

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL JUSTICE AND
EMPOWERMENT (2023-24)**

(SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)

MINISTRY OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS

**Action taken by the Government on the
Observations/Recommendations contained in the Forty-Fourth Report
(Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' of the
Ministry of Tribal Affairs.**



LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NEW DELHI

December, 2023/ Agrahayana, 1945 (Saka)

FIFTY-THIRD REPORT

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL JUSTICE AND
EMPOWERMENT**

(2023-24)

(SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)

MINISTRY OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS

**Action taken by the Government on the
Observations/Recommendations contained in the Forty-Fourth Report
(Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' of the
Ministry of Tribal Affairs**

Presented to Lok Sabha on 21.12.2023

Laid in Rajya Sabha on 21.12.2023



LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NEW DELHI

December, 2023/ Agrahayana, 1945 (Saka)

CONTENTS

PAGE

| | | |
|---------------------|---|-------------|
| | COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE | (iv) |
| | INTRODUCTION | (v) |
| CHAPTER - I | REPORT | |
| CHAPTER- II | Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government. | |
| CHAPTER- III | Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's reply. | |
| CHAPTER -IV | Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted and which require reiteration. | |
| CHAPTER- V | Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government are interim in nature. | |

APPENDIX

| | | |
|--------------------|---|--|
| *Appendix-I | Minutes of the Third Sitting of the Committee held on 19.12.2023. | |
| Appendix-II | Analysis of Action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Forty-Fourth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs. | |

* Not appended with this cyclostyled copy

**COMPOSITION OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL
JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT (2023-24)**

SMT. RAMA DEVI - CHAIRPERSON

MEMBERS

Lok Sabha

2. Shri Deepak (Dev) Adhikari
3. Smt. Sangeeta Azad
4. Shri Bholanath (B.P. Saroj)
5. Smt. Pramila Bisoyi
6. Shri Thomas Chazhikadan
7. Shri Chhatar Singh Darbar
8. Smt. Maneka Sanjay Gandhi
9. Shri Hans Raj Hans
10. Shri Abdul Khaleque
11. Smt. Ranjeeta Koli
12. Smt. Geeta Kora
13. Shri Vijay Kumar
14. Shri Akshaibar Lal
15. Sardar Simranjit Singh Mann
16. Shri V. Sreenivasa Prasad
17. Smt. Supriya Sadanand Sule
18. Shri K. Shanmuga Sundaram
19. Smt. Rekha Arun Verma
20. Shri Devendrappa Y.
21. Shri Tokheho Yephthomi

Rajya Sabha

22. Smt. Sumitra Balmik
23. Smt. Ramilaben Becharbhai Bara
24. Shri Abir Ranjan Biswas
25. Smt. Geeta *alias* Chandraprabha
26. Shri N.Chandrasegharan
27. Shri Naryana Koragappa
28. Smt. Mamata Mohanta
29. Shri Ramji
30. Shri Anthiyur P. Selvarasu
31. Shri Mukul Balkrishna Wasnik

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

- | | | | |
|----|--------------------------|---|------------------|
| 1. | Smt. Mamta Kemwal | - | Joint Secretary |
| 2. | Dr. Vatsala Joshi | - | Director |
| 3. | Shri Krishendra Kumar | - | Deputy Secretary |
| 4. | Smt. Banani Sarker Joshi | - | Under Secretary |

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson, Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment (2023-24) having been authorized by the Committee to submit the Report on their behalf, do present this Fifty-Third Report on the Action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Forty-Fourth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs.

2. The Forty-Fourth Report was presented to Lok Sabha and laid in Rajya Sabha on 14.03.2023. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs have furnished their replies indicating action taken on the recommendations contained in that Report on 19.06.2023. The Report was considered and adopted by the Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment at their sitting held on 19.12.2023.

3. An analysis of the Action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Forty-Fourth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs is given in Appendix.

4. For facility of reference, observations/ recommendations/ comments of the Committee have been printed in bold in the body of the Report.

NEW DELHI;

20th December, 2023
29 Agrahayana, 1945 (Saka)

RAMA DEVI
Chairperson,
Standing Committee on
Social Justice and
Empowerment

CHAPTER - I

REPORT

The Report deals with the action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Forty-Fourth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants (2023-24)' of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs.

2. The Forty-Fourth Report was presented to Lok Sabha and laid in Rajya Sabha on 14.03.2023. It contained 10 observations/recommendations. Action Taken Replies of Government in respect of all the observations/recommendations have been examined and are categorized as under: -

- (i) Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government: - **(Total: 05, Chapter: II)**
Rec. Para No. 2.10, 2.11, 6.8, 9.11 and 10.12.
- (ii) Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's reply: - **(Total: 02, Chapter: III)**
Rec. Para No. 5.12 and 7.11
- (iii) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration: - **(Total: 03, Chapter: IV)**
Rec. Para No. 3.9, 4.10 & 8.8.
- (iv) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government are interim in nature: - **(00, Chapter: V)**
Rec. Para No. NIL

3. The Committee desire that action taken notes on the recommendations contained in Chapter-I of this Report may be furnished to them at the earliest and in any case not later than three months of the presentation of this Report.

4. The Committee will now deal with the replies received from the Government which need reiteration or merit comments.

Recommendation (Para No.3.9)

5. The Committee, in their original Report, had recommended as follows:-

“The Committee are happy to note that under Pradhan Mantri Adi Adarsh Gram Yojana, the Ministry of Tribal Affairs have identified 36428 villages having at least 50% tribal population and 500 STs for integrated development to bridge the gap existing in various sectors of development including health, education, livelihood, housing, road connectivity, etc. in a phased manner between 2021-22 to 2025-26. The Committee find that 16554 villages were taken up for integrated development during 2021-22 and 2022-23 and an amount of ₹2,047 crore has been released to the States/UTS under Village Development Plan in support of 6264 villages. It has also been found that no funds were released to Andhra Pradesh, Dadra & Nagar Haveli and Daman & Diu, Goa, Jammu & Kashmir, Ladakh, Kerala, Maharashtra, Meghalaya, Sikkim, Uttarakhand, Uttar Pradesh and West Bengal during 2021-22 for 1251 villages approved in the States/UTs. Similarly, funds were also not released to the States of Andhra Pradesh, Arunachal Pradesh, Bihar, Goa, Himachal Pradesh, Kerala, Sikkim, Uttarakhand and Uttar Pradesh for 231 villages approved for 2022-23. The Committee are constrained to observe that the objective of the Scheme may witness a setback as the funds have been released for less than 40% of the total number of villages approved for integrated development. Hence, they would like to be apprised of the reasons for not releasing funds to several villages in 2021-22 and 2022-23. The Committee further note that no time limit has been fixed for the integrated development of each village. The timeline taken for completing the identified works in a village need to be planned, therefore they recommend that stage wise time limit, along with provision of monitoring at the level of Ministry, should be worked out for the integrated development of villages. The Committee like the Ministry to lay down guidelines/SOPs with regard to the integrated development of tribal villages along with time limit. The Committee would not

like the Ministry to hold State/UTs responsible for the slow pace of progress of different activities under the Scheme hence it is the utmost requirement that the possible causes for delay should be identified at the present stage itself. The Committee also recommend that the criteria for selection of villages would need to be reviewed at later stage so that the villages having less than 50% ST population are also covered, once the works in villages identified as per the prevailing criteria, are completed so that all tribal villages progress in a similar fashion”.

6. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs in their Action Taken Reply, have submitted as under:-

“The Ministry feels motivated with the note of pleasure by the Committee at the outset of their observations with regard to PMAAGY scheme. The observations and comments of the Committee are guiding light for the Ministry in implementation of the scheme further. With regard to the concerns expressed by the Committee, it is mentioned as follows:

Release of funds under PMAAGY: As per the scheme guidelines, 50 % of the funds are to be released to the States / UTs concerned on selection of villages for the financial years, subject to compliance of procedural requirements related to Single Nodal Account (SNA), transfer of funds from State Treasury to the SNA, submission of utilization Certificates (UCs) by the States and other relevant financial instructions issued by Ministry of Finance from time to time. Remaining 50% of the entitled funds are released after submission of Village Development Plans by the State Government / UT Administration and approval by the Project Appraisal Committee (PAC).

The scheme is a Centrally Sponsored Scheme. Formulation of VDPs and implementation of approved projects are the responsibility of the concerned States / UTs. Ministry makes efforts to the best of the capacity for ensuring smooth and accelerated implementation of the Scheme. At the same time, responsive support of the concerned States / UTs is equally essential for desired

results. Funds could not be released to the following States / UTs during 2021-22 and 2022-23, as pointed out by the Committee, due to non-fulfillment of prerequisites by them as mentioned below:

Financial year: 2021-22:

(₹. in lakh)

| Name of the State | No. of villages | 50% of the entitled fund (@₹20.38 lakh per village) | UC pending | SNA compliance |
|-------------------|-----------------|---|------------|----------------|
| Andhra Pradesh | 109 | 1110.71 | 13682.87 | No |
| DNDD | 12 | 122.28 | 0.00 | No |
| Goa | 4 | 40.76 | 651.82 | No |
| J & K | 64 | 652.16 | 372.95 | No |
| Ladakh | 28 | 285.32 | 0.00 | No |
| Kerala | 1 | 10.19 | 0.00 | No |
| Maharashtra | 759 | 7734.21 | 18787.71 | No |
| Meghalaya | 176 | 1793.44 | 2659.45 | No |
| Sikkim | 13 | 132.47 | 1232.32 | No |
| Uttarakhand | 13 | 132.47 | 433.02 | No |
| Uttar Pradesh | 39 | 397.41 | 1288.74 | No |
| West Bengal | 184 | 1874.96 | 1398.09 | No |

Financial year: 2022-23:

(₹. in lakh)

| Name of the State | No. of villages | 50% of the entitled fund (@₹20.38 lakh per village) | UC pending | SNA compliance |
|-------------------|-----------------|---|------------|----------------|
| Andhra Pradesh | 94 | 957.86 | 13682.87 | No |
| Arunachal Pradesh | 26 | 264.94 | 5973.48 | No |
| Bihar | 34 | 346.46 | 3880.44 | No |
| Goa | 4 | 40.76 | 651.82 | No |
| Kerala | 1 | 10.19 | 0.00 | No |
| Sikkim | 11 | 112.09 | 1232.32 | No |
| Uttarakhand | 12 | 122.28 | 433.02 | No |
| Uttar Pradesh | 33 | 336.27 | 1288.74 | No |

Approval of Village Development Plan (VDP): Preparation of VDPs at the State level is an exhaustive process, which involves several layers of administrative structure starting from the villages to the Gram Sabha, District Level Committee and State Level Executive Committee. Thereafter, the VDPs are submitted to this Ministry. Subsequent to that, the VDPs are appraised and

approved by the Project Appraisal Committee in the Ministry. This is followed by further release of funds to the States / UTs after obtaining concurrence from Integrated Finance Division subject to compliance of SNA norms. It may be noted that preparation and approval of VDP under PMAAGY is a continuous exercise. So far, the Ministry has received VDPs from the following states and the same have been appraised and approved by the Ministry:

| S. No. | Name of the State | Total No. of villages identified under PMAAGY | Villages selected for taking up during 2021-22 and 2022-23 | VDPs submitted by the States / UTs till 31.03.2023 | VDPs approved by PAC | Total funds released till 31.03.2023 (₹ in lakh) |
|---------------|--------------------------|--|---|---|-----------------------------|---|
| 1 | Andhra Pradesh | 517 | 203 | 0 | - | 0.00 |
| 2 | Arunachal Pradesh | 141 | 98 | 0 | - | 733.68 |
| 3 | Assam | 1700 | 1167 | 858 | 858 | 20281.24 |
| 4 | Bihar | 184 | 110 | 0 | - | 774.44 |
| 5 | Chhattisgarh | 4029 | 2263 | 1530 | 1530 | 38617.62 |
| 6 | DNDD | 55 | 22 | 0 | - | 173.23 |
| 7 | Goa | 21 | 8 | 0 | - | 0.00 |
| 8 | Gujarat | 3764 | 2246 | 1562 | 1562 | 35318.54 |
| 9 | Himachal Pradesh | 90 | 53 | 37 | 37 | 665.12 |
| 10 | J & K | 302 | 119 | 0 | - | 932.39 |
| 11 | Ladakh | 132 | 52 | 0 | - | 470.93 |
| 12 | Jharkhand | 3891 | 1526 | 0 | - | 13447.07 |
| 13 | Karnataka | 507 | 302 | 197 | 197 | 3077.38 |
| 14 | Kerala | 6 | 2 | 0 | - | 0.00 |
| 15 | Madhya Pradesh | 7307 | 2867 | 1195 | 1195 | 39963.30 |
| 16 | Maharashtra | 3605 | 1414 | 1553 | 1553 | 13485.50 |
| 17 | Manipur | 254 | 99 | 0 | - | 723.45 |
| 18 | Meghalaya | 836 | 328 | 0 | - | 3342.30 |
| 19 | Mizoram | 344 | 135 | 135 | 135 | 2399.44 |
| 20 | Nagaland | 530 | 208 | 125 | 125 | 3120.50 |
| 21 | Odisha | 1653 | 649 | 176 | - | 3772.92 |
| 22 | Rajasthan | 4302 | 1688 | 860 | 860 | 22494.37 |
| 23 | Sikkim | 62 | 24 | 0 | - | 0.00 |
| 24 | Tamil Nadu | 167 | 65 | 0 | - | 570.94 |
| 25 | Telangana | 533 | 319 | 332 | 332 | 3943.22 |
| 26 | Tripura | 375 | 147 | 147 | 147 | 1536.26 |

| | | | | | | |
|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|------------------|
| 27 | Uttarakhand | 64 | 25 | 0 | - | 0.00 |
| 28 | Uttar Pradesh | 183 | 72 | 0 | - | 0.00 |
| 29 | West Bengal | 874 | 343 | 0 | - | 3495.20 |
| Total | | 36428 | 16554 | 8707 | 8707 | 213339.04 |

Timeline for completion of projects: Government has approved the scheme of 'Pradhan Mantri Adi Adarsh Gram Yojana (PMAAGY)' for implementation during the years 2021-22 to 2025-26 wherein 36,428 villages having at least 50% tribal population and 500 STs across States / UTs is being taken up for transforming them into model villages (adarsh gram). All the 36,428 villages will be developed in the time frame of 2021-22 to 2025-26. This Ministry is rigorously coordinating with the State Governments for submission of VDP. State Governments have submitted VDPs for 8707 villages under the scheme for the year 2021-22 and 2022-23 till 31.03.2023. The Ministry has approved the VDPs for these 8707 villages till 31.03.2023. Subsequently, Ministry has received VDPs for 641 villages from Government of Jharkhand and 44 villages from Government of Manipur. The process of appraisal and approval of these VDPs is continuously going on.

Monitoring of the implementation of Scheme: The scheme guidelines of 'PMAAGY' has provision of Project Monitoring Unit in the Ministry of Tribal Affairs to provide technical resource support for execution of the Scheme in coordination with the Central Ministries and State Governments. Similarly, at the State/UT level, the scheme guidelines provide for a Project Monitoring Unit to extend technical resource support for implementation of the Scheme in coordination with District Level Committee / ITDP / ITDA / MADA Clusters / Gram Panchayats, etc. Necessary support systems can also be provided at the District/Division level on need basis.

Review of criteria for selection of villages: The recommendation of the Committee that the criteria for selection of villages would need to be reviewed at later stage so that the villages having less than 50% ST population are also covered, once the works in villages identified as per the prevailing criteria, are

completed. This has been noted for deliberations and further appropriate action in the Ministry”.

7. The Committee had noted in their original Report that 16554 villages could only be selected in 2021-22 and 2022-23 for integrated development under Pradhan Mantri Adi Adarsh Gram Yojana out of 36428 villages identified by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs for integrated development during 2021-22 to 2025-26. The Committee note from the action taken reply of the Ministry that the Project Appraisal Committee approved Village Development Plan of 8707 villages only out of the 16554 villages selected for taking up integrated development under Pradhan Mantri Adi Adarsh Gram Yojana in 2021-22 and 2022-23. The Committee are not convinced with the progress of Village Development Plan as only 24 percent of the villages identified under Integrated Development Plan could be approved by Project Appraisal Committee in a period of two years. The Committee in their original Report were of the view that unless the Ministry of Tribal Affairs lays down guidelines/SOPs along with time lines for the integrated development of Villages and identify possible causes for delay at this stage itself, they will not be able to take up 36428 villages identified by the Ministry of Tribal affairs for integrated development during 2021-22 to 2025-26. The Committee find from the Action Taken Reply that no substantive steps have been taken to address the perennial problem of non-submission of Utilisation Certificates, non compliance of Single Nodal Account (SNA), etc. The Committee feel that if some viable solution is not worked out by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs to overcome this problem, this Project of the Ministry may suffer as mere coordination/persuasion with State/UT Governments has never yielded desired results in past also. Further, the Committee have no doubt about the competency of the Project Monitoring Unit but they believe that their role comes only after the VDP is sanctioned and funds are released to the States/ UTs but prior to that the time consumed in appraisal of the VDP needs to be curtailed and also the timelines are to be laid down for each stage so that there is no delay and the work of integrated development of

36428 villages identified by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs is completed within the time period of 2021-22 to 2025-26. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation and expect that the Ministry would take necessary action on suggestions made by the Committee to accomplish the task.

Recommendation (Para No.4.10)

8. The Committee are rather apprehensive on the enhanced budgetary allocation for PVTGs and its utilization by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs as data on population of Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups (PVTGs) in several States/UTs is still not available with them. During oral evidence, the representatives of the Ministry had informed that for PVTGs, annual expenditure to the tune of ₹5,000 crore has been planned. The Committee have also been informed that the Ministry had requested States/UTs to carry out baseline surveys and now they are in the process of verification of the population data received in consultation with States/UTs. The Committee feel that this should have been done earlier because they strongly believe that in the absence of correct details of the population of PVTGs, the financial allocation for the Scheme may not bear the desired results. An evaluation study has also brought out the fact that PVTG data is absent in many States/UTs, including A&N islands visited recently by the Committee, where 6 out of 7 ST groups fall under PVTGs. The Committee hope that now the details of the population of PVTGs in different States/UTs would be collected seriously and verified at the earliest so that the budgetary allocation for them is utilized correctly and socio-economic development of PVTGs could be done in a comprehensive manner. The Committee, at the same time, appreciate that at least some initiatives for the socioeconomic development of PVTGs have been taken for the 17,02,589 persons from PVTGs, as revealed by the office of Registrar General of India. As only a very meagre amount of ₹6.48 crore could be spent by 31st January, 2023 out of the Budgetary Estimates of ₹252 crore for the year 2022-23 and the budgetary estimates had to be substantially reduced at RE stage in 2020-21, 2021-22 and 2022-23 awaiting the utilization certificates and demand/proposals from State Governments/UT Administrations, the Committee expect the Ministry to focus on the welfare of PVTGs

under a well-conceived Action Plan. Since the latest introduction of Single Nodal Agency model under PFMS (SNA) has also reportedly resulted in non-release of funds to States/UTs, the Committee would like the Ministry to take suitable necessary action for enabling States/UTs to do timely nomination of Single Nodal Agency so that the problem of lower expenditure due to the pendency of utilization certificates is resolved and the grant due is released to the States/UTs. The Committee would also like the Ministry to guide the State/UT Governments on how to submit the Conservation-cum-Development plan for the socioeconomic development of the PVTGs, and release funds accordingly. The Committee feel that the new initiative of the Government i.e. Pradhan Mantri Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups (PVTG) Development Mission, if implemented with the requisite push, will rejuvenate the crumbling Scheme as it is expected to overcome the flaws of the Scheme. Hence, the Committee would like the Ministry to expeditiously frame the modalities/SOPs/guidelines of the said Mission. The Committee would like to be informed of the necessary steps taken in this regard by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs.

9. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs, in their Action Taken Reply, have submitted as under:-

“Ministry of Tribal Affairs is thankful to the Hon Committee for raising very relevant concerns. Obtaining and maintaining a reliable database in respect of the PVTG is a very important priority for the Ministry. Ministry is continuously taking up the matter for verification of the data in consultation with States / UT. With regard to submission of conservation-cum-development plan, it is stated that extant scheme guidelines of Development of PVTGs defines the sectors and areas to be undertaken under the CCD plan. Further, Ministry, while requesting States / UTs for furnishing annual plan / CCD plans, advises the parameters and priority areas to be focused. For compliance of SNA procedure also, Ministry has been continuously taking up the matter with States.

In so far as framing of modalities / SOPs / guidelines of the PM PVTG Development Mission is concerned, it is stated that Ministry of Tribal Affairs is in the process of formulating the PM PVTG Development Mission documents (in consonance with the announcement made in Budget 2023-24) in consultation

with concerned Central Ministries / Departments. It is a challenge to achieve convergence of the resources and schemes of other Ministries like Rural Development, Education, Health, Women and Child Development”.

10. The Committee had observed in their original Report that data on population of Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups(PVTGs) in several States/UTs is still not available with them and budgetary Estimates for 2020-21, 2021-22 and 2022-23 was substantially reduced at RE stage and very meager amount of the Budgetary Estimate for 2022-23 could be spent by 31 January, 2023 on the welfare of the PVTGs. The Committee had hoped that the details of the population of PVTGs in different States/UTs would be collected seriously so that the economic development Plan of PVTGs is done in a comprehensive manner to optimally utilise the given budgetary allocation and the problem of non-utilisation of the Budgetary allocation due to non-availability of SNAs in States/UTs, non-submission of Utilisation certificates, etc. would be resolved urgently. However, the Committee find that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs have given routine reply that they are continuously taking up the matter for verification of the PVTG population and SNAs with States/UTs and they have been advised to focus on priority areas for annual/CCD plans. The Committee also find that no time period has been prescribed to either collect the number of PVTGs population in each State/UT or to open SNAs in each State/UT, etc. The Committee are of the opinion that unless the States/UTs are instructed to complete the task in a time bound manner, the task may continue endlessly. In the light of recent announcement of Pradhan Mantri Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Group Development Mission (PM PVTG), the work of welfare of PVTGs has to be completed on a Mission mode, hence it becomes more important that the time bound action is taken to complete all the procedural requirements to avoid any hurdle in achieving the objectives of the Mission in the stipulated time period. The Committee expect that the modalities/SOPs/ guidelines of the PM PVTG would have been framed by now so that the funds allocated

under the Mission are fruitfully utilized for the welfare of PVTGs as planned under the PM PVTG Mission. The Committee would like to be apprised of the progress of the PM PVTG Mission till date since sufficient time has elapsed after the announcement of the Mission.

Recommendation (Para No.8.8)

11. The Committee, in their original Report, had recommended as follows:-

“The Committee find that 27 Tribal Research Institutes (TRIs) have been established in the country from the 1950s till 2020. The first TRI at Jharkhand (erstwhile undivided Bihar) was established as early as 1953 and TRI at Goa was established in 2020. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs extends support to strengthen TRIs in their infrastructural needs, research and documentation activities and training and capacity building programs, exchange points by tribals, etc. so that the tribal cultural practices, languages and rituals are preserved and disseminated. The Committee had an opportunity to visit TRIs in Gujarat and A&N Islands and appreciated their efforts, however, they are yet to find any Institute that has performed extraordinarily with a ground breaking discovery of tribal history, hence they are of the firm opinion that these Institutes need to work more and indepth to gain on tribal research. The Committee are also not happy to note that budgeted estimates for 2020-2021, 2021-2022 and 2022-23 were reduced almost to half at RE stage. The actual expenditure of ₹6.96 crore against RE of ₹58.50 crore by 31st January, 2023 in 2022-23 does not seem to be a healthy implementation of the TRI Scheme. The Committee are not convinced with the routine reply of the Ministry for slow progress of the scheme in 2022-23. They feel that mere allocation of funds does not assure the success of any Scheme. It is a known fact that the traditional culture of the various communities is disappearing fast and in the case of tribal communities, the situation cannot be more true. The Committee are highly concerned about the preservation and dissemination of tribal history, practices, languages and rituals. The Committee believe that any change in procedure should not prove be detrimental for the scheme rather it should help in better management and monitoring of funds. The

Committee therefore recommend that appropriate expertise is developed and disseminated so that viable proposals from TRIs are received from States. The Committee also desire that research activities of all the Tribal Research Institutes should be increased. In this connection, the Committee, during their recent visit to Ahmedabad, had called attention towards the Siddi tribe in Gujarat and Karnataka, which are originally negroid, having come originally from the African Continent eons ago, but are now completely amalgamated in the Indian ethos, as this particular group had largely remained on the margins so far. Bearing an athletic build, this tribe can show real promise in sports activities too, once provided proper support from the Government. The Committee would like to be informed of the action taken by the Ministry in this regard”.

12. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs, in their Action Taken Reply, have submitted as under:-

“The Committee's recommendations and the suggestions on gathering more proposal about viable tribal related research activities including sports activities by the TRIs, have been conveyed to the concerned State/UT Governments/TRIs so that such proposals are sent for the consideration of the selection committee under the scheme of 'Support TRI'. The matter of encouragement of sports amongst the Siddi tribe has also been conveyed”.

13. Keeping in view of less utilization and reduced allocations of RE stage under TRI Scheme, the Committee had recommended to enhance the research activities of the Institutes and felt the need for more research proposals from the TRIs so that appropriate expertise is developed and disseminated to achieve the envisaged objectives of Tribal Research Institutes. The Committee strongly believe that it is the failure of the executing agency if they are not able to spend the estimated budget and it implies that there is either a flaw in preparation of the Budget or the work could not be done as planned. The Committee find that the reply of the Ministry is not specific as they have submitted that State/UTs Governments

have been apprised on the suggestions of the Committee. The Committee believe that unless effective measures are taken to ensure that State/UT Governments take keen interest in the TRIs and submit relevant proposals to the Ministry for achieving the envisaged objectives of the Institutes, the purpose of establishing these Institutes will be defeated. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation and expect that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs will take effective steps to invigorate the TRIs so that they are able to promote tribal culture and disseminate knowledge about tribal communities globally.

CHAPTER-II

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

(Recommendation Para No. 2.10)

India has one of the largest tribal populations in the world, which has rich traditions, cultures and heritage with unique lifestyles and customs. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs is the nodal Ministry for overall policy, planning and coordination of various programmes /schemes for welfare and development of Scheduled Tribes. Before analyzing last years' budgetary trends in this Ministry, the Committee appreciate the fact that the Budgetary allocation for 2023-24 has been enhanced to a substantial amount of ₹12,386.00 crore from ₹8,406.92 crore in 2022- 23, with an increased allocation and focus on facilitating construction of additional EMRS schools in the next two years. This is to complete the target of 740 EMRS by 2025- 26. It would, though, remain for the Committee to see if the enhancement in the Budgetary allocation for 2023-24 stays put as it has been the trend in the Ministry so far to get reduced funds from BE to RE stage. Nonetheless, as the Budgetary Estimates for 2023-24 has been substantially enhanced, the Committee would expect that the funds are fully utilized for the purpose and are not subsequently revised for one or the other reason. They would also like to reiterate that identification of all ST beneficiaries through ST Certificates is a must before the benefits accruing from the increased llocation of funds to the Ministry is to reach them all.

Reply of the Government

Ministry of Tribal Affairs gratefully appreciates the observations of the Hon Committee. The Ministry will like to assure that all steps will be taken for full utilization of funds under various schemes viz. PMAAGY, PVTG, Grants under Article 275 (1), EMRS, Support to TRI and Livelihood. Regular reviews will be conducted with participating states for increasing fund-utilisation. In respect of some of the schemes, Ministry further submits as under:

Ministry has been able to fully utilize the Budgetary Allocation under the scheme of Pradhan Mantri Aadi Adarsh Gram Yojana (PMAAGY) for the financial year 2022-23. The

scheme of 'PMAAGY' has Budgetary Allocation of ₹1485.00 crores for the F.Y. 2023-24 and Ministry would plan to fully utilize the Budgetary Allocation. As regards Grants under Article 275 (1) & the Scheme of Development of PVTG, issue of expeditious implementation of the sanctioned activities and thereby utilization of funds are regularly taken up by the Ministry in consultation with the State Governments. As regards EMRS Scheme, the funds of ₹2,000 Crores allocated for EMRS Scheme have been fully utilized for the year 2022-23. The Ministry regularly takes up the matter with NESTS to expeditiously utilize the allocated funds for construction of EMRS. Further, regarding selection of ST students, due care would be taken to ensure that only genuine ST students get admission. 100% of the RE in all four scholarship schemes (Post Matric Scholarship for STs, Pre Matric Scholarship for STs, National Fellowship and Scholarship Scheme, National Overseas Scholarship for ST students) have been utilized during FY 2022-23. The Post & Pre Matric Scholarship Schemes are implemented through States/UTs. All the major States are managing implementation of these schemes through their own portal. 14 states are managing the implementation of these schemes through National Scholarship Portal (NSP). The State/UTs are ensuring the identification of STs through mandatory submission of ST Certificates while applying for scholarship under Pre & Post Matric Scholarship at State Portal/ /NSP. With regard to Central Sector Schemes of National Fellowship & Scholarship Scheme and National Overseas Scholarship Scheme, submission of Community Certificate is mandatory.

Ministry of Tribal Affairs OM No. 16015/01/2023-PC dated 19.06.2023

(Recommendation Para No. 2.11)

Coming to the budgetary analysis of the last three years, the Committee note that in the year 2020-21, the budgetary estimate of the Ministry was revised from ₹7,205.74 to ₹5,472.50 crore and in 2021-22 the budgetary estimate of 7484.07 crore was revised to ₹6,126.46 crore. Similarly, in 2022-23, the BE of ₹8,406.92 crore was also reduced to ₹7,246.30 crore at RE stage. The contention of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs that the implementation of the schemes slowed down during 2020-21 and 2021-22 as the Governmental and Non-Governmental implementing agencies were not able to carry out

the field level activities in the wake of Covid-19 Pandemic is not convincing at least for 2022-23 as by 2022 the impact of the Pandemic had weakened considerably. An oft-repeated submission is that the budget could not be released to States/UTs as implementing agencies could not submit Utilization Certificates and second installment could only be released on submission of Utilization Certificates after 75% of first installment is utilized as per the procedure revised by the Ministry of Finance. Adding another revised procedure this year, which the MoTA explained during their oral evidence, the Ministry of Finance has reportedly asked States/UTs receiving Central share under CS Schemes, to set up a Single Nodal Agency having a single Nodal Account (SNA) in which States/UTs will transfer amount received from Centre as well as their own corresponding share and release of funds will be through SNA only which will be tracked by PFMS. This procedure is particularly for scholarship schemes. After overall analysis of all the reasons given by the Ministry, the Committee have found that absence of advance planning, change in procedures and failure of States/UTs to implement Schemes with the requisite enthusiasm and procedural discipline, are the major reasons, due to which actual expenditure during these years was less in comparison to Budgetary Estimates. The Committee desire that the Ministry should make an exhaustive exercise to keep all stakeholders informed about adherence to procedural requirements in implementation of various Schemes as well as collect proper data of beneficiaries and take corrective measures to ensure maximum public awareness on welfare schemes for STs so that the entire funds allocated at BE stage are utilized. The Committee would also like that the State/UT Governments should be involved in the process by conducting more interactions online before any procedural/policy change is made as they are playing an important role for implementing various Schemes.

Reply of the Government

It is submitted that in the above observations/recommendation of the Hon Committee, Budget Estimates (Schemes only) of Rs.7205.74 cr. for FY 2020-21 is mentioned, whereas Budget Estimates for the same FY was 7355.76 cr.

Ministry of Tribal Affairs is regularly following up with the State Governments for adherence to procedural requirements related to Single Nodal Account (SNA), transfer of funds from State Treasury to the SNA, submission of utilization Certificates (UCs) and implementation of approved projects under the scheme of 'Pradhan Mantri Adi Adarsh Gram Yojana (PMAAGY).

In respect of Grants & PVTG scheme, Ministry regularly takes up the issue with State Governments / UT Administrations for expeditious implementation of the sanctioned activities and thereby utilization of funds as also the procedural requirements are regularly impressed upon the State Governments / UT Administration through review meetings / formal communications. In case of any need of training conveyed by any State/UT, training is being facilitated for adapting the new procedures.

Under the scheme of 'Support to TRIs', the stakeholders are informed about the procedural requirements in implementation of the scheme through communication, meetings - online and offline – as well as in assisting them when they face challenges in implementation.

Under the scheme of EMRS, the budget allocations made during the last three years have fully been released to NESTS by the Ministry.

In accordance with the suggestions, further efforts will be made in respect of the Livelihood schemes.

As mentioned in reply to para 2.10 above, in respect of the Scholarship schemes, Ministry has been fully utilizing the budget allocated to it during the current year. During Covid pandemic also, the entire budget allocated for scholarship schemes was fully utilised. Despite new procedure of SNA compliances, the Ministry through regular interactions with the states is ensuring the implementation of revised procedure of release of funds through SNA under the Centrally Sponsored Schemes of Pre-Matric and Post-Matric Scholarship Scheme. The Ministry is conducting regular review meetings with State/UTs to ensure smooth implementation of SNA system. Training session is conducted in coordination with PFMS officials for all States/UTs regarding SNA compliances, correction of SNA reports and other procedural matters. The Ministry has

already collected the fund requirement from States/UTs and earmarking of funds in PFMS has been completed for the year. With regard to entry of legacy data, as required by Department of Expenditure, two rounds of training have been arranged with all States/UTs, with the help of PFMS, and review meetings are held as part of follow up action. The Ministry is coordinating with Tribal Welfare Departments, State Finance Departments and PFMS in this regard for release of funds in the current year also.

(Recommendation Para No.6.8)

For educational empowerment of STs, the Pre-matric and Post-Matric scholarship Schemes of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs are implemented by the State Governments and UT Administrations to support the education of the Scheduled Tribe students. The Committee are surprised to find that the Budgetary Estimates under Pre-Matric and Post-Matric Scholarship Schemes have almost remained same as ₹1,970.77 crore have been estimated for 2023-24 whereas ₹1,965 crore was estimated for 2022-23 under Post-Matric Scholarship Scheme. Similarly, ₹411.63 crore have been estimated for 2023-24 against ₹419 crore estimated for 2022-23 under the Pre-Matric Scholarship Scheme. The Committee also find that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs have not been able to fully spend the Budgetary allocation for 2022-23 under both the schemes as ₹1920.52 crore have been spent out of the Budgetary Estimate of ₹1,965 crore under Post-Matric Scholarship Scheme and ₹314.98 crore could be spent out of ₹419 crore under Pre-Matric Scholarship Scheme upto 31st January, 2023. It was seen that from certain States, the proposals are not received for scholarships. The Committee believe that the recent procedural requirement of Single Nodal Agency is also likely to hamper the disbursement of scholarships, being a new addition, unless the State Governments and UT Administrations are directed to implement this system in a time bound manner. The Committee have also found that the Ministry is yet to take action on some of the pertinent recommendations made under the Evaluation study by Indian Institute of Public Administration, such as facility of Book Bank in schools, making funds available in advance, social audit etc. Hence, the Committee feel that this should be seriously considered by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs so that suitable action is taken urgently in the interest of the socially and educationally backward tribal students. Further, the Committee strongly believe that the current income eligibility criteria fixed for these Scholarships needs to be urgently reviewed and revised as it deprives many needy students from availing the scholarships benefits. A Group of Ministers is considering this matter. Hence, the Committee would await for a positive outcome and urge that the income ceiling needs to be appropriately revised for expansion of coverage of ST students. The Committee believe that the Pre-matric and Post-matric scholarships are

playing a pivotal role in providing education to Tribal students who have no financial resources for the same. To contain the school drop out rate among the tribals, the Committee recommend that the Ministry should direct all the States/UTs to publicize the Schemes vigorously particularly in tribal dominated areas.

Reply of the Government

It is submitted that the budgetary allocations under the Pre-Matric and Post-Matric Scholarship Scheme is fully utilized and the details are given below: -

₹ in crore

| Scheme | BE | RE (2022- 23) | Expenditure (2022-23) | BE (2023- 24) |
|-------------------------|-----------|------------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------|
| Pre-Matric Scholarship | 1965 | 1965.00 | 1965.00 | 1970.77 |
| Post-Matric Scholarship | 419 | 357.30 | 357.30 | 411.63 |

Also, as rightly pointed out by the Committee, the Group of Ministers, is examining the rationalization of Scholarship Schemes including increase in annual income limit. Presently as per DoE's instructions, the total financial outlay for the year 2021-22 to 2025-26 has been provided to the extent of 5.5 times of the actual expenditure for the year 2019-20. In respect to Single Nodal Agency (SNA), it has already been elaborated in reply to para 2.10 & 2.11 above. For publicity of the scholarship schemes following para is added in the revised guidelines: -

“The State Governments/U.T. Administration suitably publicize the Scheme and invite applications by issuing an advertisement in local language, in the leading newspapers of the State and through their respective websites and other media outfits. The awareness programme may also be arranged in coordination with Civil Society Organization (CSOs)/NGOS/PRIIs/any other stake holders”. The States are publishing the advertisement in local languages inviting applications under these schemes.

Ministry of Tribal Affairs OM No. 16015/01/2023-PC dated 19.06.2023

(Recommendation Para No.9.11)

The Committee notes that Pradhan Mantri Janjatiya Vikas Mission (PMJVM) was launched in 2021-22 by merging two earlier schemes *i.e.*, 'Mechanism for Marketing of Minor Forest Produce (MFP) through Minimum Support Price (MSP) & Development of Value Chain for MFP' and 'Institutional Support for Development and Marketing of Tribal Products/Produce' for promotion of Tribal livelihood with a budgetary provision of ₹1612.27 crore for 2021-22 to 2025-26. The Committee, however, find that out of the budgetary estimate of ₹499.60 crore for 2022-23, the Ministry was able to spend only ₹135.27 crore by 31st January 2023. The Committee also find that no target was fixed in 2021- 22 against the budgetary allocation of ₹219.90 crore for the stipulated activities under the Mission. They are quite surprised to note that the procurement of MFPs by State Governments has also gone down in 2021-22 and 2022-23 in comparison to 2020-21. The Committee further note that 1018 VDVKs have been made operational in various States out of 3225 sanctioned VDVKs. As regard to the prime objective of promotion of Tribal livelihood, the Committee are constrained to observe that the number of beneficiaries have also gone down in 2021-22 in comparison to 2019-20 and 2020- 21 as the number of beneficiaries was 302271 in 2021-22 whereas it was 331799 in 2019-20 and 329888 in 2020- 21. Similarly, under Institutional Support Scheme, the procurement of Tribal products by TRIFED has also gone down to ₹25.73 crore in 2021-22 in comparison to 2019- 20 where the procurement was of ₹50.95 crore. In a nutshell, from the figures mentioned above on the various activities under the scheme, the Committee do not find the performance of the Mission very encouraging in initial phase in all parametres. The Committee are of the firm belief that mere distribution of the budgetary provision between 2021-22 to 2025-26 and fixing of target on the stipulated activities to make the Mission successful is not sufficient. The Ministry needs to develop a foolproof and constant monitoring mechanism and adopt stringent measures to achieve the laid down targets in the given time frame well within the budgetary provision. Hence, here the initiatives/revisited procedures under PFMS must play a definite role. The Committee feel that concerted efforts are required to be taken to achieve the objectives of the Mission so that through this Mission, financial support is

provided to maximum number of tribal people who are engaged to collect forest produce for their livelihood. The Committee desire that establishment of Van Dhan Kendras should be accelerated and infrastructure of all the existing Kendras should be strengthened so that coverage of beneficiaries can be maximum under the Mission. The Committee desire to be apprised of target fixed and achievement under all parameters in this Mission beyond 31.1.23 at the action taken stage.

Reply of the Government

It is submitted for kind consideration that in the above observations/recommendation of the Committee, Budget Estimates of ₹499.60 cr. for FY 2022-23 is mentioned for Scheme 'PMJVM', whereas Budget Estimates for the same FY was ₹499.00 cr. ₹.219.90 cr is mentioned as BE 2021-22 for the Mission, however before the FY 2022-23 scheme was bifurcated into:

(i) Institutional support for development and marketing of tribal products and (ii) MSM for MFP whose allocation were 150.00 cr and 155.00 cr respectively. The following points are further submitted for kind information of Hon Committee. i. There were some procedural matters of obtaining approval of D/o Expenditure on re-appropriation with reference to some components within the scheme.

ii. Though a target of setting up of 500 VDVks was fixed during 2021-22, a total of 1009 VDVks were sanctioned by TRIFED.

iii. The procurement of MFPs under the MSP for MFP scheme is undertaken only in case the market price of the MFP falls below the notified MSP. Hence, it is only an institutional mechanism for safeguarding and ensuring minimum remuneration to the MFP gatherers for their efforts in MFP collection. The MFP gatherers can sell their MFPs in the open market in case they are getting better prices. In view of this, it is submitted that the quantum of MFPs procured does not directly reflect the performance of the scheme.

iv. The beneficiaries under VDVks correspond directly to the number of VDVks sanctioned during the particular year. Hence, the lower number of beneficiaries during

2021-22 is due to the slightly lower number of VDVks (1009 in 2021-22 from 1118 and 1098 in 2019-20 and 2020-21 respectively) sanctioned during the year.

v. The procurement of tribal products by TRIFED was less in the recent years as the primary focus during the period was on clearing the available stock in the godowns to reach a reasonable level.

vi. The targets fixed for various activities under PMJVM during 2023-24 are as under:

| S. No. | Activity | Target for 2023-24 (In Nos.) |
|---------------|--|---|
| 1. | Haat Bazaars | 500 |
| 2. | Storage Godowns | 100 |
| 3. | Setting up of VDVks | 300 |
| 4. | Setting up of VDPEs | 10 |
| 5. | Organization of Aadi Mahotsav | 8 |
| 6. | Organization of Aadi Bazaar | 14 |
| 7. | Organization of TAM (Tribal Artisan Melas) | 45 |
| 8. | Geographical Indications | 25 |
| 9. | Skill training | 24 |

Ministry of Tribal Affairs OM No. 16015/01/2023-PC dated 19.06.2023

(Recommendation Para No.10.12)

While the target of establishing 740 EMRS has been set to be achieved by 2025-26, so far only 401 schools have been made functional as on 28.2.2023. This would mean making 339 EMRS functional in the remaining financial years. The Committee are little apprehensive about the achievement of the target as the Ministry of Tribal Affairs could only spend ₹1,465.27 crore till 31.01.2023 out of the Budgetary Estimates of ₹2,000 crore under EMRS in 2022-23. The Ministry have informed that around 2.5 years are required for one EMRS to complete hence the Committee expect all remaining EMRS construction to start now if the target is to complete those by 2025-26. The Committee,

in their 34th Report presented in April, 2022, have already examined EMRS to the last details and expect the Ministry to positively implement their recommendations. However, they would like to underline, once again, first, the implementation of the proposal to appoint all proposed 38,800 teachers & staff for the EMRSs well in time, second, to address the difficulties of first time learners/children hitherto devoid of any formal education from Tribal population in clearing entrance exams for EMRS (which start from class VI) and third, to ensure that inspiring life-stories of tribal leaders, freedom fighters, academicians, environmentalists, entrepreneurs, market leaders etc. are adequately included in the school curriculum of EMRS. The Committee would also like to be informed of the expenditure incurred from the Budgetary Estimates of 2023-24 on the EMRS in their Action Taken Notes.

Reply of the Government

The Ministry fully appreciates the concern shown by the Hon'ble committee and has been taking steps to follow the guidance received from time to time. It is humbly submitted that the Ministry is in compliance with the recommendations of the Hon'ble Committee in the 34th Report on "Review of the Functioning of Eklavya Model Residential Schools (EMRS)". As pointed out by the Hon'ble Committee, this Ministry has taken steps for construction for the remaining EMRSs to start immediately in order to achieve the target of completion by 2025-26. It is humbly submitted that identification of land and providing suitable land for construction free from all encumbrances, with forest clearance etc. are the responsibility of the State Government under the scheme. As the construction of a school takes more than two years, the States have been advised to make the schools functional from alternate building, preferably a government building, and make provision of teachers on deputation till the construction is complete. Keeping in view the objective of timely completion of EMRS as per prescribed timelines, Ministry of Tribal Affairs in coordination with NESTS is continuously following up with the State Governments to provide suitable land for construction. Additionally, in EMRSs where work has been commenced, the Ministry and NESTS organize periodic review meeting for all construction agencies to monitor the timely

progress of construction. As on date, 235 schools sanctioned under the old scheme and the Phase 1 construction of 17 schools under the new scheme have been completed. Construction work is in progress at 246 locations. Under the new scheme, Administrative Approval and Expenditure Sanction (A/A & E/S) has been issued for 323 locations, construction work has commenced at 219 locations where suitable land has been provided by States. On many other locations, where land has been found to be suitable, estimates are being prepared for technical and administrative sanctions. NESTS has constituted a dedicated construction wing with experienced engineers and architects to strengthen the monitoring mechanism and are consistently monitoring the construction activities assigned to PSUs/CPWD/State Govt. at various locations across the States. It is therefore expected that significant progress will be made during the coming months. With reference to the concern raised regarding timely appointment of more than 38000 teachers as announced in the Budget 2023-24, it is humbly submitted that necessary steps have been taken. It has been decided to carry out recruitment of regular teaching and non-teaching staff in a phased manner. In the year 2023-24, it is proposed to fill approximately 10,000 teaching and non-teaching posts. In the second phase additional 9000 vacancies shall be filled and the entire process is likely to be completed by 2025-26. CBSE has been requested to facilitate the recruitment process for which the Recruitment Rules have been finalized and notifications are to be issued. With regards to the recommendation of the Hon'ble Committee on addressing the difficulties of first-time learners/children from tribal population in clearing the entrance exams for EMRS, it is stated that as per the admission guidelines of EMRS, there is no pre-condition for any formal education. The entrance exams for EMRS are designed in a way to test aptitude and verbal ability of the children keeping first-time learners in mind. Children devoid of any formal education from tribal population may appear and qualify for the exam without much difficulty. In so far as the school curriculum of EMRS is concerned, it is submitted that EMRSs have either been affiliated to CBSE Board or State Board. As per the affiliation bye-laws, the schools are to follow the curriculum and syllabus prescribed by CBSE/NCERT or as prescribed by the State Board. However, it has been reported that the schools ensure that inspiring life-stories of tribal leaders, freedom fighters, academicians, environmentalists, entrepreneurs, market leaders etc.

are included during morning assembly, as part of co-curricular activities conducted at school level, and at other events at National Level. The suggested topics were also included as part of EMRS National Cultural Fest by way of storytelling, theatre etc. The Budgetary Estimates of 2023-24 for the scheme of EMRS is ₹5,943.00 Crores. Out of which, the expenditure of ₹1,277.96 Crores has been incurred as on 03.05.23.

Ministry of Tribal Affairs OM No. 16015/01/2023-PC dated 19.06.2023

CHAPTER- III

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE GOVERNMENT'S REPLY

(Recommendation Para No. 5.12)

The Committee note that Proviso to Article 275 (1) of the Constitution of India provides for release of Grants to 26 States having ST population. Under this Programme, 100 per cent funding is made by Government of India towards various sectors such as education, health, agriculture, horticulture, animal husbandry, fisheries, dairy, skill development and other income generating Schemes to enable the States in promoting the welfare of Scheduled Tribes. The Committee have, however, found that the Budgetary Estimates were substantially reduced at RE stage as several States/UTs did not comply to the provision of submission of Utilization Certificates and PPRs as per provisions of GFR and also due to nature of the Projects sanctioned which require creation of Capital Assets thus taking substantial time for completion. The Committee are happy to note that majority of the States/UTs have submitted Utilization Certificates now in respect of the funds released. However, some States such as Maharashtra, Madhya Pradesh, Assam and Andhra Pradesh have not been able to take full share of allocation due to outstanding Utilization Certificates over the years. The Committee also found that the overall expenditure on various sectors has gone considerably down during 2020- 21 and 2021-22 in comparison to 2017-18, 2018-19 and 2019-20 and hence would like to know reasons therefor. The Committee have further observed that no evaluation study has been conducted to assess the performance of the Scheme. Hence, they urge the Ministry to conduct periodic evaluation of the progress under this Constitutional Provision so that the lacunae in the implementation of the Scheme are timely identified and plugged suitably.

Reply of the Government

This Ministry has been taking earnest effort to obtain pending UCs and PPRs from the concerned state and as a result most of the states have submitted these documents. Ministry is also holding periodic review meeting with those states from where these

documents are awaited to facilitate adequate and time release of funds to these states. The decrease in the overall expenditure on various sectors during 2020-21 and 2021-22 is due to the fact that till 2019-20, the allocation for the scheme of EMRS was also part of the budget allocation for Grants under Article 275 (1). However, since the scheme of EMRS was carved out as a separate central sector scheme from Grants under Article 275 (1) of the Constitution of India, therefore, from the Financial Year 2020-21, separate allocation was made for the scheme of EMRS under different appropriate head of account and therefore, the allocation of the Grants under Article 275 (1) was correspondingly reduced. As regards the recommendation of the Committee for evaluation of the progress under this constitutional provision, it is submitted that this has been noted for compliance.

Ministry of Tribal Affairs OM No. 16015/01/2023-PC dated 19.06.2023

(Recommendation Para No.7.11)

The Committee find the performance of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs commendable with regard to the actual expenditure *vis-à-vis* revised estimate in the Scheme of "Grant in aid to Voluntary Organizations working for the welfare of Scheduled Tribes" as they were able to spend ₹59.50 crore out of ₹60 crore in 2020-2021, ₹89.25 crore out of ₹90 crore in 2021-2022 and ₹88.92 crore out of ₹110 crore upto 31st January, 2023 in 2022-2023. Further, the Ministry has got a substantially increased budgetary provision by ₹30 crore for 2023-2024 to ₹140 crore in comparison to ₹110 crore budgeted for 2022-2023. However, the Committee are perplexed to note that the Ministry had approved only 166 projects out of 404 recommended by States/UTs between 2017-2018 to 2020- 21 and that no new projects were sanctioned in 2021-22 as the NGO portal was not opened. The Committee do not find any reason attributed by Ministry of Tribal Affairs for non-approval of the Projects recommended by the State Committee for support of voluntary efforts and thus feel that making the scheme suffer for want of an open NGO portal only is not desirable. Non-approval of the Projects discourages Voluntary Organisations particularly when the Scheme is demand driven. The Committee do not find any logic in fixing targets on the basis of allocation of funds for the particular year and physical achievements of previous year when the percentage

approval of the project is very less. The Committee would, therefore, like the Ministry to ensure that all viable Projects are approved with a view to achieve the objectives of the Scheme. The Committee would also appreciate if the Budgetary Estimates are not reduced at RE stage as happened in previous years and due efforts are made to make the scheme effective in the interest of tribal population of the Country. The Committee feel that to contain dubious NGOs and encourage genuine NGOs, regular evaluation of the Scheme should be held by an agency. The recommendations contained in such evaluation study should be examined and suitably implemented to remove flaws in the Scheme. The Committee also observe that inter-alia remarks of the Ministry, as submitted by them on the recommendations of Bharat Rural Livelihood Foundation pertaining to revision in Ministry's share of the budget, prioritization of the projects, enhancement in salary and financial support to set up digital learning facilities in schools are not convincing. The Committee desire that these recommendations should be reviewed and if found appropriate, these may be implemented. The Committee would like to be apprised of the action taken in this regard.

Reply of the Government

It is submitted for kind consideration of the Hon Committee that in the above observations/recommendations of Committee, expenditure of ₹59.50 cr and ₹89.25 cr are mentioned for FY 2020-21 and 2021-22 respectively for NGO. It appears that the figures taken were provisional and the final expenditure for the respective FYs are 59.66 cr and 89.43 cr. As observed by the Hon'ble Committee, Ministry of Tribal Affairs (MoTA) had utilized more than 99 per cent of the funds allocated in RE in the Financial Years 2020-21 and 2021-22 under the Scheme 'Grants in Aid to Voluntary Organisations working for the Welfare of the Scheduled Tribes'. Further, an amount of ₹109.25 crore (99.31%) was utilized against BE/RE of ₹110.00 crore during the last financial year *i.e.*, FY 2022-23. Ministry is hopeful that the entire funds allocated under the scheme in the current Financial Year (2023-24) will be utilized. It is submitted that at present Ministry is funding around 190 NGOs for about 320 projects in service deficient areas, LWE affected areas and border areas, primarily in education and health sectors for the welfare of Scheduled Tribes. Scheme guidelines have been revised *w.e.f.* 2022- 23. In

the revised guidelines financial norm for all the projects has been enhanced in the range of 23-40 percent as decided in EFC and approved by CCEA. For the current year and next 2 Financial Years ₹140 crore, ₹150 crore and ₹160 crore have been approved in EFC. Proposals for new projects have been invited through the NGO portal. Ministry will consider to sanction new projects for the current Financial Year. However, while considering the new projects MoTA is required to take into account the committed liability of the projects of previous years, availability of fund and enhancement of beneficiaries for the on-going projects for the current year, and the budgetary allocation for the current Financial Year under the scheme. As recommended by the Hon'ble Committee, provision for regular assessment/evaluation of the projects by an independent agency has been included in the revised guidelines. Assessment includes prefunding appraisal of new project applications, evaluation of the ongoing projects to assess the performance, effectiveness of the project deliverables, grading of all organizations/projects based on the performance of the projects, etc. Ministry is examining appointing an independent agency in this regard. It is also submitted that Bharat Rural Livelihoods Foundation (BRLF) had conducted evaluation study of the scheme for its continuation in the current financial cycle. Recommendations of BRLF were taken into account while submitting EFC proposals and note for CCEA. MoTA intends to further improve the functioning of the scheme based on the evaluation study by the independent agency.

Ministry of Tribal Affairs OM No. 16015/01/2023-PC dated 19.06.2023

CHAPTER-IV

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION.

(Recommendation Para No.3.9)

The Committee are happy to note that under Pradhan Mantri Adi Adarsh Gram Yojana, the Ministry of Tribal Affairs have identified 36428 villages having at least 50% tribal population and 500 STs for integrated development to bridge the gap existing in various sectors of development including health, education, livelihood, housing, road connectivity, etc. in a phased manner between 2021-22 to 2025-26. The Committee find that 16554 villages were taken up for integrated development during 2021-22 and 2022-23 and an amount of ₹2,047 crore has been released to the States/UTS under Village Development Plan in support of 6264 villages. It has also been found that no funds were released to Andhra Pradesh, Dadra & Nagar Haveli and Daman & Diu, Goa, Jammu & Kashmir, Ladakh, Kerala, Maharashtra, Meghalaya, Sikkim, Uttarakhand, Uttar Pradesh and West Bengal during 2021-22 for 1251 villages approved in the States/UTs. Similarly, funds were also not released to the States of Andhra Pradesh, Arunachal Pradesh, Bihar, Goa, Himachal Pradesh, Kerala, Sikkim, Uttarakhand and Uttar Pradesh for 231 villages approved for 2022-23. The Committee are constrained to observe that the objective of the Scheme may witness a setback as the funds have been released for less than 40% of the total number of villages approved for integrated development. Hence, they would like to be apprised of the reasons for not releasing funds to several villages in 2021-22 and 2022-23. The Committee further note that no time limit has been fixed for the integrated development of each village. The timeline taken for completing the identified works in a village need to be planned, therefore they recommend that stage wise time limit, along with provision of monitoring at the level of Ministry, should be worked out for the integrated development of villages. The Committee like the Ministry to lay down guidelines/SOPs with regard to the integrated development of tribal villages along with time limit. The Committee would not like the Ministry to hold State/UTs responsible for the slow pace of progress of different

activities under the Scheme hence it is the utmost requirement that the possible causes for delay should be identified at the present stage itself. The Committee also recommend that the criteria for selection of villages would need to be reviewed at later stage so that the villages having less than 50% ST population are also covered, once the works in villages identified as per the prevailing criteria, are completed so that all tribal villages progress in a similar fashion.

Reply of the Government

The Ministry feels motivated with the note of pleasure by the Committee at the outset of their observations with regard to PMAAGY scheme. The observations and comments of the Committee are guiding light for the Ministry in implementation of the scheme further. With regard to the concerns expressed by the Committee, it is mentioned as follows:

Release of funds under PMAAGY: As per the scheme guidelines, 50 % of the funds are to be released to the States / UTs concerned on selection of villages for the financial years, subject to compliance of procedural requirements related to Single Nodal Account (SNA), transfer of funds from State Treasury to the SNA, submission of utilization Certificates (UCs) by the States and other relevant financial instructions issued by Ministry of Finance from time to time. Remaining 50% of the entitled funds are released after submission of Village Development Plans by the State Government / UT Administration and approval by the Project Appraisal Committee (PAC). The scheme is a Centrally Sponsored Scheme. Formulation of VDPs and implementation of approved projects are the responsibility of the concerned States / UTs. Ministry makes efforts to the best of the capacity for ensuring smooth and accelerated implementation of the Scheme. At the same time, responsive support of the concerned States / UTs is equally essential for desired results. Funds could not be released to the following States / UTs during 2021-22 and 2022-23, as pointed out by the Committee, due to non-fulfillment of prerequisites by them as mentioned below:

Financial year: 2021-22:

₹ in Lakhs

| Name of the State | No. of villages | 50% of the entitled fund (@Rs. 20.38 lakh per village) | UC pending | SNA compliance |
|-------------------|-----------------|--|------------|----------------|
| Andhra Pradesh | 109 | 1110.71 | 13682.87 | No |
| DNDD | 12 | 122.28 | 0.00 | No |
| Goa | 4 | 40.76 | 651.82 | No |
| J & K | 64 | 652.16 | 372.95 | No |
| Ladakh | 28 | 285.32 | 0.00 | No |
| Kerala | 1 | 10.19 | 0.00 | No |
| Maharashtra | 759 | 7734.21 | 18787.71 | No |
| Meghalaya | 176 | 1793.44 | 2659.45 | No |
| Sikkim | 13 | 132.47 | 1232.32 | No |
| Uttarakhand | 13 | 132.47 | 433.02 | No |
| Uttar Pradesh | 39 | 397.41 | 1288.74 | No |
| West Bengal | 184 | 1874.96 | 1398.09 | No |

Financial year: 2022-23:

₹ in Lakhs

| Name of the State | No. of villages | 50% of the entitled fund (@Rs. 20.38 lakh per village) | UC pending | SNA compliance |
|-------------------|-----------------|--|------------|----------------|
| Andhra Pradesh | 94 | 957.86 | 13682.87 | No |
| Arunachal Pradesh | 26 | 264.94 | 5973.48 | No |
| Bihar | 34 | 346.46 | 3880.44 | No |
| Goa | 4 | 40.76 | 651.82 | No |
| Kerala | 1 | 10.19 | 0.00 | No |
| Sikkim | 11 | 112.09 | 1232.32 | No |
| Uttarakhand | 12 | 122.28 | 433.02 | No |
| Uttar Pradesh | 33 | 336.27 | 288.74 | No |

Approval of Village Development Plan (VDP): Preparation of VDPs at the State level is an exhaustive process, which involves several layers of administrative structure starting from the villages to the Gram Sabha, District Level Committee and State Level Executive Committee. Thereafter, the VDPs are submitted to this Ministry. Subsequent to that, the VDPs are appraised and approved by the Project Appraisal Committee in the Ministry. This is followed by further release of funds to the States / UTs after obtaining concurrence from Integrated Finance Division subject to compliance of SNA norms. It may be noted that preparation and approval of VDP under PMAAGY is a continuous exercise. So far, the Ministry has received VDPs from the following states and the same have been appraised and approved by the Ministry:

| S. No. | Name of the State | Total No. of villages identified under PMAAGY | Villages selected for taking up during 2021-22 and 2022-23 | VDPs submitted by the States / UTs till 31.03.2023 | VDPs approved by PAC | Total funds released till 31.03.2023 (Rs. in lakh) |
|---------------|--------------------------|--|---|---|-----------------------------|---|
| | Andhra Pradesh | 517 | 203 | 0 | -- | 0.00 |
| | Arunachal Pradesh | 141 | 98 | 0 | -- | 733.68 |
| | Assam | 1700 | 1167 | 858 | 858 | 20281.24 |
| | Bihar | 184 | 110 | 0 | - | 774.44 |
| | Chhattisgarh | 4029 | 2263 | 1530 | 1530 | 38617.62 |
| | DNDD | 55 | 22 | 0 | - | 173.23 |
| | Goa | 21 | 8 | 0 | - | 0.00 |
| | Gujarat | 3764 | 2246 | 1562 | 1562 | 35318.54 |
| | Himachal Pradesh | 90 | 53 | 37 | 37 | 665.12 |
| | J & K | 302 | 119 | 0 | - | 932.39 |
| | Ladakh | 132 | 52 | 0 | - | 470.93 |
| | Jharkhand | 3891 | 1526 | 0 | - | 13447.07 |

| | | | | | | |
|--|----------------|-------|-------|------|------|-----------|
| | Karnataka | 507 | 302 | 197 | 197 | 3077.38 |
| | Kerala | 6 | 2 | 0 | - | 0.00 |
| | Madhya Pradesh | 7307 | 2867 | 1195 | 1195 | 39963.30 |
| | Maharashtra | 3605 | 1414 | 1553 | 1553 | 13485.50 |
| | Manipur | 254 | 99 | 0 | - | 723.45 |
| | Meghalaya | 836 | 328 | 0 | - | 3342.30 |
| | Mizoram | 344 | 135 | 135 | 135 | 2399.44 |
| | Nagaland | 530 | 208 | 125 | 125 | 3120.50 |
| | Odisha | 1653 | 649 | 176 | - | 3772.92 |
| | Rajasthan | 4302 | 1688 | 860 | 860 | 22494.37 |
| | Sikkim | 62 | 24 | 0 | - | 0.00 |
| | Tamil Nadu | 167 | 65 | 0 | | 570.94 |
| | Telangana | 533 | 319 | 332 | 332 | 3943.22 |
| | Tripura | 375 | 147 | 147 | 147 | 1536.26 |
| | Uttarakhand | 64 | 25 | 0 | | 0.00 |
| | Uttar Pradesh | 183 | 72 | 0 | | 0.00 |
| | West Bengal | 874 | 343 | 0 | | 3495.20 |
| | Total | 36428 | 16554 | 8707 | 8707 | 213339.04 |

Timeline for completion of projects: Government has approved the scheme of 'Pradhan Mantri Adi Adarsh Gram Yojana (PMAAGY)' for implementation during the years 2021-22 to 2025-26 wherein 36,428 villages having at least 50% tribal population and 500 STs across States / UTs is being taken up for transforming them into model villages (adarsh gram). All the 36,428 villages will be developed in the time frame of 2021-22 to 2025-26. This Ministry is rigorously coordinating with the State Governments for submission of VDP. State Governments have submitted VDPs for 8707 villages under the scheme for the year 2021- 22 and 2022-23 till 31.03.2023. The Ministry has approved the VDPs for these 8707 villages till 31.03.2023. Subsequently, Ministry has received VDPs for 641 villages from Government of Jharkhand and 44 villages from Government of Manipur. The process of appraisal and approval of these VDPs is

continuously going on. Monitoring of the implementation of Scheme: The scheme guidelines of 'PMAAGY' has provision of Project Monitoring Unit in the Ministry of Tribal Affairs to provide technical resource support for execution of the Scheme in coordination with the Central Ministries and State Governments. Similarly, at the State/UT level, the scheme guidelines provide for a Project Monitoring Unit to extend technical resource support for implementation of the Scheme in coordination with District Level Committee / ITDP / ITDA / MADA Clusters / Gram Panchayats, etc. Necessary support systems can also be provided at the District/Division level on need basis. Review of criteria for selection of villages: The recommendation of the Committee that the criteria for selection of villages would need to be reviewed at later stage so that the villages having less than 50% ST population are also covered, once the works in villages identified as per the prevailing criteria, are completed. This has been noted for deliberations and further appropriate action in the Ministry.

Ministry of Tribal Affairs OM No. 16015/01/2023-PC dated 19.06.2023

(Recommendation Para No.4.10)

The Committee are rather apprehensive on the enhanced budgetary allocation for PVTGs and its utilization by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs as data on population of Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups (PVTGs) in several States/UTs is still not available with them. During oral evidence, the representatives of the Ministry had informed that for PVTGs, annual expenditure to the tune of ₹5,000 crore has been planned. The Committee have also been informed that the Ministry had requested States/UTs to carry out baseline surveys and now they are in the process of verification of the population data received in consultation with States/UTs. The Committee feel that this should have been done earlier because they strongly believe that in the absence of correct details of the population of PVTGs, the financial allocation for the Scheme may not bear the desired results. An evaluation study has also brought out the fact that PVTG data is absent in many States/UTs, including A&N islands visited recently by the Committee, where 6 out of 7 ST groups fall under PVTGs. The Committee hope that now the details of the population of PVTGs in different States/UTs would be collected seriously and verified at the earliest so that the budgetary allocation for them is utilized correctly and

socio-economic development of PVTGs could be done in a comprehensive manner. The Committee, at the same time, appreciate that at least some initiatives for the socioeconomic development of PVTGs have been taken for the 17,02,589 persons from PVTGs, as revealed by the office of Registrar General of India. As only a very meagre amount of ₹6.48 crore could be spent by 31st January, 2023 out of the Budgetary Estimates of ₹252 crore for the year 2022-23 and the budgetary estimates had to be substantially reduced at RE stage in 2020-21, 2021-22 and 2022-23 awaiting the utilization certificates and demand/proposals from State Governments/UT Administrations, the Committee expect the Ministry to focus on the welfare of PVTGs under a well-conceived Action Plan. Since the latest introduction of Single Nodal Agency model under PFMS (SNA) has also reportedly resulted in non-release of funds to States/UTs, the Committee would like the Ministry to take suitable necessary action for enabling States/UTs to do timely nomination of Single Nodal Agency so that the problem of lower expenditure due to the pendency of utilization certificates is resolved and the grant due is released to the States/UTs. The Committee would also like the Ministry to guide the State/UT Governments on how to submit the Conservation-cum-Development plan for the socioeconomic development of the PVTGs, and release funds accordingly. The Committee feel that the new initiative of the Government i.e. Pradhan Mantri Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups (PVTG) Development Mission, if implemented with the requisite push, will rejuvenate the crumbling Scheme as it is expected to overcome the flaws of the Scheme. Hence, the Committee would like the Ministry to expeditiously frame the modalities/SOPs/guidelines of the said Mission.

The Committee would like to be informed of the necessary steps taken in this regard by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs.

Reply to Government

Ministry of Tribal Affairs is thankful to the Hon Committee for raising very relevant concerns. Obtaining and maintaining a reliable database in respect of the PVTG is a very important priority for the Ministry. Ministry is continuously taking up the matter for verification of the data in consultation with States / UT. With regard to submission of conservationcum- development plan, it is stated that extant scheme guidelines of

Development of PVTGs defines the sectors and areas to be undertaken under the CCD plan. Further, Ministry, while requesting States / UTs for furnishing annual plan / CCD plans, advises the parameters and priority areas to be focused. For compliance of SNA procedure also, Ministry has been continuously taking up the matter with States. In so far as framing of modalities / SOPs / guidelines of the PM PVTG Development Mission is concerned, it is stated that Ministry of Tribal Affairs is in the process of formulating the PM PVTG Development Mission documents (in consonance with the announcement made in Budget 2023-24) in consultation with concerned Central Ministries / Departments. It is a challenge to achieve convergence of the resources and schemes of other Ministries like Rural Development, Education, Health, Women and Child Development.

Ministry of Tribal Affairs OM No. 16015/01/2023-PC dated 19.06.2023

(Recommendation Para No.8.8)

The Committee find that 27 Tribal Research Institutes (TRIs) have been established in the country from the 1950s till 2020. The first TRI at Jharkhand (erstwhile undivided Bihar) was established as early as 1953 and TRI at Goa was established in 2020. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs extends support to strengthen TRIs in their infrastructural needs, research and documentation activities and training and capacity building programs, exchange points by tribals, etc. so that the tribal cultural practices, languages and rituals are preserved and disseminated. The Committee had an opportunity to visit TRIs in Gujarat and A&N Islands and appreciated their efforts, however, they are yet to find any Institute that has performed extraordinarily with a ground breaking discovery of tribal history, hence they are of the firm opinion that these Institutes need to work more and in depth to gain on tribal research. The Committee are also not happy to note that budgeted estimates for 2020- 2021, 2021-2022 and 2022-23 were reduced almost to half at RE stage. The actual expenditure of ₹6.96 crore against RE of ₹58.50 crore by 31st January, 2023 in 2022-23 does not seem to be a healthy implementation of the TRI Scheme. The Committee are not convinced with the routine reply of the Ministry for slow progress of the scheme in 2022-23. They feel that mere allocation of funds does not assure the success of any

Scheme. It is a known fact that the traditional culture of the various communities is disappearing fast and in the case of tribal communities, the situation cannot be more true. The Committee are history, practices, languages and rituals. The Committee believe that any change in procedure should not prove be detrimental for the scheme rather it should help in better management and monitoring of funds. The Committee therefore recommend that appropriate expertise is developed and disseminated so that viable proposals from TRIs are received from States. The Committee also desire that research activities of all the Tribal Research Institutes should be increased. In this connection, the Committee, during their recent visit to Ahmedabad, had called attention towards the Siddi tribe in Gujarat and Karnataka, which are originally negroid, having come originally from the African Continent eons ago, but are now completely amalgamated in the Indian ethos, as this particular group had largely remained on the margins so far. Bearing an athletic build, this tribe can show real promise in sports activities too, once provided proper support from the Government. The Committee would like to be informed of the action taken by the Ministry in this regard.

Reply of the Government

The Committee's recommendations and the suggestions on gathering more proposal about viable tribal related research activities including sports activities by the TRIs, have been conveyed to the concerned State/UT Governments/TRIs so that such proposals are sent for the consideration of the selection committee under the scheme of 'Support TRI'. The matter of encouragement of sports amongst the Siddi tribe has also been conveyed.

Ministry of Tribal Affairs OM No. 16015/01/2023-PC dated 19.06.2023

CHAPTER-V

**OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE
GOVERNMENT ARE INTERIM IN NATURE.**

NIL

NEW DELHI;

**20th December, 2023
29 Agrahayana, 1945 (Saka)**

RAMA DEVI

**Chairperson,
Standing Committee on
Social Justice and
Empowerment**

ANALYSIS OF ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE CONTAINED IN THEIR FORTY-FOURTH REPORT (SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA) ON 'DEMANDS FOR GRANTS (2023-24)' OF THE MINISTRY OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS

| | Total | Percentage |
|--|-------|------------|
| I. Total number of Recommendations | 10 | |
| II. Observations/ Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government- Rec. Para No.2.10, 2.11, 6.8, 9.11 & 10.12 | 05 | 50% |
| III. Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's reply:- Rec. Para No.5.12 & 7.11 | 02 | 20 |
| IV. Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration:- Rec. Para No. 3.9, 4.10 & 8.8 | 03 | 30% |
| V. Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government are interim in nature:- Rec. Para No. NIL | 00 | 00 |
| | | 100% |