

Saturday, 27th July 1957

# LOK SABHA DEBATES

**Second Series**

**Volume IV, 1957**

*(27th July to 8th August, 1957)*



**SECOND SESSION, 1957**

*(Vol. IV Contains Nos. 11 to 20)*

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI**

## CONTENTS

[Second Series, Volume IV—27th July to 8th August, 1957]

	COLUMNS
<b>No. 11—Saturday, 27th July, 1957.</b>	
Business of the House . . . . .	5471—73
Question of Privilege . . . . .	5473—74
Panel of Chairmen . . . . .	5520
Demands for Grants—	5475—5642
Ministry of Health—	5475—5566
Ministry of Community Development	5567—5642
Daily Digest . . . . .	5643-44
<b>No. 12—Monday, 29th July, 1957.</b>	
Oral Answers to Questions—	
Starred Questions Nos. 412 to 428 and 430 to 432 . . . . .	5645—82
Written Answers to Questions—	
Starred Questions Nos. 409 to 411, 429, 433 to 442, 444 and 445 . . . . .	5682—92
Unstarred Questions Nos. 301 to 316 and 318 to 339 . . . . .	5692—5711
Motion for adjournment—	
Rise in Jamuna level . . . . .	5711-12
Papers laid on the Table—	5712-13
Committee on Absence of Members—First Report . . . . .	5714
Calling Attention to Matter of Urgent Public Importance—	
Agreement between the Bombay Dock Workers and the Government . . . . .	5714
Election to Committees—	
(1) Indian Central Arecanut Committee . . . . .	5714-15
(2) Indian Lac Cess Committee . . . . .	5715
Appropriation (Railways) No. 2 Bill—Introduced . . . . .	5716
Industrial Finance Corporation (Amendment) Bill—Introduced . . . . .	5716
Mines and Minerals (Regulation and Development) Bill—Introduced . . . . .	5716-17
Inter-State Corporation Bill—Introduced . . . . .	5717
Demands for Grants—	5717—5854
Ministry of Community Development . . . . .	5717—5803
Ministry of Food and Agriculture . . . . .	5803—54
Daily Digest . . . . .	5855—60
<b>No. 13—Tuesday, 30th July, 1957.</b>	
Members sworn . . . . .	5861
Oral Answers to Questions—	
Starred Questions Nos. 447, 449 to 451, 453, 455 to 460, 463 to 466, 468 to 471, 473 and 474 . . . . .	5861—97
Written Answers to Questions—	
Starred Questions Nos. 446, 448, 452, 454, 461, 462, 467, 472 and 475 to 485 . . . . .	5897—5907
Unstarred Questions Nos. 340 to 342 and 344 to 377 . . . . .	5907—28
Papers laid on the Table—	5928
Calling Attention to Matter of Urgent Public Importance—	
Fall in production of certain mills and the effects thereof . . . . .	5929-30
Demands for Grants—	
Ministry of Food and Agriculture . . . . .	5930—6094
Daily Digest . . . . .	6095—98

	COLUMNS
<i>No. 14—Wednesday, 31st July, 1957.</i>	
Oral Answers to Questions—	
Starred Questions Nos. 486 to 488, 507, 489 to 492, 494 to 496, 499, 501 to 504, 506, 509 and 512 to 514	6099—6136
Short Notice Question No. 1	6136—38
Written Answers to Questions—	
Starred Questions Nos. 493, 497, 498, 500, 505, 508, 510, 515 and 518 to 529	6138—49
Unstarred Questions Nos. 378 to 393, 395 to 404 and 406 to 416.	6149—69
Motion for Adjournment—	
Strike of municipal workers and sweepers in New Delhi	6169—73
Paper laid on the Table	
Calling Attention to Matter of Urgent Public Importance—	6173
Collision of an engine with a goods train	6173—75
Leave of Absence	6175—76
Election to Committees—	
(1) Coffee Board	6176
(2) Rubber Board	6177
Demands for Grants—	
Ministry of Irrigation and Power	6177—6302
Daily Digest	6303—06
<i>No. 15—Thursday, 1st August, 1957.</i>	
Member sworn	6307
Oral Answers to Questions—	
Starred Questions Nos. 530, 532, 567, 533 to 543, 546, 547, 544, 545 and 548	6307—42
Written Answers to Questions—	
Starred Questions Nos. 549 to 565, 568 and 569	6342—53
Unstarred Questions Nos. 417 to 442	6353—69
Motions for Adjournment and Calling Attention to Matter of Urgent Public Importance—	
Sweepers' strike in Delhi and Police firing	6370—93
Demands for Grants—	
Ministry of Irrigation and Power	6393—6510
Daily Digest	6511—14
<i>No. 16—Friday, 2nd August, 1957.</i>	
Oral Answers to Questions—	
Starred Questions Nos. 570 to 573 and 575 to 582.	6515—46
Written Answers to Questions—	
Starred Questions Nos. 574, 583 to 606.	6546—60
Unstarred Questions Nos. 443 to 467	6560—71
Papers laid on the Table	
Business Advisory Committee—Fifth Report	6571—72
Calling Attention to a Matter of Urgent Public Importance—	6572
Explosion of a railway wagon at Asansol	6572—74
Point of Information	6574—6655
Demands for Grants—	
Ministry of Law	6574—6610
Ministry of Transport and Communications	6610—53
Committee on Private Members' Bills and Resolutions—Third Report	6655
Resolution <i>re</i> Discontinuance of grant of scholarships to students on community basis	6656—6702

	<i>Columns</i>
<b>Resolution re Appointment of a committee to examine the Regional Disparity Average per capita income</b>	6702—16
<b>Daily Digest</b>	6717—20
<i>No. 17—Saturday, 3rd August, 1957</i>	
<b>Motions for Adjournment—</b>	
Sweepers' strike in Delhi and Police Firing	6721—23, 6863—6928
<b>Calling attention to matter of Urgent Public Importance—</b>	
Sweepers strike in Delhi and Police Firing	6723-24
Business of the House	6724
Correction of Answer to Starred Question No. 636	6724—25
<b>Statement re appointment of a Commission of Enquiry re Emoluments and Conditions of Service of Central Government Employees</b>	6725—26
<b>Essential Services Maintenance Bill—</b>	
Introduced	6726—48
<b>Demands for Grants—</b>	
Ministry of Transport and Communications	6748—6863
Paper laid on the Table	6851
<b>Business Advisory Committee—</b>	
Sixth Report	6863—65
Daily Digest	6929—30
<i>No. 18—Monday, 5th August, 1957</i>	
<b>Oral Answers to Questions—</b>	
Starred Questions Nos 607 to 616, 619, 620, 622 to 626, 628 and 629	6931—69
Short Notice Question No. 2	6969—74
<b>Written Answers to Questions—</b>	
Starred Questions Nos. 617, 618, 621, 627, 630 to 635, 635-A, 636 to 649	6974—87
Unstarred Questions Nos 468 to 472, 474 to 479, 481 to 489, 491 and 492	6987—7002
<b>Papers laid on the Table</b>	7002—05
<b>Business Advisory Committee—</b>	
Fifth Report	7005
<b>Essential Services Maintenance Bill—</b>	
Motion to consider	7006—7182
Daily Digest	7183—86
<i>No. 19—Tuesday, 6th August, 1957</i>	
<b>Oral Answers to Questions—</b>	
Starred Questions Nos. 650 to 653, 655 to 663, 665, 666, 668 and 669	7187—7222
Short Notice Question No. 5	7222
<b>Written Answers to Questions —</b>	
Starred Questions Nos. 654, 664, 667, 670 to 691, 693, 694, 694-A, 695 to 697 and 531	7222—38
Unstarred Questions Nos 493 to 500 and 502 to 525	7239—57
Short Notice Questions Nos 3 and 4	7257—58
Papers laid on the Table	7258—59
Business of the House	7259—62
<b>Essential Services Maintenance Bill—</b>	
Clauses 2 to 8 and 1	7260—7405
Motion to pass	7405—19
<b>Demands for Grants—</b>	
Ministry of Transport and Communications	7419—54
Daily Digest	7455—60



	<i>Columns</i>
<i>No. 20—Thursday, 8th August, 1957</i>	
<b>Oral Answers to Questions—</b>	
Starred Questions Nos. 698 to 702, 729, 704, 705 and 707 to 717 . . . . .	7461—83
Short Notice Question No. 6 . . . . .	7494—96
<b>Written Answers to Questions—</b>	
Starred Questions Nos. 703, 706, 718 to 728 and 730 to 739 . . . . .	7496—7509
Unstarred Questions Nos. 526 to 528, 530 to 560 and 562 to 569 . . . . .	7509—30
Statement <i>vs</i> impending stoppages of work in certain essential services . . . . .	7530—32
Papers laid on the Table . . . . .	7535
<b>Calling Attention to Matter of Urgent Public Importance—</b>	
<i>Rs</i> : termination of Services of Inspectors of Life Insurance Corporation . . . . .	7534—35
<b>Demands for Grants . . . . .</b>	<b>7535—7686</b>
Ministry of Transport and Communications . . . . .	7535—7605
Ministry of Information and Broadcasting . . . . .	7609—86
Statement <i>vs</i> : withdrawal of proposed strike by P. & T. employees . . . . .	7636—86
Daily Digest . . . . .	7687—90

*N.B.*—The sign + above a name of a Member on Questions, which were orally answered, indicates that the Question was actually asked on the floor of the House by that Member.

## LOK SABHA DEBATES

5471

### LOK SABHA

Saturday, 27th July, 1957.

*The Lok Sabha met at Eleven of the Clock*

[MR SPEAKER in the Chair]

### BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

**The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs (Shri Satya Narayan Sinha):** With your permission, Sir, I rise to announce that in accordance with the order of discussion and voting of Demands for Grants announced by me on 19th July and the allocation of time for them as approved by this House, business for the week commencing Monday, the 29th July, will consist of the discussion and voting of Demands for Grants in respect of the Ministries of Food and Agriculture, Irrigation and Power, Law, Transport and Communications, Information and Broadcasting, and Rehabilitation and Minority Affairs. Should the discussion of any Demands remain unfinished today, the Demands stated above will be taken up after the conclusion of the voting of Demands carried over from today.

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh (Sasaram):** I would suggest that the time allotted for the discussion of the Demands for Grants relating to the Ministry of Community Development should be extended by two or three hours, because that is a subject which concerns every Member. The time allotted for it now is only 5 hours.

**Shri Satya Narayan Sinha:** For the information of my hon friend, I might tell him through you that this matter was considered, when time was being

5472

allocated for the different Ministries. In the first instance, we had allotted only three hours for this Ministry. But the leaders of the various groups there insisted, and I yielded, and thus 2 hours more, as a sort of compromise, were added to the time allotted for the Ministry of Community Development. So, from this, it looks as if they were all agreed to 5 hours as a compromise. But today, I believe, the House is sitting till 4.30 P.M. or something like that: I do not know.

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** But this concerns every Member.

**Mr. Speaker:** A full day was allotted for this, till 5.30 P.M. inclusive of the half an hour extension. Of course, community project is an ever-increasing or ever-growing demand.

**Shri Satya Narayan Sinha:** I shall have no objection if the House sits late for half an hour or an hour more. But so far as the extension of the time is concerned, the entire programme for the Demands coming up next week will be upset.

**Sardar A. S. Saigal (Janjgir):** When every Member wants that the time should be extended, that request should be considered, and time should be extended.

**Shri Satya Narayan Sinha:** I have already explained the position to the House.

**Mr. Speaker:** Two hours have been allotted for the Ministry of Health, and we are going to start the discussion on those Demands presently. This discussion will go on up to one o'clock. And 5 hours for the Ministry of Community Development would mean that it would go up to 6 P.M., unless the House is willing to sit till six o'clock, it will go over to the next day.

[Mr. Speaker]

I shall do this. Let us sit till 5.30 P.M. today, and the Minister will be asked to reply on the next day. Thus, we shall have 4½ hours today, and half an hour or one hour more next week—let it not be included in these 5 hours. I shall give only half an hour to the Minister. That way, it will be extended.

### QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE

#### PUBLICATION BY P.I.B. OF ANSWERED STARRED QUESTION BEFORE BEING ORALLY ANSWERED

Mr. Speaker: Shrimati Renu Chakravarty brought to my notice yesterday, and tabled also a motion yesterday or the day before when she raised the matter in the House, that a question which was originally tabled as an unstarred question had been admitted as unstarred; subsequently, it had been converted into a starred question, and it was put down for answer on the 23rd inst or so; later on, after it was admitted as a starred question, it was postponed to the 31st inst. But, notwithstanding the postponement, the Press Information Bureau have announced in their bulletin or in their hand-outs of the replies the reply to this question also, which was not given on that day, but which was intended to be given on a later day, to which the question had been postponed.

This matter was raised as a breach of privilege. The Principle Information Officer was written to regarding this matter, and he has sent an apology. He came on his own; as soon as he read these proceedings and heard of this—the Press Information Bureau have got their representatives here—in the Press gallery—he came of his own accord to the Secretary and gave this letter to the Secretary. It reads thus:

I should be grateful if the following submission may kindly be placed before the Speaker:

On the 23rd July, a press release of an answer to unstarred question No. 182 which had been printed on the Order Paper for 23rd July had been made by the Press Information Bureau on the basis of material received from the Ministry of Rehabilitation that morning.

It is with great distress that we have learnt of the fact that the subsequent change of the unstarred question from the printed list for 23rd July to 31st July had escaped the notice of the officer responsible for the release. The circumstances under which the copies containing the Minister's answer for the 23rd July were received in the Press Information Bureau on the morning of that day, had unfortunately not suggested the possibility of any change in the order of questions.

It is learnt that the Ministry of Rehabilitation are also taking steps to make amends for the omission to warn the Press Information Bureau about the change in the date of answer. Nevertheless, the responsibility of the Press Information Bureau cannot be minimised.

A close check is kept during question hour in regard to questions both for variation, if any, in the oral answer and whether or not the question has been reached. It is extremely regretted that equal care in regard to last minute variations in the printed list for unstarred questions was not taken in this case. Orders have, therefore, been issued to officers handling Parliamentary questions to handle both starred and unstarred questions with equal vigilance. With great contrition, the Press Information Bureau would beg to assure you, Sir, that there will be no repetition of such a lapse in the future. In view of this, I am sure the House would not expect me to proceed in this matter further but accept what has been stated; and I am sure a responsible officer, as he gives an assurance, will not commit similar mistakes in the future.

The matter is dropped at this stage.

**Shri V. P. Nayar (Quilon):** What about the Rehabilitation Ministry? It appears from what you have read out that the Rehabilitation Ministry is also to be blamed

**Mr. Speaker:** As for the Rehabilitation Ministry also, in view of what has been stated by this one officer—it is not that a 'bundle' of officers should come here—the Rehabilitation Ministry, I am sure, will take note of this fact and act according to it. If, in spite of it, they commit a lapse, a similar one, next time, the hon Member is alert, and he can always bring it to the notice of this House

\*DEMANDS FOR GRANTS—contd

MINISTRY OF HEALTH

**Mr. Speaker:** The House will now take up discussion of the Demands for Grants Nos 47, 48, 49, 50 and 119 relating to the Ministry of Health. As the House is aware, 2 hours have been allotted for the Demands of this Ministry

There are a number of cut motions to those various Demands. Hon Members may hand over at the Table within 15 minutes, the number of the selected cut motions which they propose to move. I shall treat them as moved if the Members in whose name, those cut motions stand are present in the House and the motions are otherwise in order.

Personally, I am in favour of allotting the largest amount of time for the Ministry of Health, but somehow the Sub-committee which sat over this matter—it has given 101 hours for the entire Budget—has been a little frugal with respect to the Health Ministry. All the same, it is not for me to decide that, it has been accepted by the House.

I shall give preference, first of all, to doctors, then to lady Members and then to others

**Shri Kaswara Iyer (Trivandrum):** What about lawyers?

**Mr. Speaker:** I shall call Shri D. S. Raju first

DEMAND NO 47—MINISTRY OF HEALTH

**Mr. Speaker:** Motion moved

"That a sum not exceeding Rs 7,66,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of 'Ministry of Health'"

DEMAND NO 48—MEDICAL SERVICES

**Mr. Speaker:** Motion moved.

"That a sum not exceeding Rs 2,26,43,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of 'Medical Services'"

DEMAND NO 49—PUBLIC HEALTH

**Mr. Speaker:** Motion moved

"That a sum not exceeding Rs 5,35,30,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of 'Public Health'"

DEMAND NO. 50—MISCELLANEOUS EXPENDITURE UNDER THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH

**Mr. Speaker:** Motion moved

"That a sum not exceeding Rs 60,56,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of 'Miscellaneous Expenditure under the Ministry of Health'"

DEMAND NO 119—CAPITAL OUTLAY OF THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH

**Mr. Speaker:** Motion moved.

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 5,89,68,000 be granted to the

\*Moved with the recommendation of the President

[Mr. Speaker]

President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of 'Capital Outlay of the Ministry of Health'."

Shri D. S. Raju (Rajahmundry): I would like to make a few observations on some of these health problems, which, I think, should be tackled and solved on a national emergency basis. I do not say that these problems are not within the awareness of the public and the responsible authorities, but I would only like to suggest that they should be tackled more urgently and more efficiently.

With regard to medical services, we are aware that all over India, from the Himalayas to Cape Comorin, almost all the hospitals are overcrowded. There is a shortage of doctors, nurses and midwives. For a country like India, with a population of about 380 million, there are only 70,000 qualified doctors, 24,000 midwives and 24,000 nurses. In spite of the fact that a host of other unregistered doctors were functioning during this influenza epidemic, we had a lot of difficulty in controlling this epidemic. That is because we are short of doctors and nursing services.

On a rough estimate only one doctor is available for about 6000 to 7000 people whereas in foreign countries, it works out to one doctor to about 2000 or 1500 people.

Under the Second Five Year Plan, we have proposed to start about 6 more medical colleges. Without asking for more money, I would suggest that existing hospitals can be expanded to quite a good strength. Also a few more hospitals could be started. After all, doctors cannot be manufactured by spending a lot of money on buildings alone. It is not the brick and cement or the stone and lime that could make doctors. We want experienced teachers, and for this purpose some of the Retired Surgeons and Physicians could also be available.

So I would suggest that we can save some money by cutting down on this capital expenditure in the construction of buildings and all those things. We can rent, if necessary, quite a number of buildings in most of the cities. They could be utilised for starting new medical colleges. Therefore, by saving some money we can easily expand the existing medical colleges as well as start new medical colleges under the Second Plan.

Then there is the question of de-urbanisation. You are aware that urbanisation and industrialisation are creating for us a number of problems. Ours was an agricultural economy for centuries. Now people are migrating to cities in larger and larger numbers. They are congregating in industrial areas so much so that we are finding it difficult to provide for them food, accommodation, medical facilities and other conveniences. Quite a number of these people come from villages. They are quite illiterate and they come without their families, so much so that after coming to the cities their morals also have dropped. That creates for us another problem. So de-urbanisation is a very urgent question which requires constant attention from our leaders and statesmen.

I think there is a lot of truth in the saying of great men 'back to the village'. Even Mahatma Gandhi had said that if villages perished, our nation perishes. There is a lot of truth in this, because after all we have lived for centuries in villages and we have been revitalised and re-energised from the natural surroundings of villages. It is not for a tropical country like ours to so suddenly change from village, agricultural economy to an industrial economy. We should be slow and cautious.

Next I would refer to the question of import of drugs. We are all aware that we are spending about Rs. 30 to Rs. 40 crores on the import of foreign drugs. I admit that some of these drugs are quite useful and efficient, but as a medical practitioner for a

number of decades I would like to suggest that quite a number of these drugs are not necessary for the treatment of diseases. They might be put down to a few dozens. Probably, if a committee could go into this and find out what are our essential requirements in respect of foreign drugs, we can save a lot of foreign exchange also.

Another point is about the Hindustan Antibiotics Ltd. This company has been stated to produce penicillin. It has gone into production about two years ago. But still it is not able to meet all our requirements of penicillin. Penicillin, after all, is a very very useful antibiotic. If more energy, more vigour and more enthusiasm had been put into the organisation, I think it should have been able to meet our requirements by now.

Also production of streptomycin and chloromycetin, which are very useful antibiotics, could be achieved by an extension of the same process. This production of the two valuable antibiotics should have been started by now.

Then I come to anti-malarials which have been dumped into India in vast numbers. Paludrin, Daraprim, Chamoquin etc. all these drugs, I agree, are quite efficient, but we should not forget our old quinine which has stood the test of time for the last 300 years. It is still a basic remedy in the treatment of malaria and in the preparation of so many contraceptives and anti-ceptive remedies. It is a thing which Government should take in hand and encourage. Almost all the hill stations in India can produce a lot of quinine.

Suppose something happens—as happened with regard to the Suez crisis—and we are not able to get our foreign stock. Then we will be in trouble. So I would suggest that we should revise our policy of relying to much upon foreign drugs for most of these anti-malarial or synthetic remedies. I would suggest to Government to pay more attention to the production of quinine and en-

courage the use of quinine by medical practitioners, government hospitals etc.

DDT is another product which is very very important in the anti-malarial and anti-mosquito campaign. We have got a factory in Delhi. But it produces only about a ton a day whereas our requirement for the whole country is about 10 tons a day. We should hurry up with the production of this insecticide which is such an important and essential material for anti-malarial purposes.

Then there is the question of sales tax on drugs. There is an urgent necessity for a revision of the sales tax policy with regard to drugs. At present, there is some harassment caused to chemists, druggists and also some medical practitioners who have got to keep a daily account of these things, by reason of the attitude of the sales tax officials. I would humbly request Government to take this matter into consideration and afford relief to the people concerned.

Medical research is very very important item. Under the present conditions of our life, as a direct consequence of the effects of our civilisation, we are getting more and more sick. Not only we, but everywhere in the world, people are getting more and more sick. The stress and strain of life, the competitive existence from birth to death, the problem of finding bread and butter—all these things are produced by our civilisation. In future also, we are bound to get more and more sickness.

Diabetes and blood pressure are the direct consequences of the present civilisation. I would call them twin sisters. There is increasing morbidity on account of these two diseases in almost all countries, including America.

I would suggest that a separate section or branch should be opened in the All India Institute of Medical Sciences to give prominence to this. This Institute should be started well and very good foundations should be laid even from now on. It should

[Shri D. S. Raju]

attract and give facilities not only to our talented young men, but doctors from all over the world should be encouraged to come and do reach on some of these very important and urgent problems.

Regarding some of our ancient systems of medicine, ayurveda and unani, I have great respect for them. In ancient ayurveda, tuberculosis was described in detail. Gold was suggested as a remedy for it about two thousand years ago. Even now, in spite of antibiotics, we are occasionally compelled to use Myocrysin and Sanocrysin. These are preparations of gold for the treatment of tuberculosis. I would suggest that due attention should be given to research in ayurveda and unani.

You will have seen from the papers that there is a new drug found out called Rauwolfia Serpentina. In ayurveda, it is called Serpagandhi. This has got a very good name lately in the medical profession. Out of this, they are able to manufacture alkaloids which are very good for the reduction of blood pressure. They are also good for mental diseases. These alkaloids serpassil, Reserpine etc of serpentina—have become very very useful remedies.

**D. S. Raju:** Alkaloids are not made here.

**Shri D. S. Raju:** The raw products are grown here.

**Shri D. S. Raju:** Alkaloids are not manufactured in India. It is a highly technical process. The raw products are grown in India on an extensive scale in almost all the hill regions. I would like the Government to take serious note of this industry.

We have several programmes in the country: National Malaria Control programme, filaria control programme and TB control programme and Leprosy control programme, and many others. They are well thought out. Funds have been allotted for these schemes but I feel that they are not sufficiently large. I know the

real difficulties of the profession and the people and I suggest that the Finance Minister should be more generous in allotting funds to some of these important items. Malaria takes a very heavy toll; fifty million people are affected every year. You can imagine the extent of the damage and the loss to the country by this one dreadful disease.

It is true that the Government by its preventive methods have protected about ten crores of people and given mass treatment to about half a million people. It is good but still much more has got to be done on this matter. During the last war allied planes with sufficient quantity of DDT sprayed certain whole areas and completely eliminated this disease and other mosquito borne diseases. It was extra-ordinary how they can spray those areas and kill these mosquitoes. I wonder if our Government could take this measure by spraying these areas with DDT from planes.

Then, about this TB control programme. We have got only 24,000 beds all over India which is inadequate. Some of the very good remedies streptomycin and INH, a synthetic product—are being very effective. In fact, some years ago cases which were considered incurable, patients in advanced stages of TB, are very well controlled by streptomycin and INH. Efforts should be made to manufacture some of these products on a sufficiently large scale in India. It is not possible to depend upon foreign sources for any length of time, especially for essential drugs. We should take note and create maximum facilities and give maximum allotment for the production of these things in India.

Then about the leprosy clinics. Some institutions are doing very good work: Mahatma Gandhi Memorial Trust, Ramakrishna Mission and Kushta Nivarana Sangha Mission lepers. There are about two million lepers and it is very difficult to collect these lepers in different asylums and give treatment to them. Sulphone

drugs latterly are very effective and even very advanced cases are marvelously cured in about a year or two years' time. They are very cheap also costing about two annas per day per patient or even less. One tablet costs half an anna and two or three tablets would be ample. Even patients in advanced stage previously thought incurable, have made remarkable recoveries if they swallow these tablets for two years or so. It is one of the recent advances in Medicine of which every scientist can be proud and every doctor happy.

**Shri Feroze Gandhi (Raj Bareli)**  
Can it be used for flu also?

**Shri D. S. Raja:** No Sir. The remedy should not be more drastic than the disease itself as in the case of flu. Leprosy which is claiming and disabling about two million people in India is a curable disease and can be tackled easily and effectively. The influenza epidemic has affected the lives of so many people. There is no necessity to get unnecessarily panicky about the disease. After all, it has been there in almost all the countries in an endemic form, occasionally it sprouts in an epidemic form. It takes only three or four days and there is some fever and then probably it leaves. We should not get panicky over such a mild disease. The Government is trying to prepare some vaccine in the Coonoor research laboratories. I do not know how far it will be effective or useful because the virus changes its nature frequently. If we find out a cure for one type, it changes itself into another type by changes in mutation and this vaccine may not be useful. I would ask the Government not to waste so much money and to go cautious about the preparation of the vaccine.

I would refer to family planning before I conclude. We are multiplying very rapidly and every year five million more people are added. While the birth rate has increased, the death rate has fallen and the average expectation of life has increased. That means that there should be more

for accommodation, travelling facilities, medical and other amenities. At this rate, by the end of the century, our population, it has been calculated, will be double the present that is, 74 crores. Could we imagine a country like ours expanding so rapidly? Could we be able to provide for the 78 crores of people? We should take stock of the situation and give more prominence to family planning. It should be done on a very enthusiastic and vigorous scale. Everybody should take interest in this, not only the Government but voluntary organisations and almost all the intelligent people of the country should become aware of the seriousness of the problem and try to tackle it now. In the next decade this problem will probably be unmanageable and uncontrollable and there would be a cause for regret.

The Second Plan provides four crores for family planning. I hope intense research will be done and contraceptive and other methods will be found out.

I have no complaint against anything except that we are not going with such zeal and enthusiasm that I would like to see in the implementation of the programmes. If you do so, our desire for a welfare State would be much nearer than expected.

**Shri Easwara Iyer:** Sir, I do concede the competency of doctors and women to speak on this subject of health.

**Mr. Speaker:** Patients also.

**Sardar Hukam Singh (Bhatinda):** He is not in any of these categories.

**Shri Easwara Iyer:** In fact, I have been suffering from a certain amount of fear complex as to whether I am the right person to speak on this subject of health but a look at my hon. friend in the Treasury Bench on the other side gave me some sort of assistance.

Coming to the subject of health, I am desirous of pointing out as a layman, as a lawyer layman, if I may say so with all respect, as to what I



[Shri Easwara Iyer]

think should be the programme for the development of our national health. I bestowed serious attention on the report of the Ministry of Health for 1956-57, and I cannot deny that we have made some progress in the matter of health. But, to me it appears that regarding certain aspects of the matter we have to make a different approach, particularly regarding the question as to how we should tackle the problem of disease.

Tackling the problem of disease falls under two main heads. We employ drugs which are preventive or curative. So, diseases are either prevented or cured; there is no third way of dealing with a disease. Probably, the conservative cynic might be tempted to say that there is a third way, tackle the disease by another drug, and that is by death; that is, by the non-application or wrongful application of the drugs.

On the question of drugs the science of medicine has, I understand from the hon. friend on the other side, made strides of progress during the last two decades. Certainly so. Antibiotics like penicillin, chloromycetene, tetracylin and all such things have come to effectively combat the diseases.

But the question still remains, Sir, as to whether these drugs, these essential life saving drugs are available to the ordinary poor man. The sale of these essential drugs are still in the hands of private business, and when a patent medicine in the name of Lederle, Parke Davis or Sharp and Dhome come for the first time in this country, we find that they are offered for fanciful prices. I remember a time when penicillin was first marketed. Then it was not available for even Rs. 50, that is in 1950 or 1951. When chloromycetene first came into the market, it is very useful for typhoid and various other ailments, it was not available for less than Rs. 100.

Still we find that the sale of these drugs are in the hands of private business. Even though we find various firms offering them at competitive prices, we find, as a matter of

fact, that these drugs are not available for the common man, or the ordinary poor man.

Shri D. S. Raju: It is only one rupee now.

Shri Easwara Iyer: I certainly know that. But, when these drugs are out of stock, when at times of necessity like the influenza epidemic or other times a private businessman can find a way out of the situation by concealing the stock and boosting up prices, these drugs are not available to the poor man.

So, I would suggest, as a matter of constructive suggestion, to our Health Minister that he must have some sort of a control over at least the sale of these essential life saving drugs. He might answer me by saying that we have got the Drugs Control Act. But the Drugs Control Act has no control over the sale prices of these essential drugs. What I am suggesting is that at least with respect to these essential antibiotics they must develop a public sector. If that is not possible, in the alternative I must say that we must have a control over the prices of these antibiotics, otherwise the common man who is asked to elect between cure of the disease and death has no option.

When I am on this question of drugs I am tempted to say that in this country we have various laws. Of course, speaking as a lawyer I am saying that we have a number of laws to control the quality of drugs and the standard of drugs. But, I do not know as to whether this Drugs Control Act provides for testing the components of every medicine that is marketed, and also the efficacy of the medicines for the purpose for which they are advertised. We find that products are marketed professing to cure so many things. These products come forward with a good load of literature and the suffering man, unhelped by the professional man, reading these advertisements concludes that he has found a panacea for all his ailments. We find that

these advertisements proclaim to the world that the product is a simple remedy for all ailments. Have we got a law, or have we got the machinery to test the components of each drug that is being marketed to see whether they are really efficacious for the purpose for which they are advertised?

I remember to have read a law in America, a Federal Law. I believe, whereby it is provided in America that before any drug is patented and put into the market that drug must be submitted to a central research laboratory, a huge laboratory the kind of which we cannot afford to have, where these drugs are tested. The research workers there examine the details of the advertisements of the drugs to be put forward in the market, and see whether they are really applicable for the disease to which they are to be applied. This is what they do. If the research workers come to the conclusion that these drugs are spurious, then they are not allowed to be marketed in New York. There is a proviso, and that is the hard part of the job. The proviso says, even if they are found to be spurious and unfit to be marketed in New York, if those goods are marked "for export only", then they can be exported. We find some of those medicines coming here and widely advertised.

So far as these Knox products are concerned, we find a lot of advertisements coming out, like cystex for kidney troubles, mendaco for asthma, hynox for blood pressure.....

An Hon. Member: Okasa.

Shri Easwara Iyer: I have only come to the Knox products. These things are not allowed to be sold in New York. In fact, this medicine mendaco can be sold in New York only with the caution administered that it is dangerous for children under seven years and cannot be administered to T.B. patients. I do not know how many of our professional men know that. But we find sometimes this mendaco for asthma and hynox

for high blood pressure prescribed by various doctors. I am not disputing the efficiency of professional men, but sometimes these men do prescribe these things as though they are effective remedies.

The question is whether we can afford to have a central laboratory and prevent the import of these goods, otherwise America would find that India is a good place for selling her spurious goods. I would respectfully submit that we can effectively check them if we can make a law whereby it is said that any drug which cannot be sold in America cannot be imported at all; if it is marked "for export only", it should not be imported at all. This is one point which I would respectfully submit before this House for the consideration of the hon Minister for Health.

I have so many aspects of the matter to deal with, but for lack of time I cannot deal with all of them. I have to deal with the question of public health, which is of utmost importance. Here we deal with the preventive side of the disease. We have got so many complaints regarding the manner in which the problem of public health is tackled in our country, the most important aspect of public health is the problem of fresh water. In fact, in the coastal lines of Kerala State, we find water everywhere, but not a drop to drink. So, I would request the hon Minister to pay some attention to the matter of fresh water problem in Kerala State.

Then, there is the question of subsidy for the control of leprosy in Noornad in Kerala State. We have got a leprosy colony and I understand this year there is no subsidy given for that centre. I would earnestly request the hon Minister to consider the claims of this leprosy colony. This is one of the biggest leprosy centres in South India.

I have also to point out that the system of training auxiliary nurses and midwives needs a complete reorganisation. The target figures show

[Shri Easwara Iyer]

that we must have at least 6,000 people of this kind before the end of the Five Year Plan, but we find that very little personnel being trained. We must examine the reason why we are not getting enough trainees. My suggestion is that it is because the pay is very low and the medium of instruction is English. I find in most of the States the medium of instruction is English and women, who have passed out of the fifth or sixth standard and who are being trained as auxiliary nurses, are not able to follow the lectures that are given. Therefore, I earnestly request the hon. Minister to consider the problem of training of auxiliary nurses and midwives and to give more incentive to the trainees.

With regard to the indigenous system of medicine, which has been referred to by the hon. Member who spoke last I must say with respect that the allopathic doctors have developed a sort of allergy towards ayurvedic vaidhakims or homoeopathic doctors. This allergic attitude towards the indigenous system of medicine should stop. There is need for more collaboration between them and the Ministry should provide facilities for collaboration and consultation between the ayurvedic doctors or hakims or siddha vaidhs and the allopathic doctors. I am told in China there is an academy of Chinese medicines to develop the indigenous systems of medicine. I am also told that even the best allopathic doctors who have got special qualifications and who are specialists go there and have consultations, discuss matters and find out the efficacy of the indigenous medicine. The need for standardising and testing the quality of ayurvedic medicine is also there. I do not deny that.

There are spurious drugs in ayurveda also coming up in the market nowadays. We have to test whether they conform to the quality or can be effective for curing the disease it professes to cure. As a matter of fact, instances are not lacking. We find that in the market—I am only citing

an example—there is a rasayanam from the south called *karumkorangu rasayanam*, which is said to be an extract of the elements of the black monkey. But from the quantity of this rasayanam that has now been marketed, I think that if there is any element of the monkey in the rasayanam, the whole species would have been extinct by this time.

Mr. Speaker: Nobody takes exception on the ground that it is cruel to animals.

Shri Easwara Iyer: I am not aware of it. The glands or the adrenals of the monkey are supposed to be the component parts of the rasayanam. I do not want to elaborate it.

Regarding arishtams and asavams also, we find that their important component parts are honey and other costly medicines. These are being marketed with jaggery water. In the *kasturi rasayanam* also, we do not find any *kasturi* or any element of musk. These are the spurious drugs that are marketed and the suffering man is really cheated. So, even with respect to ayurvedic medicines, I would say that we must have control over them, test the quality and standard of the medicine before they are allowed to be marketed. Not to speak of the *navaratna kalpa* which contains the extract of nine gems and which is marketed for Rs 2. I do not want to enter into details because of want of time. I only say that while the need for collaboration between ayurvedic and allopathic doctors is very high, there is also the need for standardising the quality of the medicines.

I want to invite the attention of the hon. Minister to the problem of ayurvedic doctors in our State, where it cannot be denied that this system of medicine is highly developed. But we have not got the facility for research work or post-graduate work. So, I would request the hon. Minister to consider the claims of Kerala State regarding ayurveda.

Again, there is one branch of Ayurveda which has not come up for discussion or consideration, namely, the system of bone-setting in our place. We have got experts in bone-setting. I have come across cases of bone-setting successfully done by these experts where allopathic doctors have failed miserably.

**Mr. Speaker:** In Puthur in the Andhra State also it is there.

**Shri Easwara Iyer:** These people are not encouraged. I am told they are proceeding on some scientific basis, probably handed over to them from generation to generation. They have made a good deal of study about this matter and they are experts in the line; I would submit that this system, particularly bone-setting with massaging, should be encouraged. In the allopathic system, bone-setting is done by putting the bones together and keeping it at rest for a number of days; this sometimes fails. These experts, I am told, do the bone-setting and do a little bit of oil massaging. This method of bone-setting is very remarkable. These things which are available are escaping the attention of our Health Ministry.

Regarding control of malaria and filaria—of course, my hon. friend said it is control of malaria, what we want is total eradication. It is not merely control. We have reached a stage when we must say that India is no longer suffering from malaria, so that there need not be a control over malaria. In fact, the World Health Organisation is extending its help for the eradication of Malaria. As regards filaria, I must say that my State has not got the help which the people of that State deserve. In Shertalai and other places, we find filaria in abundance.

Before concluding, I must make an earnest appeal to the members of the medical profession. I should not be misunderstood when I make this appeal to them. This is one of the noblest of the noble professions. We do concede that. But, they must engage themselves as citizens of India

with the responsibility which has been thrown upon them in a spirit of self-sacrifice, and serve mankind and be prepared to go to the villages and rural parts without caring for the remuneration that they may get and try to build up India with good health and prosperity. If they do so, they will be remembered for generations. I should say that among some of the members of the profession, pecuniary considerations are even now prevailing. That is why I am saying that the medical profession is one of the noblest of the noble professions in India for serving mankind and that, they should realise. If the Minister of Health would agree to provide refresher courses for even the medical men in the profession, by which they are again and again reminded of their duties, I would say it will serve the purpose.

I have got so many points to stress. I do not wish to take more of the time of the House. I will utilise any other occasion that may come to me for taking up this aspect of public health.

**Mr. Speaker:** Shri Bbagwan Dm Misra. He is an Ayurvedic vaid. I called an allopath; I called a patient; now I call a vaid.

**Shri Easwara Iyer:** I am in good health.

**Shri B. S. Murthy (Kakinada-Reserved-Sch. Castes):** If every patient is like Shri Easwara Iyer, there is no need for a health department to exist.

श्री श्री बी० विष्णु (केनराज) .  
अध्यक्ष महोदय, स्वास्थ्य मंत्रालय के  
अन्तर्गत स्वास्थ्य विभाग की ४७, ४८,  
४९ और ५० नम्बर की मांगों का बर्णन  
है। स्वास्थ्य विभाग को दो भागों में  
बांटा जा सकता है। एक वह हिस्सा  
है जिसके द्वारा यह चेष्टा की जाती है कि  
देश में रोग फैलने न पावें और सकई रहे  
और शुद्ध जल तथा शुद्ध वायु का प्रबन्ध  
हो। दूसरा हिस्सा चिकित्सा से सम्बन्ध  
रखता है। उनके द्वारा रोग होने पर

[श्री म० सी० मिश्र]

रोगियों को निरीग करने का प्रयत्न किया जाता है ।

जहाँ तक सफाई, शुद्ध जल और शुद्ध वायु के प्रबन्ध का सम्बन्ध है इस विषय में स्वास्थ्य विभाग ने शहरों में तो बहुत हद तक काम किया है यद्यपि इस में भी अभी बहुत कुछ करने को शेष है । एक माननीय सदस्य ने कहा कि शुद्ध जल का अभी प्रबन्ध काफी नहीं हो पाया है । लेकिन मैं अपने स्वास्थ्य मंत्री का ध्यान इस ओर आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ कि सफाई, शुद्ध जल और शुद्ध वायु का प्रबन्ध अभी देश के उस थोड़े हिस्से में ही रहा है जिस को शहर कहते हैं । लेकिन देश की २५ करोड़ जनता के लिये जो कि देहातों में रहती है और जिस को ग्राम शुद्ध भाग्य कह सकते हैं उन के लिये तो अभी सफाई का लेव मात्र भी नहीं है । बहा पर शुद्ध जल और शुद्ध वायु के लिये कोई प्रबन्ध नहीं किया गया है । बहुत से स्थानों पर तोंग नानाबों का पानी पीने है और बहुत सी जगह नदियों के किनारे मूड्डे खोद कर पानी प्राप्त करते हैं । अभी गाँव के रहने वालों के लिये सफाई का, शुद्ध जल का और शुद्ध वायु का प्रबन्ध नहीं हो सका है ।

इस में संदेह नहीं कि जहाँ तक सकारक रोगों का संबंध है, जहाँ तक मलेरिया का सम्बन्ध है, इन को रोकने में इन विभाग ने बहुत कुछ सफलता प्राप्त की है । पहले जब बड़े बड़े मेले हुआ करते थे तो उन के बाद भ्रंशर हैजे जैसी सकारक बीमारिया फैल जाया करती थी । उस पर हेल्वि विभाग ने बहुत कुछ कटौत कर लिया है मेरे जिले बहराइच के उत्तरी भाग में मलेरिया बहुत हुआ करता था । लेकिन आज इस विभाग द्वारा उसको रोकने की समुचित व्यवस्था करके उसे प्रकोप करीब २५ प्रतिशत ही रह गया है । आज की

प्रबन्ध में गाँवों में रहने वालों के लिये सफाई, शुद्ध जल और शुद्ध वायु का प्रबन्ध करने की बहुत अधिक आवश्यकता है । गाँवों में ही देश की अधिकतर आबादी रहती है ।

दूसरा भाग चिकित्सा का प्रारम्भ होता है । अभी इस सम्बन्ध में माननीय सदस्य ने प्रायुर्वेदिक चिकित्सा पद्धति का जिक्र किया । हमारे डा० राजू ने भी प्रायुर्वेदिक औषधियों की कुछ बर्षों की है । उन्होंने सर्पगंधा के प्रयोग के बारे में कहा और छय के लिये सोने के उपयोग के बारे में भी कहा । मैं तो कहना हूँ कि आयुर्वेद को कोई भी जानने वाला प्रारम्भ में ही यह जानता है कि छय रोग के लिये सोने का प्रयोग किया जाना चाहिये । और यह कोई आज की बात नहीं है । महस्वी वर्षों में यह प्रयोग चला आता है । लेकिन यह दुःख है कि चिकित्सा के सम्बन्ध में शिक्षा मन्त्रालय ने इसी में सन्तोष कर लिया कि जगह जगह अस्पताल खोल दिये हैं । क्या उन के द्वारा ३७ करोड़ जनता रोग विनिर्मुक्त हो सकती है । मैं कह सकता हूँ कि आज भी देहातों में प्रायुर्वेदिक, यूनानी और दूसरी देशी चिकित्सा पद्धतियाँ फैली हुई हैं । बहुत सी धर्मार्थ मन्पाओं के और कुछ विद्यालयों के औषधालय काम कर रहे हैं और उन के द्वारा लाखों रोगी रोग विनिर्मुक्त होते हैं । इस में कोई शक नहीं कि आपने ऐलोपैथिक पद्धति के लिये माइटिफिक प्रयोग किये हैं और उस के लिये करोड़ों रुपया खर्च किया है । उन के बाद आप कह सकते हैं कि हमको इसकी औषधियाँ शुद्ध रूप में मिल नहीं हैं । और ये इन इन रोगों के लिये प्रयुक्त हैं । लेकिन जो २५ करोड़ की जन संख्या देहातों में रहती है उसको इन औषधियों से लाभ नहीं पहुंच रहा है । बल्कि मैं तो कहूँ कि शहरों में भी जो आबादी थी तो आई थी

व्यय मासिक पाता है वह भी इन चीज-  
धियों से अपने बाल्कों का इलाज नहीं करवा  
सकता। पहले अक्सर निक्सचर  
दिये जाते थे। पर अब ज्यादातर  
डाक्टर इन्वेक्शन काम में जाते हैं। वे  
रोमी को नुस्खा लिख देते हैं जो कि २०  
रुपये में १५ रुपये में या ३५ रुपये में मिलता  
है। बेचारा रोमी इतनी कीमत देव कर  
परेशान हो जाता है और दूसरी चिकित्सा  
पद्धति की ओर जाता है और उम प्रणाली  
से रोग विनिर्मुक्त होता है।

ऐसी अवस्था में इस बात की बहुत  
आवश्यकता है कि सरकार देशी चिकित्सा  
पद्धति को अपनाए। सरकार की ओर से यहा  
पर जो खर्च की कमी की चर्चा की जाती है,  
पर इस के साथ ही साथ वह अधिक से अधिक  
कीमती चिकित्सा प्रणाली को प्रचलित  
करके देश के एक कोने से दूसरे कोने तक सब  
लोगों को लोगों से विनिर्मुक्त होने में सहायता  
पहुँचाना चाहती है, यह कहा तक सम्भव है ?

12 hrs.

मैं यह भी कह सकता हूँ कि मेडिकल कौंसिल  
के कुछ डाक्टर भी यह चाहते हैं कि देश में  
धायुर्बैदिक चिकित्सा प्रणाली, या होम्योपैथिक  
सिस्टम या सुनानी सिस्टम किसी तरह से भी  
प्रचलित न हो सके। वे हमेशा इन प्रणालियों  
को अनसह्युक्तिक बता कर इन को ठुकराने की  
चुंटा करते हैं। मैं यह दावे के साथ कह सकता  
हूँ कि हमारे देश के डाक्टर इन चिकित्सा  
प्रणालियों के साथ सदा सौतेला व्यवहार करते  
हैं। यह नहीं चाहते कि ये चिकित्सा प्रणालियाँ  
अच्छी तरह से सफल हो कर देश की सेवा कर  
सकें। मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि दस वर्ष  
पहले उत्तर प्रदेश में एक कमेटी बिठाई गई थी,  
जिस का मैं भी सदस्य रहा हूँ। उस कमेटी ने  
यह सिफारिश की थी और यह तय कर लिया  
गया था कि धायुर्बैदिक चिकित्सा प्रणाली  
को विशेष प्रोत्साहन दिया जाना चाहिए।  
मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि केंद्रीय सरकार के

द्वारा इस चिकित्सा प्रणाली को कहां तक  
प्रोत्साहन दिया गया है। मैं एक नबागंतुक  
सदस्य हूँ, इसलिए इस विषय में मुझे पूरा पूरा  
पता नहीं है, लेकिन मैं समझता हूँ कि अगर  
कुछ प्रोत्साहन दिया गया होगा, तो वह नहीं  
के बराबर होगा।

देशी चिकित्सा प्रणाली में रिसर्च करने  
के लिए आमनगर में एक इंस्टीट्यूट खोला गया  
है। मुझे पता नहीं है कि उस में कहां तक काम  
हो सकता है और किन व्यक्तियों के तत्वावधान  
में वहां काम हो रहा है। अगर वहां पर इन्हीं  
महाप्रभु डाक्टरों के तत्वावधान में ही काम  
हो रहा है, तो आप को मैं विश्वास दिलाता हूँ  
कि अन्त में उन की रिपोर्ट असफल होने की ही  
आयगी, सफलता का सूत्र आप के सामने नहीं  
आ सकेगा।

इसलिए मैं चाहता हूँ कि यदि आप वास्तव  
में धायुर्बैदिक चिकित्सा प्रणाली को प्रोत्साहन  
देना चाहते हैं, तो आप अनुदानों और अन्य  
प्रकार के उत्साह के द्वारा राज्य सरकारों को  
इस बात के लिए प्रेरित करें कि वे अपने यहां  
धायुर्बैदिक चिकित्सा प्रणाली को स्थान दे।  
इस सम्बन्ध में मैं उत्तर प्रदेश सरकार को  
अवश्य धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ। उसने इस  
दिशा में बहुत कुछ भागें कदम बढ़ाया है, यद्यपि  
उसे मतोषजनक नहीं कहा जा सकता है।  
फिर भी उम ने एक धायुर्बैदिक विद्यालय  
खोला है और एक बहुत बड़ी रमायनशाला  
स्थापित की है, जिस में बच्चों के तत्वावधान  
में धीपधिया नैयार की जाती है। उस  
देहात में बहुत से धायुर्बैदिक चिकित्सालय  
भी खोले हैं, यद्यपि मैं यह जानना चाहता  
हूँ कि उन के साथ जैसा व्यवहार होना चाहिये,  
वह नहीं किया जा रहा है। देहात में एक एसी-  
पैथिक चिकित्सालय खोलने के लिए सरकार  
की तरफ से तोस हजार रुपए भवन बनाने के  
लिए दिए जाते हैं, जब कि धायुर्बैदिक चिकित्सा-  
लय के लिए पंद्रह रुपए मासिक किराये पर  
एक मकान की व्यवस्था की गई है। इस अवस्था

[श्री भ० दौ० मिश्र]

में मैं यह कैसे कह सकता हूँ कि सरकार जिस तरीके से इस सम्बन्ध में कार्यवाही कर रही है, उस के परिणामस्वरूप यह किसिस्ता प्रणाली प्रफुल्लित हो सकती है और पूर्ण रूप से बेस की सहायता कर सकती है।

जहाँ तक मिडवाइन्ज का सम्बन्ध है अगर आप आँकड़ों को देखें, तो आप को पता चल जायगा कि अपने राज्य की ती वषों की अवधि में आप अधिक में अधिक दो में चार हजार तक ट्रेन्ड मिडवाइन्ज नैयार की होंगी। मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि घात्री गिखा एक ऐसी चीज है, जिस का सम्बन्ध देश के गब भागों और सब वर्गों में है। इसलिए ऐसा व्यवस्था को जाना चाहिए जिस के द्वारा गेब में गेब और छोटे में छोटे व्यक्ति को यह मुविधा मिल सके। मुख्य में वॉगन मिडवाइन्ज के अनुसार देहन में रक्त वाहियों का ट्रेन्ड करने का प्रयत्न किया जाना चाहिए, तानि अधिक में अधिक लोग लाभ उठा सके। मैं नि दिन करना चाहता हूँ कि इस और आप को अधिक ध्यान देने का आवश्यकता है। साथ ही राज्य सरकारी का भी ध्यान हम योग्य आवर्षित किया जाना चाहिए।

अब मैं एक विशेष बात के सम्बन्ध में कुछ कहना चाहता हूँ, जिसकी चर्चा अभी एक मानवैय सदस्य ने की है। हमारे देश में कुष्ठ रोग बहुत ज़ोरों में फैल रहा है और इस के कई विशेष कारण हैं। हमारे देहात में ज्यादातर लोग नमक या अटाई से भोजन करते हैं। उन के भोजन में पोषक-तत्वों का पूर्णतया अभाव होता है, जिस के कारण देहात में रक्त की बीमारियाँ पैदा हो री हैं। इस सम्बन्ध में जो सेंट्रल एक्ट है, उस में यह विधान नहीं है कि कृषि कुष्ठ रोग सक्कामक है। इस लिए उसमें आकर्मत व्यक्ति जनता से पूषक रखे जायें। उन लोगों को अपने घरों में न रहने दिया जायें, बल्कि उनके लिए दूसरी जगह व्यवस्था की जाय, जिस में ऐसा कोई नियम नहीं है। स सम्बन्ध में मैं आप को बहराइच का एक उदाहरण देना

चाहता हूँ। वहा एक दरगाह के पास मेला लगता है, जिसके विषय में यह किचवन्नी है कि जो कुष्ठ-रोगी वहां जाता है, वह उस रोग से विनिर्मुक्त हो जाता है। सिर्फ हमारे सूबे से ही नहीं, बल्कि देश की दूसरी जगहों से भी कुष्ठ के रोगी वहां पहुंच जाते हैं। इस का नतीजा यह है कि उन की बीमारी ठीक होती नहीं, अपितु वे बहराइच जिले में अधिकाधिक कुष्ठ रोग को फैला रहे हैं। मैं आपको बता सकता हूँ कि ऐसे गांव भीजूद हूँ, जिन में पचास साठ प्रतिशत कोड़ी है और उन का कोई उपचार सम्भव नहीं हो रहा है। ऐसी अवस्था में यह आवश्यक है कि सेंट्रल गवर्नमेंट अपने एक्ट में उचित मशोपन करे। हमारे सिविल मजंन में इसविषय में कहा है कि मेरी तरफ से इसका कोई रोक-थाम नहीं की जा सकती है, जब तक कि सेंट्रल गवर्नमेंट की तरफ से हमारे ऊपर कानूनी प्रतिबन्ध न लगा दिया जाय। मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि इस बीमारी को रोकना बहुत आवश्यक है और इस के लिए थार जल्द में जल्द आवश्यक कदम उठाये। हमारा गहा एक आपघालय को लैंग अमाइलम के तौर पर प्राविशियलाइज किया गया है, लेकिन फिर भी ऐसी अवस्था में नहीं है कि कुष्ठ रोग को रोका जा सके। कोड़ी लोग बराबर बाजारों में घूमते हैं और दुकानों के सामने खड़े होते हैं। कुष्ठ रोग एक सक्कामक बीमारी है और लोग बराबर इस के शिकार होने रहते हैं। इस लिए मैं स्वास्थ्य मंत्री में प्रार्थना करूंगा कि वह शीघ्र में शीघ्र इस विषय में कोई कार्यवाही करे और इस एक्ट को इस प्रकार मशोषित करे कि कुष्ठ के रोगी को घर में न रख कर पूषक रखा जाय। इसके साथ ही साथ जो कुष्ठ के रोगी बाजारों में भिडा मागत फिरते हैं, उन के लिए निवास, भोजन और उपचार का उचित प्रबन्ध किया जाना चाहिए, अन्यथा इन बीमारी में मुक्ति सम्भव नहीं है।

अन्त में मैं स्वास्थ्य मंत्री महोदय से विशेषण कर्ना कि यह विषय भी अत्यन्त आवश्यक है।

जिस तरह सरकार मुसमरी के सम्बन्ध में परेशान है, उसी तरह इस विषय में भी परेशान होने की आवश्यकता है। आयुर्वेदिक तथा दूसरी देशी चिकित्सा पद्धतियों को सरकार की ओर से पूरा प्रोत्साहन दिया जाना चाहिए, तभी वह देश का कल्याण करने में समर्थ हो सकेगी।

**Mr. Speaker:** Shri Dasgupta

Before the hon. Member begins, I would like to say that I have received as many as 16 names. So far I have been able to call only three. The fourth Member is now in possession of the House. Is it the pleasure of the House that we may extend this time by one hour? Two hours have been allotted. Some people go by economic considerations, but other considerations are also necessary. The Sub-Committee have allotted 101 hours for the entire Budget but they have given only 2 hours for the Health Ministry, and a few hours for the Ministry of Education. I feel that hereafter there must be a full day of five hours for each of these subjects, they are the nation-building services.

**Shri Radha Raman (Chandni Chowk)** Health is an important subject

**Mr. Speaker:** Time after time, external affairs come up; that has already been accepted, on various other considerations, that has become the order of the day. But these other matters which are really useful to the public are thrown into the background.

I am sorry I did not bestow sufficient consideration on this. I merely accepted the Sub-Committee's recommendations. But I shall extend the time for the Ministry of Health by one hour, whatever may happen with respect to the other Demands.

Now, Shri Dasgupta. Hon. Members may take ten minutes each.

These are like first-class pills of the present day.

**Shri Dasgupta, B. (Purulia):** I am a new speaker. Shall I also have only ten minutes?

**Mr. Speaker:** New speakers will put everything into a nut-shell.

**Shri Dasgupta, B.:** I want to draw the attention of the House, and especially of Government to the food adulteration that is going on in our country. I think that is one of the most vital problems, which has not been given the proper attention which it deserves.

Food adulteration has reached such a stage in our country that practically it amounts to slow poisoning of the nation or killing the nation or eating into the vitals of the nation. If we are not alert, if we do not take adequate measures to prevent this, if we ignore the importance of this, then we shall be a party to killing the nation; we shall be a party to bringing the nation to a stage where it will be impossible to have a healthy nation, whatever be the type of food we may take.

It is needless to go into details regarding adulteration of food. We are eating from morning to evening, but I do not know whether we are eating soapstone, or whether we are eating *arizman*, or whether we are eating particles of stones. And there are so many diseases prevalent, such as diseases of the intestine, diseases of the heart, and so on and so forth. And there are so many medicines, so many doctors, so many specialists and so on; there are also the Health Departments of the States and the Health Ministry here. But the adulteration is going on freely in the country just with a view to bringing profit to that section of the population, for whom profit is the only motive.

I may cite to you one instance to show how this adulteration is going on in the case of even rice. We cannot just get pure rice. I know how big farms mix particles of stones in



[Shri Dasgupta, B]

the rice that they sell. They adopt a very ingenious method for this purpose. They put an iron pipe into the rice bag, and then they put rice around that iron pipe, but within the iron pipe they put a few seers of particles of stones; then, they slowly lift up the iron pipe, and pack the bags like any other bag. If anyone wants to see the quality of the rice, from the outside, he will see that the rice is pure, and quite all right. But when the bag is opened and rice is spread out on the floor, it will be found that it is a mixture of so many particles of stones with rice. It is in this way that we are taking adulterated food articles.

I want to draw the attention of the Health Ministry in particular, towards this because it is a very vital problem. If we cannot prevent this, then I am afraid that we shall not be able to have a healthy nation, a nation that can really deliver the goods not only to ourselves but to the world as a whole.

Even the laws that are in force in our country are not, practically speaking, adequate enough to prevent this. In other countries, I think there are much more stringent laws than in our country. There should be a law, and there should be some measures to take adulterators to such tasks that the punishment awarded to them will be a sufficient deterrent for others. In my opinion, food adulteration is as bad an offence as killing a man. If there could be the punishment of hanging for a murderer, I see no reason why there should not be similar punishments for that section of the people who are indulging in adulteration freely and killing the nation every minute. I would urge that there may be special laws in our country which will enable us to prevent food from being adulterated. Let there be an assurance that we can get pure food. Let there be such arrangements that we can get pure and healthy foods, so that we can live healthily and live long.

I now come to arrangements for the medical treatment of the poor. The arrangements that are there at present are such that they can be taken advantage of only by the wealthy or by that section of the people that can afford. But if we go to the villages and see the condition of the poor people there, we shall find that only five to ten persons out of the whole population can take advantage of those arrangements for medical treatment.

We are speaking of Ayurvedic treatment, and we are speaking of various other kinds of treatments. But what can the villagers do? The villagers cannot afford to call a doctor, to buy a medicine; he just cannot afford it. If there are no elaborate arrangements for giving free treatment to them, it is but natural that these villagers will be dying, and they are dying like anything, and they are suffering like anything. I would suggest that a proper scheme to facilitate medical arrangements for the poor should be drawn up by the Health Ministry. I know that such arrangements would require finance, and experts too, but I believe we can do something in this regard.

Here, I might put forward one useful suggestion. If it is not possible to arrange for allopathic treatment in all the villages, then we can at least arrange for homoeopathic treatment, for that is the cheapest treatment that can be given in the villages, and that is something which the people also can afford to have. I can cite to you the experience that we had in the Purulia District Board. When we found that it was not possible to make proper arrangements for the people in general, we from the district board started homoeopathic centres, and appointed homoeopathic doctors and supplied homoeopathic medicine. From the statistics collected, we found that at least 90 per cent. of the people had taken advantage of those medical facilities, and they had some treatment at least.

We have no treatment; we have no medical facilities at all. We have

nothing of the kind. We go to the quacks. We in the villages are compelled to go to the quacks. If they do not go to the quacks, they are to die without any medical facilities.

So if we want to rid the country of quacks, we must make arrangements for treatment under allopathy, homoeopathy or Ayurveda. It is one of the duties of the Ministry to see that if allopathy is not possible in a place, there should be homoeopathy there. Let homoeopathy be recognised. Let homoeopaths be trained and let them spread out in the villages so that at least the villagers may have the consolation that they had some medical treatment that could cure them. Let them at least feel that they have been treated. This is a long subject, but I do not want to encroach further upon the time of the House.

Shri Pramathanath Banerjee (Con-  
tai): I do not want to speak about medicine and hospitals, but I want to deal with the general state of health of the country. I know that the health of this country is deteriorating. The test is this. Our young men who go to compete in the Olympic games on different items generally get defeated there. Only our hockey team has come out successful. Even their standard is going down day by day, and it may not be long before we see them also defeated in the Olympics.

Now, what is the cause of this? Not only outside India but also in India we see this, when football teams from other countries come to India and play against our teams, in West Bengal or elsewhere. In football, at least West Bengal has got a good name, but it was miserably defeated by the Russian and Japanese football teams. The Russian and Japanese teams defeated teams of other States also. This is a shame to India, that her teams should be defeated at the hands of the Russians and Japanese in her own home.

We must find out what are the causes of our defeat. Then we shall  
102 L.S.D.

be able to take proper steps to improve the health of our boys and girls, the young men and women. Then medicine will be less necessary and doctors also will be less necessary.

In this respect, I think the Health and Education Ministry should collaborate. Government are taking measures to see that upto 14 or 15 years, there will be compulsory education. The education department has a great responsibility in improving the health of our boys and girls so that with improved health, they will be an asset to the nation, instead of being a burden to the nation. Now, how to improve the health of our young boys and girls?

One hon. Member has said that food is a great factor in improving health. Most of our students who go to school are from the poor and lower middle class. They are the very people who serve the nation in all departments. The care of these children going to school should be the concern of the education department. What do I see now? I see little boys going to school with a load of books on their back and not a morsel of food in their stomach. The parents of these children are not able to provide them with food, what to talk of balanced food. They cannot provide them a full meal a day. They cannot spare it. I think in every school Government should provide funds for enabling the school to give to all the students at least one good balanced meal so that their deficiency in food in their homes may be made up.

Next I would like to draw your attention to the health of the womenfolk of our country. I cannot speak for other States, but I can speak about West Bengal. There the health of the womenfolk is greatly deteriorating. They excel in music and other artistic attainments, but their health is deteriorating. They have got a sweet voice which we may compare with that of the cuckoo of

[Shri Pramathanath Banerjee]

the English poem, but their health gives cause for concern. What will be the condition of the Bengali young girls if this continues? I think the State Government are taking some steps. But I feel that the Central Government should also look into it.

I hope the family planning scheme is going on. Someone spoke about it. I have been told by one of our experienced physicians that generally healthy fathers and mothers have less children than weak fathers and mothers. I hope if the health of parents is improved, the burden of family planning will also be removed from the shoulders of the Government.

I hope our young men and women will be healthy, strong and robust so that they will be able to shoulder the various responsibilities awaiting them, and we shall see a happy and healthy country.

बंधित डाक्टर बाबू भार्गव (हिसार) :  
जनाब स्पीकर साहब, सब से धन्यवाद देता हूँ।  
हैल्थ मिनिस्टर साहब को मुबारकबाद देता हूँ।  
आज उन को हैल्थ मिनिस्टर बेल कर सारा मदन  
बड़ा खुश हुआ है। उन्होंने पुराने काम को  
किसनी जाँफिसानी से किया है। कामर्स एंड  
इंडस्ट्री मिनिस्ट्री में इस से हम सब लोग बाकिफ  
हैं। अगर देखा जाए तो वह माउड माइन्ड इन  
ए साउंड बाडी का मुखसिमा है। जो बातें मैं  
कह रहा हूँ, उस में कोई सी पर्सनल बात है,  
क्योंकि हमें उम्मीद है कि आइन्दा जो कुछ भी  
हम कहेंगे वह उस को उसनी ही सरमर्मी से काम  
में लाएंगे जिस तरह से वह हमारी बातों का  
पहले ख्याल करते रहे हैं। साथ ही जो हमारे  
कमिंटिसिज्म होंगे उन पर भी बैसे ही काम करेंगे,  
जिस में कि पांच बरस बाद जब वह अपना  
चार्य वापस लेंगे तो हिन्दुस्तान ज्यादा हेल्थी  
ही और हिन्दुस्तान की जो पुरानी चीजें हैं  
इलाज की उन में भी वह काफी तरफकी कर ले।

वेक्टर इस के कि मैं अपनी असल चीज की  
तरफ घाटं, मैं सब से पहले अखिल भाप की

तबज्जह एक छोटी सी बात की तरफ बिलाना  
चाहता हूँ। एक्सरे कि जितनी किस्म है उनके  
लिए तबबीज है कि कस्टम इयूटीज बढ़ा दी  
जाए। अब भी उस के ऊपर कस्टम इयूटीज  
ज्यादा थी, उन के धीर ज्यादा बढ़ाने से, या  
किसी किस्म का धीर टैक्स बढ़ाने से जो  
मेडिकल रिलीफ है, उस में फर्क पड़ जाता है  
धीर वह चीजे बहुत महंगी हो जाती हैं। इस  
पर ३४ परसेन्ट से ४० परसेन्ट इयूटी बढ़ाए  
जाने की तबबीज है। मैं अर्जे कसंगा कि आन-  
रेबल मिनिस्टर साहब इस पर ध्यान दें धीर  
कोशिश करे कि यह न बढ़े। इसी तरह से  
जहां तक सेल्स टैक्स का सवाल है, इसे लम्बरी  
गुड्स समझा जाता है। मगर यह लम्बरी गुड्स  
में नहीं आता है। इसी तरह से सजिकल गुड्स  
हैं, उन पर भी सेल्स टैक्स नहीं पढ़ना चाहिए।

मैं ने इस रिपोर्ट को, जो कि पुराने हेल्थ  
मिनिस्टर को ऐट्रिब्यूट की जा सकती है, बहुत  
गौरमे पढा। इस के अन्दर सफा १०१ पर एक  
सास बात यह है कि राजकुमारी स्पोर्ट्स कोषिण  
स्कीम्स मौजूद है। जिस के लिए १६ एक्सपर्ट्स  
बाहर से मंगाए गए। सन् १९५३ से अब तक  
मैं समझता हू कि शायद चार लाख रुपया तो  
उन की तनख्वाहो पर ही खर्च हो गया होगा।  
मेरा खयाल है कि जब देश के अन्दर मेडिकल  
रिमीफ का यह हाल है, जिस का कि मैं घागे  
जिक्र करूंगा, तब इस किस्म की जो चीजें हैं,  
हमारे लिए आउट आफ डेट हैं, कल भरते ही  
यह जरूरी हो जाएं। हमारे दोस्त ने ओलिम्पिक्स  
की तरफ तबज्जह बिसाई है। इस तरफ भाप  
जरूर तबज्जह दे, लेकिन आज वह बलत है  
जब कि हमारा देश इस तरफ ज्यादा पैसा खर्च  
करने की इजाजत नहीं दे सकता।

जब हम सफा १०० पर देखते हैं तो वहां  
पर जिक्र पाते हैं बिस्किट जिक्र पाउडर का जो  
कि इन केस आउटफोर्सेस बाहर से आया है।  
मैं उन मुल्कों को मुबारकबाद देता हूँ जिन्होंने  
इमर्जेंसी के बलत हमारी मदद की, लेकिन मैं  
यह खर्च करना चाहता हूँ कि हिन्दुस्तान को

घरों के मारे गर्क हो जाना चाहिए कि वह स्किम्ड मिल्क पाउडर बाहर से मगता है। यह वह देश है जिस में गावों की पूजा होती है, जिस में कृष्ण महाराज गोपालन करते थे, जिस से हम लोग रोजमर्रा काऊ के वास्ते स्लोगन्स उठाते हैं। इस मुल्क में स्किम्ड मिल्क बाहर से आए, इस से ज्यादा बदनामी हिन्दुस्तान की नहीं हो सकती और इस से ज्यादा कोई फेल्योर गवर्नमेंट की नहीं हो सकती।

जिक्र आया कि हेल्थ के वास्ते क्या चीज जरूरी है। मेरे लायक दोस्त ने साफ पानी का जिक्र किया। मैं उम्मीद करता हूँ कि स्किम्ड मिल्क के साथ मैं किताब में यह पढ़ूंगा कि गवर्नमेंट आफ इंडिया ने हर एक स्कूल के हर एक लड़के लड़के के लिए आब सेर दूध का इंतजाम किया है। अगर आप कान्स्टिट्यूशन की दफा ४७ को देखें तो आप कां मानूम होगा कि उस में लिखा है कि हम न्यूट्रिशन के स्टैंडर्ड का बढ़ायेंगे। मैं यह समझ सकता कि इस तरह में न्यूट्रिशन का स्टैंडर्ड कैसे बढ सकता है। आप किनी दूसरे सिविलाइज्ड मुल्क के लिए देखिए कि वहाँ के बच्चे कितना दूध इस्तेमाल करते हैं और उन की हेल्थ कितनी अच्छी है। आज हिन्दुस्तान में आप चार मजदूरों को तनख्वाह दे, लेकिन चार मजदूर उतना काम नहीं कर पायेंगे जितना कि एक रशियन मजदूर, एक रशियन सिपाही या एक जापानी जेबरर और सिपाही कर सकता है। इस से ज्यादा खराबी हमारे लिए और नहीं हो सकती। आज यह मिल्क का मामला हम मिनिस्ट्री के चार्ज में नहीं आता है, इस लिए इस मसले पर ज्यादा नहीं कहूंगा। जब फूड ऐंड ऐग्रीकल्चर की डिमान्ड आएगी उस में मैं अपनी बात अर्ब करूंगा।

मैं ने इस रिपोर्ट को देखा। उस को पढ़ने पर कुछ जगहों पर मुझे ऐसा लगा कि हमारी मिनिस्ट्री की बजह में देश की बड़ी तरक्की हुई है? मैं ने जब फेमिली प्लैनिंग की बात को

पढ़ा तो बड़ा खुश हुआ। मैं चाहूँ कि मुलवातिर इस चीज को कहता रहा है। धाकिर बक्त आया कि गवर्नमेंट ने इस की तरफ कदम उठाया है। मैं चाहता हूँ कि फेमिली प्लैनिंग के ऊपर और ज्यादा धपया खर्च किया जाए। यह देश के वास्ते बहुत जरूरी चीज है।

जहा तक मलेरिया का मवाल है, मैं मिनिस्ट्री को मुबारकबाद देता हूँ कि उस की इन्सिडेंस देस में बहुत कम हो गई है और ज्यादा कमी की तरफ जा रही है। बक्त आया जब कि मलेरिया हमारे देश से नापैद हो जाएगा।

इन चीजों को पढ़ने के बाद मैं ने देखा कि उस में बड़े अस्पतालो का जिक्र है। विलिंगडन अस्पताल, इरविन अस्पताल, दूसरे अस्पताल, मद्रान में, बंगलौर में, और न जाने कहा कहा, जिन के लिए कहा गया कि वह बहुत तरक्की कर रहे हैं। बड़ा अच्छा है वह तरक्की करें। मैं उन के बिल्साफ नहीं हूँ। मैं ने उस में यूनिफ़ॉर्म और डेल्फू० एब० प्रो० का जिक्र भी पढ़ा। इन सब चीजों को पढ़ कर मुझे खुशी होती है लेकिन जो सब से जरूरी चीज मैं समझता हूँ वह यह है कि आप नेशनल मेडिकल रिर्लीफ के वास्ते क्या कर रहे हैं। जिन के नाम पर गवर्नमेंट चलती है, जिन के नाम पर रोज पालिदानेट के मेम्बरान कस्मे खाते हैं, उन का जिक्र मैं ने इस किताब में कही नहीं पढ़ा कि उन के लिए मेडिकल रिर्लीफ के बारे में आपने क्या किया। मैं उम्मीद करता हूँ कि अपनी रिपोर्ट में डा० कि मि० करमरकर की रिपोर्ट होगी उस में आप अपना पर्सनैलिटी का आर्क डालें। मैं पूछना चाहूंगा कि हिन्दुस्तान के अन्दर करल एरियाज या विलेज के वास्ते आप ने क्या किया है मेडिकल रिर्लीफ के तौर पर। मैं यह उम्मीद नहीं करता हूँ कि यह चीज इस में मे मिलिग होगी। अगर मिसिग हीमो तो मैं इस को पढ़ना नहीं चाहूंगा। मैं नहीं चाहता कि आप के सामने मैं कोई खराब नकसा पेश करूँ। लेकिन खराब नकसा मैं क्या पेश करूँगा, सन् १९४४ में मोर कमेटी हवाई। विलेज की गवर्नमेंट ने मुर्करर की थी क्योंकि वह मैं इस

[पंडित ठाकुर दास भांगव]

बात से मुतासिर थी कि हिन्दुस्तान के लोगों की हेल्थ के लिए ठीक इन्तजाम नहीं है। भोर कमेटी ने रिपोर्ट लिखी, उस के अन्दर आयुर्वेदिक, होम्योपैथिक या यूनानी और नैचुरोपैथी का जिक्र नहीं है, लेकिन जो कुछ भी उन्होंने लिखा बहुत सानदारी के साथ लिखा। उन्होंने हिन्दुस्तानियों की तन्दुहस्ती को असली फोटो हमारे सामने खींची। मैं उस का एक छोटा सा टुकड़ा जनाब की इजाजत से ढ़ कर सुनाना चाहता हूँ ताकि हाउस को मालूम हो कि जिस चीज का मैं जिक्र कर रहा हूँ उसके बारे में उसकी क्या राय थी। कमेटी ने लिखा :

“We are unfortunately not in a position to assess the real value of these indigenous systems of medical treatment as practised today as we have been unable, with the time and opportunities at our disposal, to take such an investigation into this problem as to justify clear cut recommendations. Yet, with its present resources, the western medicine, can only provide a part of the country's medical relief. Not only this. The programme projected by the Committee on Health Survey and Development will take a period of about 40 years to provide full relief, and will cost the country an immense sum of Rs. 362, 99,00,000 non-recurring and Rs. 601,82,00,000 recurring in the first ten years. The ring and Rs. 601,82,00,000 recurring in the first ten years. The Report of the Health Survey and Development Committee gives the number of qualified graduates and licentiatees of the Western system in 1941-42 as 47, 524 in the then British India, which works out to one doctor for every 6,300 of population. This is in great contrast to one doctor for every one thousand of population in the U. K. This unsatisfactory state of affairs becomes all the more alarming when we

served in each province per medical institution, i.e. hospitals and dispensaries put together.”

मैं इस को और आगे नहीं पढ़ना चाहता हूँ, लेकिन इतना जरूर अर्ज कर सकता हूँ कि उस में दर्ज है कि जितने डाक्टरों यहां हैं उन में से कम से कम ७५ फी सदी शह में रहते हैं, जिस के माने यह है कि इन में से बड़ी तादाद ऐसी है जो गांवों में नहीं जाती। उन्होंने खुद तो कोई तबज्जह गांवों की तरफ नहीं की लेकिन जब से यह रिपोर्ट निकली उस वक्त पे गवर्नमेंट की आंखें खुलीं। मैं पुरानी हिस्ट्री में नहीं जाना चाहता, लेकिन तकरीबन १३० वर्ष हुए जब अंग्रेजों ने यह चाहा कि यहां पर यूनानी और आयुर्वेदिक सिस्टम्स को मदद दी जाए। लेकिन चन्द वर्षों के बाद ही सन् १८३३ में पुरानी गवर्नमेंट ने यह मामला खत्म कर दिया। ईस्ट इंडिया कम्पनी ने प्रिंजेजी सिस्टम को यहां पर जारी करना शुरू किया। मैं अर्ज करना चाहता हूँ कि जिस देश के अन्दर उन की हुकूमत चली जाती है, उस देश की सिर्फ हुकूमत नहीं जाती, उस देश के सारे सिस्टम एग्रेगेशन के और मेडिकल साइंस के, हर एक चीजें खत्म हो जाती हैं और कोई ताज्जुब की बात नहीं कि हिन्दुस्तान के सिस्टम आयुर्वेद और यूनानी के अंग्रेजों ने सारे के सारे खत्म कर दिए, कम से कम खत्म करने की कोशिश की। नतीजा यह हुआ कि हमारी आयुर्वेद की साइंस पीछे पड़ गई। मैं इस बात को मानता हूँ कि यह दुनिया के अन्दर सबसे बड़ी साइंस थी और यूनानी और ऐलोपैथी तो डाक्टरों के कहने के मुताबिक इसकी पोती और पड़पोती हैं। मुसलमानों के जमाने में ही यह साइंस पीछे पड़ गयी थी और इसका पहले जैसा बोलवाला नहीं रहा था। मेरे पास आयुर्वेद का सारा इतिहास आपके सामने रखने का वक्त नहीं है हाउस का हर एक मेम्बर इसके बारे में जानता है कि

किसी जमाने में आयुर्वेद किसनी हाइट पर पहुँच चुका था। जो आज की मैडीकल साइंस है मैं उसके खिलाफ नहीं हूँ। मैं तो पंडित जवाहर लाल जी की इस बात को सिर पर रखना चाहता हूँ कि जहाँ तक साइंसेज का टास्कु है, हमारे मुलक को साइंटिफिकल्ली धाने बढ़ना है। अगर नये सिस्टम में कोई चीज भरखी है तो हम उसको कबूल करेंगे। अगर किसी बारे में आयुर्वेद थुप है तो हम ऐलोपैथिक साइंस को कबूल करेंगे।

पिछले ४० सालों में प्राविसेज में इस बारे में पचासी कमेटियां बैठ चुकी हैं और इस मसले पर गौर कर चुकी हैं। मेरे पास इस वक्त चोपड़ा कमेटी, बनर्जी साहब की होमियोपैथिक कमेटी और दावे कमेटी की रिपोर्टें मौजूद हैं। उनको पढ़ने से मालूम होगा कि पिछले चालीस पचास सालों में हर एक प्राविसे में किसनी कमेटियां इस बारे में बनीं। इन रिपोर्टों में कहा गया है कि यहाँ पर पुराने सिस्टम को फिर से जारी करके लोगों को मैडीकल रिस्की का फायदा पहुँचाया जाये।

आज मेरे एक दोस्त ने बोन सैटिंग का जिक्र किया। मैं एक शास्त्र को जानता हूँ जो कि जयपुर में बोन सैटिंग का काम करता था। जिन केसेज को सिविल सर्जन ठीक नहीं कर सकते थे उनको वह कुम्हार एक रुपया लेकर ठीक कर देता था और वह एक रुपया भी वह चैरिटी में दे देता था। आज इस हाउस में ऐसे बहुत से मेम्बर हैं जिनको अपने बिस्म पर या अपने घर बावों के बिस्म पर आयुर्वेदिक इलाज के फायदे का तथ्य है कि जहाँ ऐलोपैथी फेल हो गयी वहाँ आयुर्वेद ने फायदा पहुँचाया। इस वक्त हाउस में हमारे नम्बर जी मौजूद नहीं हैं। उनकी निम्नान हमारे सामने मौजूद है कि जहाँ डाक्टर फेल हो गये और आयुर्वेदिक सिस्टम ने फायदा पहुँचाया। इसमें कोई शक नहीं है कि आयुर्वेद एक बहुत ऊंची साइंस है। इसको यह कहना कि यह साइंस नहीं खुद अपसाइंटिफिक है। मैं समझ से भ्रम करना चाहता हूँ कि चोपड़ा कमेटी, दावे

कमेटी और बनर्जी कमेटी की सिफारिशों को गवर्नमेंट तसलीम कर चुकी है और यह जान चुकी है कि सारी साइंसेज का सिविलिज के तीर पर देश को फायदा पहुँचाया जायेगा। आपने ऐलोपैथिक सिस्टम पर इस देश में करोड़ों रुपया लगाया है। मैं यह नहीं कहता कि इसको खत्म कर दिया जाये। लेकिन मैं एक बात आपकी सिफरत में भ्रम करना चाहता हूँ। आप इस चीज का धन्दाजा लगाइये कि जब से यहाँ ऐलोपैथी का सिस्टम शुरू हुआ है तब से दूसरे देशों से ऐलोपैथिक दवायें मंगाने पर कितना रुपया खर्च किया जा चुका है। अगर आप धन्दाजा लगायें तो आपको मालूम होगा कि अगर यह रुपया बाहर न भेजा जाता तो आपको अपनी फाइव हज़र प्लान्स के सिधे रुपये की जरूरत नहीं रहती। सारा रुपया देश से ही मिल जाता। इस देश का भरबों भरबों रुपया बाहर से ऐलोपैथिक दवायें मंगाने पर खर्च हो चुका है।

जो डाक्टर साहब सब से पहले बोले थे उन्होंने फरमाया कि हमारे देश में सर्वनथा और दूसरी दवायें होती हैं। जो कि धाना बर्ब की है और जिनकी नालिज देश के बहुत से लोगों के दिलों में मौजूद है। कितने ही ऐसे लोग अपने साथ उस नालिज को जिधे घर जाते हैं और उसको अपने नहीं बढ़ाते। इस देश में घर घर में खानदान खानदान में लोग ऐसी बहुत सी दवायों को जानते हैं। हमारी बूझी धीरतें इन दवाईयों के जरिये बन्धों को बन्धा कर लेती हैं, जैसा कि डाक्टर भी नहीं कर सकते। यह सारा ट्रेडीशनल नालिज है। यह सब आयुर्वेद का हिस्सा है।

**श्री किरोक नानी (रायबरेली):** होमियोपैथी की।

चित्त डाक्टर बाबू नानैब : जहाँ तक साइंस का टास्कु है मैं होमियोपैथी को भी ही जगह देने को तैयार हूँ जैसी कि आयुर्वेद को या दूनानी और ऐलोपैथी को। साइंस साइंस है। साइंस के बारे में हमको अपना

[पंडित ठाकुर दास भार्गव]

दिमांग, पंडित जी के अल्लाख में, हमेशा खुला रखना चाहिये।

आज मैं बड़े जोरो से आपके सामने यह अर्थ करने के लिये खड़ा हुआ हूँ कि पिछले साल की रिपोर्ट पढ़कर मुझे बहुत दुःख हुआ। रिपोर्ट में सफा ४५ और ४६ पर आयुर्वेद को एनकरेजमेंट देने का जिक्र है। जब कमी आयुर्वेद का जिक्र आता है तो हमारे सामने जामनगर रख दिया जाता है। सिर्फ यही एक चीज है जो कि अभी तक आयुर्वेद की तरफकी के लिये की गयी है। पहली पंच वर्षीय योजना में ३०। लाख रुपया मंजूर किया गया था। मैं अदब से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि इसमें से कितना रुपया खर्च किया गया। इस दूसरी पंच वर्षीय प्लान में मेडिसिन और उससे मुतालिक सारी चीजों के लिये २०० करोड़ रुपया रखा गया है और सिर्फ एक करोड़ रुपया आयुर्वेद, यूनानी, होमियोपैथी और हैथरोपैथी के लिये रखा गया है। ५.२३ करोड़ रियासतों के अन्दर रखा गया है। यह कितना पर सट हुआ था। फना सकते हैं। वर्कमेंट इन चीजों के बारे में फैसला कर चुकी है लेकिन आज देश में हालत यह है कि अब नये फैसले करने का जरूरत नहीं है। यह माना जा चुका है कि सिस्टम के नीचे पर साँची चीजों को एक ही जगह पर रख जायगा और सब सिस्टम का माइस को जानन वाले एक ही तरह के डाक्टर बनाय जायेंगे। पिछले मंत्रा जनाव हमारी इमदाद फरमाया था। आपने फरमाया था कि यह नहीं कहा जा सकता कि आयुर्वेदिक मॉडर्न साइन्स नहीं है। यह अब तो होने के बाद मैं अदब से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि क्यों आज तक काउन्सिल आफ आयुर्वेदिक मेडिसिन कायम नहीं की गयी। क्यों यूनानी और होमियोपैथी के लिये काउन्सिल कायम नहीं की गयी, क्यों इनके डायरिक्ट्रीट कायम नहीं किये गये। दावे रिपोर्ट को और दूसरी रिपोर्टों को माना जा चुका है लेकिन अभी तक सिर्फ एक एडवाइजरी बोर्ड बनाया गया है जिसकी मॉटिंग जायद ६ महीने में

एक बार होती है। मैं अर्थ करना चाहता हूँ कि यह निहायत असतोषजनक हालत है। सिर्फ तीन चार कालिजों को इमदाद देने से मैंड, कल रिलेफ का मसला हल नहीं हो सकता। आपके डाक्टर साहिबान कमी गाबो में जाना नहीं चाहते। फिर इनका इलाज इतना महंगा है कि गरीब आदमी तो क्या अमीर से अमीर आदमी तक के लिये इनका इलाज करवाना मुश्किल है। अगर आपकी इनका इलाज करवाना है तो पहले तो तरह तरह के टेस्ट कराने होंगे, बूक का टेस्ट कराइये, पेसाब का टेस्ट कराइये, ब्लू का टेस्ट कराइये। तब कही आपका डाइगनासिस हो सकेगा। डाइगनासिस के बाद दवाये इतनी महंगी हैं कि कोई राजा महाराजा है। उनसे फायदा उठा सकता है, गरीब आदमी तो उनसे फायदा उठा ही नहीं सकता। मेरा खयाल है कि नेशनल मेडिकल रिलेफ का काम नाममचिन होगा अगर आप पुरानी ट्रेडिशन को फिर से नये सिरे से जारी नहीं करेगे और अपने बंधों को और हकीमों को गाबो में नहीं भेजेंगे जो कि लोगों से बिलान पैसा लिये इलाज करे। जब तक ऐसा नहीं होगा तब तक न तो हमारा एंजुवैशन का मामला हल होगा और न मैंड-कल रिलेफ का मसला हल होगा। पहले तो नैच हुआ करने थे वे बिना से पैसा नहीं लेने थे व गरीबों के साथ उनके घर जाकर उनका इलाज करने थे। पर वे लोग भूखे नहीं रहते थे। आज हिन्दुस्तान के लेडमैस लैबरेटर्स, मालाना आमदनी १०० रुपया है और एक मामूली आदमी की आमदनी २५२ रुपया मात्र है। क्या ऐसे आदमी इन दवाओं से फायदा उठा सकते हैं? मैं खूबन सिन्हा साहब को मुबारकबाद देता हूँ कि कल Contributory Health Scheme पर बहम करते हुए उन्होंने वर्कमेंट की तबज्जह इस तरह बिसाई कि एंथोपैथिक सिस्टम को रिआयत न दी जाये और एक सफ्त को इजाजत ही कि वह चाहे जिस सिस्टम से चाहे अपना इलाज करायें। मैं तो चाहता हूँ कि अब तक जो वर्कमेंट

को पालिसी रही है उसको रिवर्स किया जाये। सब सिस्टम के साथ यकसां सलूक किया जाये। सब साइलेंट को बराबर का दर्जा दिया जाये और सब को बराबर प्रोत्साहन मिले। प्राप ऐसा तरीका निकालिये कि ऐनोपथी के साथ साथ दूसरे सिस्टमस का फायदा भी लोगों को मिल सके। मैं इसके हक में नहीं हूँ कि कितो एक सिस्टम को हो प्रोत्साहन दिया जाये। मैं चाहता हूँ कि प्राप जो रुपया खर्च करते हैं उसका फायदा सब सिस्टमस को मिले। अब तक प्राप इस तरह ध्यान नहीं देंगे सब तक प्राप नेशनल मंडाकल रिलाक के मतभे को हल नहीं कर सकेंगे। अब तक प्रा गया है कि प्राप अपनी पालिसी को बेंज करें और उन साइलेंट को, जो कि इस देश को पैदावार है, पूरा प्रोत्साहन दें। मैं यह नहीं चाहता कि प्राप उनका हर एक बात को कबूल करें, लेकिन उन में जो बातें अच्छी है, साबितशुदा है, उन को अपनाये और एनकरेज करें। इस में एक करोड़ रुपये का सवाल नहीं है, प्राप इसके लिये और भी बहुत ज्यादा रुपया खर्च करें। अगर मेरे हाथ में इन देश का हुकूमत होतो, तो थोड़ा मो, निहायत जरूरी चीजों के अलावा, जिन का इतजाम यहां नहीं हो सकता है, जैसे सजिकल गुड्स है, कोई भी चीज बाहर से न आने देना। मैं अर्ज करना चाहता हूँ कि इंटेड मेडिसिन्ज इस देश के लिये एक कर्म हैं। जिस इंटेड मेडिसिन को कोमत दो आने होतो है, उसके दस रुपये चार्ज कर लिये जाते हैं। अगर इन मेडिसिन्ज को मंगवाना बन्द कर दिया जाय, तो इस देश का कुछ भी नहीं बिगड़ेगा। हमारे यहां कुनीन तो पहले ही से पैदा की जा रही है। हमारे देश में हर एक क्लिन को क्वाइमेंट है, हर तरह को मेडिसिन्जस यहां पर तैयार की जा सकतो हैं। प्राय हासत यह है कि इस मामले में आपने ऐनोपथी को बेसिस बनाया हुआ है। इस पालिसी को रैडिकली बेंज करना होगा। अगर हम न इस देश का अला करना है, तो यह निहायत जरूरत है कि इस देश की जो अच्छी चीजें हैं, हम उन को बहुत जोरों के साथ प्रापे

बनायें। इस देश की जो जो साइंस है, उस के साथ बहुत धरसे से बेइसाफी की जा रही है। मैं यह अर्ज करना चाहता हूँ कि प्राप गरीबों के साथ बेइसाफी न कांजिये। और बातों का स्वराज्य मिल गया है, लेकिन मेडिकल स्वराज्य, जिसकी लोग दस बच से इंतजार कर रहे हैं, अर्था तक नहीं आया है। अब तक प्रा गया है कि इस देश के लोगों को मेडिकल स्वराज्य दिया जाय।

प्राक्त्रि में मैं सिर्फ यही अर्ज करना चाहता हूँ कि इस देश की चिकित्सा पद्धति और इस देश का दवाओं को, जहां तक बे दुस्त हों, अपनाया चाहिये। एनोपथी की जो अच्छी चीजें हैं, उनको नहीं छोड़ना चाहिये, लेकिन जो दवायें बाहर से आतो हैं, उन का आना जहर बन्द कर दिया जाना चाहिये।

**Shri Pattabhi Raman (Kumbakonam):** It is admitted on all hands that we have to have more medical colleges and more doctors in this country. For this, we should have many more doctors well qualified to teach students, so that the number may go up. We are told that in the second Five Year Plan, we need 90,000 doctors and we have now got about 70,000. We may reach somewhere near that number in 15 years time, but we have to allow for the diminution of the existing strength of doctors. Therefore, it is a growing need that we should have efficient doctors well-qualified to take up the work of preventing and healing diseases in this country.

Firstly, I wish to state that we have fixed a very high minimum as the cost plan for the medical colleges. I believe it is somewhere near Rs. 1½ crores; that is the amount needed for the medical college at Hubli. I do not think it is necessary to build huge buildings for the purpose of colleges or hospitals. There are very many big buildings in the former princely States and also in former capitals like Nagpur. In Nagpur we have got a Government House, a secretariat, a



[Shri Pattabhi Raman]

High Court, etc. I would suggest also that many railways and military hospitals should be got up-to-date. This, I would put as the first necessity, so far as the building up of hospitals and the technical personnel is concerned.

I wish to state in this connection that we must stop—I have no doubt the hon. Minister will take steps in that direction—destroying existing institutions. I am referring to the Lady Hardinge Medical College here in Delhi. It has functioned very effectively for more than 40 years and students from all over India have come and joined it. About 60 girls are taken every year as against 1500 applications. I submit that this institution must be preserved and the argument that we should not have a wholly women's college is unsound, at any rate so far as North India is concerned. Even in the United States, there are colleges like this for girls.

The Directorate General of Health and Medical Departments, used to publish health reports annually giving out the data of the health situation in the country. These reports are of great importance and they must be revived, if they have been stopped. They must be available at any rate to this House.

We used to have all-India services like the old Indian Medical Service and the Women's Medical Service. I would plead that if these services are there, they will not only co-ordinate the medical talent in this country, but will also supply homogeneity and medical administrators with all-Indian outlook and experience which will counteract fissiparous tendencies found in the various parts of the country. Actually in the olden days, there were many efficient doctors from the south serving in north and *vice versa*; I believe that we must plan realistically so far as medical personnel are concerned. The attempt must be to give some form of medical care to all as far as possible. I wish to add to what fell from my learned friend. We

must have auxiliary medical services and for this the Government should mobilise the services of acknowledged Ayurvedic Vaidyas and Hakims, who can be trained to serve as auxiliary medical men.

There is frequent reference to the need for doctors going to the rural areas. It is very important. For this purpose, we must have very many rural dispensaries with a modicum of modern equipment and drugs. Many of the doctors who go to the rural areas have to maintain households in nearby towns for the education of their children and so on. Actually while the doctors in the towns get city allowances, the doctors going to the rural areas lose it. They should not be made to suffer in this way for taking up such work. They must be given an extra allowance for going to the rural areas. They must also have links with hospitals in nearby towns and we must also have frequent visiting teams of experts, so that they will be kept trim and posted with up-to-date knowledge.

There is always reference to the importation of specialists in this country. I welcome such specialists wherever necessary. We have great need, so far as the proper utilisation of these experts is concerned.

**Shri V. P. Nayar (Quilon):** They charge high fees.

**Shri Pattabhi Raman:** I am not referring to the charge; I am on a different point. We have got many specialists, but we find that a specialist in ophthalmology is being transferred to the general side, or, an E.N.T. specialist is asked to attend to accident cases. If we collect statistics regarding the mis-use—(misuse) of specialists, it would be very revealing.

Finally, there should be real emphasis on preventive medicine and treatment. I wish to refer in this connection to the Pasteur Institute in Coonoor, which I visited. I find it is

one of the leading anti-Rabic institutions in Asia and has frequently come to the help of the Government. They have recently isolated the influenza virus and they have been given a grant of Rs. 2500. This is a charitable institution and a trust; the resources are not enough for improving and expanding it appreciably. Actually I was astounded to learn that this institution would be able to supply 20,000 vaccines against the influenza virus by August. This, I submit, is a drop in the ocean. We need much more of preventive care. From what I hear of this epidemic, the second wave is expected to be more dangerous in its incidence; and, there is a likelihood of a third wave also. Therefore, I would submit that every care should be taken to help institutions like the Pasteur Institute and Haffkine Institute and other institutions to which reference is made in the report submitted to us by the department

The staff for these institutions have to be very carefully selected and they must be increased. I am also aware that there is a Virus Institute at Poona I do not know what the actual expenditure incurred on it is. I find that an extensive survey is being conducted in this institute by eminent doctors from America and they are determining the anti-body levels of the blood population against different viruses I sincerely hope that qualified Indians are also being trained and they are given all encouragement in the Virus Institute at Poona I am not against importation of foreign experts so far as they are necessary. To the extent necessary they must be imported. But I am sure the Government will make it a condition that each and everyone of them must train as many Indians as possible in the Departments in which they are experts.

13 hrs.

Reference has been made to the drug industry *in extenso*. I wish to echo the sentiments of my learned friend, Pandit Thakur Das Bhargava, with regard to crores of rupees being

spent by Indians on drugs. There are already some European and American firms which have established big concerns here and have taken Indians into their management and organisation. There is an institute in Calcutta doing some work. I am sure Government will take every step to see that we become as self-sufficient as possible in the manufacture of drugs.

#### PANEL OF CHAIRMEN

Mr. Speaker: Before I call upon Shrimati Maniben Patel, I have to inform the House that under Rule 9(1) of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business, I have nominated the following Members as Members of the Panel of Chairmen:

- (1) Shri J. M. Mohamed Imam.
- (2) Shri C. R. Pattabhi Raman.

I request Shri Pattabhi Raman to come and take the Chair.

#### DEMANDS FOR GRANTS—contd.

##### MINISTRY OF HEALTH—Contd.

The Minister of Health (Shri Karmarkar): When are you likely to call me?

Mr. Speaker: The time was extended by one hour; that means the debate will be concluded at 2.15. How long does the Minister propose to take?

Shri Karmarkar: If you allow me, half-an-hour.

Mr. Speaker: He will be called at 1.45 I propose to allow ten minutes for every hon. Member. I find a number of hon. Members are anxious to take part in the discussion.

Shri Dasappa (Bangalore): I thought you were allotting four hours for this Ministry.

Mr. Speaker: Three hours. I extended it by one hour. I said that in future five hours will be allotted

[Mr. Speaker]

for Education and five hours for Health.

The following are the selected cut motions relating to various Demands under the Ministry of Health which have been indicated by the members to be moved.

Demand No.	No. of Cut Motions
47	737
48	741, 742, 743.
49	749, 750, 751, 752, 753, 760.
119	805.

*Desirability of revision of wages of officers and staff*

Shri Tangamani (Madurai): I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Ministry of Health' be reduced by Rs. 10."

*Proper aid to State Governments for establishing Cancer Research Institute*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move.

"That the demand under the head 'Medical Services' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Giving grants for development of 'Siddha Vaidyam' a system prevalent among Tamil speaking people in Madras State*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move.

"That the demand under the head 'Medical Services' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Low grants given to Madras State*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move.

"That the demand under the head 'Medical Services' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Necessity of B.C.G. subsidy*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Public Health' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Working of health centres in N.E.S. Blocks*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Public Health' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Allocation for Family Planning*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Public Health' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Relief to destitute and the poor*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Public Health' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Need to expand pilot project for influenza vaccine set up at Coornoor in Madras State*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Public Health' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Low allocation to Andhra and Kerala States*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Public Health' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Kadambari Estate Cincona cultivation*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Capital Outlay of the Ministry of Health' be reduced by Rs. 100."

Mr. Speaker: These cut motions are before the House.

श्रीव.श्री अलिखोन पटेल (आन्ध्र) .  
 अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं जो अपनी प्राबाज  
 इस प्राबाज में मिलाना चाहती हूँ कि लेडी  
 हाइंग मैडिकल कालेज को बहनों के लिये  
 ही खुला रखना चाहिये । उसमें सारे  
 हिन्दुस्तान से कितनी ही बहनें प्रतिवर्ष  
 आती हैं । आप अगर इस बात की ज़रूरत  
 महसूस करते हैं कि भाइयों के लिये भी  
 मैडिकल कालेज की आवश्यकता है तो  
 दिल्ली के अन्दर आप दूसरा कालेज खोल  
 सकते हैं । परन्तु मेरे निवेदन है कि आप  
 इस कालेज को खराब न करे । अगर  
 आप दोनों सदनों, यानी लोक-सभा तथा  
 राज्य सभा, की बहनों से पूछेंगे तो मेरा  
 यह दृढ़ विश्वास है कि सिवाय उस बहिन  
 के जो भी अभी कुछ देर पहले मिनिस्टर  
 थी, बाकी की सब बहनें यही कहेंगी कि इस  
 मैडिकल कालेज को जारी रखा जाना चाहिये  
 और यह केवल बहनों के लिये ही खुला  
 होना चाहिये ।

यहां पर डी० डी० टी० का भी जिक्र  
 हुआ है । इसके बारे में मुझे यह निवेदन  
 करना है कि मैं जहां भी जानी हूँ मुझे यही  
 सिकायत सुनने को मिलती है कि डी०  
 डी० टी० का पहले जो अमर हुआ करता  
 था वह आज नहीं होता है । इसका क्या  
 कारण है, यह तो मैं आपको नहीं बतला  
 सकती हूँ । परन्तु हमारा यह अनुभव है कि  
 पहले जितने भी मच्छर, कीड़े इत्यादि  
 घरो में हुआ करते थे या कोई दूसरे जन्तु  
 हुआ करते थे, वे सभी इसके प्रयोग से खत्म  
 हो जाते थे परन्तु आज इसका मच्छरों पर  
 भी असर नहीं पड़ता है । आज यह कहा  
 जाता है कि इसके प्रयोग से मलेरिया खत्म  
 हो जाता है, मच्छर खत्म हो जाते हैं तथा  
 और प्रकार से यह उपयोगी है । परन्तु  
 हमारा अनुभव यह है कि इसका प्रयोग  
 करने पर भी काफी मच्छर बच रहते हैं,  
 इसका कारण क्या है, उसको अगर आप  
 ढूढ़ने की कोशिश करेंगे तो आप को पता चल

जायेगा । मैं निवेदन करती हूँ कि आप  
 इस और भी ध्यान दें ।

13.05 hrs.

[SHRI PATTABHI RAMAN in the Chair]

जामनगर की इंस्टीट्यूशन का भी यहाँ  
 पर जिक्र किया गया है । आयुर्वेदों के लिये  
 आपने एक इंस्टीट्यूशन तो खोल रखा  
 है परन्तु मैं देख रही हूँ कि उसके ऊपर जो  
 नियंत्रण है वह एक डाक्टर का है जो कि  
 एलोपैथी का डाक्टर है । जो आयुर्वेदिक  
 सस्था होती है, उसके ऊपर अगर आयुर्वेदी  
 जानने वाले का नियंत्रण न हो तो उसका  
 विस्तार तथा विकास नहीं हो सकता है ।  
 उस पर केवल उसका ही नियंत्रण रहना  
 चाहिये जो आयुर्वेदी में श्रद्धा रखता हो,  
 उसमें विश्वास रखता हो । जिस की उसके  
 साथ सहानुभूति होगी वही उसको प्रोत्साहन  
 देने में सफल हो सकता है । यह काम जितनी  
 अच्छी तरह से आयुर्वेदी जानने वाले से हो  
 सकता है उतनी अच्छी तरह से एलोपैथिक  
 डाक्टर से नहीं हो सकता । इस वास्ते मैं  
 निवेदन करना चाहती हूँ कि इस और भी  
 आपका ध्यान जाना चाहिये । यह बात जो  
 मैं कह रही हूँ यह मेरी भी ही बात नहीं है ।  
 मैं जामनगर गई हूँ और वहाँ पर अच्छे  
 अच्छे आदमियों से मिली हूँ, ऐसे आदमियों  
 से मिली हूँ जिन को इसमें काफी दिलचस्पी  
 है, जिन्होंने इसको शुरू किया है और जिन्होंने  
 ने इसके विकास में काफी मदद की है और  
 काफी मेहनत भी की है । उन लोगों के दिनों  
 में भी इसके बारे में चिन्ता है कि अब इसका  
 क्या होगा । इस वास्ते मैं आपसे प्रार्थना  
 करती हूँ कि लोगों की चिन्ता को दूर किया  
 जाये और उसको उस डाक्टर के अन्दर  
 रखा जाये जो आयुर्वेदिक हो या इससे  
 हमदर्दी रखता हो ।

स्किम्ड मिलक के बारे में यहाँ पर कुछ  
 कहा गया है । मैं बतलाना चाहती हूँ कि  
 आन्ध्र में जो डेरी है वहाँ पर स्किम्ड मिलक

## [श्रीमती मणिबेन पटेल]

पाउडर बनता है और अब उसे विदेशों से लाने की जरूरत नहीं है। वहाँ गाय का दूध तो नहीं है, यह बात सही है। परन्तु मैं आपको बतलाना चाहती हूँ कि जितना स्किम्ड मिल्क बाहर से आता है उसमें बट्टर मिल्क पाउडर भी होता है। इस चीज को जो एक्सपर्ट्स हैं वे जांच करके देख सकते हैं। इस लिये मिल्क पाउडर का दूध जो बम्बई के होटलों में दिया जाता था उस दूध की चाय लोग पसन्द नहीं करते थे। इस चीज को हमें भेजने वाले एक आदमी ने बताया है कि हम स्किम्ड मिल्क पाउडर की जगह पर बट्टर मिल्क पाउडर भी भेजते हैं। इस लिये मैं निवेदन करना चाहती हूँ कि भ्रान्त कोओप्रोटिब डेरी में भैस के दूध का ही सही परन्तु शुद्ध और ताजा स्किम्ड मिल्क पाउडर तैयार होता है और उसके इस्तेमाल को प्रोत्साहन दिया जाना चाहिये।

अब मैं थोड़ा सा एन्टीबायोटिक्स के बारे में कहना चाहती हूँ। इन पर जितना खर्चा होता है यह देख कर लोग परेशान होते हैं। जो आयुर्वेदिक दवाई होती है जब वह नाकामयाब हो जाती है तब एलोपैथिक डाक्टर उसकी निन्दा करते हैं, नाराज होते हैं और मरीज से कहते हैं कि क्या बेबकूफी पुन करतें हो और ऐसे लोगों के पास क्यों जाते हो। परन्तु जब डाक्टर की दवाई से किसी को कुछ हो जाता है और कभी एन्टीबायोटिक्स से बुरा रिप्लेक्सन होता है तो क्योंकि वह डाक्टर है इस लिये उसे कुछ नहीं कहा जा सकता है। मैं ने देखा है कि पेशिस में तथा दवाओं में कोई ऐसे पदार्थ दिये जाते हैं डाक्टरों द्वारा जोकि बहुत खराब सिद्ध होते हैं। एक बार तो मैंने देखा है कि एक मरीज की ऐसी हालत हो गई थी कि डाक्टर लोग खूब खबरा गये थे परन्तु ईश्वर की कृपा से वह मरीज बच गया। ऐसी कोई बात नहीं है कि जितनी भी ऐलोपैथी की दवाइयाँ हैं

उनके सेवन से सजी भण्डे हो जाते हैं। एन्टीबायोटिक्स जब नहीं निकले थे तब भी हमारे यहाँ लोग बीमार होते थे और आज भी होते हैं और तब भी भण्डे हो जाते थे और आज भी हो जाते हैं। एन्टीबायोटिक्स का असर आज यह होता है कि ऊपर से बर्ष तो बिछाई नहीं देता है और जब प्राप चरमा-मीटर लगाते हैं तो बुखार का पता भी नहीं चलता है। परन्तु शरीर के अन्दर बीमारी के जो कीटाणु रहते हैं और बिच रहता है उसको निकालने में एन्टीबायोटिक्स दवाइयों द्वारा भी उतना समय लग जाता है जितना कि और दवाइयों द्वारा इलाज करने पर। कई ऐसी घरेलू आयुर्वेदिक दवायें हैं जिनका कि उपयोग करने से उतना ही फायदा मिलता है जितना कि एन्टीपैथिक दवाइयों से।

आज सब से बड़ी समस्या हमारी यह हो रही है कि हमें देहातों में भेजने के लिये क्वालिफाइड डाक्टरों नहीं मिलते हैं। शहरों में ५,६ साल तक मेडिकल शिक्षा प्राप्त करने के बाद जब वह डाक्टर बन कर निकलते हैं तो वे शहरों की सहाय्यता और अन्य चीजों के इस क्रूर धावी हो चुकते हैं कि वे देहातों में जाकर काम नहीं करना चाहते। ऐसा कोई नियम प्रापके वहाँ है नहीं कि हर एक मेडिकल विद्यार्थी को ५,६ महीने या साल भर जाकर देहातों में काम करना पड़े और उसके बाद सफलता मिलने पर उसको डाक्टरी की डिग्री मिले। मैं समझती हूँ कि अगर कुछ इस तरह का विधान कर दिया जाय तो देहातों में डाक्टरों की कमी की जो गम्भीर समस्या है वह किसी हद तक हल हो सकती है।

मैं यह बात जाती अनुभव के तौर पर वहाँ पर कह रही हूँ कि हम कल्पना द्रष्ट की संरक्ष से राज में जो मेटरीकली अस्पष्ट

चला रहे हैं, वहाँ के लिये हमको क्यालिफ़ाइट केडी डाक्टर नहीं मिल रही है। ४००, ५०० रुपये प्रति मास तक हम बेतन देने को तैयार हैं और केडी डाक्टर के बास्ते मकान भी प्रबन्ध किया हुआ है लेकिन वहाँ के लिये हमें कोई बहन नहीं मिलती। कुछ भावी भी हैं तो ४ या ५ महीने रह कर फिर वाली जाती है और बिबस हो कर हमको यह तय करना पड़ा कि अगर उस प्रस्पताल के बास्ते कोई बहन डाक्टर नहीं मिली तो हमें उस जगह पर मर्दे डाक्टर रख कर काम चलाना पड़ेगा। कस्तूरबा ट्रस्ट की ओर से हम नर्सिङ तैयार करते थे और हमने अनुभव किया कि उनकी देहातों में भेजने में तकलीफ़ होती थी इतना ही नहीं प्रपियु वे देहातों में उतने अच्छे तरीके से काम भी नहीं कर सकती थीं क्योंकि जो सुविधा सहरों के प्रस्पतालों में मिलती है वह देहातों में नहीं मिल सकती। भोखिर हमने अपना कस्तूरबा ट्रस्ट के मातहत एक स्वतंत्र कस्तूरबा ग्राम इंदौर में जोला है जहाँ हम नर्सिङ तैयार कर रहे हैं, वहाँ से हम ४,६ महीने के लिये रास की प्रस्पतालों में भेजते हैं यह हमारी हासत है। इसके बारे में आपको सोचना चाहिये और कोई ऐसा उपाय करना चाहिये जिससे डाक्टर और नर्सिङ गांव में काम करने को मिल सकें और जो कि सहरों में मिलने वाली सुविधाओं की अपेक्षा कम सुविधा के वातावरण में गांव में काम करने को राजी हों।

अब मैं कुछ बातें सदन के सामने दिल्ली सहर की वास्तव रचना बाहरी हूं मैं समझती हूं कि सारे दिल्ली सहर के स्वास्थ्य और सफ़ाई की तमाम जिम्मेदारी भारत सरकार ने अपने ऊपर ले ली है। अब मैं दूर न जाकर यहीं सेनेटेरियट के बाहर जो पास के पास हैं उनकी तरफ़ आपका ध्यान ले जाना चाहती हूं। आप शाम को या दोपहर को जा कर देखिये कि वहाँ की कैसी प्रबस्था बन रही है। वह सास सरकारी कर्मचारियों के साथ

पीरियड में आराम करने के बास्ते हैं लेकिन इन पर वे कर्मचारी बैठते ही नहीं हैं बल्कि वहाँ पर कामच में जाना बंद रह जाते हैं और बैठ कर जाते हैं और जाना सा चुकने के बाद उन झूटे कागजों और दोनों इत्यादि को वहीं वास पर फेंक देते हैं। संतरों के मौसम में यह लोग संतरे झाकर छिन्नके इधर उधर फेंक देते हैं और आज कल तो ग्रामों का मौसम है आपकी वहाँ पर इधर उधर लाये गये ग्रामों के छिन्नके और गुठलियां मिलेगी और तमाम जगह गंदगी फैली रहती है। अब आप ही बतलाये कि जब हमारे ही कर्मचारी इस तरह की गंदगी फैलायेंगे तो शेष जगहों पर आप समझ सकते हैं कि कितनी अधिक गंदगी होती होगी। शाम को आपको सड़कों पर, पटरियों पर, साइकिलों पर लोमचे लगाये बहुत से लोग लड्डे मिल जायेंगे, ग्रामों की टोकरियां लिये पटरियों पर बैठे मिल जायेंगे और लोग वही उनसे ग्राम लेकर जाते हैं और छिन्नके फेंक देते हैं। इस तरह की गंदगी सहर में चारों ओर हम देखने को मिलती है।

टैक्सी स्टैंड्स का मतलब जहाँ तक मैं समझती हूं यह तो होता नहीं कि रात दिन लोग वहीं पर बैठे रहें, वहीं पर जाना बनायें और वहाँ पर जो कमेटी का मसल बना होता है उसी पर वे नहाते हैं और तमाम जगह को गंदा बना देते हैं। बम्बई में मैंने टैक्सी स्टैंड देखे हैं वहाँ ऐसी गंदगी नहीं रहती। पता नहीं दिल्ली के टैक्सी स्टैंड के लोग वहाँ पेशान करने जाते होंगे और कहीं पर पालाने जाते होंगे, मैं तो जब सुबह ब्रूनने जाती हूं तो टैक्सी स्टैंड पर उन लोगों को सोते पड़ा पाती हूं। टैक्सी स्टैंड कोई रहने की जगह नहीं है और इस ओर सरकार को ध्यान देना चाहिये।

इसके अतिरिक्त जो आपने पानी पीने के मसल बनाये हैं उनके गटर्स का रास्ता कचरे

[श्रीमनो मणिवेन पटेल]

से भर जाता है और उसके परिणामस्वरूप पानी बह कर सबक पर आता है। एक और प्रजीब बीज नई दिल्ली में देखने में आती है और वह यह है कि कचड़ा उठाने के लिये जो सबक पर ड्रम्स रखे हुए हैं, जब कचड़ा उठाने वाला आता है तो वह उसमें से कागज छिलका तो उठा ले जायगा लेकिन अगर उसको घास, पत्ती आदि का कूड़ा भी उठाने को कहो तो वह कहता है कि घास, पत्ती का कूड़ा उठाना हाटिकलचर वाले का काम है और अगर कोई पत्थर या सीमेंट आदि के टुकड़े पड़े हों और उसको उठाने को कहो तो वह कहेगा कि यह तो पब्लिक वर्क्स वालो का काम है और मेरा कहना है कि अगर इस तरह से सफाई का काम चलेगा तो दिल्ली शहर में सफाई नहीं हो सकती है। मैं चाहती हूँ कि मन्त्री महोदय इस ओर ध्यान दें और कोई ऐसी व्यवस्था करे ताकि बम्बई आदि शहरों की तरह जहाँ सुबह ८ बजे बिल्कुल सफाई हो जाती है वहाँ दिल्ली में भी सफाई का काम हो जाय करे।

यहाँ जो हर एक कोने और जगह जगह पर कहीं साइकिल बनाने वाला, और कहीं फल बेचने वाला तो कहीं कोई शस्त्र चार प्याले लेकर चाय बेचता है तो यह सब चीजें गन्दगी को फैलाने वाली हैं क्योंकि स्पष्ट है कि जब उनको अन्यत्र मुविधा प्राप्त नहीं है तो वे वही सब अपना काम करते हैं और गन्दगी फैलाते हैं और जो कि लो गो के स्वास्थ्य के लिये खतरनाक है।

शास्त्र में मुझे इबिन अस्पताल के बारे में कुछ कहना है जहाँ कोई मरीज को देखने को कभी कभी जाना होता है। अब चूँकि इबिन अस्पताल भी आप के नीचे आ गया है इसलिये आप मेहरबानी करके देखिये कि बिस्किगडम अस्पताल कैसा है और इबिन अस्पताल कैसा है दोनों को आप

कम्पेयर कीजिये और देखिये कि यहाँ कैसा है और वहाँ कैसा है। इबिन अस्पताल में मैंने देखा है कि बीच में पानी मरा रहता है, गन्दगी रहती है और प्रकाश की वहाँ पर कमी है, तो इन बातों पर आप विचार कीजिये और जो कमियाँ हैं उनको दूर करने का प्रयत्न कीजिये।

सभापति महोदय, आपने जो मुझे थोड़ा समय दिया उसमें जितना मैं कह सकी मैं न कह दिया हालाँकि मेरे पास कहने को अभी बहुत कुछ रह गया है। आपने जो मुझे बोलने का अवसर दिया उसके लिये मैं आपको धन्यवाद देती हूँ।

Shri Nanjappa (Nilgiris) Sir, I am very glad that the Speaker has repeatedly drawn the attention of the House to the inadequate time allotted for discussion of health problems. For Education, six hours were allotted; for Community development, five hours are allotted. I wonder why health is so badly neglected.

Health is divided into two departments, Medical and Public Health. In these days when in the government services so much talk about retrenchment, economy and austerity is heard, I wonder why there should be two departments, one for medical services and another for public health. Can this work not be done with one department for both medical services and public health? That would save a lot of money. One Director can manage both medical services and public health.

I shall take up the Medical department. Under this department, grants are made to the State Governments. First of all, take the T. B. clinics. A provision of Rs. 30 lakhs was made. In these days, these clinics are growing in importance. X-ray sets are installed and treatment is given. Nowadays, emphasis is laid on home treatment, and health visitors are appointed to visit patients in their homes. In T. B. early diagnosis is all

important. So, if there are more T. B. clinics in every district headquarters hospital, I think they will go a long way in eradicating T. B. So, the provision of Rs. 30 lakhs made is, in my opinion, very poor.

Secondly, provision is made with regard to pediatric centres, that is children's centres. These have also come to prominence these days. Children by themselves are not able to express their ailments and they suffer and hence diagnosis and treatment become difficult. So, children's wards and more clinics are opened. I think in every district headquarters hospital we must have these things, but in the Budget a provision of only Rs. 2 lakhs is made. I think this is very inadequate.

I now come to a subject which is under public health, that is school health and feeding. Last year they made some provision and because that was not utilised, they have made no provision this year. Everybody knows how important is the medical examination of school children. One should detect early their ailments and if they are attended to and cured, that will go a long way in helping them. So, the medical examination of school children is very essential and for that no provision is made in the Budget because last year's amount was not at all utilised.

Then I need not press the importance of feeding school children, that is providing the midday meal at least. A good meal in rural areas at noon will be quite welcome to those children.

In regard to cancer institutions, I am glad that a provision of Rs. 7 lakhs was made and that Government have come to know the importance of these institutions. I know in many of the district headquarters hospitals they used to point their fingers to the provincial hospitals because they were not able to cure or give any treatment for cancer. So, at least in every headquarters hospital they must have some provision for treatment of this deadly disease.

Then I come to a very important aspect, that is more medical colleges. A provision of Rs. 50 lakhs only is made under this head. In one of his statements in the Madras legislature, Shri A. B. Shetty, the then Health Minister of Madras said that starting one medical college will cost at least 50 lakhs. There is clamour for more medical colleges, and so the provision made is very poor.

Then I come to the upgrading of departments in medical colleges. I think some Rs. 6 lakhs were provided. There is so much need for specialists and teachers also. There are so many colleges where the real requirements of teachers are not provided. So, there is need for upgrading departments in medical colleges.

Another thing I would draw your attention to is regarding uniform qualifications in these medical courses. There are so many lesser qualifications in other States. Madras has abolished it long ago. Why should not the other States also follow the same process?

Finally I want to say that we have had so much of talk about influenza even on the floor of the House. We had one-hour discussion. I know the Pasteur Institute at Coonoor have prepared a vaccine, they have tried it and found it to be very effective. In the Budget only a provision of Rs. 13,000 is made. I think that is very inadequate. We are also told that we have a very severe form of epidemic yet to come. So, the provision made here is very poor. More provision should be made at least in view of the impending severe epidemic.

Shri Dasappa: Our unfortunate country may be proud of so many things, but not of health. That is one of the saddest features of our country. And all indications go to show that there has not been any marked improvement in the general health of the people of the country. I do not like to lay the blame for it at the doors of the hon. Minister or the Ministry because it depends upon various factors, particularly the



[Shri Dasappa]

amount of calories and vitamins that go into the diet of the ordinary man. Therefore, this is a very big question which should not be tackled in any isolated or perfunctory manner. The brain trust of the Ministry should now think of a much more comprehensive plan to see that the health of the people of this country improves.

Young as I am, or old as I am, I know there has been a perceptible deterioration in the health of the people of the villages. I do not reckon it by looking at the urban areas. I am referring to the rural areas where I have seen a very sturdy peasantry which it is difficult to see now. After all, a country's independence depends upon a sturdy peasantry, but unfortunately their health is going down. I would like the hon. Minister to tell us how he is going to tackle this rather deep, almost universal, problem.

I consider that even more than the curative aspect of his work, the hon. Minister must take up the preventive aspect which itself necessitates the provision of healthy diet for the people of the country. Even if you do not take much care of the older people, I think it is very necessary to make a start right from the school-going children or even right from the nursery stage of the children of the land. The grandiose expression is that the State must look after the citizens right from the cradle to the grave, or as they say now from the womb to the tomb which is a better thing because we must start taking care of the children even before they get to the cradle. So, that is a very problem. And I shall be very happy to know from the Minister that this aspect is borne well in his mind.

The most controversial thing that I have seen here is the Ministry being allergic to indigenous systems of medicine and virtual neglect of the indigenous systems of medicine. I do not think I should add very much more to the vehement case that have

been made out in favour of these systems. I can cite just one or two instances which are within my experience.

I know of a case where a boy who was hardly about nine or ten years old had an accident as a result of which he had developed a cataract in his eyes. Six months' treatment under one of the ablest ophthalmic physicians of the day gave him no relief. But it was given to a cousin of his to take him to a village, and within a month, he was cured by the use of a shrubby plant; about nine to ten inches length of that was cut at about four o'clock in the morning, and dewy drops from it were blown into the eyes. And within a month, he got cured completely. Why should we allow this wonder-cure to be forgotten, and why should no attempt be made on the part of the persons responsible, to see that these benefits are extended to others?

Then, I know the case of a boy who was about thirteen years old, but who was confined to bed with rheumatism. He could not get any cure at the hands of allopaths. But it was given to a Kerala physician for a paltry sum of Rs 2/- to provide two oils one to the body and the other to the head; and there was no question of drugging the boy at all. And the boy got cured completely.

Then, I know the case of a person who had some ear trouble. A lot of puss was coming out of his ears. He underwent treatment at the hands of allopaths for about four to five months. Finally, it was given to a village woman to apply a wee-bit of medicine twice on to the ears and the boy got cured.

Then, again, there was one who was suffering from rheumatoid arthritis. He was unable to get up from bed. But it was given to a Kerala physician to immediately rescue him from the acute stage. Later on, at the hands of that master physician, the Father of the Nation, Mahatma Gandhi, by fast-cure, he was able to

take away 42½ lbs. of his weight, and he got absolutely cured. As Babu himself claimed it, it was a rejuvenation process, which was set in motion as a result of fasting.

I can give so many instances like this, and let nobody suspect what I am saying. I have quoted cases not from outside this Chamber or this House, but very much inside. If evidence is required, there is Dr. Sushila Nayar just behind me, who can testify to the case.

**Shri V. P Nayar:** Not now

**Mr. Chairman:** She was behind the hon. Member

**Shri Karmarkar:** He continues to speak under that inspiration.

**Mr. Chairman:** She is behind him in spirit.

**Shri Dasappa:** I would like to say a word about the difference in approach between the Indian allopathic doctors and the foreign allopathic doctors towards indigenous systems of medicine. From my experience, I have found that the allopathic doctors coming from foreign countries are more eager to learn from our indigenous systems than our own Indian doctors. I am sorry I have got to say this but that is the experience that I have had I know one Dr. Hailley, a German Jew, who was in Mysore, who was in close touch with the Ayurvedic Hospital across the road, whereas none of the Indian doctors was as eager as the foreign doctor to know about the indigenous system.

After all, we know that many of the drugs that have come back to India as patents are those which were manufactured from out of the pharmacopoeia of our country. The Germans took our Sanskrit books, made a thorough study of them, carried out researches on them, and the result is that they form the best drugs now.

So, what I would urge is that there should be no kind of antipathy bet-

ween the various systems. I am not saying in the slightest that allopathy has no place; it is absolutely foolish on my part, if I were to say that. On the side of surgery, of course, there is nothing to match the allopathic system. But on the side of medicine, I think there is a great deal to be taken from out of the indigenous systems. It is, therefore, that I make a very passionate plea that we should give every encouragement to the indigenous system. How that is to be done is a thing for the Minister to decide.

It may be that his Ministry was a little allergic to indigenous system, but I hope he is not. But I may caution him that he will have to contend against very strong forces, before he can overcome the Humalayan prejudice that has grown against indigenous systems. I hope, however, that the Minister, with his broad shoulders, will be able to tackle these problems very successfully, so that when he comes before the House next year, he will be able to render a more encouraging account of the work of his Ministry.

I must now race fast with a few of the other points. I was referring so far to the preventive aspect of our health problems. People have spoken about slum clearance and so on. But what is the position of our villages today? Each one of our villages, except the ones that are looked after very well in certain States, is a slum or even worse than a slum. There is nothing like drainage, there is nothing like drinking-water facilities and so on. I have not yet seen any comprehensive programme or scheme which the Ministry has evolved in order to tackle the problem of sanitation, rural water supply and so on in these five lakhs of villages. Unless we provide healthy surroundings, how can we expect the health of the nation to improve? That is absolutely impossible. So, I plead for a more comprehensive approach to this problem of rural sanitation.

[Shri Dasappa]

In regard to the manufacture of drugs, I would say that I agree with many of the hon. Members who have spoken earlier and said that crores of rupees are being drained out of our country. On drugs and medicines only, not including surgical apparatus, we had spent a sum of about Rs. 7 crores, in 1949-50; in 1950-51, it was Rs. 10 crores, and in 1951-52, it was Rs. 15 crores. As to what it is today, I have not been able to get at the latest figures, and, only the Minister will be able to say. We have had various committees and commissions to go into this matter, and their reports are also available before us. For instance, there is the report of the Pharmaceutical Enquiry Committee of 1954; then we have the report of the separate panel of the Planning Commission on this matter in 1956. All these reports are there, but I wonder, to what purpose. I would, therefore, request the Minister to implement those recommendations a little more vigorously than before.

I must agree with regard to the steps to be taken for family planning. I am one of the foremost believers in family planning, and unless that is done now, it does not matter how much production we make, it cannot keep pace with reproduction. So, it is very necessary that we must resort to family planning on a more universal scale.

As regards nursing, I would very much like the non-official agencies like the one which the hon. lady Member who preceded me said, namely the Kasturba Trust, and so on, being given the fullest encouragement and help. If Government were to step in, the trouble will arise about fair wages, minimum wages, and strikes and so on.

I will be surprised if nurses also begin to strike. What will happen to the country if they do so? Therefore, it is far better to encourage non-official agencies as far as possible. They can manage it on much smaller scale of salaries than an official

agency. So I would plead with the Minister that non-official agencies should be encouraged as much as possible.

Mr. Chairman: Dr. Samant Sinhar. There are two or three more hon. Members to speak and then the hon. Minister has to reply. So I would request hon. Members to reduce their time to even less than 10 minutes.

Shri Karmarkar: The Minister was supposed to start at 1:45 P.M. and was to conclude by 2:15 P.M. Of course, I am not anxious to take very much time, but if the House wants to have a reply to all the points raised, I must have time.

Mr. Chairman: The Speaker announced the list.

Shri Karmarkar: The Speaker also announced when I should reply. Of course, I am not peevish about the time, but certainly to do just honour to all the points raised and in fairness to hon. Members, I must have time to reply.

Shri V. P. Nayar: He can reply in five minutes.

An Hon. Member: We must listen to the Minister also.

Dr. Samantsinhar (Bhubaneswar): First I must congratulate the Health Ministry on the steps they have taken to eradicate the malaria menace in our country. I come from a constituency which, about ten years ago, was full of malaria. People in that constituency were suffering so much from malaria that they were unable to perform their daily duties. When malaria begins to visit a certain family man, it soon spreads to others in the family and also to other families and there would be none to serve the patients.

I am also a private medical practitioner and during the last 8 years, I find that in that area the incidence of malaria has been reduced, and even doctors in that area are now handicapped in their profession because malaria was the source of every

disease in that part of the country. So I must congratulate the Ministry on their taking practical steps to eradicate the disease which was prevailing in a virulent form there.

But the Ministry should see one thing. After the eradication of malaria, bed bugs trouble has become too much in places where DDT has been sprayed. Of course, I do not know whether DDT has any effect on these bed bugs, but I know there are villages where people cannot sleep in the night due to bed bugs, and they think that due to the spraying of DDT the bed bugs have increased. So there must be some investigation to know the actual cause of this trouble.

My constituency is full of filaria and leprosy. I come from Bhubaneswar in Orissa. You know that the people of Orissa are poor. About 1 per cent of the population are suffering from leprosy and yet no steps have been taken to eradicate the disease. Leprosy is not a disease as such, but it is caused more or less by deficiency of vitamins. We know that due to want of proper balanced food, people suffer from this disease. So unless proper diet is supplied and nutritional standards are raised, the disease cannot be fully eradicated.

Next to that, there is filaria. Nothing has yet been done to combat this disease. I hope Government would look into the matter and take steps to eradicate this disease also.

Next to food, the most important thing is water. I know that in villages there is no water to drink. All our plans are very big and we say so many things, but the actual benefits do not reach the people. If people cannot get even a drop of drinking water, what is the good of all our plans? The people do not understand it. If the people should think that they are under a democratic form of government and their country is now independent, they should at least get drinking water facilities in their places. Otherwise, our independence won't be of any help to them.

श्री वास्तवीक (बुलन्दशहर-रमित-ग्रनु-  
सूचित जातियाँ) : सभापति जी,  
मैं आप को धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ कि  
आपने मुझे बोलने का समय दिया।

उपस्थापिते धनमीवा धयवमा, धस्मान्यं सन्तु  
पृथिवी प्रसूता :

दीक्षे न धायुः प्रतिबुध्यमाना, वयं तुम्यं बलि-  
हृतः स्वाम् ।

प्राचीन भारत में, जहाँ रोग नहीं था, सुख और  
वैभव था, धर्मवेद के पृथिवी सूक्त के इस मंत्र  
में एक ऊंचा भावना प्रदर्शित की गई है :—  
हे पृथिवी, तेरी गोद में फलती फूलती तेरी सन्तानें  
नरिणि तथा भक्षय हों, हमारी धायु दीर्घ हों।  
मैं भारत सरकार को इस बात के लिये धन्यवाद  
देना चाहता हूँ कि उसके प्रयत्नों से इस देश में  
नीरोगता की दिशा में कदम रखा है।

इस सम्बन्ध में मुझे एक बात नाराजगी  
की कहनी है। यहाँ पर कहा गया कि डाक्टर,  
हकीम और वैद्य इस विषय पर बोलेंगे, लेकिन  
सभी लोगों के स्वास्थ्य के लिये जो इंसान  
अपनी तनदरस्ती को गंवाता है—जोकि  
मंगी कहलाता है—और जिस का काम किसी  
डाक्टर, हकीम या वैद्य से कभी कम नहीं है,  
उसकी जो धवहेलना की गई है, उस की  
दशा की ओर मैं इस सदन का ध्यान खीचना  
चाहता हूँ। इस सम्बन्ध में मैंने ७३८ और  
७३९ दो कट-मोशन रखी हैं। कट-मोशन  
७३८ इस प्रकार है—

That the demand under the head  
Ministry of Health be reduced by  
Rs. 100 (Situation arisen after the  
hunger-strike of the municipal work-  
ers—sweepers—of New Delhi Muni-  
cipal Committee.)

दूसरी कट मोशन भी इसी सिलसिले में  
है।

यह ठीक है कि कुछ रोगों में कमी हो गई  
है, लेकिन कई नए नए रोग भी फैल रहे हैं।

### [श्री बाल्मीकी]

एक तरफ कहा जाता है कि मलेरिया कम हो रहा है, लेकिन दूसरी तरफ जाडिस, इन्फ्लुएन्जा और गैस्ट्रो-एन्टेरिस (जो कि प्रांतों की एक बीमारी है) जैसी अजीब अजीब बीमारियां देखने में आ रही हैं। बीमारियां एक तरफ दब रही हैं और दूसरी तरफ बढ़ रही हैं। इनको रोकने के लिये विशेष कदम उठाने की आवश्यकता है।

प्राज स्थिति यह है कि शुद्ध वायु नहीं मिलती है, शुद्ध जल नहीं मिलता है और शुद्ध भोजन नहीं मिलता है। सब और मिलावट है। जिन्दगी में मिलावट है। दिमागों में मिलावट है, भाषा और विचारों में मिलावट है, जात-पात की मिलावट है, खाने और दूध में मिलावट है। इस तरह के अजीब वातावरण में किस तरह इंसान की जिन्दगी चले, यह देखने की बात है। फिर भी प्रयत्न करने की जरूरत है। बल लगा कर इस मिलावट को रोकने की आवश्यकता है।

अब मे स्वीपर्ज और स्कैवेजर्स की हालत के विषय में कुछ कहना चाहता हूँ। मिसेज रुजवेल्ट ने एक किताब लिखी थी, जिस में उन्होंने कहा था केवल नर्द दिवनों के बारे में जहा झाड़ू की मूठ की बनिस्वत आदमी सन्ते है। यह में समझता हूँ कि आप को मूठ का पता न होगा, क्यो कि आप का झाड़ू से कभी वास्ता नहीं पडा है, हालांकि जर्मनों के कवि गंटे ने झाड़ू को दुलहिन के हाथ का खिलीना बताया था, लेकिन वह तो सोलह आने भगन के हाथ से चिपटी है, और किसी का उसमे सम्बन्ध नहीं है। इतना आवश्यक समाजो-पयोग का काम करके अजरम दख जात है और वह लोग भी जो इस कार्य में लगे है न चे सम्भके जात है। आने उम काम का उनक इच्छा क विरुद्ध जिन्दगी भर क लिए उन पर लाड शिा है और वे इस पर रड है। अगर उनक हालत क मधुरता में आपका कसब्य होना चाहिये।

प्राज आप जोर जोर से कहते हैं कि हमारा मुल्क तरफकी कर रहा है, प्राज आप कहते हैं कि हम लोगों को ऊंचा उठा रहे हैं और इसके बारे में बड़ा शोर मचाते हैं। लेकिन अगर अंगियों की जो हालत है, वे जहां पर रहते हैं उन बस्तियों की जो हालत है, उसको दुनिया वालों को दिखा दिया जाए तो आप रो पड़ेंगे और जो पत्थर हैं वे भी उनकी हालत को देखकर घ्रासू बहाये बगैर नहीं रहेंगे। प्राज भी इतनी गली सड़ी और गिलाजत से भरी जिन्दगी बसर कर रहे हैं जिसका कोई ठिकाना नहीं है।

आपने जो प्रॉप्रेस रिपोर्टें हमें दी है उसके पेज ५५ पर आप ने एक सर्वे का चित्र किया है जिसका हैडिंग है Health Survey among Sweepers and Scavengers

इसके अन्दर कहा गया है कि हैल्थ मिनिस्टर न जो वादा किया था उसके मुताबिक ही इस सर्वे को हाथ में लिया गया है: इसके अन्दर कलकत्ता, हावडा और बहानगर का जिक्र किया गया है। बडानगर तो में नहीं गया हूँ मूकिन हावडा तथा कलकत्ता में अवश्य गया हूँ और वहा की गदी वरिस्तयो को मेने अपनी आखों में देखा है। अगर प्राज ही जा कर वहा की गन्दी बस्तियों की हालत को देखे तो आप यह कर् बगैर नहीं रहेंगे कि टम सर्वे में जो नजीके निकामू गय है वे पिल्कुल गलत है। आपका मालूम हो जायेगा कि वे पीने पडे हुए हैं और तरह तरह की बिमारियों से पीडित है, खाने का नही मिन रहा है और बहुत ही बुरी जिन्दगी बिना रहे हैं।

अब मवान यह पैदा होत है। इस सब को दूर करने का भार किम पर है। इस सब का भार आपने राज्यों पर डाला हुआ है। जिन हानात में वे लोग रहते हैं जो तकलीफें उनकी हैं, उनको देखना और उनकी कठिनाईयो को दूर करना, में समझता हूँ, आपका फर्ज है, और आप ही जिम्मेदार है।

आज उनकी उपेक्षा की जा रही है उनकी ओर कोई ध्यान नहीं दिया जा रहा है।

सब से अफसोसनाक जो बात है वह यह है कि नई दिल्ली म्यूनिसिपैलिटी के कर्मचारी २२ जुलाई से भूख हड़ताल पर हैं लेकिन उनकी मांगों पर कोई ध्यान नहीं दिया जा रहा है। इन मांगों की ओर मे बाद में आता हूँ। लेकिन यहाँ पर मैं इतना अवश्य कहना चाहता हूँ कि नई दिल्ली की म्यूनिसिपल कमेटी जो कि भारत सरकार की नाक के नीचे है, जिसकी हालत भारत सरकार से छिपी हुई नहीं है, यदि उसके कर्मचारियों का यह हाल है तो बाकी की म्यूनिसिपैलिटियों का क्या होता होगा, इनका भ्रष्टाचार आप लगा सकते हैं। मैं यह कहे बगैर नहीं रह सकता कि इस मुल्क की म्यूनिसिपैलिटिया गदगी का डेर हैं। एक जस्टिस ने भी अपने फंसले में लिखा था कि नई दिल्ली म्यूनिसिपल कमेटी एक कूड़े का डोल है। नई दिल्ली की म्यूनिसिपल कमेटी द्वारा लगातार पिछले तीन सालों से मेहतगों के साथ अन्याय किया जा रहा है, उनकी मांगों पर कोई ध्यान नहीं दिया जा रहा है, उनके साथ जुल्म किया जा रहा है, उनकी बिल्कुल उपेक्षा

इन लोगों की मांगों के बारे में मैं दो चार बातें कहना चाहता हूँ। मैं मानता हूँ कि आज कल के जमाने में भूख हड़ताल की कोई भी व्यक्ति आपको धमकी दे सकता है, कोई भी भ्रष्टाचारी आपको आँखें दिखा सकता है, आपको डरा धमका सकता है। मगर मैं प्रधान मंत्री जी तथा स्वास्थ्य मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि वे कौन सी बजूहात हैं जिन के कारण मेहतर भूख हड़ताल करने पर धामादा हुए हैं या मजबूर हुए हैं। उनकी जो मुश्कलात हैं, उनकी जो मांगें हैं उन पर आपको सहायभूतिपूर्वक विचार करना चाहिए। आज सारे हिन्दुस्तान की म्यूनिसिपल कमेटिया गन्दगी, गिलाबूत, दुराचार, अत्याचार, भ्रष्टाचार, पापाचार, तथा धनाचार की गड़ है, और जो नई दिल्ली की म्यूनिसिपल कमेटी

है वह उसकी एक जंतु जागती, निमान हमारे सामने मौज है। यहाँ क मेहत जा हड़ताल पर है, उनके साथ जिस तरह न सलूक किया जा रहा है, उनकी मांगों की जिस प्रकार उपेक्षा की जा रही है, उसका बार में मैं दो एक बातें आपके सामने रखना चाहता हूँ और चाहता हूँ कि प्राय मुझे याद या मगर आर है। मैंने देखा है कि जब भा मंगियों की कोई बात की जाती है तो उनका पक्ष को उपस्थित करने का कांशिक क जाता है तो कह जाता है कि मनय का कर्म है और बोलने नहीं दिया जाता है।

मैं पूछना चाहता हूँ कि कौन सा कारण है जिनसे मजबूर होकर मंगियों ने भूख हड़ताल की है। क्या कारण है कि उनकी ओर से बड़े बड़े इस्तहार निकाले गये हैं और भूख हड़ताल करने के नोटिस दिये गये हैं। हैलथ मिनिस्टर जब राजकुमारी जी थी तब मामूली मे मामूली भ्रष्टाचारी तक को मिलने की इजाजत नहीं थी। आज भी यह हालत है कि हैलथ मिनिस्टर के अफसरान मामूली गरीब भ्रष्टाचारी को जो कि दबाये जाते हैं, जिन पर कि जुल्म किया जाता है, हैलथ मिनिस्टर साहब से मिलने नहीं देते हैं। मुगल सम्राट जहांगीर के जमाने में घटा लटका रहता था और कोई गरीब या गधा भी जाकर उसको बजा कर इसाफ पा सकता था। लेकिन आज न घटा है, न घटी है और न टुनटुनी है (हंसी)। यह हसने की बात नहीं है, जो मैं कह रहा हूँ, सब कह रहा हूँ। आज जिस गन्दगी के अन्दर हरिजन रह रहे हैं उसको मैं बयान नहीं कर सकता। इस सब के आधार पर यह नतीजा निकाला गया है कि स्केबेंजर्स तथा स्वीपर्स में फगस की साल की बीमारी ज्यादा थी और टी० बी० इतनी ज्यादा नहीं थी। यहाँ नई दिल्ली म्यूनिसिपल कमेटी के अन्दर प्रतिशत लोग टी० बी० के मरीज हैं और इन लोगों के साथ गलत यह किया जाता है कि इनको दो मिनट के अन्दर निकाल बाहर कर दिया जाता है। इनसे तीन तीन और छः छः सौ रुपया रिखत ली जाती है।

[श्री: बालनीकी]

अब मैं मेहतरों की जो मांगें हैं, उनकी तरफ आता हूँ। उनकी पहली मांग तो यह है कि उनको भारत सरकार के ग्रन्थ कर्मचारियों की तरह से मैडिकल की सब सुव्यवस्था दी जायें। दूसरी मांग उनकी यह है कि उनको रिटायर होने पर प्रोव्यूटी दी जायें। तीसरी मांग उनकी यह है कि प्राविडेंट फंड छः प्रतिशत के बजाय दस प्रतिशत काटा जाय। चौथी मांग उनकी क्वार्टर, बिजली पानी सहित भुक्त दिये जाने की है। आज उनके मकानों की यह हालत है कि वे इतने सड़े हुये हैं, इतने गन्दे हैं कि कुछ ठिकाना नहीं। वे टूटे हुये हैं। आज हालत यह है कि उनके नलों पर टूटियाँ नहीं हैं और टट्टियों में जजीरें नहीं हैं। हजारों रुपये का सालाना एस्टीमेट मरम्मत के लिये बनाया जाता है लेकिन यह रुपया किसी और के ही पेट में चला जाता है और कोई पूछने वाला नहीं है। इस प्रकार का भ्रष्टाचार चल रहा है और इस प्रकार का भ्रष्टाचार, इस प्रकार का ग्रन्थाय मामूली लोगों के साथ, गिरे हुये लोगों के साथ, पिछड़े हुये लोगों के साथ हो रहा है। उनकी एक डिमांड यह है कि उनके पे स्केल रियाइज किये जायें। यह कहा गया था कि जिस का पांच साल से अधिक का तजुर्बा होगा उसमें से लोगों को जमादार या सैनिटरी सुपरवाइजर बनाया जायेगा और उनको इन अपनों पर काम करने का मौका दिया जायेगा। इसको टाला जा रहा है और यह बात दस महीने से चली आ रही है लेकिन कोई एक्शन नहीं लिया जा रहा है। यह बात उन पर लागू होती है जो प्राफेशनल मेहतर हैं या उन पर लागू होती है जिन के पास हाई स्कूल सर्टिफिकेट या डिप्लोमा हो। उनकी अगली डिमांड यह है कि मजदूरों का एक नुमाइंदा कमेटी में लिया जायें। समस्त बस्तियों में लेबर बैलकेयर सेंटर खोले जायें, इत्यादि इत्यादि। ये जो उनकी मांगें हैं ये चायज मांगें हैं। अगर ताज्जुब की बात यह है कि लोगों को बिना कारण सर्वेड किया जाता है और क्यों सर्वेड किया जाता है, इसविषे किया

जाता है कि वे जल्म सहने से इन्कार करते हैं या दस दस घंटे काम करने के खिलाफ आवाज उठाते हैं। आज उनसे दस दस घंटे काम कराया जाता है, उनके दूसरे साधियों की जगह पर उनको अपने काम के अलावा काम करने के लिये मजबूर किया जाता है। सुबह ६ से ९ बजे तक वे अपना काम करते हैं और उसके बाद उन्हें कहीं और काम करने के लिये भेज दिया जाता है। अगर वे इसकी शिकायत करते हैं तो उनको सस्पेंड कर दिया जाता है, तग किया जाता है। खुशकिस्मती की बात यह है कि यहाँ पर एक रिफूटमेंट बोर्ड है। उससे रिपवत तो कम हुई है लेकिन मैं यह कहे बगैर नहीं रह सकता कि रिपवत दूसरे दायरों में फैल गई है। जो सैनिटरी इंस्पेक्टर होता है वह उसको इधर से उधर और उधर से इधर दौड़ाता है और जब वह तंग आ जाता है तो मजबूर होकर अपने आप उसको रुखा दे देता है। ऐसी हालतों में जब मजदूर हड़ताल करते हैं तो मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि किस और उनकी हमदर्दी होगी। मैं प्रार्थना करता हूँ कि आप शांतिमय वातावरण में बैठकर किसी तरह से मजदूरों की जो मांगें हैं उन पर गौर करें और उनके नुमाइंदों के साथ बान्धित करे। मैं अधिकारियों से भी कहूँगा कि वे उनकी बात को सुनें और जो जल्म उन पर हो रहे हैं उनको न हों दे।

आज भगिरी की हालत अच्छी नहीं है और उनकी हालत को सुधारना आपका फर्ज है। आप बाकी राज्यों को तो छोड़ दें, लेकिन जो सैट्टनी एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन एरियाज है उनकी तो जिम्मेदारी आपको अपने ऊपर लेनी चाहिये।

नई दिल्ली म्यूनिसिपल कमेटी, कुनबा परवरी तथा भ्रष्टाचार का झुंडा है। उसकी हालत अच्छी नहीं हो सकती है जब तक कि वह इन्फिंट बॉडी नहो हो जाती। वहाँ पर अब भी राजे महाराजे बैठे हुये हैं, बड़े बड़े दिन

के विभाग वाले बैठे हुए हैं। वहाँ के जो प्रेजी-डेंट हैं वे एक प्रजीब विभाग के ही प्रादमी हैं। वे एक एगोरोक्रेटिक विभाग,—एगोरोक्रेटिक इंटेलिटी वाले प्रादमी हैं। मैं चाहता हूँ कि जो नया नक्शा बनने वाला है उसके प्रन्दर उसको भी शामिल कर लिया जाए। मेरा मतलब कारपोरेशन से है।

मैं प्रन्त में यही कहना चाहता हूँ कि नंत्री महोदय से जो कुछ मैंने कहा है उस पर विचार करेंगे और मेहतारों की हालत सुधारने के साथ साथ भूखहड़तालियों के साथ हमदर्दी का इजि हार भी करेंगे। और नई दिल्ली म्यूनिसिपल कमेटो के अधिकारियों पर जोर देने कि, उनकी मांगों को मान लें।

**Mr. Chairman:** The Minister.

**Shri Tangamani:** May I request the hon. Minister to refer to the points raised in the cut motions?

**Shri Karmarkar:** I shall deal with them.

**Shri Tangamani:** Also Siddha Vaidya prevalent in Madras.

**Shri Karmarkar:** I shall deal with all the points raised by the hon. Members subject of course to the limitation of time.

**Shri Sonavane (Sholapur—Reserved—Sch. Castes):** Sir, on a point of information, between 1 and 2:30 the hon. Members are expected to have their lunch. The reply from the hon. Minister during that period would not be proper. He may reply after 2:30.

**Mr. Chairman:** A time-limit was fixed and it has been extended to three hours. We have already passed that three hours. So, the hon. Minister should reply. We must have the benefit of the Government's point of view from the hon. Minister in reply to the various points raised.

14 hrs.

**Shri Sonavane:** The convention is that no important business is to be transacted during this period and,

therefore, the reply of the Minister should be given only after 2:30 as I consider the reply of the Minister as important.

**Shri V. P. Nayar:** Those who want to hear the Minister should be here sacrificing their lunch.

**Mr. Chairman:** The only point is about quorum. There is no restriction anywhere about a Minister giving his reply during this hour.

**Shri Karmarkar:** In any case, the hon. Member has no case because he is present here and has not gone for lunch.

**Shri Sonavane:** I am not very keen.

**Shri Karmarkar:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, I must confess to a sense of difficulty in trying to do justice to the points raised by hon. Members in this house. All of them are, I should say, important, but in view of the time available to me I should just like to invite the attention of the House to the more important points and skip over those that are relatively less important.

Now, to take the last point, I find that the hon. Member who made such a fervent plea for the bhngis just now is not there to listen to my answer to his point. He must have rather exerted himself on that performance, and must have gone out to have a little coffee or something like that.

**Shri Sonavane:** That is why I said that the Hon'ble the Minister should answer after 2-30.

**Shri Karmarkar:** Lest the House misunderstands the position, I should like to inform the House about the point raised by my esteemed friend, Shri Balmiki. I find from the information that I have that he was himself present at the meeting of the New Delhi Municipal Committee at which these points were discussed in detail.

**An hon. Member:** Shri Balmiki has come back to the House.



**Shri Karmarkar:** I am very happy that after what I have said, he has returned to the House. I was just trying to meet my friend Shri Balmiki's point, because he was rather passionate about it, and I was telling the House that I find from the proceedings that are before me of the New Delhi Municipal Committee, that Shri Balmiki himself was present along with four or five others on behalf of the sweepers. When these points were discussed on the 18th July, 15 of the points were conceded in the sense of their being considered or conceded straightaway. The Committee was not able to accept two points, and some one or two points were forwarded to relevant authorities for consideration. I am not able to go into these points. Ultimately, we, so far as this Ministry is concerned, come in a general way with regard to local bodies by way of co-ordination, very very generally, much less than in the case of health, in the co-ordination of their activities and, therefore, I regret my inability to go into the merits of the question.

I am sorry that even after Shri Balmiki represented the case of the sweepers so ably at the meeting of the 18th, at a later meeting right when the meeting was going on, the hunger strikers began their strike. I cannot go into that question at all, the authorities concerned will be able to look after that.

**Shri B. K. Galkwad (Nasik):** What was the decision taken at the meeting?

**Shri Karmarkar:** It will take another ten minutes to explain, and ten minutes is half the time allotted to me. I assure my hon. friend that I will go through these five or six pages with him immediately after I finish my reply.

**Shri B. K. Galkwad:** I want to know the decision which the Municipality has taken in regard to the hunger strikers.

**Shri Karmarkar:** I do not know that decision because, ultimately, the people who have gone on hunger strike, have to take their decision regarding the hunger strike.

**Mr. Chairman:** I think the nation would be more interested in the Minister's answer to the general points raised in the debate for which there must be an effective answer from the Government.

**Shri Karmarkar:** Thank you very much, Sir, for this guidance.

After the points which I thought it was necessary to touch upon in view of the vehemence of the hon. Member's speech, I shall now pass on to some of the important points. I am happy that a reference has been made to the malaria control programme. I am also happy to find that there has been a sense of appreciation of what has been achieved. In fact, the House will be interested to know that, ultimately, in such matters statistics are by and large true; one cannot go to every case of suffering from malaria.

We find, for instance, after this programme came into existence the annual incidence which was about 60·7 million in 1953-54 came down to 41·2 million in 1954-55, to 19·3 million in 1955-56, and I presume that the programme has progressed further. There has been an all round report of progress in this direction.

There have been a few complaints also that D.D.T. has been less effective, that inspite of D.D.T. spraying in some places malaria mosquitoes are still to be had. Now, there is a scientific possibility of mosquitoes growing immune to D.D.T. or any other material that might be used, and it is with that apprehension that we are thinking of what is known as Malaria Eradication Programme. But there are no frightening symptoms at the present moment. The work has been going on and the progress that is being achieved is also being maintained.

With regard to that programme, what has been contemplated is about 200 units of operation operating in the whole of the area where malaria is very largely prevalent. Out of the 200 units that have been allotted till the end of the period of 1956-57 including the units already allotted, the actual functioning units are to the tune of 165 75.

The malaria programme is one of the programmes, thanks to the co-operation of the people also, which is claimed to have had a good deal of success. Our examination also has shown that a sample area was taken for spleen examinations. In that area fight against malaria was going on even previously to our taking up the intensified national programme. The programme that was going on was from 1946. It is a happy feature to know that as against the spleen rate of 72.2 in 1946 it came down to 3.7 in 1950, 0.9 in 1951, 0.3 in 1952, 0.2 in 1953, and during the years of 1954 and 1955 the examinations show that the spleen rate was zero per thousand. This has been in the North Kanara District which was taken for a sample examination. Another area chosen was in Shimoga District, and to make a long story short, there again the spleen rate was found to be infinitesimally small.

This shows that this malaria control programme has been a fairly good success. We are hoping that the States will take up the programme as vigorously as before. We are also hoping that it may be possible, with the assistance that has been coming from various organisations, like the TCM and UNICEF, for us to take up what may be known as the Malaria Eradication Programme, eradication not to an ideal extent but to an extent that is possible, that is to say, go on exterminating the possibilities of malaria to the largest extent possible and thus try to exterminate the disease or the possibilities of that altogether.

Something was said about filaria, which, though in its incidence is only to a more limited area, is a very

dreadful disease in its effect. Some time back it was estimated on a rough scale that about 25 million people are those who might be exposed. We have had a scheme for that. Out of 42 units that have been allotted to the various States, 35 are included in the provision. The budget provision made is for Rs 103 14 lakhs.

Something has been said of different areas. I must deny myself the pleasure of referring to various areas. For instance, Kerala is one of the areas where the people suffer from intensive filaria. I am quite sure in my mind that so far as finances permit, whether it is Kerala or any other area, as regards the malaria or filaria or any such general programme that we have taken up in our hands, we shall be very happy to do all that we can to co-operate with the States in combating the various diseases.

I would just touch on the programmes about tuberculosis. We have given in great details in the report what we have been doing with regard to tuberculosis. This is also an enemy that has to be fought vigorously. On a rough estimate, about 5,00,000 people must be dying every year by T.B. In the ideal state of things, if we are to cure all of them, we must require 4,000 clinics, 5,00,000 beds, 15,000 doctors, 50,000 nurses and 10,000 other health workers. Figures like that obviously look impossible of achievement, looking to our resources. Of course, we have been trying to meet the situation as best as we can. I will content myself with a few figures. For instance, regarding the number of hospitals and the like, as against 124 hospitals in 1955, we had by the end of December, 1956, 135 hospitals; as against 166 clinics in 1955, we had 185 clinics by the end of 1956, as against 140 wards, we had 150 wards, as against 16,827 beds in 1955, we had by the end of 1956, 22,300 beds. Now I shall not enter into details about the programmes, but it is our intention to establish a T.B. clinic in almost every district and also help private institu-

[Shri Karmarkar]

tions which have engaged themselves in this work

Something was said about leprosy also. That is another large problem we have to face. I will just content myself with saying that the programme has been briefly explained in the report and that we shall be very happy to take any possible steps that can be taken. In fact, it is found more feasible to treat a case of T.B. But with regard to leprosy, experiments are being carried on, we have to go slow because the drug that is being used is also being used on a partly experimental basis and unless we are sure of our mind, it is no use hurrying forward.

Something was said about medical education. Government are aware of the shortage in the number of institutions. For instance, as against 30 colleges in 1950-51, we have at the present time 44 colleges. As against 2,500 students admitted previously, we are now admitting about 3,500 students, but still the existing number of colleges are not able to satisfy the requirements of the country. We are told that as against 70,000 doctors that we have, at present, even with the proposed addition of 12,500 doctors in the second Five Year Plan, we shall still be short of the required personnel of 90,000 doctors. We have tried to utilise the amount placed at our disposal by the Planning during the second Five Year Plan period and we have been able to help new proposed colleges in Bhopal, Kanpur, Calicut, Ranchi, Jamnagar, Jubbulpore and Hubli, in addition to the college that has been strengthened in Pondicherry. I will not repeat what has been mentioned in the report, but under this head, I am sorry to tell the House that we have been enormously handicapped by way of fund. In fact, there have been a few demands from some of the States for starting new colleges and we will only be too happy to help them if finances are available.

It will not be necessary for me to dwell at length on the points raised

regarding the auxiliary health workers and the auxiliary nurse-midwives. I come to the water-supply scheme for which, to my regret and to the regret of my Ministry, it has not been found possible to make the full provision this year. In fact, for this year, we had asked for a budget allotment of Rs. 15 crores and we had hoped to get about Rs. 10 crores, but we have got only Rs. 5 crores. The country has been passing through a period of strain and I am quite sure what has been said in the House will be helpful to the cause of water-supply. I am not quite despairing, I am quite sure that my esteemed colleague, the Finance Minister, will be able to help us more than what he has been able to do till now owing to the stringency of finance. In any case, I agree entirely with the view expressed in the House that water-supply schemes for supplying the needs must receive fairly a high amount of priority. I do hope that it may be possible for the Finance Minister to help us with a little more money.

Shri C. K. Nair (Outer Delhi): Is Delhi included in this?

Shri Karmarkar: Delhi will be provided for. I think the provision made is to the tune of Rs. 1 crore; they are asking for Rs. 2 crores and my hon. friend knows as much or even a little more than I do about it. In any case, the case of Delhi is receiving the attention that is due to it.

Shri Thirumala Rao (Kakinada): Delhi stands on a different footing.

Shri Karmarkar: I should not like either to agree or to disagree.

Another important subject is this. I am sorry I am not able to do justice to that subject, it is very important. Hon. Members of this House know that for sometime past, we have found it possible to help institutions of indigenous medicine, whether ayurveda, unani, homoeopathy or nature cure; lest I should forget the *siddha* type of medicine, of which my hon. friend here was very proud, I may say that

we have circularised all the State Governments to send their proposals regarding assistance to various types of indigenous medical institutions and if the Kerala Government would send us.....

**Shri V. P. Nayar:** Madras Government.

**Shri Karmarkar:** I thought it was from Kerala. Anyhow, it does not matter to us from what State it comes. If the Madras Government supports that scheme for helping any institution carrying on either research work or practice work in the *sidha* type of medicine, we shall be very happy to encourage them

This is a question which has arisen on the floor of the House and it is bound to arise in future also. Instead of giving the figures as to the amount of aid we have been able to give in the past or we propose to do in future—the figures are found in the proceedings of the House and in the report—I should just like to dwell for a brief moment on the policy of Government in this matter, because what we shall be able to do depends on the resources that are available to us, but in what direction we shall proceed depends upon the policy which we have to pursue. For historical reasons, allopathy has commanded the pride of place till now. On account of historical reasons also, possibly on account of want of State patronage, possibly on account of the fact that people have taken to the new system of allopathy, possibly on account of all these reasons put together, the ayurvedic and the other systems of indigenous medicines had fallen into a sort of disuse. Perhaps part of the credit of the systems of indigenous medicine going to the wall was due to a large number of people whom, for want of a better phrase, we may call 'quacks', people who are said to be pandits, but who are not, and possibly also due to the elaborate method of preparation of the medicines. I am not going into the history of that question now. But there has been a strong feeling that what available knowledge is in store

with us either in the theory or practice of indigenous systems of medicine, all that knowledge should be utilised for that purpose.

I feel that the general attitude—and that is exactly the attitude of Government—in a case like this is that we would not do well to deny ourselves of the advantage, or deny people the advantage of any system, whatever you may call it. Ultimately, ayurveda means the science of life. The science of life is the same for all time. Our ancients believed in the science of life; they wanted to prolong life, they wanted to make the people healthy; they went along with their researches; they achieved results. Long before allopathy was born in the whole of our country millions and millions of people were treated by resort to the only system of medicine available then, that is the ayurvedic system. All people were not cured, nor did all people die, on account of this system.

Modern science has also progressed. and in our passion for the past, I wish we do not forget the justice that is due to the present. People who are ailing do not care as to what medicine is used; they want to live, they want to be cured. It will not comfort a man who is dying if he knows that it is the ayurvedic medicine that will not cure him, or the allopathic medicine that will kill him. He is not interested in either of these. The ailing man is particular about finding a cure for his ailment, call it by whatever name you will. And if all these systems fail and if another system gave any relief, he will welcome that system.

Therefore our policy all along has been to look to the end. If an ayurvedic drug is found to be effective, get the people cured by all means. We have no predilections in the matter; we have no partiality for ayurveda because it is patriotic to support ayurveda. We have no hatred against allopathy. We would like to take advantage of every system that is available. In addition to all the systems mentioned, if there is any other system which will bring relief to the

[Shri Karmarkar]

people we would like to take advantage of it. We do not go by labels.

Ultimately we cannot gainsay the progress of science. Surgery has made advances. The other day a friend of mine told me that there is an ayurvedic method of removing the teeth. There might be an ayurvedic antiseptic. But when a man puts in his instrument and takes out the tooth the Vaidya may remember the Ayurvedic God Dhanvantri and the modern man may remember some western doctor. But taking out of the tooth is the same.

I can well understand that the medicine that you apply may be ayurvedic. But what is the ayurvedic method of taking out the tooth? I have not known an allopathic method of breaking bones or curing the broken bones. There are different methods. But ultimately let us adopt the method that is best and effective. That has been the attitude of Government.

It is true that during the last one hundred years and more allopathy has made much advance. Now we have tried to devote our attention a little more than before to the indigenous systems of medicine. There again we are confronted with a two-fold problem. One is the diagnosis—the *kaph vāyū pīth* method and the other is the remedy. It does not matter to me what method you adopt.

On the remedial aspects, what we have been doing is this. At the Jamnagar institute we are having patients treated purely on the ayurvedic method and then we have asked allopathic men to keep a check. Some casualties are bound to happen in any system. We are subjecting the whole of the medicines, so far as it is possible for us to do, to a test, with the ultimate idea of adopting what is best. The conflict in the systems will continue till the end. The *kaph, vāyū, pīth* man will continue to stick to his belief, the modern man will have all the methods of examination, X-ray,

and all that. One might be a symptomatic treatment, the other might be an analytical treatment. But we have no partialities in the matter. Supposing either of these can bring effective relief, we shall be happy to adopt.

It is a fact that in so far as modern scientific progress is concerned, Government definitely hold the opinion that if there is something tangible, they must keep to that. Therefore it is that we have to proceed a little cautiously. It is not a question of having faith in either method. Government have no blind faith in any method. Therefore we have taken to this experiment at Jamnagar Institute, where we have all doctors. We have put in the purest ayurvedic doctor, not contaminated by allopathy. We want the modern medicine doctor to take out the best from ayurved.

This controversy is bound to go on in any case for the next five or ten years. I am not sanguine that in a short time this controversy will close.

I have already exceeded my time. I will take a few more minutes. There is also a great controversy now going on on which the ayurvedic pandits themselves are divided whether to take to an integrated system of teaching of ayurvedic medicines or a separate system. Some pandits hold that immediately you allow modern medicine to come and there is an integration, in the ayurvedic man develops an inferiority complex and what he does later on is that he practices modern medicine masquerading as an ayurvedic pandit. This subject is bristling with difficulties. To clinch the point it is not that we are showing any patronage to either system. At the same time we have to take care of the patients.

Today the difficulty is this. In fact, someone as well equipped and cultured as anyone of us, gave a quiet solution to me. He said the best solution appears to be that for all minor ailments which do not endanger life I take to ayurveda, if there is anything critical about life, I shift my faith to

modern medicine That is his safe method; there might be others too who might do likewise

So, this is a subject which has to be approached with a sense of responsibility and Government are doing all that is possible under the circumstances If there is more money we shall be happy to give more money There is no question about that But this is a subject in which Government do not take the view of patronage, that we are doing something patriotic because we are patronising ayurveda We are doing what is necessary for the common citizen

I have no more time to devote to the subject, otherwise I would have liked to go into details If at any other time an opportunity arises, I would like to dwell on this subject I may content myself by saying that the research experiment that we have undertaken in this matter is yielding fairly good results and it may be possible for us to process it further

Something was said about the import of drug. The House will be happy to know that we are actually producing more and more drugs For instance the value of indigenously produced drugs is about Rs 45 crores and what we are importing is about Rs 12 crores and maybe in the near future we may be able to reduce that also to a greater extent

**Shri Dassappa:** What year is that?

**Shri Karmarkar:** You may roughly take it as the present position Maybe these figures are six months old, but we are not allowing anything to be imported for the next three months This may be the average for the last three or four years

The present production of penicillin is about 18 million mega units and plans are in progress to increase the production to 40 million mega units. Efforts are being made for the production of streptomycin. As the House knows the capacity of the DDT factory is about 100 tons, it is proposed to increase it to 1,400 tons

**Shri V. P. Nayar:** May I put a question?

**Shri Karmarkar:** Question at the end

**Shri V. P. Nayar:** I have a difficulty When we import medicines and drugs we are allowed to import them only from countries the pharmacopoeia of which has been accepted by us Other countries are offering drugs at very much cheaper rates Do we have any proposal before us by which we will accept the pharmacopoeia of such countries so that we may get cheaper drugs here?

**Shri Karmarkar:** To cut the time short, I shall reply to this point on another occasion

Something was said about Rauwolfia Serpentina It is a good point. It was known as sarpagandhi in our literature It was used in cases of hyper tension Its use was re-discovered again There is a firm in Bombay which I should not name which was making a drug from rauwolfia serpentina these seven or eight years and we used to earn a good foreign exchange from that That invited the attention of foreigners They have gone further I am told that a European firm has been able to isolate an element which is different from the elements that they have found here or elsewhere I do not exactly recall the name of the element But I am happy to tell the House that in bulk this medicine has been manufactured here and is being exported

**Shri V. P. Nayar:** That is only reserpine No other alkaloid is extracted from rauwolfia serpentina in our country

**Shri Karmarkar:** If I go on correcting the errors of my hon friend, I will have to spend the whole of my time here

**Shri V. P. Nayar:** If you take my information, you can cut short the time

**Shri Karmarkar:** We have received a complaint from the Health Minister of Bombay about the shortage of A.P.C.. We shall look into that in the context of a second wave of influenza.

Something was said about the law. The law is there. I need not make it clear, what power we have under the Drugs Control Act, the Food Adulteration Act, etc. I think it will be unnecessarily teasing the House by telling what they already know.

There was one point arising out of the observations of the hon. Member Pandit Thakur Das Bhargava. He was perfectly right. It is necessary to provide medical facilities in the villages. But, difficulty is a difficulty. Doctors like to stick to the cities. Any villager who comes to the cities likes to stick to the city. Many of the city people refuse to go to the villages because there are no conveniences. Therefore, it is that we are thinking of this plan of having a primary Health Centre for every 66,000 of the population, in these community projects and N.E.S blocks. That is the first scheme in that direction. It has been partially worked out during the First Plan. We want to open centres, I think, about 2000, under the Second Plan. I should also say that this is a very modest attempt, because ultimately,.....

**Shri Tangamani:** How many centres have so far been opened?

**Shri Karmarkar:** I have got all the figures here. The proposals are for opening 2,000 centres in all. I am not able to lay my fingers at the moment on the information. I have got it here. I shall give it to my hon. friend.

As I was saying, this is in fact a modest step, because ultimately one centre for 66,000 people is neither here nor there. That is obvious. But, it is the beginning of what I should consider a rather revolutionary programme. Because, ultimately, suppose we want a centre for every 5,000 or 10,000 of the population, we have to

begin somewhere. The idea is that these centres will serve the primary needs of the people that it is intended to serve. We shall place some vehicles at their disposal. In any case, it will be a good start for the villages to have 2,000 units in the rural areas to serve the population which you possibly serve. I am aware of the fact that one unit like that cannot by any means adequately serve 66,000 people. But, still, it is a definite step in the right direction. I am quite sure that the States will fully like the idea and work it out. It is also up to the people to make the best of such centres. Because, unless there is the awakening of the people, for whom such such centres are intended, the best possible benefits could not be had from them.

I am sorry, I have not been able to cover even half of the points that I intended to cover. One of the points that was made by my esteemed friend Shri Dasappa; I should not like to overlook. Ultimately, till now, much emphasis has been laid on the curative aspect of health problems. We, as a country of 370 millions now, are beset with such large problems. Thanks to mal-nutrition which is largely prevalent, thanks also to want of necessary aids, we have thought it proper during the recent past to concentrate our attention more on the curative side than on the preventive side. There, again, we are beset with difficulties which are the creations of our economic conditions. Ultimately, a well fed man is less prone to diseases than an ill-fed man. I should imagine that half of our present ailments is due to mal-nutrition.

At the moment, I should like to clear a point made by the hon. Member, Shrimati Maniben Patel. She asked, when we producing sufficient skimmed milk, why do you import from abroad. What comes from abroad is by way of aid, by way of supplementing the resources of the country. What comes to us readily, I suppose, we should utilise.

Apart from that, I think there has to be a large effort at what you might call rationalisation of our food habits. I am sorry to say that along with many good things that modern civilisation has brought to us,—the so-called modern civilisation—some bad things have also come. One of the things that it has brought is partly a good sense of standard of life and also a false sense of standards of life. I am aware of the fact, as this House is aware doubtless, that during the past 30 years, comparatively people have been earning more than what they used to earn 30 years before. But, they spend less on their food and other necessities and cloth budget than on other things. It is something dismal to imagine that in spite of the progress, the way in which we are going is partly responsible for our health conditions. In such conditions, I wish we do our best to tell our people, especially the poor people, because they are the most vulnerable part of our population, to work harder, earn more and to make their conditions of life better, to give their children more by way of food than by way of anything else.

I do not wish to say much about the urban classes, because they can better look after themselves. But, many suffer under a sense of false notions. Apart from what we are able to provide on the curative side, as in the case of hospitals, public health measures, etc., I wish we concentrate the attention of the population on the primary duty that they owe to themselves, to their children and to their families, that they must see in so far as possible that nutrition comes first. Because, ultimately if our country is to be rid of all the ailments, we have to devote attention to the nutrition of the country. That is the sin under which we are suffering, in spite of the other things we have got, greater production and greater national wealth and all that.

The other thing is that, we as a nation are rather careless in what is known as co-operation with public health measures. We, as householders,

many a time, content ourselves as having done our duty by cleaning our own houses and throwing the entire dirt in the dust bin of our neighbours. I would like the co-operation of the House in this matter. All of us here have got our own areas and we have to tell our people this. Ultimately, we owe a duty to our constituency. Apart from raising questions here and trying to answer them from the Treasury Benches, there is a greater duty that we owe to our constituency. We should tell our people about this. From the way in which even my hon. friend Shri V. P. Nayar smiles, I am quite sure that this is a proposition which carries conviction.

I regret very much that I have had, under compulsion, to skip over many points. I plead I am guilty. I may take another opportunity to inflict some more explanations and some more points. Lastly, to conclude with a note about Delhi, I almost agree with my hon. friend who referred to Delhi.

**An Hon. Member:** We were not allowed time.

**Shri Karmarkar:** Otherwise you would have made things worse for Delhi. Delhi needs much attention. I am sure that when all these municipal units come together under one Corporation, at least we will have some one to hold responsible for the sanitary conditions in Delhi, and things will improve better. Otherwise, without saying anything uncomplimentary to Delhi, if a choice were to be given to me, I would prefer to stay far away from the city, at least till a Corporation comes into being, somewhere outside Delhi rather than in Delhi itself. That is neither here nor there. We are always prepared to co-operate with the health authorities and do the best we can.

I must apologise to you, Sir, because for the last ten minutes, I did not look at you lest I should be checked. I wanted to do at least the minimum by way of discharging my duty to this House. Therefore, I took



[Shri Karmakar]

the cue from the friend who came up to you and whispered that the time is up. I thank the House for the co-operation so far as the Health Ministry is concerned. We may err, but we shall never be found wanting in co-operation. We are always prepared to learn. There is much we have to learn and there is much that this House has to teach us. Only for us to learn and the House to teach, it requires a far greater study than what we have been able to do till now. I am quite sure the House will be convinced that I say this as one of the House, and if all of us put in our effort, I am sure, as some hon. Member hoped, that within two, three or four years we may be able to achieve better results

Mr. Chairman: Now I shall put the cut motions to the House.

*All the cut motions were put and negatived*

Mr. Chairman: The question is:

"That the respective sums not exceeding the amounts shown in the fourth column of the Order Paper, be granted to the President, to complete the sums necessary to defray the charges that come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of the following heads of demands entered in the second column thereof:—

Demand Nos.—47, 48, 49, 50 and 119 "

*The motion was adopted.*

[*The motion for Demands for Grants which were adopted by the Lok Sabha are reproduced below—Ed.*]

**DEMAND No 47—MINISTRY OF HEALTH**

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 7,66,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the

31st day of March, 1958, in respect of 'Ministry of Health'".

**DEMAND No. 48—MEDICAL SERVICES**

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 2,26,43,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of 'Medical Services' "

**DEMAND No. 49—PUBLIC HEALTH**

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 5,35,30,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of 'Public Health' "

**DEMAND No 50—MISCELLANEOUS EXPENDITURE UNDER THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH**

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 60,56,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of 'Miscellaneous Expenditure under the Ministry of Health' "

**DEMAND No. 119—CAPITAL OUTLAY OF THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH**

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 5,89,68,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of 'Capital Outlay of the Ministry of Health'".

**MINISTRY OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT**

**Mr. Chairman:** The House will now take up discussion of the Demand for Grants Nos. 6, 7 and 105 relating to the Ministry of Community Development. As the House is aware, 5 hours have been allotted for the Demands of this Ministry which may be extended a little as observed by the Speaker in the morning.

There are a number of cut motions to these various Demands. Hon. Members may hand over at the Table within 15 minutes, the numbers of the selected cut motions which they propose to move. I shall treat them as moved, if the Members in whose names those cut motions stand are present in the House and the motions are otherwise in order.

**DEMAND No. 6—MINISTRY OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT.**

**Mr. Chairman:** Motion moved:

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 12,11,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of ‘Ministry of Community Development’.”

**DEMAND No. 7—COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS AND NATIONAL EXTENSION SERVICE**

**Mr. Chairman:** Motion moved:

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 7,18,00,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in

respect of ‘Ministry of Community Development and National Extension Service’.”

**DEMAND No. 105—CAPITAL OUTLAY OF THE MINISTRY OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT**

**Mr. Chairman:** Motion moved:

“That a sum not exceeding Rs. 97,70,000 be granted to the President to complete the sum necessary to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1958, in respect of ‘Capital outlay of the Ministry of Community Development’.”

The Minister of Community Development (Shri S. K. Dey): By now the community development programme covers about 40 per cent. of rural India. There is hardly a subdivision in the country which has not been covered somewhere or the other by this programme. I therefore assume that the hon. Members of this House are well acquainted with the working of the programme. Therefore, I would much rather postpone any talk so far as I am concerned on this programme till I have had the opportunity of hearing the hon. Members of the House.

**Mr. Chairman:** Shrimati Renuka Ray.

Shrimati Renuka Ray (Malda): I had not stood up. So, I did not know I was to be called first.

**Mr. Chairman:** All the better she can give the lead.

**Shrimati Benaka Ray:** In a country whose people live predominantly in villages, the community projects assume a very vital and real role. The Minister has said just now that 40 per cent. of rural India has been covered, perhaps not as well as it should be done, but to some extent, through community projects and NES blocks. I think the essence of this whole community projects idea is to change the psychology of the people who through centuries of domination had forgotten that in themselves, through their own power and capacity they have to change the nature of their living conditions. It is not an easy task to change this psychology which has become deep-seated and to the extent that the work has been done, I certainly am not one to belittle it in the slightest degree. Nevertheless much remains to be done.

When the First Five Year Plan was coming to an end I think the Programme Evaluation Report said that in the last year of the Plan there was a spurt of activity mainly on construction. That is correct, and after that the next year shows a period of inactivity. Perhaps this inactivity that followed is due to the fact that neither the workers nor the people at large for whom they worked had realised that self-help to a greater extent was required. In the First Plan, although there was some impetus to encourage self-help, there was more of help from the State. Now the new factors come into play, that at the outset perhaps the lack of realisation may be one of the factors that had produced the period of inactivity.

In the ultimate analysis, a project of this kind cannot be judged by the number of health centres, experimental farms or schools or even roads that have been constructed, but by the amount of co-operation and people's effort that has been put forward.

I hope that this very essential factor will not be lost sight of because to-day we face an urgency, a very great urgency to overcome the ills that have been with us through the centuries, to revitalise our country and bring to our people adequate living conditions.

But so far as the community projects are concerned, they are not merely a nation-building project in the sense that health or education is. Theirs is the task, the responsibility, as I said in the beginning, of changing the psychology, and I hope that to a great extent in the years to come this will be realised both by those who are workers in the community and NES blocks and the people themselves.

, As I have said, I have no desire to belittle anything and if I bring out certain points, it is in all seriousness because I think in the light of experience it is possible now to correct some of the errors of the past and to go ahead with greater speed

In the agricultural sector perhaps the community project and the NES blocks have shown greater sign of success than on any other account. This is natural. It is one of the greatest needs of this country today, which being an agricultural country has to buy foodgrains from abroad, which needs to conserve its foreign exchange and other resources. It is a shame, it is a most unfortunate thing that even today we have to bring in foodstuffs and foodgrains from abroad, and naturally attention must be focussed on it. But in so doing, let not the community projects and NES blocks forget that they must not by-pass the people's effort, and if they try to do so in order to work out certain schemes, certain targets of production, they will fail in the essential feature. From the evaluation report, I find that the Programme Evaluation Organisation have asked the community projects to lay more emphasis

on adequate supply of small agricultural loans to the people.

It has to be regretted, but it is that although we urgently require that the people's mind should turn towards co-operative methods, yet co-operative farming will perhaps be the last co-operative effort that will come in. There should be a greater concentration of co-operatives, but at the same time, I do not think that the time has come yet when we can stop giving small agricultural loans to individual peasants. The individual agriculturists should be given help to an adequate degree, and what is more, in time. Whether it be agricultural loan or seeds for distribution, it is no use giving the loan or the seeds, in particular, after the sowing season is over. But that is what takes place very often. You may not give very great assistance, but such assistance as is given must be given in time.

Apart from agriculture, I welcome the recent decision to lay greater stress on irrigation. While larger irrigation projects are very necessary, the fact remains that they take time and resources. But in the meantime, what is happening in this country is that we are still entirely at the mercy of nature. Year after year, we are faced with floods and droughts, with the consequence that large sums of money have to be given by way of relief. Here is a field where the Community Projects Administration should come into the picture to a far greater extent than it has hitherto.

I know that roads have been built in many places, and that people's enthusiasm has been roused to dig tanks and so on; and to that extent, there has been co-operative endeavour there. Nevertheless, I would suggest that in many places today, bunds have to be erected, small irrigation schemes have to be started, and tanks have to be dug and tube-wells have to be constructed, if possible, or otherwise, at least ordinary wells. All these things are yet to be done, taking the country as a whole but I feel sure that well-planned

schemes of this nature would go a long way to arouse co-operative effort and enthusiasm.

I would suggest that the funds for this purpose as also the necessary resources, whether they be little or large, should be placed in the hands of the block development officer and the *gram sevaks* and *gram sevikas*. It is unfortunate, but true very often—and the Minister himself knows about it—that these block development officers and these young *gram sevaks* and *gram sevikas* are enthused by the work that they have to do, and they go about and enthuse the people also. But what happens is that the resources required—maybe, they are very little—are not coming to their hands in time. Several months pass, and they get frustrated, and along with it the enthusiasm of the people also dies away. Every effort must be made to set things right in this regard. I know the difficulties. I am not trying to belittle the efforts that are being made, but I feel greater attention must be bestowed on these matters.

So far as cottage industries and production centres are concerned, they are a vital necessity in these areas. But here, I feel that the Community Projects Administration has not been able to show concrete results so far to any great extent. One of the reasons for this, I believe, is the lack of trained personnel. No doubt, they are training people, and I wish them all success.

But I would like to give one example to the Minister, and I would ask him to judge it for himself. I visited recently a block development area in North Bengal, where I met some young *gram sevikas*, who were doing good work. They were very keen about their work, and they had great enthusiasm. And they showed me whatever they were doing. I do not want to decry what they were doing but after seeing one of the things that they were teaching to some of the women there I was filled with dismay.

[Shrimati Renuka Ray]

I asked them who had taught it to them, and why they had undertaken such work; they said that they had been taught that in the training school.

To give you one small example, they were teaching the women to make little plaques on which pictures from illustrated books and papers from other countries as well as from India could be pasted, and this was a part of the home-beautiful movement. I thought to myself that in this India of ours, in this India where art and design and the most beautiful and exquisite things are fashioned in the villages where they are deep-rooted, we have perhaps lost sight of them. Why should our girls be taught these things? Perhaps, this is due probably to too much of foreign advice, but whatever it be, I do hope that the Minister will look into this. It is a small point, no doubt, but it is an indication of what is being done, and it must be set right. So many more useful crafts can be taught.

It is true that India can learn much from the world outside. I am not one of those who believe in closing one's ears or taking anything good from other countries. But I am afraid that we might also irritate the worst of other people; that is hardly the best thing, more especially, when training schools for the girls who are going to teach our villages, are set up. I have pointed this out because I feel..

**Mr. Chairman:** The hon. Member's time is up.

**Shrimati Renuka Ray:** I shall finish in a few minutes.

**Mr. Chairman:** My difficulty is this. There are as many as 19 speakers—5 hours have been allotted for this Ministry—besides those who have tabled cut motions. I would request the hon. Member, therefore, to conclude in a minute or two.

**Shrimati Renuka Ray:** I shall finish in five minutes.

Having dealt at length with this matter, I should like to say a word or two on a few points which are very fundamental, if we are to progress in this work. The first point of which I have given an illustration is the administrative procedure. There are two points involved in this. The first is co-ordination. The other day, the Minister, while replying to a question said that co-ordination was a continuing process. I appreciated that answer, because I realised that he was trying his best to achieve co-ordination, but co-ordination between the departments and Ministries of the Centre and the States is yet to come about, in any effective manner. I do not think that the Community Projects Administration itself—leave alone the other administrative departments—can progress unless there is proper co-ordination. In human society, we certainly err, and to some extent, faults cannot always be remedied all at once, but a greater amount of co-ordination is required in the sense that petty internal jealousies between departments and Ministries of the Centre and the States must be eliminated to a much greater extent. In these community development blocks, agriculture and irrigation, education and public health, and cottage industries must go together; otherwise, it is not possible for us to go ahead.

Last but not least, I feel that unless there is a proper appreciation of this fact, not only the community development projects, but even the Second Five Year Plan, or the core of the Plan or whatever part of it we implement, will be vitiated.

15 hrs.

[MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER in the Chair]

And that is that we must have some method by which the present administrative procedure is changed and changed vastly. Redtapism persists to a great extent. As I said once before in the House, the man who does the implementing work must be given the resources and responsibility to do his

work. If he is not given these, it is no use at a later stage, when something goes wrong, saying that the implementing authority is to blame. I feel very sad sometimes to hear generalisations, particularly in regard to the lower level workers. Some of these village level workers, with enthusiasm shining on their faces, are wonderful people, if we can utilise them in the proper manner. But why do we fail to do so? It may be that there is corruption. It may be that there is inefficiency. Let us take note of these things and check them vigorously. But let us not dishearten those young men and women by sweeping statements which lunge all together.

I am speaking not only of Community Projects but of many other fields of activity. There are many who are really attempting to help the country's progress. We are too apt and prone to blame the implementing authority each time, not realising that the implementing authority does not receive all the things in time and the resources in time. When two Governments come into the picture as they do in the Community Projects—it becomes still more difficult.

I know the Minister is alive to it. In India today, we are trying a new experiment, an experiment through the democratic approach to change the conditions of a country that has been left behind for centuries, a country in which much leeway has to be made. We want to do so without regimenting men or making them into sheep. In order to do that, we have to encourage their own effort. That is the main purpose of the Community Projects. But if we are to achieve success, if the results are to be proportionate to all our needs, it may take some time, but let us lay the basis truly and well. I know that the Community Projects Administration has good objectives and ideals, but until our administrative procedure is changed, I doubt very much whether we can achieve results in the manner we want.

Not so long ago in this country, orthodox social customs—outworn

customs—had been clinging like weeds and choking the life of our society. Today I feel we are trying to move ahead in this new adventure to build a nation. We are also being choked by red-tapism. Administrative procedures which have no meaning today continue to exist. Even today legal and technical quibbles are allowed to hold up many things. I know that the Government are focussing attention on these matters, but I feel that a change is required swiftly if we are to make swifter progress. With these few words, I support the Demands.

डा० रत्न सुभग सिंह (साइसराम) :  
 उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, कम्युनिटी डेवलपमेंट प्रोजेक्ट्स और एन० ई० एस० ब्लाक्स का मुख्य उद्देश्य यह था कि जनता का दृष्टिकोण बदले, और बदले इसलिये कि देश का उत्पादन बढ़े, यहाँ वर्गहीन समाज की स्थापना हो जिसमें सभी लोग यह समझें कि वे एक स्वतन्त्र देश के निवासी हैं और वे स्वावलम्बन की नीति प्रस्तुत करने में सफल हों और उन को यह अधिकार भी मिले कि वे जो कमाई करें उस का अच्छी तरह से उपभोग कर सकें। जहाँ तक इस नीति का सवाल है, हम को देखना यह है कि इस तरह की अवस्था पैदा करने में कम्युनिटी डेवलपमेंट प्रोजेक्ट्स और एन० ई० एस० ब्लाक्स को कोई सफलता मिली है या नहीं। यहाँ पर मुख्यतया तीन बातें आती हैं। देश के उत्थान के लिये आवश्यकता है कि हम अपने धार्मिक राजनीतिक और सामाजिक दृष्टिकोणों को बदलें। धार्मिक दृष्टिकोण इसलिये कि यहाँ पर कई तरह की असमानताएँ हैं। धार्मिक भी हमारे देश में ऐसे लोग हैं जिन को खाने के लिये भ्रम नहीं मिलता, पहिने के लिये बदन नहीं मिलता। लेकिन दूसरी ओर ऐसे लोग भी हैं जिन के पास सब कुछ इफ़रात है, जो इतने पैसा व धाराम में रहते हैं कि उस को देख कर जिस के पास कुछ नहीं होता, वह मर सकता है। इस दृष्टिकोण को बदलने में कम्युनिटी प्रोजेक्ट्स डिपार्टमेंट कहीं तक सफल हुआ, यह सब के सामने है।

[डा० राज सुख सिंह]

भाज दिल्ली में गणतन्त्रवादी मकान हैं तरह तरह के ऐश ब धाराम के साधन हैं लेकिन देहातों में भाज भी हालत यह हैं मैं अपने क्षेत्र की बात करता हूँ जहाँ पर कि कम्युनिटी प्रोजेक्ट्स भी हैं, एन० ई० एस० ब्लाक्स भी हैं, कि वहाँ पर नहरें इस तरह की हैं कि धान का बीज क्षेत्र में डालने के लिये पानी नहीं मिलता है। बाढ़ के चलते नई नहरें अवरोध हो जाती हैं और उन के अवरोध हो जाने के कारण जो बीज डाला जाता है वह बिल्कुल सूख या सड़ जाता है। इस के बाद कोई ऐसी योजना नहीं है कि फिर से वहाँ के लोगों को धान का बीज मिल सके।

दूसरा सवाल यह आता है कि एन० ई० एस० ब्लाक्स और कम्युनिटी प्रोजेक्ट्स के अमर खर्च भी हुआ यह नहीं है कि उन लोगों ने पैसा खर्च नहीं किया। काफी क्षेत्रों में उन की स्थापना हुई, भाज करीब १३ करोड़ आदमी इस के अन्तर्गत हैं और हमारे भाषे से ज्यादा गांव कम्युनिटी डेवलपमेंट के अन्तर्गत आ गये हैं। उन पर बहुत काफी खर्च हो रहा है। लिखा गया है कि ऐग्रीकल्चरल फील्ड्स में २६ लाख, २८ हजार डेभोन्स्ट्रैक्शन्स हुए। बीज बांटा गया ७४ लाख, ६६ हजार मन। १ करोड़ ६६ लाख मन के करीब फर्टीलाइजर बांटा गया। इसी तरह से लैंड रिक्लेमेशन भी किया गया, कैटल के उत्पादन के लिये भी बहुत काम किया गया। यानी अगर रिपोर्ट को देखा जायें तब तो बहुत काम हुआ है। यह मैं मानने के लिये तैयार हूँ कि जो आंकड़े हम लोगों को दिये जाते हैं उन के अनुसार आसानी से यह नहीं समझा जा सकता कि काम नहीं हुआ है, लेकिन हम को चाहिये कि उस का असस परिणाम क्या निकला है, इन सब आंकड़ों के देखने के बाद पता लगाना चाहिये कि जनता के आर्थिक दृष्टिकोण में कहां तक उम्मीदी आई है और क्या इतना सब खर्च करने के बाद हम समाजवादी समाज की स्थापना कर सकें, क्या हम सर्वहोम समाज बनायें की और अक्षर हो

सके? क्या जनता के अन्दर अम की महिमा, विगनिटी आफ लेबर जमी है, इस को बढ़ाने में इन सब कामों के द्वारा क्या कोई प्रेरणा मिली है जनता को? यह सही बात है कि भारत के किसी भी कोने में जनता के दिल में अम की महिमा नहीं बढ़ी है। सन् १९५२ में जो अवस्था थी वही आज भी है। आज भी हम समझते हैं कि मकान बनाना सराब काम है, हल चलाना सराब काम है, झाड़ू लगाना सराब काम है। आज भी वही पुरानी हालत चली आ रही है। जब तक हम लोगों के अन्दर अम की महिमा नहीं बढ़ावेंगे तब तक विकास का कोई भी प्रोग्राम सफल होना सम्भव नहीं है।

साथ ही यह भी है कि एक और तो अम की महिमा नहीं बढ़ी, दूसरी ओर जो अनेकों स्कूल, अस्पताल बने या और छोटे बड़े काम हुए, पुल बने, दूसरी चीजें बनीं जैसा उन के लिये एक बार कहा भी गया था, उन का निर्माण इस ढंग से हुआ है कि उन में तनिक भी नबबती नहीं है। इस तरह की चीजें होते हुए भी खर्च ज्यादा हो रहा है। लैंड रिक्लेमेशन का काम हुआ। अगर किसी जमीन के रिक्लेमेशन करने में ५५ रुपये लगने चाहिये और उस ने १०० रुपए लगा दिये गये, तो इस से जनता को तो कोई प्रेरणा नहीं मिलती। इसी तरह से मान लीजिये कहीं पर एन० ई० एस० ब्लाक है कुछ गांवों का, वहाँ पर अधिकारी पैदल जा सकते हैं या साइकल पर जा सकते हैं अगर वहाँ पर दो दो कारें या जीप्स रक्की जाती हैं, तो इस से जनता का दृष्टिकोण बदलने में कितनी प्रेरणा मिलेगी। आज पांच स्रः बंधे हो गये लेकिन यह काम अभी तक सम्भव नहीं हो सका है। जो रबैया पहले था आज भी वही है। इन कार्यकर्मों का यह उद्देश्य था कि जनता समझे कि हम की स्वायत्तवादी बनना है। हम को हर बात के लिये गवर्नमेंट की तरफ नहीं साकना है, हमें यह नहीं सोचना है कि अगर गवर्नमेंट हम को नीकरी नहीं देती तो हमारा जीवन दुर्लभ हो जायेगा। लेकिन यह उद्देश्य पूरा

नहीं हुआ है। साथ ही हासत यह है कि गांवों के बीच बाहरों की तरफ बीड़ते हैं जहां कि कुछ सुविधा है। यहां भाकर लोग एम्प्लायमेंट एक्सचेंजों में बचके जाते हैं। तो इस विभाग के काम से हमारे नीजवानों को स्वावलम्बन की कोई प्रेरणा नहीं मिली है। हमारे नीजवानों के विकास के धीरे भी जो कार्य हो रहे हैं उन से यह प्रेरणा नहीं मिलती है कि गांवों में चल कर खेती करें या भवेली पालें। तो इस प्रकार हमारे आर्थिक दृष्टिकोण में कोई परिवर्तन नहीं हुआ है।

एक दो वर्ष पहले कहा जाता था कि प्लानिंग के कारण बहुत ज्यादा उत्पादन में वृद्धि हुई है। नेशनल सैम्पल सर्वे ने भी लिखा कि कम्युनिटी डेवलपमेंट और एन० ई० एस० ब्लाक एरिया में २० से २५ प्रतिशत वृद्धि उत्पादन में हुई है। मैं इसका सडन नहीं करना चाहता क्योंकि अपना अपना दृष्टिकोण होता है उन की जाच करने की कोई प्रणाली होगी। उस के अनुसार उन्होंने न जाच करवाई और यह रिपोर्ट दी कि उत्पादन में २० से २५ प्रतिशत तक वृद्धि हुई है। इस वृद्धि के लिये सरकार की तरफ से साढ़े ६० करोड़ रुपया खर्च किया गया और जनता की तरफ से साढ़े ३६ करोड़ रुपया खर्च किया गया। इस नारे खर्च के होते हुए भी जो हमारे दृष्टिकोण में अन्तर आना चाहिये कि हम उमंग के साथ अपने कामों को करने में लग जायें, वह अन्तर नहीं आया। आज भी लोगो की यही मूर्खति है कि सरकार पर हर काम के लिये निर्भर करे।

पहली पंचवर्षीय योजना और दूसरी पंचवर्षीय योजना में बहुत सी कोआपरेटिव सोसाइटीज भी खुली हैं। कहा गया था कि इन से अनेक दुराइया दूर हो जायेंगी। पाच छ. वर्ष प्रचार करने का मौका भी मिला। लेकिन आज इतने समय के बाद इन कोआपरेटिव सोसाइटीज का केवल यही उपयोग हो रहा है कि किसान को लीड मित्र जाता है, क्रेडिट मिल जाता है और एडिनाइजर मित्र जाता है। इन्हीं तीन कामों के लिये आज कोआपरेटिव का उपयोग

हो रहा है। लेकिन जनता अभी कोआपरेशन के उद्देश्य को नहीं समझ सकी है। या तो इस के लिये जनता को कुछ बोध दिया जाय या यह हो सकता है कि हमारा सरकारी यंत्र ही उन को यह उद्देश्य नहीं समझा सका। हो सकता है कि इस में दोनों की टुटि हो। लेकिन मेरी समझ से तो समझाने की ताकत की ही कमी मालूम होती है। यह तो हमारी आर्थिक प्रगति हुई है।

हमारे राजनीतिक दृष्टिकोण में भी बिल्कुल प्रगति नहीं हुई है। सविधान के अनुसार हम ने ग्राम पंचायतो का निर्माण किया है। कम्युनिटी डेवलपमेंट एरिया और एन० ई० एस० ब्लाक में काफी को-आपरेटिव्स भी बनाये गये हैं। हमारा यह उद्देश्य था कि लोकल बाडीज से जनता को अपना काम स्वयं करने की प्रेरणा मिलेगी और इस प्रकार अधिकारो का विकेन्द्रीकरण हो सकेगा। लेकिन आज आप कही भी जायें चाहे उत्तर प्रदेश में जायें, या बिहार में जायें या पंजाब में जायें, आप देखेंगे कि लोकल बाडीज का सिलसिला टूटता जा रहा है। इन के समय पर चुनाव नहीं होते। ग्राम पंचायतो ने चुनाव में भी अनेक खराबिया है। हो सकता है कि हम ना धारण हमारी वह पुरानी परम्परा हो जिस के कारण हम किसी नई चीज को जल्दी अपना नहीं पाते। लेकिन एक चीज हम देखते हैं कि जो पहले नीचे से लोगो को ऊपर उठाने की परम्परा थी वह खत्म होती जा रही है। आप देखते हैं कि अलीगढ़ विश्वविद्यालय या काशी का हिन्दू विश्वविद्यालय जैसी बड़ी बड़ी संस्थाये पहले किसी एक या दो या कुछ आदमियों ने मिल कर खड़ी कर दी। लेकिन आज हम साधन सम्पन्न होते हुए भी ऐसे विश्वविद्यालय खड़े नहीं कर सकते। इस का कारण यह था कि पहले नीचे से लीडरशिप निकलती थी, वह अपनी बुद्धि से काम करती थी। अगर उस समय लोगो को मान लीजिये किसी गांव में खड़क बनानी होती थी तो वे अपने ढंग से उस काम को कर लेते थे। या कोई आन्दोलन भी चलाना होता था



[डा० राम सुभग सिंह]

तो अपने ढंग से चलाते थे। लेकिन आज तो इस ताकत पर कुठाराघात हो रहा है क्योंकि न तो आज लोगों का सार्वजनिक जीवन रह गया है और न पूरे तौर पर सरकारी ज्वन ही बन पाया है। दोनों का ऐसा गठबन्धन हुआ है कि दोनों की क्षमता जाती रही है। ज्यादातर क्षमता राजनीतिक जीवन की कम हो रही है क्योंकि सरकारी यंत्रों का प्राधान्य स्थापित कर दिया गया है। इस कारण जो खुद ब खुद काम करने की ताकत थी वह कुंठित हो गई है और आज हमारा राजनीतिक दृष्टिकोण यही रह गया है कि सरकारी यंत्रों की ज्यादा से ज्यादा सहायता ली जाये। अगर हम को कोई विकास कार्य करना है तो हम दौड़ते हैं सरकिल आफिसर के पास। अगर वहां पर हमारा काम न बन सका और हमारी अनुनय विनय सफल न हुई तो फिर हम दूसरी जगह दौड़ते हैं। कलक्टर माहब के यहां जाते हैं। वहां पर सुनवाई नहीं होती। लोगों को पता नहीं कि अपनी शिकायतें दूर करवाने के लिये किस अधिकारी के पास जायें। अगर हम को काम के लिये सीमेंट नहीं मिल रहा है तो हमारी कही सुनवाई ही नहीं होती। इस तरह हमारा राजनीतिक जीवन टूटता जा रहा है। अब जनता समझ गई है कि हम किस का सहारा लें। यह योजना की गई कि कम्युनिटी डेवलपमेंट और एन० ई० एस० की प्रोजेक्ट्स में जनता के प्रतिनिधियों को भी मिला कर एडवाइजरी कमेटी बनायी जायें। लेकिन जो काम होता है वह ग्राम सेवक की रिपोर्ट पर प्रोजेक्ट के एक्जीक्यूटिव आफिसर, असिस्टेंट एग्जीक्यूटिव आफिसर और ग्रामपंचायत सुपरवाइजर के द्वारा। उन के हाथों में अधिकार दे दिये गये हैं। इस लिये अब जनता यही समझती है कि हम को ज्यादा से ज्यादा सरकारी यंत्र पर ही अवलम्बित होना है। मैं इस के खिलाफ नहीं हूँ। आप चाहें तो सार्वजनिक जीवन को बिल्कुल खत्म कर दीजिये लेकिन साथ ही सरकारी यंत्र को कुशल बना दीजिये ताकि वगैर किसी

तरह के सारा काम चलता रहे। अगर अधिकारियों को शिकायत का एक पोस्टकार्ड भी भेज दिया जायें तो वे तत्काल उचित कार्यवाही कर दें ताकि किसी को शिकायत न रह जायें। आज हमारे राजनीतिक दृष्टिकोण की यही हालत है।

अब मैं सामाजिक दृष्टिकोण के बारे में कुछ कहना चाहता हूँ। इनको सोशल सेंटरस बुले है। ५८,००० के करीब एडल्ट एजुकेशन सेन्टर बने हैं। सामाजिक स्थिति को बदलने के लिये, एक लाख ३८ हजार रिजियुवान सेंटर बने हैं। कम्युनिटी प्रोजेक्ट एरिया में २२ या २३ हजार स्कूल भी बने हैं। इन के अलावा यूथ लीग, महिला समिति और बालर वगैरह के लिये शालाये बनी हैं। इन तमाम चीजों के बनाने का उद्देश्य था कि लोगों के सामाजिक दृष्टिकोण में तबदीली की जायें। मैं समझता हूँ कि इस की बहुत आवश्यकता है। लेकिन आज उस काम की यह हालत है कि आज तीन बरस के बाद अगर कम्युनिटी प्रोजेक्ट हट गयी तो वह सोशल सेंटर गिर रहे हैं। कोई उन को मेन्टेन नहीं करता। मैं यह नहीं कहता कि लोगों में उन को मेन्टेन करने की क्षमता नहीं है क्योंकि हमारे यहां पहले गरीब लोगों ने कड़े कड़े काम चलाये हैं, जैसा कि मैं ने पहले कहा। लेकिन उन में इतना जोश पैदा नहीं किया गया है कि वे उन कामों को वगैर सरकारी सहायता के कर सकें। जब भी कहीं बाढ़ आती है या भूकम्प आता है, तो लोग स्वयं कुछ करने के बजाय यह समझते हैं कि सरकार उन को भिखा देगी। कम्युनिटी प्रोजेक्ट्स एरियाज में भी यही स्थिति है कि उन को आधा या एक चौथाई खर्चा दिया जाय, तभी वे काम करते हैं। एडल्ट एजुकेशन के केन्द्र ५८,००० खोले गये हैं, लेकिन प्रश्न यह है कि उन में कितने लोगों को शिक्षित किया गया है। पहले यहां घंटाख प्रतिघात शिक्षित लोग थे। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि इन पांच वर्षों

में आप ने वह परसेंटेज कितना बढ़ाई, कितने एडल्ट लोगों को शिक्षित किया। यदि एक केन्द्र ने दस व्यक्तियों को—या सौ व्यक्तियों को—भी शिक्षित किया हो, तो संख्या लाखों करोड़ों तक पहुंच जाती है। जहां तक स्कूलों का सम्बन्ध है, यह कितने शर्म की बात है कि यू० पी० हो या बिहार या कोई और राज्य, पेरेन्ट्स अपने बच्चे को किसी स्कूल में भेजें—वह स्कूल म्युनिसिपल कमेटी का हो, या डिस्ट्रिक्ट बोर्ड का, बेसिक हो या कम्युनिटी प्रोजेक्ट का—और उन्हें सन्तोष न हो कि हम ने अपने बच्चे को किसी अच्छे स्कूल में भेजा है। सब जगह यही स्थिति है। जो समृद्ध हैं, वे तो अपने बच्चों को सेंट ग्रेवियर या अन्य पब्लिक स्कूलों में भेज देते हैं। साधारण लोगों को इन स्कूलों में सन्तोष नहीं है। हमारी योजना अच्छी है, इस में कोई सन्देह नहीं, लेकिन उस को पूरी शक्ति के साथ क्रियान्वित कीजिये। अगर कहीं भी कोई शिकायत हो, तो उस को दूर किया जाय।

मैं यह भी कहना चाहता हूं कि योजना के अन्तर्गत जो भी काम हुआ है, सोशल सेन्टर खोले गये हैं या एडल्ट एजुकेशन केन्द्र खोले गये हैं, वह सब कुछ उन क्षेत्रों में किया गया है, जहां रोड्ज हैं। इन्टोरियर में अभी तक प्रवेश नहीं हो पाया है, यद्यपि इस की कोशिश की जा रही है।

आज हमारे बीच पंडित जी हैं। सब लोग इन के इशारे पर चलते हैं और चलेंगे, लेकिन दिक्कत यह है कि हमारे यंत्र में दोष हैं। अगर कहीं भी कोई किठनाई होती है या लोगों को कष्ट होता है, तो बदनामी भी इन्हीं की होती है। देश को आगे बढ़ाने के लिये, कांग्रेस और सरकार की प्रतिष्ठा को बनाये रखने के लिये वह जो भी अपील करेंगे, जनता उस को स्वीकार करेगी। अगर वह कहे कि खाना नहीं है, उपवास करो, तो जनता उस के लिये भी तैयार होगी। लेकिन वह उस के लिये तैयार कब नहीं होगी? जब एक और माँगें हो रही हो, सीमेंट और लोहे

की चोरा हो रही हो, कुछ मोटरों पर चल रहे हों, तब लोग इस प्रकार की बात मानने के लिये तैयार नहीं होंगे। आज जरूरत इस बात को है कि हमारा जो यंत्र है, और जो कार्य-पद्धति है उसमें रैडिकल रिफार्म करें। यह ठीक है कि हमारी योजना की प्रशंसा में बहुत लोगों ने अच्छी अच्छी बातें कही हैं, लेकिन मेरा कहना यह है कि मैं ऐसी जगह से आता हूं, जहां के कम्युनिटी प्राजैक्ट के काम को तारीफ ज्यादा हुई है और जहां की प्रशंसा हुई है, उस की हालत यह है, जो कि मैं ने अर्धो वर्गन की है, तो फिर उन जगहों की क्या हालत होगी, जहां काम अच्छा नहीं हुआ है। आज इस बात की आवश्यकता है कि आप किसी दूसरी ऐजेंसी को भी मौका दें कि वह काम कर के दिखाये और हम देखें कि उस का काम कैसा है। यदि इन अड़चनों को दूर किया जा सकेगा, तो मुझे विश्वास है कि उत्पादन भी बढ़ेगा और वर्गहीन समाज की भी स्थापना होगी।

**Shri Tangamani:** Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, I have moved cut motions numbers 221 to 230, 832 to 839 and 844. I would also like to refer to the cut motions moved by my friends Shri Kumaran and Shri Sarju Pandey, and I will at the outset request the Hon. Minister to refer to these cut motions even if I do not enlarge upon the points raised in those cut motions.

I would like to say, the fact that the Community Development Ministry is coming forward with Demands for Grants, giving an opportunity for the Members of this House to express their opinion, is a welcome feature.

Again, I would like to suggest that there must be co-ordination not only between the various Ministries at the centre, but the Ministries at the centre and also in the different States. Such a co-ordination now exists in the Labour Ministry by way of periodic conferences between the various Labour Ministers. I submit, that has produced a very wholesome effect. If

[Shri Tangamani]

the same policy is adopted for this Ministry also, it would considerably help co-ordination and also in getting the co-operation of the people.

We know that there is sufficient literature on the subject. We have been told that there are as many as 87 publications, and we have been given valuable information about the working of the Ministry. It all reads very well on paper. As one of the hon. Members remarked earlier, something more than that is necessary.

During the five years ever since the scheme started in October, 1952, some hundred crores have been spent, and we are told that 259 post intensive blocks, 501 community development blocks and 1054 N.E.S. Blocks have been established; in other words, 1800 blocks are now functioning covering nearly 2,30,000 villages and a population of 130 million.

Now, during the Second Plan period a sum of Rs. 200 crores is going to be spent, and the objective is to see that the entire country is covered. For the next year we are told that about 753 more blocks will be introduced. Roughly, according to the reply given by the Minister to one of the questions luring the last session, each block covers about 100 villages and a population of 66,000. That sounds to be a really very impressive thing.

But, what I would like to say is that in a scheme such as this, which has been rightly termed by the hon. Prime Minister once that a revolutionary thing is happening in rural India, and the subsequent events have only added to my conviction, if such a revolutionary thing is to happen, let us dispassionately analyse the various aspects of the programme.

According to me, Sir, there are three aspects or three features of this programme. One is the development of agricultural production through loans, supply of seeds, fertilisers, implements and such other things. The second one is the development of community service like construction of roads, provision of drinking water etc. The third is, drawing in the co-

operation of the people. If these three things are to be achieved the willing co-operation of the people is necessary in the first instance and, secondly, the energetic and enthusiastic co-operation of all the political parties, social organisations and mass organisations like kisan sabhas, kisan sanghs or kisan congress must be ensured. Unless the willing co-operation of all these people is ensured, there will not be this revolutionary fervour which we want to be generated in the villages.

I shall illustrate my point further. My friends from Bengal, U.P., Andhra and also from Kerala have been telling me how at various levels the co-operation of the political leaders is not encouraged. At village levels when it is admitted that a particular worker is really a public worker his co-operation is not taken in, because if his co-operation is accepted, the party to which he belongs might strengthen its hold in that particular area. We find from these reports that at the State level, there is no non-official included in the State advisory committee. Only in the district level, we have got the district advisory committees and in these district advisory committees, the non-officials are either Members of Parliament or members of the local assemblies and some so-called social workers.

The Estimates Committee has also pointed out how there is reluctance on the part of these officials to discuss or co-operate with non-officials. I feel that they are reluctant because they are afraid of a certain hostility which has been developed by those who are in power. I believe I have said enough on that particular point. Hon. Members will bear with me when I say that this has got to be radically changed. I am appealing in all sincerity to the hon. Minister, who has had experience as administrator to go through this more carefully.

There was a questionnaire set by the committee which is now touring the country. I took pains to go through each item there and sent my

reply. I would request the hon. Minister to go through the replies to this questionnaire, at least the replies sent by the Members of this House. I would like to make certain suggestions, which I think are the best. There are these stages of these blocks—the initial stage called the N.E.S., the intensive stage called C.D. and the post-intensive stage. Formerly the budget allotment for N.E.S. was Rs. 7½ lakhs, C.D. Rs. 15 lakhs and post-intensive stage Rs. 1 lakh. Now it has been reduced to Rs. 4 lakhs, Rs. 12 lakhs and Rs. 30,000 respectively. In the post-intensive block, with which I had something to do, I find that because of lack of finance, enthusiasm is gradually dying out. It is all right to say that the initiative must come from the people. But when people have not gone fully into the spirit of this, unless assistance is given to them I am afraid it is likely to die down.

Another point I would like to mention is the question of supply. There are several villages where manures and other things have to be supplied. The stores are available only at the block centre and the villagers have to go to these block centres. If mobile vans or some other arrangements are provided at Government's expense by which these manures can be taken to the villages, it will considerably help them.

Another point is the fixing of targets. Targets are necessary. In fixing targets, it should not be targets fixed by the Deputy Commissioner or the E.O. It must be fixed at the block level. The block advisory committee must go into it in great detail. Unless they fix the targets, certain unreal things develop. My friend from Malabar told me how in a particular block, they stipulated that 20 wells should be dug, but they found there was no place to dig a well, because there was plenty of water. They had to go to the hills to find a place for digging the well. In Madras State, the hon. Minister knows that in Palani taluk in Madurai and in the Palladam taluk in Coimbatore, the need is not for construction of roads and houses;

what they require is good drinking water. Drinking water is not available even for the caste Hindus. So far as the Harijans are concerned, they have got a dual responsibility. Whenever a block development officer is approached by the Harijan community, he says, there is Harijan welfare officer who is going to dig this well. Already there is a scheme pending from 1952 onwards. Ultimately in several villages, not even a single drinking water well is dug. Apart from the Harijan communities, there are other backward classes in the Thirumangalam taluk, called mukkulathars. The block development officer asks them to approach the Harijan welfare officer and the welfare officer asks them to approach the block development officer. So, there is not only lack of co-ordination, but there is lack of imagination and understanding of the problem.

The Health Ministry knows the need for health centres. We are told we are going to have thousand health centres. Already we are having 1800 blocks and at the rate of one centre per block, it comes to 1800 centres. More and more blocks are going to come up. Our target must be at least one health centre in one particular block. That should be the objective and there must be mobile vans to carry the patients to these health centres. Another point I want to impress is the need for maternity homes. There must be at least one maternity home per block.

There is another matter which I would like to mention here, though it is of a controversial nature. We always find that a step-motherly treatment is given to the south. Rightly there is agitation in the minds of the people that the south is being ignored. If we take the budget figures here under this head, the total is Rs. 14 crores. About Rs. 10 crores have been allotted to the various States. Just for the sake of information, I may point out that Madras, Kerala and Andhra put together get Rs. 172 lakhs; Uttar Pradesh gets Rs. 164 lakhs; Bihar gets Rs. 112 lakhs; Madhya Pradesh gets Rs. 124

[Shri Tangamani]

lakhs. I am not grudging it, but I am only pointing out that hardly one-sixth is given to three States—if you include Mysore, it is one-fifth. In allocating the grants to the various States, we must really take into consideration the need of the particular States also; otherwise it gives rise to the controversy that the South is being ignored.

Another point I would like to mention is about visits to foreign countries. Already we have had two teams which visited foreign countries. My submission is that visits to foreign countries must stop here and now. One team visited the whole of Europe and Israel and another team visited United States and South-east Asia. I do not know what new things they are going to bring for the understanding of rural problems in this country. Have we not got experts who can study and know, without going to foreign countries, the problems which are facing us in our country? Already we have copied from America. The very name 'extension scheme' is copied from the American agricultural extension service. Having copied it, let us now make it more national. Let us now stop the mania for sending study teams to foreign countries. Let us have detailed reports of the study team which is now travelling the country as soon as possible. We are told it will be ready by the end of August; let us have it as soon as possible.

There is another point, to which particular reference has been made by the Estimates Committee in their recommendation No. 78. There is another recommendation No. 47, which I would like to read with your leave. It is contained in the Estimates Committee report, Part II, December, 1956:

"The committee note that the position in respect of training of mid-wives is not satisfactory, as only 657 have been trained and 118 are undergoing training, out of a total of 10,096 required upto

the end of the second Five Year Plan period. The committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry of Community Development should seriously take up this matter with the Health Ministry to make satisfactory arrangements to complete the training...." etc.

So, now there is a proposal for training these midwives. The hon. Minister must go into the reason why people are not coming forward for this scheme.

Another point I would like to mention is the way in which the training centres are functioning. I do not want to say anything against any particular centre. I happen to know something of the centre at Gandhigram. It is mentioned as one of the important centres. But when we are spending one lakh of rupees we must know how the training is taking place and under what circumstances these things are going on.

One important point which is a basic point, I would like to mention. Even during the last Commissioners' Conference there was a discussion about gram dan. My submission is that gram dan should not form an excuse, or gram dan should not become a substitute for the urgently needed agrarian reforms. I am not referring to the ultimate programme which the Communist party would like to place before the country. There has been a Land Reforms Committee set up. The Land Reforms Committee has placed before us certain recommendations. Those recommendations are very simple. If there is a tenant he has to be given fair rent; if there is to be an agricultural labourer he must be given fair wages. There must be a ceiling fixed on the personal holdings and the surplus lands must be converted into collective farms, or co-operative farms where the agricultural labourer will have an opportunity to feel that he is tilling his own land. Unless the State Governments take adequate

steps to implement these fair recommendations, the community development scheme will be going in one way and the agricultural problem will be developing in another way.

As the hon the Prime Minister rightly pointed out the State Governments must whip up the question of land reforms I may mention about the State of Madras There was a land reform against eviction But what we find is that Government and the police force under them are very reluctant to touch even the landlords You find a different picture in the case of Kerala The recommendations of the Land Reforms Committee must be put into practice

Lastly, even in regard to land reforms, we find that the team which went to China are advocating co-operative farming Of course, co-operative farming will take some time, but what exactly is the idea of the Ministry regarding co-operative farming I may in this connection tell the hon Minister that in my constituency in Madurai district there is a co-operative farm of three hundred acres Some small peasants have combined together and the farm has been going on for more than a year Three or four months back but for my intervention there would have been murders What happens is that there is so much of confusion during the harvesting The tahsildar says that the harvested paddy must be put in another place and the villagers say they must have their share before it is pooled People are not yet attuned to the idea It is all very well to say that we have so many farms In Madras this is the only farm which is functioning, another one is going to be started in Coimbatore district and a third one in Chingleput During the last session, when the hon Minister was answering a question, the Minister for Agriculture said there were 1,400 to 1,500 co-operative farms I would like to know where they are The House is entitled to know how those are functioning and how they are going to be developed.

According to the recommendation of the Patil Committee we are to have at least one co-operative farm for 50 villages At that rate we must have for 5,06,000 villages, we should have 11,000 co-operative farms Are we in a position to do it? On that also I would like to have the hon Minister's views

In the end I would like to mention one point This is a minor point, but it affects the psychology of the people A certain block is made an NES block and then developed We find that two blocks are left out and a fourth block is taken as NES block. Care must be taken to see that the new blocks are contiguous blocks Otherwise it creates a false psychology If the blocks are going to be developed it must be contiguous As I said earlier, I would like the hon Minister to pay attention to the various cut motions which have been moved He will see that from top to bottom there is a heavily loaded administration and the benefits which go to the people are not consistent with the amount that is spent.

Shri A. C. Guha (Barasat). Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, I have great pleasure in supporting the Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Community Development It is its first demand as a separate ministry This is one of our important items of development works and it has been claimed to be the most important or the most revolutionary item of our development works It affects the fortune and future of 80 per cent of the population I would like in this connection to remind the House of what Gandhiji said about the rural areas and the rural people We should remember that even now Indian nationhood rests and lives in the villages If the villages are not resuscitated, it will be impossible to have a renovated Indian nationhood.

Sir, I think it would not be improper here to make some personal references to the present Minister who has devoted himself to this task. Leaving a very lucrative post he came forward as a voluntary worker

[Shri A. C. Guha]

and worked for nine years as a really honorary worker and that has actually meant serious privations not only for himself but also for his family. He has devoted his life to this work and now I am glad he has taken over charge of this Department as a Minister of the Government of India

Sir, in view of the importance that we all attach, in view of the importance that the Prime Minister also has given to this item, this House should act as a jealous guardian or watchdog of the progress achieved by the Community Development Department. In the first Plan, a sum of Rs 90 crores was earmarked for this Department, but it has not been possible to spend more than Rs 47 crores. This shortfall in expenditure should not by itself be taken as the criterion of its success or failure. I do not believe in the monetary target being taken as the standard of success of development work. Anyhow when we have spent Rs 47 crores and when the villagers have also contributed about Rs 26 or 27 crores either in kind or by their labour, and sometimes in cash, there must have been some physical or material assets created out of this huge amount. But, community development is not simply for the creation of some material assets in the rural areas. It is for developing mainly the human resources, to change the entire psychology and the mental make up of the people of the rural areas. If the work of this department is to be judged, it should be judged only from that point of view. There are many other nation-building departments, the Education department, the Health department, the Irrigation department, the Food and Agriculture Department, etc. All these departments must have been creating so many physical assets in the rural areas. So, I say, that is not the main function of this department. Its main function is to change the psychology and mental make up of the rural people. I should ask this House and the Minister himself to judge the

achievement of this department from this point of view

The pivot in the whole community development work is the village level worker, or gram sevaka. He is the man who has to change the psychology of the village people. He is the friend, philosopher and guide of the village people. But, we find that due to official outlook, the village level worker has been converted into a work supervisor. He has to distribute seeds, distribute fertilisers and supervise the construction of roads and other things. In the ultimate analysis, he has hardly any time left for him to work for the real purpose for which he was meant. His real purpose was to work as an extension worker, to work among the villagers, to move among them, talk with them, mix with them and live with them.

Recently, two reports are available to us. One is the Fourth Evaluation report and another is the Forty-fifth Report of the Estimates Committee.

An Hon. Member. What is the date of the Estimates Committee report?

Shri A. C. Guha. December 1956,—not very old.

We find that the village level worker has become an official. I do not like to quote passages from here, as the hon. Minister must have intensively studied these reports. He can easily find out these passages. This is the word used, that they have developed an official attitude and their behaviour is more as an officer than as an extension worker or as a social worker. This, I consider to be the most regrettable portion of the work of this department. Unless that can be changed, I think the whole purpose of the community development programme would fail.

In a CD block, there are 10 male gramsevakas and two gramsevikas. I do not say that the construction works, distribution of seeds and fertilisers and other things should be neglected. I think the hon. Minister

can easily allot five of these V.L. Workers for the supervision, and other things, and five should be left to work as extension workers. If all the ten cannot be allotted for that purpose, at least, out of ten, five can easily be left to work as extension workers and five can be left for supervision of works and other things and both the Gram Sevikas should be left free to work as extension workers.

There are several items of work undertaken by this department in the Block areas. One of them is the distribution of loans. I think it is better this has not been undertaken. The Fourth Evaluation Report has very adversely criticised this and has even said that this has created a bad psychological effect on the village people. There are so many agencies for the distribution of loans, co-operative societies, land-mortgage banks, and several departments of the Government for takkavi loans, for grow more food loans, and other things. So this is unnecessary reduplication. The worst part of this is that these CD Block loans are available at a lower rate of interest than a co-operative society loans. It is thus competing with the co-operative societies as regards distribution of loans. One of the purposes of the CD Block is to develop the co-operative spirit and co-operative institutions. But, if by its own activity, it undermines the co-operative credit societies, it destroys the credit and prestige of the co-operative institutions. By giving loans at a lower rate of interest than the co-operative societies can afford to give. Moreover these loans have not helped the poorer section as much as the wealthier. I think it is neutralising its own purpose. I do not like to say many things on this aspect. I would rather refer the hon. Minister to Chapter XIV of the Fourth Evaluation Report. Again, I would say, I am sure he has read that report carefully. I think this work may better be dropped in the C.D. Blocks. Rather, these attempts should be to develop co-operative societies.

In that respect also, whatever co-operative ventures have been successful, they are mostly credit societies, not other societies. For example, co-operative societies for handicrafts, for marketing, for warehousing, all these things have not progressed properly. These are more important than simple credit societies. I think that aspect also should attract the attention of the hon. Minister.

I have said that the psychological effect that was expected out of this community development work has not been achieved. One of the reasons, as I have mentioned, is that the gramsevaks have not been allowed to function properly. Another is that the Advisory Committees of the Blocks or the districts have more or less been neglected. Again, I would refer the hon. Minister to the Fourth Evaluation Report. It has been definitely said there that there is a sort of reluctance on the part of the officials to treat the Advisory Committees with proper regard and respect. The selection of the members and the composition of the Advisory Committee also is done in a haphazard way as if it were one of so many other means of distributing patronage by the officers. Those who may have taken some interest in social work should have preference to those who may be enjoying a privileged position in society due to their wealth or family status. Very often, the officials prefer the latter class of people, wealthier people and those belonging to the better social status, and not those who might have made a mark as social workers. In this respect I can understand the helplessness of the Minister in the Central Government.

16 hrs.

My experience has been that whenever any development work or any programme is undertaken in collaboration with the State Government, only a sort of left-handed co-operation is afforded by the State Governments to the Central Government. I think only yesterday the Minister of State for Industries in reply to a



[Shri A C Guha]

question said that certain sums are given to the State Government for development of small-scale industries, but after that the Central Government has little say as to how the sum is to be spent or which are the industries to be helped. Similarly, I think here also the hon Minister may more or less be a helpless victim in the hands of the State Governments, but I think it should be taken up at the proper level that the advisory committees should be properly utilised.

I can remember five years ago when the community projects idea had been just started, we as members of the advisory committees used to receive letters to attend the committee meetings with a foot note that the advice of the advisory committees need not necessarily be binding on the officials. We raised this point with the Minister then in charge, Shri Nanda. Of course, he shared our indignation, but from the reports that I have been reading I do not think things have progressed any farther from that date.

Shri Raghbir Sahai (Budaun) But the same remark is not quoted in the notices.

Shri A. C. Guha: That might be, but the same mental attitude is there. Only they are not doing it so bluntly, they have become clever.

I think I am using some hard words in this respect. That is because I really want the Minister to take it seriously and unless he can make the advisory committees really effective and really representative of the local people I do not think the necessary psychological change can come about.

Now the community development blocks are facing a sort of crisis. What was known as the intensive programme is over. Now some of the blocks are changing to the post-intensive programme. In the intensive period the budget was Rs 22 lakhs for each block and subsequently it was reduced to Rs. 12 lakhs for 3 years, but now for the post-inten-

sive period the budget is just barely Rs 2 lakhs for three years and the result is there is a complete stoppage of work. The staff is there. Out of this Rs 2 lakhs I should mention, almost more than half would go for the staff because I believe the staff will remain almost the same, the gram sevaks and others, but they will not have that money at their disposal, they will not have the work with which they were keeping themselves busy so long. So, a sense of frustration has come over them. They find they have to pass a rather tiresome and idle life. This aspect has also been commented upon both in the Estimates Committee Report and the Fourth Evaluation Report. I think the Minister should pay some attention to this.

Moreover, he knows that it will not be possible to maintain most of the material assets created by the intensive programme during the post-intensive period. That is the apprehension expressed in both these reports. What would happen to those institutions—the roads, wells, schools etc.?

I think the Member preceding me or Dr Ram Subhag Singh, either of these two, has mentioned that it is not that the village people have not the means to maintain these things, but they have not the mind to maintain these things. It is undoubted that due to so many development works, due to improvement in irrigation and methods of cultivation there has been a significant change in the financial position of the village people. So, it may not be quite difficult for them to maintain these things if they have got the proper mind to do that.

Then I should mention something about handicrafts and small-scale industries. Whatever improvement has been done in agriculture has not been seen in handicrafts and small-scale industries. I come from West Bengal. With its very limited agricultural potentialities and high density of population, it is an imperative necessity for the West Bengal

villages that there should be well-organised small-scale industries in the rural areas. So, I attach great importance to this aspect; but so far not much has been done about this. A few minutes ago I mentioned that co-operatives, neither for handicrafts and industries nor for the processing of agricultural goods nor for warehousing and marketing, have developed properly in the block areas. But only through these co-operative societies can they develop the small-scale industries and handicrafts. These co-operatives should be organised.

There is also another psychological aspect. The village people are quite eager to take advantage of any facilities offered by the community development programme or by the Government. They take it that it is the obligation of the Government to render all these services, but when it is a question of properly handling the institutions or maintaining the institutions, the same amount of enthusiasm is not to be found. A tube well or an artesian well they would very much like, but when it is a question of properly maintaining it or keeping the water clean and pure, they will not abide by the instructions, or they will not care to look to the instructions given by the community development officers. On the medical side also, they will take medicine easily. Rather, I find from the reports that there is a craze for injections. But on the sanitary side they would be completely lacking. They will not take care to keep their houses and their precincts clean and tidy. Just a few minutes ago the Minister in charge of Health was also referring to this aspect and asking for the co-operation of the Members of this House, so that when we go to our constituencies we may ask the people to observe the sanitary rules and regulations. But I feel that that should also be one of the items of work in these community development blocks, and the Community Projects Administration should instil this sense also in the minds of the village people, namely

that they must exert themselves, and that they must make some effort to improve their lot themselves, and not depend too much on Government. I am afraid that some of our activities, particularly in the field of community development, have given rise to this attitude in the minds of people that it is an obligation on the part of Government to render these services, while there is no such obligation on their part to help themselves.

I know they have contributed to the extent of Rs. 25 to 26 crores. But that is for the achievement of some material assets, some physical assets. But when it comes to a question of maintaining these things, when it is a question of exerting themselves in other matters, where material asset is not the real target but something else is the goal, they are not so much enthusiastic. This aspect also should attract the attention of the Minister.

If I have pointed out all these defects, it should not be taken to mean that I am out to condemn the community development blocks. As I have stated before, we consider this to be one of the most important items of our development works, and as such, we, as Members of this House, should be jealous guardians of their achievements and their reputation, and it is from that point of view that I have tried to point out these defects, and I hope these will be looked into by the Minister.

जीवरी लक्ष्मीबाई (बिकाराबाद) :  
समापति जी, कम्यूनिटी प्रोजेक्ट्स के बारे में ध्यानरेबल मेम्बरज ने जो बिचार प्रकट किये हैं, मैं मानती हूँ कि उन में काफी सच्चाई है; लेकिन इस का मतलब यह नहीं है कि कुछ काम नहीं हुआ है। काम तो हुआ है, लेकिन अगर वह धीरे-धीरे होता तो अच्छा होता। सरकार यह समझ रही है कि हम गांव वालों के लिये करेडों रुपये सर्क कर रहे हैं और उन लोगों के लिये कोई भी बिबाध इतना काम नहीं करता,

### [भीमती लक्ष्मी बाई]

जितना कि कम्प्यूनिटी डेवलपमेंट का विभाग कर रहा है, परन्तु फिर भी गांव वालों में सँटिसफ़ेक्शन नहीं है। हकीकत यह है कि जो करोड़ों रुपये सरकार खर्च कर रही है, उन का ६५ परसेंट, बल्कि उस से भी ज्यादा, एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन पर खर्च होता है। एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन वाले चाहते हैं कि वह बहुत अच्छी अच्छी रिपोर्ट्स लायें, अच्छी अच्छी फ़ाइलें लायें, बहुत सुन्दर सफ़ेद किताबें छापें। ऐसा ही इन लोगों का ढंग होता है। बाकी ३५ परसेंट रुपया गांव वालों के लिये खर्च किया जाता है और वह बहुत कम है। गांव वालों को जो कांट्रीव्यूशन देना होता है, जो श्रमदान वगैरह करना होता है उस को वे देते नहीं हैं, जिस का परिणाम यह होता है कि उन की भलाई के लिये किये जाने वाले कामों पर बहुत थोड़ा रकम खर्च होती है। जिस प्रकार एक नानी उर्ध्वो ज्यों प्राये बढ़नी जाती है वह छोटी-सी डोनी जाती है और उस का पानी कम होता जाता है, और प्राये चल कर वह एक बिलकुल छोटे से छब में रह जाती है उसी प्रकार कम्प्यूनिटी प्रोजेक्ट्स के लिये खर्च किये जाने वाले रुपयों की दशा डोनी है। कई माननीय सदस्यों ने सही बाने बाई है परन्तु प्रश्न यह है कि इस का उपाय क्या है। केवल कार्टे करने से काम नहीं चलेगा इस का कुछ रास्ता निकालना चाहिये। हम सम्बन्ध में मुझे जो तज़ूर्बा है उस के आधार पर मैं अपने कुछ सुझाव देना चाहती हूँ।

हैदराबाद में मेरी कांस्टीब्यूएन्सी, बांस-बाड़ा, निज़ामाबाद डिस्ट्रिक्ट, में कम्प्यूनिटी प्रोजेक्ट शुरू हुआ। वहाँ पूरा एक साल उस योजना को समझने में लग गया। दूसरे साल उस योजना को समझ लिया गया और तीसरे साल काम होने लगा। काम भी अच्छा हुआ। लेकिन काम का होना या न होना तो सिर्फ़ आफिसरों के ऊपर निर्भर है। हर एक आफिसर को अपने काम में

दिलचस्पी नहीं होती है। मैं समझती हूँ कि लगभग ७० परसेंट आफिसरों—डिप्टी सेक्रेटरी डिप्टी क्लेक्टर वगैरह जो छोड़ कर—ऐसे होते हैं, जो जीप के लालच से इस डिपार्टमेंट में आते हैं। जैसाकि मैं ने अभी कहा, हमारे यहाँ अच्छा काम हुआ। मेरी महोदय को यह मालूम है। वहाँ एक आफिसर बहुत अच्छा काम करने वाले थे। उन का अच्छा शौना ही एक गुनाह हो गया। उन को यहाँ पर ला कर रख दिया गया। वहाँ पर और दूसरे कई साकों में काम को देख कर मैं इस नतीजे पर पहुँची हूँ कि गांवों में वास्तविक काम के लिये मासिकल से पच्चीस परसेंट रुपया बचता है—एक रुपये में से सिर्फ़ चार आने उन के लिये बच रहते हैं। जैसाकि मैं ने अभी कहा है, गांव वाले अपना कांट्रीव्यूशन नहीं करते हैं, इसलिये बहुत थोड़ा काम हो पाता है।

दूसरी बात मैं यह कहना चाहती हूँ कि गांव में जा कर काम करना बहुत आसान नहीं है। शहर में काम करना सरल होता है। वहाँ पर लाउडस्पीकर लगाया, लोग आयेंगे और बात सुनेंगे परन्तु गाँवों में नैक्बर का काम नहीं है। वहाँ तो काम करना ही पड़ेगा। जिस प्रकार मैं अपने बीमार बच्चे के साथ व्यवहार करती है, उसी प्रकार गांव वालों के साथ व्यवहार करना पड़ता है। गांव वाले पढे लिखे तो होते नहीं हैं। उन को समझाना पड़ेगा कि पंच-वर्षीय योजना क्या है। उन को सबक देना पड़ेगा। गांवों के ऊँचे नीचे, गरीब धनी, पटेल पटवार आदि कई वर्गों के और कई प्रकार के लोग होते हैं। वहाँ पर गरीब से जा कर बात करो, ती धनी गरीब हो जाते हैं, धनी के पास जायें, तो गरीब लोग गरीब हो जाते हैं। पटेल के पास जा कर बात करें, ती दूसरे लोग गरीब हो जाते हैं। इसलिये कठिन परिस्थितियों में काम करने के लिये फिर ही

लगाया जाता है ? एक बीस स.म के लड़के को यह काम कर के लिये विलेज बर्कर बना दिया जाता है, जोकि मट्रिकुलेशन की परीक्षा पास कर के धनी धनी भ्राता है, जिस को न काम करने का डंग भ्राता है, न तजुर्बा होता है और जिस को सब बातों का ज्ञान भी नहीं होता है। जाने से पहले उस को बस महीने की ट्रेनिंग दी जाती है। और उस ट्रेनिंग में क्या होता है ? एक दो विषयों के कुछ लैसन्य दे दिये जाते हैं। विलेज बर्कर की उम्र भी बड़ी होनी चाहिये और उस के पास तजुर्बा भी होना चाहिये। उस को सब छोटे बड़े के साथ व्यवहार करने का डंग भ्राता चाहिये लोगों को अपनी बात समझाने का तरीका भ्राता चाहिये। उस को सब छोटी छोटी बातों का पता होना चाहिये तभी वह सकल हो सकता है। हम देखने हैं कि गांव में बनिये की दुकान में सब छोटी बड़ी चीजें रहती हैं, तब ही उन को दुकान चलती है। उस को गांव के लोगों की हर एक छोटी से छोटी जरूरत की चीज रखनी पडनी है। अगर वह ऐसा न करे, तो वह दुकान चल नहीं सकती है। इसी प्रकार विलेज बर्कर के पास तजुर्बा, हिकमत, प्रेम और अच्छा का होना बहुत जरूरी है।

यह मैं अपनी कानस्टिच्यूटरी के एक गांव इन्डायीम पेट जोकि बांमबाडे ताल्लुके में है, को एक बटना सुनायी हूँ। एक बार मैं वहां पर दौरा करने गई, तो पूरा गांव मेरे पास आया। उन्होंने शिक्षायत की कि विलेज बर्कर ने एक धावनी को मारा। मैं ने पता लगाया तो मालूम हुआ कि एक बार वह गांव गया और लोगों से कहा कि परतों मिनिस्टर भा रहे हैं, इसलिये कल तक सब घरों को प्रच्छी तरह साफ कर लेना। वह हट लगा कर, पैट पहिन कर गया और लोगों से यह बात कही और बहुत अधिकार जमाया। वे लोग अपने सेती और इरिनेशन के काम में मसरफ़ वे, इसलिये, ऐसा न कर सके। दूसरे दिन वह फिर गया

और पूछा कि सफ़ाई क्यों नहीं की। उन में से किसी ने कहा कि नहीं की, तो उस बर्कर (Worker) ने उस धावनी को मारा। इस पर तमाम गांव बिगड़ गया। फिर मैं वहां गई और उस विलेज बर्कर को समझाया कि इस प्रकार काम नहीं चल सकता है। मैं ने लोगों की कहा कि टोकरा, झाड़ू लाओ, मैं ने खुद भी उन के साथ काम किया, तब वहां सफ़ाई हो गई।

इस प्रकार की छोटी छोटी रुकावटें इस काम में आती हैं। जैसाकि मैं ने कहा है, काम बहुत हुआ है, मगर जितनी प्रपेक्षा हम लोग करते थे, उतना नहीं हुआ है। इस के भ्रसाबा विलेज बर्कर का सारा समय तो रिपोर्ट लिखने और दफ़तर का दूसरा काम करने में खर्च हो जाता है। गांव में काम करने का तो उसे वक्त ही नहीं मिलता है। उस को 15, पच्चीस गांव मिले होते हैं और एक साइकिल उस के पास होती है। ज्यादातर वह हेडक्वार्टर में रहता है और कभी कभी गांवों का चक्कर लगा जाता है। मेरा कहना यह है कि इस तरह काम नहीं होता है। जिस तरह बनिये की दुकान पर हर प्रकार की छोटी से छोटी चीज होती है, उसी प्रकार विलेज बर्कर के हर एक हालत में काम करने का डंग भ्राता चाहिये और उस को सब छोटी छोटी बातों का ज्ञान होना चाहिये। आज के विलेज बर्कर काबिल नहीं होते हैं। उन को कोई तजुर्बा नहीं होता है। किसी से बात करने का हीसला उन को नहीं होता है। गांव में बड़े बड़े तीस मार जा होते हैं, पटेल पटवार होते हैं। उन सब के साथ व्यवहार करने का डंग उस को भ्राता चाहिये। उस को वह मालूम होना चाहिये कि किस तरह गांव वालों को काम में रखा जाय। हमारे यहाँ एक डिप्टी क्लेक्टर था। वह बहुत प्रच्छा काम करता था। वह कभी भी अपने घर में नहीं रहता था। वह रात दिन काम करता था। जिस प्रकार बीकृष्ण यमुना के पास

### [श्रीमती लक्ष्मीबाई]

बंसी बना कर सब नोपाकों को साथ लेते थे, सब को ले कर उसी प्रकार वह भी काम करता था और सब लोग उस से बड़े लुभा थे।

मेरा सुझाव यह है कि चार्ल्स साल की उम्र वाले, तजुबे'कार प्राथमी इस काम के लिये रखने चाहियें। अगर कोई लिखने का, टाइप करने का या रिपोर्ट लिखने का काम है, तो कोई गुमास्ता या राइटर रख लेना चाहिये। प्राय कल मैट्रिकुलेशन पास लड़के रख लिये जाते हैं। क्या उन से कोई बज्रुत का काम करवाना है, या कोई रिपोर्ट लिखवाना है? गांधी में काम करने के लिये उन लोगों को रखना चाहिये, जिन को इस बारे में कुछ तजुर्बा हो और जिन को इस काम में श्रद्धा हो।

एस० धार० सी० की जो सिकारिखें थीं उन पर जब धम्स किया गया या उस बन्त तेलेंगाना वालों ने यह चाहा या कि उन का धलंग से प्रान्त बनाया जाय। परन्तु उन कः इस मांग को स्वी पर नहीं किया गया है और उन को दूसरे प्रान्त के साथ मिला दिया गया है। वहां पर डेढ़ साल से कुछ काम नहीं हुआ है और सब काम ठप्प पड़ा हुआ है और वहां के लोग नाराज हैं। वहां पर गाड़ी बकी पड़ः है, उस में पैट्रोल नहीं है, बह्र भागे नहीं बड़ पा रही है। मैं प्रार्थना करता हूँ कि प्राप को इस और भी सोचना पड़ेगा। औरतों के क्षेत्र में काम तो बिल्कुल भी नहीं हुआ है बल्कि मैं तो यहां तक कहूंगी कि माइनस काम हुआ है। मैं यह भी देख रही हूँ कि जो विलेज लेबेनवर्कर होते हैं उन को उन प्रान्तों में ला कर काम करने के लिये रख लिया जाता है, वह जहां की भाषा को समझ नहीं पाते हैं। वे वर्कर दूसरो भाषा की ही समझने वाले होते हैं। वे वहां के रहस्य व रिवाजों की नहीं समझते हैं, वहां के लोगों का जो

रहस्य सहन का तरीका है उस को नहीं समझते हैं। प्राप जो औरतों को तथा लड़कियों को कम्प्युनिटी डिवेलपमेंट क्लास में रखते हैं, उन के बारे में प्राप ने यह कहा है कि वे कम से कम मैट्रिकुलैट होनी चाहियें। इस के बजाय मैं प्राप से यह प्रार्थना करती हूँ कि प्राप उन लड़कियों को रखें जो चाहे मैट्रिक न हों लेकिन तजुबे'कार हों। इस सम्बन्ध में मैं चाहती हूँ कि प्राप कस्तूरबा ट्रस्ट में से ट्रेन्ड (Trained) लड़कियों को लें, जो चाहे मैट्रिक नहीं हैं, बल्कि काफी तजुबे'कार हैं और मेहनती हैं। इन औरतों को लेडीस को बोली सीना सिलाना होता है तथा और दूसरे जो मोटे कपड़े सीना सिलाना होता है। इस काम को कस्तूरबा की लड़कियां बहुत अच्छी तरह से कर सकती हैं।

इन लोगों को जो वहां के रिवाज है उन से भी वाफिक होना चाहिये। मैं यह नहीं कहती कि प्राप बबरा कर काम करें। बबराने की कोई जरूरत नहीं है। जरूरत इस बात की है कि कोई रास्ता निकाला जाय और हम प्राप सोच विचार कर चलेंगे तो प्राप को रास्ता भी मिल जायेगा जिस पर चल कर प्राप कामयाब हो जायेंगे। वहां पर नन्दीकोंडा प्रोजेक्ट चल रही है। मन्जवान बच्चों को जो धरी कामयाब हो कर आते हैं उन को मदीकोंडा प्रोजेक्ट में लना दीजिये। वे बच्चे वहां अच्छा काम करेंगे बनिस्वत कम्प्युनिटी एरिया में। विलेज लेबेन वर्कर को लोगों के साथ मिलना जुलना होता है, छुन अछुत का खेरभाव मिटाना होता है, दिन रात उब के साथ रह कर उन के रिवाजों के साथ वाफिक होना होता है, उन की क्षाधियों तथा बज्रुतों में क्षाधिय होना होता है, उब जा कर कहीं यह काम-वादी के साथ कार्य कर सकता है।

घाप दूसरा प्लान शुरू कर चुके हैं। घाप में जो प्रोजेक्ट रिपोर्ट दी है, उस में मैं समझती हूँ बहुत ज्यादा एम्बेडेशन है। उस के अन्दर जब घाप १० रुपये बाण्डों की दरम्यात पर जर्ब करते हैं, लिख देते हैं, घासन में कहूँ की वेत हीजी है तो उस का हवाला दे देते हैं। यह ठीक नहीं है। यह जैसे ही हुआ कि स्ट्रेच मरर जिस तरह से किया करती है कि वह दिखाने में ही इंडलज करती है। घाप को रोयल मरर बन कर दिखाने का कोई कार्य नहीं करना चाहिये। घाप को काम ज्यादा करना चाहिये और दिखाना कम। घाप ने जो काम किया है उस को कितनी और को नहीं हिन्दुस्तान वालों को ही बतलाना है।

घाज सब से अधिक जिस चीज को घाजक्यकता है वह श्रद्धा की है और सैक्रिफाइस की है। घाप को रिपोर्टों को लोग नहीं समझ पाने हैं क्योंकि वे पढ़े लिखे नहीं हैं। उन को ग्रप जेनो इम्प्रेस कर सकने हैं जब घाप एकनुप्रती कोई काम करवा कर दिखायें। जिस तरह से एक डाक्टर बीमारी को जांच पड़ताल कर के ठीक प्रेसक्रिप्शन दे देता है, उसी तरह से घाप को बीमारों की तब तक पढ़ना चाहिये और अगर एक तरीके से बीमारों दूर न हो तो दूसरा तरीका अपनाना चाहिये। विलेज सेबल बर्कर्स के लिये जो घाप क्वालिफिकेशन की बात रखी है उस को घाप को जल्म कर देना चाहिये और उन के तबुर्दों को ही देखना चाहिये। यदि घाप ने ऐसा किया तो घाप का जो काम है वह अच्छी तरह से हो सकेगा।

वह जो हमेशा कहा जाता है कि "काम करो, काम करो" यह बहुत गलत है। हमें काम को खुद करना और तब दूसरों से करवाना चाहिये। हमें चाहिये कि उस के चालचलन में, उन के रहन सहन के तरीके में, उन के कपड़े में तबदीली लायें। हमें उन्हें सीका सावा जीवन ज्योत कराने के

लिये प्रेरित करना चाहिये। कम्युनिटी प्रोजेक्ट्स का मतलब यह है कि हम प्रेक्टिकल हों। केवल बातें करने से ही काम नहीं चल सकता है। तिल तिल करने से ही तेल नहीं निकल सकता है, हमें तिलों को कूटना पड़ता है तब आ कर हम तेल निकाल पाते हैं। हमें काम करना और तब दूसरों से करवाना चाहिये।

आजकल देखने में आता है कि जब कोई बड़ा प्रकृप आता है तो गांव के पास सड़क बना दो जाती है ता कि वहां से उस की मोटर गुजर जाय। अमरीका से कोई आता है या किनो दूसरे देश से आता है तब भी हम यही कुछ करते हैं। लेकिन घाज भावक्यकता इस बात की है कि जो सड़कों का हालत गांवों के इंडोरियर में है उस को हम मुबारें। गांव वालों को हमें बताना है कि जो आजादी हमें मिली है और जो हमारा राज्य हुआ है, उस के अन्दर हम उन्हीं के लिये काम कर रहे हैं और वे लोग तब तक सैटिसफाइड नहीं हो सकते हैं जब तक कि कुछ जोस कार्य उन को कर के हम नहीं दिखाने हैं।

हर जगह पर कम्युनिटी प्रोजेक्ट्स बने हैं, वहां पर इरिगेशन की सल्लियतें दी गई हैं, पानी भी वहां बहता है। परन्तु मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि बारषा सिस्टम की नैट्रिन्स बनाने का जो तरीका है वह गांव गांव में होना चाहिये। मेरी कांस्टिट्यूटों में कितनी ही बहनों ने मुझे इस के बारे में कहा है। उन के घाप इस समय बाहर जाने की सल्लियत नहीं है। घाप को चाहिये कि घाप ट्रेच लैट्रिन्स प्रोवाइड करें।

जो मुद लोग विलेज सेबल बर्कर्स को ट्रेन करते हैं उन को सोक पिट्स बनाना तो सिखा देते हैं लेकिन जो उन को मेनटेन करने का तरीका है, वह उन को भी नहीं आता है। जिस तरह से घाज्ज के बिना जो घाज्जी होता है वह बेकार हो जाता है

[ श्रीमती लक्ष्मी बाई ]

किसी काम का नहीं रहता है, उसी तरह से एक चीज को बना कर जब उस को मैनटेन नहीं किया जा सकता है तो वह भी कार हो जाती है ।

जो प्रेक्टिकल काम है वह आप को करना चाहिये । आप को गांव की जो बूढ़ी औरतें हैं वे बता सकती हैं कि क्या काम होना चाहिये और क्या नहीं होना चाहिये । आप को उन के तजुबे से कायदा उठाना चाहिये । आज गांवों में ६६ प्रतिशत औरतों के पास काम नहीं है, आप उन से काम ले सकते हैं । आज देखने में आता है कि विलेज लेवेल वर्कर को सी रपया मिलता है । लोगों के दिलों में यह ज्वाला होता है कि इस को सी रपया मिलता है लेकिन यह कुछ भी नहीं करता है । इस वास्ते उस को दो और तीन सी रपये का काम कर के दिखाना चाहिये और जब वह ऐसा करेगा तब जा कर लोगों के हृदय में यह भावना जागृत होगी कि जो यह इतना काम करता है तो हमें भी अवश्य काम करना चाहिये । आज लोग इस चीज को महसूस नहीं कर रहे हैं ।

अन्त में मैं इतना ही कहना चाहती हूँ कि आप जो एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन पर रपया खर्च कर रहे हैं उसे आप कम करें । जब आप ने पहली पंचवर्षीय योजना बनाई थी उस वकत आप को तजुबा नहीं था और स्कीमें बनाने में आप को बहुत देर लगी । अब आप को तजुबा हो गया है और जो मुटियां पहले आप को मालूम हुई हैं उन को हूर किया जाना चाहिये ।

इस से और अधिक मुझे कुछ नहीं कहना है, बन्धवार ।

Shri Khadilkar (Ahmednagar): Sir, the Community Projects programme under discussion needs to be examined from the point of view of results. After examining the results, if any, and if the achievements are found

to be disappointing, then we will have to examine whether the content of the programme is correct or needs some modification and whether the administrative apparatus is properly functioning and what the impact or the effect of the programme is on the villagers' minds. Obviously, this programme is intended to rehabilitate or re-construct the disintegrating village life and give the people there—or, as has been said bringing to the villages—a new look and a new life.

I have said that we will have to examine the failures in order to learn some lessons. We can find out its failures from the fourth evaluation report. I am not going into the details but I shall point out from the conclusions that have been drawn here—in chapter 5—that the results are not very encouraging. I would not read it at length because I want to say something else and so I would not waste my time over here. What is written here? Item involving change in social attitude—not particularly successful; items involving change in organisational attitude—comparatively unsuccessful; item involving change in organisational attitude in the economic field—comparatively unsuccessful. If you go through all of these items what do you find?

We discover it after four or five years our efforts have failed to produce desired results. The ideal was quite good. But, we have achieved very little. Whatever we have achieved is clear from these reports. Is it of any permanent value? Has the village life been affected in a particular manner?

I do not want to attach all these failures to the Ministry itself. The failure is inherent in the circumstances itself. In the modern context of the industrial civilisation, there is a disintegrating impact on the villages. There is a free market economy outside. The world economy reaches the villages at every neck

and corner. The economic targets placed before a movement of this kind are: creating a co-operative atmosphere for a co-operative endeavour, encouraging co-operative farming, providing for credit and developing local initiative removing stagnation and apathy that is all round—all this within the framework of the free market economy outside. The development programme is built up with a nucleus in an isolated village cut off from other places and it is supposed it would create a favourable climate for a co-operative economy.

In order to rejuvenate and reconstruct the village life, the main problem to be solved is the land problem. It has been rightly observed in this report that it has not been even touched to the fringe. The land reform is the basic thing for success of these programmes and you have to make a beginning somewhere.

The legislation is there; we have practically surpassed many other countries which have just become free in this field. But, from the point of results or implementation, there has been a complete failure. Unless you are prepared to introduce some reform in the land relationship, you cannot enter the core of the village life. You will only touch the fringe. You will go there if you have some missionary spirit, which the hon. lady Member wanted to introduce in the movement. You will reach them like an old Christian missionary. They will look at you because you have come with all the urban civilisation that is visible in your dress, speech, attitude etc. You are telling them: 'Look here, we are creating better conditions for you here.' It is not that there is no yearning to go to the cities that keeps them there. The only thing that keeps them in the villages is that they could not get better employment in the cities. The attraction of the city is there. You cannot provide alternative employment in the cities. Industrialisation is taking place and certain amenities are provided here and the influence of urban life has spread out.

An hon. lady Member complained just now about the pictures that were

pasted on the glass to hang them on the walls. You go to the villages. Along with our beloved Prime Minister, you will find the pictures of well known actresses, very popular in the city area on the walls of mud huts. That expresses the urge of the village people in some way.

As I said, you have got to examine the content of the programme. Can you develop a village on the basis of a co-operative economy? If you want to develop, you can dig and build a few wells, give them education and make some progress regarding agriculture. When you give them water, you do not give them other things. Good cultivation demands some credit. Have you been able to provide credit for them? Unless you give them credit facilities, benefits of water villagers cannot reap.

From my experience, I have known certain things. One of the best known officers was working in the Community Development programme. He was formerly Collector of Kolhapur. Before that, he was working in another area, known as Karjat area which is a backward and poor area compared to Kolhapur. He admitted that in that particular area which was a little better it was possible to achieve some results. So far as the other area is concerned—poorer area—where he was trying to show some results, the achievements were not comparable to what he could do in the Kolhapur area.

I am stressing this particular point because of certain point reasons. A person should be conscious that if he produces more, there is a market outside; he can get more. Then, he will participate in these programmes with a view to get certain immediate benefits. I could not get the results of the Poona University Survey here, but I know some of the conclusions that have been reached by them are almost similar to those given in this evaluation report. Some work has been entrusted to the Poona University and that is their andi.g.

There are certain defects in the existing set-up of the village. There



[Shri Khadilkar]

is a caste hierarchy. Certain dominant section takes the utmost advantage of whatever schemes are in operation. The Project officers usually get closer to such people. Those elements that are not in real need of immediate help, get such help.

I will just point out one thing from "A Guide to Community Development" an official publication. It has been stated in this guide:

"There must be realistic programmes to provide employment opportunities for village people. Planning and progress in health are less than adequate. Little has been done to improve rural credit facilities or terms, the village teacher and the village school are not realistically brought into the programmes. Little direct benefit of the programme trickles down to the landless labourers"

[page 203].

This is the particular thing which everybody ought to note, everybody who wants to bring about a little change, some little better conditions for our countryside people, because even in the Poona University Survey I was told the same conclusion is reached that is, everything depends on the leadership. If you get the right type of leadership in a village, and if you get the right type of officers with some little missionary zeal, then alone you can achieve results of a lasting nature; otherwise all these efforts shall have undesired consequences. Foreign visitors see things with their own glasses. They say it is magnificent, it is very good. When foreigners come they are bound to say this. I do not want to be guided by what others say or how others see it. I want to see things for myself, I want to see with my own glasses what I find in the village. Therefore, I would like to request the hon. Minister concerned to look at the problem in a realistic manner.

Another aspect of the problem must not be neglected, and that is the

administrative aspect. Our experience is, when I received some questionnaire from the Planning Commission or a sub-committee after I was elected, I could not reply to it. I take, I should think so, quite an intelligent interest in such aspects of social development. But I had no opportunity to observe what is being done in a community project area. Because we do not see eye to eye with the ruling party. Even now after the elections are over—unfortunately, for the party in power in some districts has suffered defeat—when the question of reconstituting village development boards and programme committees is hanging fire, no decision has yet been taken and they want to take it up with the ruling party; they want to provide jobs or positions for their men. On the other side what do I find. The Minister ought to take note of this. When the Bombay firing took place during the language agitation days, one of the workers was shot dead in Bombay. All his villagers gathered and said that they wanted to erect a small memorial for him. What did they propose? What was the urge of the people? They said that they shall collect money to construct a building for a school to be strated in his name. So, at the other end they only wanted a school, as a memorial for a martyr.

On the one side there is the people's urge for roads, wells, schools, a better life, a little progress, little development. They are ready to cooperate. On the other side, those people who have become bundles of frustration, because they could not get some place of power or position in a particular party, are moving around all over the place. These bundles of frustration and disappointment in the ruling party are moving about advising and pocketing particular officers. All these things are coming in the way. That is the greatest drawback in the system as you have developed.

Therefore, I would humbly urge, that this system of administration must be changed. From the Communist Party to the Congress Party every party is eager and all people are ready to co-operate. Invite their co-operation, their active participation and you will achieve better results.

I would like to place another before you. There are areas where because of water you can easily get commercial crops. For instance, there is Kolhapur which is a big market. There irrigation means sugarcane, sugarcane means certainly wealth and a motor car. That is almost a conclusion. Instead of selecting such an area for the community development programme, though you may not immediately get results, should concentrate on areas which are backward, poverty stricken, famine stricken, where communications are lacking, where people are eager to help you in order to better their own conditions. Unfortunately, such areas are neglected. Even this report says that the community development officers concentrate more where communications are easy. They do not want to go to hill sides, the far off neglected places and there, naturally, the radical politics has spread. Because radical politics has entered this area immediately you feel, all right, neglect it. Something is to be thrown to the people, some benefits are to be given, they are not to participate and no initiative from them should get encouragement. That is the whole approach.

Therefore, if you do not want to waste your efforts, the nation's efforts with this community project movement, I would very strongly urge that you change the administrative system. Change the whole approach. Take people into confidence. Whatever a man's politics may be, so long as he is prepared to co-operate with you, and not co-operate with a selfish motive to get at the helm of affairs in league with an officer, you must get his co-operation.

Another point is regarding the gram panchayats. It has been observed

here that you must try to entrust more responsibility to gram panchayats. I would suggest that if you get the right type of men as gram panchayat secretaries or serpanchs—I do not know what they are called in this part of the country—they will be of immense use in helping you in this processes of development.

Shri Heda (Nizamabad): They are elected.

Shri Kahdikar: I know they are elected, that does not matter. This panchayat secretary is a paid servant. If this machinery is made a little more active and entrusted with responsibility, I am sure you can enter the core of the life of villagers. After all, however much we might glorify sitting here the idiosyncrasy, the backwardness of the village life as it is today people living then know what a hard lot they are put to. In order to make life a little more comfortable, the surroundings a little more better, every effort must be mobilised from all quarters, so that the desired effects could be achieved within some measurable period.

Therefore, before concluding I would again repeat that unless village community development programme is prepared in some measure to insulate village economy from the impact of the free market economy in some fields, provide credit facilities and create a machinery with co-operation from all sections. I am afraid you will fail to achieve the good results that every side of this House and the people outside are expecting from this programme. But, if you could make an innovation on these lines I am confident that the Minister in charge with all his enthusiasm will be able to report next year better results.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: The following are the selected cut motions relating to Demands under the Ministry of Community Development which

[Mr. Deputy Speaker]

have been indicated by the members to be moved subject to their admissibility:—

Demand No.	No. of Cut Motion
7	719, 720, 114, 115, 149, 221, 222, 223, 224, 225, 226, 227 228, 229, 230, 582, 583, 584, 721, 722, 723, 724, 725, 726, 832, 833, 834, 835, 836, 837, 838, 839,
105	844.

*Manners of functioning which is unsuited to Kerala*

Shri Kumaran (Chirayinkil): I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced to Re. 1."

*Composition and functioning of Advisory Committees*

Shri Kumaran: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced to Re. 1."

*Training of Scheduled Tribe Officers*

Shri Ignance Beck (Lohardaga—Researved—Sch. Tribes): I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Control of lower staff by Development Officers*

Shri Ignance Beck: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*The composition of Local Advisory Committees of the Community Development*

Shri Jadhav (Malegao): I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development

Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Wastages in the working of the scheme*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Proportionately high cost of establishment compared to the amount spent on benefits*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Uneven allocation to different States*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Need for drawing up targets in consultation with B.D.O.S. and B.A.C.*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Necessity of including more non-officials in District Planning Boards and Block Advisory Committees*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Failure to associate non-officials at lowest level on political considerations*

**Shri Tangamani:** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Plight of Scheduled Castes in the National Extension Service and Community Development Blocks*

**Shri Tangamani:** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Mode of extending the scheme to new Blocks*

**Shri Tangamani:** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Failure to associate village panchayats in the low level committees*

**Shri Tangamani:** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Need to increase the total ceiling for National Extension Service and Community Development Blocks during post intensive development*

**Shri Tangamani:** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Failure to associate non-officials at village level*

**Shri P. G. Deb (Angul):** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Failure to impart the benefits of these projects and services to the common men and women of the country*

**Shri P. G. Deb:** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Policy and working of the Community Development Projects and National Extension Service*

**Shri P. G. Deb:** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Failure to make rural population participate in implementation of projects*

**Shri Kumaran:** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Failure to develop the spirit of team work*

**Shri Kumaran:** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Wastage in administrative expenses*

**Shri Kumaran:** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Failure to find marketing facilities for products of cottage industries.*

**Shri Kumaran:** I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development

[Shri Kumaran]

Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Failure to organise cooperative activity*

Shri Kumaran: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs 100."

*Failure to effect any change in the outlook of the people in the countryside*

Shri Balasaheb Patil (Miraj): I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs 100 "

*Composition and functioning of Advisory Committees at various levels*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100 "

*Inadvisability of Study Team's Tours in foreign countries in future*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move.

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs 100 "

*Desirability of early report of the present tour of Study Teams in the country*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Functions of Social Education Organisers' Training Centres*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development

Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Working of S.E.O. Training Centre at Gandhigram*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Adopting recommendations of the Indian Delegation to China regarding Cooperation*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100 "

*Selection of college students and teachers for grant of apprenticeship in village development works*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100."

*Scope of various seminars held and references for future seminars*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Community Development Projects, and National Extension Service' be reduced by Rs. 100 "

*Large sums set apart for incidental charges*

Shri Tangamani: I beg to move:

"That the demand under the head 'Capital Outlay of the Ministry of Community Development' be reduced by Rs. 100."

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: These cut motion are before the House.

**Shri Raghbir Sahai:** I am one of those who think that the community development idea is no longer a new idea. I feel it is a thing which has come to say. We have had at least five or six years' experience of the working for these projects. Everybody knows that the first 55 projects were started in the year 1952. Later on 53 blocks were started in 1953. After that every year, the blocks are being added on and at present there are more than 1800 blocks working all over the country.

The term of the blocks that were started in 1952 and 1953 has come to a close, and we have got big volumes of reports about the working of these blocks. During all this time the Programme Evaluation Organisation was submitting its reports from time to time. Also, during the last Parliament, on a non-official resolution, a full-dress debate took place on this subject. Thereafter, the Estimates Committee took up a close examination of the entire subject and from the speeches that have been made today, it appears that the reports of the Estimates Committee have been studied and digested by many of the Members. After that, this year we received a very compendious and elaborate volume containing the report on 20 blocks in the country. I congratulate Programme Evaluation Organisation on producing such an informative and instructive document on the subject. I am very sorry that such reports are not available with regard to the other blocks that have completed their term.

So far as the object of the community development goes, I think there can be no two opinions that the whole idea has been evolved with the best of motives by the best of brains in the country for the good of the village people as a whole. But there can certainly be two opinions with regard to the implementation, whether the implementation has been satisfactory or

not. I do not agree with the hon. friend who has just closed his speech when he said that very little achievements have been made in this direction. I do not think any other hon. Member who spoke today on this subject was of that view. But certainly there is a point to be considered by us whether, having regard to the large sums of money that have been spent over the entire scheme and the time taken, we have produced commensurate results. I am one of those who feel that great achievements have been made, but commensurate with the time that has been taken and the money that has been spent over it, the results are not satisfactory.

During the first Five Year Plan, we had spent something like Rs. 52 crores over community development and I am told that something like Rs. 26 crores were spent by way of people's contribution. So, it came to something like Rs. 78 crores. As I said, we have had five or six years' experience of the working of this programme. Let us see whether commensurate results had been achieved or not. I am basing all my remarks in this connection either on the strength of the reports that have been issued by the Programme Evaluation Organisation of the Community Development Ministry or my own personal observations in certain community development blocks. As I said, this volume is very instructive, full of information and gives us an idea of the real achievements and also the shortfalls. But I fail to find from this volume what achievement has been made in the social conditions of the people living in these blocks. Everyone of the hon. Members who has spoken today said, the main object of starting the community projects was to change the psychology of the man and to change the outlook of the village people. By social condition, I mean, whether any improvement has taken place in regard to their habits, for instance, their habit of drinking, illicit distillation, committing crimes and other anti-social activities in

[Shri Raghbir Sahai]

which these village people are sometimes engaged and whether any particular attention was being paid towards the building of the man. Shri Guha has spoken about the hon. Minister in such praise-worthy terms. We know what work he has done. He must be familiar with the remarks of the Prime Minister in this connection. About the building of the man himself, the Prime Minister said in 1952:

"These community projects appear to me to be something of vital importance, not only in the material achievement that they would bring about, but much more so because they seek to build the community and the individual and to make the latter a builder of his own village-centre and of India in a large sense."

I submit that men, who are addicted to drink, illicit distillation, committing crimes and other anti-social activities in those villages which are being benefited by the community development blocks, can certainly not build their community, village or the country. I do not think this aspect must have been ignored entirely by those who are really in charge of this work. But at least, this aspect has not been mentioned in this report. I would beg of the hon. Minister that in subsequent reports, we should have some idea about the change of outlook, about the change of social conditions of the people, in those areas which are covered by the development blocks.

We also find from the reports that in every block, the progress that has been made is not similar. On the other hand, we find dissimilarities almost everywhere. If we find that good progress has been made in certain blocks in certain items, then we find that in another block, progress has been made on other items, while there are certain other blocks where progress has been altogether unsatisfactory. With regard to this, I submit that this dissimilar

progress is due to the change of personnel from time to time. It was laid down in the First Five Year Plan and again in the Second Plan that those in charge of the community development work should not be frequently transferred. I beg to submit that that rule is being honoured more in breach than in observance. B.D.Os. are being changed; D.P.Os. are being changed. Project officers and collectors are being changed sometimes after a few months. Can you expect much progress in those blocks where the personnel is being transferred so frequently?

17 hrs.

We also find from this report that it is also due to the inadequacy of staff. There are many posts which lie vacant. Why should they? Either the B.D.D. is absent, or the project executive officer is absent, or the agricultural officer is absent. There are certain blocks where sufficient number of V.L.Ws. have not been posted. In these circumstances, do you expect the progress to be similar?

Now it is said that they are short of personnel. If you are short of personnel, why this craze for starting, for inaugurating more blocks? Take care of the personnel that you have got in your possession and if you have not got sufficient personnel, do not be hasty about inaugurating these blocks. That is my humble submission.

It is also said that these advisory committees in many places have proved to be ineffective. I quite agree. I agree with many of the reasons that have been given in the Evaluation report. But there is one more reason, apart from these, which have been given in these reports, why these advisory committees are ineffective. It is because people in charge of these advisory committees have not got sufficient knowledge of the area in which they work. For instance, the B.D.Os., the project executive officers or the A.P.Os., or A.D.Os. do not know the area, the men that inhabit those areas, their felt needs, their problems, and they have not got, over and above,

the willingness to take people into their confidence. Until and unless the B.D.Os. or the project executive officers, or the S.D.Os., or the collectors are fully informed of the area in which that block exists, how can he control the advisory committee. Individual demands will come of a personal nature, as they do generally come, and larger questions would be put aside. If those officers who are in charge of these advisory committees are fully posted with the information about those areas they can control the meetings and create interest. This is also one of the reasons for the ineffectiveness of these advisory committees.

One other point that I have noticed in this report is this. Although it is full of information and facts and figures, sometimes those figures are confusing. We cannot make out why they have been quoted. There are figures for how much seed has been distributed, how much manure has been distributed, how much area has been covered by new irrigation facilities and all that. But have they cared to give us some figures how much foodgrain production has increased. The vital problem in the country is increase in food production. All attempts are directed in that direction. But can we have any idea by how much food production has increased? Why should you not give those figures? The improved seed may have gone to waste; the improved manure may have gone to waste or the improved seed and the improved manure and irrigation facilities may have been directed towards producing more of cash crops. But we cannot sustain ourselves only by cash crops; potato, mungphali, sugarcane very good things in themselves, but until and unless we have more of wheat and more of bajra and more of maize and more of gram people cannot sustain themselves. Where is that emphasis on increase in foodgrains. I find that thing absent altogether from this report.

One other prominent thing that you will find in this report is that records are being generally not kept properly.

That is a general complaint. Now if records are not kept properly and if they are not checked properly, how can we rely on these figures with which this book is replete. Every volume is replete with figures. But the Programme Evaluation Organisation says that these figures are not reliable. There is no checking agency, there is no supervising agency. Then these figures are meaningless until and unless there is some agency to supervise the work.

Shri Shree Narayan Das (Darbhanga): How many agencies will be set up to supervise and inspect.

Shri Raghbir Sahai: My hon. friend asks how many agencies will be set up? Well, there is a hierarchy of people in the Community Development blocks and in this organisation. Any one of them can take up this work and discharge it. My grievance is that though the figures are generally given by V.L.Ws., why should they not be checked at the B.D.Os. level, at the D.P.Os. level. You need not add to the existing agencies, but you have to see that the present agencies are geared up.

For all these things which are enumerated and the other complaints that have been made today there is one remedy. The remedy is that your staff entrusted with this important work should be actuated by a missionary zeal. At present it lacks that zeal. How can it have a missionary spirit and zeal when the recruitment is haphazard? What do you do? You take one man from the Agricultural Department; you take another from the Revenue Department; a third from the Cooperative Department and a fourth from the Veterinary Department and you put all these gentlemen together. They are all anxious to go back to their parent departments to improve their prospects, instead of doing their work. Until and unless you create a special cadre for doing this work nothing can be achieved.



[Shri Raghbir Sahai]

I was looking into the latest report that has been issued by this Department and I was simply amazed that training of village level workers is being done under the Ministry of Agriculture; training of social education organisers and block development officers under the Ministry of Community Development; training of extension officers in industry under the Ministry of Commerce and Industry and training of extension officers for co-operation under the Ministry of Cooperation with the Reserve Bank of India. What is all this? I was reminded of a crude Hindi proverb:

कहीं की रोट, कहीं का रोड़ा, बान्मती ने  
कुन्ना जेड़ा।

What is all this? Though the persons who would give the training may be taken either from the Agricultural ministry or any other only in that case the staff working in the Community Development would be expected to be imbued with the requisite spirit. All this training should be conducted under the auspices of the Community Development Department.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: The hon. Member must conclude now.

Shri Raghbir Sahai: One or two minutes more.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: I have every regard for the hon. Member, but I have been seeing that they are encroaching upon the privileges of the Chair. The earlier speaker when I rang the bell said he would take five more minutes. He assumes to himself the authority to take as much time as he likes. I have to adjust how much time a Member should be given, and it is not for the Member to decide how much time the Chair should allow him.

Hon. Members should respond to the bell when it is rung; because it is they themselves who have placed this

restriction on themselves. It is their own imposition and they should not think that it is coming from outside. Unless we adjust ourselves to that it would not be possible to complete our work within the time-limit that we have imposed.

Shri Raghbir Sahai: I will obey the Chair and finish my speech with the remark that all these points that I have made should be taken in the spirit in which they have been offered by way of constructive criticism.

With these remarks, I support the grant.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Paadit D.N. Tiwary. He will have to finish at 5.28 because I want to call upon an hon. Member from this side of the House before we rise.

Pandit D. N. Tiwary (Kesaria): I shall require at least 15 minutes.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Fifteen minutes would be all right.

पं० ह० ना० तिवारी : उपाम्यज महोदय, कम्युनिटी डेवेलपमेंट का काम जिय नियम मे शुरू किया गया है और जो हम का प्राइमेट था, आज हमें पांच वर्ष ब्यतीत होने के बाद यह देखना है कि क्या वह पूरा हुआ है या नहीं। बहुत से डेवेलपमेंट स्टाफ्स गवर्नमेंट द्वारा बोले गये हैं और जब हम ने इन को बोला था उस वकत हम ने यह धारा की थी कि पांच वर्षों के अन्दर ये स्टाफ्स रीटों पर लगे हो जायेंगे, इस के बाद इन को सरकारी महायता नहीं मिलेगी। हाँ हम ने यह कहा था कि कुछ सलाह अवर ये चाहेंगे, कुछ टैकिंग्स एव यदि ये चाहेंगे तो वह इन को मिलती रहेगी। आज हमें यह देखना है कि क्या ये स्टाफ्स अपने रीटों पर लगे हो सके हैं या नहीं। आज हमें यह

देखना है कि क्या हम ने उन में इतनी ताकत भर दी है कि जिस के धासरे वे भागे अपना कार्य चला सकें ।

यह ठीक है कि देहातों में जो बी० डी० बी० साहब है वे मोटरों में घूमते हैं । मैं यह मानता हूँ कि मोटरों में उन के लिये घूमना भी जरूरी है लेकिन इस के साथ कुछ बेस्टेज भी हुआ करती है । बहुत सा पैट्रोल वे अपनी एंटरटेनमेन्ट के लिये भी खर्च कर देते हैं । यह ठीक नहीं है । इसको रोका जाना चाहिए ।

एक किसान गवर्नमेंट ने जिकाली भी धीर उसका नाम था "एच भद्रम सी इट" या "धू भद्रसं घाइच" । इसमें तारीफों के पुल बांधे गये थे । बात यह है कि दूर के जो लोग आते हैं उनको बही गांव दिनाये जाते हैं जिन की हालत अच्छी होती है ताकि उन पर जो इम्प्रेसन पड़े वह अच्छा पड़े । इसको भी मैं एक जरूरी बात समझता हूँ । लेकिन हमें देखना यह है कि आप दर भसल क्या कर रहे हैं । इसके बारे में आपने जो इन्वेन्चुएशन कमेटी बिठाई थी, उसकी क्या राय है, उस पर भी हमें धीर करना है । इसके साथ ही साथ हम लोग जो कुछ देहातों में जा कर देखते हैं धीर उसके आधार पर जो कुछ यहां कहते हैं, उसको भी आपकी ध्यान से सुनना चाहिए और उसको भी कुछ महत्व देना चाहिए और जो सजेशन यहां पेश किए जाते हैं उनकी भी कुछ कद्व होनी चाहिए ।

इस चीज को हमने जिस नियत से शुरू किया था, उसके बारे में जो कुछ आपने लिखा है, उसमें से मैं एक साइन पढ़कर सुनाना चाहता हूँ । यह यह है :-

In any case, the village panchayat and the village co-operative should be induced to play a basic role in the planning and implementation of the programme, the

N.E.S. staff serving as the stimulating agency, with due administrative provision being made for this agency to be treated as the overall rural development arm of Government.

इतना ही नहीं, हमारी नियत यह भी थी -

Simultaneously, action will have to be taken to strengthen the financial resources of local organisation like panchayats, district boards, and co-operatives. There must also be undertaken an intensive programme of education and orientation of the membership of these bodies with a view to stimulating initiative, responsibility and use of organised action.

मैं इस बात को मानता हूँ कि आपने कुछ एबीवर्मेट्स शामिल की हैं, कुछ सड़कें बनाई हैं, कुछ स्कूल खोले हैं, कुछ लोगों को तालीम दी है । लेकिन मैं पूछना चाहता हूँ कि क्या आपने लोगों को इस काबिल बनाया है कि वे अपने पैरो पर खड़े हो सकें ।

आपने कुछ एमेनीटीज प्रवश्य दी हैं । लोगों की, मैं पूछना चाहता हूँ, क्या भ्रामदनी बढ़ी है ? जो दरल इंडेंटिडनेस था, क्या वह कम हुआ है ? क्या उसकी फिगरमेंट आपके पास है ? कम्युनिटी डिवेलेपमेंट बनाकर खून जाने के बाद गांवों वालों का जो कर्जा था वह बटा है या नहीं बटा है । एस्टीमेट्स कमेटी के साथ मुझे विभिन्न प्रान्तों के कितने ही गांवों में जाने का मौका मिला है । जिन किसी भी गांव में मैं गया हूँ मैंने पूछा है कि इस ब्लाक के खूनने से पहले गांव वालों पर कितना कर्ज था और आज कितना है जबकि चार बरस गुजर गये हैं, इस का मुझे कोई जबाब नहीं मिला है । इस के बारे में क्रिगर्स किसी के पास नहीं है, किसी के पास कैम्पस नहीं है । ऐसी हालत में कैसे मालूम हो कि उन लोगों की माली हालत अच्छी हुई है या खराब हुई है । केवल कुछ एक एमेनीटीज दे देने से काम नहीं चल सकता है ।

[श्री दा० ना० तिवारी]

घ्राप को उन की माली हालत को बेहतर बनाना होगा। इस के बास्ते घ्राप क्या कर रहे हैं, यह मैं घ्राप से पूछता हूँ। घ्राप पीने के पानी की व्यवस्था कर रहे हैं, घ्राप सिंचाई की सुविधायें प्रदान करने में कुछ काम कर रहे हैं, घ्राप फरटिलाइजर उन के लिये मुहैया कर रहे हैं। लेकिन कोई परमानेंट बेनिफिट घ्राप उन को क्या दे रहे हैं और इस बेनिफिट को मैं इस माने में लेता हूँ कि उन की माली हालत सुधर जायें।

दूसरा मकसद घ्राप का इन को शुरू करने में यह था कि लोगो में इनिशियेटिव पैदा हो, लीडरशिप की भावना पैदा हो। लेकिन मैं देख रहा हूँ कि लीडरशिप प्राज गवर्नमेंट आफिशल्स के हाथ में है, लोगो के हाथ में नहीं है। बी० डी० प्रो०, डिस्ट्रिक्ट मैजिस्ट्रेट, एस० डी० प्रो० लोग जाते हैं और काम शुरू करा के आ जाते हैं। ये लोग यह नहीं करते कि लोगो की सलाह ले लें, लोगो की राय ले लें और उन की राय पर चलें। घ्राप एडवाइजरों की मेट्री नामिनेट करते हैं लेकिन उस का भी जो प्रेजिडेंट होता है वह बी० डी० प्रो० ही रहता है और वह यह चाहता है कि लोग उस की हां में हां मिलाते जायें। अगर कोई डिफर करता है तो उस को हटाने की भी कोशिश की जाती है। घ्राप का प्रोग्राम यह भी था कि नान-आफिशल्स को इन कमेटियो का बेयरमैन घ्राप बनायेंगे लेकिन घ्राप वह भी नहीं कर सके हैं। एक साथ जगह पर अगर कोई नान-आफिशल बेयरमैन थे भी, उन को भी हटा दिया गया है। घ्राप ने पालिसी को बेंज कर दिया है। इन कमेटियो में अगर कोई सजेशन दिये जाते हैं तो उन पर कोई ध्यान नहीं दिया जाता है। एक साथ जगह जहाँ पर कोई नान-आफिशल बेयरमैन था, वहाँ पर जो गवर्नमेंट आफिशल थे, वे उस के साथ कोओप्रेट नहीं करते थे। ऐसी वृत्त में घ्राप किस तरह से लोगो में

इनिशियेटिव की भावना जागृत कर सकते हैं, किस तरह से उन में लीडरशिप की भावना पैदा कर सकते हैं।

मैं समझता हूँ कि इन एरियास में जो काम होता है उस को करने के लिये घ्राप को ग्राम पंचायतों की सहायता लेनी चाहिये, कोओप्रेटिव सोसाइटीस की हेलप लेनी चाहिये। और जगहों की बात तो मैं नहीं कहता, लेकिन कोसी में मैं ने देखा है कि ग्राम पंचायतों को तथा लेबर कोओप्रेटिक्स को जो काम सौंपा गया है, उनको, उन्हें, ने, बहुत, अच्छी, तरह से किया है। घ्राप ने देखा होगा कि वहाँ पर लाखों रुपये का काम इस तरह से करवाया गया है। घ्राप ने, जिन्होंने काम किया, उन को मजदूरी प्रषय दी लेकिन काम को प्रोग्रैनाइज बहा के लोगो ने अपने घ्राप किया। वे लोग हम के लिये घ्राप पर निर्भर नहीं रहे। वहाँ पर अफसरों ने काम करने की उन को फ्रीडम दी। भारत सेवक समाज के तत्वावधान में उन्होने काम कर के दिखाया। गावों में पंचायतों पर इस का भार डाला। घ्राप को चाहिये कि घ्राप पंचायतों को काम करने की फ्रीडम दें, कोओप्रेटिक्स को काम करने के लिये आगे आने को कहें। यदि घ्राप ऐसा करेंगे तो घ्राप का काम अच्छी तरह से हो सकेगा।

मैं घ्राप को बनाना चाहता हूँ कि घ्राप ने जिन मतलब में लिये इस काम को शुरू किया था वह नहीं पूरा हो पा रहा है। हम मन्त्रालय में मैं इन्वेस्टिगेशन कमेटी की रिपोर्ट में से एक पैरा घ्राप को पढ़ कर सुनाना चाहता हूँ —

In the undertaking and implementation of the constructional programmes, there has been a considerable volume of public participation; in the increasing of the producing potential.

यह तो ठीक है। लेकिन आपने कहा गया है

On the other hand it does not appeal that there has been anything like a corresponding growth of the spirit of self-reliance and initiative, nor has there been any wide-spread use of community organisations as such for the planning or implementation of development programmes. By and large, neither panchayats nor co-operatives have been used to any significant extent as the organisational media through which the movement is attempting to bring about economic development in the villages

यह आप की इवैल्युएशन कमेटी की रिपोर्ट है। एक भ्रदर्स मी इट के नाम से आप ने जो किताब छपी है, वह कोई माने नहीं रखती। मैं आप से कहूंगा कि इन को खाने की कोशिश कीजिये और जो डिफेक्ट्स हमने यहाँ पर प्वाइंट आउट किये हैं उन को दूर कीजिये। आज हम देखते हैं कि उस विभाग में बड़ी कम्यूसिटी है। लोगों ने तारीफ कर दी कि एक मील सड़क बन गई, ४ स्कूल बन गये और एक कम्युनिटी हाल बन गया और आप के प्रफसरान एक कम्यूसिटी में पढ़ जाते हैं। मैं चाहता हूँ कि मिनिस्टर साहबान आपस में बातचीत न कर के मेरी बात को ध्यान से सुने और उन का जवाब दे।

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: I also find that there are loud voices on my right. The Minister cannot hear

श्रीमान् डा० ना० तिवारी : आप की रिपोर्ट में यह लिखा हुआ है :

"Rural development not only involves the stimulation of rural consciousness but also requires incentives, skills, and supplies with the help of which alone this cons-

sciousness can lead to the emergence of concrete results. This particularly applies to things like seeds, fertilizers, warehouse facilities ..."

दूसरी बात मुझे यह कहनी है कि आप के द्वारा गावों में कम्युनिटी ब्लाक्स खोलने के बाद गावों में एम्प्लायमेंट कितना बढ़ा है इस की जानकारी इस रिपोर्ट में दी जानी चाहिये थी। इस रिपोर्ट में यह बतलाया जाना चाहिये था कि कितने लोगों को काम मिला, खेती में कितनी तरक्की हुई और गावों में कौटुंब इंडस्ट्रीज और दूसरे चरलू धंधों में कितने लोगों को हम खपा सके और कितने आइडिल हैंड्स को हम काम पर लगा सके, इस सम्बन्ध में फीगरमें देनी चाहिये थी और उस हालत में यह मालूम किया जा सकता था कि कम्युनिटी ब्लाक्स खोलने के बाद लैंड पर कितना प्रेशर हम कम कर सके और कितने आदमी हम खेती बाड़ी से अन्य काम धंधों पर लगा सके। मालूम होता है कि इस तरफ आप का ध्यान कम गया है और आप ने कम तवज्जह की है . . . . .

उपरोक्त महोदय में तो ध्यान देता रहा हूँ।

पंडित डा० ना० तिवारी : माफ कीजियेगा, आप से मेरा मतलब मिनिस्टर महोदय से था और मैं आप की मार्फत उन को एड्रेस कर रहा हूँ। तो मैं कह रहा था कि उन का ध्यान इस तरफ जाना चाहिये ताकि लैंड पर प्रेशर कम हो और लोग दूसरे काम और धंधों में लगे और यह अनएम्प्लायमेंट की समस्या सफलतापूर्वक हल की जा सके।

तीसरी चीज जिस की कि तरफ मैं मिनिस्टर महोदय का ध्यान दिलाना चाहता हूँ वह यह है कि गावों में आप के जाने के

[श्री डा० ना० तिवारी]

बाद धीर कम्युनिटी डेवलपमेंट ब्लाक्स क्लब के बाद गांवों में पहले की अपेक्षा लड़ाई झगड़े धीर मुकद्दमेबाजी कम हुई या नहीं, उस के भी आंकड़े इस रिपोर्ट में दिये जाने चाहिये थे। इस का चित्र इस रिपोर्ट में कहीं पर नहीं है कि पहले प्रमुख गांव में कितने मुकद्दमे होते थे और अब कितने होते हैं। विलेज वर्कर्स और बी० डी० प्रोजे० ने अपने को सीडर माना हुआ है और गांव पंचायतों के चुनाव वही गाइड करते हैं। मैं चाहता हूँ कि वे लोग गांव वालों को निर्भीक बनायें ताकि लोग दलालों को न चुन कर अच्छे लोगों को चुने। यह सब डाइरेक्शंस प्राप को देने चाहियें।

मैंने यह भी कभी कभी देखा है कि प्राप के जो बी० डी० प्रोजे० या गवर्नमेंट प्राफ़िजल्ट्स हैं, वे ऐडवाइसरी कमेटीज में जहाँ पीपुलिटीशियन भी जाते हैं, वहाँ दल बनाते हैं और वे दोनों पक्षों को लड़ा कर मौज उड़ाते हैं। उन को इस बात का डर लगा रहता है कि अगर ऐडवाइसरी कमेटी में एक राय रही तो फिर उन पर काम का प्रेशर काफ़ी बढ़ जायगा और उन की नुक्ताचीनी भी होने लगेगी और कम्युनिटी ब्लाक्स के लिये जो मोटर होती है और जिस को कि वह नाजायज तौर पर काम में लाते हैं, उस को वह न ला सकेंगे और इसलिये वे दोनों को आपस में लड़ा देने की तरकीब करते हैं। इस धीर भी हमारे मंत्री महोदय को ध्यान देना चाहिये।

गवर्नमेंट को ऐसे बी० डी० प्रोजे० रखने चाहियें जोकि लगन धीर ईमानदारी के साथ अपने कर्तव्य को निबाह सके और ऐडवाइसरी कमेटीज में ऐसे लोगों को लिया जाय जोकि ट्रिब्यु रिप्रेजेंटेटिव्स हों और जोकि फ़िरलेंसकी काम कर सके।

Shri Mohamed Imam (Chitaldrug):  
I am conscious that I am addressing a tired House.

I have tabled a cut motion which aims at the reduction of a substantial sum of Rs. 8 crores from the Demands. I have tabled this not because I am against these schemes or these projects, but to show to the Government that the people, especially the villagers are not getting the benefit as is sought to be made out, and also to show the wasteful expenditure that is being incurred in the course of the working of these community projects and NES schemes.

Our hopes were raised when these two schemes were introduced on the ground that the Government, especially the popular Government was going to fulfil the pledge to revive the rural life and bring about their uplift, bring about socio-economic changes in their life and provide them with all amenities that are needed for a comfortable life. Our hopes and expectations rose still further when we read the enormous literature that was circulated to us. This literature really contains very noble ideas and very noble sentiments. It points out that all Government agencies should work together as a team and aims at bringing closer and closer together the Government agencies and the village folk, and also bring together as has been pointed out in the report, the representatives of the people and the villagers. It has also been pointed out in the literature that the aim is to bring about a radical change in the outlook of the villagers, to establish village leadership, to make them organise themselves into various institutions and also to make them take an interest in all the work that is being done under these schemes. These sentiments are really laudable.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: We can continue on Monday.

**Shri Mohamed Imam:** I may point that I will not be here on Monday morning.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** Then we can sit another ten minutes and let the hon. Member finish.

**Shri Mohamed Imam:** But when we actually come to the implementation of these schemes, to the mode of execution, it is there that I have to differ very radically from the Government.

I will be very brief. We are spending on an average about Rs. 12 crores on these schemes and we must just know and investigate with what results, whether we have been doing this to the maximum advantage of the people for whom we are spending, whether there has been corresponding benefit for the amount. The canons of finance lay down that we must confer the maximum possible benefit on the people with the minimum possible expenditure. It has also been laid down that the benefit conferred should be on the maximum number of people. It has further been laid down that the cost of administration in any such schemes must be as low as possible.

But, here, I must state, and it looks as if I am on strong grounds, that most of the amount that has been earmarked goes towards staff, towards establishment, and towards the implementation of such theoretical projects as do not directly benefit the people. I may give you one example. Each national extension service block gets a share of Rs. 4 lakhs. One block is expected to spend Rs. 4 lakhs on the villagers. But let me give a break-up of the expenditure that is incurred. Out of these Rs. 4 lakhs, nearly Rs. 1 lakh goes towards the pay of staff, establishment charges, travelling allowances and honoraria etc., because the cost of the establishment per month comes to about Rs. 20,000.

Then, the cost of the equipment also is very substantial. Then, the amount

spent on buildings also is substantial, so much so, that out of Rs. 4 lakhs, nearly Rs. 3 lakhs are taken away by staff, establishment, equipment, travelling allowances and cost of buildings; and only a small amount of Rs. 1 lakh is left to be spent on the essential needs of the villagers. The same thing is true regarding the community development block also. There also, I can say on good authority that a good deal of amount is being spent on staff, establishment, and things which could very easily be added in this manner. If you look at the Demands for Grants, you will find under each Demand, the cost of training, the cost of establishment, the cost of travelling allowances, and various other things which may not directly benefit the villagers.

The point that I want to make is that though we are setting apart a substantial amount, only a very little portion of it is actually spent on the people; and consequently, there is very little progress.

In this connection, I may point out that the local agencies and the local departments are not fully made use of. I would suggest that these local agencies and local departments must be made use of. There are local bodies which have done very good service, and there are departments which could very well be made use of, thereby avoiding all this wasteful expenditure. If all this amount could be handed over to the local bodies like the district boards or the taluk boards, I think we shall be saving a lot of expenditure and a good deal of amount will be available for being spent for the villages.

At present, we are having the block development officers, village level workers and various other people, who have very little influence with the villagers themselves. I know they cannot induce or influence the villagers to come and work or to co-ope-

[Shri Mohamed Imam]

rate in their schemes. They are all very new individuals, who are strangers to that area. Their main duty will be to tour in a magnificent jeep or to spend their time speaking to the villagers. But no substantial work is done.

Look at the amount of work that has been entrusted to them. They are expected to attend to agriculture, animal husbandary, communications, social education, irrigation, and what not, so much so that it looks as if they are Jacks of all but masters of none.

I can tell you from my experience and personal knowledge—that is what is being felt by the local people also—that their presence there does not help much in bringing about

the required progress among the villagers. I feel that on the other hand, Government should think of making use of the local talents. After all, it is only the local people and the local agencies that have any real influence on the villagers. A substantial portion of the amount that is available must be handed over to the local departments and to the local bodies who must be charged with the work that they have to do in this regard. If that is done, I am quite certain that the amount would be spent profitably and judiciously, and it will be spent for the advantage of the villagers.

17.39 hrs.

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Monday, the 29th July, 1957.*

[Saturday, 27th July, 1957]

COLUMNS	COLUMNS
<b>QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE</b> 5473—75	<b>DEMANDS FOR GRANTS</b> 5475—5642
<p>The Speaker informed the House of the contents of a communication received from the Principal Information Officer regretting the advance release to the Press of an answer to an unstarred question in regard to which a point was raised in the House by Shrimati Renu Chakravartty on the 26th July, 1957.</p> <p>In view of this the House decided not to proceed further in the matter .</p>	<p>Discussion on Demands for Grants in respect of the Ministry of Health concluded. The Demands were voted in full . . . .</p> <p>Discussion on Demands for Grants in respect of the Ministry of Community Development commenced</p> <p>The discussion was not concluded . . . .</p>
<b>PANEL OF CHAIRMEN</b> 5520	<b>AGENDA FOR MONDAY, 29th JULY, 1957—</b>
<p>The Speaker informed Lok Sabha that he had nominated the following Members to the Panel of Chairmen.</p> <p>(1) Shri J. M. Mohamed Imam.</p> <p>(a) Shri C. R. Pattabhi Raman.</p>	<p>Further Discussion on Demands for Grants in respect of Ministry of Community Development .</p>