

[Translation]

SHRI RAM NAIK: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Minister has submitted that a Task Force has been constituted and its recommendations have also been received and the same are under examination. I would like to know the main recommendations of the 'Task Force' and whether the wagons proposed to be manufactured in the public sector also. What is the view point of the Government in this regard?

SHRI MALLIKARJUN: Sir, the parties who are interested to supply wagons to Railways, will give orders to the wagon manufacturing units but the Railways will inspect the wagons according to its specifications and designs. The wagon builders will have to manufacture the wagons as per Railway specifications.

SHRI RAM NAIK: Will these be manufactured in the private sector or in the public sector?

SHRI MALLIKARJUN: Most of our 'Wagon Builders' are in the private sector.

[English]

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Does Bharat Wagons come under private sector?

SHRI MALLIKARJUN: I am telling mostly.

Death Due to Negligence of Doctors

*393. **SHRI MOHAN SINGH (DEORIA):**
DR. VASANT PAWAR:

Will the Minister of HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE be pleased to state:

(a) whether the attention of the Government has been drawn to the news item captioned 'AIIMS admits lapse after 18 month cover up' appearing in the Indian Express dated June 26, 1992;

(b) if so, whether the Government have conducted an inquiry in this regard;

(c) if so, the outcome thereof; and

(d) the steps taken by the Government to ensure that such incidents do not recur?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRIMATI THARADEVI SIDDHARTHA): (a) to (d). A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

STATEMENT

An enquiry was conducted into the case of Shri V.K. Dutta, who expired on 13/12/1990 in the All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi. The enquiry report has *inter-alia* brought out the need to ensure that there is constant supervision during administration of anaesthesia and delineation of specific responsibilities of junior Residents and Senior Residents/Faculty Members in the Department of Anaesthesiology. This has since been effected defining responsibility for administration of anaesthesia, the level of supervision to be extended in each type of operative case including the specific condition of the patient.

[Translation]

SHRI MOHAN SINGH (Deoria): Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Minister has not given reply to my question. He simply gave a statement to that effect. Through you, I would like to submit that a poor common man who sustained knee injury by a scooter was admitted to AIIMS in December 1990. The man named Shri V.K. Dutta was told that a minor operation will be performed on the injured part of the body.

Sir, my submission is that a man was admitted there, he was given local anaesthesia and the lady doctor, after injecting it left the place, though as a precaution she should have stayed there for at least 30-50 minutes. In the meanwhile the patient had a severe heart attack and he died immediately.

My submission is that the incident took place due to the negligence on the part of the doctor. It is ironical that a person dies due

to the negligences of a doctor in such a prestigious Institute as AIIMS. Did the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare or the governing body of AIIMS got this incident inquired to fix the responsibility for the untimely death of the patient? What action has been taken against the persons found guilty?

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI M.L. FOTEDAR):

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I do agree with the hon. Member and there is no doubt in it that Shri Dutta died due to the negligence on the part of a doctor. This incident took place in December 1990. A lady doctor Dr. Sushma Ahlawat was on duty and she was to stay ~~here~~ till the patient regained consciousness. However it was alleged that the doctor did not stay there. The concerned Ministry set up a high powered committee and the Chairman of that Committee was Dr. D.P. Goyal who is an ex-DHS, other member of the committee Dr. I.D. Bajaj was also former DGHS; other members of that committee were Dr. R.S. Saxena, who had been consultant in anesthesiology department at Safdarjang Hospital and Dr. A.K. Mukherjee who is additional DG in Directorate General of Health Services. It has stated in their report that -

[English]

There has been a failure of the individual in this case,

[Translation]

and I would like to make a short reference to another thing they have pointed out that it is beyond doubt that it happened due to failure of some system. When the case reached the concerned Ministry, they ordered that immediate action be taken against all those responsible for this lapse in performing their duty. However, she was Senior Resident Doctor appointed under the contract system and when the report was submitted and the action was taken she was not in the service of AIIMS.

[English]

She was not in the services of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences.

[Translation]

Later Dr. Sushma Ahlawat again applied for being appointed in the AIIMS as Assistant Professor or Associate Professor. The selection committee recommended her name for the post but the governing body rejected that recommendation and directed that such a doctor should not be appointed in All India Institute of Medical Sciences.

SHRI MOHAN SINGH: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Minister could give all the details in reply to the original question itself which he has given in reply to the supplementary question. Despite, I would like to submit that a number of similar incidents have been occurring in AIIMS and I have written a number of letters to the hon. Minister in this regard. I would not like to discuss them here today - and I would like to know from him whether the Government have taken or propose to take measures against all the doctors who have been found guilty of being negligent in doing their duty in All India Institute of Medical Sciences.

SHRI M.L. FOTEDAR: I would like to assure the hon. Member that if at all any doctor is found guilty of being negligent in his duty, strict action would be taken against him and I would not engage myself in any favoritism in this regard. You must be aware that the matter of irregularities made by Dr. O.P. Singh was raised in the House and though his name had been recommended by the Selection Committee we not only dismissed the recommendation but also suspended him. Because he was one of the doctors working in AIIMS. Therefore, I would like to assure you that nobody - whether doctor or anybody else - would be spared if found guilty of negligence while performing his duties.

SHRI MOHAN SINGH: I had written a letter to you in regard to a case of a mentally

unsound doctor. The Mental Hospital has also declared him mentally unsound and a certificate in this regard has been issued but no action is being taken.

[English]

DR. VASANT NIWRUTTI PAWAR: Forget about this individual case. But there are already deaths occurring because of wrong anesthesia, I feel in this cases this final anesthesia should not have been given; instead of that general anesthesia should have been given. But, anyway, part (d) of the question is: "The steps taken by the Government to ensure that such incidents do not recur." I would like to ask the Minister whether there is a routine practice for the pre-operative check-up of a patient plus a training in the refresher courses for the Anaesthesiatsts. I just like to know whether there is a routine practice of holding a conference after the death of the patient.

SHRIM.L. FOTEDAR: I would like to tell the hon. Member that necessary guidelines in details and in writing have been issued; and the Director of Medical Institute has been directed that he will have to ensure that these guidelines issued by the Department concerned are complied with strictly.

[Translation]

DR. CHATTRAPAL SINGH: Mr. Speaker, Sir, as the hon. Minister has admitted in his reply that Shri Dutta died in All India Institute of Medical Sciences just due to the negligence of a doctor there. Keeping this fact in view has a criminal case been registered against her. If not, the reasons thereof.

SHRI M.L. FOTEDAR: I would only submit to the hon. Member that she was a senior doctor and was appointed in contract basis.

SHRI RAJVEER SINGH: Hon. Minister, what does it mean? A person commits a murder and then leaves the place and you would say that he was on contract basis.

[English]

SHRIM.L. FOTEDAR: We have directed the Director of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences that appropriate action should be taken against the doctor. I can go even to the extent that if the dependents of Dr. Dutta file any suit or complaint, I am not going to defend such a doctor.

MR. SPEAKER: The Question hours is over.

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

[English]

Privatisation of Railways

*394. SHRI AMAL DATTA:
SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA:

Will the Minister of RAILWAYS be pleased to state:

(a) whether the Government have decided to privatise Indian Railways in a big way and throw open all its future expansion and procurement plans to the private sector; and

(b) if so, the details of the plan including the railway sectors proposed to be included therein?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI MALLIKARJUN): (a) and (b). No, Sir. Railway transport is reserved for the State sector as per the Industrial Policy announced in July, 1991. However, efforts are being made to expand the privatisation of certain auxiliary activities namely catering and 'own your wagon' scheme on the Indian Railways, without retrenching any staff.

Incidents of Chain Pulling

*395. SHRI TEJ NARAYAN SINGH: Will the Minister of RAILWAYS be pleased to state: