## 2841 Motion re Report on the Working of the Preventive Detention Act

# [Shri Sadhan Chandra Gupta]

movement, began to enter into houses, to lathi charge people inside the houses, to commit vandalism and molest women inside houses. There is a limit to tolerance, and that is how some violence occurred. The leaders of the movement have always asked the populace to be peaceful in spite of all provocations. It is only the police, by lathicharging and shooting down innocent persons, that provoked violence. And there was very little of it; it was nothing compared to the police violence. Why this talk of violence, why this bogey of violence? The State Governments do not believe The reason is simple. They want it to trample down our movement against British exploitation and against capitalist exploitation. They want to trample down our movement against enhancement of tram-fares which has been held to be unjustified by a Commission appointed by the Government. They want to check our movement against bonus. They want to check our movement against bad food, bad quality of rice and high price of food.

We as Communists are proud to have borne the brunt of the abuse of this Act, but other political parties have not escaped. They have got their share also. In West Bengal, Communists, Socialists, Praja Socialists and others have equally borne it, and even Congressmen have been detained.

Sir. in conclusion I appeal to all sections of the House to realise the pernicious character of this Act. It puts our country to shame before the conscience of civilized society. It has become a perpetual menace to every honest and right-thinking individualto Communists and Socialists, to Forward Bloc or R.S.P., even to Congress people-whose motive is to stand by the millions of our oppressed people against a handful of persons who oppress them. It is a menace to our workers, peasants and middle classes. Whoever want to strive to get rid of the present life of hunger, misery and squalor is menaced by this pernicious Act. Therefore I would appeal to

for the reorganisation

### of States

every section of the House to voice their opposition against this pernicious Act.

STATEMENT RE. APPOINTMENT OF A COMMISSION FOR THE RE-ORGANISATION OF STATES

The Prime Minister and Minister of External Affairs and Defence (Shri Jawaharlai Nehru): Mr. Speaker, I am not intervening in this debate, but by your leave and the leave of the House I should like to make a statement totally unrelated to the subject under debate.

The Government of India have been giving careful consideration to the problem of the States which are constituent units of the Indian Union. These States, as they exist today, are largely the result of historical processes and the spread and consolidation of the British power in India. On the attainment of Independence, India was partitioned and the independent State of Pakistan was created. A process of merger and integration took place in regard to what were then "Indian States". called the This integration of the old Indian States. which was brought about within а very short period, was an event of historic significance. The integration, however, was naturally based to a large extent on the old patterns which existed before Independence.

The pattern of our States in the Union is thus the result of historical accident and circumstances. The mere existence for a hundred years or more developed, political, administrative and cultural associations within and between them.

The greater development of political consciousness among the people and the growing importance of the great regional languages led gradually to demands for the formation of certain States on a linguistic basis. Each such problem was. separate however. closely inter-related with other problems, and any formation of a new State necessarily affected a number of other States. It thus became increasingly difficult to consider 2117 such problem in trolation.

The language and culture of ลก area have an undoubted importance as they represent a pattern of living which is common in that area. In considering a reorganisation of States, however, there are other important factors which have also to be borne in mind. The first essential consideration is the preservation and strengthening of the unity and security of India. Financial, economic and administrative considerations are almost equally important, not only from the point of view of each State, but for the whole nation. India has embarked upon a great ordered plan for her economic, cultural and moral progress. Changes which interfere with the successful prosecution of such a national plan would be harmful to the national interest.

The Government of India have come to the conclusion that the whole question of the reorganisation of the States of the Indian Union should be carefully examined, objectively and dispassionately, so that the welfare of the people of each constituent unit, as well as of the nation as a whole, is promoted. The Government have accordingly decided to appoint a Commission to conduct such an examination. The Commission will investigate the conditions of the problem, the historical background, the existing situation and the bearing of all important and relevant factors thereon. They will be free to consider any proposal relating to such reorganisation. The Commission will be at liberty to devise their own procedure for their work, for collecting information and for ascertaining public opinion. The Commission will ordinarily hold their sittings in private.

The Commission will make their recommendations to the Government as soon as may be practicable, and not later than the 30th June, 1955.

The Government expect that the Commission would, in the first instance, not go into the details, but make recommendations in regard to the broad principles which should govern the solution of this problem and, if they so choose, the broad lines

#### Motion re Report on 2844 the Working of the Preventive Detention Act

on which particular States should be reorganised, and submit interim reports for the consideration of the Government.

The Commission will have a Secretary and such staff and advisers as may be considered necessary.

The Commission will consist of Shri Saiyid Fazl Ali, at present Governor of Orissa, Shri Hriday Nath Kunzru, Member of the Council of States, and Shri Kavalam Madhava Panikkar, at present Ambassador of India in Egypt. of whom Shri Saiyid Fazl Ali shall be the Chairman of the Commission.

#### MOTION RE. REPORT ON THE WORKING OF THE PREVENTIVE DETENTION ACT-contd.

Shrl Frank Anthony: Sir. I am sorry that the Home Minister is not here, because I am afraid that during the course of my speech I shall be constrained to refer to him, perhaps not always in the most gentle terms. I regret that the Home Minister made, by his speech, a bad case worse. I feel that in some respects, and I say this with all respect to the Home Minister, at the same time, he displays an unfortunate capacity, almost a genius, not only for irritating people wantonly, but for gratuitously giving offence by a cavalier and almost a flippant manner to a most serious problem, by either over-simplifying or over-stating the Government's case. Quite frankly, I was rather amazed both at the attitude and language of the Home Minister. The Home Minister gave me the impression of a lawyer who argued his case vehemently and in a partisan manner in order to justify his brief. If the Home Minister had admitted that the Government today was following on the footsteps of the British because of abnormal conditions in this country, if he had admitted that preventive detention without trial in times of peace is something which is repugnant to the fundamental concept of democracy, if he had admitted that this is an evil, but a necessary evil,