

श्री विदेश सिंह : उनके मुद्राविजे क मवाल नहीं है क्योंकि वहाँ जो उनक मामान है उस में से वे अपने साथ एक काय के हिसाब से ला सकेंगे ।

श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा : उनकी जो प्रापरटी रह जायेगी उसका क्या बनेगा ?

Shri Man Singh P. Patel: May I know what is the position of the persons who are not covered by the two Prime Ministers' Agreement and whether anything will be done in relation to that?

Mr. Speaker: This Question relates to that Agreement only.

श्री भागवत झा आजाद : जिन प्रवासी भारतीयों का इस से सम्बन्ध है चूंकि उन का बहुत विरोध इस समझौते के सम्बन्ध में हुआ है तो क्या मैं यह जान सकता हूँ कि सरकार ने संयुक्त अधिकारी समिति बनाने के पूर्व इस बात पर विचार किया है कि उनके विरोध के कारण कहीं सारे जो अभी तक के प्रयत्न हैं वे असफल न हो जायँ इसलिए उस पर पहले ही विचार कर लिया जाय ?

श्री विदेश सिंह : इस का तो पहले भी विचार हुआ था लेकिन इस में कोई ऐसा खास विरोध नहीं हो रहा है, सब से मिल कर कोशिश हो रही है कि ये समझौते पूरे तरीके से अमल में लाये जायँ ।

Shri Narendra Singh Mahida: May I know whether there is any term in the Agreement whereby the implementation of the Agreement would be re-examined after some time?

Shri Dinesh Singh: This is mentioned in the Agreement.

#### Concentration of Chinese Troops

+

Shri Yashpal Singh:  
Shri S. M. Banerjee:  
Shri D. C. Sharma:  
Shri Prakash Vir Shastri:  
Shri Jagdev Singh

\*62.

Siddhanti:

• Dr. L. M. Singhvi:  
Shri Sidheswar Prasad:  
Shri Hem Barua:  
Shri Madhu Limaye:  
Shri Sivamurthi Swamy:  
Shri Man Singh P. Patel:  
Shrimati Renuka Ray:  
Shri D. N. Tiwary:  
Shri Gulshan:  
Shri D. J. Naik:  
Shri Krishna Pal Singh:  
Shri P. C. Borooah:  
Shri Balkrishna Wasnik:  
Shri Vidya Charan Shukla:  
Shri Ram Harkh Yadav:  
Shri Rameshwar Tantia:  
Shri Maheswar Naik:

Will the Minister of Defence be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is possible to indicate the size of the concentration of the Chinese troops on the borders of India;

(b) whether it is in excess of the number of troops normally required for guarding the borders of a country; and

(c) the action proposed to be taken in the matter?

The Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Defence (Dr. D. S. Raju): (a) The Chinese are known to have deployed roughly 13 to 16 Divisions on the northern borders of India.

(b) Yes Sir.

(c) All necessary steps have been taken and our defences are adequate to meet any eventuality.

श्री यशपाल सिंह : क्या सरकार यह बतला सकती है कि हिन्दुस्तान की सीमा कौन सी भारत सरकार मानती है, मैकमोहन लाइन को मानती है, कोलम्बो प्रपोजल्स की मानती है या जहाँ से इन के जनरल कौल भाग कर आये थे उस लाइन को अपनी सीमा मानती है या जो अभी यह नो-मैन-लैंड का नया प्रपोजल आया है इस को मानती है, आखिर उस के विचार में भारत की

वह कौन सी सीमा है जिसके लिए भारत की कोटि कोटि जनता यह कसम उठावे कि हम उस की रक्षा के लिए लड़ेंगे ?

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** माननीय सदस्य ने तो सवाल न पूछ कर एक व्याख्यान ही दे डाला है।

**श्री यशपाल सिंह :** आखिर सरकार कोई रेखा तो बतलाये कि उस रेखा की रक्षा करनी है ?

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** रेखा बतला सकते हैं।

**The Minister of Defence (Shri Y. B. Chavan):** I can certainly say in a general way that international frontiers are established frontiers and they are naturally what they were before November 1962.

**श्री यशपाल सिंह :** वह सन् 1947 की लाइन को मानती है या 62 वाली लाइन को मानती है ?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** I do not know what is the distinction between the two. (*Interruption*).

**Shri P. K. Deo:** It is a very damaging statement that he has made. He has said that the frontiers are what they were before 1962. It is all wrong. The stand taken by us has been that we accept the 1947 border.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** From the statement of the Minister it appears that the Chinese have concentrated their posts across the border. I would like to know whether Government have any information that this time the Chinese are likely to attack in April or May from the Chumbi valley and, if so, what steps have been taken to counteract this attack through Nathula Pass and other regions.

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** The Chumbi valley is considered to be a more sensitive area. Looking into its assess-

ment, necessary steps have been taken about it.

**Shri D. C. Sharma:** When we think of the Chinese build-up, we think of its land forces and its air force. I would like to know from the hon. Minister, without giving us any details, whether our land forces and our air force are adequate to deal with Chinese invasion which may be a surprise attack any time.

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** As far as the land forces are concerned, certainly we have reached a stage where I can say 'Yes' but in the case of air force, we have to take steps to expand and modernise it and those steps are in the process of being taken.

**श्री जगदेव सिंह सिद्धान्ती :** जैसे कि पिछले चीनी आक्रमण के समय उन का प्रतिरोध करने के लिए ऐसे दुर्बल भगोड़े सेनापति आप ने लगा दिये थे तो क्या इस बार तो आप बैसे नहीं लगायेंगे ?

**श्री यशवन्तराव चव्हाण :** भारतीय सेना में ऐसे कोई सेनापति हैं ही नहीं।

**Mr. Speaker:** All of us are expected to be and really are intense patriots. We ought to see whether any supplementary question would bring in an answer that might not be very desirable.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** Why should we have regard for Gen. Kaul who had betrayed us. (*Interruptions*).

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order.

**Dr. L. M. Singhvi:** In what areas or in what sectors particularly is there an abnormal or inordinate concentration of Chinese troops, and is there any particular region which is considered more liable to be assaulted upon by the Chinese concentration of troops?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** I do not think that I should go into the question of giving these assessments etc.

**Mr. Speaker:** I also would not advise him to do so. If he mentions one place which is not really the place where there is greatest concentration, then too it is harmful; if he gives the exact place also, it is harmful. So, why should any answer be expected for this question.

**Shri Hem Barua:** In view of the fact that our reverses in NEFA and Ladakh have pinpointed (a) the urgency of what they call in defence parlance battle inoculation for troops, (b) acclimatisation of our troops for higher altitudes, and (c) the lacunae in our military intelligence, may I know whether Government are in a position to assure us that our *bando-bust* on all these counts is *pucca*?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** I think I have made statements on the floor of this House before, but I would like to repeat the assurance given before that as far as the battle inoculation is concerned, the training is intensified, and certain new instructions about the training have been undertaken. As far as acclimatisation is concerned, steps have already been taken, for the last nearly two years, to acclimatise all the troops by rotation at high altitude regions. As far as intelligence is concerned, it is certainly a matter which takes time to build up. Certain steps are being taken which I am sure will lead ultimately to an improvement in the situation in that particular respect.

**Shri Hem Barua:** The hon. Minister has said that as far as intelligence is concerned, it takes time to build up, and I agree with him in that entirely. But then, if our intelligence has not been built up, how is it that Government are in a position to state that the Chinese have concentrated their troops on our borders?

**Mr. Speaker:** If the hon. Member agrees with the hon. Minister, then he should wait and not ask further questions in this manner.

**श्री मधु लिमये :** क्या सरकार के पास इस बात की कोई जानकारी है कि नजदीक के भविष्य में चीन के द्वारा हमारी सीमा पर फिर फ़ौजी हमला या चढ़ाई होगी ?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** It is not a matter merely of intelligence. It is a matter of a certain assessment of political factors and other matters. I can only say that they are there in a larger concentration, and their posture is a threatening posture. Whether they will do something or not is not a matter on which I can prophesy.

**श्री मधु लिमये :** मैंने जानकारी के बारे में पूछा है। क्या सरकार के पास उस की खुफिया पुलिस या फ़ौजी विभाग के द्वारा कोई जानकारी मिली है, यह मेरा सवाल है ?

**श्री यशवन्तराव चव्हाण :** मेरे पास जानकारी हो भी, तो भी मैं यह बात नहीं कहना चाहता हूँ।

**श्री द्वा० ना० तिवारी :** क्या यह सही है कि चाइनीज़ सैनिक कभी कभी लुक छिप कर भारतीय सीमा में घ्रा जाते हैं और वहाँ के लोगों से भाई चारा कर के और उन को मुलावे में डाल कर कोई खबर लेते हैं ?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** There were certain incidents of intrusions about which we lodged protests with China, which protests have also been published. But there have been no occasions when the Chinese troops came inside to keep contact with the people as such.

**Shri Krishnapal Singh:** Have we established any unit for intercepting wireless messages which are sent from the other side?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** I do not think I can answer that question.

**श्री ग़ुलशन :** क्या मैं जान सकता हूँ कि जो चीनी सैनिक भारतीय सीमाओं के नजदीक जमा हुए हैं, क्या उन्होंने किसी जगह

श्री भारतीय भूमि पर भी कब्जा किया है ?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** No, Sir. Except what they have occupied in Ladakh, they have not occupied any area as such. But certainly certain incidents of intrusion, to which I made a reference, did take place.

**Shri Vidya Charan Shukla:** Is our troopline the same as was made by the Chinese when they unilaterally declared a cease-fire in NEFA, or have we gone beyond?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** I cannot answer this question about the location of our army.

**श्री विभूति मिश्र :** हिन्दुस्तान और चीन के बीच में नेपाल की 750 मील लम्बी स्टेट है। नेपाल की फौजी ताकत और नेपाल के बार्डर पर चीनी फौजों के दबाव को देखते हुए क्या भारत सरकार नागालैंड से लेकर लखनऊ के बीच में सीमा की सुरक्षा के लिए कोई अड्डा बनाने का विचार कर रही है ?

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** यह तो जनरल सवाल है। माननीय सदस्य ने सारे इंडिया के डिफेंस का सवाल उठाया है।

**श्री विभूति मिश्र :** नेपाल बार्डर पर डिफेंस का कोई जॉ या नहीं है और सुरक्षा की कोई व्यवस्था नहीं है।

**Shrimati Savitri Nigam:** In view of fresh concentrations of Chinese troops on our borders, has any fresh protest been sent or have the Colombo Proposal countries been informed about it?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** There was no occasion for a fresh protest except about the intrusions made. I do not think we have made any contact with the Colombo Proposal countries.

**श्री यशपाल सिंह :** क्या सरकार बता सकती है कि ढकिला चौकी पर, जिस को चीनी लोग खाली कर गए हैं, आज तक हमारा

कोई सैनिक या गार्ड नहीं है, इस का क्या कारण है ?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** They have not sent it, and we have not sent our people there.

**श्री रघुनाथ सिंह :** क्या यह ठीक है कि चालीस हजार से ज्यादा आफिसर्स नेवी में ट्रेन किये जा रहे हैं और क्या इंडोनेशिया के जहाज अडमान तक आने लगे हैं ?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** No. Certainly some fishing vessels were seen and they were of Malaysian origin.

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath:** Has the Minister's attention been drawn to certain press reports to the effect that the Chinese have build or strengthened their air bases on the frontier, increased the number of their fighter aircraft and also build missile bases in Tibet?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** I have seen the press reports.

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath:** Has it been confirmed by your Intelligence?

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** Even if that be so, I would not like to reply to this question.

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath:** On a point of order . . .

**Mr. Speaker:** Even if he has some information, he says it would not be in the public interest to disclose it.

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath:** It is all right; he need not give any figures about what we are doing. But why should information about what the Chinese are doing be concealed from the nation? I cannot understand this kind of mentality.

**Mr. Speaker:** I have considered it. Shri Kamath may be right in one respect. But there is the other aspect also which he should consider. If he gives the correct idea about the enemy's forces which the Ministry has got, then too it would not be in our interest because the enemy, knowing

that, will certainly try to take certain measures. If we make an assessment that is wrong, then the enemy would be reassured that our information is not correct. They should also be kept guessing as to whether we have got the information or not.

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath:** The crucial point that arises is, what is Parliament, what is the nation, to know.

**Mr. Speaker:** He can just sit with the Minister and discuss it.

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath:** It is not a private affair; it is a national affair. We are here in Parliament, the nation's highest forum. Why should he conceal this information from us? They did it once, and that was the reason why the debacle took place last time. If they similarly conceal everything from us now, there may be another debacle. This is a shameful affair. Why should they proceed in this manner?

**Mr. Speaker:** We can consider it on some other occasions.

**Shri Hem Barua:** May I seek your guidance?

**Mr. Speaker:** I cannot allow two Members to rise at a time.

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath:** The people's morale should also be strengthened.

**Mr. Speaker:** I have heard him patiently. He should resume his seat now. I will hear Mr. Hem Barua.

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath:** If you think that the Minister should be protected, it is all right, but should not the nation be protected? The nation also needs protection from China. I do not know what protection he gives, and how.

**Mr. Speaker:** He may kindly sit down now.

**Shri Hem Barua:** May I seek your guidance? If the Minister could inform Parliament about the Chinese troops seen and where they were seen including the number of divisions that they have on our border, why cannot the Minister inform Parliament of their air bases and missile bases?

**Mr. Speaker:** The ordinary practice is—our rules also conform to that practice, that it is left to the Minister—when he feels that certain information should not be given in public interest, then I should not ordinarily compel him.

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath:** Ordinarily.

**Mr. Speaker:** There might be special circumstances.

**Shri Hem Barua:** He did not say 'public interest': it is you who are putting that idea into his head.

**Mr. Speaker:** What other interest can he have? Not any personal interest.

**Shri Ranga:** We cannot very well assume that. After all there is a limit beyond which you cannot be expected to protect these people. It is for him to think for himself and say: in public interest, I am unable to say this.

**Shri Y. B. Chavan:** I will explain the matter. The idea is not to deny any useful information to this hon. House. I have always tried to give as much information as I could give. I have told the House that there is a growing complex of air-fields in Tibet. I can give a general assessment of the preparations that they are doing. If I start giving detailed information of what we know about that, it will certainly be against public interest. It was from that point of view that I said that I could not give this information. My idea was not to refuse or deny any important information which I could usefully give to the hon. Members. . . (Interruptions).

**Mr. Speaker:** Next question.

#### Peace Talks in Nagaland

+

63. { **Shri Bhagwat Jha Azad:**  
**Shri Yashpal Singh:**  
**Shri S. M. Banerjee:**  
**Shri P. C. Borooah:**  
**Shri Prakash Vir Shastri:**  
**Shri Jagdev Singh**  
**Siddhanti:**