

**श्री मधु लिमडे :** उन्होंने कहाँ जवाब दिया है। उन्होंने चैटर्जी साहब का भ्रमसाँ लिया है।

**Shri R. S. Pandey:** In order to represent the Kutch case before the international tribunal, I want to know whether we have collected all the documents written in Gujarati from the Maharao of Kutch and whether they are in our possession now? It is a very simple question.

**Shri Swaran Singh:** There are a large number of documents in Gujarati, in English and I presume some even in Sindhi. They have come to the notice of our team who have worked for months together in collecting all the evidence from that area locally, as well as from London and from our offices; all the relevant documents have been collected and are in our custody.

**Shri Hem Barua:** Shri N. C. Chatterjee has just now said that he has seen the instrument of accession at Geneva. I do not doubt the authenticity of that document. It is authentic. In that context, is it not a fact that the original instrument of accession that was signed between the Head of the State of Kutch and the Government of India when Lord Mountbatten was the Governor-General was missing from the Government of India files and had to be procured by Shri Jivaraj Mehta, our High Commissioner in London from the Maharao. We would like to know whether that is a fact.

**Shri Swaran Singh:** That is not a fact.

**Shri Narendra Singh Mahida:** May I know whether the appointment of the Maharao of Kutch on the Indian delegation would have been beneficial to us or not?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** This is a lawyers' group preparing the case and arguing on our side. Whereas we can get all the information from whatever sources it might be available, it is not a layman's delegation, if I may use that expression.

**Shri Nath Pai:** May we have an assurance that the presentation of India's case, which is irrefutable and if properly and assiduously submitted any impartial tribunal must uphold it, is being properly attended to? With due respect to Mr. N. C. Chatterjee and other eminent advocates whom we have drafted, we get the impression that whereas the Pakistani delegation is making it a whole-time job, ours is not. I say with the best of knowledge that our case may go for want of proper presentation, with due apology to the very eminent lawyers.....

**Mr. Speaker:** He has answered it already.

**Shri N. C. Chatterjee:** India's case has been fully, properly, adequately and comprehensively represented.

**Shri Nath Pai:** I can give details as to how many attended, for how many hours.

**Mr. Speaker:** Next question.

#### Extension of Cease-Fire in Nagaland

- +
- \*123. **Shri D. C. Sharma:**  
**Shri Yashpal Singh:**  
**Shri Kolla Venkalah:**  
**Shri P. R. Chakraverti:**  
**Shri H. C. Linga Reddy:**  
**Shri P. C. Borooah:**  
**Shri M. L. Dwivedi:**  
**Shri Bhagwat Jha Azad:**  
**Shri S. C. Samanta:**  
**Shri Subodh Hansda:**

Will the Minister of External Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) whether Church leaders in Nagaland have proposed an extension of the cease-fire period in the State by 45 days after its expiry on the 15th October, 1966; and

(b) if so, the decision arrived at in the matter?

**The Minister of State in the Ministry of External Affairs (Shri Dinesh Singh):** (a) and (b). No proposal has been received by the Government of

India from the Church leaders, although according to reports they proposed an extension of suspension of operations upto 31st December, 1966. The Underground Nagas, however telegraphically proposed two months extension from 15th October, 1966. The proposal was accepted by the Government and the period of suspension of operations has been extended upto the 15th December, 1966.

**Shri D. C. Sharma:** So far as I know, there have been four rounds of talks between the Prime Minister and the underground Naga leaders. May I know what has been the net result of these talks besides the cordiality of atmosphere that has prevailed when the talks have gone on?

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** We have reported to the House the progress of the talks as they have taken place. We shall be making a fuller statement on the last talks that have taken place.

**Shri D. C. Sharma:** May I know how long the Government propose to continue this dialogue with the underground Naga leaders and whether any time-limit on their side and our side has been set to this dialogue which has been going on, I think, for more than 2 years or so?

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** The House will appreciate that it is very difficult to fix any time-limit for such talks. While peace lasts in Nagaland and we are wanting to settle this peacefully, we shall have to go on talking. I can only say that the talks have gone on in a very friendly and frank atmosphere and I hope we shall be able to convince the underground Nagas of what we are saying.

**श्री यशपाल सिंह :** सरकार क्या यह बतला सकती है कि जो छिपे हुए नागा हैं, उनको एक्सकोन्डर डिक्लेर किया गया है या नहीं ? एक्सकोन्ड करने वाले जब कोई तार भेजते हैं, तो उसको एक्सेप्ट कर लेना, हम सरकार के लिये डिस्प्रैसफुज है या नहीं ?

**श्री दिनेश सिंह :** डिस्प्रैसफुज नहीं है । जो बातें हम उनसे कर रहे हैं, उन सिलसिले में वे तार भी भेजेंगे ।

**Shri P. R. Chakraverti:** May I know whether the departure of Rev. Michael Scott has helped the Naga rebels to modify their earlier intransigent, attitude and adjust themselves to the sovereignty of India?

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** We have mentioned several times in the House that we felt the presence of Rev. Michael Scott was not helping in these talks. Obviously, since he has left it is going on more smoothly.

**Shri P. C. Borooah:** May I know whether from the 14-point memorandum submitted by the Naga underground delegation to the Prime Minister and handed over to the newsmen in Calcutta it is clear that all discussions and deliberations so far held have made no change in their original stand; if so, whether, in such circumstances, the Government has any proposal to transfer this responsibility, the responsibility of negotiating with the underground Naga delegation to the duly constiuted Government of Nagaland and bring home to the extremist section the fact that any armed action against India is futile?

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** I would not say that there has been no progress in these talks. There has been progress made. I may say that we shall be making a fuller statement on this question. This relates only to the extension of cease-fire.

**Dr. L. M. Singhvi:** May I know whether Government have any information that during this period of extension there have been efforts by certain sections of rebel Nagas to consolidate their position and to build up their armed strength?

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** Yes, Sir, we have received reports from time to time that the Nagas are trying to strengthen their forces. On the other

hand, there is also this strong feeling that while these peace talks are going on there is a greater desire in them to settle this matter peacefully.

**Shri Indrajit Gupta:** We were happy to hear from the hon. Minister that there has been some progress in the talks. If that is so, are we to discount the Press reports which say almost unanimously that the rebel Nagas who came here said: (a) that they are not interested in any cease-fire and (b) that they stick to their original demand of absolute independence from India? Since he has said that there has been some progress, are we to take it that these reports are incorrect?

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** I mentioned on the last occasion that the underground Nagas have stated their point of view and we have stated our point of view. Yet the talks are going on and while talks are going on progress is made and there is always positive hope of a peaceful solution.

**श्री म० ला० द्विवेदी :** नागा विद्रोहियों के नेताओं से भारत सरकार की जो इतने दिनों से वार्ता चल रही है और बार-बार स्यंगित हो जाती है तो गत्यावरोध के या बातचीत के रुक जाने का मुख्य कारण क्या है और क्या इसकी सम्भावना है कि आग आप को इस पर कोई हल मिल जायेगा ?

**श्री विनेश सिंह :** मैंने अभी निवेदन किया अध्यक्ष महोदय, कि जब इस तरीके की बातें चलती हैं तो हर एक बात के विस्तार-पूर्वक बतलाने में बड़ी कठिनाई होती है और फिर आगे उससे चलने वाली बातों में रुकावट पैदा हो जाती है। बातचीत चूँकि अभी चल रही है तो वह इसकी एक निशानी है कि अभी कुछ उसमें गुंजाइश है कि यह मामला शान्तिपूर्ण ढंग से तय हो जाय और इस सदन को यह सोचना है कि हर मर्तबा यह सवाल उठता है और हर मर्तबा यह जवाब मुझ को देना पड़ता है। मैं समझता हूँ कि एक मर्तबा इस को विचार कर लें। यह जिस ढंग से

बातचीत चल रही है नागाओं से वह इस सदन को मालूम है। इस सदन ने भी उसको मंजूर किया और हम उस पर कोशिश कर रहे हैं। हम आशा करते हैं और मुमकिन है कि उससे कोई एक शान्तिपूर्ण फैसला निकल आये। अब जैसा मैंने कहा हर वक्त उसके बारे में विस्तार में जाना और बतलाना कि क्या उन्होंने कहा और क्या हम ने कहा जरा कठिन होता है।

**श्री म० ला० द्विवेदी :** मैंने विस्तार की कोई बात नहीं पूछी कि क्या उन्होंने कहा और क्या हम ने कहा। मैंने केवल इतना पूछा है कि किस कारण से गत्यावरोध हो जाता है, उस रुकावट का क्या कारण है एक आध कारण बतला दें . . . .

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** वह उन्होंने कह दिया है कि विस्तार में जाने में टैम्स में आगे बाधा पड़ेगी।

**Shri S. C. Samanta:** May I know the grounds that were put forward by the Church leaders and whether because of those grounds the extension has been made or Government made it on its own?

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** I have given this answer in the body of the main reply.

**Shri Subodh Hansda:** It has appeared in the newspapers that about 2500 Nagas are undergoing training in East Pakistan and in anticipation of that the underground Nagas have asked for the extension of cease-fire. May I know whether Government is aware of that and whether it is a fact that these Nagas are undergoing training in East Pakistan?

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** This matter was mentioned to the underground Nagas and they denied that there was any training going on in Pakistan.

**Shrimati Jyotsana Chanda:** May I know whether the cease-fire agreement is in operation only in Nagaland or it is extended to Ukhrul subdivision of Manipur?

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** Ukhrul sub-division is covered by the cessation of operations.

**श्री राम सेवक यादव :** अभी मंत्री महोदय ने कहा कि नागालैंड के तथाकथित विद्रोही नेताओं और भारत सरकार के बीच में जो वार्ता चली उसमें उन्होंने अपना दृष्टिकोण रखा और भारत सरकार ने अपना दृष्टिकोण रखा और यह आशा करते हैं कि प्रगति हो रही है और कोई समझौता भी हो जायगा तो मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि नागा प्रतिनिधियों ने जो अपना दृष्टिकोण रखा क्या उससे भारत सरकार के मन पर यह असर है या उससे यह नतीजा निकलता है कि वह सम्पूर्ण स्वतंत्रता को छोड़ कर फिर भी समझौता कर लेंगे और दूसरे यह कि जब यह शान्ति वार्ता चलती है यह उनसे सीज फायर का एग््रीमेंट होता है उसके बीच में इधर, उधर के कितने लोग मारे गये ? यह दो मेरे सवाल हैं ।

**श्री विनेश सिंह :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैंने अभी विस्तारपूर्वक यह कहने की कोशिश की थी । मुझे दुःख है कि माननीय सदस्य उसको समझे नहीं हैं क्योंकि जब इस तरीके की बातें चलती हैं कि जो हमारी बात है उसको नागा मान जाते हैं या उनकी बात हम मान जाते हैं तब तो बातें खत्म हो जाती हैं क्योंकि फिर तो आगे कुछ कहने को नहीं रह जाता है लेकिन सवाल तो उस वक्त का होता है कि जब हम एक बात कहते हैं और वह दूसरी बात कहें तो फिर कोशिश होती है कि कितने नजदीक हम अपने उनको ला सकते हैं और उसी का प्रयत्न हो रहा है ।

**श्री राम सेवक यादव :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा यह प्रश्न नहीं था । मेरा आप से नम्र निवेदन है कि मेरा निवेदन सुन लिया जाय और उसका उत्तर मंत्री जी से दिलवा दिया जाय । हम को संतोष हो जायगा ।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** मंत्री जी ने जवाब दे दिया है कि अभी जब बातें चलती हैं तो वह उन बातों की तर्कनील में नहीं जा सकते हैं

और इसलिए वह उसका जवाब नहीं दे सकते हैं ।

**श्री राम सेवक यादव :** दूसरा सवाल यह था कि जब यह शान्ति वार्ता चलती है और यह उन से सीज फायर का एग््रीमेंट होता है तो उसके बीच में इधर और उधर के कितने लोग मरे उसका जवाब भी उन्होंने नहीं दिया है ?

**श्री विनेश सिंह :** यह सूचना समय-समय पर हम ने सदन के पटल पर रख दी है ।

**Shri Joachim Alva:** Is it not true that ever since the Simon Commission the Nagas have demanded a separate State and that it will take some time to take them out of this complex and that it is our firm and unequivocal policy that we stand for the sovereignty of India that we have put the entire matter before all the Naga leaders, some of whom are underground and some of whom are not available for negotiation so that they may take up the matter for consideration before their collective council?

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** That is the position. We have placed our views before them.

**श्री प्रकाशबोर शास्त्री :** पादरी स्काट के निष्कासन के बाद भी भारत सरकार को क्या इस प्रकार की जानकारी मिली है कि बर्मा और पाकिस्तान के माध्यम से नागा विद्रोहियों का दूसरे देशों के साथ सम्बन्ध है और वहां से हथियार उन्हें प्राप्त होते रहते हैं यदि हां, तो उसे रोकने के लिए भारत सरकार क्या प्रयास कर रही है ?

**श्री विनेश सिंह :** यह तो अध्यक्ष महोदय, समय-समय पर सदन के सामने रखा गया है और मैंने अभी जिक्र किया कि जो विद्रोही नागा नेता थे उनसे भी इसका जिक्र किया है यह मुनासिब नहीं है कि जब हमारी वार्ता चल रही है तो वह किन्हीं नागाओं को हथियार लाने या ट्रेनिंग लेने बाहर भेजें । उन्होंने इससे इंकार किया ।

**The Minister of External Affairs (Shri Swaran Singh):** If I may supplement it, the suggested insinuation in the question that the Burmese Government is in any way encouraging them is absolutely incorrect. We have got the best of relations with the Government of Burma and there has been complete co-operation and understanding between us and the Government of Burma.

**Shri Ranga:** May I know whether during the latest talks the Government have assured themselves of the co-operation and active assistance and advice of the present Chief Minister, Shri Angami and the ex-Chief Minister, Shri Shilu Ao? Are they trying to be in touch with both of them continuously in regard to this particular matter of the negotiations with the rebel Nagas?

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** The Nagaland Government is in touch with us very closely and the Chief Minister was here during the talks. We are in very close touch with them.

**Shri Ranga:** What about the ex-Chief Minister, Shilu Ao? Are they seeking his co-operation or not? There are two or three tribes and both of them are leaders of two different tribes; we should be able to assure ourselves of their co-operation.

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** We have the co-operation of the former Chief Minister also.

**Shri Swell:** Last time when the delegation of the rebel Nagas came here and had talks with the Prime Minister, reports which were supposed to emanate from official circles indicated that the talks were progressing satisfactorily, but the leader of this delegation, Mr. Kughato Sukhai, went to Calcutta the next morning and said that the talks had reached a deadlock. I would like to know which of these views is nearer the truth. Mr. Kughato Sukhai had also issued a 14-point memorandum. I would like to know whether this Government is

issuing any statement clarifying those points raised by Mr. Kughato Sukhai.

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** The underground Naga delegation has gone back to consult their colleagues and to that extent, as I said earlier, the talks had gone on. It is for them to go back, consult their colleagues and let us know. If the talks continue, obviously they have gone on satisfactorily; but if the talks do not continue, then of course there will be a deadlock. So far as the other question that the hon. Member asked about the 14-point memorandum is concerned, it is true that a note was handed over to the Prime Minister by Mr. Kughato Sukhai. We did not go into it because that related largely to the past and we said that what mattered most was our present association and any future adjustments that may be necessary.

**Shri Swell:** The Minister has entirely evaded my question. I had asked which of the contradictory points of view was nearer the truth and, secondly, whether the Government was issuing any statement to clarify the points raised by Mr. Kughato Sukhai. This House is not any better enlightened by this evasive answer given by the Minister. We are entitled to better answers.

**Shri Dinesh Singh:** My difficulty is that hon. Members only listen to one side. I had said at the very beginning that we shall be making a statement. I do not know what else I shall say.

#### Foreign Minister's Speech in Commonwealth Prime Ministers' Conference

+

- \*124. **Shri Shree Natayan Das:**  
**Shri S. M. Banerjee:**  
**Shri Daji:**  
**Shri Yashpal Singh:**  
**Shri P. C. Borooah:**  
**Shri D. J. Naik:**  
**Shri Kishen Pattnayak:**  
**Shri Madhu Limaye:**

Will the Minister of External