

LOKSABHA DEBATES

LOK SABHA

Thursday, August 26, 1993/Bhadra 4, 1915
(Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at Eleven of the Clock

[MR. SPEAKER in the Chair]

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Medical and Dental Colleges

*421. SHRI RAMESHWAR PATIDAR:
Will the Minister of HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE be pleased to state:

(a) the number of recognised and un-recognised Medical and Dental Colleges functioning at present in each State and Union Territory;

(b) the number of Medical and Dental Colleges opened during each of the last three years in these States and Union Territories;

(c) whether any ideal ratio has been fixed with regard to teaching staff and students in recognised Medical and Dental Colleges;

(d) if so, the details thereof; and

(e) if not, the reasons therefore?

[English]

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR): (a) to (e) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

STATEMENT

(a) A Statement showing the number of recognised and unrecognised medical and dental colleges State-wise is at Annexure I and II respectively.

(b) The number of medical and dental colleges opened during each of the last three years is as under:

<i>Name of the State</i>	<i>Year of Establishment</i>	<i>No. of Colleges</i>
MEDICAL COLLEGES		
Chandigarh UT	1991	1
Maharashtra	1990	5
	1991	2
Rajasthan	1992	1
Tamil Nadu	1992	1
DENTAL COLLEGES		
Andhra Pradesh	1990	1
Karnataka	1992	2
Maharashtra	1989	1
	1992	5
Pondicherry	1990	1
Punjab	1992	1
Tamil Nadu	1990	2
West Bengal	1991	1

(c) to (e) The Medical Council of India and the Dental Council of India have laid down the requirements of staff in their respective Regulations.

The teacher-student ratio as laid down for Post-graduate medical courses is 1:1 at degree level and 1:2 at Diploma level. In respect of the Post-graduate Dental courses the prescribed ratio is 2 students per teacher per year.

In respect of the undergraduate medical courses the requirements are determined department-wise depending upon the specific phase of the course, the number of beds and students admitted. Generally 10 students in a department are expected to be trained by 1 teacher, to develop adequate skills and competence.

The staff requirements for undergraduate Dental courses has been determined by the quantum of work load and is generally 58 teachers for 100 admissions.

ANNEXURE I

Number of Recognised and Unrecognised Medical Colleges in the Country State/Union Territory-wise

<i>Name of the State/UT</i>	<i>Recognised Medical Colleges</i>	<i>Unrecognised Medical Colleges</i>
Andhra Pradesh	10	..
Assam	3	..
Bihar	8	2
Goa	1	..
Gujarat	5	1
Haryana	1	..
Himachal Pradesh	1	..
Jammu & Kashmir	2	1
Karnataka	15	3
Kerala	5	..
Madhya Pradesh	6	..
Maharashtra	16	15
Manipur	1	..
Orissa	3	..
Punjab	5	..
Rajasthan	5	1
Tamil Nadu	12	2
Uttar Pradesh	9	..
West Bengal	7	..
Delhi	4	..
Pondicherry	1	..
Chandigarh	1
Total	120	26

ANNEXURE II

Statement Showing the Number of Dental Colleges in the Country

S. No.	Name of State/Union Territory	Recognised dental colleges	Unrecognised dental colleges*	Total
1.	Maharashtra	5	11	16
2.	Uttar Pradesh	2	Nil	2
3.	Punjab	2	1	3
4.	Andhra Pradesh	1	6	7
5.	Himachal Pradesh	Nil	1	1
6.	Tamil Nadu	5	7	12
7.	West Bengal	1	1	2
8.	Gujarat	1	2	3
9.	Karnataka	11	31	42
10.	Kerala	2	Nil	2
11.	Madhya Pradesh	1	Nil	1
12.	Bihar	2	13	15
13.	Goa	1	Nil	1
14.	Haryana	2	1	3
15.	Assam	1	Nil	1
16.	Rajasthan	1	Nil	1
17.	Orissa	1	Nil	1
18.	Jammu & Kashmir	1	Nil	1
19.	Delhi	2	2	4
20.	Pondicherry	Nil	2	2
21.	Chandigarh	1	Nil	1
	Total	43	78	121

*Out of these 20 are approved by the Council and 53 are not approved for starting the college.

[Translation]

SHRI RAMESHWAR PATIDAR:
Mr. Speaker, Sir, through you, I would like to draw the attention of the Government to the fact that they have augmented the powers of Ayurved Council by opening a new Medical College 4 months ago. The Chairman of the Ayurved Council of Medical College has stated that now there is no more need of medical colleges in the country because we have enough doctors. I would like to know whether the Government also thinks on the same lines that that we have enough doctors? Today the position of Doctors in villages is much the same as it was 40 years ago. The craving for knowledge and the need for doctors should never end. We export workers abroad. If the day comes when we have a large number of doctors, they would be exported. Even now they are

going abroad. Will the Government lay stress on opening more and more medical colleges? The Government have made a law of health for all by the year 2000. Don't we need more doctors to achieve health for all and do not we need more medical colleges to have more doctors?

[English]

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR:
Sir, I agree with the hon. Member that there is still shortage of doctors in our country. Recently, we passed a Bill in this House also whereby we have controlled the unhealthy growth of medical colleges in this country. We have given some parameter and within that parameter, they can still apply for establishing medical colleges. But, they have to have some infrastructure to build to have a medical college in this country.

[Translation]

SHRI RAMESHWAR PATIDAR: The population of Madhya Pradesh was 3 crore and 23 lakh in 1961 which has grown to 6 crore and 66 lakh to-day...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: This question relates to whole of India

SHRI RAMESHWAR PATIDAR: I would like to ask another question. The number of medical colleges is less in some States and more in others. Would the Central Government provide financial assistance to open more medical colleges to those states where the number of Medical Colleges is less? After the verdict of the Supreme Court, the wards of rich will be able to get admission in medical colleges. This will pave way for a tussle between wealth and knowledge. Will it not result into frustration for the society. Do you propose to provide reservation for students belonging to rural and backward classes in medical colleges in order to remove such social frustration?

[English]

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: Sir, in many States, there are Government medical colleges established by the State Governments. There are also private medical colleges. Medical education is a State subject. If a State Government comes forward with any proposal to the Central Government for establishing a new medical college with full infrastructure, I think, from the Central Government's side, we will give full cooperation.

[Translation]

SHRI RAMESHWAR PATIDAR: The Hon'ble Minister has not replied regarding reservation to students belonging to backward classes at college level.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: It is a valid question.

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: There are provisions for reservation of seats for scheduled castes, scheduled tribes and backward classes in some of the State Government medical colleges.

MR. SPEAKER: He is trying to understand what will happen to the sons and daughters of the poor people.

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR

In a recent judgment, the Supreme Court has divided the seats into two categories— one is the paid category seats in the private medical colleges and another is the free category seats. They have divided these seats on 50:50 basis. All the students for these two categories will be selected on the basis of merit in the entrance examination.

DR. B.G. JAWALI: Mr. Speaker, Sir it is a vast subject. I think, the whole country is discussing about the medical and dental education. I would request the hon. Speaker—if it is possible—to have half-an-hour discussion on this because it is a very sensitive issue. The entire country is waiting for the judgments, admissions all that entrance examinations and what not.

Anyway, my question pertains to the ratio of the teaching staff as well as the students. If we take Karnataka alone, out of 18 medical colleges, only four are Government-run colleges. Out of 42 dental colleges, there are hardly one or two.

If you take the standard available and the teacher and the taught ratio, it is the worst in Government colleges—though they have hardly four colleges, particularly in two situated at places other than the capital. Though the medical students are admitted on merit a lot of hardship is put as far as the academic standard is concerned. But if we compare with the private colleges, they are definitely far far superior.

With the new system and the new policy, I am not quite sure what will happen to the standard. Has the Government given any serious thought over the standard of education?

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: I would like to differ with the hon. Member saying that the Government medical colleges are far worse than the private medical colleges. It is not a fact. For recognising a medical college, the Medical Council of India has parameters: how many students should be there, what will be the bed ratio and how many teachers should be there to teach those students.

After the MCI is satisfied, it recommends and the Central Government recognises the medical college. I do not agree with the hon. Member, (*Interruptions*) The conditions in Government medical colleges are far better than those prevailing in many of the private medical colleges.

[*Translation*]

DR. G. L. KANAUIA: There are several private medical colleges running in Karnataka and some of which were established 8-10 years ago, but they are yet to be recognised. Are you putting any pressure to ensure that they are recognised? You have stated that certain parameters have been fixed by Medical Council of India. They are in written form and we are aware of them. But is any action being taken to implement them or not? If not, why?

[*English*]

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: In the case of graduates from the unrecognised college, there is a little difficulty because the MCI has a strict provision. Such colleges have to have certain type of infrastructure without which they are not going to recognise these medical colleges. The MCI is not registering the names of graduates coming out of the unrecognised medical colleges in the registered list of the doctors in this country. That is the position.

[*Translation*]

SHRI G. L. KANAUIA: Mr. Speaker. Sir, my question has not been answered. The colleges which were opened 8-10 years back are still to be recognised. Most of the medical colleges functioning in the State to which the Hon'ble Minister belongs have not been recognised as they do not meet the parameters. What have you said regarding those colleges? When would you get them recognised?...(*Interruptions*)... Some colleges which were established much later have been recognised. There are some 5-6 Medical Colleges which have not been recognised so far. Please state as to what do you propose to do for them.

[*English*]

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: Sir, we cannot compromise with the standard of medical education in this country.

DR. KRUPASINDHU BHOI: Sir, medical education is not a State subject; medical education is in the Concurrent List of the Central Government. So, that should be put straight on record.

Medical education and dental education are recognised by the Medical Council of India and Dental Council of India respectively. Since 15 years, there has been no election in the Medical Council of India which is controlling the medical colleges in the sense that they are giving recognition and increasing their parameters.

MR. SPEAKER: This question is on medical colleges and not on Medical Council of India.

DR. KRUPASINDHU BHOI: Medical colleges means medical education, Sir. As per the report given, it definitely comes under medical education. For the recognition of these medical colleges, I want to know from the hon. Minister as to when will the Parliament take up the pending Medical Council (Amendment) Bill and deliberate the standard of medical education in this country.

MR. SPEAKER: This question is disallowed.

DR. VASANT NIWRUTTI PAWAR: Sir, the hon. Minister in his reply has stated that there are 16 medical colleges which are recognised and 15 medical colleges which are unrecognised.

MR. SPEAKER: This question is about all-India level. Please read the question.

DR. VASANT NIWRUTTI PAWAR: Sir, this is in the answer. I would like to know whether it is a fact that these 15 unrecognised medical colleges had applied to the Medical Council of India for recognition and recognition is not being granted. Is it that after completion of four-and-a-half years of medical education, the Medical Council intervenes and gives recognition? I would like to know the fact.

MR. SPEAKER: If you have the information, you can give it.

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: I will check it up and pass on the information to him.

* SHRI MUMTAZ ANSARI: Sir, there are not many medical and dental colleges in the country. Still, after 15 years or 16 years, they have not been recognised by Dental Council of India or Medical Council of India. There is a certain package programme for the welfare and technical upliftment of education of minorities. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether certain relaxations will be granted to such minority medical colleges and dental colleges so that these may be recognised by the Medical Council of India or Dental Council of India.

MR. SPEAKER: What happens to the health of the patient?

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: I have already stated that in the case of medical education, the Government cannot compromise with the standard of medical education.

SHRI SOBHANADREESWARA RAO VADDE: The hon. Minister, in his reply, has stated about the number of teachers and students ratio, beds and other things. It is good. But apart from this, there is another very important aspect that really helps the students in dental and medical colleges, that is, best equipped library. In view of the devaluation of the rupee which puts a higher burden on our getting books and magazines from abroad and only the State Governments are giving funds for the medical colleges to meet the library requirements which is not adequate, will the Health Ministry interact with the University Grants Commission and see that adequate funds are given by the UGC for the medical colleges and dental colleges to equip their libraries in a fit condition and improve the quality of education?

MR. SPEAKER: The question is disallowed.

SHRI SUDHIR GIRI: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to know through you from the hon. Minister whether the

students coming out of the unrecognized medical colleges are eligible for sitting in the competitive examinations in India. If they are allowed to sit for the competitive examinations, what are the reasons for not recognizing those medical colleges?

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: Graduates coming out of the unrecognized medical colleges are not allowed to sit in the examinations for postgraduate degree and diploma.

MR. SPEAKER: No, no. He is asking about the UPSC and other competitive examinations.

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI B. SHANKARANAND): The Union Public Service Commission prescribes the required minimum qualifications for any post that is advertised, and the person who is totally eligible under those requirements, can apply. It is for the UPSC to decide whether they are going to recognize the degrees conferred by unrecognized medical colleges. We do not come into the picture.

MR. SPEAKER: The Government does not come into the picture! How?

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: The UPSC will prescribe the requirements. Accordingly, it is for the UPSC to decide...
(interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: UPSC is also a part of the Government. I think you should discuss this matter with your colleagues.

[Translation]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the original question which has been asked is as to what should be the teacher-student ratio in medical and dental colleges. The reply of this question has also been made by the Government. I would like to know from the Government whether the Government propose to take any measures to enforce the ideal ratio of teacher-students. I am making this question because it comes under the concurrent list and the Government can issue directions to this effect, supervise it and look

into the matter. Secondly, you have stated about the unrecognised medical colleges that the Indian Medical Council do not compromise with the standard. I am also of the opinion that this should never be at any cost and there should be no compromise with the standard of medical and technical education. What measures does the Government propose to take to close the unrecognised medical colleges which are functioning at present?

[English]

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: The problem of medical education in this country is so complex. There are a number of medical colleges which are imparting education even without permission. That is the situation in this country. There are certain medical colleges which are imparting medical education only on a temporary basis. The Medical Council of India has a large inspectorate under them. The inspectors do go to inspect the conditions of the medical colleges and if they find that everything required under the rules is fulfilled, then only they recommend to the Medical Council of India for the recognition of those colleges. Under the present law, we do not recognize any medical college if it is not recommended by the Medical Council of India. The degrees of such medical colleges are not recognized. Till very recently, the Medical Council of India used to grant recognition to those colleges if the universities recognized the degrees of such colleges. To prevent such things, we have brought in a new law. Now the Government has taken over authority and the Government will see to it that all the conditions are fulfilled before the recognition is granted to the medical colleges.

[Translation]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: Mr. Speaker, Sir, this is the required reply of my question. Since my question has been replied to I have nothing more to say. The Government itself may kindly look into it... (Interruptions)... But my question was as to how the Government would monitor the teacher-students ratio and whether the Government would close the unrecognised medical colleges in case the Indian Medical Council does not give them

recognition. It has not been replied... (Interruptions)

SHRI RAM KRIPAL YADAV: Mr. Speaker, Sir, this topic must be discussed. It is a very important issue... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Give notice for half-an-hour discussion; Then it will be looked into.

[English]

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: The hon. Member has rightly asked the question. It is quite relevant. His question is whether we can only refuse recognition of those degrees and not close them. We cannot compel the private organisations to close their institutions... (interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Those doctors whose degrees are not recognised are practising. Can we take action against them or not?

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Under the present circumstances, we can only not recognise their degrees. We cannot ask them to close down their medical colleges.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: The doctors whose degrees are not recognised are practising. Can we take action against them or not? (interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI RAJESH PILOT): Sir, let me give a helping hand.

MR. SPEAKER: No.

(Interruptions)

SHRI D.K. NAIKAR: Sir, after the Supreme Court's judgement, it has become very difficult for the private managements to admit students. In Karnataka, there are four private colleges which run on capitation. Now, the Government is making a statement that they are going to implement the Supreme Court's judgement, whereas, the managements of private colleges are saying that they are not going to admit the students. Now, we are at the fag end of August and none of the students were admitted in the colleges.

Mr. Shankaranand is a Cabinet Minister who hails from Karnataka.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: No. It is an all-India question. I am not allowing Karnataka Members. Family problems can be discussed in the family and not in Parliament!

SHRI D.K. NAIKAR: I want to know whether the Minister is interfering or taking any measure to settle the issue.

SHRI A. CHARLES: Sir, the basic problem of medical education is the inherent defect in the rule. The Medical Council are, under the present rule, supposed to look into the question of recognition only during the final year. Without the permission of the Medical Council, anybody can start a Medical College but under certain conditions. May I know from the hon. Minister whether the permission of Medical Council shall be made a pre-condition for starting a Medical College and then a direction may be given that students shall not be admitted in the colleges which are functioning for over a period of few years without recognition. (interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: It is a very good question. You please sit down. Can it be made a pre-condition? Now, you take your seat, the Minister will reply.

SHRI A. CHARLES: I have not completed my question.

MR. SPEAKER: You are confusing yourself.

SHRI A CHARLES: Also in case, after a few years, a Medical College was not recognised that College be prevented from admitting the students. Because of this, the students are put to unnecessary difficulty. Sir, the doctors are not being allowed to practise. This is a crime, May I know from the hon. Minister, what action he is going to take in this regard.

MR. SPEAKER: It is a good question. You are confusing yourself.

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: Sir, with the recent Amendment, they have

to take the permission from the Central Government for establishing any medical college. They have to take prior permission from the Government.

About the Graduates from the un-recognised colleges, I would like to mention that many States have recognised them at their levels. They can practise within their States.

[Translation]

SHRI ANNA JOSHI: Mr. Speaker, Sir, my question has three parts. My first question is whether the Government has any plan to regularise and to give recognition to several unrecognised colleges so that they may be recognised within two-three or four years.

MR. SPEAKER: Its reply has come. Please come to the next question.

SHRI ANNA JOSHI: My second question is as to what measures are proposed to be taken by the Government to rectify the ratio of teachers-students in several colleges.

The third part of my question is that recently the Supreme Court and the Government have made certain laws regarding the admission of students in the medical colleges. As a result thereof the private medical colleges have stopped admission totally. Not a single student is being given admission there. I would like to know about the steps proposed to be taken by the Government in this regard.

[English]

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: Sir, about the un-recognised colleges...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You have already explained it. You reply to second and third part of his question.

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: Sir, the Supreme Court has given directives to the State Governments to formulate a policy.

It is upto the State Government to formulate a policy and inform the Supreme Court. The State of Maharashtra has formulated a policy; the State of Karnataka has also formulated a policy about the paid seats and unpaid seats. There are some complications, but they are not yet sorted out.

[Translation]

SHRI DATA MEGHE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, there are many unrecognised medical colleges where the officials of the Medical Council of India and the Dental Council of India did not visit for their examination. Moreover, there are several unrecognised medical colleges which fulfil all the prescribed norms but they have not been recognised because the officials of medical council did not visit there. There are many medical colleges in Maharashtra which have not been recognised by the Medical Council of India and directives have been issued to close them down but they are still functioning. Does the Medical Council or the Dental Council have any programme to regularise them; and are they likely to be recognised within six months? The number of lady doctors is also less in these colleges. Does the Government propose to give them priority as much as possible by providing quota for them?

[English]

SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR: For unrecognised colleges, the Medical Council of India and the Dental Council of India have laid down that these are the conditions which they have to fulfil. If the hon. Member can give me information about a particular medical college where the Medical Council has not visited and for that reason it has not been recognised, I will definitely look into that.

Kashmiri Migrants

*422. **SHRI GABHAJI MANGAJI THAKORE:**

SHRI B.L. SHARMA PREM:

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

(a) whether the Government have received any memorandum regarding the demands of Kashmiri migrants in Delhi;

(b) if so, the details thereof; and

(c) the reaction of the Government thereto?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI RAJESH PILOT): (a) to (c) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

STATEMENT

Representations have been received from time to time from migrants and different organisations representing them, regarding problems of the Kashmiri migrants. Their demands broadly relate to education of migrant students, service matters of migrant employees, recruitment of unemployed youth, provision of assistance to businessmen and traders, settlement of insurance claims, increase in the level of cash relief, and compilation of information regarding the property left behind in the Valley.

Permanent rehabilitation of the migrants outside the Valley is not contemplated. They are expected to go back to the Valley after restoration of normalcy in the State for which consistent efforts are being made. However, steps have been taken to provide immediate relief and basic amenities. Besides provision of ration/cash relief to the migrant families, arrangements for sanitary and medical facilities, supply of electricity, water, etc. have been organised in the camps that have been set up for them. Special efforts have been made for education of children in camp schools and colleges and for their admissions in other institutions. Arrangements have been made for payment of leave salary/pensions to migrant Government employees, transfer of bank accounts and lockers, insurance settlement, etc. Facilities and concessions in respect of loans, working capital assistance have also been given. Action for computation of information about the properties of the migrants has been commenced.

The arrangements are being reviewed regularly so that recurring problems can be resolved and difficulties being faced by the migrants can be minimised.