
36. Chacko, Shri P.C.
37. Chakraborty, Shri Ajay
38. Chandra Shekhar, Shri
39. Chatterjee, Shri Somnath
40. Chaudhari, Shrimati Nisha A.
41. Chaudhary, Shri Ram Raghunath
42. Chavan, Shri Prithviraj D.
43. Chavda, Shri Ishwarbhai Khodabhai
44. Chengara Surendran, Shri
45. Chidambaram, Shri P.
46. Chinnasamy, Shri V.K.
47. Chinta Moham, Dr.
48. Choudhary, Col. Sona Ram
49. Coudhary, Shri Samar
50. Choudhary, Shrimati Reena
51. Chowdhury, Shri A.B.A. Ghani Khan
52. Chowdhury, Shri Bikash
53. Damor, Shri Somjibhai
54. Das, Shri Mahant Charan
55. Das, Shri Nepal Chandra
56. Dennis, Shri N.
57. Deora, Shri Murli
58. Devegowda, Shri H.D.
59. Devi, Shrimati Omvati
60. Devi, Shrimati Rama
61. Dhamotharan, Shri M.C.
62. Dome, Dr. Ram Chandra
63. Eden, Shri George

- | | |
|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| 64. Fatmi, Shri Mohammad Ali Ashraf | 98. Khan, Shri Rizwan Zaheer |
| 65. Gamang, Shri Girdhar | 99. Khan, Shri Sunil |
| 66. Gamit, Shri C.D. | 100. Kondaiah, Shri K.C. |
| 67. Gangadhar, Shri S. | 101. Krishnadas, Shri N.N. |
| 68. Gavai, Shri R.S. | 102. Krishnamoorthy, Shri K. |
| 69. Gavit Shri Manikrao Hodlya | 103. Kumar, Shri Shailendra |
| 70. Ghatowar, Shri P.S. | 104. Kumar, Shrimati Meira |
| 71. Giri, Shri Sudhir | 105. Kurien, Prof. P.J. |
| 72. Giryappa, Shri C.P.M. | 106. Kurup, Shri Suresh |
| 73. Gogoi, Shri Tarun | 107. Kyndiah, Shri P.R. |
| 74. Gopal, Shri C. | 108. Lahiri, Shri Samik |
| 75. Goswami, Shri Nripen | 109. Lalu Prasad, Shri |
| 76. Govindan, Shri T. | 110. Maganti Babu, Shri |
| 77. Gujral, Shri I.K. | 111. Mahato, Shri Bir Singh |
| 78. Gupta, Shri Inderjit | 112. Mahto, Shri Raj Banshi |
| 79. Hamid, Shri Abdul | 113. Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra |
| 80. Handique, Shri Bijoy | 114. Mallu, Dr. Ravi |
| 81. Hooda, Shri Bhupinder Singh | 115. Malviya, Shri Mahendrajeet Singh |
| 82. Jaffer Sharief, Shri C.K. | 116. Mandal, Shri Sanat Kumar |
| 83. Jain, Shri Mitha Lal | 117. Mandlik, Shri Sadashivrao Dadoba |
| 84. Jakhar, Shri Balram | 118. Mayawati, Kumari |
| 85. Jalappa, Shri R.L. | 119. Meena, Shri Bheru Lal |
| 86. Janarthanan, Shri Kadambur M.R. | 120. Meena, Shri Ram Narain |
| 87. Jogi, Shri Ajit | 121. Meena, Shrimati Usha |
| 88. Jos, Shri A.C. | 122. Meghe, Shri Datta |
| 89. Kahandole, Shri Z.M. | 123. Mehta, Prof. Ajit Kumar |
| 90. Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar | 124. Mohol, Shri Ashok |
| 91. Kamal Nath, Shri | 125. Mollah, Shri Hannan |
| 92. Kamat, Shri Gurudas | 126. Mukherjee, Shri Pramothas |
| 93. Kamble, Shri Arvind | 127. Mukherjee, Shri Subrata |
| 94. Karunakaran, Shri K. | 128. Mukherjee, Shrimati Geeta |
| 95. Kawade, Prof. Jogendra | 129. Mukhopadhyay, Shri Ajoy |
| 96. Khan, Shri Abul Hasnat | 130. Muniappa, Shri K.H. |
| 97. Khan, Shri Arif Mohammed | 131. Munusamy, Shri K.P. |

- | | |
|------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| 132. Murmu, Shri Rupchand | 166. Patil, Shri Madan |
| 133. Murugesan, Shri S. | 167. Patil, Shri Ramkrishna Baba |
| 134. Muttemwar, Shri Vilas | 168. Patnaik, Shrimati Jayanti |
| 135. Nagra, Shri Aman Kumar | 169. Pawar, Shri Sharad |
| 136. Naik, Shri A. Venkatesh | 170. Pilot, Shri Rajesh |
| 137. Naik, Shri Ravi Sitaram | 171. Pradhani, Shri Khagapati |
| 138. Naik, Shri Sudhakar Rao Rajusing | 172. Pramanik, Prof. R.R. |
| 139. Nam, Shri Shankar Sakharam | 173. Premajam, Prof. A.K. |
| 140. Narah, Shrimati Ranee | 174. Premchandran, Shri N.K. |
| 141. Nishad, Capt. Jai Narayan Prasad | 175. Puglia, Shri Naresh |
| 142. Ola, Shri Sis Ram | 176. Radhakrishnan, Shri Varkala |
| 143. Om Prakash, Shri | 177. Raghavan, Shri V.V. |
| 144. Osmani, Shri A.F. Golam | 178. Rajarethinam, Shri P. |
| 145. Owaisi, Shri S.S. | 179. Rajbanshi, Shri Madhab |
| 146. Pal, Shri Rupchand | 180. Rajukhedi, Shri Gajendra Singh |
| 147. Palaniswami, Shri K. | 181. Ramachandran, Shri Mullapally |
| 148. Panabaka. Shrimati Lakshmi | 182. Ramaiah, Shri Sode |
| 149. Panneerselvam, Shri Kanchi | 183. Ramarajan, Shri |
| 150. Pannu, Er. Shankar | 184. Ramulu, Shri H.G. |
| 151. Paramasivam Raja, Shri | 185. Rao, Shri K.S. |
| 152. Paswan, Shri Pitamber | 186. Rao, Shri R. Sambasiva |
| 153. Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas | 187. Rao, Shri Gurunadha |
| 154. Patel, Shri Dinshaw | 188. Rao, Shri Nadendra Bhaskara |
| 155. Patel, Shri Jang Bhadur Singh | 189. Rathwa, Shri N.J. |
| 156. Patel, Shri Praful | 190. Reddy, Dr. B.N. |
| 157. Patel, Shri Shantilal Purshottamdas | 191. Reddy, Dr. Subbarami |
| 158. Pathak, Shri Anand | 192. Reddy, Dr. Y.S. Raja Sekara |
| 159. Patil, Dr. Ulhas Vasudeo | 193. Reddy, Shri K. Vijayabhaskara |
| 160. Patil, Shri Bhaskar Rao | 194. Reddy, Shri M. Baga |
| 161. Patil, Shri M.B. | 195. Reddy, Shri Magunta Sreenivasulu |
| 162. Patil, Shri Madhav Rao | 196. Reddy, Shri N. Janardhana |
| 163. Patil, Shri Shivraj V. | 197. Reddy, Shri S. Jaipal |
| 164. Patil, Shri Uttamrao Deorao | 198. Reddy, Shri S. Sudhakar |
| 165. Patil, Shrimati Suryakanta | 199. Reddy, Shri Venkatarami Anantha |

200. Riyan, Shri Baju Ban
 201. Rongpi, Dr. Jayanta
 202. Rosaiah, Shri Konijeti
 203. Roy Pradhan, Shri Amar
 204. Roy, Shri Hira Lal
 205. Sangma, Shri Purno A.
 206. Sangtam, Shri K.A.
 207. Sankaran, Shri P.
 208. Sar, Shri Nikhilananda
 209. Sardinha, Shri Francisco
 210. Saroj, Shri Daroga Prasad
 211. Saroja V., Dr.
 212. Sathiamoorthy, Shri V.
 213. Sayeed, Shri Mufti Mohammed
 214. Sayeed, Shri P.M.
 215. Scindia, Shri Madhavrao
 216. Selvarasu, Shri M.
 217. Sen, Shrimati Minati
 218. Seth, Shri Lakshman Chandra
 219. Shahabuddin, Mohammad
 220. Shamanur, Shri Shivashankarappa
 221. Shervani, Shri Saleem Iqbal
 222. Shinde, Shri Sushil Kumar
 223. Shiv Shankar, Shri P.
 224. Siddaraju, Shri A.
 225. Singh, Rao Inderjit
 226. Singh, Shri Buta
 227. Singh, Shri K. Natwar
 228. Singh, Shri Kirti Vardhan
 229. Singh, Shri Lakshman
 230. Singh, Shri Mohan
 231. Singh, Shri Raghuvansh Prasad
 232. Singh, Shri Rajo
 233. Soy, Shri Vijay Singh
 234. Soz., Prof. Saifuddin
 235. Sreenivasan, Shri C.
 236. Subba, Shri M.K.
 237. Sudheeran, Shri V.M.
 238. Sultanpuri, Shri K.D.
 239. Swamy, Dr. Subramanian
 240. Tanpure, Shri Prasad Baburao
 241. Taslimuddin, Shri
 242. Thakur, Dr. Prabha
 243. Thakur, Sh.i Ramsheth
 244. Thambi Durai, Dr. M.
 245. Thiyagarajan, Shri M.
 246. Thomas, Shri P.C.
 247. Thorat, Shri Sandipan
 248. Topdar, Shri Tarit Baran
 249. Tupe, Shri Vithal
 250. Upadhyay, Shri Rampal
 251. Upendra, Shri P.
 252. Venugopal, Shri K.
 253. Verma, Kumari Vimla
 254. Verma, Shri Ravi Prakash
 255. Verma, Shrimati Usha
 256. Verma, Shri Beni Prasad
 257. Vora, Shri Motilal
 258. Wangcha, Shri Rajkumar
 259. Warpudkar, Shri Suresh
 260. Wasnik, Shri Mukul
 261. Yadav, Shri Anup Lal
 262. Yadav, Shri Balram Singh
 263. Yadav, Shri Mitrasen
 264. Yadav, Shri Mulayam Singh
 265. Yadav, Shri Parasnath
 266. Yadav, Shri Pradeep Kumar
 267. Yadav, Shri Sita Ram

268. Yadav, Shri Surendra Prasad (Jhanjharpur)

269. Yadav Shri Surendra Prasad (Jahanabad)

270. Zahedi, Shri Mahboob

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, please take your seats.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, I am appealing to all of you to go back to your seats.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : The result of the division is :

Ayes 269

Noes 270

The motion was negatived.

MR. SPEAKER : The House stands adjourned till 11 a.m. on Monday, the 19th April, 1999.

14.08 hrs.

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Monday, April 19, 1999/
Chaitra 29, 1921 (Saka).*

© 1999 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

Published under Rules 379 and 382 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha (Ninth Edition)
and printed by Data Point Computing Technology (India) Pvt. Ltd., Janakpuri, New Delhi.
