#### Seventeenth Loksabha

>

Title: General discussion on the Union Budget for 2022-2023.

**DR. SHASHI THAROOR (THIRUVANANTHAPURAM):** Thank you very much, hon. Speaker, for giving me this opportunity to initiate the debate on the Union Budget for 2022-23, which was presented by the hon. Finance Minister last week. ... (*Interruptions*)

Sir, India has gradually moved beyond the horrors of the destructive second wave of COVID-19 pandemic and is coping reasonably well with the present crisis of Omicron. ... (*Interruptions*)

Sir, can you get the House in order so that we can have a meaningful debate? ... (*Interruptions*) Sir, the House is not in order. ... (*Interruptions*)

माननीय अध्यक्ष: माननीय सदस्यगण, प्लीज़, बैठिए।

... (व्यवधान)

माननीय अध्यक्षः शशि थरूर जी, आप एक मिनट बैठिए । हाउस ऑर्डर में लाने दीजिए ।

... (व्यवधान)

माननीय अध्यक्षः माननीय सदस्यगण, प्लीज़, खडे नहीं रहिए।

... (व्यवधान)

माननीय अध्यक्षः माननीय सदस्यगण, प्लीज़, बैठिए ।

... (व्यवधान)

माननीय अध्यक्ष: सुरेश जी, प्लीज़, बैठिए।

... (व्यवधान)

माननीय अध्यक्षः डा. शशि थरूर ।

**DR. SHASHI THAROOR**: Thank you, Speaker, Sir. I hope you start the clock again from now for our time. We are very obsessed with the amount of time we get. Thank you for giving me this opportunity once again.

I was saying that while India has moved beyond the horrors of the destructive second wave of the COVID pandemic and is coping reasonably well with the current Omicron wave, there can be no doubt that the past year has placed the citizens of our country in unimaginable distress.

The pain that so many of our fellow citizens have suffered, especially during the tragic and widespread loss of life between March and May last year, has etched scars in our public consciousness that can never be erased. Today, we have crossed the unsettling landmark of officially recording over five lakh COVID related deaths - and perhaps, almost 6-7 times that figure, unofficially - which is a grim reminder of the far-reaching implications of the pandemic.

### 19.11 hrs (Shri A. Raja in the Chair)

In that context, the presentation of the Budget annually cannot merely be seen as a purely routine economic exercise or of an endeavour in straightforward accounting involving fiduciary allocations and unassuming numbers. Rather, it is an instrument through which the

about:blank 2/61

Government of the day presents a political vision to manage the economy, heal the country, and to set it on a path to recovery.

The Budget serves as a platform through which the people of this nation are informed of the political priorities of their Government, a Government which was sworn in on the Constitutional premise and promise that it will safeguard the interests of all Indians. So, what then were the expectations the people of this country had of this Government's priorities and vision, and what could we have expected the Government to offer the people through the Budget? I would say there were three broad expectations that the nation had. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN (CHENNAI CENTRAL): Sir, please ask the Minister to come here. This is the main House. She has to be here. She has to come here.

**SHRI KODIKUNNIL SURESH (MAVELIKKARA):** She has to come here. She can come here. ... (*Interruptions*) No, she has to be here.

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Hon. Members, she is sitting in the other House and listening to the proceedings.

SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN: No, this is the main House.

HON. CHAIRPERSON: Please sit down. She is listening.

**DR. SHASHI THAROOR**: Sir, I will continue. I would say, there were three broad expectations. The first was an expectation that this Government would acknowledge the problems that the nation is facing.

Acknowledge the fact that our nation is today facing unprecedented levels of unemployment which has left countless citizens, especially our

about:blank 3/61

young and dynamic working age population with little prospects for a brighter tomorrow. Admit that one-fifth of India's population has plunged a staggering 53 per cent in the last five years, in their income. While the wealth of the richest 100 Indians has soared to Rs.57 lakh crore, 4.7 crore Indians have slipped into extreme poverty, that is, below the poverty line. Acknowledge the fact that the Indian middle-class has been left defenceless in the face of rising inflation, shrinking incomes, and the consequent acceleration of household debt. Recognise the widespread distress and anguish in the agrarian economy, exacerbated by the peremptory manner in which your Government passed the three contentious farm laws, that drove hundreds of our farmers to camp outside the borders of our city in the bitter winter cold, in the harsh summer Sun and in the soaking monsoon rain, in a cause for which over 670 of them gave their lives. And, concede that all these issues have been avoidable misadventures forged by your style of misgovernance – a style of governance that prioritises one-man rule over consultation, a style that demands conformity rather than seeking consensus, and a style that has scant regard for the fundamental conventions or institutions that have traditionally guided our democracy.

We all heard the Prime Minister today telling us of his Government's achievements. Let us ask, of what use are toilets without running water, gas cylinders whose refills you cannot afford, electricity connections whose bills you cannot pay because you do not have a job.

हमने प्रधान मंत्री का शेर भी सुना । अली सरदार जाफरी के शब्दों में उनका जवाब है,

> "तुमने फिरदौस के बदले में जहन्नुम देकर कह दिया हमसे गुलिस्तां में बहार आई है, बागबान बनकर उठे और चमन बेच दिया है।"

That is what this Government has done. So, we have been left bitterly disappointed by this Government's unwillingness to offer even a token recognition of the problems they have caused, of the widespread anguish they have inflicted upon the *aam admi*, the unemployed youth, our kisans, who are still facing the existential crisis caused by this Government.

This House has not forgotten the Prime Minister talking about zero budget natural farming but his Government has, I am sorry to say, left a zero in the Budget for farmers.

The second expectation, Sir, that the people of this nation had, was for the Government to assure concrete actions and corrective measures to address the multi-pronged calamities that their own Government had caused them; an expectation to address the increasing unemployment crisis and declining labour force participation by developing targeted measures for job creation and strengthening existing employment guarantee schemes like MGNREGA, an expectation to provide life support for the MSME sector battered first by demonetization and then by lockdowns, to help them through fiscal support and a less exacting regulatory framework; an expectation from the Government to mitigate the crisis, the crisis of the middle class by reducing Income-Tax or at least raising the exemption slab to at least Rs.5 lakh, as this Government had repeatedly promised earlier, and arresting the untrammelled rise in the prices of the basic commodities; an expectation that the Government will have the commitment and vision to design a pathway out of the staggering inequality in our country, and where our kisans are concerned, an expectation to fix the cracks in our MSP and offer them

about:blank 5/61

support in terms of the procurement of basic commodities like fertilizers at a time when the price of raw material is skyrocketing. Sadly, this Government's Budget has given the nation exactly the opposite: a significant slashing of the MGNREGA scheme, more tokenism in credit support for the MSME sector, no changes in the personal taxation regime and no relief in terms of addressing rising inflation, no targeted efforts for job creation, barring the inadequate 60 lakh jobs over last five years, a far cry from the two crore jobs a year they had promised earlier in the equally illusory *achche din;* the reduction of Budgets for social welfare schemes and significant cuts in schemes for crop insurance, MSP and fertilizers, leaving many farmer groups to term this Budget as a 'revenge budget'.

In the words of Kamna Prasad:

"कल की खातिर, आज को बर्बाद करके रख दिया, हम तुम्हारी दूरंदेशी के कायल हो गए। जो थे पस्ती में, उन्हें बस ख्वाब दिखाए गए, जो बुलंदी पर थे, उनको और ऊंचा कर दिया।"

That is what has happened here, Sir.

Now, while none of these concerns were addressed, the people of this country at least expected from the Government to learn from the grim experiences of recent times, and prioritize allocations accordingly, then the Budget might offer a vision of economic recovery that would guide our nation out of the darkness of distress of the pandemic in the aftermath. But where have we seen this, Sir? This Government has not learnt from the repeated instances of incursions on our sovereign territory by prioritizing, by expanding the Defence Budget and

about:blank 6/61

providing support for our Armed Forces to accelerate urgent modernization requirements. The Government has not learnt from harrowing ordeals during the height of the pandemic to strengthen our medical infrastructure so as to shore up our preparedness in the event of future contagion.

The Government has not learnt to increase allocations to education so as to prepare our young children better to cope with an uncertain future. The Government has not learnt to attempt to solve the problems of today's Indian citizens rather than stretching the mirage of achche din 25 years into the future, into some illusory *Amrit Kal* that no one in the Government will be around to be accountable for at all. After all,

# "अगली नस्लों को तबाही से बचाने के लिए जो भी करना है, इसी नस्ल को करना होगा।"

But they are not interested in doing any of that; they would rather just defer and postpone. We have hollow slogans and insincere promises, the famous *jumlas* and the empty claims of achievement. To paraphrase Ghalib, "हमको मालूम है बजट की हकीकत, लेकिन दिल को बहलाने के लिए, निर्मला जी, ये ख्याल अच्छा है"

Anyway, I am sorry to say, Mr. Chairperson, that the announcements of this Budget simply mask a betrayal by the Government of the hopes and aspirations of the people - तमन्ना आसमां की थी जमीन भी न मिली I However, it was good to hear the hon. Finance Minister quoting from the *Mahabharat*'s *Shanti Parv*, talking about the duty of a king to govern the State in accordance with *dharma*. Of course, this Government would do well to remember the equally

about:blank 7/61

prescient wisdom also in the same *Shanti Parv* which warns that when the kingdom goes into decline, the life of that king is one of shame.

As a more recent poet Dushyant Kumar famously said:

"जिस दौर में मखलूख को मयस्सर नहीं रोटी उस दौर के सुल्तान से कोई भूल हुई है"

What, then, is the state of this kingdom and the sultan? Any conversation on the state of this country must necessarily commence with the state of the people who make up the nation. After all, there is no robust economy or GDP growth as abstract on theoretical concepts, unless you are concerned about the welfare of the people who constitute this economy. That understanding of our economy is simply not there in our Finance Minister's Budget. Partly as a result of the pandemic and partly on account of consistent failures in policy-making since 2014, the *aam admi* finds himself in an unprecedented state of distress. The hon. Finance Minister in her address spoke about how her Government constantly strives to provide the necessary ecosystem for the middle-class. I heard the Prime Minister also using this word. This has become a new favourite word of the Government – ecosystem.

After seeing the contents of the Budget, the Indian middle-class would like to know what is in this ecosystem. Was it the disruptive policy of demonetisation that denied our citizens access to their own money overnight and caused widespread economic havoc and the unconscionable loss of lives? Was that part of the ecosystem for the middle-class? Was this Government's decision to repeatedly increase excise duties on fuel and their lethargy in tackling the drastic increase in the prices of basic commodities from LPG cylinders to pulses to edible

about:blank 8/61

oil, part of the so-called ecosystem for the middle-class? The price of LPG has gone up in one year in Delhi from Rs. 502 to Rs. 899. Is that the ecosystem they would like to talk about? Or, was it the proposal in this Budget to reduce corporate surcharge from 12 per cent to seven per cent while offering no change in either personal income tax rates or the slabs which are exempt from taxation, at a time of severe economic distress? Is that also part of their grand ecosystem for the middle-class, after promising that they would do so in Mr. Jaitley's first Budget in 2014? One thing that was made abundantly clear, even if the ecosystem is not clear, is that for the middle-class and the poor, who were both mentioned a grand total of two times in the speech - they were betraying the real priorities of this Government — this Budget has served as a definitive and unconscionable let-down.

Mr. Chairperson, let us take the unemployment rate. Just last week, the Centre for Monitoring of Indian Economy published fresh data which pegged the unemployment rate as of January at 6.57 per cent. This is certainly a welcome improvement from 7.9 per cent in the previous month. It still remains higher than the worst unemployment rates in our country in the last 45 years. In December, the nation had 5.3 crore 53 million individuals who were unemployed, including 3.5 crores who were actively seeking work and could not find any. It is a strong indictment of this Government's ineptitude that India's unemployment rate in recent months has grown faster than Bangladesh's and Vietnam's.

Sir, it is also no wonder, then, that we are witnessing an unprecedented and worrying decline in incomes and a simultaneous increase in household debt. In the last two years, 84 per cent of

about:blank 9/61

households have suffered a loss of income and *per capita* income has fallen from Rs. 1,08,000 in 2019-20 to Rs. 1,07,000 in 2021-22. This has naturally depressed household spending and, of course, saving.

During the UPA era, mass welfare schemes ensured that we were able to pull 27.3 crore - 270 million - Indians out of poverty. Under this Government's watch, 4.7 crore - 47 million - Indians have been pushed back under the poverty line.

For the first time since 1995, the annual income of the poorest 20 per cent of India's households fell by 53 per cent, as I mentioned earlier. And in the same five-year period, that is, the last five years, the richest 20 per cent saw their annual household income grow 39 per cent. So, the poorest 20 per cent are down by 53 per cent, the richest 20 per cent are up by 39 per cent. This is what my senior colleague, Shri Rahul Gandhi was talking about when he spoke of two Indias.

The rapid expansion in income inequality in our country is not just a grave source of concern but, as Shri Rahul Gandhi had pointed out, an issue that really stands to threaten the social fabric that has held our country together since Independence. We have already seen one such instance from the recent railway recruitment drive where 1.25 crore applicants applied for just 35,000 listed jobs.

This grave unemployment crisis, that under this Government's watch threatens to convert our demographic dividend into a demographic disaster, required urgency and a sense of purpose from this Government which is missing in all this talk of *Amrit Kaal*. In fact, the poet, Dushyant Kumar put it quite well:

भूख है तो सब्र कर, रोटी नहीं तो क्या हुआ,

about:blank 10/61

# आजकल दिल्ली में है, ज़ेर ए बहस ये मुद्दा ।

That is all that is going on in this *behes*. There is no action coming out of this Government. Infact this reminds me, since we had the Prime Minister quoting from a distinguished former Prime Minister, let me quote a senior Member of this House, who used to be a Chief Minister. He said:

कहां जाएगा मेरा नव जवान, कहां जाएगा, यह गरीब मां का बेटा? कहां जाएगा, किस देश में रहेगा?

Kis desh mein rahega, is a very good question to ask the author of these words who is none other than our hon. Prime Minister himself. We should ask him. According to his Government, the answer for our jobless youth, who are facing not just poverty but an affront to their dignity and their ability to provide for their families today is that they have to wait for another 25 years for their Amrit Kaal. By their own logic, the Government appears to have adopted a twist to Sant Kabir Das's famous doha, which in today's India means:

आज करे सो कल करे, कल करे सो परसों, इतनी भी क्या जल्दी है, जब अच्छे दिन ना आने बरसों ।

It is a matter of national disgrace that this Government has during a period of record levels of unemployment and distress in the rural economy, chosen to slash the funds of MGNREGA by nearly 25 per cent

about:blank 11/61

or 1/4<sup>th</sup>. Last year in response to the unprecedented clamour for jobs, you were forced to bring in additional funding for the MGNREGA scheme through Supplementary Demands for Grants in December and that took the total allocation to Rs. 98,000 crore. Rather than learn from this experience, which we had warned the Government about – in my own Budget debate speech a year ago, I had warned the Finance Minister this would happen, it happened, and they have still not learnt the lesson – this year, they have again budgeted too little, just Rs. 73,000 crore for MGNREGA. It is an allocation that defies logic and blatantly ignores the on-ground reality in the country.

The Prime Minister kept telling us let us see the on-ground reality, the grassroots reality. That is what the Finance Minister needs to do herself because already out of Rs. 73,000 crore, Rs. 20,000 crore are pending in dues from last year that they have not paid. So, in effect, she has provided a paltry Rs. 50,000 crore for this entire scheme which is such a vital scheme to keep the rural population afloat. Most experts have consistently argued that MGNREGA needs a minimum of Rs. 1.34 lakh crore or up to a maximum of – depending on which experts you consult – Rs. 3.5 lakh crore in order to meet the increasing demand for jobs if you want to keep your promise of a minimum guarantee of 100 days of employment.

As of last year, an estimated 91 lakh households that demanded employment under the scheme were ignored. Forget developing an urban version of MGNREGA to address rising urban poverty, as many experts have advocated, the current allocations will mean that the Government will at best be able to provide 16 to 20 days of work, not 100.

about:blank 12/61

It is even worse than their miserable performance last year which saw that on an average, households received only 52 days of work as opposed to 100. So, this is supposed to be Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme, but neither the word 'employment' nor the word 'guarantee' is apparently of any value to this Government's ecosystem. They have not taken them seriously. They are providing no guarantees and no employment.

The Government may not have much regard for this scheme. The hon. Prime Minister once described it as a 'living monument of the failure of the UPA Government', but let me remind my colleagues this evening that it was that very monument of the UPA Government that served as a ventilator for the rural economy during the pandemic, a monument of the UPA which provided 13.3 crore Indians with jobs during the height of the pandemic after this Government abdicated its responsibility of shielding our citizens from the economic distress that engulfed rural India.

The Prime Minister was criticizing the Congress Party for helping people to go to their homes, but what arrangements have this Government made to feed, to shelter and look after these migrant workers in wherever they work?

There was absolutely no arrangement made and that is why they had to go home, and the Government remained shamefully culpable for what they have done. The truth is, with all of this distress that they did nothing about this indeed, MNREGA is a monument of the UPA for which the Government was forced to increase the budgetary allocations to Rs.1.11 lakh crore during the pandemic because it was the only lifeline for our rural people. And if that today is still seen by this

about:blank 13/61

Government as a monumental failure, then we are proud to wear this as a badge of honour. The monument was built by us; the failure is theirs.

This Budget has missed a far more vital issue. In a country where the median age stands at a youthful 28, how will we provide jobs for the millions of our underemployed and unemployed youth? This Budget talks about the creation of 60 lakh jobs over five years. I am sorry to say, respected Chairman, 12 lakh jobs a year, which is what it comes down to, is not any kind of solution in a country where 5.3 crore are currently unemployed and 47.5 lakh job seekers enter the job market each year in Labour Department's own figures. Our Government that tells the nation that there are 47.5 lakh people added to the unemployment list every year is grandly promising in the Budget 12 lakh jobs. This is what we are seeing. I must say that I am reminded again of the words of the immortal Dushyant Kumar:

'कहाँ तो तय था उजाला हर घर के लिए, कहाँ चिराग़ मयस्सर नहीं शहर के लिए।'

Not even a simple lamp for anybody! That is what this Government has reduced us to.

One concrete measure to boost employment generation would have been to support our ailing MSMEs, which till the commencement of the pandemic actually managed to employ 42 per cent of the people in this country who had any work, and that is despite the savage blow undertaken because of the demonetization. This Budget has done very, very little to recognize and support this extraordinary need.

While we welcome the announcement of the extension of the ECGL Scheme till March, 2023, merely providing credit support is never enough. It falls short of the recommendation by the Parliamentary

about:blank 14/61

Standing Committee on Industry which urged the Government to offer a larger economic package with long-term measures.

Sixty lakh MSMEs went out of business after demonetization. And SIDBI, the Prime Minister seemed to have referred to it though he pronounced it slightly differently, says that 67 per cent of the remaining MSMEs that they surveyed closed last year. So, you may disagree with our and SIDBI's assessment of the MSMEs that your policies have forced to close, but that is a bit rich given your own admission that the Government does not maintain any data on this, so I do not know how they can disagree with us. But the scale of the challenge has yet again been reaffirmed by the SIDBI report, the most recent one, which highlighted not just the closures but that more than 50 per cent of MSMEs witnessed a decline of more than 25 per cent in their revenues. So, I do not know what was the PM talking about when he praised himself, patted himself on the back about our MSMEs? I don't know.

Rather than offering concrete support, this Government has failed to provide basic interventions such as the restoration of the Interest Subvention Scheme or a reduction in GST rates, the 'Good and Simple Tax' which is neither good nor simple. That is the story that we have in the country. It is leaving manufacturers of auto parts with a 28 per cent slab. For the garment industry GST has been hiked from five per cent to 12 per cent. How are you going to get the economy to flourish without any concessions in these?

The MSMEs in these sectors are suffering terribly, and already the rising costs of commodities like fuel -- particularly, with this Government's taxes on petrol and diesel -- has made them even more unviable.

about:blank 15/61

The treatment of MSMEs mirrors the manner in which the agrarian economy, which is the other mainstay of employment in our country, has been short-changed in this Budget. Forget the promise of doubling farmer incomes by 2022-2023. Do you remember that promise, Sir, from the Prime Minister? They have wisely not repeated that promise this year. There was no mention of farm incomes in the Budget at all. Not only has this sector's share in the overall allocations declined from last year, but their announcements have left farmer unions alleging an attitude of revenge from this Government for having been forced to retract the poorly conceived Farm Bills. ... (*Interruptions*)

Sir, I am entitled to a few more minutes. I lost a bit at the beginning because of disturbance by people. I just want to say that the Government has only marginally increased the total allocation for agriculture by a miserly 4.4 per cent while slashing funding for key schemes like the Pradhan Mantri Fasal Bima Yojana, which is down by 3.1 per cent, significant reductions in key subsidies including for fertilisers, which is down by 25 per cent, and of course for petroleum, which is down by 11 per cent.

So, they can talk about increased procurement under MSP, but this is only restricted to wheat and paddy, and as farmer unions have pointed out that the number of beneficiaries of the MSP regime has fallen by 17 per cent and the quantity procured has fallen by seven per cent in the last year. We are seeing a real crisis in the farm sector with all the other cuts.

It is ironic when the Prime Minister keeps reminding us of how much strength of India lies in the villages and the need to bridge the gulf between urban and rural India whereas his Government's Budget is widening the chasm between these two Indias.

about:blank 16/61

There is much more that I could say, Sir. I do want to mention a couple of things. Certainly, the Budget's neglect is also going to further accelerate the hardships faced by other vulnerable sections in our country like fisherfolk. In my Constituency of Thiruvananthapuram, they are struggling with severe shortage of kerosene. They have largely slipped below the poverty line in the last couple of years. The Government is indifferent and there are no special measures for them.

There are a couple of things more. As regards defence, the Prime Minister again talked about the defence exports, but what is he giving to the soldiers who are already here? The overall Budget for defence has increased 4.3 per cent, but it is actually a nominal decrease once inflation has been factored in. We are happy that they may have increased the capital allocation, but it falls short of the Defence Ministry's own projections, which says that they would need Rs. 8.45 lakh crore to meet their modernization plans by 2026-2027 and that would require a 16 per cent year-on-year increase. So, the fact is that the Prime Minister's optimism is not warranted. ... (*Interruptions*)

Sir, kindly give me three more minutes. I do want to stress that there is a real problem with the defence's Budget not being increased, but equally let us look at health. We have been facing a pandemic for the last two years. The healthcare Budget has been grossly under-funded again. Despite the frailties in our medical infrastructure that were exposed by the pandemic, the health sector was only given Rs. 200 crore more this year. Once you factor-in inflation, there is also an overall decrease and it is a long way off from the goal envisaged in the National Health Policy 2017 of spending 2.5 per cent of our GDP on health. Ill-health drives our citizens into poverty, but the Government is not raising money for the National Health Mission.

about:blank 17/61

Sir, kindly give me two minutes more. Not all announcements in the Budget were unwelcome, but ... (*Interruptions*)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Please conclude now. There are two more speakers from your Party.

#### ... (Interruptions)

**DR. SHASHI THAROOR**: Sir, I know about it. I will abbreviate. I do want to stress that there are a couple of things in particular. There was a lot of celebration in the Budget about the announcement of increase in capital expenditure, but we are concerned about whether it will generate urgently needed jobs because of the Government's poor implementation record. CAPEX has actually fallen in each of the last three Quarters along with a decline in new project announcements in the last Quarter.

At the same time, we have heard about the Vande Bharat trains. We are very glad, and we, in Kerala, look forward to receiving them to enhance the speed of travel in our State. But there have been many specific requests for allocations missing, including in my own experience as an MP, I can say like a long-promised new terminal at Nemom, doubling of the Thiruvananthapuram to Kanyakumari line, introduction of new MEMU trains, etc. Nothing has been done, and I am sure that every MP has similar concerns. We have not seen any announcement of a new AIIMS for Kerala, which has been promised for many years. Of course, I have already talked about education, which has been completely neglected in this Budget.

I do want to stress that as far as we are concerned, we have been startled by the lack of consistency in the Government's approach even on privatisation. They make announcements, and they don't implement

about:blank 18/61

them. Last year, they announced the National Monetisation Pipeline to seek six lakh crore worth of old infrastructure to finance new infrastructure-building. Again, this year, they are silent on it. They announced the imminent privatisation of two banks and an insurance company. What happened? Nothing, this year they didn't even mention it.

If you look at the Budgets of this Government, not only have they been 'announcement government' rather than 'an action or implementation government'. They keep promising things, and moving the goalposts; and now, they have moved it for another 25 years.

I would conclude, Sir, that a talent for developing flashy slogans is not enough. In fact, today, instead of *Amrit Kaal* over the next 25 years, today, our people are facing *Andhkaal*, and for this, it is extremely important that we must find a solution. Things are looking dark for our people but the dawn will come, because I must say, 2024 is not very far .

SHRI ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY (BAHARAMPUR): Sir, Budget is a matter concerning Lok Sabha. Until the Lok Sabha appropriates the sum demanded by the Finance Ministry, the Government cannot go ahead. ... (*Interruptions*) Here, on this solemn occasion, our Finance Minister is conspicuously absent. It is really an unbecoming scenario. ... (*Interruptions*)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Adhir *ji*, let us hear the hon. Minister of State for Finance.

#### ... (Interruptions)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Hon. Member, I will permit you after hearing the hon. Minister

about:blank 19/61

.... (Interruptions)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Shri Premachandran, let us hear the Minister. Please be patient.

... (Interruptions)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Hon. Members, heavens will not fall. Don't worry. Let us hear the Minister. Thereafter, you can react.

... (Interruptions)

वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (डॉ. भागवत कराड): सर, प्रधान मंत्री जी की स्पीच समाप्त होने के बाद बजट पर डिस्कशन चालू हो गया था। पहले स्पीकर डॉ. शिश थरूर जी थे। उन्होंने बजट के बारे में जो डिस्कस किया है, उसे मैं ध्यान से सुन रहा था। हम यहां पर बैठकर माननीय सदस्यों को लगातार सुन रहे हैं।...(व्यवधान)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON:** Hon. Members, be patient. If necessary, I would advise the Government.

... (Interruptions)

**DR. BHAGWAT KARAD:** All the points raised by Dr. Shashi Tharoor have been noted down, and all the points will be answered. ... (*Interruptions*) What exactly you want? ... (*Interruptions*)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON:** Is the Minister coming or not?

... (*Interruptions*)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: I will call, please take your seats. Let him continue. I will call you. you

... (*Interruptions*)

about:blank 20/61

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Please hear me. This is not fair on your part. Please respect the Chair. Bear with the Chair. I will advise the Government. I think, the hon. Finance Minister is a little engaged in other matters.

... (Interruptions)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Hon. Members, kindly wait. I will advise the Government.

... (Interruptions)

HON. CHAIRPERSON: Shrimati Supriya Sule, please hear me.

... (Interruptions)

HON. CHAIRPERSON: Please, let him continue. I will call him.

... (Interruptions)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Please hear me. Please respect the Chair. I will advise the Government. I think that the hon. Finance Minister is engaged in some other work. I will advise the Government.

... (Interruptions)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON:** Supriya ji, please sit. Adhir ji, please sit. I will advise the Government.

... (Interruptions)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON:** No, please sit. At least, let him speak. This is not fair on your part. All of you are standing together.

... (Interruptions)

about:blank 21/61

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Mr. Adhir Ranjan, I will advise the Government. please sit down.

... (Interruptions)

#### 19.45 hrs

At this stage, Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury, Shri N. K. Premachandran and some other hon. Members then left the House.

... (Interruptions)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Please take your seat. Speak from your seat. Nishikant ji, please continue.

... (Interruptions)

# डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे (गोड्डा): धन्यवाद सभापति महोदय ।

मैं माननीय प्रधानमंत्री जी के नेतृत्व में, वित्त मंत्री जी द्वारा एक गांव, गरीब, किसान, महिला, दिलत, पिछड़े, भूखे-नंगे आदिवासियों के हक में लाए हुए बजट के समर्थन में बोलने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूं।... (व्यवधान)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Nothing will go on record except Nishikant ji's speech.

... (Interruptions) ... \*

डॉ. निशिकांत दुवे: सभापित महोदय, अभी जब कांग्रेस के लोग बोल रहे थे, उनके जो मुख्य वक्ता बोल रहे थे, तो मुझे हमेशा लगता था कि कांग्रेस एक पुरानी पार्टी है, सोच-समझकर बोलती है, नियम-कानून की जानकारी है, लेकिन मैं आपको बताना चाहूंगा कि आजकल कांग्रेस पार्टी सेलेक्टिव एम्नेसिया की शिकार है।... (व्यवधान) उसको जो अपने पक्ष में नजर आता है, उसके बारे में बात करती है जैसे, जो उसके मुख्य वक्ता थे, उन्होंने बॉयकाट जानबूझकर कर लिया। यह देखिए कि कांग्रेस पार्टी को कितना इतिहास और भूगोल पता है या

about:blank 22/61

चीजों के बारे में कितनी जानकारी है। ... (व्यवधान) आज माननीय प्रधानमंत्री जी ने, यहां लोक सभा के स्पीकर महोदय ने लता जी की मृत्यु के ऊपर संवेदना व्यक्त की, दुख व्यक्त किया और पूरा देश दुख में है, लेकिन कांग्रेस पार्टी के जो मुख्य वक्ता थे, मैं उनकी जानकारी के बारे में बता दूं कि कल उन्होंने एक ट्वीट किया कि लता मंगेशकर गोवा में पैदा हुईं। ... (व्यवधान) इतनी शेमफुल बात है कि कांग्रेस को यह भी नहीं पता है कि भारत रत्न लता मंगेशकर जी इन्दौर में पैदा हुईं, गोवा में पैदा नहीं हुई थीं, वह उनका पुश्तैनी घर था। ... (व्यवधान)

HON. CHAIRPERSON: You have already walked out. Please go there.

... (Interruptions)

**डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे :** सभापति महोदय, आज कांग्रेस की जो हालत है । वह हालत ऐसी है ... (व्यवधान)

सभापित महोदय, यह क्या हो रहा है? ...(व्यवधान) ये बॉयकाट करते हुए फिर वापस आ जाते हैं। मैंने पहले कहा है कि सेलेक्टिव एम्नेसिया है। कांग्रेसी यह तय ही नहीं कर पाते हैं कि उनको समर्थन करना है या विरोध करना है, हाउस में रहना है या हाउस के बाहर रहना है। ... (व्यवधान) यही कारण है कि इतनी बड़ी पोलिटिकल पार्टी आज एक रीज़नल पार्टी के तौर पर हो गई है।... (व्यवधान) मुंशी प्रेमचन्द की एक बहुत अच्छी लाइन है कि अमीरी की कब्र पर पनपी गरीबी बड़ी जहरीली होती है। ... (व्यवधान) कभी किसी जमाने में कांग्रेस अमीर हुआ करती थी, आज चूंकि वह गरीब हो गई, उसे दूर तक सत्ता नजर नहीं आ रही है, इसीलिए बेबात की बात करना, बतंगड़ खड़ा करना कांग्रेस की आदत है और इसी कारण ये हंगामा कर रहे हैं।... (व्यवधान) अभी मैंने दुष्यंत कुमार से लेकर ग़ालिब तक की सारी गज़लें और कपलेट्स सुन ली हैं। उनके पास बोलने के लिए कोई शब्द नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान) क्या है कि जब कांग्रेस का शासन था, उनके लिए एक बहुत अच्छी शायरी है:

"न मांझी, न रहबर, न हक में हवाएं है कश्ती भी जर्जर, ये कैसा सफ़र है।"

about:blank 23/61

सभापित महोदय, कांग्रेस को अपने सफ़र के बारे में पता ही नहीं था। पिछले आठ साल से, जब से हमारे प्रधानमंत्री जी आए हैं, उनकी एक लाइन है, वे हमेशा कहते हैं:

> "अलग ही मजा है फकीरी में अपना, न पाने का ग़म है, न खोने का डर ।"

यह जो बजट है, यह बजट इसी तरह से है ।...(व्यवधान) मैं आपको बताऊं। ...(व्यवधान)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Please take you seat. Nishikant ji, please speak.

**डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे**: सर, पूरी दुनिया कोरोना से ग्रसित है। पूरी दुनिया कोरोना के हाहाकार में है। माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने जो सुबह कहा ...(व्यवधान)

SHRIMATI SUPRIYA SADANAND SULE (BARAMATI): Mr. Chairman, Sir, this is very important. The Budget of this country is being discussed. All we are saying is that we expect the Cabinet Minister of Finance to be a part of this debate. ... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS, MINISTER OF COAL AND MINISTER OF MINES (SHRI PRALHAD JOSHI): She is coming. ... (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI SUPRIYA SADANAND SULE: Okay. Thank you. We appreciate that. ... (*Interruptions*)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: She is coming. Please cooperate with the House. We cannot pass the Budget unless she comes.

**SHRIMATI SUPRIYA SADANAND SULE**: Thank you. All we are bringing to the notice of the House is that there is no quorum. That is all.

about:blank 24/61

There is no quorum. This is an important issue. The Budget is a very important document. Let us all take it seriously. Thank you.

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: The point is well taken.

**SHRI PRALHAD JOSHI:** Sir, let me clarify this. When the discussion was initiated from the Opposition side, hon. Finance Minister was sitting in the Rajya Sabha chamber.

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: It was displayed on the screens. Everybody knows that.

**SHRI PRALHAD JOSHI**: Let me clarify this, Sir. The Minister of State for Finance is sitting here. Two Cabinet Ministers are sitting here. ... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND MINISTER OF PANCHAYATI RAJ (SHRI GIRIRAJ SINGH): Three Cabinet Ministers are here. ... (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI PRALHAD JOSHI:** Maran ji, please understand. Three Cabinet Ministers are present here including me.

**SHRIMATI SUPRIYA SADANAND SULE**: All we are saying is that Budget is a very important document. ... (*Interruptions*)

HON. CHAIRPERSON: Hon. Member Sule, please put this to rest.

**SHRI PRALHAD JOSHI:** The Finance Minister will not be able to be present all the time. When the discussion was initiated by the Opposition, the hon. Finance Minister was there. Now, Minister of State for Finance and other senior Cabinet Ministers are here. ... (*Interruptions*)

about:blank 25/61

**SHRIMATI SUPRIYA SADANAND SULE**: What about the quorum, Sir. ... (*Interruptions*)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON:** Hon. Member Nishikant Dubey, you please continue.

डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे: सभापित महोदय, यह इन लोगों का दिवालियापन है कि इनको लगा कि हमारे पांच आदिमयों के बाहर निकलने से कोरम का मुद्दा उठाया जा सकता है। बाहर से यिद आना है और मैं सारे कांग्रेस पार्टी के लोग जो बाहर खड़े हैं तो मैं लोक सभा टेलीविजन वालों से आग्रह करूंगा कि वे पूरे देश को दिखाएं कि वे किस तरह से डिरेल करने के लिए, चूंकि इस देश में माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी, जो गरीब हैं, पिछड़े हैं और दिलत को सम्मान देना चाहते हैं। महिलाओं को सम्मान देना चाहते हैं; इस कारण से ये सब बायकॉट के तौर पर कोरम की बात उठा रहे हैं। सर, क्या यह कोई तरीका है कि वे लॉबी में खड़े होकर कोरम की बात कर रहे हैं? मैं यह मानता हूं कि सरकारी पार्टी होने के नाते इस समय इस सदन में हमारे लोगों की संख्या होनी चाहिए, लेकिन जब कभी वर्ष 2004 से लेकर 2014 तक कांग्रेस का शासन था तो मैक्सिमम टाइम कोरम भारतीय जनता पार्टी ने पूरा किया, हमने पूरा किया। राजा साहब, आप मंत्री थे, उस समय हमने कोरम पूरा किया था। ...(व्यवधान)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Hon. Member, come to the point. We are discussing the General Budget

**डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे**: यहां चार जगहों पर लोग बैठे हुए हैं। राज्य सभा में कौन लोग हैं, कौन लॉबी में बैठे हुए हैं, कौन जानता है?

सर, पूरा देश कोरोना से जूझ रहा है । ग्लोबल वर्ल्ड की पूरी अवधारणा खत्म हो गई । हमारे वेद पुराण में जो लिखा गया कि -

"अयं निजः परो वेति गणना लघु चेतसाम् । उदारचरितानां तु वसुधैव कुटुम्बकम्।"

about:blank 26/61

यह सब खत्म हो गया है। आप यह समिझए पिता की लाश जलाने के लिए वहां बेटा नहीं जा रहा है, बेटे की सेवा करने के लिए वहां माँ मौजूद नहीं है, कोई समाज कंधा देने के लिए तैयार नहीं है। यह देश इस सिचुएशन में है और इस देश का बजट आया है। क्या हम सबकी सामूहिक जिम्मेवारी नहीं है कि इस बजट के बारे में चर्चा करें, उसकी अच्छाई के बारे में बताएं, उसकी बुराई के बारे में बताएं और फिर देश को बताएं कि हमने किस तरह से कोरोना के होते हुए भी पिछले दो साल में 9 परसेंट से ज्यादा इकोनॉमी को बढ़ाया है, जीडीपी को बढ़ाया है? क्या यह अपोज़िशन का फर्ज नहीं है? मैंने आपको कहा कि जो मुंशी प्रेमचंद की लाइन है - अमीरी की कब्र पर पनपी हुई गरीबी बड़ी जहरीली होती है। दस साल सत्ता भोगने के बाद, 70 साल में से 60 साल सत्ता भोगने के बाद कांग्रेस को जब यह दिखाई दे रहा है कि वह कभी सत्ता में वापस नहीं आएगी तो इस तरह के हथकंडे अपनाकर, इस तरह की घटियापंती करके वह डिबेट को रोकना चाहती है और गांव, गरीब तथा किसानों के हक को मारना चाहती है।

सर, हमारे बिहार में एक कहावत है कि सावन में जो बच्चा पैदा होता है, उसको सब कुछ हरा-हरा दिखाई देता है । मैंने काँग्रेस की पूरी बजट स्पीच को देखा है । सर, आप मंत्री रहे हैं ।

सभापित महोदय, राजा साहब, जब आप मंत्री थे और हम लोग माननीय एमपीज थे तो हम ने मनरेगा का कानून पास किया। क्या हमें यह पता नहीं है कि मनरेगा एक डिमांड ड्रिवेन प्रोग्राम है। जितना पैसा चाहिए और जहां पैसा चाहिए, वह पैसा सरकार देगी। इसीलिए सरकार एक नोशनल बजट देती है। आप ने कभी 35-40 हजार करोड़ रुपए से आगे नहीं दिया। पिछले सात-आठ सालों में लगभग चार-पांच करोड़ की आबादी बढ़ी होगी। हम ने 130 करोड़ लोगों के लिए एक लाख करोड़ रुपए तक दिए हैं। इस बजट में 73 हजार करोड़ रुपए दिए गए हैं, तो जितना पैसा मांगा जाएगा, वह दिया जाएगा। क्या इसी तरह का डिबेट और डिसकशन होगा?

सर, मैं इंटरलिंकिंग ऑफ रिवर्स के बारे में बताना चाहता हूं । केन-बेतवा एक प्रोजेक्ट है । मैं इस बजट की ओर आना चाहता हूं । इस देश के बहुत बड़े

about:blank 27/61

नेता हैं, युवराज हैं । हम लोग छोटे आदमी हैं, उनका नाम नहीं लेना चाहते हैं । के.एल. राव जी, नेहरू जी के समय, इंदिरा जी के समय से इस देश की हालत ऐसी है कि कहीं सूखा है, तो कहीं बहुत बारिश होती है । पानी की स्थित यह है कि कहीं निदयों में बाढ़ आ जाती है । मैं जिस इलाके से चुन कर आया हूं, मैं जिस इलाके में पैदा हुआ हूं, हम उस इलाके में प्रत्येक साल बाढ़ से जूझते हैं । जिस वक्त हमारे यहां बाढ़ की स्थित होती है, उस वक्त दूसरी निदयां सूखी होती हैं । इसीलिए 60 के दशक से ये बातें चल रही हैं । आज माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी कह रहे थे कि कोई योजना इतने दिनों से चली और चलती रही । इसके बाद वाजपेयी जी की सरकार बनी । सर, कुछ नहीं हुआ, वर्ष 1960-65 के बाद, मिस्टर राव के बाद लोगों ने उसको ठंडे बस्ते में डाल दिया । जब माननीय अटल वाजपेयी जी इस देश के प्रधान मंत्री बने, तो उन्होंने सुरेश प्रभु जी के नेतृत्व में इंटरलिंकिंग ऑफ रिवर्स के लिए एक कमेटी बनाई । उस समय डीएमके भी उस शासन की पार्ट थी।

दयानिधि मारन साहब यहां बैठे हुए हैं, इनके पिता जी उस सरकार में मंत्री थे। वापजेयी जी ने यह तय किया कि इस काम में काफी लेट हो गए हैं और हमें रिवर्स का सेलेक्शन करना चाहिए, क्योंकि हमें किसानों की उपज को दोगुना करना है। मैं जिस राज्य से चुन कर आया हूं, उस राज्य में आज भी केवल 12 प्रतिशत से 13 प्रतिशत जमीन के लिए ही सिंचाई का साधन उपलब्ध है। हमारी जो सिंचित भूमि है, वह 12 प्रतिशत से 13 प्रतिशत है। आप समझ सकते हैं कि हमारे पानी से बंगाल में सिंचाई होती है। चाहे वह मसानजोर डैम हो, पंचेत डैम हो, मैथन डैम हो या दामोदर वैली कॉर्पोरेशन का इतना बड़ा संगठन हो, जहां बिजली पैदा हो रही है, लेकिन हमारे राज्य में, हमारा पानी होते हुए भी, हम केवल 12 प्रतिशत और 14 प्रतिशत पर निर्भर हैं। वर्ष 2004 में जब सरकार बनी, जो युवराज हैं, अल्ट्रा कम्युनिस्ट पार्टी के नेता हैं और उन्हीं के पीछे-पीछे ये सीधा चलते हैं। इनको किसी चीज से मतलब नहीं है, क्योंकि इन्होंने कभी गांव नहीं देखा है, किसानी नहीं देखी है, गरीब नहीं देखा है, खेती कैसे की जाती है, पानी की क्या आवश्यकता है? इन्होंने वन फाइन मॉर्निंग यह डिसिजन ले लिया कि अब कोई इंटिरलिकेंग ऑफ रिवर नहीं होगी। इनसे इनको लगा कि

about:blank 28/61

इकोलॉजी बिगड़ जाएगी, एनवायरन्मेंट बिगड़ जाएगा और 10 सालों तक देश के किसान तड़पते रहे, मरते रहे । चाहे वे बुंदेलखंड के लोग हों, जिनके पास पीने के लिए पानी नहीं है, चाहे झारखंड के हमारे जैसे लोग हों, ओडिशा के लोग हों, आंध्र प्रदेश के लोग हों, तिमलनाड़ के लोग हों या आंध्र प्रदेश का जो बंटवारा हुआ है, वे लोग भी डैम बनाने के लिए एक एग्रीमेंट का पार्ट हैं । 10 सालों तक कुछ नहीं किया गया । जब माननीय मोदी जी की सरकार आई तो इस बजट से केवल केन-बेतवा ही नहीं, मध्य प्रदेश और उत्तर प्रदेश के किसानों को ही फायदा नहीं होगा, उनकी लाखों हेक्टेयर जमीन की ही सिंचाई नहीं होगी बल्कि इनके अलावा चाहे दमन गंगा-पिंजाल का सवाल हो, पार तापी-नर्मदा का सवाल हो, गोदावरी-कृष्णा का सवाल हो, कृष्णा-पेन्नार नदी का सवाल हो, या पेन्नार-कावेरी का सवाल हो, क्या यह देश के लिए बजट नहीं है, किसानों के लिए बजट नहीं है? यदि 10 सालों तक इस कांग्रेस पार्टी ने यह काम नहीं किया, इसने बर्बाद करने का काम किया, तो क्या यह पूरी देश की जनता को जानने का हक नहीं है । क्या यह माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी और माननी वित्त मंत्री जी के लिए मेज थपथपाने का समय नहीं है? हमने इतने वर्षों के बाद किसानों की सुध ली है । इसी तरह से देश चलेगा।

दूसरा है, गंगा किनारे मेरा गांव, फिल्मों गाना आता रहा है, सुदीप साहब जिस क्षेत्र से बिलॉंग करते हैं, वहां गंगा जा कर मिलती है ।

### **20.00 hrs**

मैं प्रत्येक साल, बच्चे की उम्र से लेकर आज तक, ऐसा कोई साल नहीं है, जब मेरे गांव में बाढ़ नहीं आती है, ऐसा कोई साल नहीं है । हमारी इतनी उपजाऊ भूमि है, जहाँ तीन फसलों की खेती हो सकती है, वहाँ केवल एक फसल की ही खेती होती है । कई बार ऐसा होता है कि यदि हमारे खेतों में मकई लगा हुआ है, अरहर लगा हुआ है, तो गंगा में बाढ़ का पानी आता है और सारी फसलें उसमें चली जाती हैं । इसी कारण से जल्दी-जल्दी फसल पैदा करने के लिए डीएपी का यूज करते हैं, फर्टिलाइजर का यूज करते हैं, केमिकल का यूज करते हैं । उसमें ऐसी क्वालिटी की फसल लगाना चाहते हैं, जिससे कम समय में

about:blank 29/61

फसल पैदा हो जाए । इस बजट में क्या हुआ? इस बजट में पहली बार हम गंगा माता की बात करते हैं, गौ माता की बात करते हैं । हम कहते हैं कि गंगा के किनारे जो पूरा-का-पूरा लैंड है, वह फर्टाइल लैंड है। लेकिन इस बजट में पहली बार यह दिखाई दे रहा है कि पाँच किलोमीटर चौड़े दायरे में, चाहे बाएं या दाएं, पूरी-की-पूरी आर्गेनिक खेती के लिए यह सरकार कटिबद्ध है । माननीय प्रधानमंत्री जी ने कहा कि आर्गेनिक खेती का जो प्रचलन है, यहाँ सिक्किम के सांसद बैठे हैं, यदि उनसे पूछा जाए, तो पता चलेगा कि सिक्किम एक ऐसा राज्य है, जिसने नॉर्थ-ईस्ट में और पूरे देश में एक दिशा दिखाने का काम किया है। वहाँ सेंट-परसेंट आर्गेनिक खेती है और उसके कारण किसानों को दोगुना ही नहीं, तिगुना और चौगुना फसल की कीमत मिलती है और उनकी आय दोगुनी-तिगुनी हो रही है । यह दो तरफा काम है । एक तरफ किसानों को आर्गेनिक खेती की तरफ बढ़ावा देना है और दूसरा यह है कि जो केमिकल-फर्टिलाइजर के कारण, बाढ़ के पानी के कारण, बारिश के कारण पाँच किलोमीटर के दायरे में खेत होते थे, उसमें गंगा का पानी भर जाता था । मैं जिस इलाके से आता हूँ, वहाँ बटेश्वर स्थान में पूरा एरिया गंगा की डॉल्फिन से भरा है । वहाँ गंगा की डॉल्फिन मर जाती थी । अगर वहाँ आर्गेनिक खेती होगी, तो केमिकल-फर्टिलाइजर का यूज कम होगा और सारे के सारे किसान चाहे वे उत्तर प्रदेश के किसान हों, चाहे बिहार के किसान हों, चाहे झारखण्ड के किसान हों, चाहे बंगाल के किसान हों, आप यह बताएं कि इसमें कौन-सी राजनीति है? आज झारखण्ड में कांग्रेस समर्थित सरकार है, बंगाल में टीएमसी की सरकार है । यदि हमने किसानों की बात की, बजट की बात की, तो क्या आप नहीं सुनना चाहेंगे? इसलिए मैंने कहा कि 2014 में नहीं, सावन का जो बच्चा पैदा होता है, उसे सब कुछ हरा-हरा दिखाई देता है, उसको बजट में कोई भी चीज दिखाई ही नहीं देती है ।

यदि मैं पीएम गतिशक्ति की बात बताता हूँ। इस पर बात होती है तो आप कहते हैं कि जुमला देते हैं, हवा देते हैं, कोई काम नहीं करते हैं, आपको कैसे दिखाई देगा। रेल के प्रोजेक्ट्स आपको कैसे दिखाई देंगे? मैं जिस इलाके से सांसद हूँ, मेरे लोक सभा क्षेत्र का नाम गोड्डा है। गोड्डा में आजादी के 75 साल

about:blank 30/61

बाद भी, मैं जहाँ से सांसद हूँ, वहाँ कांग्रेस पार्टी के बिहार के पूर्व मुख्यमंत्री और केन्द्र में रहे पूर्व मंत्री श्री भागवत झा आजाद का घर है। यहाँ श्री रामेश्वर ठाकुर जी वित्त मंत्री रहे, उनका घर है। श्री भागवत झा आजाद जी कांग्रेस के बड़े नेता थे, जो मुख्यमंत्री रहे और केन्द्र में मंत्री रहे। श्री रामेश्वर ठाकुर जी भी केन्द्र में मंत्री रहे, बिजली मंत्री रहे श्री चन्द्रशेखर जी का भी घर है। यह मेरी पूरी कांस्टिट्यूएंसी है। उस गोड़ा में आजादी के 75 वर्ष बाद तक रेल लाइन नहीं थी।

यदि इस साल यानी वर्ष 2021 में, आजादी के ठीक 75 साल बाद, माननीय प्रधानमंत्री जी के नेतृत्व में वहाँ रेल लाइन पहुंचा दी गई, तो क्या पीएम गतिशक्ति काम नहीं कर रही है? क्या गरीबों को रेल देखने का अधिकार नहीं है? मैं आप लोगों को फोटोग्राफ दिखाऊँगा, तो आप लोगों को आश्चर्य होगा कि जब रेल का उद्घाटन हो रहा था, तो रेल को देखने के लिए गोड्डा में लगभग पाँच लाख लोगों की भीड़ थी । आज भी ऐसे रिमोट एरियाज हैं, जहाँ रेल नहीं है । मैं जिस इलाके से आता हूँ, वह एक एस्पिरेशनल डिस्ट्रिक्ट है । एस्पिरेशनल डिस्ट्रिक्ट होने के नाते, आप समझिए कि वहाँ कोई इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर नहीं था । वहाँ एक भी स्कूल, कॉलेज नहीं था । आप इंजीनियरिंग कॉलेज की तो बात ही छोड़ दीजिए । लेकिन आज मेरे इलाके में तीन केन्द्रीय विद्यालय हैं, दो पॉलिटेक्निक कॉलेजेज हैं, दो इंजीनियरिंग कॉलेजेज हैं, दो नवोदय विद्यालय हैं, एग्रीकल्चर के दो-दो कॉलेजेज हैं, डेयरी का एक-एक कॉलेज है, एम्स है और चार फोन लेन के लगभग छ: नैशनल हाइवेज हैं । क्या आजादी के 70 साल के बाद हमारे लोगों को यह देखने की फुर्सत नहीं थी, क्या वह देखना नहीं चाहते थे? यदि उनका कोई एमपी यहाँ बोल पाने की स्थिति में नहीं है, यदि वह लड़ाई लड़ पाने की स्थिति में नहीं है, तो क्या आप छोटे और पिछड़ी जगहों को रेल नहीं देंगे, रोड नहीं देंगे, स्कूल नहीं देंगे, कॉलेज नहीं देंगे, हॉस्पिटल नहीं देंगे?

आज भी हमारे लोग, ज्यादातर जितने भी बिहार और झारखंड के एमपीज़ हैं, वे एम्स, दिल्ली आने के लिए अपना पूरा का पूरा इन्फ्रास्ट्रक्चर क्रिएट किए हुए हैं । वे यहां आएंगे, उनके पीए उनको ले जाएंगे, दिखाएंगे, उनको रुकवाएंगे, उनको खिलाएंगे-पिलाएंगे, उनको टिकट देंगे । आज मेरे गोड्डा जैसे पिछड़े इलाके में एम्स खुल गया है, एयरपोर्ट खुल गया है । ...(व्यवधान) यदि चप्पल

about:blank 31/61

पहनने वाले को जाना है, तो कुशीनगर में, देवघर में, छोटी-छोटी जगहों पर क्या आपने 70 सालों में ये सब बनाने की कोशिश की? ... (व्यवधान) आपने क्यों नहीं कोशिश की? ... (व्यवधान) पीएम गति शक्ति से मल्टी-मॉडल कनेक्टिविटी आएगी।

श्री राजीव प्रताप रूडी साहब यहां नहीं हैं। परसों ही वे शिलान्यास करके आए हैं। गंगा को आपने नैशनल लाइन डिक्लेयर कर दिया, लेकिन क्या कभी सोचा कि यह जो ट्रांसपोर्टेशन है, जो रेल के मुकाबले, जो रोड के मुकाबले सस्ता पड़ेगा और इस पानी का यूज़ यदि हम वॉटरवेज़ के तौर पर करेंगे, तो केवल बड़े-बड़े राज्यों जैसे तिमलनाडु, महाराष्ट्र और गुजरात के लोगों का हक नहीं है कि वे पोर्ट देखें, हमारे जैसे लोगों का भी हक है कि वे पोर्ट देखें। ...(व्यवधान) क्या आपने कभी इसे देखा?

आज छपरा में मल्टी-मॉडल पोर्ट बन रहा है। मेरे इलाके में, जहां से मैं सांसद हूं, वहां साहबगंज में ऑलरेडी बन गया है। प्रधान मंत्री जी ने उसका उद्घाटन कर दिया है। मैं आपको बताऊं कि वहीं के इलाके में 60 सालों में लोग भूखे-प्यासे मर गए, आंदोलन होता रहा कि झारखंड में गंगा नदी पर एक पुल होना चाहिए।

आज तक आपने उसको राष्ट्रीय प्रोजेक्ट नहीं घोषित किया और वह नैशनल हाईवे नहीं बन सका। अब उसका काम चालू हो गया है और दो सालों में गंगा नदी पर पुल बन जाएगा। इतनी छोटी-छोटी जगहों पर ये काम आपको नहीं दिखाई दे रहे हैं? आप पीएम गतिशक्ति का मजाक उड़ाते रहेंगे?

आप इसलिए मजाक उड़ाते रहते हैं क्योंकि आप अच्छी अंग्रेजी बोलते हैं, अच्छी जगह से आते हैं, आप विदशों में जैसे अमेरिका या लंदन में रहे हैं, आप दिल्ली में राजनीति करते हैं और दिल्ली में राजनीति करके आप अपने रिलेशन्स बनाए हुए हैं। आप अपने क्षेत्र में बड़े-बड़े प्रोजेक्ट्स ले जाते हैं और जो गरीब सांसद है, वह पांच-दस सालों में ऐसे ही बियाबान में खो जाता है और उसके लोग इंतजार करते रहते हैं कि आ जाएगा, आ जाएगा, आ जाएगा। यदि माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी आज इसे पूरा कर रहे हैं तो गांव के गरीब किसान उनको वोट

about:blank 32/61

क्यों नहीं देंगे और वे लगातार जब तक चाहेंगे, तब तक इस देश के प्रधान मंत्री क्यों नहीं रहेंगे, यह आपके सोचने का विषय है । ...(व्यवधान)

### **20.07 hrs** (Shri Kodikunnil Suresh *in the Chair*)

सर, जहां तक सवाल एग्रीकल्चर का है, नारे खूब चलते हैं। कांग्रेस का नारा '—जय जवान, जय किसान'। यह नारा शास्त्री जी ने दिया था, लेकिन मैं आपको बताऊं कि शास्त्री जी की डेथ वर्ष 1966 में हुई थी। आज तक किसानों को टैक्नोलॉजी के साथ जोड़ने के लिए भारत सरकार ने क्या-क्या काम किए? वह समय था, मैं यह मान सकता हूं कि वर्ष 2004 से वर्ष 2014 तक पवार साहब थे, उन्होंने किसानों के लिए निश्चित तौर पर काम किया, लेकिन एक मंत्री के नाते एक सीमा होती है, क्योंकि जब तक प्रधान मंत्री आपके साथ न हों, तब तक आप बहुत कुछ कर पाने की स्थिति में नहीं होते हैं।

आज इस बजट में ड्रोन की बात है। 'जय जवान, जय किसान, जय विज्ञान' का भी नारा आया। आज यदि डिफेंस में ड्रोन की आवश्यकता है तो किसानों को भी ड्रोन टैक्नोलॉजी के लिए प्रोत्साहित किया जाना चाहिए, जिससे वे अपनी फसल की रक्षा कर पाए, फर्टिलाइज़र भी दे पाएं, जिससे वे टैक्नोलॉजी का भरपूर उपयोग कर पाएं, कीटनाशकों का उपयोग कर पाएं। ...(व्यवधान)

श्री भर्तृहरि महताब (कटक) : थोड़ी देर पहले हमने प्रधान मंत्री जी को सुना था । इस देश में 80 प्रतिशत किसान मार्जिनल फार्मर्स हैं । ...(व्यवधान) उनके लिए ड्रोन टैक्नोलॉजी शायद वर्ष 2047 में आएगी, जब हमारा सेंटिनेरी सेलिब्रेशन होगा । आप यही बात कह रहे हैं? ... (व्यवधान)

डॉ. संजय जायसवाल (पश्चिम चम्पारण) : वह अभी से ही आएगी । ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री गिरिराज सिंह** : आएगी नहीं, आ चुकी है **।** ...(व्यवधान)

about:blank 33/61

डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे: सभापति महोदय, इस बजट में वित्त मंत्री जी ने कहा है कि use of kisan drones will be promoted for crop assessment along with digitization of land records, spraying of insecticides and nutrients. यह इस बजट में है और यह आज शुरू हो जाएगा । जब बजट इम्प्लीमेंटेशन का पेपर अगले साल आएगा, तो हमने कहां-कहां क्या प्रोजेक्ट किए, वह भी बताया जाएगा, क्योंकि यह केवल घोषणा नहीं है । मोदी जी के बजट में कोई घोषणा नहीं होती है, बल्कि काम कैसे किया जाएगा, इसका पूरा प्लान बनता है और इसलिए इसमें इसका जिक्र है । क्वालिटी एजुकेशन की भी बात है । मैं पिछड़े इलाके से बाबा साहब अम्बेडकर जी के संविधान के कारण पढ़कर यहां आया हूं । कोरोना काल के कारण जिस तरह से दो साल से माहौल है, उसकी वजह से लगभग सभी स्कूल, कालेजेज बंद हैं । स्कूल, कालेजेज बंद होने के कारण इन दो सालों में किसी पर असर हुआ या नहीं हुआ, लेकिन गरीब बच्चों पर सबसे ज्यादा असर हुआ है । उसका कारण यह है कि मैं जिस एस्प्रेशनल डिस्ट्रिक्ट से आता हूं, वहां आज भी यह हालत है कि 4जी या 5जी की बात छोड़िए, इंटरनेट या मोबाइल पर बात नहीं कर सकते हैं । जब बात ही नहीं कर सकते हैं तो गांवों में बच्चों को कैसे पढ़ा सकते हैं क्योंकि फिजिकल क्लासेज नहीं चल रही हैं। पहली बार किसी प्रधान मंत्री ने या वित्त मंत्री ने अपने बजट में Universalisation of quality education और उसमें कैसे टीवी के माध्यम से डिजिटल यूनिवर्सिटी के माध्यम से और किस तरह से रीजनल लैंग्वेज में पढ़ाई कराई जा सके, इसे भी ध्यान में रखा है । रीजनल लैंग्वेज की बात भी है कि केवल जिन्हें हिंदी आती है या अंग्रेजी आती है, वही नौकरी कर सकते हैं। जो वेरियस लैंग्वेजेज हैं, जो स्पोकन लैंग्वेजेज हैं, वे लैंग्वेजेज नहीं जो कि आठवीं अनुसूची में हैं, जैसे भोजपुरी और राजस्थानी भाषा का बहुत बड़ा सवाल चल रहा है । आप समझिए कि आप कैसे पढ़ाई करके आगे बढ़ सकते हैं, यह इस बजट में दिया गया है, तो क्या यह बजट गरीबों के लिए नहीं है, गरीब बच्चों के लिए नहीं है? मुझे इस बात का फख्र है कि झारखंड सरकार ने कोरोना काल के दो सालों में जिस ज्ञानोदय ऐप का यूज किया, जिसके कारण पूरे झारखंड के बच्चे पढ़ रहे हैं, वह ऐप मैंने डेवलप कराया है । वह ऐप मेरे लोकसभा क्षेत्र गोड्डा में डेवलप हुआ । जो लोग बिजनेस मैन का विरोध करते हैं, मैं बताना चाहता हूं कि अडानी का एक पावर प्लांट मेरे

about:blank 34/61

संसदीय क्षेत्र में आ रहा है और मैंने उनके लोगों को कहा कि आप इस ऐप के लिए मदद कीजिए, उनका सारा का सारा पैसा मैंने सीएसआर में लिया और आज वह पूरे झारखंड के बच्चों को, गरीब बच्चों को पढ़ा रहा है। क्या आप सीएसआर की बात नहीं करेंगे, क्या आप बिजनेस मैन के कंट्रीब्यूशन की बात नहीं करेंगे, क्या आप छोटे-से पिछड़े इलाके की बात नहीं करेंगे कि गोड्डा भी पूरे झारखंड को, पूरे देश को दिशा दिखा सकता है। आज यह सिचुएशन है और इसी कारण माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी को पता था कि छोटी-छोटी जगह के बच्चों को यदि आगे बढ़ाना है, तो यह जरूरी है इसलिए इस बजट में उन्होंने ऐसा काम किया है।

महोदय, एक बात 'हर घर में नल' की है । इसमें बहुत चर्चा होती है कि साठ हजार करोड़ रुपये दिए गए हैं । कोई कहता है टोटी लगेगी और आगे कोई विकास नहीं होगा । . . .(व्यवधान) महोदय, हमारे समय में से 10 मिनट का समय विपक्ष ने ले लिया और सभापित जी आप भी उस समय हल्ला कर रहे थे । आप जब चेयर पर आए, तब से हमारा समय काउंट कीजिए । यह जो टंकी के नल से पानी का सवाल है, यह आज तक अमीरों का ही रहा है जैसे गैस चूल्हे की बात थी कि यह उन्हीं के पास है जो अमीर हैं । यह जो 'हर घर नल 'की योजना है, यह सोचने का सवाल है । इसमें चूंकि राज्य सरकार इन्वाल्व है, जैसे कि राजीव गांधी विद्युतीकरण योजना में कांग्रेस पार्टी ने सोचा कि प्रत्येक गांव को इलेक्ट्रीफाई कर दें और इलेक्ट्रीफिकेशन में ऐसा किया कि एक फेस की लाइन जाएगी और जो बीपीएल परिवार होगा, केवल उसी को कनेक्शन मिलेगा । बीपीएल के बारे में भी एक कहानी मैं बताना चाहता हूं और प्रधान मंत्री जी जिन बातों को कह रहे थे।

चूंकि कांग्रेस के एक बड़े नेता ने बड़ी बातें कहीं कि 23 करोड़ लोगों को हमने गरीबी रेखा से ऊपर कर लिया । यह अच्छा संयोग है कि मेरे सामने उदासी साहब और श्री भर्तृहरि महताब साहब बैठे हुए हैं । कांग्रेस ने इस नक्शे और नॉर्म्स को बदलने के लिए चार कमेटियां बनाईं । पहली तेंदुलकर कमेटी बनी, जिसकी रिपोर्ट में आया कि इस तरह के लोग ही गरीब माने जाएंगे । दूसरी एनसी सक्सेना की कमेटी बनी, जिसने कहा कि गरीब इस तरह से निर्धारित होंगे

about:blank 35/61

। मैं आपको केवल बता रहा हूं कि लोगों को यदि मूर्ख और बुड़बक बनाना हो, तो उसे कांग्रेस पार्टी से सीखना चाहिए। इसके बाद तीसरी आसिफ कमेटी बनाई, जो शहरी गरीबों के बारे में देखेगी। चौथी मोंटेक सिंह अहलूवालिया कमेटी बनी।

महोदय, हमारे यहां कहा जाता है कि 'ज्यादा जोगी, मठ उजाड़'। कांग्रेस पार्टी की स्थित यह थी कि उसमें डॉक्टर मनमोहन सिंह बड़े इकोनॉमिस्ट, मोंटेक सिंह अहलूवालिया उनसे थोड़े-से छोटे इकोनॉमिस्ट, रघुराम राजन साहब उनसे थोड़े-से छोटे इकोनॉमिस्ट थे। ...(व्यवधान) मैं प्रधान मंत्री जी की ही बात कर रहा हूं। क्या श्री मनमोहन सिंह जी प्रधान मंत्री नहीं थे? ... (व्यवधान) जब मोंटेक सिंह अहलूवालिया कमेटी बनी, तब आप मंत्री थे। सौगत बाबू, मैं यह कह रहा हूं कि प्लानिंग कमीशन में श्री मोंटेक सिंह अहलूवालिया के नेतृत्व में इन तीनों कमेटी के एसेसमेंट के लिए एक कमेटी बनी और उसने यह तय किया। यदि ऑन रिकॉर्ड आप 32वीं रिपोर्ट पढ़ना चाहते हैं तो हमारी कमेटी की 32वीं रिपोर्ट आप पढ़ लीजिए।

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN (CHENNAI CENTRAL):** Sir, the hon. Member is taking names of people who are not present in the House to defend themselves. ... (*Interruptions*)

**डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे:** महोदय, उसमें ऑन रिकॉर्ड श्रीमती सुधा पिल्लै, जो मेंबर सेक्रेट्री थीं, ने कहा था कि हम पहले जूता बनाते हैं और उसके बाद नाप देखने की कोशिश करते हैं कि किसमें यह जूता अटेगा, इसीलिए मैंने यह कहा। आप उस वक्त मंत्री थे और उस कमेटी के पार्ट नहीं थे। कांग्रेस ने गरीबी और गरीबों का जो मजाक उड़ाने का काम किया, वही उनको दिखाई देता है।

राजीव गांधी विद्युतीकरण के नाम पर उन्होंने एक फेज की जो बिजली दी, उसमें 9 किलोवाट, 16किलोवाट और 25 किलोवाट का ट्रांसफार्मर लगाया । स्थिति ऐसी हो गई कि सारे के सारे या तो चोरी हो गए या जल गए या अमीरों ने उनको जला लिया । यही कारण है कि- 'अपने दिल से जानिए पराए दिल के हाल में । 'कांग्रेस यह समझती है कि किसी के घर में पानी नहीं जाएगा ।आज हमने

about:blank 36/61

25 सालों का एक सपना देखा है। आजादी का अमृत महोत्सव है। 75 साल पूरे हुए हैं और 100 साल बाद हमारा देश कैसा होगा, गांव, गरीब और पिछड़ों की स्थिति कैसी होगी, ऐसा सपना हमने माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी के नेतृत्व में देखा है। चाहे टैक्स का सवाल हो, चाहे स्टार्ट-अप का सवाल हो, चाहे मनरेगा का सवाल हो, चाहे पीएम गित शक्ति का सवाल हो, हमने सभी को राहत देने का प्रयास किया है।

महोदय, कांग्रेस पार्टी ने श्री दुष्यंत कुमार को क्वोट किया था । मैं दुष्यंत कुमार की एक लाइन क्वोट करते हुए अपनी बात समाप्त करूंगा-

'तुम्हारे पांव के नीचे जमीन नहीं, कमाल ये है कि फिर भी तुम्हें यकीन नहीं। '

इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ मैं माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी के इस बजट का समर्थन करता हूं । जय हिन्द, जय भारत ।

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN:** Hon. Chairperson, Sir, thank you for giving me the opportunity to take part in this discussion on the Budget.

It is one of those moments, when a serious discussion on the Budget, such an important document, is taking place in the House, we find that the hon. Finance Minister is not present. An hon. Member from the principal Opposition Party spoke, the hon. Finance Minister was not present. Leave aside that, he is a Congressman and they have no respect for Congressmen ... (*Interruptions*) You know probably the BJP has scant regard for Congress and the entire proceedings, from the reply of the hon. Prime Minister to everyone's reply, there is an attack on the Congress. Their own partyman, Shri Nishikant Dubey ji was giving a lecture and the hon. Finance Minister, Smt. Nirmala Sitharaman ji is not here to take note of what even her own partyman is saying. It is a ... (Not recorded)

about:blank 37/61

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (DR. BHAGWAT KARAD): I am part of the Finance Ministry. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN: She is your principal. She is the Union Minister..... (*Interruptions*) It is an insult to us. It is her own presentation. She has presented the Budget but she is not present here. Dr. Dubey, she is not here to listen to you. She has no respect for her own partymen because probably she is not elected from Lok Sabha. She is a Member of Rajya Sabha. Sir, she has no respect for Lok Sabha. ... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER STATE IN OF THE **MINISTRY** PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE **OF CULTURE** (SHRI **MINISTRY ARJUN** RAM **MEGHWAL):** For your knowledge, I want to mention about Short Title and definition of a Minister. It is there in rule 2 of Chapter I. ... (*Interruptions*)

""Minister" means a member of the Council of Ministers [and includes a member of the Cabinet], a Minister of State, a Deputy Minister or a Parliamentary Secretary;"

... (*Interruptions*) He is MoS in the Ministry of Finance.... (*Interruptions*) The Finance Minister was in the Rajya Sabha. She is in a press conference. She is coming. It was a practice in the House also.... (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN**: Sir, with all due respect, respect for the House is most important. We are Lok Sabha Members. Each Member represents nearly 12 lakh people of our constituency. Sir, she cannot be

about:blank 38/61

here but she is in *India Today Conclave* talking and debating about the Budget. She should be here. ... (*Not recorded*) ... (*Interruptions*)

HON. CHAIRPERSON: Shri Maran, you kindly speak on the Budget.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN: Is this the way she treats the Members? She should have respect for the House. Is *India Today* important or is Parliament important? ... (*Interruptions*) If she can bunk, and if she does not take us seriously, what are we here for? ... (*Interruptions*) Is it because she is not being elected by the people and she is a nominated Member, she has no respect for Lok Sabha?

**डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे :** महोदय, पाँच कैबिनेट मिनिस्टर्स यहाँ बैठे हुए हैं ।... (व्यवधान)

श्री गिरिराज सिंह: आपकी बात सुनने के लिए ये आपके लोग कहाँ हैं? ... (व्यवधान)

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN**: I am talking for you also, Shri Nishikant Dubey. She was not here to listen to you also. Your Minister was not here to listen to you. She has no respect for the BJP also.

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Shri Maran, you will lose your time. Please carry on with your speech.

... (Interruptions)

श्री गौरव गोगोई (कलियाबोर) : चैनल ज्यादा महत्वपूर्ण है ।... (व्यवधान) प्रचार ज्यादा महत्वपूर्ण है । ... (व्यवधान)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON:** Nothing is going on record except the speech of Shri Maran.

about:blank 39/61

### ... (Interruptions) ... <u>\*</u>

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN**: Sir, we are appreciating the Finance Minister's dedication to ensure that the Budget is known to the entire country through the television but not to sit in the Parliament. We appreciate it, Sir.

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: You speak on the Budget.

SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN: Sir, let me say that the Finance Minister's speech of the Budget, over the years, has been reducing by 15 minutes every year and this year, she has made sure that her speech about the Budget was only for one hour and thirty minutes and she was in a hurry to look at the clock to ensure that the Budget ended very soon. I do not know the reason. Probably she had to go for a TV interview. ... (Interruptions)

At the outset, let me term this Budget as an anti-federal and anti-people Budget and this Government has completely ignored the welfare of the people. The total expenditure for this Budged is pegged at Rs. 39.45 lakh crore. There is a huge deficit of Rs. 16.61 lakh crore which they are going to borrow. Straightaway, the Finance Minister has said that she is going to borrow more than 50 per cent of the Budget estimate, and literally, she is going to sell, and she is going to beg. This is what one can say. Of this, interest payment is about Rs. 9.40 lakh crore; the capital expenditure is about Rs. 7.5 lakh crore; the establishment expenditure is about Rs. 6.92 lakh crore; Defence is for about Rs. 3.85 lakh crore; subsidies are for Rs. 3.18 lakh crore; grants for States is just ten per cent of the Budget and it is Rs. 3.17 lakh crore.

about:blank 40/61

For pension, it is Rs.2.07 lakh crore. So, all that remains for other development expenses is a paltry sum of Rs.3.36 lakh crore for the development of this country.

Sir, the Finance Minister was so generous in thanking the middle classes who pay the taxes. What did she say? "Thank you. You have been good taxpayers. I am not going to make any change in tax limit for you. You end up paying the same tax. There will be no benefit for you. COVID or no COVID, you are there to pay taxes."

The middle classes were expecting a lot. For the last two years, it has been very bad for the middle classes. They have been suffering due to COVID. Although, empty promises were coming from the Treasury benches, nothing really came out of it.

Sir, another interesting subject is agriculture. The Economic Survey and the Budget have failed to address the elephant in the room; they have failed to address agriculture.

After burning the fingers with the three farm laws, you have not paid any attention to our farmers, even though we thought that five States' election might impress you to give some more subsidies to the farmers. Sir, I would like to say that the Finance Minister had promised us that in the year 2022, she will double the farmers' income. We are in 2022. We are waiting for this. You have not taken any accountability for the agricultural sector's demands like MSP. You do not want to address the issue of MSP or other solution concerning the lack of remunerative prices, unfair markets and rising input costs.

Sir, the Finance Minister has announced new tech, hitech drones that will review the crop assessment, digitization of land records, and

about:blank 41/61

spraying of insecticides and nutrients. But, there is no uniform national level policy for supplying of maps and other information required for developing such technologies.

In this Budget, the allocation for rural development as percentage of GDP has declined from 0.62 per cent to 0.54 per cent this year. The allocation for food subsidy has been slashed. Since procurement of wheat and rice is not likely to come down, the Government seems to have decided to access the stock in central pool.

Sir, there are no welfare schemes or compensation for farmers who stood outside our capital for one year, fighting to withdraw the rules. You have not done anything for them. What was the response to a question by MPs on this issue? The Government has replied that it has no data how many farmers had died.

Sir, I would like to quote my hon. good friend, Dr. Shashi Tharoor. Last year, he quoted, "'NDA' means 'no data available'". Whatever we ask, there is no data available. When we asked about the migrant workers who lost their jobs, who lost their lives in 2020, they said that there is no data available. When we asked how many frontline health workers have lost their lives due to pandemic, the Health Minister announced that there is no data available.

In 2011, caste-wise Census was taken. Why do you not give us data? They say that there is no data available. But if you want reservation for the economically weaker sections, you can pass it without any data and substantiate your stand in Supreme Court.

So, on a wide range of data regarding security, GDP or anything, the answer we get from the Government is that there is no data

about:blank 42/61

available. If you have any data, please share with us. You are worried. If you give us data, we will ask you uneasy questions for which you do not have any answers.

Sir, take the MGNREGA situation. The largest rural employment scheme has been pegged down to Rs.73,000 crore, Rs.25,000 crore lesser than the Revised Estimated for the current year of Rs.98,000 crore despite the fact that the Economic Survey actually provided evidence that the demand for work under this Scheme even during the current year continues to be higher than the pre-COVID-19 level.

Sir, our Chief Minister, Shri M.K. Stalin pointed out that reduction by Rs. 25,000 crores shows the Centre's poor thought process on this that they do not want any single rupee to remain in the hands of the poor people. Is it due to lack of funds allocation, or is it that new announcements for States are banned?

Sir, despite our Prime Minister making huge statements in the international conferences about the Climate Change, about the commitment India is making, from where he is going to get the money, he has never announced. When we ask, there is no data available. We appreciate him in regard to the Climate Change.

Sir, I come from Chennai, Tamil Nadu. We have been voicing our opinion that Chennai has been facing the worst climate change. We have been getting unseasonal rains. About 74 per cent more rains and floods have occurred there. Our Chief Minister had written letters asking for funds, but there are no funds available. There is no data available and there are no funds available.

about:blank 43/61

Sir, if the same situation had happened in Gujarat, even before anything happened there, Rs. 500 crore would have been sent there for Gujarat. My founder Arignar Anna said: 'Vadakku Vazhkirathu Therku Theikirathu' -- the North is prospering and the South is not getting any respite. Why are you doing this?

Sir, they made announcements during the COVID. Where do the diamond merchants come from? They all come for Gujarat. For Gujarat, they have announced just five per cent duty on diamonds.

What is happening in Tamil Nadu because of this pandemic situation? Everyone knows that Tiruppur is a Capital for garment manufacturing industries. Exports from Tiruppur have been world known. It has more than 15,000 SMEs, producing factories in the Capital City of multi-billion dollar garment industries with international significance. Every successive Government has been ensuring that the garment industry goes on. But during the COVID lockdown, there was an unprecedented rise in price of raw materials and inadequate infrastructure due to lack of concerted polices. The Union Government just ignored it.

In the previous AIADMK Government and the Modi Government, we saw 50 per cent of these garment industries closing down.

Sir, immediately after coming to power, our CM, Thiru M.K. Stalin had assessed the situation and realised that if this situation is allowed to continue, it will kill the exports and they will be losing their net worth. So, he wrote to the Union Government for a slew of measures that could have supported the garmenting industries. What did we ask? We asked for removal of tax duties, take stringent action to reduce surging yarn price. Cotton is coming from the one major State,

about:blank 44/61

and it is from Gujarat. That is reason we asked the Union Government to take some efforts on that. He also asked the Union Government to study the global scenario on garment industry ... (*Interruptions*)

**DR. SANJAY JAISWAL:** Sir, how much time has been allotted to his party? ... (*Interruptions*)

**AN. HON. MEMBER**: He is the only speaker from our party ... (*Interruptions*)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: He is taking his party's time.

... (Interruptions)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Hon. Members, please take your seats. Otherwise, your party will lose the time.

... (Interruptions)

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN**: Sir, this time of disturbance should be taken into account, and I may be given extra time.

HON. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, please continue.

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN**: Mr. Jaiswal ji, I never knew that you like my speech so much. I will talk for long! ... (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB**: Sir, three days have been allotted for discussion on General Budget. Can any Member stand up here in the House and ask, how much time has been allotted to that party? ... (*Interruptions*)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: There is no point of order.

**DR. SANJAY JAISWAL**: Sir, I am on a point of order.

about:blank 45/61

HON. CHAIRPERSON: There is no point of order. Please sit down.

... (Interruptions)

**HON.CHAIRPERSON**: Hon. Members, please cooperate with the Chair.

... (Interruptions)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Jaiswal ji, you are a senior Member. Please sit down.

Maran ji, please continue.

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN**: Sir, the House should be set in order. ... (*Interruptions*)

Our Chief Minister, Thirui M.K. Stalin asked for removal of tax duties. Stringent action should be taken to reduce the surging yarn price.

He asked the Union Government to study the global scenario of the garment industry and support our Tirupur manufacturers to compete in the international market and to appoint a separate welfare board and integrated scheme to support lakhs of garment workers. What did the Modi Government do? Sorry, what did the BJP Government do? They did nothing. They did nothing for Tamil Nadu. ... (*Interruptions*) Jaiswal ji, you are not supposed to discuss with each other.... (*Interruptions*) The reason why I am talking about Tirupur is not to pinpoint at Gujarat's growth for which you are trying to take all the taxpayers money. The reason why I am saying this, Sir, is because there is a dangerous situation to arise. If you take our neighbour Bangladesh, they are surging ahead of us, of India, despite India having a natural

about:blank 46/61

advantage in this industry simply because your Government failed to address the issue of Tirupur.

Once described as a bottomless market by the US Secretary of State, Henry Kissinger, Bangladesh is emerging as a bull economy outpacing India in many indices of economic or human development and it has a good Government support for the garment industry. Their per capita GDP has also surpassed ours in the garment sector. There is something which you have to know. The Finance Minister has to realise this. In 2007, the per capita income of Bangladesh was half of that of India but it will overtake us in per capita GDP once again in 2025 according to IMF, and World Economic Forum's outlook. This is a serious situation and that is why I am trying to get your attention but you do not want me to speak out because it hurts you when I tell you the truth with disturbing data.

Sir, again, as I said, you are not respecting the South, there is no fund allocation for any project proposed by the Tamil Nadu Government, especially, for new railway schemes in Tamil Nadu. How can we accept 'One Nation, One Registration' proposal? It infringes the rights of the State Governments and betrays the guiding principles of the federal structure of the Constitution. Though the proposed allocation of Rs. 1 lakh crore on the basis of cooperative federalism appears to benefit the State, the fund will be spent on the Prime Minister's Gati Shakti Plan. In the plan, in the name of allocating funds to the States, the Union Government will spend all the money. They will say: "No, we are allocating the fund to the State. You will be spending it." What are we supposed to do? This is a mere eye-wash.

about:blank 47/61

The Union Government has not taken any effort regarding the fiscal deficit.... (*Interruptions*)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Hon. Member, please address the Chair. Please, do not listen to anybody. Please address the Chair.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN: Sir, the Union Government has not taken any effort regarding fiscal deficit of the States. It has only allowed a fiscal deficit of 4 per cent of GSDP for 2022-23, of which 0.5 per cent will be tied to power sector reforms. This will be absolutely critical for States like Tamil Nadu which is offering free electricity to benefit the farmers. The States should be allowed a fiscal deficit of 5 per cent of GSDP without any condition. This is the need of the hour. The Union Government is infringing the rights.

All the money which is collected from the States are given to the elder brother. The Central Government has no financial sources of revenue. All the revenue comes from State sources. We trust you. We gave it to you but what you did, you did not spend it on us. You pretend to listen to us. You have meetings, but only selected States get the funds. The developing States like Maharashtra, Tamil Nadu, Karnataka, Kerala, Andhra Pradesh, Telangana and Odisha are feeling the brunt and most of the States are non-BJP states. If you are a non-BJP State, there will be no development. If it is West Bengal, nothing will happen. If it is Tamil Nadu, nothing will happen. Sir, the Finance Minister, who is not present here in the House, has said while giving an interview to India Today channel that India's economic growth, in the current year, is estimated at 9.2 per cent, the highest among all the large economies.

about:blank 48/61

Sir, but the same Economic Survey, which she presented, is more cautious with an estimate of only 8 per cent.

Sir, this is a story which we just all like to talk about. In India, we are seeing that a very few seem to be enjoying the growth that the Government is talking about.

Indian billionaires increased their wealth by 35 per cent during the lockdown, whereas the middle-class India is estimated to have shrunk by 3.2 crore people, and 12 crore people were pushed back into poverty, according to reports. So, who has really benefitted? This is the question. Someone has really benefitted.

Sir, the BJP saw a growth of its fortunes. The BJP declared its assets worth Rs. 4,847.78 crore in the Financial Year 2019-20, the highest among all the political parties, which is up by nearly Rs. 1950 crore compared to Rs. 2904.18 crore which you declared in 2018-19. ... (*Interruptions*) Sir, we would like to know what their recipe is. If BJP has got a good recipe, we request the BJP to share that with all the other Parties. ... (*Interruptions*)

**DR. NISHIKANT DUBEY**: Sir, I have a Point of Order. ... (*Interruptions*)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Just a minute. What is the rule?

... (Interruptions)

DR. NISHIKANT DUBEY: Sir, it is Rule 369. It says:

"A paper of document to be laid on the Table shall be duly authenticated by the Member presenting it."

about:blank 49/61

इन्होंने कहा कि कोविड काल में बिलिनियर्स 30.5 परसेंट इनक्रीज हुए हैं । आप इनको ऑथेन्टिकेट करने के लिए कहिए ।

दूसरा सवाल यह है कि वह डिसक्रिमिनेशन के बारे में जो कह रहे हैं, यह सी.डी.रेशियो ऐसा है कि 100 परसेंट से ज्यादा तिमलनाडु को मिलता है। हमको 34 परसेंट मिलता है। हम बिहार और झारखंड से आते हैं। बैंक का सारा पैसा तिमलनाडु, महाराष्ट्र और गुजरात को जा रहा है। पैसा हमारा है और वे लेते हैं। आप इनको दोनों पेपर ऑथेन्टिकेट करने के लिए कहिए, नहीं तो अपनी बात वापस करने के लिए कहिए। ...(व्यवधान)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Your point is not relevant. Shri Maran, please continue.

## ... (Interruptions)

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN:** Sir, the rise in fortunes of the top 100 billionaires since the lockdown in March is enough to give everyone of the 138 million poor Indian people Rs. 94,045 each, according to Oxfam's 'Inequality Virus Report.

Sir, the wealth of the top 11 billionaires in India, who made money in the pandemic can easily sustain the MGNREGA Scheme and the needs of the Health Ministry for the next ten years. Sir, at this point, I would like to ask this. ... (*Interruptions*)

Sir, at the outset, I would like to congratulate the hon. Finance Minister for the great Indian sale. The Air India has been offloaded. You undersold the Central Electronics Limited which was developing critical frontier technologies for defence and space, and was of strategic interest to India. The strategic partner for Neelanchal Ispat Nigam Limited has been selected. You are planning for the Initial Public Offer of LIC in the March quarter. Next, in line, there are BPCL, Shipping Corporation of

about:blank 50/61

India, Concor, BEML projects. ... (*Interruptions*) Sir, I am the only speaker. ... (*Interruptions*) Sir, you are stopping my flow. ... (*Interruptions*)

Sir, next in line, there are BPCL, Shipping Corporation of India, Concor, BEML, Project & Development India Limited, Engineering Project (India) Limited, and Container Corporation of India Limited. All of them are listed for sale.

What an achievement! This is done following the PM's statement in February last year. The Government has no business to be in business. The FM is taking it in letter and spirit and ensuring she is selling everything off of the PSUs. I have a serious question to the Government. The Parliament has to be respected. While the Finance Minister comes and addresses the Parliament and informs us about the sale, she should also inform us about the investment the Government of India is making on the tax money. On the one hand, you are selling and on the other hand you have taken 34.8 per cent stake in Vodafone. Whose money is that? It is our tax-payers' money. You have also taken a stake in Airtel. Whoever does not pay money to you, you take their stakes. Why are you only doing for the rich people? There are so many Indians who lost their business because of the pandemic. There are so many people who have not been able to pay their loans for the houses and they have been pushed out of their houses. Why cannot you be equal partners in their sorrows also?

I think the Finance Minister should give a White Paper on how and why a decision was taken. Are you being like a Temasek of Singapore trying to invest there? You should be clear on this. The Parliament is not informed, like she is missing in action in the most

about:blank 51/61

important crucial Budget debate and the Finance Bill. She should have informed us that she is investing this money in Vodafone. This is the taxpayers' money. ... (*Interruptions*)

Again, I would like to say about the railways. Sir, look at it. They get very upset when I say all the projects are going to Gujarat. The Indian Railways is investing about Rs.1.37 lakh crore in the Vande Bharat trains, which is in three segments for three years. If we really look at it, it is around Rs.40,000 crore a year. But the Finance Minister has made it look as if it is a very good project. You have made a huge investment on the bullet trains which are connecting Ahmedabad and Mumbai. It is not Mumbai. My dear friends, do not get fooled. It is for Ahmedabad. They want to do it. You are spending money. We welcome it. Some investment is good. But I am asking one thing.

The Rafale deal has cost us Rs.58,891 crore. I am not talking bad about it. I am not going into the controversies. Do not get alarmed. I am not going to talk about that. India has pumped nearly Rs.60,000 crore into the French economy by the Rafale deal. I would like to ask you one thing.

The IT golden triangle in South India is Bengaluru-Hyderabad-Chennai. This is the golden IT triangle which creates a lot of money. Why cannot you ask the French to invest on TGV which is equivalent to the bullet train, and put a high-speed train route in South India, which will be of so much of use? Is it that you are investing? Why cannot you ask them? ... (*Interruptions*)

Sir, I am concluding. I am done in five minutes. I have nothing more.

about:blank 52/61

Again, here also it is the same thing. You see the amount of money which is being given to the GIFT city. You are investing so much of our tax-payers' money on the GIFT city. Even now the Finance Minister has announced huge relief to the GIFT city but the GIFT city project is not taking up.

If you have put that city in Mumbai or Delhi or Chennai or Hyderabad, it would have been a huge success. So, useful resources are being lost.

There is one question which I would like to ask the Finance Minister. ... (*Interruptions*) No, Sir. I have got three more questions and then I will finish it. I have got 30 minutes' time. ... (*Interruptions*) Right now, the Home Minister has also come to listen to my speech. So, I would like to make the best use of it. Since the Finance Minister has not come, the Home Minister has come.

The Finance Minister is so dedicated to make sure that every product is made in India. Sir, we appreciate that. So, what she does is, she puts 20 per cent duty on umbrellas. My Kerala friends, you are the users of umbrellas. She has put 20 per cent duty on umbrellas but no duty on the parts which are made to make umbrellas. So, what she is trying to say is that the manufacturing of umbrellas, after so many years, should be made in India. Is that the real thing? Is that going to happen?

The reality is that the umbrellas will be assembled in India. They are not going to be made in India. If you really look at this, the trade between India and China has increased to the tune of 125.7 billion. The deficit is 69.4 billion. There was a growth in the year 2021. Our import has increased by 46 per cent. Do you know the reason why I am saying this? ... (*Interruptions*) Sir, I am going to wind up.

about:blank 53/61

Sir, I will just wind up my speech. At the end of the day, we are totally depending on Make in India.

Sir, we are talking about NEET. In 2017, when the Finance Minister was present in Tamil Nadu, she made a statement that she is supporting the exemption of NEET in Tamil Nadu because the rural students are not benefiting from it. It was Nirmala Sitharaman's Press interview that I am reminding her of. This is the same thing that we are doing. It is time that we should go forward. .... (Interruptions)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Please conclude.

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN**: Sir, I am given 30 minutes time. .... (*Interruptions*)

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: But the time allocated to you is over.

....(Interruptions)

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN**: Sir, 10 minutes ended up in disruptions. ....(*Interruptions*)

HON. CHAIRPERSON: Please conclude your speech.

....(Interruptions)

**SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN**: It is a very serious issue.

I would like to put a question to the Finance Minister. She says that 5 per cent of the USO funds are going to be used for 5G technology development. As I know about it, the 5G is going to be a homegrown technology. But instead of the companies paying money for it, the USO fund being allocated for it. The USO fund is only to make sure that rural India gets telephone connections and free internet. That money is now

about:blank 54/61

being used for these companies. That is objectionable. Even there was no mention of BSNL and MTNL. Today, what is the status of 4G? Are you going to give 4G to BSNL and MTNL? There is not a word on it.

At the end of the day, I would like to say that States make India. Prosperous States make a prosperous India. I would urge the Central Government not to be biased against States, and please be generous with all States, especially the States which are not ruled by the BJP.

Thank you very much, Sir.

**SHRI SUDIP BANDYOPADHYAY (KOLKATA UTTAR):** Sir, I expected and it would have been better had the Finance Minister been present at the time of the Budget debate.

Sir, this year's Budget is of Rs.39.45 lakh crore and the total receipt is of Rs.22.84 lakh crore. So, it is a deficit Budget overall. I want to draw the attention of the House to what has happened to the previous year's Budget as well. It was a Budget of Rs.34.83 lakh crore and when it was revised, it increased by Rs.37.70 lakh crore. Do you know, Sir, why was it lifted when it was revised? Here, an amount of Rs.51,791 crore was made towards settlement of outstanding guaranteed liabilities of Air India, including from capital expenditure of Revised Estimates. The amount of Rs.51,000 crore was taken by the Government to make TATA's passage clear, and Air India was sold to TATAs for only Rs.18,000 crore. It was mentioned proudly in the Budget Speech. It is not my quote but it is a quote mentioned in the Budget. So, I think this portion of the Budget should be described as 'the joke of the Budget 2022-23'

about:blank 55/61

Sir, this Budget is presented by saying "Prime Minister's Vision for India @100." I consider it as a pious wish. It is a Budget of grave disappointment. It contributes nothing to the common people — I will come gradually to it. It is long on promises but short on effect. No sign of overall reform is reflected in this Budget. I will describe this Budget as a 'Sell India Budget'.

Air India is sold. The name of Neelanchal Ispat Nigam Limited, NINL has been mentioned in the Budget speech. It would also be sold. LIC's public issue is going to come. So, it is also proposed to be sold. What is happening so far as the public sector undertakings are concerned? In our country, there are *navratna* type of public sector undertakings, *maharatna* type of public sector undertakings, *maharatna* type of public sector undertakings, but this Government is in a mood to sell out all the public sector undertakings. Mr. Dayanidhi mentioned the names. So, I will not mention the names in details. Why are they doing it? We totally oppose the idea of this Government to disinvest the public sector undertakings.

We totally oppose the sale of at least the profit-making public sector undertakings. What is the reason for which the Government is going to sell out a portion of even the LIC? LIC is a jewel crown-asset of the country. LIC is the largest asset manager of this country. Its assets are of about Rs. 31 lakh crore as per the balance-sheet, which is about the balance-sheet of SBI – Rs. 39.51 lakh crore. The balance-sheet of LIC is equivalent to the amount of Central Budget. The Central Budget is of Rs. 35 lakh crore. So, why should we touch such type of a sector?

Today, banks are in an uncertain position. People are keen to know what will be the fate and future of the banks of this country, which

about:blank 56/61

were once nationalised by the great leader, Shrimati Indira Gandhi? Now, does this Government have a thought or idea to go for denationalisation of banks? Does it want to hand over the banks and the LIC altogether to the private people? I apprehend that the basic economic policy of the Government is going to take completely another shape. All attempts are being made to see that all past records and all past history are lifted. These issues can be taken up. I apprehend that banks, LIC and also the nationalised coal mines can be given to the private parties.

Now, I come to cryptocurrency. How will you introduce such a currency in a country like ours? Cryptocurrency is a risk. They are going to introduce a Bill in this Session itself. It is a gambling type of currency. People are not aware of what cryptocurrency is. They will get it passed without sending the Cryptocurrency Bill to the Standing Committee. This Government has the habit to introduce the Bill and get it passed without a discussion. In this case, I warn from the very beginning. What is Digital Rupee? We all have to pay serious thoughts and ideas to this. The hon. Finance Minister has to explain about it. Then, Sir, unemployment is at a skyrocketed high.

Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury was telling the other day that it has come down from two crores to 60 lakhs. That is your commitment in this Budget. There is no increase for 100-day jobs under MGNREGS.

#### **21.00 hrs**

The most accepted policy of the Government at least inspired unemployed people of the country. But there is no signal of any increase in 100-day jobs. For youths, it is taking a very negative side that it can

about:blank 57/61

be withdrawn also. What I would propose is this. MSMEs are to be given more priority.

**HON. CHAIRPERSON**: Hon. Members, if the House agrees, the time of the House may be extended by half-an-hour.

**SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS**: Yes. ... (*Interruptions*)

HON. CHAIRPERSON: 'Zero Hour's' time is also included.

SHRI SUDIP BANDYOPADHYAY: MSMEs are to be given more financial support. MSMEs can generate employment. This Government should not run behind the big industries which are near and dear to them. At this juncture, the condition of the country cannot be very effective and big industries cannot deliver employment facilities which MSMEs can. So, the Government should give priority to this sector.

There are seven engines in Prime Minister Gati Shakti Scheme. What are these seven engines? These are – roads, railways, airports, ports, mass transport, waterways, and logistics infra. They are supposed to pull forward the Indian economy. I want to know from the Government how many airports we have sold. I am asking a straightforward question. Airports have been sold. I want to know from the Government how many have been sold. And you are going to develop your economy through airports! You have to remain answerable to this House.

There is a type of godowns which are going to be established in this country. It is known as silo godowns. What are these godowns? These will be steel structure bodies with 50,000 MT to 5,00,000 MT capacity for protection of food grains in a better way. I appreciate it as I am the Chairman of the Standing Committee on Food, Consumer Affairs

about:blank 58/61

and Public Distribution. All these silos whether they are in Bengaluru or Gujarat or Maharashtra have been handed over to Mr. Adani but no one else. I propose to the Government to set up these silo projects but consult with the State Governments. Take ideas from them. It is being looked after by FCI but this system is running very speedily.

Now, I come to black money. Parallel black money economy is still running in the country. What benefit did we achieve from demonetization? Piyush Goyal Ji made a statement in February 2019 that Rs. 1.39 lakh crore had been recovered through various anti-black money measures including demonetization. It is not a failure. With a great enthusiasm, the Government announced demonetization but only Rs. 1.39 lakh crore were recovered. What about the black money kept in Switzerland? What agreement have Switzerland and Government of India made with each other? Till now, \$12 trillion are in Switzerland illegally. I want to know from the Government whether you are negotiating with the Switzerland Government. Since our young age, we are habituated to hear that there is money in Swiss Bank.

स्विस बैंक के साथ जो एग्रीमेंट हुआ था, उसका क्या हुआ? आप लोग उस ब्लैक मनी को कब वापस लाएंगे? हर एक बैंक अकाउंट में 15 लाख रुपये डाले जाएंगे, यह कमिटमेंट, यह डिक्लेरेशन तो भारतीय जनता पार्टी ने चुनाव से पहले किया था। कम से कम स्विजरलैंड से तो ब्लैक मनी रिकवर कीजिए।

The prices of fuel are going up. There is nobody to ask; there is nobody to respond. Why? They are autonomous bodies. You cannot ask questions. Why is it not increasing now? It is because Uttar Pradesh elections are there. We apprehend that when Uttar Pradesh elections will be over, prices of fuel may go up to any level. We want commitment from the Government that wherever it is stopped, let it be stopped, or

about:blank 59/61

make a roll back of the prices. We, from the Benches of the Opposition, make a demand that price rise which has happened up till now should be rolled back. The big ideas, big proposals, big assurances cannot make the common people happy.

The issue of cooperative federalism has been raised. I also want to speak on this issue. The policy of the Government in this Budget has been declared that financial assistance to States for capital investment will be increased from Rs. 10,000 crore to Rs. 1 lakh crore up to 2022-23 Budget. What will happen? What is the roadmap for allotment of Rs. 1 lakh crore? I want to know whether it will go to Gujarat or Maharashtra or to Karnataka. After Independence, the States of Eastern India, regionally, were exploited in Indian economy. We were exploited. People look at the States which are flourishing which are well-equipped, but we must claim that Rs. 1 lakh crore. We want to know for which State it is going to be allocated. ... (Interruptions). I am going to conclude. I normally do not take much time. What for is Central vista being created? How much money has been spent? Big buildings like Vigyan Bhawan, National Museum, National Cultural Centre have been demolished. There is no Vigyan Bhawan today. All have been demolished. Another six new buildings are going to be constructed. What for? What is the total amount allocated to decorate Rajpath?

I must make a demand which all political Parties once supported.

# 21.08 hrs (Hon. Speaker in the Chair)

अमित शाह जी, आप भी यहां पर हैं, इसलिए आप मेरी डिमांड सुनकर जाइए। अभी यहां पर वित्त मंत्री जी नहीं हैं, इसलिए मैं आपसे ही कहूंगा। What is the thinking of the Government regarding State funding of elections? Once a Committee headed by Shri Indrajit Gupta broadly placed that all

about:blank 60/61

recognized political parties will be extended support for their candidate to contest the elections. It was also an all-Party resolution supported by both the ruling as well as Opposition parties. I propose to you to consult in the Cabinet or in the Party and think over the State funding of elections. It is a necessity at this time.

Lastly, I would like to conclude by asking about the Pegasus agreement. Nowhere is it being discussed at all. We want to know whether it is a fact or whether it has happened or whether we have come to any agreement with Israel. It is not less than a USD 200 crore agreement. My Chief Minister, Mamata Banerjee, very vehemently commented upon this Budget that it is a Pegasus-spin Budget, but I describe it as a cosmetic type of Budget.

So, we want to hear from the hon. Finance Minister whether it is a Pegasus-type or cosmetic-type or sell-India-type Budget. Today, I heard the speech of Modi ji from beginning till end. It was a total battle between Prime Minister and Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury. Many other Members spoke many things. They requested me to make this issue alive over here once. Why did the Prime Minister not respond to any other Opposition Party Leader? Is it an understanding between the two Parties, which is alleged sometimes?

Sir, thank you very much for allowing me to speak by exceeding my time. The Member from my Party to speak next, namely, Shri Kalyan Banerjee will speak tomorrow. Please do not cut any of his time. With this request, I do not support the Budget. Thank you, Sir.

## 21.12 hrs

about:blank 61/61