

**TRAINING OF OFFICERS IN INDIAN NAVY**

**MINISTRY OF DEFENCE (INDIAN NAVY)**

**PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE  
(2023-24)**

**HUNDRED AND SEVENTH REPORT**

**SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI**

**HUNDRED AND SEVENTH  
REPORT**

**PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE  
(2023-24)**

(SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)

**TRAINING OF OFFICERS IN INDIAN NAVY**

MINISTRY OF DEFENCE (INDIAN NAVY)



*Presented to Lok Sabha on:* 08-02-2024

*Laid in Rajya Sabha on:* 08-02-2024

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI**

February 2024/ Magha 1945 (Saka)

<b>CONTENTS</b>		
	COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2023-24)	(iii)
	INTRODUCTION	(iv)
	<b>PART- I</b>	
	<b>REPORT</b>	
	<b>PART – II</b>	
	<b>OBSERVATIONS/ RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE</b>	
	<b>APPENDICES</b>	
II*	Minutes of the Sitting of the Public Accounts Committee (2023-24) held on 18-07-2023.	
III*	Minutes of the Sitting of the Public Accounts Committee (2023-24) held on 05-02-2024.	

\*Not appended in the report

## **COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE**

**(2023-24)**

**Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury - Chairperson**

### **MEMBERS**

#### **LOK SABHA**

2. Shri Subhash Chandra Baheria
3. Shri Thalikkottai Rajuthevar Baalu
4. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
5. Shri Jagdambika Pal
6. Shri Pratap Chandra Sarangi
7. Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
8. Shri Rahul Ramesh Shewale
9. Shri Gowdar Mallikarjunappa Siddeshwara
10. Dr. Satya Pal Singh
11. Shri Brijendra Singh
12. Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh alias Lalan Singh
13. Shri Jayant Sinha
14. Shri Balashowry Vallabhaneni
15. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav

#### **RAJYA SABHA**

16. Shri Shaktisinh Gohil
17. Dr. K Laxman
18. Shri Derek O'Brien\*
19. Shri Tiruchi Siva
20. Dr. M. Thambidurai
21. Shri Ghanshyam Tiwari
22. Dr. Sudhanshu Trivedi

#### **SECRETARIAT**

1. Shri Sanjeev Sharma - Joint Secretary
2. Shri Partha Goswami - Director
3. Shri Alok Mani Tripathi - Deputy Secretary
4. Shri Vijay Mishra - Committee Officer

\*Elected w.e.f. 19.08.2023 consequent upon retirement of Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray, MP on 18.08.2023.

## **INTRODUCTION**

I, the Chairperson, Public Accounts Committee (2023-24) having been authorized by the Committee, do present this Hundred and Seventh Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on **“TRAINING OF OFFICERS IN INDIAN NAVY”** based on "Para - 2.2 of Report No 9 of 2018.

2. The Report of Comptroller and Auditor General of India was laid on the Table of the House on 07-08-2018.

3. The Public Accounts Committee took oral evidence of the representatives of Ministry of Defence (Indian Navy) on 18-07-2023. The Committee considered and adopted this Report at their sitting held on 05-02-2024. The Minutes of the sittings of the Committee are appended to the Report.

4. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in bold and form Part-II of the Report.

5. The Committee would like to express their thanks to the representatives of the Ministry of Defence (Indian Navy) for tendering evidence before them and furnishing the requisite information to the Committee in connection with the examination of the subject.

6. The Committee also place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the Committee Secretariat and the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

**NEW DELHI**  
**05 February, 2024**  
**16 Magha, 1945 (Saka)**

**ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY**  
**Chairperson,**  
**Public Accounts Committee**

## REPORT

### Part -I

#### Introductory

The Committee have learnt that Director of Audit (Navy), Mumbai under instructions of Director General of Audit (Navy), New Delhi undertook an audit review on the subject 'Training of Officers in Indian Navy' on behalf of Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) of India. The audit was conducted from Jun to Nov 2017, wherein the audit team visited XXXXX<sup>1</sup>. Based on the observations during the audit, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) of India's has submitted "Audit Para - 2.2 of Report No 9 of 2018 (Navy and Coast Guard)", which included 12 sub paras. C&AG Audit Report No. 9 of 2018 on Defence Services, Navy & Coast Guard has been tabled in Parliament on 07 Aug 2018.

2. As per the information gathered by the Committee each officer trainee of the Indian Navy undergoes training depending upon the scheme of his or her entry and the branch allocated to the trainee. Indian Navy has 29 training schools/ establishments, imparting training to officers. The efficacy and productivity of the Indian Naval training organization has a direct bearing on combat readiness and operational effectiveness of Naval platforms/ Systems and is a crucial enabler to achieve the desired results in combat.
3. Audit observed that the XXXXX<sup>2</sup> on the training being imparted to officers of Indian Navy. XXXXX<sup>3</sup> existed for training crew on the aspects of XXXXX<sup>4</sup>. XXXXX<sup>5</sup> practical training is imparted through attachment to the Indian Navy's DC and FF facilities, which is based on XXXXX<sup>6</sup> layout. XXXXX<sup>7</sup>. The results of internal assessments of Training Establishments and Weighted Input Output Analysis have XXXXX<sup>8</sup> in the XXXXX<sup>9</sup>.
4. The Public Accounts Committee took up the subject for detailed examination and called the representatives of the Ministry of Defence for tendering evidence before the Committee. The Committee also sought post-evidence replies on pertinent issues. The subject as examined by the Committee is detailed in the ensuing paragraphs.
5. The Ministry of Defence in their reply had furnished that a new simulator roadmap has been prepared for the Indian Navy. When asked to furnish if this new roadmap addresses the requirement of training as raised by Audit in their report, the Ministry in their written reply stated as under:

**Simulator Roadmap**. During the last few years there has been a significant increase in the numbers of simulators being inducted by the Navy for training due to obtainability of more realistic simulators

due to advanced technology, cost effectiveness as compared to operating and maintaining actual platforms and capability to achieve increased the quality of training. In order to streamline the induction process in and to transition from a system in which simulator induction and training is in silos, to one in which it is coordinated and in alignment with the Navy's Missions, a '**Simulator Roadmap for the Indian Navy**' was promulgated by IHQ MoD(N) on 29 Nov 21. The Roadmap has been formulated to achieve the following: -

- (i) To establish a system of classification for simulators.
- (ii) To formally integrate simulators into training syllabus.
- (iii) To enhance use of simulators in continuation training.
- (iv) To integrate simulator training with live operations to create a live cum virtual environment for training.
- (v) To provide a system of oversight for procurement of simulators.
- (vi) To provide a link with 'Framework of Simulators' under formulation by HQIDS.
- (vii) To eventually transition to a 'system of systems' model of simulators, wherein networking is used to optimise simulator usage.
- (viii) To create a method by which progress on the above fronts is regularly monitored.

(a) **Standing Board for Simulator Training (SBST)**. Since the induction and utilisation of simulators is a continuous process, the same would evolve with technology advances and the missions of the Navy and it is therefore necessary that these are monitored over time and modified. Towards same the Standing Board for Simulator Training (SBST) has been constituted as part of the Simulator Roadmap, which is responsible for all simulators in the Indian Navy, XXXXX<sup>10</sup>. This Standing Board is headed by XXXXX<sup>11</sup> and comprises representatives from Professional Directorates at IHQ MoD(N), Operational Commands, Class authorities of *IN* and Naval Training Schools along with a Technical Sub-Committee.

(b) As mandated on SBST, two documents viz. Guidelines for New Simulator Procurement and Guidelines for Utilisation of in-Service Simulators have been prepared and are under promulgation. Once promulgated, these guidelines aim to establish the following on promulgation: -

- (i) Procedures/ methodology to be adopted at various levels for procurement of Simulators for training. All issues to be considered whilst procuring new simulators like inclusion with original contracts, maintenance philosophy for each simulator, role of each stakeholder, classification, design/ development methodology and obsolescence management have also been elucidated.

(ii) Issues *wrt* in-Service simulators like classification, dovetailing into syllabi, benchmarking of utilisation rate and minimum operating standards, enhancement of utilisation of simulators for initial training at training units and continuation training at other organisations, maintenance methodology to be adopted to cater for obsolescence and necessary upgrades, networking aspects and cross utilisation by personnel from sister Services and other civil agencies.

(c) It is evident from the foregoing that *IN* has established procedures towards effectively utilising the existing simulators in the *IN* inventory including aspects of maintenance methodology, obsolescence, upgrades and networking aspects as well as laying down the process for induction of new simulators. The implementation of guidelines mentioned above would address XXXXX<sup>12</sup> as all aspects of training have been catered right from AoN stage of the new induction, contract stage and till delivery. This would ensure availability of the simulator/emulator for training at respective training establishments for the personnel to be trained prior they are positioned onboard these platforms. "

6. When asked about the shortage in the strength of Indian Navy, the representative of the Ministry of Defence during the oral evidence stated as under:

"That is correct. The total strength sanctioned for sailors is XXXXX<sup>13</sup>. So, we cannot have a shortage of one lakh. The sanctioned strength itself is XXXXX<sup>14</sup>."

He further stated as under:

"That is correct. There is a shortage... But approximately, the shortage is XXXXX<sup>15</sup>."

7. Explaining the details of the various training facilities and the shortcomings pointed out by the Audit, the representatives of the Ministry of Defence (Indian Navy) during the evidence stated as under:

"With regard to non-procurement of new XXXXX<sup>16</sup>, it is submitted that five out six, identified by audit, have already been procured. Procurement of XXXXX<sup>17</sup> was delayed due to discontinuation of a procurement procedure called revenue to capital procedure and Budget constraints during COVID years. However, the XXXXX<sup>18</sup> is presently under procurement using Government e-Marketplace at a much lesser cost. In addition, XXXXX<sup>19</sup> have been positioned from Original Equipment Manufacturers as would be evident in this short video clip. So, this is the Diesel Engine Wing Facility at XXXXX<sup>20</sup> where we have I XXXXX<sup>21</sup> in ample numbers as is shown on the screen.



The next issue is with regard to XXXXX<sup>22</sup>. It is informed that the facility was completed in March, 2019 and is fully functional. About 16,000 trainees have utilized the facility including about two hundred trainees from fourteen friendly foreign countries. Shown on the screen are two photographs of the facility.

With regard to XXXXX<sup>23</sup>, it is submitted that all equipment are operational after having them repaired in-house, and hence, now there is 'nil' impact on training. A short video clip of the Industrial Training Wing is now shown on the screen.

With regard to XXXXX<sup>24</sup>, it is confirmed that twenty-four simulators, emulators, and static models have been installed in addition to live equipment. Further, Navy-wide standardization has resulted in requirement of lesser number of equipment at the training school. Notwithstanding, induction of live equipment of new induction platforms is an institutionalized process and so our policies and standing committees. ...we are exploiting state-of-the-art AR and VR simulators, live equipment, theoretical classes and it is a combination of this training continuum which we aimed to achieve.

The next issue is with regard to XXXXX<sup>25</sup>. It is confirmed that a new software XXXXX<sup>26</sup> was sourced from the Original Equipment Manufacturer and it was upgraded and licensed in 2020, thereby achieving full functionality of the simulator. A photograph of the simulator is shown on the screen now. Procurement of simulators for XXXXX<sup>27</sup> was XXXXX<sup>28</sup> due to the facility being first-of-its-kind and the need for careful development of the requirements. The Facility was commissioned in May this year and is regularly being utilized to impart training. Photographs of the XXXXX<sup>29</sup> Facilities are shown on the screen.

With regard to XXXXX<sup>30</sup> feedback, it is submitted that Navy has implemented online feedback management system in 2018 which has resulted in percentage compliance of feedback from operational units from nine per cent in 2017 to close to eighty per cent in 2022. We have adequate data points, as feedback, to refine our training processes.

In order to address the XXXXX<sup>31</sup> by introducing a 26-week bridging course including three weeks afloat attachment onboard ships. In addition, a comprehensive policy for conduct of XXXXX<sup>32</sup> was issued in February, 2018. All these measures have resulted in 'nil' withdrawals in the last three years.

With regard to an observation that there was an increasing trend of XXXXX<sup>33</sup> from 2012 to 2017, it is submitted that correlation coefficient is a function of performance at the entry level and in the final examination. However, in the quoted period, while entry-level test was based on 10+2 certification on subjects like Physics and

Mathematics, the final test was on different subjects like seamanship and navigation, which are service subjects leading to a XXXXX<sup>34</sup>. When the results were compared with similar subject, positive correlation was observed."

8. Regarding XXXXX<sup>35</sup>, representatives of the ministry during the course of examination explained that the reason for XXXXX<sup>36</sup> was due to unavoidable circumstances. The ministry has brought forward the following in explanation: -

*"The Phase 1 of the project was completed by Oct 19 and to ensure that the XXXXX<sup>37</sup> undertook alternate measures such as the commissioning of a pre-fabricated XXXXX<sup>38</sup> and resorted to XXXXX<sup>39</sup> thus allowing the XXXXX<sup>40</sup> to cater to the designated strengths to meet immediate requirements. The execution of infrastructure projects in a time bound manner at XXXXX<sup>41</sup> is a challenge due to its XXXXX<sup>42</sup> of the country. These have been experienced in projects which have been executed in Phase-I and those that are completed/ being executed in Phase-II. Further, COVID-19 pandemic restrictions and lockdowns between the period Mar 20 - Jun 21 had resulted in non-availability of labour and unprecedented delays in delivery of construction materials, both of which had severely affected the work progress in all ongoing projects of Phase-II. Based on the progress of works, the envisaged EDC of Phase II is 31 Dec 25"*

9. Regarding XXXXX<sup>43</sup>, representatives of the ministry during the course of examination explained that the XXXXX<sup>44</sup> was related to infrastructure delays and has been concurrently addressed. The ministry has brought forward the following in explanation: -

*XXXXX<sup>45</sup> requirement of XXXXX<sup>46</sup> were completed in 2016 and meets the demands of the XXXXX<sup>47</sup>. In the interim period, the practical classes for XXXXX<sup>48</sup> onwards were conducted through collaboration at XXXXX<sup>49</sup> and XXXXX<sup>50</sup> for XXXXX<sup>51</sup>. Therefore, all lab requirements of the XXXXX<sup>52</sup> were met at all times."*

10. Regarding XXXXX<sup>53</sup>, representatives of the Ministry during the course of examination explained that there have been many procedural changes brought out to ensure that this issue is addressed. The Ministry has brought forward the following in explanation: -

*"New Induction Training Committee (NITC)' formulated in 2004 has been empowered and is currently chaired by a Rear Admiral (JS level officer) to evolve a plan for equipping training establishments with live equipment, training aids, viz emulators/ simulators/ CBTs and IETMs, keeping in pace with the induction of new equipment. The committee has been able to make considerable progress in procurement/ induction of equipment/ simulators for training units and currently, training requirements are included in the scope of each procurement contract being processed by procurement Directorates at NHQ. A Simulator*

*Roadmap for the Indian Navy was promulgated by NHQ in Nov 21 to streamline procurement and utilisation of simulators at various training units and other organisations in IN. Additionally, Standing Board for Simulator Training (SBST) headed by a Rear Admiral has been constituted as part of the roadmap as a single point contact for all simulator related requirements including preparation of two guidelines (new simulator procurement & in-service simulator utilisation).*

11. Regarding XXXXX<sup>64</sup> for training at XXXXX<sup>65</sup>, representatives of the Ministry, during the course of examination explained that procurement efforts have been generally affected due to the cost implications. The ministry has brought forward the following in explanation: -

*"There was constant impetus on procuring the training aids and five out of the six requirements projected have been met and only one procurement of XXXXX<sup>66</sup> is pending. Procurement of this XXXXX<sup>67</sup> was delayed due to exorbitant costing by OEM and also few procedural delays. To mitigate the shortfall, alternate means such as Virtual Reality, Interactive Electronic and Technical Manual (IETM) and other simulators and CBT packages are being used to augment the practical understanding on XXXXX<sup>68</sup>."*

12. Regarding XXXXX<sup>69</sup>, representatives of the Ministry during the course of examination explained that Nuclear Biological Chemical (NBC) training facility has been completed in Mar 2019 and the facility is being used for training. The Ministry has brought forward the following in explanation: -

*"The IN has been training officers and sailors on NBC aspects since 1950s through introduction to theoretical concepts followed by practical training in detection, protection measures and drills. The NBC training facility is a training aid which has augmented effective training being imparted to personnel till the simulator was inaugurated. The concept of a NBC simulator had its gestation time due to the complexity of design with no reference system available and arriving at correct procedure for procurement to evolve a cost effective and optimal solution. Additionally, keeping with the drive for indigenisation, the project was awarded to an Indian firm. The simulator has been inaugurated in Mar 2019 and the facility has enhanced understanding of trainees and helped in building confidence and understanding of various nuances involved in Defence against NBC attacks and handling of NBC agents. Indian Navy is the only Navy in Asia to hold such a training facility which has trained over 17,000 trainees which includes over 500 trainees from Friendly Foreign Countries."*

13. Regarding XXXXX<sup>60</sup>, representatives of the ministry during the course of examination explained that defective machines have been repaired through trade/ vendors /in-house efforts and currently 100% machinery is

available for training. The Ministry has brought forward the following in explanation: -

*"Procurement was initiated for 34 workshop machinery but was not progressing due to poor vendor response as most machinery was specific to naval use and thus suffered from lack of expertise in repair as well as spare support. However, 30 out of 34 defective machines have been repaired through trade/ vendors/ in-house efforts and the balance 04 machines are presently are not used in training due to change in syllabus and obsolescence over time. Hence, training requirements are effectively achieved through 100% availability of machinery. Towards addressing the issue in future, the procurement and modernisation is being kept pace with Commercially off-the Shelf (COTS) machinery so as to ease maintenance and spare issues."*

14. Regarding XXXXX<sup>61</sup>, representatives of the Ministry during the course of examination indicated that most of the equipment has been installed either as live equipment/ simulators. The representatives also gave a detailed plan for induction of deficient equipment with timelines. The Ministry has brought forward the following in explanation:-

*"Training Equipment at XXXXX<sup>62</sup>are XXXXX<sup>63</sup>. Whilst impetus is taken on procurement of original equipment itself for training in an ideal scenario, when not feasible, all efforts are being undertaken to augment the training by Simulators, Augmented Reality (AR), Virtual Reality (VR), etc. For future procurements, IN has already instituted as a policy wherein the RFPs of new induction equipment are to include a training model of the equipment for the concerned training unit. All new induction equipment are being procured with a corresponding training model."*

15. Regarding XXXXX<sup>64</sup>, representatives of the Ministry, during the course of examination indicated that the shortfall has been mitigated by using ' XXXXX<sup>65</sup> Software' The XXXXX<sup>66</sup> Simulator is fully functional and is being utilised for training. The ministry has brought forward the following in explanation: -

*"The 'XXXXX<sup>67</sup>' software which is used for post processing of data was not installed due to contractual issues with OEM leading to audit objection. However, system was fully functional and was extensively used for hands on training on recording and operation. The substitute XXXXX<sup>68</sup> Software, which does the post processing of data akin to XXXXX<sup>69</sup> has been sourced from Indian reps of the OEM (XXXXX<sup>70</sup>). Additionally, in 2020 the XXXXX<sup>71</sup>' software was upgraded and licensed through OEM and is now in-date. With XXXXX<sup>72</sup> software, the XXXXX<sup>73</sup> Simulator is fully functional and is being utilised for training. The XXXXX<sup>74</sup> Software' is currently fulfilling the extant requirement and XXXXX<sup>75</sup> software is not being procured"*

16. Regarding XXXXX<sup>76</sup>, representatives of the Ministry during the course of examination indicated that the facility has been commissioned on 02 May 23 and the delays were due to the project being a maiden venture. The Ministry has brought forward the following in explanation: -

*"The contract for XXXXX<sup>77</sup> was signed with an Indian firm, XXXXX<sup>78</sup> on 26 Aug 19 thereby boosting indigenisation law Gol policy. The facility has been commissioned on 02 May 23 and about 350 personnel have been trained till date. Delays were due to the project being a maiden venture and concept, design and proving of this venture was purely indigenous as no foreign country or firm assisted in the same. Additionally, the restrictions imposed due COVID-19 pandemic further delayed project completion. With commissioning of the facility, fully designed and implemented in-house, IN has made a quantum leap in XXXXX<sup>79</sup> safety training."*

17. In regard to XXXXX<sup>80</sup> representatives of the ministry during the course of examination indicated that the *Online Feedback Management System (OFMS)* which has been implemented in Indian Navy provides adequate data points as feedback on training. These feedbacks are continuously and institutionally analysed and worked towards improvements, if necessary. The Ministry has brought forward the following in explanation: -

*"With OFMS, the feedback chain has been strengthened and currently 79% compliance has been achieved. This combined with robust system of syllabus review every three years adds value to the refinement in training. A new version of OFMS 3.0 incorporating features based on suggestions received from Feedback Initiator and Feedback Rendering Units has been launched on 20 Sep 23, which is expected to increase the percentage of feedback received."*

18. Asked to furnish the specific efforts made to improve compliance with the utilization of OFMS, the Ministry in a written reply stated as under:

Efforts taken towards improvement in compliance of the utilisation of OFMS are as follows: -

- (a) Detailed advisories are being forwarded to all stakeholders on regular basis.
- (b) Provision has been made to upload remarks of offline feedback.
- (c) Accounts on OFMS have been created using designation-based IDs for better accountability.
- (d) Provision of automated e-mail over Naval Unified Domain (NUD) to the Commanding Officer of the concerned unit highlighting pending feedback on monthly basis.
- (e) Necessary steps have been initiated to achieve adequate levels of feedback. It is pertinent to mention that 100% compliance may not be achieved due to many rendering units XXXXX<sup>81</sup> which may only XXXXX<sup>82</sup>. Nevertheless, a marked increase in the compliance rate of the utilisation of OFMS for rendering of external feedbacks has been observed post hosting of the updated version in Mar 2018, training imparted on utilising the software by the team

and issuance of Training Directives and implementation of feedback monitoring mechanism. The same is expected to improve further.

(f) The Online Feedback Management System (OFMS) had to be unplugged from the Naval Unified Domain in Jul 2021 due to technical issues and remained unplugged till Nov 2021. During this period, feedbacks were generated by the training units in the offline mode of the application, resulting in a decrease in the compliance rate of the feedbacks in Dec 2021. Subsequent to the system being plugged back into the domain in Nov 2021, the feedback rendering units are being continuously liaised with for the pending feedbacks. The improvement in utilisation status and a comparison over the past few years is as tabulated below: -

<b>Ser</b>	<b>Month Ending</b>	<b>Percentage Compliance</b>
(i)	Jun 17	8.87%
(ii)	Jul 17	11.28%
(iii)	Aug 17	19.68%
(iv)	Nov 17	29.56%
(v)	Feb 18	33.97%
(vi)	Apr 18	36.13%
(vii)	Jul 18	38.03%
(viii)	Aug 18	41.28%
(ix)	Jul 19	53.00%
(x)	Jul 20	64.00%
(xi)	Jun 21	72.00%
(xii)	Dec 21	59.38%
(xiii)	Jun 22	74.00%
(xiv)	Dec 22	79.00%

(g) A new version of OFMS 3.0 incorporating features based on suggestions received from Feedback Initiator and Feedback Rendering Units is under development. With an EDC of Jan 2024, this would increase the percentage of feedback received. It is pertinent that OFMS provides adequate data points as feedback on training. These feedbacks are continuously and institutionally analysed and worked towards improvements, if necessary. Therefore, the current system is considered adequate.

19. Regarding the XXXXX<sup>83</sup> in training pointed out by XXXXX<sup>84</sup>, representatives of the ministry during the course of examination indicated that the o XXXXX<sup>85</sup> are parts of internal feedback mechanism of training in Indian Navy and XXXXX<sup>86</sup>. The observations have been taken cognizance of, and a slew of measures have been implemented which resulted in Nil failures subsequently. The Ministry in this regard stated :-

*"Post detailed studies, new Marine Engineering Specialisation Course (MESC) phase of 26 weeks (inclusive of 03 weeks afloat attachment) has been introduced wef Dec 17 as part of Engineer*

officer's ab-initio training. This additional MESC phase has acted as a Bridging course and has improved the understanding of officers prior to proceeding for XXXXX<sup>87</sup> onboard ships. Additionally, a comprehensive policy on conduct of XXXXX<sup>88</sup> has been promulgated by NHQ in Mar 18. Strict implementation of policy and continuous monitoring of the efficacy of the training through external feedback has been successful in achieving 100% pass in past few years."

20. When asked to furnish the improvements made to address the XXXXX<sup>89</sup> since the implementation of the policy on XXXXX<sup>90</sup>, the Ministry in a written reply stated as under:

(a) **Clarification.** The observations brought out by various XXXXX<sup>91</sup> boards are parts of feedback mechanism in place and may not be construed as only shortcomings and the same have been taken cognizance of, while implementing course corrections. Notwithstanding, a slew of measures were already being progressed which are enumerated as actions taken.

(b) **Syllabus for Training.** Based on a study undertaken as part of revision of B. Tech (ME) syllabus at Indian Naval Academy (INA), a new Marine Engineering Specialisation Course (MESC) phase of 26 weeks (inclusive of 03 weeks afloat attachment) has been

introduced wef Dec 17 as part of Engineer officer's ab-initio training. Hence, the overall training duration of MESC for Engineer officers has been increased from XXXXX<sup>92</sup>. This additional MESC phase has acted as a *bridging course* and has improved the understanding of various concepts in engineering of young officers prior to proceeding for XXXXX<sup>93</sup> onboard ships. The year wise details of board results are tabulated below:-

Year	Course	Str	XXXXX <sup>94</sup> Cleared (Attempt)		Remarks
			1 <sup>st</sup>	2 <sup>nd</sup>	
12-13	60.075	26	25	01	All Qualified.
	60.076	45	42	03	All Qualified.
13-14	60.077	42	42	--	All Qualified.
	60.078	81	79	01	All qualified except one Change of Branch due to permanent Low Medical Category (LMC).

14-15	60.079	69	66	01	All qualified except two who were withdrawn from service.
	60.080	37	37	--	All Qualified.
15-16	60.081	52	44	06	All qualified except two who were withdrawn from service
	60.082	50	45	05	All Qualified.
16-17	60.083	55	48	05	All qualified except one who expired during training and one was placed in LMC.
	60.084	34	30	01	One change of Branch due to PmtLMC, 02 cleared with XXXXX <sup>95</sup>
17-18	60.085	40	38	--	Two failures cleared with XXXXX <sup>96</sup>
	60.086	48	43	--	04 cleared with XXXXX <sup>97</sup> , 01 placed in LMC
18-19	60.087	03	03	--	All Qualified
	60.088	57	57	--	
19-20	60.089	52	48	--	Four failures cleared with XXXXX <sup>98</sup> .
	60.090	62	62	Nil	All Qualified
<b>Year</b>	<b>Course</b>	<b>Str</b>	<b>XXXXX<sup>99</sup> Cleared (Attempt)</b>		<b>Remarks</b>
			<b>1<sup>st</sup></b>	<b>2<sup>nd</sup></b>	
	60.091	31	26	02	Two failures conjoined with XXXXX <sup>100</sup>
20-21	60.092	50	43	07	All Qualified
	60.093	32	32	--	All Qualified
21-22	60.094	57	57	--	All Qualified
	60.095	37	34	03	All Qualified

(c) **Policy Measure.** Comprehensive policy on conduct of XXXXX<sup>101</sup> has been promulgated by IHQ MoD(N) in Mar 18. Strict implementation and continuous monitoring of the efficacy of the bridging course through external feedback including from examination boards is being incorporated.

(d) **Feedback.** The recommendation of Boards along with other feedback mechanisms continue to be the mainstay of inputs for periodic revision of syllabus and training duration if there is a need.



(e) It can be seen that there has been a definite improvement in the trainees post above actions.

21. Regarding XXXXX<sup>102</sup> output analysis and increasing trend of XXXXX<sup>103</sup>, representatives of the ministry during the course of examination indicated that the observation was due to an erroneous calculation done between XXXXX<sup>104</sup>. Further, analysis done between similar subjects that is 10+2 and engineering subjects indicated a positive correlation. The projected Extended Delivery Schedule (EDS) for various equipment, such as XXXXX<sup>105</sup>. Asked to furnish the present status of these projects, the MoD in a written reply stated as under:

XXXXX<sup>106</sup>

Asked to state the impact of the XXXXX<sup>107</sup> of the Indian Navy and the XXXXX<sup>108</sup> of the country, the Indian Navy in a written reply stated as under:

- (a) Delay in delivery of above equipment is not envisaged.
- (b) XXXXX<sup>109</sup> are available at XXXXX<sup>110</sup> for training.
- (c) XXXXX<sup>111</sup> Trainer is available at XXXXX<sup>112</sup> and is available for use by trainees of XXXXX<sup>113</sup>."

22. Regarding the XXXXX<sup>114</sup>, the Ministry replied as under:

"The sanction and the procurement of the XXXXX<sup>115</sup> was undertaken in right earnest and the chronological sequence is enumerated below:-

(a) XXXXX<sup>116</sup> had directed XXXXX<sup>117</sup> to take up a SOC for XXXXX<sup>118</sup>. XXXXX<sup>119</sup>, as per XXXXX<sup>120</sup> directives, forwarded specific requirements and capabilities intended for XXXXX<sup>121</sup> to various firms. The firms requested to undertake a detailed study and forward project reports to XXXXX<sup>122</sup> by end Oct 14. As the estimated cost was beyond the financial powers of Command HQs, the case was required to be taken up under the Capital Route by IHQ MoD(N).

(b) The following challenges were overcome prior accord of AoN by Competent Authority: -

(i) Necessity for re-aligning the case with DPP-16 post promulgation.  
(ii) Non-availability of existing design of XXXXX<sup>123</sup> with any vendor. Therefore, the technical requirements had to be determined through extensive staff process.

(iii) Requirement of accommodating XXXXX<sup>124</sup> capabilities for XXXXX<sup>125</sup> different classes of XXXXX<sup>126</sup> operated by the **IN** in a single

training facility required extensive deliberations between *IN* and DRDO.

(iv) Due to non-availability of any existing design, the assessment of financial implication of the first of its kind Training Facility required extensive deliberations with MoD (Fin).

(c) The contract for XXXXX<sup>127</sup> Simulator for XXXXX<sup>128</sup> was signed with an Indian firm, M/s XXXXX<sup>129</sup> on 26 Aug 19 at a total value of Rs 67.6 Cr inclusive of taxes thereby boosting indigenisation *iaw* Gol policy. The Facility has been commissioned on 02 May 23 and about XXXXX<sup>130</sup> personnel from various organisations like XXXXX<sup>131</sup> have been trained till date.

(d) The chronological sequence of event towards the acquisition of the said trainer in a tabulated form is as under:

<u>Ser</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Event</u>
(i)	26 Aug 19	Contract Signed
(ii)	06 Sep 19	Presentation by Firm at IHQ MoD(N)/XXXXX <sup>132</sup>
(iii)	26 Sep 19	Visit to Fire Fighting Simulator at XXXXX <sup>133</sup>
(iv)	03 Oct 19	Presentation by Firm to all board members
(v)	28 Nov 19	Scrutiny and final approval of Civil Drawings by Board Members
(vi)	22 Jan 20	Scrutiny and final approval of Structural Drawings of Building by Board Members
(vii)	10 Feb 20	Design of Internal arrangements of simulators.
(viii)	25 Aug 20	Draft Design drawings by submitted by the firm
(ix)	15 Sep 20	Foundation Stone laying by XXXXX <sup>134</sup>
(x)	15 Sep 20	Construction of Admin & Utility buildings
(xi)	13 Aug 21	Fabrication & Erection of XXXXX <sup>135</sup> sheds
(xii)	26 Nov 21	Readiness of draft software for simulation for trials
(xiii)	02 May 23	Facility Commissioned"

23. Cooperative engagement with friendly foreign countries is mentioned as a way to broaden the horizons of naval personnel. However, there have been XXXXX<sup>136</sup> for personnel to participate in such engagements. Asked to furnish the plan of the Indian Navy to increase the scope and frequency of cooperative engagements with foreign navies to facilitate knowledge sharing and skill development, the Ministry in a written reply stated as under:

(a) **Training of Foreign Personnel.** *IN* has been providing training to foreign personnel in India for more than five decades, during which it has trained over 19000 (9412 Officers and 9710 sailors) foreign personnel from over 46 Friendly Foreign Countries. During the present Training Year (TY) 2023-24 which commenced on 01 Jul 23, XXXXX<sup>137</sup> vacancies has allocated to FFCs in the various courses conducted at *IN* Training Establishments.

(b) **Mobile Training Teams.** Special impetus has been laid on sending Mobile Training Teams (MTT) to Friendly Foreign Countries. This endeavour has not only reduced the burden on our own training infrastructure but also effectively increased our training footprint in the FFCs.

(c) **Visit of Training Delegation.** In order to showcase the *IN*'s standard of training as well as training facilities visit of Foreign Training delegation is undertaken at regular basis. *IN* teams also visit FFCs to understand the training methodology and exchange of best practices.

(d) **Admiral's Cup.** The Admiral's Cup Sailing Regatta has gained popularity over the years and each consecutive edition has seen wider participation. The Admiral's Cup 2022 edition was held from 04 to 10 Dec 22, saw participation of 25 foreign Navies (28 teams). For the forthcoming edition of Admirals Cup 2023 scheduled from 03 to 09 Dec 23, invites have been extended to 63 FFCs.

(e) **Deputation of *IN* Personnel for Courses/ Training Abroad.** Every year XXXXX<sup>138</sup> approx *IN* personnel are deputed for various training courses. The courses include National Defence Course, Higher Command Courses, Staff Courses and niche technology / capacity building course. Personnel are also deputed for Sea Training onboard foreign Naval Ships, Seminars, Cadet exchange program with Naval academies and Sailing Regattas. Other training visits include Foreign Study Tours for officers undergoing NHCC course at NWC, Goa."

#### **Joint Training and Collaboration with Other Services.**

24. The Indian Navy emphasizes the importance of joint training and mentions the identification of vacancies for subscription by three services in each other's training facilities. However, the actual implementation and execution of joint training programs have been limited.

In regard to the measures being taken to ensure effective utilization of joint training opportunities, the Ministry in a written reply stated :

**“Joint Training.** A number of Joint courses are undertaken at various levels between the three services, both at Tri - Services Institutes (viz NDA, DSSC, MILIT, CDM, NDCetc) and at Service specific training establishments (viz AFA, Diving School, CME etc). All these courses significantly contribute towards Joint Training. The Joint Training Committee (JTC) at HQIDS coordinates all the requirements of individual services for the courses being conducted in the Tri-Services Institutes. Further, the course content and syllabi of these courses, coordinated under the aegis of HQIDS/ JTC, focuses on Jointmanship and synergy.

(a) In addition, a large number of courses are conducted by individual services with participation of personnel from the sister services. The syllabi and vacancies are deliberated bilaterally between services. The sharing of experiences, and deliberation of inter-service training requirements at service specific institutes also takes place at the highest level in the Tri-Services Training Command Conference (TSTCC), which is a major forum to discuss Joint Training. As a follow up of decisions of Combined Commanders Conference 2017, a COSC Directive was issued for a Study on XXXXX<sup>139</sup> on Training by SHQs, **with IN as lead service.** The study report was submitted to COSC on 25 Jul 17 and approved thereafter in Aug 17. Based on the recommendations brought out in the study report, subscription to additional courses by the three Services in each other's training establishments was also discussed and highlighted during the Tri-Services Training Commands Conference (TSTCC) held at HQARTRAC in early Nov 17. **Consequently, Services have commenced subscription to the additional courses with each other, thereby enhancing Jointmanship."**

PART - II  
Observations/Recommendations

Training

1 The Indian Navy is one of the most important arms of our Defence Forces. It undertakes onerous duties not only during war time in combating the threat perception but also plays an important role in safeguarding our maritime boundaries. Indian Navy works in consonance with several Navies of our friendly countries and keeps a constant vigil in the Indian Oceans not only from the angle of Defence but also by way of checking illegal trade and menace of pirates etc. It is a multi-dimensional force that has been organized to safeguard India's maritime territorial integrity and other maritime interests. Indian Navy is a well balanced and cohesive force capable of effectively safeguarding our national interests.

Of all the elements that go into making an effective and vibrant Navy, training of personnel is of paramount importance. Training equips the personnel with the necessary skills, knowledge, and physical fitness to face a diverse range of challenges and threats. From mastering advanced weaponry and tactical strategies to developing teamwork and leadership abilities, comprehensive training prepares personnel to handle complex and dynamic situations with resilience and precision.

The Committee take note of the excellent training facilities and procedures set in place by Indian Navy to ensure all round training of Officers. The training

done in multiple stages at varying seniority is carefully gradated to ensure well qualified personnel for each job.

The Committee note that the audit observation regarding non- availability of training aids and equipment for newly inducted platforms is being addressed by Indian Navy through refining of procurement procedures and laying down roadmap for induction and utilisation of simulators. The Committee further note that cost implication is a major factor in capital procurement cases and operational requirements are always prioritised over training. However, the Committee emphasise that training is the most important peace time activity of any fighting force and adequate impetus needs to be given for procurement of training aids.

2 The mitigation measures adopted by Indian Navy in circumventing training gaps caused due to delay in procurement of customised workshop machinery include, carrying out repairs through trade/ vendors /in-house efforts. These efforts have led to considerable savings to exchequer. Such initiatives need to percolate to other wings/divisions to set an example and act as a motivating factor.

### **3 Training Budget**

The Committee would like to recommend allocating a dedicated budget head specifically for training purposes. This would ensure that training programmes receive the necessary financial resources without being compromised or overshadowed by other budgetary concerns. The Committee would recommend the Directorate of Naval Plans and IHQ MoD

(Navy) to prioritize the creation of a dedicated training budget head to enhance the training capabilities of the Indian Navy.

4. The Committee would like to recommend that Navy not only revisit its funding structure and consider increasing the budgetary allocations for training programmes but also facilitate specialized training initiatives on the basis of specific requirements collated by the Commands concerned. A thorough and comprehensive assessment of training needs should be conducted across all Commands and Units within the Indian Navy. This assessment should focus on identifying the specific areas where training requires improvement. By understanding the training gaps, the Navy can allocate resources more effectively, ensuring that the training budget is utilized to address the most critical needs and areas for improvement.

5. The Committee feel that the effectiveness of training programmes should be regularly evaluated to assess their impact on operational readiness and performance. By implementing robust performance evaluation mechanism, the Committee feel that the Indian Navy can determine the return on investment for its training initiatives. This the Committee feel, will enable informed decision-making regarding budgetary allocations and ensure that resources are directed towards training programmes that deliver the best results. In this regard, the Committee also recommend that the Navy should allocate a portion of the training budget towards mental skill development, leadership development and

stress management etc. This form of specialized training will contribute to the overall competence and adaptability of the naval personnel.

#### **6. REFINING OF PROCEDURES**

The Committee are of the opinion that the procedures for capital procurements are leading to considerable delays in materialising various projects. Refining the process and induction of e-governance initiatives into the system should aid in simplifying the procedures thereby ensuring timely provisioning. Additionally, strict monitoring of timelines by the Ministry should be implemented and delays should be identified and active corrective measures implemented.

#### **7. SHARING OF BEST PRACTICES BETWEEN SERVICES**

The Committee recommend that best practices followed in the Indian Navy and other Services which has led to mitigation of shortfalls may be shared between the Services through interactions at all levels. This will improve interoperability and ensure collective improvement in providing services to citizens.

#### **8. THRUST ON INDIGENISATION**

The Committee emphasise the need to provide adequate impetus to indigenisation and recommend strengthening the industry-academia collaboration for research and development. The efforts of Indian Navy in this area are well appreciated but the delays could have been reduced with better cooperation at all levels. The government may institute a framework for such cooperation and provide avenues for mutual exchange of ideas to bridge the gap.



## 9. JOINT TRAINING

The Committee recommend that since the armed forces are on the verge of shifting to Theatre Commands, a relook should be cast on aspects to promote Jointmanship at both working and planning level. Implementation of measures such as joint capsules by lead service, optimising training effort by re-organising common training requirement by forming various Joint Services Training Institutes and cross posting of staff at both training and operational levels will pave way to smooth implementation of Theatre Commands.

## 10. CYBER SECURITY & SPACE SECURITY

With the advent of weapons capable of even attacking space-based assets, the Indian Navy need to prepare for such threats through adequate training. Additionally, Cyber Space is the new medium of warfare and with all sophisticated weapons being controlled by computers, the Indian Navy need to invest in training in the field of Cyber security for preparing to meet the future challenges.

## 11. FUTUREPROOFING TRAINING REQUIREMENTS

On the above aspect, the Committee recommend that existing polices/ strategies/ vision documents should continue to be evolved towards evaluating the needs of *Futuristic Warfare* and catering to changes which may be required in training paradigm to 'futureproof' training. This will ensure that the Indian Navy continues to be a combat ready force in *war-time* based on the effectiveness and high-standards of its training in *peace-time*.

**12. CAPACITY BUILDING OF TRAINERS AND OPTIMIZATION OF RESOURCE ALLOCATION FOR TRAINING**

The Committee emphasize the need to work on capacity building of trainers and a review of the training module.. The Committee also recommend regular assessment of training needs, focusing on effectiveness, and allocating resources accordingly.

The Committee would like to reiterate the critical need for a dedicated training budget and recommend optimization of resource allocation for training purposes.

**NEW DELHI**  
**05 February, 2024**  
**16 Magha, 1945 (Saka)**

**ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY**  
**Chairperson,**  
**Public Accounts Committee**

\*\*\*