

### Biography of General Thimayya

- +
- \*833. { Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:  
 Shri S. M. Banerjee:  
 Shri Chin:amoni Panigrahi:  
 Shri Prakash Vir Shastri:  
 Shri Tridib Kumar Chaudhuri:  
 Shri Tangamani:  
 Shri A. M. Tariq:  
 Shri Ram Krishan Gupta:  
 Shri Braj Raj Singh:  
 Shri Jagdish Awasthi:  
 Shri D. C. Sharma:  
 Shri Jinachandran:  
 Shri Ajit Singh Sarhadi:

Will the Minister of Defence be pleased to refer to the reply given to Starred Question No. 1752 on the 27th April, 1960 and state:

(a) whether any report of the officials studying Mr. Humphry Evans' book entitled 'Thimayya of India—A Soldier's Life' has been received; and

(b) whether the author's preface that the book is an elaboration of General Thimayya's manuscript and that the General has collaborated in writing the book are correct?

**The Minister of Defence (Shri Krishna Menon):** (a) The book has now been generally examined.

(b) It is understood from General Thimayya that he did not actually collaborate with the author in the publication of this particular book and that it had been published without his previous consent or knowledge. This book however appears to be based largely on information which it is learnt he supplied to the author in connection with another book which General Thimayya has stated he intends to write.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** In view of the fact that it is largely based on a book which General Thimayya was supposed to write, may I know whether that did not transgress the law which is there that no such book will be written or information given which has anything to do with strategy or the activities of the Army?

**Shri Krishna Menon:** This book has not yet been examined by us from the legal point of view. But I have asked him whether the information was supplied and the answer has been that he has written no letters to the author in regard to this book. But the conclusion is inevitable from the quotations given that the material could have come only from the Chief of Staff.

**Some Hon. Members:** We are not hearing the concluding part of the answer.

**Mr. Speaker:** The conclusion is irresistible that the matter contained in this book came from General Thimayya.

**Shri A. M. Tariq:** May I know if the hon. Defence Minister and the Defence Ministry had seen this map which has been given in the inside cover of the book showing Kashmir, not as part of India? If so may I know what action has been taken by them?

**Shri Krishna Menon:** There is a map here in the inside cover of this book which does show the State of Jammu and Kashmir, as separate from the Union as in conventional maps printed by the foreign countries. But I have no information that General Thimayya supplied this map or the responsibility is his. The map does appear in this book. (Interruptions).

**Shri A. M. Tariq:** May I know if the hon. Minister is aware of this chapter entitled 'Srinagar' written in this book and in that chapter our friend General Thimayya had disclosed the army tactics which we adopted in fighting a war with Pakistan in Kashmir? May I know what action has been taken for disclosing the army tactics?

**Shri Krishna Menon:** I would not be able to say whether it comes under the categorisation 'tactics'. But certainly you cannot describe a war action in Kashmir without giving the details. There are plenty of details and there has been no suggestion that it did not come from that source because it is in quotation marks. But what I have to say is that the Chief of Army Staff has not authorised its

publication. He has said that he has only discussed these matters with this gentleman for the purpose of writing the other book or books as the case may be. But as I said, whether it comes—the disclosure—under the operation of the law or not is a matter which we must consult the Law Ministry about in due course..... (Interruptions).

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** Sir, on a point of order. What the hon. Defence Minister has just now said amounts to denouncing the action of the Chief of the Army Staff. May I know whether this action of the Defence Minister is justified? If he thinks, so, he should better fire that Chief of the Army Staff ..... (Interruptions) instead of allowing questions and letting him down day in and day out..... (Interruptions).

**Shri Krishna Menon:** I have given you factual information based upon what was supplied to me. It is not possible for me to withhold from the Parliament what is in a printed book. I was asked whether it disclosed information about Kashmir and I said that I could not say whether it was tactical or not but the information was there..... (Interruptions).

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** All the time the Defence Minister says that it is not in public interest but today he has disclosed so much of information.... I have raised this point of order..... (Interruptions).

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. He has raised a point of order. The book has been published. A number of questions have been tabled and I deeply considered whether this matter ought to be brought before the House or not. But inasmuch as wide publicity has been given to the book and a foreigner has written the book containing a number of statements which could have emanated only from so and so, I thought it was my duty to apprise Parliament and see whether it was right or wrong. The hon. Defence Minister has been answering the question. Once he tried to say that it was

too early for him and he had not examined it in full and so was not in a position to say whether it was proper or improper. To another question from Shri Tariq he said that he could not definitely say that it contained any information relating to the tactics. If he only wanted to let down the Chief of the Army Staff, he could have easily said: yes; this also forms part of the tactics. Therefore, he has been very guarded and he wants to take a legal opinion before he can hazard an opinion whether it is right or wrong. Even disclosing some matter to the foreigner in advance of publication of a book and that man using it—it is a strange thing. I do not know how hon. Members can take exception to this question being asked and the hon. Defence Minister, to the best of his ability, trying to satisfy this House that nothing will go wrong and no secret will be let out by any person however important or otherwise he may be. Whatever other impressions the hon. Members may have, from the manner in which the hon. Defence Minister has been proceeding with this question, it is wrong to make an allegation that he is letting General Thimayya down from time to time. It ought not to be said. The hon. Members when they make allegations and say that the Chief of Staff ought to be protected must be equally interested in protecting the Defence Minister.

**Shri Tyagi:** May I request you in the interest of the security of the country to let me put one question to the Defence Minister? Is he in a position to assure the House and through this the Public that his relations with the Army Chief are quite cordial and there is no chance for any misunderstanding..... (Interruptions).

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. It is presumptuous *juris de jure*. So long as the Defence Minister and the Army Chief of Staff are in the same Government, the cordial relations are absolutely cordial. Further, it does not arise out of this question at all. We are straying away from this question. One more question from Mr. Banerjee—then I will proceed to the next question.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** May I know whether the attention of the hon. Minister has been drawn to the following expression used for INA in the said book on page 14—

“INA—Indian Nationalist Army forces raised by Japanese from among the Indian Army captives to use against the Allies”.

May I know whether the Government agrees with this and if not whether there have been any protests made?

**Shri Krishna Menon:** This is not a Government publication.

**Mr. Speaker:** Hon. Members will see that we are going into an examination of the book and asking whether a particular portion is acceptable to the Defence Minister or whether it is not accepted by the Defence Minister. Generally he has said that there is no doubt that General Thimayya gave information, though not for writing this book but he gave some information. Then, there was another question put to him whether in his opinion it was right that such a disclosure should be made. The legal aspects of it are there and he is trying to examine them by the Law Ministry. Therefore, there is no good pursuing that matter... (*Interruptions*). Next question.

**Shri Jaipal Singh:** May I seek a clarification in the light of what Dr. Ram Subhag Singh has raised? The hon. Defence Minister has in the course of his earlier reply mentioned that it is in connection with some other publication. So, it seems that it is the same American—or whatever he is—who is concerned with both these publications. One has already been published. The other one which is probably the main source of information cannot be published now for obvious reasons; we know why it cannot be published. The whole reply purports to impugn the Chief of Army Staff as having given specific permission to publish this. I do not quite understand how it comes in because if he is collaborating for the bigger work, the bigger work is not yet published.

The other man may abuse the privilege. We know, therefore, that information has not been given for publication in this book.

**Mr. Speaker:** That is all right. We are not arguing this matter and then prosecuting X or Y or trying to take proceedings departmentally against anybody. It is only a question; where information is elicited from. The information has been given in relation to some other book which he intended to publish. Whether it ought to be published, whether he can do it or not, whether he ought to be allowed to do or not—that is another matter; we are not proceeding with that matter. Let us proceed. We will go to the next question. Shri Ram Krishan Gupta—

**Shrimati Sucheta Kripalani:** Sir you allowed Shri Jaipal Singh to put a question. Please allow me also to put one question.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** Sir, you permitted me to put only one supplementary. I may be allowed to put one more supplementary.

**Mr. Speaker:** The hon. Member has always got a number of questions.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** I have put only one supplementary.

**Mr. Speaker:** All right, let us hear her.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** Sir, It is clearly stated in the Preface of this book by Mr. Humphry Evans that the material was given to him by General Thimayya. May I know whether any contradiction at any stage has been made by General Thimayya regarding this?

**Mr. Speaker:** Where?

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** In public or anywhere. This is a book that is openly sold in the market. It is clearly stated in the Preface that the material was given by General Thimayya.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. Is the hon. Minister aware of any contradiction issued either to the Press or in

any other manner by General Thimayya refuting the statement made in the Preface of the book that the information was supplied by General Thimayya?

**Shri Krishna Menon:** Sir, the Government have, in spite of what has been stated by hon. Members opposite, tried to get factual information with regard to this and questions were put to the Chief of Army Staff. He told us: "I certainly obtained Mr. Evans's help in organising and laying out my autobiography, which is still in manuscript form and which will be published after my retirement from service." He also stated that he had not asked this book to be published, he had not known about the book till it came, prior to the publication of the book there had been no correspondence with the author on any matter connected with the book and it was only after he became aware of the publication when he saw a review in the local papers that he corresponded with him remonstrating against the publication of the book (*Interruption*).

**Shri Hem Barua:** Sir, I rise to a point of order.

**Mr. Speaker:** What is the point of order?

**Shri Hem Barua:** The hon. Defence Minister said that this book has been published without the knowledge of General Thimayya—that is what General Thimayya has said.

**Shri Ranga:** We wanted to hear it much earlier.

**Shri Hem Barua:** That is what General Thimayya has written to the Defence Minister. I just want to know why action could not be taken against the publishers of this book for saying that General Thimayya has collaborated in writing this book, which actually General Thimayya has not done.

**Shri Ranga:** This information could have been given to this House much earlier at the time when questions were put to him. Why did he keep

that information back from this House. (*Interruption*)?

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** Sir, I would like to submit that this information was not given when a question was put earlier.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** Sir, I rise to a point of order. I think, Sir, the way questions are put and supplementaries are asked goes against the morale of the Army. (*Interruption*). My point is, can we discuss about a person when he is not present in this House to defend himself?

**Shri Ranga:** There is the Defence Minister to defend him.

**Shrimati Sucheta Kripalani:** May I know whether military officers of a similar status in other countries have not published similar books; if so, may I know why there is so much rumpus over this book?

**Mr. Speaker:** The matter is quite clear. This has happened without the knowledge of General Thimayya. He gave some information so that an autobiography may be written after his retirement. We do not know whether that can be written thereafter or not—we are not going into that matter. But the author of this book had no authority to publish this statement there. It was improper on his part to have done so—that is what General Thimayya says. We leave it at that stage. (*Interruption*).

**Shri Braj Raj Singh:** May I know whether the Government of India have written to the Government of USA with regard to this publication?

**Mr. Speaker:** It is none of its business.

#### Nagarjunasagar Project

+

\*834. { **Shri Ram Krishan Gupta:**  
**Shri Rami Reddy:**  
**Shri Madhusudan Rao:**  
**Shri Agadi:**  
**Shri Sugandhi:**  
**Shri Venkatasubbaiah:**

Will the Minister of Finance be pleased to refer to the reply given